



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Breaking of ensemble equivalence for complex networks

Roccaverde, A.

Citation

Roccaverde, A. (2018, December 5). *Breaking of ensemble equivalence for complex networks*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/67095>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/67095>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The following handle holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation:

<http://hdl.handle.net/1887/67095>

Author: Roccaverde, A.

Title: Breaking of ensemble equivalence for complex networks

Issue Date: 2018-12-05

Bibliography

- [1] K. Anand and G. Bianconi. Entropy measures for networks: Toward an information theory of complex topologies. *Phys. Rev. E*, 80:045102, Oct 2009.
- [2] K. Anand and G. Bianconi. Gibbs entropy of network ensembles by cavity methods. *Phys. Rev. E*, 82:011116, Jul 2010.
- [3] D. Aristoff and L. Zhu. Asymptotic structure and singularities in constrained directed graphs. *Stochastic Process. Appl.*, 125(11):4154–4177, 2015.
- [4] D. Aristoff and L. Zhu. On the phase transition curve in a directed exponential random graph model. *Adv. in Appl. Probab.*, 50(1):272–301, 2018.
- [5] R. Arratia and T. M. Liggett. How likely is an i.i.d. degree sequence to be graphical? *Ann. Appl. Probab.*, 15(1B):652–670, 2005.
- [6] R. Balian. *From microphysics to macrophysics: methods and applications of statistical physics. Vol. II.* Theoretical and Mathematical Physics. Springer, Berlin, 2007.
- [7] J. Barré and B. Gonçalves. Ensemble inequivalence in random graphs. *Phys. A*, 386(1):212–218, 2007.
- [8] J. Barré, D. Mukamel, and S. Ruffo. Inequivalence of ensembles in a system with long-range interactions. *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 87:030601, Jun 2001.
- [9] A. Barvinok and J. A. Hartigan. The number of graphs and a random graph with a given degree sequence. *Random Struct. Algor.*, 42(3):301–348, 2013.
- [10] E. A. Bender. The asymptotic number of non-negative integer matrices with given row and column sums. *Discrete Math.*, 10:217–223, 1974.
- [11] E. A. Bender and E. R. Canfield. The asymptotic number of labeled graphs with given degree sequences. *J. Comb. Theory Ser. A*, 24(3):296–307, 1978.
- [12] S. Bhamidi, G. Bresler, and A. Sly. Mixing time of exponential random graphs. *Ann. Appl. Probab.*, 21(6):2146–2170, 2011.
- [13] G. Bianconi. Statistical mechanics of multiplex networks: Entropy and overlap. *Phys. Rev. E*, 87:062806, Jun 2013.
- [14] G. Bianconi, A. C. C. Coolen, and C. J. Perez Vicente. Entropies of complex networks with hierarchically constrained topologies. *Phys. Rev. E (3)*, 78(1):016114, 11, 2008.

-
- [15] M. Blume, V. J. Emery, and R. B. Griffiths. Ising model for the λ transition and phase separation in he^3 - he^4 mixtures. *Phys. Rev. A*, 4:1071–1077, Sep 1971.
 - [16] S. Boccaletti, G. Bianconi, R. Criado, C. I. del Genio, J. Gómez-Gardeñes, M. Romance, I. Sendiña Nadal, Z. Wang, and M. Zanin. The structure and dynamics of multilayer networks. *Phys. Rep.*, 544(1):1–122, 2014.
 - [17] M. Boguñá, R. Pastor-Satorras, and A. Vespignani. Cut-offs and finite size effects in scale-free networks. *Eur. Phys. J. B*, 38(2):205–209, Mar 2004.
 - [18] B. Bollobás. A probabilistic proof of an asymptotic formula for the number of labelled regular graphs. *European J. Combin.*, 1(4):311–316, 1980.
 - [19] L. Boltzmann. Ueber die mechanischen Analogien des zweiten Hauptsatzes der Thermodynamik. *J. Reine Angew. Math.*, 100:201–212, 1887.
 - [20] C. Borgs, J. T. Chayes, L. Lovász, V. T. Sós, and K. Vesztergombi. Convergent sequences of dense graphs. I. Subgraph frequencies, metric properties and testing. *Adv. Math.*, 219(6):1801–1851, 2008.
 - [21] C. Borgs, J. T. Chayes, L. Lovász, V. T. Sós, and K. Vesztergombi. Convergent sequences of dense graphs II. Multiway cuts and statistical physics. *Ann. of Math. (2)*, 176(1):151–219, 2012.
 - [22] G. Caldarelli. *Scale-Free Networks: Complex Webs in Nature and Technology*. Oxford University Press, 2007.
 - [23] A. Campa, T. Dauxois, D. Fanelli, and S. Ruffo. *Physics of long-range interacting systems*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014.
 - [24] A. Campa, T. Dauxois, and S. Ruffo. Statistical mechanics and dynamics of solvable models with long-range interactions. *Phys. Rep.*, 480(3-6):57–159, 2009.
 - [25] P. J. Carrington, J. Scott, and S. Wasserman. *Models and Methods in Social Network Analysis*, volume 28. Cambridge University Press, 2005.
 - [26] S. Chatterjee. An introduction to large deviations for random graphs. *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. (N.S.)*, 53(4):617–642, 2016.
 - [27] S. Chatterjee. *Large deviations for random graphs*, volume 2197 of *Lecture Notes in Mathematics*. Springer, Cham, 2017.
 - [28] S. Chatterjee and A. Dembo. Nonlinear large deviations. *Adv. Math.*, 299:396 – 450, 2016.
 - [29] S. Chatterjee and P. Diaconis. Estimating and understanding exponential random graph models. *Ann. Statist.*, 41(5):2428–2461, 2013.
 - [30] S. Chatterjee, P. Diaconis, and A. Sly. Random graphs with a given degree sequence. *Ann. Appl. Probab.*, 21(4):1400–1435, 2011.

- [31] S. Chatterjee and S. R. S. Varadhan. The large deviation principle for the erdős-rényi random graph. *European J. Combin.*, 32(7):1000–1017, 2011.
- [32] Chavanis, P. H. Gravitational instability of isothermal and polytropic spheres. *A&A*, 401(1):15–42, 2003.
- [33] F. Chung and L. Lu. The average distances in random graphs with given expected degrees. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 99(25):15879–15882, 2002.
- [34] G. D’Agostino and A. Scala. *Networks of Networks: The Last Frontier of Complexity*, volume 340. Springer, 2014.
- [35] M. D’Agostino, F. Gulminelli, P. Chomaz, M. Bruno, F. Cannata, R. Bougault, F. Gramagna, I. Iori, N. L. Neindre, G. Margagliotti, A. Moroni, and G. Vannini. Negative heat capacity in the critical region of nuclear fragmentation: an experimental evidence of the liquid-gas phase transition. *Phys. Lett. B*, 473(3):219 – 225, 2000.
- [36] A. Dembo and E. Lubetzky. A large deviation principle for the erdős-rényi uniform random graph. *arXiv:1804.11327*.
- [37] F. den Hollander, M. Mandjes, A. Roccaverde, and N. Starreveld. Breaking of ensemble equivalence for perturbed erdős-rényi random graphs. *arXiv:1807.07750*.
- [38] F. den Hollander, M. Mandjes, A. Roccaverde, and N. J. Starreveld. Ensemble equivalence for dense graphs. *Electron. J. Probab.*, 23:Paper No. 12, 26, 2018.
- [39] P. Diao, D. Guillot, A. Khare, and B. Rajaratnam. Differential calculus on graphon space. *J. Combin. Theory Ser. A*, 133:183–227, 2015.
- [40] R. S. Ellis, K. Haven, and B. Turkington. Large deviation principles and complete equivalence and nonequivalence results for pure and mixed ensembles. *J. Statist. Phys.*, 101(5-6):999–1064, 2000.
- [41] R. S. Ellis, K. Haven, and B. Turkington. Nonequivalent statistical equilibrium ensembles and refined stability theorems for most probable flows. *Nonlinearity*, 15(2):239–255, 2002.
- [42] P. Erdős, D. J. Kleitman, and B. L. Rothschild. Asymptotic enumeration of K_n -free graphs. pages 19–27. *Atti dei Convegni Lincei*, No. 17, 1976.
- [43] S. Fortunato. Community detection in graphs. *Phys. Rep.*, 486(3-5):75–174, 2010.
- [44] P. Fronczak, A. Fronczak, and M. Bujok. Exponential random graph models for networks with community structure. *Phys. Rev. E*, 88:032810, Sep 2013.
- [45] D. Garlaschelli. The weighted random graph model. *New J. Phys.*, 11(7):073005, 2009.

-
- [46] D. Garlaschelli, S. E. Ahnert, T. M. A. Fink, and G. Caldarelli. Low-temperature behaviour of social and economic networks. *Entropy*, 15(8):3148–3169, 2013.
 - [47] D. Garlaschelli, F. den Hollander, and A. Roccaverde. Complexe netwerken vanuit fysisch perspectief. *Nieuw Arch. Wisk.*, 5/16(3):207–209, 2015.
 - [48] D. Garlaschelli, F. den Hollander, and A. Roccaverde. Ensemble nonequivalence in random graphs with modular structure. *J. Phys. A*, 50(1):015001, 35, 2017.
 - [49] D. Garlaschelli, F. den Hollander, and A. Roccaverde. Statistical physics. <http://www.networkpages.nl/statistical-physics/>, 2017.
 - [50] D. Garlaschelli, F. den Hollander, and A. Roccaverde. Covariance structure behind breaking of ensemble equivalence in random graphs. *J. Stat. Phys.*, Jul 2018.
 - [51] D. Garlaschelli and M. I. Loffredo. Maximum likelihood: Extracting unbiased information from complex networks. *Phys. Rev. E*, 78:015101, Jul 2008.
 - [52] V. Gemmetto and D. Garlaschelli. Multiplexity versus correlation: the role of local constraints in real multiplexes. *Nature*, 5:9120, Mar 2015.
 - [53] J. W. Gibbs. *Elementary Principles of Statistical Mechanics*. Yale University Press, New Haven, Connecticut, 1902.
 - [54] J. W. Gibbs. *Elementary principles in statistical mechanics: developed with especial reference to the rational foundation of thermodynamics*. Dover publications, Inc., New York, 1960.
 - [55] C. Greenhill, B. D. McKay, and X. Wang. Asymptotic enumeration of sparse 0-1 matrices with irregular row and column sums. *J. Combin. Theory Ser. A*, 113(2):291–324, 2006.
 - [56] P. Hertel and W. Thirring. A soluble model for a system with negative specific heat. *Ann. Phys.*, 63(2):520 – 533, 1971.
 - [57] P. W. Holland, K. B. Laskey, S. Leinhardt, and and. Stochastic blockmodels: first steps. *Soc. Networks*, 5(2):109–137, 1983.
 - [58] P. Holme and J. Saramäki. Temporal networks. *Phys. Rep.*, 519(3):97 – 125, 2012.
 - [59] K. Huang. *Statistical mechanics*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc., New York, second edition, 1987.
 - [60] I. Ipsen and D. Lee. Determinant approximations. *arXiv:1105.0437*.
 - [61] E. T. Jaynes. Information theory and statistical mechanics. *Phys. Rev. (2)*, 106:620–630, 1957.

- [62] B. Karrer and M. E. J. Newman. Stochastic blockmodels and community structure in networks. *Phys. Rev. E* (3), 83(1):016107, 10, 2011.
- [63] R. Kenyon, C. Radin, K. Ren, and L. Sadun. Multipodal structure and phase transitions in large constrained graphs. *J. Stat. Phys.*, 168(2):233–258, Jul 2017.
- [64] R. Kenyon, C. Radin, K. Ren, and L. Sadun. The phases of large networks with edge and triangle constraints. *J. Phys. A*, 50(43):435001, 22, 2017.
- [65] R. Kenyon, C. Radin, K. Ren, and L. Sadun. The phases of large networks with edge and triangle constraints. *J. Phys. A*, 50(43):435001, 2017.
- [66] R. Kenyon, C. Radin, K. Ren, and L. Sadun. Bipodal structure in oversaturated random graphs. *Int. Math. Res. Notices*, 2018(4):1009–1044, 2018.
- [67] R. Kenyon and M. Yin. On the asymptotics of constrained exponential random graphs. *J. Appl. Probab.*, 54(1):165–180, 2017.
- [68] L. D. Landau and E. M. Lifshitz. *Course of theoretical physics. Vol. 5: Statistical physics*. Pergamon Press, Oxford-Edinburgh-New York, 1968.
- [69] L. Lovász and B. Szegedy. Limits of dense graph sequences. *J. Combin. Theory Ser. B*, 96(6):933–957, 2006.
- [70] E. Lubetzky and Y. Zhao. On replica symmetry of large deviations in random graphs. *Rand. Struct. Algor.*, 47(1):109–146, 2015.
- [71] E. Lubetzky and Y. Zhao. On the variational problem for upper tails in sparse random graphs. *Rand. Struct. Algor.*, 50(3):420–436, 2017.
- [72] D. Lynden-Bell. Negative specific heat in astronomy, physics and chemistry. *Phys. A*, 263(1):293 – 304, 1999.
- [73] D. Lynden-Bell, R. Wood, and A. Royal. The gravo-thermal catastrophe in isothermal spheres and the onset of red-giant structure for stellar systems. *Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc.*, 138(4):495–525, 1968.
- [74] R. Mastrandrea, T. Squartini, G. Fagiolo, and D. Garlaschelli. Enhanced reconstruction of weighted networks from strengths and degrees. *New J. Phys.*, 16(4):043022, 2014.
- [75] R. Mavi and M. Yin. Ground states for exponential random graphs. *J. Math. Phys.*, 59(1):013303, 14, 2018.
- [76] B. D. McKay and N. C. Wormald. Asymptotic enumeration by degree sequence of graphs with degrees $o(n^{1/2})$. *Combinatorica*, 11(4):369–382, Dec 1991.
- [77] M. Molloy and B. Reed. A critical point for random graphs with a given degree sequence. *Random Struct. Algor.*, 6(2-3):161–179, 1995.

-
- [78] M. E. J. Newman, S. H. Strogatz, and D. J. Watts. Random graphs with arbitrary degree distributions and their applications. *Phys. Rev. E*, 64:026118, Jul 2001.
 - [79] V. Nicosia, G. Bianconi, V. Latora, and M. Barthelemy. Growing multiplex networks. *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 111:058701, Jul 2013.
 - [80] J. Park and M. E. J. Newman. Solution of the two-star model of a network. *Phys. Rev. E* (3), 70(6):066146, 5, 2004.
 - [81] J. Park and M. E. J. Newman. Statistical mechanics of networks. *Phys. Rev. E*, 70:066117, Dec 2004.
 - [82] T. P. Peixoto. Entropy of stochastic blockmodel ensembles. *Phys. Rev. E*, 85:056122, May 2012.
 - [83] O. Pikhurko and A. Razborov. Asymptotic structure of graphs with the minimum number of triangles. *Combin. Probab. Comput.*, 26(1):138–160, 2017.
 - [84] M. A. Porter, J.-P. Onnela, and P. J. Mucha. Communities in networks. *Notices Amer. Math. Soc.*, 56(9):1082–1097, 2009.
 - [85] C. Radin and L. Sadun. Phase transitions in a complex network. *J. Phys. A*, 46(30):305002, 12, 2013.
 - [86] C. Radin and L. Sadun. Singularities in the entropy of asymptotically large simple graphs. *J. Stat. Phys.*, 158(4):853–865, 2015.
 - [87] C. Radin and M. Yin. Phase transitions in exponential random graphs. *Ann. Appl. Probab.*, 23(6):2458–2471, 2013.
 - [88] A. A. Razborov. On the minimal density of triangles in graphs. *Combin. Probab. Comput.*, 17(4):603–618, 2008.
 - [89] F. Reif. *Fundamentals of Statistical and Thermal Physics*. McGraw Hill, Tokyo, 1965.
 - [90] A. Roccaverde. Is breaking of ensemble equivalence monotone in the number of constraints? *Indagationes Mathematicae*, 2018.
 - [91] S. R. A. Salinas. *Introduction to statistical physics*. Graduate Texts in Contemporary Physics. Springer-Verlag, New York, 2001.
 - [92] T. Squartini, J. de Mol, F. den Hollander, and D. Garlaschelli. Breaking of ensemble equivalence in networks. *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 115:268701, Dec 2015.
 - [93] T. Squartini and D. Garlaschelli. Reconnecting statistical physics and combinatorics beyond ensemble equivalence. *arXiv:1710.11422*.
 - [94] T. Squartini and D. Garlaschelli. Analytical maximum-likelihood method to detect patterns in real networks. *New Jour. Phys.*, 13(8):083001, 2011.

- [95] T. Squartini, R. Mastrandrea, and D. Garlaschelli. Unbiased sampling of network ensembles. *New. J. Phys.*, 17(2):023052, 2015.
- [96] W. Thirring. Systems with negative specific heat. *Z. Phys. A-Hadron. Nucl.*, 235(4):339–352, Aug 1970.
- [97] H. Touchette. Equivalence and nonequivalence of ensembles: thermodynamic, macrostate, and measure levels. *J. Stat. Phys.*, 159(5):987–1016, 2015.
- [98] H. Touchette, R. S. Ellis, and B. Turkington. An introduction to the thermodynamic and macrostate levels of nonequivalent ensembles. *Phys. A*, 340(1-3):138–146, 2004. News and expectations in thermostatics.
- [99] R. van der Hofstad. *Random graphs and complex networks. Vol. 1*. Cambridge Series in Statistical and Probabilistic Mathematics, [43]. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2017.
- [100] Y. H. Wang. On the number of successes in independent trials. *Statist. Sinica*, 3(2):295–312, 1993.
- [101] M. Yin. Critical phenomena in exponential random graphs. *J. Stat. Phys.*, 153(6):1008–1021, 2013.
- [102] M. Yin. Large deviations and exact asymptotics for constrained exponential random graphs. *Electron. Commun. Probab.*, 20:no. 56, 14, 2015.
- [103] M. Yin and L. Zhu. Asymptotics for sparse exponential random graph models. *Braz. J. Probab. Stat.*, 31(2):394–412, 2017.
- [104] X.-D. Zhang. The smallest eigenvalue for reversible Markov chains. *Linear Algebra Appl.*, 383:175–186, 2004.
- [105] L. Zhu. Asymptotic structure of constrained exponential random graph models. *J. Stat. Phys.*, 166(6):1464–1482, 2017.
- [106] R. M. Ziff, G. E. Uhlenbeck, and M. Kac. The ideal Bose-Einstein gas, revisited. *Phys. Rep.*, 32C(4):169–248, 1977.