



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Trade, investment and labour: interactions in international law

Zandvliet, R.

Citation

Zandvliet, R. (2019, February 21). *Trade, investment and labour: interactions in international law. Meijers-reeks*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/68881>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/68881>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/68881> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Zandvliet, R.

Title: Trade, investment and labour: interactions in international law

Issue Date: 2019-02-21

Trade, Investment and Labour: Interactions in International Law

Trade, Investment and Labour:
Interactions in International Law

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 21 februari 2019
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Ruben Zandvliet

geboren te Venray

in 1986

Promotor: prof. dr. N.J. Schrijver
Co-promotor: dr. E.V. Koppe

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. N.M. Blokker
prof. dr. P.F. van der Heijden
prof. dr. F. Weiss (University of Vienna, Austria)
prof. dr. N.M.C.P. Jägers (Universiteit Tilburg)
prof. dr. K. Boonstra (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Lay-out: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

© 2019 R. Zandvliet

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the author.

To my mother, Diana van Herwaarden, in loving memory.

Acknowledgements

Although writing this PhD thesis sometimes felt like a solitary endeavour, I could not have done it without the support of many people. First of all, I would like to thank my promotor, Nico Schrijver. Nico sparked my interest in pursuing a PhD after my studies in Leiden and New York, and has been a wonderful supervisor throughout the years. Our mutual interest in politics provided a continuous topic of conversation and a welcome distraction from discussions about the history of the ILO or investment protection standards. I could not have wished for a better co-promotor than Erik Koppe, whose meticulous reviews of my draft texts greatly improved the research. I am honoured that my committee members, Niels Blokker, Klara Boonstra, Nicola Jägers, Paul van der Heijden and Friedl Weiss, were not only involved in the examination of my final thesis, but that I got to know all of them in different ways throughout the course of my project. In particular, I thank Paul for inviting me to a session of the ILO Committee on Freedom of Association, which allowed me to observe tripartism in action.

I thank Hanna Bosdriesz and Vid Prislan for their friendship and willingness to be my paranymphs. Hanna's passion for human rights is truly inspiring. Our conversations on Guatemala provided me with insights that no academic paper or arbitral award can provide. With Vid, I co-authored two articles on investment-labour linkage. This project has been extremely valuable to the course of my research. His profound knowledge of international investment law opened my eyes to the field of law in my research with which I was least familiar. I also thank my other former colleagues at the Leiden Law School. The Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies was a place of unity in diversity, both with regard to research topics as well as personal backgrounds. Probably my most productive weeks of writing I spent with Ingrid, Nelleke and Vestert in Renkum. The combination of kitchen-table research, long walks and Zomergasten could have lasted much longer. During the winter and spring of 2015 I had the pleasure of working at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law at the University of Cambridge as a visiting scholar. This research visit has been sponsored by the Leiden University Fund/van Beuningen Fund and the Cornelis van Vollenhoven Stichting. I am grateful for their support.

I also would like to thank two mentors outside of academia. Paul Kalma gave me the opportunity to take my first steps in the political arena as well as the business and human rights field. Maria Anne van Dijk proves every

day that corporate activism on the Zuidas can thrive. I am proud to be part of the journey.

Finally, I would like to thank my family. There are no words to describe my gratitude to Heike for giving me so much space to finish my research and for all the other ways in which she has supported me over the last years. Lauren and David have truly enriched our lives. I am looking forward to spending my weekends reading fairy tales instead of law journals, and to all other wonderful things that lie ahead.

Ruben Zandvliet
November 2018

Table of contents

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xv
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Research question, scope and academic context of the study	4
1.3 Sources and methodology	9
1.4 Thesis outline	12
2 ECONOMIC COMPETITION AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF INTERNATIONAL LABOUR LAW	15
2.1 Introduction	15
2.2 The origins of international labour law	16
2.2.1 Introduction	16
2.2.2 Economic competition and the need for international cooperation	16
2.2.3 The quid pro quo between improving labour standards and tariff reductions	19
2.2.4 The International Association of Labour Legislation and the emergence of multilateralism	21
2.3 The International Labour Organization	25
2.3.1 Introduction	25
2.3.2 The establishment of the ILO and its institutional framework	25
2.3.3 The purpose of the ILO	28
2.3.3.1 Early perspectives: social justice and the coordination problem	28
2.3.3.2 Contemporary perspectives: fundamental rights and sustainable development	31
2.3.4 The legal framework	34
2.3.4.1 Conventions	34
2.3.4.2 Recommendations	37
2.3.4.3 Flexibility of international labour standards	38
2.3.4.4 The 1998 Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work	41
2.3.4.5 Labour standards as part of customary international law	45
2.4 Implementation of ILO standards	48
2.4.1 Introduction	48
2.4.2 The ILO supervisory procedures	48

2.4.2.1	Structure of ILO supervisory procedures	48
2.4.2.2	The Myanmar complaint and economic countermeasures	52
2.4.3	Interpretation of ILO Conventions	55
2.4.4	Perspectives on the effectiveness of the ILO in relation to the trade-labour debate	59
2.5	Concluding remarks	62
3	MULTILATERAL TRADE LAW AND LABOUR	65
3.1	Introduction	65
3.2	Introduction to multilateral trade-labour linkage	66
3.2.1	Introduction	66
3.2.2	Labour and employment in the Havana Charter	66
3.2.3	Labour and employment in the GATT and WTO era	72
3.2.3.1	The quest for a labour clause	72
3.2.3.2	The difference between labour clauses and labour-related trade measures	76
3.2.3.3	Defining 'fair labour standards' in trade law	78
3.3	Labour-related trade measures under WTO law	80
3.3.1	Introduction	80
3.3.2	Foreign labour conditions as unfair trade practices	80
3.3.2.1	Social dumping	80
3.3.2.2	Subsidies	84
3.3.3	Foreign labour conditions as nullification and impairment of benefits	86
3.3.4	Trade measures in response to foreign labour conditions	89
3.3.4.1	PPMs and a typology of labour-related measures	89
3.3.4.2	Labour-related trade measures under the GATT	91
3.3.4.3	Labour-related trade measures under the TBT Agreement	92
3.3.4.4	The definition of 'like' products in WTO law	95
3.4	Justifications under the GATT general exceptions clause	98
3.4.1	Introduction	98
3.4.2	Article XX(a): The protection of public morals	99
3.4.2.1	International labour standards as public morals	99
3.4.2.2	Addressing foreign labour conditions through domestic consumer concerns	102
3.4.3	Article XX (b): The protection of human life or health	106
3.4.4	Article XX(d): Securing compliance with non-inconsistent laws or regulations	109
3.4.5	Article XX(e): Products of prison labour	111
3.4.6	The <i>chapeau</i> -test	115
3.4.6.1	Arbitrary or unjustifiable discrimination	115
3.4.6.2	Disguised restriction on international trade	117
3.5	Labour conditionality in the Generalized System of Preferences	119
3.5.1	Introduction	119
3.5.2	The Generalized System of Preferences	119

3.5.2.1 Article I GATT and the Enabling Clause	119
3.5.2.2 The <i>EC–Tariff Preferences</i> case and the notion of ‘development needs’	120
3.5.3 Labour conditionality in the United States’ GSP	123
3.5.4 Labour conditionality in the European Union’s GSP	125
3.6 Concluding remarks	132
 4 INTERNATIONAL INVESTMENT LAW AND LABOUR	 135
4.1 Introduction	135
4.2 Introduction to investment-labour linkage	137
4.2.1 Introduction	137
4.2.2 The deregulation of labour	137
4.2.3 The regulation of labour	140
4.2.4 The regulation of investors	144
4.3 Investment protection standards in relation to labour regulation	146
4.3.1 Introduction	146
4.3.2 Direct and indirect expropriation	147
4.3.2.1 Background of the norm	147
4.3.2.2 Taxonomy of treaty interpretation	147
4.3.2.3 Police powers, legitimate public welfare objectives, and labour	150
4.3.3 Fair and equitable treatment	152
4.3.3.1 Background of the norm	152
4.3.3.2 Legitimate expectations and labour	156
4.3.3.3 Expectations based on violations of international labour standards	163
4.3.3.4 Violations of labour standards as a breach of the FET standard	165
4.3.4 Full protection and security	166
4.3.5 Non-discrimination	168
4.4 Strategies to increase host states’ regulatory autonomy	171
4.4.1 Introduction	171
4.4.2 Legislative strategies	172
4.4.2.1 The object and purpose of IIAs	172
4.4.2.2 General right to regulate provisions	176
4.4.2.3 General exception clauses	178
4.4.2.4 The effect of inter-state labour obligations on investor protection standards	181
4.4.3 Interpretative issues	184
4.4.3.1 Standard of review and deference	184
4.4.3.2 Systemic integration of international law	186
4.5 Provisions addressing the conduct of investors	191
4.5.1 Introduction	191
4.5.2 Types of CSR clauses	191
4.5.3 Functions of CSR clauses	195
4.5.3.1 Inter-state dialogue and cooperation	195

4.5.3.2	Host-state regulation of investors	196
4.5.3.3	Balancing investor rights and obligations	199
4.5.4	Towards binding obligations for business enterprises	202
4.6	Concluding remarks	206
5	PREFERENTIAL TRADE AND INVESTMENT AGREEMENTS AND LABOUR	209
5.1	Introduction	209
5.2	Provisions addressing derogation from labour standards	210
5.2.1	Introduction	210
5.2.2	The types and functions of non-derogation clauses	211
5.2.3	The economic benchmark	213
5.2.3.1	Derogations in exporting sectors	216
5.2.3.2	Geographical distribution of trade effects	217
5.2.3.3	Character of the obligation and legal standing	217
5.2.3.4	Standard of proof	219
5.2.4	Specific characteristics of enforcement obligations	221
5.2.4.1	'Effective' enforcement of non-compliance with domestic labour law	221
5.2.4.2	Composite acts	225
5.2.4.3	Scope of enforcement obligations in monist legal systems	227
5.3	Provisions addressing the improvement of labour standards	234
5.3.1	Introduction	234
5.3.2	Types and functions of improvement clauses	234
5.3.3	The legal character of improvement clauses	237
5.3.4	Justiciability of improvement obligations and options for reform	239
5.4	Provisions addressing domestic governance issues	241
5.5	Labour rights as 'essential elements' of EU external agreements	244
5.6	Delimitations of labour provisions through federal clauses	248
5.7	Implementation and enforcement of labour provisions	252
5.7.1	Introduction	252
5.7.2	Pre-ratification impact assessments and conditionalities	252
5.7.3	Post-ratification implementation and monitoring	256
5.7.4	Dispute settlement	259
5.7.4.1	Dispute settlement under the NAALC	259
5.7.4.2	Dispute settlement in subsequent US and EU agreements	263
5.8	Relationship between ILO standards and PTIA labour provisions	268
5.8.1	Introduction	268
5.8.2	Multiplicity of labour norms and the risk of fragmentation	268
5.8.3	Systemic integration of international law	273
5.8.4	Early practice in PTIA labour disputes	276
5.8.5	Lessons from the integration of human rights and labour law	279
5.9	Concluding remarks	282

6 CONCLUSIONS	285
6.1 Introduction	285
6.2 Constraining and supporting domestic labour(-related) law	286
6.3 Interactions between international trade, investment and labour law	291
6.4 Evaluating economic perspectives in light of legal practice	297
6.5 Navigating between fair competition and fundamental rights	302
6.6 Outlook for labour standards in trade and investment agreements	307
 SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	 309
BIBLIOGRAPHY	321
TABLE OF TREATIES	343
TABLE OF CASES	351
OTHER SOURCES	359
CURRICULUM VITAE	375

List of abbreviations

AA	Association Agreement
ACP	African, Caribbean and Pacific
AFL-CIO	American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
AG	Advocate General of the European Court of Justice
ARSIWA	Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BEE	Black Economic Empowerment
BIT	Bilateral Investment Treaty
BLEU	Belgium-Luxembourg Economic Union
BP	British Petroleum
CARIFORUM	Caribbean Forum
CAS	(Conference) Committee on the Application of Standards
CEACR	Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CETA	Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement
COMESA	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa
CPTPP	Comprehensive and Progressive Agreement for Trans-Pacific Partnership
CRC	Committee on the Rights of the Child
DG	Directorate General
ECE	Evaluation Committee of Experts
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECJ	European Court of Justice
EComHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EFTA	European Free Trade Association
EPA	Economic Partnership Agreement
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FET	Fair and Equitable Treatment
FPS	Full Protection and Security
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services

GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GB	Governing Body
HRC	Human Rights Committee
HRU	Human Rights Undertaking
IALL	International Association of Labour Legislation
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICSID	International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes
IIA	International Investment Agreement
IILS	International Institute for Labour Studies
IIME Declaration	International Investment and Multinational Enterprises
IISD	International Institute for Sustainable Development
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Labour Conference
ILO	International Labour Organization
Iran-US CTR	Iran-United States Claims Tribunal
IRLR	Internationally Recognized Labour Rights
ISDS	Investor-State Dispute Settlement
ITUC	International Trade Union Confederation
LDC	Least Developed Country
MAI	Multilateral Agreement on Investment
MMDA	Model Mine Development Agreement
MNE	Multinational Enterprise
NAAEC	North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation
NAALC	North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NAO	National Administrative Office
NCP	National Contract Point
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OTLA	Office of Trade and Labor Affairs
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PPM	Process and Production Methods
PTIA	Preferential Trade and Investment Agreement
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SCM	Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
SIA	Sustainability Impact Assessment
SUTSP	Sindicato Unico de Trabajadores de la Secretaria de Pesca
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TPP	Trans-Pacific Partnership
TTIP	Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership
UAE	United Arab Emirates
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations

UNCITRAL	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNRIAA	United Nations Reports of International Arbitral Awards
USMCA	United States-Mexico-Canada Agreement
WTO	World Trade Organization