Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Trade, investment and labour: interactions in international law

Zandvliet, R.

Citation
Zandvliet, R. (2019, February 21). *Trade, investment and labour: interactions in international law*. *Meijers-reeks*. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/68881

Version:	Not Applicable (or Unknown)
License:	Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden
Downloaded from:	https://hdl.handle.net/1887/68881

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page

Universiteit Leiden

Leiden University Repository

The handle http://hdl.handle.net/1887/68881 holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Zandvliet, R.
Title: Trade, investment and labour: interactions in international law
Issue Date: 2019-02-21

Trade, Investment and Labour: Interactions in International Law

Trade, Investment and Labour: Interactions in International Law

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 21 februari 2019
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Ruben Zandvliet

geboren te Venray

in 1986

Promotor:	prof. dr. N.J Schrijver
Co-promotor:	dr. E.V. Koppe
Promotiecommissie:	prof. dr. N.M. Blokker
	prof. dr. P.F. van der Heijden
	prof. dr. F. Weiss (University of Vienna, Austria)
	prof. dr. N.M.C.P. Jägers (Universiteit Tilburg)
	prof. dr. K. Boonstra (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Lay-out: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

© 2019 R. Zandvliet

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the author.

To my mother, Diana van Herwaarden, in loving memory.

Acknowledgements

Although writing this PhD thesis sometimes felt like a solitary endeavour, I could not have done it without the support of many people. First of all, I would like to thank my promotor, Nico Schrijver. Nico sparked my interest in pursuing a PhD after my studies in Leiden and New York, and has been a wonderful supervisor throughout the years. Our mutual interest in politics provided a continuous topic of conversation and a welcome distraction from discussions about the history of the ILO or investment protection standards. I could not have wished for a better co-promotor than Erik Koppe, whose meticulous reviews of my draft texts greatly improved the research. I am honoured that my committee members, Niels Blokker, Klara Boonstra, Nicola Jägers, Paul van der Heijden and Friedl Weiss, were not only involved in the examination of my final thesis, but that I got to know all of them in different ways throughout the course of my project. In particular, I thank Paul for inviting me to a session of the ILO Committee on Freedom of Association, which allowed me to observe tripartism in action.

I thank Hanna Bosdriesz and Vid Prislan for their friendship and willingness to be my paranymphs. Hanna's passion for human rights is truly inspiring. Our conversations on Guatemala provided me with insights that no academic paper or arbitral award can provide. With Vid, I co-authored two articles on investment-labour linkage. This project has been extremely valuable to the course of my research. His profound knowledge of international investment law opened my eyes to the field of law in my research with which I was least familiar. I also thank my other former colleagues at the Leiden Law School. The Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies was a place of unity in diversity, both with regard to research topics as well as personal backgrounds. Probably my most productive weeks of writing I spent with Ingrid, Nelleke and Vestert in Renkum. The combination of kitchen-table research, long walks and Zomergasten could have lasted much longer. During the winter and spring of 2015 I had the pleasure of working at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law at the University of Cambridge as a visiting scholar. This research visit has been sponsored by the Leiden University Fund/van Beuningen Fund and the Cornelis van Vollenhoven Stichting. I am grateful for their support.

I also would like to thank two mentors outside of academia. Paul Kalma gave me the opportunity to take my first steps in the political arena as well as the business and human rights field. Maria Anne van Dijk proves every

day that corporate activism on the Zuidas can thrive. I am proud to be part of the journey.

Finally, I would like to thank my family. There are no words to describe my gratitude to Heike for giving me so much space to finish my research and for all the other ways in which she has supported me over the last years. Lauren and David have truly enriched our lives. I am looking forward to spending my weekends reading fairy tales instead of law journals, and to all other wonderful things that lie ahead.

Ruben Zandvliet
November 2018

Table of contents

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS XV

1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Research question, scope and academic context of the study 4
1.3 Sources and methodology 9
1.4 Thesis outline 12

2 ECONOMIC COMPETITION AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF INTERNATIONAL LABOUR LAW 15
2.1 Introduction 15
2.2 The origins of international labour law 16
2.2.1 Introduction 16
2.2.2 Economic competition and the need for international cooperation 16
2.2.3 The quid pro quo between improving labour standards and tariff reductions 19
2.2.4 The International Association of Labour Legislation and the emergence of multilateralism 21
2.3 The International Labour Organization 25
2.3.1 Introduction 25
2.3.2 The establishment of the ILO and its institutional framework 25
2.3.3 The purpose of the ILO 28
2.3.3.1 Early perspectives: social justice and the coordination problem 28
2.3.3.2 Contemporary perspectives: fundamental rights and sustainable development 31
2.3.4 The legal framework 34
2.3.4.1 Conventions 34
2.3.4.2 Recommendations 37
2.3.4.3 Flexibility of international labour standards 38
2.3.4.4 The 1998 Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work 41
2.3.4.5 Labour standards as part of customary international law 45
2.4 Implementation of ILO standards 48
2.4.1 Introduction 48
2.4.2 The ILO supervisory procedures 48

2.4.2.1 Structure of ILO supervisory procedures 48
2.4.2.2 The Myanmar complaint and economic countermeasures 52
2.4.3 Interpretation of ILO Conventions 55
2.4.4 Perspectives on the effectiveness of the ILO in relation to the trade-labour debate 59
2.5 Concluding remarks 62

3 Multilateral Trade Law and Labour 65
3.1 Introduction 65
3.2 Introduction to multilateral trade-labour linkage 66
3.2.1 Introduction 66
3.2.2 Labour and employment in the Havana Charter 66
3.2.3 Labour and employment in the GATT and WTO era 72
3.2.3.1 The quest for a labour clause 72
3.2.3.2 The difference between labour clauses and labour-related trade measures 76
3.2.3.3 Defining 'fair labour standards' in trade law 78
3.3 Labour-related trade measures under WTO law 80
3.3.1 Introduction 80
3.3.2 Foreign labour conditions as unfair trade practices 80
3.3.2.1 Social dumping 80
3.3.2.2 Subsidies 84
3.3.3 Foreign labour conditions as nullification and impairment of benefits 86
3.3.4 Trade measures in response to foreign labour conditions 89
3.3.4.1 PPMs and a typology of labour-related measures 89
3.3.4.2 Labour-related trade measures under the GATT 91
3.3.4.3 Labour-related trade measures under the TBT Agreement 92
3.3.4.4 The definition of 'like' products in WTO law 95
3.4 Justifications under the GATT general exceptions clause 98
3.4.1 Introduction 98
3.4.2 Article XX(a): The protection of public morals 99
3.4.2.1 International labour standards as public morals 99
3.4.2.2 Addressing foreign labour conditions through domestic consumer concerns 102
3.4.3 Article XX (b): The protection of human life or health 106
3.4.4 Article XX(d): Securing compliance with non-inconsistent laws or regulations 109
3.4.5 Article XX(e): Products of prison labour 111
3.4.6 The *chapeau*-test 115
3.4.6.1 Arbitrary or unjustifiable discrimination 115
3.4.6.2 Disguised restriction on international trade 117
3.5 Labour conditionality in the Generalized System of Preferences 119
3.5.1 Introduction 119
3.5.2 The Generalized System of Preferences 119

3.5.2.1 Article I GATT and the Enabling Clause 119
3.5.2.2 The *EC–Tariff Preferences* case and the notion of 'development needs' 120
3.5.3 Labour conditionality in the United States' GSP 123
3.5.4 Labour conditionality in the European Union's GSP 125
3.6 Concluding remarks 132

4 International Investment Law and Labour 135
4.1 Introduction 135
4.2 Introduction to investment-labour linkage 137
4.2.1 Introduction 137
4.2.2 The deregulation of labour 137
4.2.3 The regulation of labour 140
4.2.4 The regulation of investors 144
4.3 Investment protection standards in relation to labour regulation 146
4.3.1 Introduction 146
4.3.2 Direct and indirect expropriation 147
4.3.2.1 Background of the norm 147
4.3.2.2 Taxonomy of treaty interpretation 147
4.3.2.3 Police powers, legitimate public welfare objectives, and labour 150
4.3.3 Fair and equitable treatment 152
4.3.3.1 Background of the norm 152
4.3.3.2 Legitimate expectations and labour 156
4.3.3.3 Expectations based on violations of international labour standards 163
4.3.3.4 Violations of labour standards as a breach of the FET standard 165
4.3.4 Full protection and security 166
4.3.5 Non-discrimination 168
4.4 Strategies to increase host states' regulatory autonomy 171
4.4.1 Introduction 171
4.4.2 Legislative strategies 172
4.4.2.1 The object and purpose of IIAs 172
4.4.2.2 General right to regulate provisions 176
4.4.2.3 General exception clauses 178
4.4.2.4 The effect of inter-state labour obligations on investor protection standards 181
4.4.3 Interpretative issues 184
4.4.3.1 Standard of review and deference 184
4.4.3.2 Systemic integration of international law 186
4.5 Provisions addressing the conduct of investors 191
4.5.1 Introduction 191
4.5.2 Types of CSR clauses 191
4.5.3 Functions of CSR clauses 195
4.5.3.1 Inter-state dialogue and cooperation 195

4.5.3.2 Host-state regulation of investors 196
4.5.3.3 Balancing investor rights and obligations 199
4.5.4 Towards binding obligations for business enterprises 202
4.6 Concluding remarks 206

5 Preferential Trade and Investment Agreements and Labour 209
5.1 Introduction 209
5.2 Provisions addressing derogation from labour standards 210
5.2.1 Introduction 210
5.2.2 The types and functions of non-derogation clauses 211
5.2.3 The economic benchmark 213
5.2.3.1 Derogations in exporting sectors 216
5.2.3.2 Geographical distribution of trade effects 217
5.2.3.3 Character of the obligation and legal standing 217
5.2.3.4 Standard of proof 219
5.2.4 Specific characteristics of enforcement obligations 221
5.2.4.1 'Effective' enforcement of non-compliance with domestic labour law 221
5.2.4.2 Composite acts 225
5.2.4.3 Scope of enforcement obligations in monist legal systems 227
5.3 Provisions addressing the improvement of labour standards 234
5.3.1 Introduction 234
5.3.2 Types and functions of improvement clauses 234
5.3.3 The legal character of improvement clauses 237
5.3.4 Justiciability of improvement obligations and options for reform 239
5.4 Provisions addressing domestic governance issues 241
5.5 Labour rights as 'essential elements' of EU external agreements 244
5.6 Delimitations of labour provisions through federal clauses 248
5.7 Implementation and enforcement of labour provisions 252
5.7.1 Introduction 252
5.7.2 Pre-ratification impact assessments and conditionalities 252
5.7.3 Post-ratification implementation and monitoring 256
5.7.4 Dispute settlement 259
5.7.4.1 Dispute settlement under the NAALC 259
5.7.4.2 Dispute settlement in subsequent US and EU agreements 263
5.8 Relationship between ILO standards and PTIA labour provisions 268
5.8.1 Introduction 268
5.8.2 Multiplicity of labour norms and the risk of fragmentation 268
5.8.3 Systemic integration of international law 273
5.8.4 Early practice in PTIA labour disputes 276
5.8.5 Lessons from the integration of human rights and labour law 279
5.9 Concluding remarks 282

6 CONCLUSIONS 285
6.1 Introduction 285
6.2 Constraining and supporting domestic labour(-related) law 286
6.3 Interactions between international trade, investment and labour law 291
6.4 Evaluating economic perspectives in light of legal practice 297
6.5 Navigating between fair competition and fundamental rights 302
6.6 Outlook for labour standards in trade and investment agreements 307

SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY) 309
BIBLIOGRAPHY 321
TABLE OF TREATIES 343
TABLE OF CASES 351
OTHER SOURCES 359
CURRICULUM VITAE 375

List of abbreviations

AA	Association Agreement
ACP	African, Caribbean and Pacific
AFL-CIO	American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
AG	Advocate General of the European Court of Justice
ARSIWA	Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BEE	Black Economic Empowerment
BIT	Bilateral Investment Treaty
BLEU	Belgium-Luxembourg Economic Union
BP	British Petroleum
CARIFORUM	Caribbean Forum
CAS	(Conference) Committee on the Application of Standards
CEACR	Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CETA	Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement
COMESA	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa
CPTPP	Comprehensive and Progressive Agreement for Trans-Pacific Partnership
CRC	Committee on the Rights of the Child
DG	Directorate General
ECE	Evaluation Committee of Experts
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECJ	European Court of Justice
EComHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EFTA	European Free Trade Association
EPA	Economic Partnership Agreement
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FET	Fair and Equitable Treatment
FPS	Full Protection and Security
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services

GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GB	Governing Body
HRC	Human Rights Committee
HRU	Human Rights Undertaking
IALL	International Association of Labour Legislation
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICSID	International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes
IIA	International Investment Agreement
IILS	International Institute for Labour Studies
IIME Declaration	International Investment and Multinational Enterprises
IISD	International Institute for Sustainable Development
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Labour Conference
ILO	International Labour Organization
Iran-US CTR	Iran-United States Claims Tribunal
IRLR	Internationally Recognized Labour Rights
ISDS	Investor-State Dispute Settlement
ITUC	International Trade Union Confederation
LDC	Least Developed Country
MAI	Multilateral Agreement on Investment
MMDA	Model Mine Development Agreement
MNE	Multinational Enterprise
NAAEC	North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation
NAALC	North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NAO	National Administrative Office
NCP	National Contract Point
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OTLA	Office of Trade and Labor Affairs
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PPM	Process and Production Methods
PTIA	Preferential Trade and Investment Agreement
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SCM	Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
SIA	Sustainability Impact Assessment
SUTSP	Sindicato Unico de Trabajadores de la Secretaria de Pesca
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TPP	Trans-Pacific Partnership
TTIP	Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership
UAE	United Arab Emirates
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations

UNCITRAL	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNRIAA	United Nations Reports of International Arbitral Awards
USMCA	United States-Mexico-Canada Agreement
WTO	World Trade Organization