



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## Finding focus : using external focus of attention for practicing and performing music

Williams, S.G.

### Citation

Williams, S. G. (2019, June 6). *Finding focus : using external focus of attention for practicing and performing music*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/73832>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Leiden University Non-exclusive license](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/73832>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/73832> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Williams, S.G.

**Title:** Finding focus : using external focus of attention for practicing and performing music

**Issue Date:** 2019-06-06

## **Finding Focus**

Using external focus of attention for practicing and performing  
music

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op donderdag 6 juni 2019

klokke 10:00 uur

door

Susan Gayle Williams

geboren te Canberra, Australië

in 1960

Promotor

Prof.dr. Henk Borgdorff Universiteit Leiden

## Copromotores

Dr. Rebecca Schaefer Universiteit Leiden

Dr. Michiel Schuijzer Conservatorium van Amsterdam

## Promotiecommissie

Prof.dr. Bernhard Hommel Universiteit Leiden

Prof.dr. Adina Mornell University of Music and Performing Arts Munich

Dr. Raoul Oudejans Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam

## TABLE of CONTENTS

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....</b>	3
<b>GLOSSARY of TERMS .....</b>	4
<b>INTRODUCTION .....</b>	6
Background and Context: Training Performing Musicians .....	6
Approaches to Learning to Play Music.....	11
Aim and Relevance of this Research .....	14
Research Approach .....	15
Outline of this Dissertation .....	16
<b>PART I: MAKING MUSIC .....</b>	19
<b>1 Learning Motor Skills .....</b>	20
What Kind of Skill is Music-making? .....	20
Current Theories on Motor Control and Motor Learning.....	21
Stages of Learning Motor Skills and the Role of Attention.....	24
Explicit and Implicit Motor Learning .....	27
The OPTIMAL Theory of Motor Learning .....	32
Motor Learning and Motor Performance for Music-making .....	33
<b>2 Attentional Focus for Learning and Performance .....</b>	35
Introduction: What do Musicians Focus on? .....	35
What is Attentional Focus? .....	35
Types of Focus .....	36
Limitations of Attentional Focus .....	38
The Effects of Arousal and Anxiety on Attention .....	40
Optimal Focus for Learning and Performance.....	40
External Focus of Attention .....	41
<b>3 Audiation and Musical Imagery .....</b>	51
Introduction.....	51
Audiation: Music as Language .....	51
Musical Imagery .....	53
Singing and Gesture .....	56
Playing Variations.....	57
Practicing Musical Intention .....	58
<b>Summary of Part I .....</b>	59
<b>PART II: FOCUSSING ON MUSICAL INTENTION Three Empirical Projects.....</b>	60
<b>4 An Overview of the Projects .....</b>	62
Introduction.....	62
APT: Designing an Audiation Practice Tool .....	63
How External Focus was used in the Projects .....	64
<b>5 Empirical Project One: The Effects of External Focus on the Skill Acquisition of Natural Trumpet Players .....</b>	65
Introduction.....	65
Method .....	65
Results .....	76
Discussion .....	83
<b>6 Empirical Project Two: The Effects of Using External Focus in Preparing a Trumpet Ensemble Project “Macht und Musik”.....</b>	86
Introduction.....	86
Method .....	88
Results.....	91

Discussion .....	99
<b>7 Empirical Project Three: Using External Focus in a Mixed Ensemble Project “Biber Immersion Project” .....</b>	<b>101</b>
Introduction .....	101
Method .....	102
Results .....	105
Discussion .....	107
<b>PART III: DISCUSSION, CONCLUSIONS and RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>109</b>
<b>8 General Discussion of the Research Findings .....</b>	<b>110</b>
The OPTIMAL Theory Revisited .....	112
Recommendations for Future Research .....	113
<b>9 Conclusions: Approaching Practice and Performance .....</b>	<b>114</b>
A Holistic Approach to Learning and Performing .....	114
The Three Stages of Learning Reformulated .....	116
Training Performing Musicians .....	117
The Role of Conservatoires .....	118
Future Directions .....	120
<b>10 Disseminating and Applying Research on Musicians’ Motor Learning to Musicians and their Teachers .....</b>	<b>121</b>
Bridging Science and Musical Practice .....	121
<b>SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>123</b>
<b>SAMENVATTING .....</b>	<b>126</b>
<b>REFERENCES .....</b>	<b>129</b>
<b>CURRICULUM VITAE .....</b>	<b>136</b>
<b>APPENDICES .....</b>	<b>137</b>
Appendix A Test Pieces .....	138
Appendix B Self-efficacy Scales .....	145
Appendix C General Information Questionnaire .....	147
Appendix D Pre-sight-reading/Pre-performance Questionnaire .....	148
Appendix E Repertoire Assessment Form .....	149
Appendix F Practice Style Assessment Form .....	150
Appendix G Logbook Session Sheets .....	151
Appendix H Explanation, Guidelines and Rules for Using APT .....	152
Appendix I Guidelines and Rules for the Practice Sessions .....	153
Appendix J Post-performance Questionnaires .....	154
Appendix K Practice Style Data .....	157
Appendix L Post-APT Phase Questionnaire Answers to “Comments” with Analysis .....	158
Appendix M Practice Instructions for Project Two .....	161
Appendix N Practice Log Sheets for Project Two .....	162
Appendix O Post-performance Survey Questions for Project Two .....	163
Appendix P Transcripts of Post-project Interview for Project Two .....	164
Appendix Q Coding for the Post-project Interview .....	184
Appendix R Post-project Questionnaire for Project Three .....	185
Appendix S Transcripts of the Answers to the Post-project Three Questionnaire .....	186
Appendix T Program for “Macht und Musik” (Project Two) .....	189
Appendix U Program for the “Biber Immersion Project” (Project Three) .....	196
Appendix V Schedule for the “Biber Immersion Project” .....	201
Appendix W Teacher Training Document .....	202
Appendix X <i>Quality Practice: a Musician’s Guide</i> .....	208

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks go to my promoter – prof. Henk Borgdorff and my co-promotores dr.Rebecca Schaefer and dr.Michiel Schuijzer for your expert guidance and generous support. This work involved a complex interaction between the disciplines of performing arts, pedagogy and psychology and needed a very subtle and critical blend of supervisors, which I thankfully had. Thanks also to prof. Adina Mornell and dr. Melissa Bremmer and to Joram van Ketel for your tremendous help and advice.

The support of the Royal Conservatoire The Hague is gratefully appreciated, and in particular that of Martin Prchal.

The research presented in this thesis owes a lot to the enthusiasm and inspiration I have shared with many of my colleagues both those who I have performed with and those I have worked with in the field of Performance Science – in particular my dear colleagues from the ‘Potential to Performance’ team: Wieke Karsten, Päivi Arjas, Erja Joukamo-Ampuja, Eve Newsome and Gabriela Meyer.

Thank you to my husband Matthias and son Jonathan for your love and patience, and to Wayne Williams for your indispensable help.

**This work is dedicated to all of my students – past, present and future.**

## GLOSSARY of TERMS

**Associative focus:** focusing on something that is relevant to the task at hand

**Audiation:** the comprehension and internal realization of music, or being able to hear or feel sound when it is not physically present

**Cognition:** the mental action or process of acquiring knowledge and understanding through thought, experience, and the senses

**Declarative learning:** learning by following verbal instructions

**Dissociative focus:** focusing on something that is not relevant to the task at hand

**Motor skill:** a skill involving movement

**Movement efficiency:** refers to energy expenditure: the less energy expended during execution of a sport skill, the more efficient is the movement

**Explicit learning:** learning, which generates verbal knowledge of movement performance (e.g. facts and rules)

**External focus:** focus on the intended result of one's movements

**Implicit learning:** learning that occurs without the person's awareness

**Internal focus:** focusing on the movements of the body

**Music-making:** playing or singing music

**Procedural learning:** learning by doing

**Self-efficacy:** one's belief in one's ability to succeed in specific situations or accomplish a task. Self-efficacy is also defined as a person's capacity to bring about a desired result.

*“People think focus means saying yes to the thing you’ve got to focus on. But that’s not what it means at all. It means saying no to the hundred other good ideas that there are. [...] You have to pick carefully.”<sup>1</sup>*

*“Intention unites desire and action.”<sup>2</sup>*

---

<sup>1</sup> Steve Jobs, keynote speech, WWDC Conference, May 1997

<sup>2</sup> Vadim Zeland (2012), *Reality transurfing*