Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

A Transmission and its transformation : the Liqujing shibahui mantuluo in Daigoji

Hunter, H.J.

Citation
Hunter, H. J. (2018, September 26). *A Transmission and its transformation : the Liqujing shibahui mantuluo in Daigoji*. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/65999

Version:	Not Applicable (or Unknown)
License:	Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden
Downloaded from:	https://hdl.handle.net/1887/65999

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page

Universiteit Leiden

The handle http://hdl.handle.net/1887/65999 holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Hunter, H.J.
Title: A Transmission and its transformation : the Liqujing shibahui mantuluo in Daigoji
Issue Date: 2018-09-26

CHAPTER ONE: THE *LIQUSHI* AND THE *LIQUJING MANTULUO*

INTRODUCTION

The historical record seems to indicate that the early Heian Shingon monk Shūei 宗叡 (809–884) brought two differing exemplars of the *Liqujing* 理趣經 set of eighteen mandalas from China to Japan after his travels there (862–865).[1] One, the original of which is presently in Ishiyamadera 石山寺, is dated the fifth year of the Chinese reign period Xiantong 咸通 (864).[2] Names written with Chinese characters mark the positions of the figures in this set of mandalas. The other survives as a copy from the second year of the Japanese reign period Antei 2 安貞二年 (1228), now at Daigoji 醍醐寺.[3] This exemplar, a type called a "great mandala" 大曼荼羅 (*mahāmaṇḍala*), provides physical representations of the different figures that make up the mandalas.

According to Shingon school tradition the iconography of the Daigoji exemplar is based on Amoghavajra's 不空 (705–774) commentary to his translation of the *Liqujing*, the *Liqushi* 理趣釋. In the later Shingon school the iconographic authority of the Daigoji exemplar said to have been introduced by Shūei derives from the school's canonized Amoghavajra transmission.[4] On the other hand, the Ishiyamadera exemplar, an original Tang dynasty document with a precise date, is never mentioned by later scholar-monks. This is because the set lay unknown in the temple archives until its discovery during preparation for the publication of materials for the *Iconographical Supplement* of the *Taishō* 大正新修大藏經圖像部 (*Taishō shinshū daizōkyō zuzōbu*) in the 1930s.[5] Modern researchers, such as Hatta Yukio, fail to discuss the Ishiyamadera exemplar; Ono Genmyō and Fukuda Ryōsei, who do notice it, assert that the Ishiyamadera mandalas do not correspond with the *Liqushi*.[6]

Thus, the Shingon school's official account—that Shūei brought back a copy of the Daigoji exemplar, and that the Daigoji exemplar and Amoghavajra's commentary are closely related—has never been questioned.[7] Nevertheless, it cannot be true. No matter where we turn, whether to the historical record or to the contents of the texts and mandalas, the official account falls apart on close examination, leaving us with more questions than answers.

The first problem is with the claim that Shūei was responsible for introducing a set of the eighteen mandalas to Japan. The ninth-century Tendai monk Annen 安然 (841–915?) is the earliest extant source to state that Shūei returned with a set of the *Liqujing mantuluo*. However, in the same text Annen records that another Tendai monk, Ennin 圓仁 (794–864), also brought back a *Liqujing* set of eighteen mandalas. Neither Shūei nor Ennin left any record of these mandala sets in the place where such information might most logically be sought: the inventories of the religious objects that they had collected in China. Neither exemplar is listed in Shūei's *Shinshosha shōrai hōmontō mokuroku* 新書寫請來法門等目錄 (Inventory of Newly Copied and Imported [Works on the) Gateway to the Teachings and Other [Topics]) or the *Zenrinji Shūeisōjō mokuroku* 禪林寺宗叡僧正目錄 (Inventory of Shūei Sōjō of Zenrinji), which is though to have been composed by Shūei's disciples. A like silence prevails throughout Ennin's lists of religious paraphernalia.[8] There is some circumstantial evidence that may be interpreted as linking Shūei to the mandala set in the Ishiyamadera.[9] Shūei's connection with the Daigoji exemplar is more problematical and will be the focus of a later chapter of this dissertation.

When we turn from the historical record to the content of the documents, further questions arise. As we have noted, the Shingon school holds that the Daigoji exemplar is based on Amoghavajra's *Liqushi*. From the standpoint of content, this is patently false: the iconography of the Daigoji set varies widely from what is described in the *Liqushi*. In contrast, the iconography of the Ishiyamadera set corresponds reasonably well to Amoghavajra's text, though a number of inconsistencies remain. Later scholar-monks, such as Kōzen 興然 (1120–1203) of the early medieval period and the eighteenth-century master Shinkai 眞海 (?–1770), not knowing of the existence of the Ishiyamadera document, "corrected" only the Daigoji set in order to match its iconography with Amoghavajra's commentary.

To sum up, the Shingon account of Shūei and the *Liqujing mantuluo* is wholly unreliable. To replace it with something more accurate, we must conduct a systematic investigation of both *Liqujing* sets of mandalas, and the first step of such an undertaking must be a comparative analysis of the base text and the respective images and representations. Below, we will examine several examples in detail, to further illustrate the relationship between the *Liqushi* (Amoghavajra's commentary on the *Liqujing*) and the Daigoji and Ishiyamadera exemplars.

COLLATION OF THE *LIQUSHI* AND THE DAIGOJI AND ISHIYAMADERA EXEMPLARS

The *Liqujing* presents the Tathāgata Mahāvairocana expounding the teaching of the "purity of the perfection of wisdom" 般若波羅蜜多清淨 (*prajñāpāramitā-viśuddhi*[*-pada*]).[10] This is done in successive "Stages" 段, after each of which a seed letter 種子 (*bīja*) is provided to mark the termination of the Stage and summarize its essence.

Although the seed letters are basic to the structure of Mahāvairocana's teachings, their number and placement vary between the *Liqujing* text and its commentary, the *Liqushi*. The *Liqujing* has a total of *sixteen* seed letters: fifteen of these bring to a close specific Stages, and a final seed letter wraps up the text as a whole. Amoghavajra divides his *Liqushi* into *seventeen* sections, and also delineates a mandala for the Opening Assembly. Thus the *Liqushi* prescribes a total of *eighteen* mandalas as graphic representations of the teachings of the text. The actual mandalas are based on the commentary, not the text of the scripture, since they are not explained in detail in Amoghavajra's translation of the *Liqujing*.

Collation of the *Liqushi* with the images in the two sets of mandalas shows at once that the Daigoji exemplar contains more than are prescribed by the *Liqushi*. It adds four mandalas, *Wu Daxukongzang* 五大虛空藏 (Five Great Ākāśagarbhas), *Foyan mantuluo* 佛眼曼荼羅 (Buddhalocanā mandala), *Dafoding mantuluo* 大佛頂曼荼羅 (Mahābuddhoṣnīṣa mandala), and *Airan mingwang* 愛染明王 (Rāgavidyārāja), to the text's eighteen, for a total of twenty-two.[11] The Ishiyamadera set, on the other hand, has eighteen mandalas, but the text's *Wubu juhui* 五部具會 (Assemblies of the Five Families) has been replaced by a copy of the *Jingangshou tan* 金剛手壇 (Mandala of Vajrapāṇi), which is not mentioned by Amoghavajra in the *Liqushi*. Thus, obvious discrepancies exist between the two sets of mandalas and between each and the text they are supposed to be based on. The discussion of four examples below will make the nature of these discrepancies clearer.

The Opening Mandala

The opening Stage of the *Liqujing* names the expositor of the text's teachings, describes the setting, and introduces the assembly that listens to the teachings. Mahāvairocana, the expositor, resides in a palace in the Paranirmita-vaśavartin Heaven 他化自在天王宮 at the summit of the realm of desire 欲界 (*kama-dhātu*). He is attended by a vast crowd of Bodhisattvas, headed by the Eight Great Bodhisattvas.[12] The characters and presentation are very similar to those in the opening of the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* (Compendium of the Truth of All the Tathāgatas),[13] Amoghavajra's Chinese translation of a part of a larger Indian Esoteric Buddhist scripture.[14]

Amoghavajra's translation of the *Liqujing* and the *Liqushi*, his commentary, show a systematic assimilation of Esoteric Buddhist concepts and elements into the earlier *Prajñāpāramitā* tradition.[15] The *Liqushi* discloses an obvious re-interpretation of the *Prajñānpāramitā* teachings within the framework of an Esoteric Buddhist corpus that Amoghavajra referred to as the *Jingangding yuqie shibahui* 金剛頂瑜伽十八會 (Eighteen Assemblies of the Yoga of the Adamantine Crown) and which he made a summary of after his return to China in 746 from his trip to India.[16] Amoghavajra's *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* translates a part of the first chapter in the First of the Eighteen Assemblies of Yoga of the Adamantine Crown.[17] The Esoteric Buddhist system to which this First Assembly belongs, as well as other assemblies of this system, underlies the teachings of Amoghavajra's translation of the *Liqujing* and his *Liqushi* commentary.

There are a number of differences between the opening scenes of the *Liqujing* and the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. For instance, the settings are not the same. In the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*, Mahāvairocana resides in the palace of the ruler of the Akaniṣṭha Heaven, located at the summit of the realm of form.[18] The setting of the *Liqujing*, on the other hand, is within the realm of desire, although at its very summit, where desires have been purified.[19] Here Mahāvairocana will teach how to overcome and transform the inner demons of desires into those that will propel the practitioner upward through the more purified realms of form and formlessness, and so on to enlightenment.[20] Nevertheless, in both texts, the same group of Eight Great Bodhisattvas heads the vast assembly who listens to the Tathāgata's teachings.[21] It is important to note here that this group of Eight Great Bodhisattvas is common to the textual lineages of both the *Liqujing* and that of the Eighteen Assemblies of Yoga of the Adamantine Crown.[22]

In the *Liqushi*, Amoghavajra reformulates the elements of the *Liqujing*'s introductory Stage into a mandala.[23] The prescriptions for this opening mandala are similar to the mandala described in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. Both have four gates in the four directions, inside of which gates there are eight pillars, and a multi-storied pavilion with an adamantine pinnacle composed of jewels.[24]

Whereas the main characters of this opening scene are simply enumerated in *Liqujing* 1, in *Liqushi* 1 Amoghavaja provides a brief description of each figure as he positions them in the opening mandala. This mandala focuses upon the nine figures of Mahāvairocana and the Eight Great Bodhisattvas who surround him. It represents graphically the teachings of the following stages of the *Liqujing*, wherein Mahāvairocana will transform himself into various Buddhas and Bodhisattvas in order to elucidate his teaching from a variety of perspectives.

Thus, each figure in this first mandala embodies one of the core concepts of the teaching that Mahāvairocana will expound in subsequent stages of the *Liqujing*. At the same time, each personifies an aspect of the cosmic Buddha Mahāvairocana. Amoghavajra's *Liqushi* explains each of the Eight Great Bodhisattvas in the following way:

> [The scripture states that "he was attended by a great throng of eighty *koṭi* of Bodhisattvas..."] Each one of these Bodhisattvas had the same nature and they [also] had a throng of attendants, ten *koṭi* in number. Bodhisattva Vajrapāṇi dwells in the lunar disc in front of [Mahā]vairocana and he represents the mind of enlightenment (*bodhicitta*) of All the Tathāgatas. The one who first awakens the mind of enlightenment relies upon the empowerment 加持 (*adhiṣṭhāna*) of Vajrasattva. [Then,] cultivating and realizing the vows and practices of Samantabhadra, he attains the stage of Tathāgata.
>
> Bodhisattva Avalokiteśvara resides in the lunar disc behind [Mahā]vairocana and he represents the great compassion of All the Tathāgatas. According to the causal dictates in the six paths [of existence], he rescues all sentient beings [from] the sufferings and impurities [that are due to the rounds] of life and death. [Further,] he speedily realizes the meditative concentration (*samādhi*) of purity, he is not attached 不著 to the [rounds of] life and death and he does not attain *nirvāṇa*. All this is due to the actual realization by Avalokiteśvara of the adamantine teachings (*vajradharma*).
>
> Bodhisattva Ākāśagarbha dwells in the lunar disc to the right of [Mahā]vairocana. He represents the stocks of merit and good fortune, [as innumerable as] the grains of sand in the Ganges River, of the absolute reality 眞如 (*bhūtatathatā*) of All the Tathāgatas. Because of the cultivation of the practices of Bodhisattva Ākāśāgarbha, one performs the four types of giving 施 (*dāna*), which I shall explain later. [To give an example,] the purity of the threefold circle [of the giver, the one who receives and the gift], may be compared to empty space. The numberless [acts that are] without the defilements [produced through] causation constitute the raw materials 資粮 of the Enjoyment (*saṃbhogakāya*) and Transformation (*nirmāṇakāya*) Bodies.
>
> Bodhisattva Vajramuṣṭi [Adamantine Fist] dwells in the lunar disc to the left of [Mahā]vairocana and represents the threefold mysteries of All the Tathāgatas that lie in Bodhisattva Vajramuṣṭi's palm. Because the bodhisattva of the mantra practice enters the altar [of the mandala] and obtains consecration 灌頂 (*abhiṣeka*), he gets to hear about the practices and secret teachings of the three actions [of body, speech and mind] of the Tathāgatas. [Further,] he acquires the especially excellent attainments (*siddhi*) [that are both] mundane and supramundane. [And then,] he purifies himself by eradicating the ten unwholesome, evil deeds that are without origin and realizes the ultimate wisdom that is devoid of all obstacles.
>
> Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī dwells in the lunar disc in the southeast corner and he represents the wisdom-sword of the transcendent insight (*prajñāpāramitā*) of All the Tathāgatas 一切如來般若波羅蜜多慧劍. He resides in the three

gateways of liberation 三解脱門 and can reveal the eternalness, blissfulness, self and purity 常樂我淨 of absolute reality, the Dharma Body 法身 (*dharmakāya*). Because the Bodhisattva realizes this wisdom, he achieves universal and correct understanding, that is enlightenment].

Bodhisattva Sahacittotpādita-dharma-cakra-pravartin [the One Who Turns the Wheel of Dharma as Soon as He Has Produced the Mind of *Bodhi*] resides in the lunar disc in the southwest corner and represents the four types of wheels (mandala) of all the Tathāgatas; that is, the wheel of the Adamantine Realm 金剛界 (*vajradhātu*), the wheel of the Subjugation of the Three Worlds 降三世 (*trailokavijaya*), the wheel of Universal Conquest 遍調伏 (*sakalajagad-vinaya*) and the wheel of the Accomplishment of All Objectives 一切義成就 (*sarvārtha-siddhi*).[25] Because the bodhisattva who cultivates mantra practice can enter such wheels as these, and [because] he relies on the four seals of knowledge 四種智印, he thereby accomplishes the lives of the Sixteen Great Bodhisattvas [in the great mandalas that are expounded in the four chapters of the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*] and so realizes supreme enlightenment.

Bodhisattva Gaganagañja [Treasury (as Vast as) the Empty Sky] dwells in the northwest corner, and represents the rites of vast offerings of All the Tathāgatas. Because the bodhisattva who cultivates mantra practice performs a union of meditative concentration (*yoga samādhi*) of Gaganagañja Bodhisattva, in a single instant he is reborn before each of the Buddhas of the Realm of Reality 法界 (*dharma-dhātu*) that is as extensive as space, and in that great assembly he offers to the Tathāgatas various offerings [as numerous as] an ocean of clouds. [Moreover,] he follows all the Buddhas, listening to their expounding of the wondrous teachings. [Further,] he speedily replenishes his stocks of merit and wisdom and he uses the empty space as his storehouse. [Then,] according to the causal dictates in the various paths [of existence], he rescues and aids the many sentient beings, gradually pulling them towards supreme enlightenment by creating skillful means on their behalf.

Bodhisattva Sarvamāra-pramardin [the Destroyer of All Māras] dwells in the northeast corner and represents the great compassion (*mahākaruṇā*) and expedient means (*upāya*) of All the Tathāgatas. Outwardly he manifests great wrath, but inwardly he harbors compassion. Residing in the stage of preparatory practice, he defends and maintains the ascetic practices and sweeps away all hindrances. At the time of the attainment of enlightenment, he crushes and subdues all those beings difficult to subdue, like] the celestial Māra [of Paranirmita-vaśavartin] and Maheśvara, causing them to accept conversion and proceed towards supreme enlightenment. Using the wisdom of wrath, he thereby achieves the ultimate [stage of enlightenment].

These Eight Great Bodhisattvas, whom I have explained as above, wield the threefold teachings; these are the mind of enlightenment, great compassion and skillful means. And these Bodhisattvas, whom I have explained as above, contain [within themselves] the mantra teachings of all the Buddhas' Law, as well as the great vehicles of all the revealed [teachings].

> [The line from the scripture such that (*T*.243.8:784a29):] "a great crowd of Bodhisattvas reverently surrounded [[Mahā]vairocana]" refers to the Eight Offering and the Four Gate Bodhisattvas, and these Bodhisattvas represent the symbolic *sama*[*ya*] retinue of the Tathāgata.[26]

Nevertheless, although Amoghavajra provides a few identifying characteristics for the participants, he never gives details about hand gestures or attributes. It is precisely this kind of information that the mandala-maker needs in order to compose a mandala with figures in their anthropomorphic form. Any depiction attempted on the sole basis of this text would be far from complete.[27]

In *Liqushi* 1, the prescriptions for the opening mandala contain specifications from the mandala and text that Amoghavajra used as his reference system. The groups of the Eight Great Bodhisattvas and the Eight Offering and Four Gate Bodhisattvas appear in the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm delineated in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. The Eight Great Bodhisattvas attend on Mahāvairocana in the opening scene, and transformations of the Eight Great Bodhisattvas, the products of Mahāvairocana's special meditative concentrations (*samādhi*), are members of the thirty-seven figures that compose the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*'s Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm.[28] But the problems of the mandala-maker would not be solved by this section of the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. Like the *Liqushi*, it fails to provide sufficient information to accurately depict the figures of a great mandala.[29]

The *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* has a set pattern for the manifestation of the figures in the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm. It conveys the doctrinal concepts that the Bodhisattvas embody, as well as their mantras, symbolic forms (*samaya*) and special names, all of which are interrelated. Avalokiteśvara is one example of this. In the *Liqushi*, Amoghavajra lauds Avalokiteśvara's understanding of the adamantine teachings (*vajradharma*). In the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* Avalokiteśvara appears as Vajradharma 金剛法 (Adamantine Teachings) in the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm.[30] The lotus flower is the symbolic form of Avalotiteśvara/Vajradharma, as well as his special attribute, and this figure in the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm holds a lotus in a particular manner in order to unfold its petals. A second example is that of Mañjuśrī.[31] In the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm Mañjuśrī/Vajratīkṣṇa's attribute is the sword of wisdom.

In the opening mandala of the *Liqushi*, then, it seems all but inevitable that Avalokiteśvara will be holding a lotus and Mañjuśrī will be holding a sword. But many important details are lacking. In what hand should Avalokiteśvara/Vajradharma hold the lotus flower and which hand should perform the gesture of opening its petals? With which hand should Mañjuśrī/Vajratīkṣṇa brandish his sword? The information that Amoghavajra provides for the figures of the mandala in the opening scene of *Liqushi* 1 is insufficient to depict them at this level of detail.[32] The problem is not limited to the first part of the text. In subsequent stages of the *Liqushi*, Amoghavajra furnishes the elements essential to the ritual practice of each of the Eight Great Bodhisattvas. In addition to outlining each Bodhisattva's mandala, he explains the figure's seed syllable and the attainments (*siddhi*) that result from their ritual practice. But only occasionally does he describe hand gestures or attributes.

When we turn to the opening assembly in the Ishiyamadera exemplar, called *Piluzhena mantuluo* 毘盧遮那壇 (Vairocana's Mandala, fig. 11),[33] the figures of this mandala are represented by their names written with Chinese characters. The characters for "adamantine" 金剛

(*vajra*) prefixes all the names, including that of the central one, [Mahāvai]ro[cana] 金剛盧. This prefix indicates that the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* was Amoghavajra's source for the figures in the opening mandala of the *Liqushi*. Moreover, the names of the figures have been drawn from the names given the Bodhisattvas upon consecration in the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm, from the figures' heart mantras, or from their symbolic forms. The figures of Vajrapāṇi, Ākāśagarbha and Vajramuṣṭi are indicated by their adamantine names. Avalokiteśvara is designated Vajradharma, which is both his heart mantra and his name in the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm. Mañjuśrī is identified by his symbolic form, the adamantine sword 金剛劍. A character or two from the names of Sahacittotpādita-dharma-cakra-pravartin, Gaganagañja and Sarvamāra-pramardin are also prefixed with "adamantine."[34] The Offering and Gate Bodhisattvas are those of the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*'s Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm.[35]

The opening mandala in the Daigoji set, the *Darizun liquhui* 大日尊理趣會 (Assembly of the Guiding Principle of Venerable Mahāvairovana, fig. 1),[36] presents the figures of Mahāvairocana and the Eight Great Bodhisattvas in their anthropomorphic forms and the Offering and Gate Bodhisattvas in their symbolic forms. This depiction of the latter group of Bodhisattvas conforms to Amoghavajra's statement in the *Liqushi* (*T*.1003:608a29) where he refers to the figures of the Eight Offering and Four Gate Bodhisattvas as the Tathagata's "*samaya* family" 三昧眷屬; that is, the figures of his retinue represented in their symbolic forms. In this opening mandala Mahāvairocana forms the Mudrā of Meditation 定印, which characterizes the figure of Mahāvairocana in all the matrix mandalas of the Sino-Japanese tradition. Given the fact that Amoghavajra's commentary contains numerous references to the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*, it stands to reason that the figures would hold attributes and form hand gestures that are stipulated in this text and depicted in mandalas based upon this text. Thus, one would expect that Mahāvairocana in this opening mandala would form the Mudrā of the Fist of Wisdom 智拳印, Mahāvairocana's usual mudrā in the Sino-Japanese tradition of the mandalas of the adamantine realm. There are other discrepancies. For example, although Bodhisattva Avalokiteśvara holds a flower as though about to unfold its petals, Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī does *not* hold a sword.[37]

In contrast to the iconography of the Ishiyamadera set, which appears more closely based on the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* because it does not represent the figures in the mandalas pictorially, the iconography of the Daigoji set of mandalas has elements drawn from a number of different visual sources, not all of them related to the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. Thus, while neither of the mandalas follows their alleged source text in every detail, the Ishiyamadera exemplar is a far better fit than the Daigoji set, whose inspiration seems definitely eclectic. We will discuss three further examples in detail below to reinforce this conclusion.

The Mahāvairocana Mandala (*Liqushi* Stage 2)

In the *Liqushi*, Amoghavajra provides detailed specifications for mandalas in its Stages 2, 3, 7, and 9. *Liqushi* 2 deals with Mahāvairocana's enlightenment, the "highest, perfect awakening" 現等覺 (*abhisaṃbodhi)*, and how such a state is to be attained.

Liqujing 1 presents the goal of the text's teachings. Vajrasattva and his Bodhisattva retinue symbolize a process of awaking to one's innate purity. Because it is an enlightened mind that realizes the inherent purity of all elements of reality (*dharmas*), *Liqujing* 2 begins with an

exposition of the contents of Mahāvairocana's enlightenment. Mahāvairocana elucidates this by describing the four types of wisdom that he has acquired: the perfect awakening to the equality of the thunderbolt (*vajra*), the perfect awakening to the equality of benefits (*artha*), the perfect awakening to the equality of the teachings (*dharma*), and the perfect awakening to the equality of all actions (*karma*). Mahāvairocana represents the summation and reintegration of these four wisdoms, called in *Liqujing* 2 the "highest perfect awakening."[38]

This omniscient state is attained by means of the yogic practices of the four wisdoms, which are based upon Yogācāra school doctrines of fourfold wisdom and the school's theory of consciousness.[39] The yogic practice of these wisdoms transforms the practitioner's defiled consciousnesses, and his passage through and mastery of each yogic meditation mark his progression from unenlightenment to the enlightened status of Mahāvairocana.

In the *Liqushi*, Amoghavajra correlates these four yogic meditations to the special meditations associated with the four Bodhisattvas Vajrasattva, Vajraratna, Vajradharma and Vajrakarma, stating that these four Bodhisattvas are the outer manifestations of the workings of Mahāvairocana's fourfold wisdom.[40] Amoghavajra's specifications for this mandala, one of the few for which he does describe mudrās in detail, are as follows:

> In the center is Buddha [Mahā]vairocana. Behind him is a solar disc. His head is crowned with a preciously ornamented crown, his body clothed in a light silk garment. He makes the Wisdom-Fist Mudrā 智拳印 and sits on the lion seat, his body is like a lunar hall. In front of Buddha [Mahā]vairocana is Vajrasattva. Behind him is a lunar disc. He wears the five-Buddha crown. In his right hand he holds a vajra staff and in his left he holds a bell. He sits in the half lotus pose. At Buddha [Mahā]vairocana's right side is Ākāśagarbha. Behind him is a lunar disc. In his right hand he holds the adamantine gem, and his left hand [forms the Mudrā of] Granting Wishes. He sits in the half lotus pose. Behind Buddha [Mahā]vairocana is Avalokiteśvara. His left hand holds the lotus, his right forms the Mudrā of Opening-and-Spreading-of-the-Flower. He also sits in the half lotus pose. At Buddha [Mahā]vairocana's left side in a lunar disc is Vajrakarma. His two hands form [the Mudrā of] the Turn-Dance 旋舞 and he places [this Mudrā] at the top of his crown.[41] In the four inner corners install the four Inner Offering [Bodhisattvas]. Each manifests her original form. In the outer four corners place the Outer Four Offering [Bodhisattvas]. Each one holds her original utensil of offering. In the four gates place the Hook, Rope, Chain and Bell Bodhisattvas. Each resides in his original majestic pose.[42]

Much concerning the mandala in this Stage of Amoghavajra's commentary has been borrowed from the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. The pentad of figures, which is the focus of this Mahāvairocana Mandala, is patterned after the mandala prescriptions given in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. As noted above, in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* and its commentary Mahāvairocana generates the Sixteen Great Bodhisattvas in four groups of four, who then take their places in the cardinal directions around their parent Buddhas.[43] The format of the Mahāvairocana Mandala reflects Mahāvairocana's method of illustrating his teachings in this and subsequent Stages of the *Liqujing*. In these *Liqujing* Stages, Mahāvairocana expounds the teaching

of each Stage in a fourfold formula of description, and he is both the source of emanation and the point of reabsorption.

This process of emanation (*utpatti krama*) and reabsorption (*utpanna krama* or *sampanna krama*) characterizes Mahāvairocana in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* as well, and is a second similarity between the two texts. For example, the process of emanation outward from Mahāvairocana produces the thirty-seven figures of the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm, the first of the six mandalas described in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. Each figure in this mandala incarnates in ever subtler ways the qualities of the central figure of Mahāvairocana. In an opposite process, that of reabsorption, the thirty-seven deities of this mandala merge into the figures of the mandala of the four seals (*caturmudrā maṇḍala*) and the single figure in the mandala of the single seal (*ekamaṇḍala*), which are the fifth and final mandala of the six prescribed in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*.[44]

The significance of the mudrās and attributes of the four Bodhisattvas is also based upon *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*. This is a third common point between these two texts. In the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* and its commentary, the *Leshu Jingangding yuqie fenbie shengwei xuizheng famen*, the mudrās and attributes of these four Bodhisattvas symbolize the attainments of the teaching and practice of each Buddha and his family. For instance, Vajrasattva's *vajra* represents the first awakening and unfolding of the practitioner's mind of enlightenment, a process that is initiated and fostered by Buddha Akṣobhya and his family members;[45] Avalokiteśvara's mudrā of opening the lotus signifies the further development of the practitioner's wisdom through the guidance and encouragement of Avalokeśvararāja and his family;[46] Vajraratna holds the gem that symbolizes the consecration that is granted by Ratnasaṃbhava and his family;[47] Vajrakarma's dancing hand gesture refers to the beneficial activities that are undertaken on the practitioner's behalf by Amoghasiddhi and his family.[48] The focus of the following four stages of the *Liqujing* and its commentary is the soteriological roles performed by these four Bodhisattvas and their families.[49]

A final common point between the *Liqujing* and the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* is the use of the mandala in the method of attaining buddhahood. Amoghavajra describes, albeit cryptically, in *Liqushi* 2 (*T*.1003:611a9-22) the process by which the practitioner should envision his mental passage through this Mahāvairocana Mandala, as well as the ritual practice (611a17-22) for which this mandala is the focus. He proclaims that (611a19-21) intensive meditation upon the figures of this mandala will enable the practitioner to eradicate all obstacles and bad *karma*, and that in this present life the practitioner will attain the stage of a bodhisattva and, after passing through sixteen births 十六生, he will attain the stage of the highest form (*dharmakāya*) of Mahāvairocana. Here Amoghavajra refers to the Sixteen Great Bodhisattvas in the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm. The practitioner acquires by means of yogic practices the special qualities and wisdoms of the Sixteen Great Bodhisattvas and, by extension, their parent Buddhas.[50]

The Daigoji mandala corresponding to Amoghavajra's description in *Liqushi* 2, the *Darizun liquhui* 大日尊理趣會 (Assembly of the Guiding Principle of the Venerable Mahāvairocana, fig. 3),[51] does not match the details given so precisely above. Mahāvairocana forms the Wisdom Fist Mudrā that is prescribed in both the *Liqujing*[52] and the *Liqushi*, but he sits on a lotus, not a lion, throne. Vajrasattva holds the *vajra* in his left hand, and his right forms the Pride Fist Mudrā 慢印; Ākāśagarbha holds the flaming jewels on a long-stemmed lotus in his left hand and a flaming sword in his right; Avalokiteśvara holds a long-stemmed lotus in his left hand, and his right hand performs a mudrā, but not that of the prescribed gesture-of-opening-the-lotus;

Vajrakarma's left hand forms the Pride Fist Mudrā and he holds a long-stemmed lotus topped with a double *vajra* in his right hand. The Inner and Outer Offering Bodhisattvas appear in their symbolic 三昧耶 (*samaya*) forms and not in their original, anthropomorphic forms, holding their "utensils of offerings." In short, the mandala and its "source" have little in common.

In the Ishiyamadera exemplar (fig. 12), there is a much better correspondence.[53] In the mandala's center Mahāvairocana is designated by the epithet "the seal of the mind of the Buddha who is adamantine and universal" 金剛遍佛心印, while he is called the "the Buddha in the Body of Enjoyment (*saṃbhogakāya*) who shines universally" 遍照報身佛 in *Liqushi* 2.[54] The notations for the mudrās and attributes on either side of the names of the Bodhisattvas in the Ishiyamadera mandala agree with Amoghavajra's mandala prescriptions. For instance, Vajrasattva's name has staff 杵 on the right side and bell 鈴 on the left.[55]

The Trailokyavijaya Mandala (*Liqushi* Stage 3)

Our demonstration of the discrepancy between the mandalas prescribed in the *Liqushi* and those of the Daigoji examplar, and, on the contrary, the faithfulness of those of the Ishiyamadera examplar, continues with the example of the Trailokyavijaya mandala prescribed in *Liqushi* 3. To situate this mandala in the third stage of the *Liqujing*'s teachings, let us first describe its doctrinal context.[56]

In *Liqujing* 3, Tathāgata Śākyamuni, who subdues those beings difficult to discipline 難調,[57] begins to expound, in the line of the *prajñāpāramita* tradition, the absence of vain discourse 無戲論 (*niṣprapañca*) on different categories, such as greed, anger, ignorance, all the *dharma*s and the *prajñāpāramitā* itself. He then declares to Bodhisattva Vajrapāṇi[58] that if one observes this teaching, then "even if one kills all beings of the three realms, one does not fall into the bad destinies. On the contrary, having subdued [these beings], he will rapidly attain the supreme, correct enlightenment." While all the versions, even the oldest one by Xuanzang, agree up to this point,[59] from here on, Amoghavajra's, and later versions, introduce the new deity, Trailokyavijaya 降三世, who actually subdues all the beings, beginning with the Hindu god Maheśvara (that is, Śiva), who cannot be converted by peaceful means. Thus, to further clarify the significance of this principle of the absence of vain discourse on all elements of reality (*dharma*s), including that of the *prajñāpāramitā* itself, Bodhisattva Vajrapāṇi knits his brows, gazes ferociously, bares sharp fangs and forms the Mudrā of Conquering the Three Worlds 降三世印. Dwelling in the stance of conquering the three worlds 降三世立相, he pronounces the adamantine seed syllable of wrath: "*Hūṃ!*"[60]

The mention of Trailokyavijaya in *Liqujing* 3 constitutes an obvious reference to the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*'s second chapter, the Chapter on Trailokyavijaya, whose main subject is the subjugation of Maheśvara by Trailokyavijaya, a wrathful form of Vajrasattva (or Mahāvairocana).[61] Although Amoghavajra did not translate the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*'s second chapter into Chinese, he describes its contents in his *Jingangding yuqie jing shibahui zhigui*. Here in fact he devotes the greatest amount of space to this Chapter on Trailokyavijaya,[62] thus stressing the importance of this theme of subjugation by wrathful means.

> Next is explained the great Chapter of Trailokyavijaya (Conqueror of the Three Worlds). It has six mandalas. After the Tathāgata had attained perfect enlightenment, had turned the Wheel of the Adamantine Realm, [that is,

> manifested the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm] on the summit of Sumeru and had given to the bodhisattvas their names and functions [in this mandala], such [gods] as Maheśvara and the like were resistant and difficult to convert, being unable to be converted by peaceful means. All the Tathāgatas, who completely filled the space of the Realm of Reality 法界, unanimously entreated Vajrasattva and paid homage to [him] with a eulogy of one hundred and eight names, [saying] "These kinds of gods cannot be converted by peaceful methods." At the time Vajrapāṇi [that is, Vajrasattva], having accepted the entreaty of the Tathāgatas, then entered into the meditative concentration of the wrathful vajra (*krodhavajra samādhi*)[63] and, manifesting a body of great majestic virtue, he subdued [them all] using a variety of skillful means and thus ended their lives. Maheśvara, having died, himself observed in the lower regions, beyond the [number of grains of] sand of sixty-two river [Ganges], a world called Adorned with Ashes 灰荘嚴 (Bhasmācchanna). In that world he attained perfect enlightenment and his name became Tathāgata King Sovereign [over] Fear 怖畏自在王. Vajradhara [that is, Vajrasattva/Vajrapāṇi] pinned [Maheśvara] down with his leg and, intoning the mantra of adamantine longevity, again brought [him] back to life. [The gods, that is Maheśvara and his consort Umā] having accepted conversion, Vajrasattva[/Vajrapāṇi] then explained [to them] the great mandala. The gods that he drew into [the mandala] received the name of adamantine (*Vajra*).[64]

Amoghavajra's *Liqushi* 3 concentrates on the mythical aspects of this universal subjugation. His commentary of this stage begins as follows:[65]

> At the time Tathāgata Śākyamuni, who subdued those beings difficult to discipline, in Jambudvīpa [during] the latter days of the Teaching's period of five pollutions, manifested the eight events [of his life story,] wherein he became a Buddha, in order to subdue those "outside the [Buddha's] way" 外道 (*tīrthika*) [who were] of ninety-five kinds. All [those "outside the [Buddha's] way"] were converted to the path of the Buddha. (...) And in the multi-storied pavilion with a pinnacle [made] of *vajra*s and gems in the Heaven of the Thirty-Three [Gods] on the summit of Mount Sumeru, Buddha [Mahā]vairocana turned the wheel of the Teachings. This wheel is fourfold; the so-called adamantine (*vajra*) wheel, the wheel of gems (*ratna*), the wheel of the teachings (*dharma*) and the wheel of actions (*karma*). These four wheels are all subsumed into two wheels, the so-called wheel of the correct teaching 正法輪 and the wheel of instruction and command 教令輪.[66] That is to say, in Jambudvīpa [Mahā]vairocana transformed [himself] into [Śākyamuni, presenting to the beings] the events of his becoming a Buddha and so saved those outside the way. Then, on the summit of Mount Sumeru he manifested a majestically wrathful form and subjugated Maheśvara and the others who, [filled] with arrogance, idleness, self and pride, erroneously believed that they possessed all wisdoms because all [such] defilements as craving, anger and delusion had perfumed [and so tainted] their store-

> consciousnesses (*ālayavijñāna*). In order to make them pure and free from defilements, [Mahāvairocana therefore manifested [the form whose] left and right feet [respectively] trampled on Maheśvara and his consort Umā.[67]

Here Mahāvairocana manifests himself first as Śākyamuni in order to convert those "outside the Buddha's way" on our continent of Jambudvīpa, and then, manifesting himself upon the summit of Mount Sumeru, he presents himself in a wrathful form in order to subjugate and save such incorrigible gods as Maheśvara. On the surface this passage seems to describe the struggles between those who follow the Buddhist path and those "outside the [Buddha's] way" who adhere to non-Buddhist doctrines and heretical views. This Buddhist drama was patterned after the cosmic battle between Durga, the wrathful form of Śiva's consort Umā, and the Asura Śumbha and Niśumba that is recounted in the *Devīmāhātmya*.[68] Iyanaga Nobumi suggests that an independent version of the submission of Maheśvara and his followers might have been presented originally as a theatrical piece, used to demonstrate the conversion of the Hindu deities to the Buddhist faith.[69] Scholars have interpreted this Buddhist drama in the Indian context, especially the version presented in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*, as testimony to the struggle between Buddhist and Śaiva factions.[70]

In China, and even more so in Japan, where this historical reality of the rivalry between Śaivism and Esoteric Buddhism in India was not felt, this myth tended to be interpreted in moral terms. Thus, when a version of this mythical drama was first presented in Śubhākarasiṃha's and Yixing's *Dapiluzhena chengfojing shu* (Commentary on the *Vairocanābhisaṃbodhi sūtra*), where the subduer is Acala instead of Trailokyavijaya, it is summarized with the statement that Maheśvara, the lord of the three thousand worlds, is in fact "the beings' own mind 自心, that is to say, the stage of dwelling in ignorance without beginning."[71] The fundamental problem in Buddhism is the elimination of the inner hindrances of passions, which are the cause of all suffering and which impede the attainment of enlightenment. The inner hindrances that disturb the mind are known as the three poisons 三毒 (*tridoṣa*) of craving 貪 (*rāga*), anger 瞋 (*dveṣa*) and delusion 癡 (*moha*). According to the *Liqushi*, because of their three poisons, sentient beings are destined to transmigrate endlessly through the three realms of desire, form and formlessness.[72] This Buddhist dilemma is explicated in *Liqushi* 3 in the dramatic form of a great battle wherein a transformation of Mahāvairocana tramples upon and so subdues Maheśvara, the lord of the three realms who incarnates these three poisons. Maheśvara symbolizes the enemy within, that is, the obstructions to the practitioner's attainment of enlightenment.[73]

Amoghavajra provides in *Liqushi* 3 explicit instructions for the rite of wrathful subjugation 降伏法 (*ābhicāruka*) that the practitioner can perform for both himself and for others. He can subjugate the enemy-like passions that possess him, as well as the gods, demons and evil beings who harm the Buddha's teachings. Further, the practitioner can free another person from the three poisons and their accompanying defilements.[74] There are slight differences in the instructions, depending on whether the practitioner performs this rite for his own benefit or for the benefit of others. But fundamental to this rite of wrathful subjugation is the practitioner's entry into the *samādhi* of the yoga on the five types of absence of vain discourse, which is the teaching of *Liqujing* 3, the forming of the mudrā called the Yoga Seal of the Great Wisdom of Trailokyavijaya and the chanting the single syllable mantra *hūṃ*. The text states that it is the power of this mantra of wrath, which is the mantra of the Vajra Family 金剛部 (*vajra-kula*) that enables the practitioner to quickly accomplish the rite of subjugation.[75]

The rite of wrathful subjugation is the responsibility of the Vajra Family in such early Esoteric Buddhist texts as the *Susisddhikara sūtra* (*T*.18.893A:604b23-29), for example. Further, in the *Dapiluzhena chengfojing shu*, Śubhākarasiṃha and Yixing explicate the function of the Vajra Family in the mandala presented in the *Vairocanābhisaṃbodhi sūtra*'s second chapter, where they classify the deities of the mandala into three categories or "Families." The text states:

> Generally speaking, this is the first layer [of the mandala]. [Those in the court] above are the many virtuous adornments of the Buddha's body. [Those in the court] below are Buddha's messengers, the holders of wisdom 持明使者 (*vidyādhara-dūṭa*). All [in these two courts] are called the gate of the Tathāgata Family 如來部 (*tathāgata-kula*). [Those in the court] to the right are the pledge (*samaya*) of the Tathāgata's great compassion. Because they can nourish and grow the ten thousand goodnesses, they are called the Padma Family 蓮華部 (*padma-kula*). [Those in the court] to the left are the functioning of the power of the Tathāgata's great sapience 大慧 (**mahā-prajñā*). Because they can smash the three hindrances [of craving, anger and delusion], they are called the Vajra Family.[76]

There are five Families in the system of the Adamantine Realm and wrathful subjugation is carried out by Buddha Akṣobhya and his Vajra Family in the east. Amoghavajra clearly describes this five-family system in his *Dubu tuoluoni mu* 都部陀羅尼目 (Entries on Dhāraṇī of Various Categories), where he uses the term Vajra Family 金剛部 and notes that Buddha Akṣobhya is the head of this family.[77]

The mandala of Trailokyavijaya prescribed in *Liqushi* 3 depicts the first of Mahāvairocana's eight manifestations as the Eight Great Bodhisattvas. This mandala is composed of deities belonging to the Vajra Family, whose parent Buddha, Akṣobhya, is represented by Trailokyavijaya. Amoghavajra's instructions for this mandala are as follows:

> The fivefold wisdoms of the absence of vain discourse [on craving, anger, delusion, the *dharmas* and supreme wisdom] constitute the mandala of Trailokyavijaya. In the center install Trailokyavijaya. In front of Trailokyavijaya install the Bodhisattva Krodhasattva 忿怒薩埵 (Wrathful Being). Behind [him] install the Bodhisattva Krodhasādhu 忿怒善哉 (Wrathful Applause). At his right side install the Bodhisattva Krodharāja 忿怒王 (Wrathful King) and at his left side install the Bodhisattva Krodharāga 忿怒愛 (Wrathful Lust). In the four inner corners install the four wrathful Inner Offering [Bodhisattvas]. In the outer four corners install the four wrathful Outer Offering [Bodhisattvas]. At the east gate install the bow and arrow, drawing [thus] the symbolic [forms representing these deities].[78] At the south gate install the sword, at the west gate the wheel and at the north gate the three-pronged trident.[79]

All the figures are wrathful in appearance; the weapons in the gateways symbolize this.

The tasks of subjugation are ascribed to the Vajra Family in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* and in the *Leshu Jingangding yuqie fenbie shengwei xuizheng famen*. These works stipulate, often cryptically, the natures and functions of the buddhas and bodhisattvas in this esoteric system. For instance, Vajrapāṇi/Vajrasattva's nature and function have been detailed above.[80] Each figure of the *Liqushi*'s Trailokyavijaya mandala represents, then, a phase in the process of subjugation and the awakening of the desire for enlightenment that has been allocated to the members of Akṣobhya's family. Entry into the meditative concentration (*samādhi*) of Trailokyavijaya subdues the practitioner's inner demons and that of Vajrasattva, who is associated with the *Liqujing* 3's teaching on craving, greed and desire, transforms these passions into Great Desire for the attainment of enlightenment for oneself and others.

Because of his position in this mandala, Vajrarāja is associated with the *Liqujing*'s teaching on anger and hatred that must, by means of his *samādhi*, be transformed into a Great Anger that is compassionate. According to the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* and *Leshu Jingangding yuqie fenbie shengwei xuizheng famen*,[81] he incarnates Mahāvairocana's knowledge of the *samādhi* wherein living beings are pulled into the correct path with an adamantine hook 金剛鉤 (*vajrāṅkuśa*) and led on to enlightenment by means of four special methods of gathering 四攝法 (*catvāri saṃgraha-vastūni*), that of giving both spiritual and material goods, loving speech, conduct of body, speech and mind that benefit sentient beings, and assuming the same form as the sentient being in need of assistance.[82]

Vajrarāga corresponds to the *Liqujing* 3's teaching on ignorance and delusion. Vajrarāga is a Tantric version of Māra 摩羅, the Evil One who symbolizes evil desires and passions and who figures in the historical Buddha's life story.[83] Mahāvairocana generated from a *samādhi* on the Samaya of the Great Bodhisattva Māra the heart mantra Vajrarāga (Adamantine Lust) of All the Tathāgatas, and then he combined within his heart flower[-tipped] weapons of All the Tathāgatas, forming a great adamantine arrow 金剛箭 (*vajravāṇa*). From this arrow appeared myriads of figures of Tathāgatas who merged into the figure of the Great Bodhisattva Māra. Mahāvairocana placed in this Bodhisattva's hands the adamantine arrow and All the Tathāgatas consecrated him with the name Vajradhanu 金剛弓 (Adamantine Bow). Vajrarāga thus arises from the passions of All the Tathāgatas and represents their blinding enrapturement of love. But, because he transcends such defilements, he is able to use passions to subdue those in all beings. This he does with the great adamantine arrow.[84]

Finally, by means of the *samādhi* of Vajrasādhu the practitioner of the teachings in *Liqujing* 3 understands the true nature of all elements of reality. That is, he acquires the supreme knowledge of the illusory character of all and so attains a sphere wherein his thoughts are free from discriminations and distinctions. This achievement brings about a great joy. Extreme joy is the fundament of Vajrasādhu, according to the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* and *Leshu Jingangding yuqie fenbie shengwei xuizheng famen*.[85] He arises from the heart mantra *vajrasādhu* (adamantine applause), which transmutes into the form of great joy 大歡喜形 and then into the anthropomorphic figure of the Great Bodhisattva King of Extreme Joy 極歡喜王. Mahāvairocana grants him adamantine joy 金剛喜 (*vajrasādhu*) as his emblem and All the Tathāgatas confer upon him the name of Adamantine Joy. He is able to produce supreme joy for those who have transcended all discriminations, and he praises and delights All the Tathāgatas.

But the mandala-maker would find it difficult to produce a mandala of the deities in their anthropomorphic forms based solely on the instructions given in *Liqushi* 3. Amoghavajra specifies

the positions of the deities, but he does not describe the physical features, mudrās or attributes of any. Nevertheless, the common denominator of Trailokyavijaya's iconography in both the *Liqujing* and the *Liqushi* is the "stance of conquest." The *Liqushi* further explains Trailokyavijaya's pose:

> The [scripture's] phrase "dwelling in the stance of conquest" refers to the standing form of Trailokyavijaya 降三世立印 ... bending his right knee, he extends his left knee. His right foot tramples on Maheśvara and his left treads on Umā.[86]

Thus, a standing figure of Trailokyavijaya, in the stance of conquest, and the prostrate figures of Maheśvara and his consort Umā should be present in this mandala.[87]

The Daigoji's *Jiansanshi liquhui* 降三世理趣會 (Assembly of the Guiding Principle of Trailokyavijaya, fig. 4)[88] does not fulfill these expectations. Trailokyavijaya appears wrathful, but he is seated on a lotus blossom. The representation omits his most important iconographical feature, "the stance of conquest," and he is not trampling the figures of Maheśvara and his consort. Indeed, these two latter figures do not appear at all. This is a startling divergence, since in every one of the scriptures and ritual manuals that Amoghavajra translated or composed, Trailokyavijaya is represented in this stance.[89] Moreover, the Bodhisattvas of Trailokyavijaya's retinue do not appear wrathful, despite the stipulations of the *Liqushi*.[90] Finally, the Daigoji mandala is oriented to the north, with its three-pronged trident, instead of to the east with its bow and arrow, as Amoghavajra prescribes.

The Ishiyamadera's Trailokyavijaya mandala (fig. 13), on the other hand, by and large corresponds with the prescriptions of the *Liqushi*. The most obvious instance of this is the title, *Shijie Jiansanshi tan* 釋迦降三世壇 (Śākya-Trailokyavijaya Mandala),[91] that is recorded at the side of the Ishiyamadera mandala, referring to Mahāvairocana's manifestations, first as Śākyamuni and then as Trailokyavijaya.[92] Again, the character "wrathful" 忿 appears in the names of all the figures. Moreover, "draw the symbolic form" 書契 in Amoghavajra's directions has been understood to mandate a depiction of mudrās accompanying the gate symbols.[93] Finally, the names of the Offering and Gathering Bodhisattvas indicate that the *Liqushi* served as this mandala's textual source. However, instead of the names of the group of Offering and Gathering Bodhisattvas that are standard to the mandala described in the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*, to whom Amoghavajra refers in his instructions, the Bodhisattvas who embody the *Liqujing*'s epithets of purity have been depicted.[94]

The Mañjuśrī Mandala (*Liqushi* Stage 7)

Liqujing 2 is an exposition of the four components of Tathāgata Mahāvairocana's enlightenment, which are the four types of wisdom, that of the perfect awakening to the equality of the thunderbolt (*vajra*), the perfect awakening to the equality of benefits (*artha*), the perfect awakening to the equality of the teachings (*dharma*), and the perfect awakening to the equality of all actions (*karma*).[95] Stages 3 to 6 present this enlightenment in greater detail. The corresponding Stages of the *Liqushi* further explicate Mahāvairocana's four-fold enlightenment and the ritual methods whereby the practitioner can attain it.[96] The teachings of the subsequent four Stages of the *Liqujing*, from 7 to 10, are an exposition of ritual practices whereby the practitioner experiences

the four aspects of Tathāgata Mahāvairocana's inner realization. In the *Liqushi*'s corresponding Stages these practices are those of the Bodhisattvas Mañjuśrī, Sahacittotpādita-dharma-cakra-pravartin, Gaganagañja and Sarvamāra-pramardin, four members of the group of Eight Great Bodhisattvas. Here, we will discuss the first of these four Stages, the seventh Stage dedicated to the Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī.[97]

The theme of Stage seven of the *Liqujing* is, according to *Liqushi* 7, the remedial treatment of the practitioner's four types of consciousnesses 四種識 that arise from the inferior and erroneous functioning of his five sense consciousnesses, thinking consciousness, mental consciousness and storehouse consciousness by means of the four wisdoms of enlightenment 四智菩提.[98] The praxis taught by Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī brings about a cure. He can destroy the practitioner's delusions by revealing the illusory nature of all elements of reality. *Liqushi* 7 states that

> If [the practitioner] does not eradicate *dharmas* that cause adherence to [such] false views [that self and things are real], then he becomes ill due to his clinging to *dharmas*. Therefore, the bodhisattva [who wants to] increase his knowledge, uses the four types of wisdom-swords of [Bodhisattva] Mañjuśrī to sever hindrances, [both] those mental functions that disturb his mind as well as their objects, concerning the four types of wisdoms [acquired when one] becomes a buddha. For this reason, Mañjuśrī appears, brandishing [his sword] and chopping off the arms of the four buddhas.[99]

Amoghavajra thus equates the four lines of the *Liqujing*'s teachings on the emptiness of all elements of reality 諸法空, their aspectlessness 諸法無相, their being without desires 諸法無願 and their radiant purity 諸法光明 with the meditative concentrations of four manifestations of Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī.[100] The first three points of the *Liqujing*'s doctrine correspond with the classical Buddhist doctrine of the three gateways to liberation 三解脱門 (*vimokṣa-mukha*).[101] The last one, the radiant purity of all elements of reality, is the result of the practice of the three gateways of liberation, which reveals their true nature.

Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī possesses a penetrating wisdom which he uses like his sword to cut through false and deluded views of self and the phenomena of this world, to uncover the true nature of reality.[102] *Liqujing* 7 states that Mañjuśrī "brandished [his sword], cleaving All the Tathāgatas."[103] This action is described in *Liqushi* 7 as Mañjurśrī wielding his sword and cutting off the arms of four buddhas.[104] Such an act can best be understood in the context of the special practices over which this bodhisattva presides. Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī attacks these buddhas, who are in fact illusionary manifestations, symbolizing misleading thoughts and false arguments that are eliminated in order to understand the true characteristics of all elements of reality.

Four Buddhas, who hold wisdom-swords of emptiness 虛空智劍 in their arms, are present in the mandala that Amoghavajra prescribes in *Liqushi* 7. His directions for the construction of this mandala are as follows:

> [If] the yoga practitioner [wants to] successfully attain perfect wisdom, [then] he must construct this mandala. This mandala is laid out in the form of eight mandalas.[105] In the center draw the form of the youth 童子形 Mañjuśrī. In the

> four directions install the four Buddhas. Secure in each of the four Buddhas' arms a wisdom-sword of emptiness. In the four [inner] corners place the four emblems[106] of transcendent wisdom (*prajñāpāramitā*). In the outer four corners install the four Offering [Bodhisattvas]. In the four gates install the [following] four emblems. In the eastern gate draw the sword, in the southern gate the spear 鑠底 (*śakti*), in the western gate the bowl and in the northern gate the sūtra.[107]

The benefits acquired from practice of this mandala are unhindered eloquence of discourse 無礙辯才 (*asaṅga-pratibhāna*), the understanding of innumerable teachings on *samādhi*, and the appearance of Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī.[108]

Once again, the Daigoji's *Wenshushili liquhui* 文殊師利理趣會 (Assembly of the Guiding Principle of Mañjuśrī, fig. 8)[109] differs in nearly every respect from what is laid out in the *Liqushi*. Although a youthful Mañjuśrī is depicted, he is not in the form that Amoghavajra describes. Both the *Liqujing* and the *Liqushi* specify Mañjuśrī's emblem to be the sword,[110] but the crowned Mañjuśrī in the Daigoji mandala does not hold a sword. Instead, he holds in his right hand a rectangular form that represents a book and in his left a lotus flower. Four youths with topknots replace the four Buddhas, and the emblems of perfect wisdom appear as sets of armour, rather than as sūtras.[111] The iconography of the Daigoji mandala's Bodhisattva Mañjuśrī is that of the crowned figure from the Hall of the Eight-Petaled Central Dais 中台八葉院 in the *Genzu taizōkai mandara*.[112] Because both the *Liqujing* and the *Liqushi* provide detailed information on the iconography of Mañjuśrī, the substitution demonstrates the presence of both a different interpretation and a different iconographical source.[113]

On the other hand, despite minor discrepancies, the iconography of the Ishiyamadera's *Jingang Wenshushili Tongzhen tan* 金剛文殊利師童眞壇 (Mandala of Kumāra Vajra-Mañjuśrī, fig. 14)[114] is based on the mandala directions and commentarial explanations of the *Liqushi*. In the center of the Ishiyamadera mandala we find "the youth [who holds] the adamantine sword" 金剛利童. The four Buddhas, who represent All the Tathāgatas in the four chapters of the *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha*, are in the four cardinal directions.[115] In the four inner corners are "offerings of sūtra [boxes]" 梵甲供養, symbols of the teachings of the *Prajñāpāramitā sūtra*. At the gates are the four emblems that Amoghavajra prescribes, the sword, spear whose tip forms a three-pronged *vajra*, bowl, and sūtra, as well as depictions of hands forming mudrās.

A Word About the Remaining Mandalas

It would be possible to repeat this comparison for every one of the mandalas in the two exemplars, but going on at such length would be tedious and even pointless. The pattern established by the four examples discussed above is clear and consistent and holds for all the mandalas we are studying. Let us, however, make the following remarks.

First, there are major discrepancies between the *Liqushi*'s prescriptions and the iconography of all eighteen of the mandalas in the Daigoji exemplar. In many cases the variations appear to be deliberate. Even when Amoghavajra specifies the details of a figure in the *Liqushi* (examples are Stages 2, 3, and 7, as seen above), the iconography of the Daigoji figure does not match. *Liqushi* 9 is another example where Amoghavajra stipulates the iconography of the central figure of the Mandala of Gaganagañja, but the prescribed features for the figure of Bodhisattva

Gaganagañja are not represented in the Daigoji *Xukongku pusa liquhui* 虛空庫菩薩理趣會 (Assembly of the Guiding Principle of Bodhisattva Gaganagañja).[116]

The lack of iconographic information in the *Liqushi* posed a major problem for the composer of the Daigoji exemplar. Amoghavajra gives only the names and positions of the figures for most of the mandalas that he describes in the *Liqushi*. For instance, the central figure of the Daigoji's *Jinganglun pusa liquhui* 金剛輪菩薩理趣會 (Assembly of the Guiding Principle of Bodhisattva Vajracakra) is a wrathful figure but the theme of *Liqujing* 8 and its commentary is not that of wrath.[117] In contrast, wrath is the theme of *Liqujing* 10 and its commentary, whose focus is Bodhisattva Sarvamāra-pramardin 摧一切魔菩薩 (Destroyer of all Māras). And *Liqushi* 1 (*T*.1003:608a21-22) describes Sarvamāra-pramardin as outwardly wrathful but inwardly compassionate.[118] This Bodhisattva does not appear in his wrathful form in the Daigoji's *Cuiyiqiemo pusa liquhui* 摧一切魔菩薩理趣會 (Assembly of the Guiding Principle of Bodhisattva Sarvamāra-pramardin).[119] Further, Amoghavajra states in *Liqushi* 4 and 5, for example, that Avalokiteśvara and Ākāśagarbha are to be drawn according to their fundamental form 本形 but he gives no hints in these passages as to what this form should be.[120]

In other Stages of the *Liqushi* (13, 14, and 15, for example) Amoghavajra refers to an "extended book" 廣本 or an "extended scripture" 廣經 and to a mandala (*Liqushi* 16, 17) that was painted on the wall of Jianfusi 薦福寺 in the Chinese capital of Chang'an 長安 for details such as attributes, mudrās and colors.[121] In short, there is never a one-to-one correspondence between the mandala prescriptions in the *Liqushi* and the corresponding Daigoji mandalas.[122]

There are, in contrast, one-to-one correspondences between the *Liqushi*'s mandala prescriptions and the iconography of the Ishiyamadera set: examples are the *Jingangsaduo tan* 金剛薩埵壇 (Mandala of Vajrasattva) and the third mandala (fig. 11) with the notation "This is the third [mandala] expounded in the Scripture of the path [of guiding principles]" 此是第三道經中說.[123] In the Mandala of Vajrasattva, for instance, the names of the figures refer to the deities in *Liqujing* 1 and to explanations given in *Liqushi* 1. In the center of this mandala is Buddha Vajrasattva 金剛[薩]埵佛. This name indicates the major characters in *Liqujing* 1: after expounding the seventeen epithets of purity, the Buddha Mahāvairocana transforms himself into Vajrapāṇi/Vajrasattva.[124] The names of the figures surrounding Buddha Vajrasattva in the central circular court and in the two square courts of the Ishiyamadera mandala correspond (although not without errors in writing the Chinese characters and mistakenly replacing Kāmāvajra 愛金剛 in the upper right corner of the first square court with Vajrasādhu 金剛善哉, one of the Sixteen Great Bodhisattvas in the mandala of the adamantine realm) to the names of the figures given in Amoghavajra's directives for this mandala in *Liqushi* 1, as well as in the text of this commentary, wherein he explicates each of the seventeen epithets and specifies their seed letter mandala.[125]

Even if discrepancies can be found between the *Liqushi* and the iconography of the Ishiyamadera exemplar, the *Liqushi* and other writings by Amoghavajra serve as the iconographic sources. In fact, the variations in all but one of the mandalas *Jingangshou tan* 金剛手壇 in the Ishiyamadera exemplar can be linked to Amoghavajra's writings.[126] For instance, most numerous are the matches between the iconography of the mandalas in the Ishiyamadera examplar and the commentarial explanations given in the relevant *Liqushi* Stages. This occurs in the mandalas of Vairocana 毘盧遮那壇, Śākya-Trailokyavijaya 釋迦降三世壇 and Kumāra Vajra-Mañjuśrī 金剛文殊師利童眞壇, as I have demonstrated in this chapter,[127] and also in five other mandalas, those

of *Guanzizai pusa* 觀自在菩薩 (Bodhisattva Avalokiteśvara), *Baosheng* 寶生 (Ratnasaṃbhava), *Jingang yiqie rulai* 金剛一切如來壇 (Vajra-Sarvatathāgata), *Jingang Cuiyiqiemo* 金剛摧一切魔 (Adamantine Destroyer of All Māras) and the mandala titled "Not One Not Different. True Teachings of the Four Sisters of the Outer Vajra Family" 不一不異。外金剛部四姉妹眞教, as I will now demonstrate.

There are correspondences between the iconography of the Ishiyamadera's mandalas of Bodhisattva Avalokiteśvara, Ratnasambhava, and Vajra-Sarvatathāgata[128] and the *Liqushi*'s prescriptions, as well as the texts that constitute the source of the *Liqujing*'s teachings and the *Liqushi*'s explanations. The first correspondence occurs with the names of the central figures in these mandalas. The terms inscribed in the mandalas signify the ontological and soteriological essence of both the parent Tathāgata and main attendant Bodhisattvas of the Lotus, Gem and Action Families that are expounded in the *Liqushi*, *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* (*T*.865) and its commentary (*T*.870).

Thus, the central figure of the Ishiyamadera Mandala of Bodhisattva Avalokiteśvara is named Vajra Sovereign 金剛自在, which corresponds to Bodhisattva Avalokiteśvara 觀自在菩薩, who is described in *Liqushi* 5 as a transformation of his parent buddha, Amitāyus 無量壽;[129] Vajra/Ākāśagarbha 金剛虛空藏, the central figure in the Ishiyamadera Mandala of Ratnasaṃbhava, corresponds to Bodhisattva Ākāśagarbha 虛空藏菩薩, who is explained in *Liqushi* 6 as a transformation of his parent buddha, Buddha Ratnasaṃbhava 寶生佛;[130] and the central figure in the Ishiyamadera Mandala of Vajra-Sarvatathāgata is named Vajra Sarvatathāgata-muṣṭi 金剛一切如來拳, and this figure corresponds to Bodhisattva Sarvatathāgata-muṣṭi 一切如來拳菩薩, that is Bodhisattva Vajramuṣṭi, who is termed in *Liqushi* 7 a transformation of his parent buddha, Amoghasiddhi 不空成就.[131]

A second correspondence is the epithet *Vajra* 金剛 that proceeds all the names of the figures in the Ishiyamadera mandalas. This points to influence from Amoghavajra's *Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha* wherein the names of all the figures in the Great Mandala of the Adamantine Realm are prefixed with this term.

In *Liqushi* 10 Amoghavajra provides no information for the depiction of the figures of the mandala wherein the central figure is Sarvamāra-pramardin 摧一切魔菩薩 (Bodhisattva Destroyer of All Māras).[132] As we have noted above, wrath is the theme of *Liqujing* 10 and the teachings in this Stage of the *Liqujing* and passages in the *Liqushi* suggest that Bodhisattva Vajrayakṣa, the central figure in this mandala, would have a wrathful appearance.[133] The central figure in the Ishiyamadera Mandala of the Adamantine Destroyer of All Māras is named Adamantine Destroyer of Demons and Māras 金剛摧鬼魔, suggesting a wrathful deity, and there are other motifs corroborating the theme of wrath. "Wrathful" 忿怒 is appended to the names of all the Offering Bodhisattvas.[134] Moreover, although Amoghavajra's mandala prescriptions do not call for their representation, the inclusion of the angry manifestations of the four Buddhas — Trailokyavijaya 金剛世忿怒 of the Vajra Family, Kuṇḍalī 金剛「illegible」忿怒 of the Gem Family, Hayagrīva 金剛法忿怒 of the Dharma/Padma Family, and Ucchuṣma 金剛羯忿怒 of the Action Family, which is based upon his commentary, makes the theme of wrath more explicit. "Wrathful" also appears after their names.[135]

The title, "Not One Not Different. True Teachings of the Four Sisters of the Outer Vajra Family" for Ishiyamadera's mandala No. 17 is not given in Amoghavajra's work, but there is an

obvious thematic connection.[136] The theme of *Liqujing* 12 to 15 is the teachings of the identicalness of buddhas and sentient beings. In each of these Stages, gods who belong to the Vedic-Brahmanic traditions pay homage to the Buddha.[137] The *Liqushi* elaborates: the heterodox and the Buddhist, the unenlightened and enlightened are but two aspects of the same underlying and universal principle — all sentient beings possess the buddha nature. Thus, non-Buddhist gods become, once incorporated into Buddhism, transformations of Mahāvairocana.[138] For example, according to *Liqushi* 15 the Four Sisters represent the four perfections (*pāramitā*s) of eternalness (*nītyapāramitā*), bliss (*sukhapāramitā*), self (*ātmapāramitā*) and purity (*śuddhapāramitā*).[139] Amoghavajra's equations of identity are clearly recorded in the Ishiyamadera mandala No. 17. Tumburu *deva* is the Four Sisters' Brother and the Transformation Body of Mahāvairocana, as the inscription on the mandala records 毗盧化身／金剛部[都]牟盧／四姉妹兄也. There is confusion in the numbering and labeling in the mandala, but the Sisters are inscribed as: No. 2 Jayā, the perfection of eternalness; No. 3 Vijayā, the perfection of bliss; No. 4 Ajitā, the perfection of self; No. [not numbered] A[para]jitā, the perfection [of purity].[140]

Other writings by or attributed to Amoghavajra also account for obvious iconographical discrepancies that are seen in the Ishiyamadera mandalas for Sahacittotpādita-dharma-cakra-pravartin 纔發心轉法輪大菩薩壇, Gaganagañja 虛空庫菩薩壇, Vajrapāṇi 金剛手壇 and an untitled No. 1.

In mandalas No. 10, 11 and 13,[141] for example, the names for the Eight Great Bodhisattvas are not those given in *Liqujing* 1 but are from *Bada pusa mantuluo jing* 八大菩薩曼荼羅經 (Scripture of Mandala of the Eight Great Bodhisattvas), a work included in the list of translations and compositions Amoghavajra presented to the Chinese emperor in 771.[142] This group of Bodhisattvas consists of Avalokiteśvara 觀自在菩薩, Maitreya 慈氏菩薩, Ākāśagarbha 虛空藏, Samantabhadra 普賢菩薩, Vajrapāṇi 金剛手菩薩, Mañjuśrī 曼殊室利菩薩, Sarvanivāraṇaviṣkambhī 除蓋障菩薩, and Kṣtigarbha 地藏菩薩.[143]

Further, the *Liqushi* is not the source of the iconography of the Ishiyamadera's final mandala, which the editors of the *Taishō* have titled *Wubimi tan* 五祕密壇 (Five Mysteries Mandala).[144] *Liqushi* 17 stipulates only five figures for its Five Mysteries mandala. Instead, there are iconographical correspondences between the seventeen-deity Ishiyamadera mandala and Amoghavajra's ritual manual for the rite of Vajrasattva, the *Jingangding shengchu yuqie Puxian pusa niansong fa* 金剛頂勝初瑜伽普賢菩薩念誦法 (Method for Contemplation and Recitation on Bodhisattva Samantabhadra [taken from the] Supreme First Yoga of the Sarvatathāgata-tattva-saṃgraha)[145] and the *Dale Jingangsaduo xiuxing chengjiu yigui* 大樂金剛薩埵修行成就儀軌 (Ritual Manual for the Perfection of the Practice of Vajrasattva of Great Bliss), a manual that his disciple Yuanzhao 圓照 attributes to Amoghavajra.[146]

Detailed in these two manuals is a seventeen-figured mandala. The positions, attributes, colors and mudrās of the figures are explicitly prescribed, and the resultant seventeen-figure configuration focuses on the Five Mysteries pentad. Common to all three works are the names, attributes, mudrās and colors of the focal pentad, the names of the Outer Offering Bodhisattvas (but not their colors or positions), the names and colors of the Gathering Bodhisattvas (but not their positions) and the attributes and colors of the Inner Offering Bodhisattvas (but not their names or positions). The rotation of the Inner and Outer Offering Bodhisattvas and the Gathering Bodhisattvas accounts for their different positions in the Ishiyamadera mandala.[147]

The lack of iconographic information in the *Liqushi* and Amoghavajra's reference to an "extended scripture" accounts for the iconographical problems seen in Ishiyamadera mandalas of Maheśvara and the twenty-five *deva*s (No. 14), Mahākāla and the Seven Mothers (No. 15), and the three Brahmanic "brothers" (No. 16).[148] For instance, Amoghavajra does not provide the names of either the "eight types of gods" 八種天 in *Liqushi* 12, nor of the Mother Goddesses in *Liqushi* 13, which explains the fact that there are eight empty discs in Ishiyamadera mandalas no. 14 and 15.[149] Amoghavajra identifies the three brothers in *Liqushi* 14 as Brahmā, Nārāyaṇa and Maheśvara but he does not specify their positions in his mandala prescriptions.[150] This is the Brahmanical triad (*trimūrti*) of Brahmā, Viṣṇu (Nārāyaṇa) and Śiva (Maheśvara) — the Creator, the Preserver and the Destroyer. Maheśvara is in the central circle of this triangular mandala but the names of the other two "brothers" are not inscribed in the two circles to his left and right.[151]

CONCLUSION

In all, three major points are demonstrated by comparison of the two exemplars with their alleged source text.

The first is that the official Shingon line that the iconography of the Daigoji exemplar is based on the *Liqushi* cannot be supported and indeed appears to be false. In every case, there are major discrepancies between the Daigoji mandala set and the text of the *Liqushi*.

The second is that there is a definite relationship, though not always an exact correspondence, between the prescriptions of the *Liqushi* and the details of the second mandala exemplar, that is presently found in Ishiyamadera.

The last is that the *Liqushi* does not in fact contain enough information to make it possible to draw the anthropomorphic forms of the figures relying on its data alone. Even if the composer of the Daigoji exemplar had wished to use the *Liqushi* as his one and only textual source, he would still have had to consult other sources for some of the details. There is simply not enough detail in the *Liqushi* for it to be solely sufficient as a guide.

And yet, despite the lack of precision in many of the *Liqushi*'s mandala prescriptions, the author of the Daigoji exemplar not only deviated from these textual instructions, for example representing as benign deities that the *Liqushi* describes as wrathful, but also failed to maintain doctrinal consistency, following a matrix mandala when he should have represented deities from the adamantine realm mandala. These dramatic iconographic changes point to a source other than Amoghavajra's *Liqushi*. It is well known that Buddhist scriptures are not sufficiently descriptive or explicit to allow the drawing of accurate icons. Icons generally contain more iconographic information than texts. Clearly, a master's oral instructions would have been very important in the production of mandalas and the execution of rituals of which they are the focus.

I discuss the iconographical sources of the Daigoji exemplar in Chapter Three of this study. A close reading of the *Liqushi* discloses that Amoghavajra's reference system never varies: it is the First Assembly, as well as other assemblies of the Eighteen Assemblies of Yoga of the Adamantine Crown, as I will demonstrate in Chapter Four. The problems of the provenance and ascription of the Daigoji exemplar must be addressed and this I undertake in the following chapter.