



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Land rights and the forces of adat in democratizing Indonesia : continuous conflict between plantations, farmers, and forests in South Sulawesi

Muur, W.E. van der

Citation

Muur, W. E. van der. (2019, January 9). *Land rights and the forces of adat in democratizing Indonesia : continuous conflict between plantations, farmers, and forests in South Sulawesi*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/68271>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/68271>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/68271> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Muur, W.E. van der

Title: Land rights and the forces of adat in democratizing Indonesia : continuous conflict between plantations, farmers, and forests in South Sulawesi

Issue Date: 2019-01-09

Land Rights and the Forces of Adat in Democratizing Indonesia

Continuous conflict between plantations, farmers, and forests in South Sulawesi

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 9 januari 2019
klokke 13.45 uur

door

Willem Egbert van der Muur

geboren te Utrecht

in 1987

Promotoren: Prof. dr. A.W. Bedner
Prof. dr. J.M. Otto

Promotiecommissie: Prof. dr. J.M. Ubink
Prof. dr. J.B. Gewalt
Prof. dr. D.E.F. Henley
Prof. dr. K. von Benda-Beckmann (Max Planck Institute, Halle,
Duitsland)
Dr. J.F. McCarthy (Australian National University, Canberra, Australië)
Dr. W. Berenschot (KITLV)
Dr. J.A.C. Vel

Cover-design: Camiel Voorn (Studio Wonder), Deventer

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Achieving the result of this exciting journey - the book in front of you - would not have been possible without the enormous amount of hospitality and helpfulness that I have encountered while doing field research in Indonesia. I am more than grateful to all the people in South Sulawesi that shared their stories and experiences so openly with me. I owe much to my host family in Bulukumba and Makassar, particularly ibu Misbawati Andi Wawo and Faiz Fadillah. The way they adopted me into the family is truly admirable. I am also indebted to Jumarlin and his family for welcoming me at any given moment in their beautiful Kajang house. Thanks to Andi Mandasini Saleh for hosting me while staying in Sinjai Utara.

I am grateful to the people who assisted me with conducting fieldwork and collecting data: Wahyu Mustamin, Andis Syarifuddin and Burhanuddin for their guidance in Sinjai. To Andra Andi Rahmat and Gufrani Rusani, your tireless help during the first fieldwork period in Bulukumba was essential. I would also like to thank those who helped me during orientation visits elsewhere: Oki Hajiyansyah Wahab and pak Tisnanta in Lampung; Romi Adra, Deri Mayandra and Rezhy in Kerinci.

Much gratitude to all who helped facilitating the realization of this study. Pujo Semedi at UGM provided support as my Indonesian research sponsor. Novrizal Bahar and Andi Yani helped me find research assistance. I wish to thank Sardy Razak (AMAN Sulsel), Ardi and Adam (Balang), and Rudi Njet and Budi Rebel (AGRA) for the network support in South Sulawesi. I am thankful to KNAW for funding this research and the adatrechtstichting for additional financial support. Many thanks to Urban El-Fatih Adam and Junaid Judda for designing the research locations map included in this book.

After the fieldwork adventure I faced an entirely new challenge: writing the dissertation. I was lucky to be in an inspiring working environment, the Van Vollenhoven Institute. I owe much to my promotors Adriaan Bedner and Jan Michiel Otto. Both have taught me a lot about socio-legal studies, Indonesia's legal system and public administration in developing countries. I greatly benefited from discussions with all VVI colleagues: Jacqueline Vel, Laure D'Hondt, Bruno Braak, Arshad Muradin, Herlambang Wiratraman, Surya Tjandra, Fachrizal Affandi, Laura Lancee, Bernardo Ribeira de Almeida, Yance Arizona, Annelien Bouland, Hoko Horii, Carolien Jacobs, Rogier Cremers, Mies Grijns, Loes van Rooijen, Daniel Blocq, Maartje van der Woude, Erik Herber, Nick Huls, Suliman Ibrahim, Roxane de Massol de Rebetz, Maryla Klajn and Neske Baerwaldt. All along Dennis Janssen, Kari van Weeren and Kora Bentvelsen provided excellent support in all practical matters. Santy Kouwagam deserves special mention; she always ensured that I had a home in Jakarta. In addition, I would like to thank fellow researchers Micah Fisher and Rebecca Meckelburg for all the fruitful discussions on our shared topics, Mei Mei van Dorth for motivating me while in the field, and Ghislaine Gill for getting me acquainted with newspaper archives.

If the VVI was my first academic home, the KITLV certainly was my second. As one of the PhD researchers of the 'C2C' project I got to join a very talented team. The input I

received during our periodic chapter reading sessions helped me reconceptualize and restructure my dissertation at crucial moments of the writing process. I therefore wish to thank Gerry van Klinken, Ward Berenschot, Henk Schulte Nordholt, Prio Sambodho, Retna Hanani, Sita Hidayah, Vita Febriany, Muahamad Zamzam Fauzanafi and Chris Chaplin.

I am thankful to all of my friends and family that visited me in Indonesia, above all my parents. Finally, I wish to express my greatest gratitude to my girlfriend Binh who stood by me through the whole process. She always had a listening ear and never expressed a complaint about my long periods abroad. I can't thank you enough for your support.

GLOSSARY

<i>adatrechtbundel</i>	adat law compilation volume
<i>adatrechtpolitiek</i>	adat law policy
<i>beschikkingsrecht</i>	the right of avail
<i>dwifungsi</i>	dual function of the army in national security and politics
<i>erfpacht</i>	long term lease under Dutch colonial law
<i>Gerakan Aksi Sepihak</i>	land claiming movement in rural areas during the 1960s
<i>hadat</i>	council of noble rulers in South Sulawesi
<i>hak menguasai</i>	the state's right to control land, water and air
<i>hak komunal</i>	communal right to land
<i>kampung</i>	village settlement
<i>kalompoang</i>	sacred objects in South Sulawesi
<i>Karaeng</i>	the highest (Makassarese) noble title in South Sulawesi
<i>masyarakat adat</i>	adat community
<i>masyarakat hukum adat</i>	adat law community
<i>pasang</i>	customary rules of the Ammatoa Kajang community
<i>penggarap</i>	cultivator
<i>preman</i>	local thug/gangster
<i>penggugat</i>	claimant
<i>rakyat</i>	the people
<i>Regent</i>	indigenous head of <i>afdeling</i> , an administrative unit under the colonial administration (today district)
<i>rembang seppang</i>	inner-territory of Ammatoa Kajang community
<i>rembang luara</i>	outer-territory of Ammatoa Kajang community
<i>Reformasi</i>	period of political and legal reform after the fall of the Suharto regime in 1998
<i>Tomanurung</i>	belief-system in South Sulawesi based on an ancient myth
<i>ulayat</i>	form of communal customary control over land
<i>wilayah adat</i>	customary territory

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ABRI	Angkatan Bersenjata Republik Indonesia (Republic of Indonesia Armed Forces during the New Order period)
AGRA	Aliansi Gerakan Reforma Agraria (Alliance of Agrarian Reform Movements)
AMAN	Aliansi Masyarakat Adat Nusantara (Archipelago's Alliance of Indigenous Peoples)
APEC	Asian Peasant Coalition
BAL	Basic Agrarian Law (Ind. <i>Undang Undang Pokok Agraria</i>)
BFL	Basic Forestry Law (Ind. <i>Undang Undang Pokok Kehutanan</i>)
BTI	Barisan Tani Indonesia (Indonesian Peasant Guard)
BRWA	Badan Registrasi Wilayah Adat (Organization for mapping/registration of customary land)
DRB	Dewan Rakyat Bulukumba (People's Assembly of Bulukumba)
FKSN	Forum Keraton Silaturahmi Nusantara (national organization for local kings and sultanates)
HGU	Hak Guna Usaha (right to cultivate or exploit state land)
Tim IP4T	Tim Inventarisasi Penguasaan, Pemilikan, Penggunaan dan Pemanfaatan Tanah (Team for Inventarization of Control, Ownership, Use and Utilization of Land)
Kodim	Komando Distrik Militer (district military unit)
Komnas HAM	Indonesian National Human Rights Commission
KPA	Konsorsium Pembaruan Agraria (Agrarian Reform Consortium)
MEF	Ministry of Environment and Forestry
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NLA	National Land Agency (Ind. <i>Badan Pertanahan Nasional/BPN</i>)
pilkada	pemilu kepala daerah (regional elections)
PKI	Partai Komunis Indonesia (Indonesian Communist Party)
PT. Lonsum	PT. PP. London Sumatra
DFPD	District Forestry and Plantation Department (Dinas Kehutanan dan Perkebunan)
SNUB	Solidaritas Nasional Untuk Bulukumba (National Solidarity for Bulukumba)
SPJB	Serikat Petani Jawa Barat (West Java Peasant Union)
WALHI	Wahana Lingkungan Hidup Indonesia (Indonesian Forum for the Environment)
YLBH	Yayasan Lembaga Bantuan Hukum (legal aid foundation)

YPR	Yayasan Pendidikan Rakyat (People's Education Foundation)
YTM	Yayasan Tanah Merdeka (Foundation for Liberated Land)

Table of Content

1 INDIGENEITY, CONFLICTS AND COLLECTIVE LAND RIGHTS IN INDONESIA: QUESTIONS, CONCEPTS AND METHODS	7
1.1 Background of the research	7
1.1.1 Land conflicts in the Global South.....	7
1.1.2 The trend towards communal and indigenous land rights.....	8
1.1.3 Academic debates on indigeneity.....	10
1.1.4 Land conflicts and the indigenous turn in Indonesia.....	12
1.2 Research questions and conceptual framework	14
1.2.1 Research questions	14
1.2.2 Citizenship in a post-colonial setting.....	15
1.2.3 What is a community?	17
1.2.4 Social movements and collective action frames	17
1.2.5 Adat, customary law and adat law	18
1.2.6 Government administration in rural Indonesia.....	19
1.3 Approach, methods and research sites: Bulukumba and Sinjai.....	20
1.3.1 An interdisciplinary approach.....	20
1.3.2 Research locations, case studies, and methods.....	21
1.4 Outline of the book.....	24
2 LAND RIGHTS DEVELOPMENTS IN INDONESIA: FROM ADAT LAW COMMUNITIES TO CITIZENSHIP AND BACK.....	27
2.1 Introduction.....	27
2.2. Adat law, land rights and the colonial state.....	27
2.2.1 Citizenship and legal pluralism under Dutch rule	28
2.2.2 Discovering the importance of adat law	29
2.2.3 Ethical Policy and the legal battle of Cornelis van Vollenhoven.....	30
2.2.4 Adat law communities.....	31
2.2.5 Realizing recognition of adat land rights in parliament.....	32
2.2.6 The aftermath of the ‘adat law policy’ and retrospective debates.....	33
2.3 After Indonesian independence: moving towards citizenship-based land rights	36
2.3.1 Legal unification, rural politicization and the enactment of the BAL.....	36
2.3.2 The BAL and its relation to adat law.....	37
2.3.3 The 1965-1966 massacres and the end of land reform.....	39
2.4 The disregard of customary land rights under the New Order	40
2.4.1 The BAL under the New Order: legitimizing dispossession.....	40
2.4.2 The 1967 Basic Forestry Law.....	41
2.5 Adat land rights under Indonesian law	42
2.5.1 The fall of Suharto and the call for adat community rights	42
2.5.2 Legal change and the return of the adat law community in Indonesian law.....	43
2.5.3 Constitutional Court ruling no. 35/2012 on the separation of adat and state forest....	45
2.5.4 Legal options for the recognition of adat law communities.....	46
2.5.5 Towards more inclusivity: ‘hak komunal’.....	47
2.6 Conclusion	49

3 AGRARIAN CONFLICT IN BULUKUMBA DURING THE NEW ORDER AND BEYOND (1981-2006)	51
3.1 Introduction	51
3.2 Studying land conflicts	52
3.2.1 What is a conflict?.....	52
3.2.2 Approaching land conflicts	53
3.3 Land conflicts in Indonesia during the New Order and beyond	53
3.3.1 The rise of land conflicts during the New Order	53
3.3.2 The continuation of land conflicts after the fall of Suharto	56
3.4 The Bulukumba plantation conflict under the New Order (1981-1998)	58
3.4.1 Origins of the conflict.....	58
3.4.2 The legal dispute	60
3.4.3 Beyond the legal dispute: Local repression and coercion	62
3.5 The Bulukumba plantation conflict during Reformasi (1998 -2006)	64
3.5.1 The execution.....	64
3.5.2 From legal claimants to people’s movement.....	66
3.5.3 Escalation.....	68
3.5.4 Government mediation.....	70
3.5.5 The politics of internal distribution.....	71
3.6 Conclusion	73
4 THE RISE OF THE INDIGENOUS MOVEMENT IN INDONESIA	75
4.1 Introduction	75
4.2 Adat community: a ‘common language’ for the marginalized?	75
4.2.1 The birth of the indigenous movement.....	75
4.2.2 Social movements and collective action frames	77
4.2.3 The adat community frame as collective resistance against the repressive state.....	78
4.2.4 The legitimacy of adat communities in national ideology and law.....	80
4.2.5 The depiction of adat communities as indigenous custodians of the environment	81
4.2.6 Adat communities and identity politics	83
4.3 Actors in the indigenous movement	85
4.3.1 The advocates of adat communities.....	85
4.3.2 Adat communities: who are they, what are they?.....	86
4.4 Objectives, action and outcomes of the indigenous movement	87
4.4.1 Organizations and objectives.....	87
4.4.2 Legal and political strategies	88
4.4.3 Mixed results.....	89
4.4.4 Growth of the movement: losing its oppositional character?.....	91
4.5 Conclusion	93
5 ADAT IN TRANSITION: SPIRITUAL CULTS, DIVINE RULERS AND STATE FORMATION IN SOUTH SULAWESI	95
5.1 Introduction	95
5.2 Adat, colonialism and political authority (1605 – 1948)	95
5.2.1 The Tomanurung cult of South Sulawesi.....	95
5.2.2 The influence of colonialism on traditional rule	98

5.2.3 The revival of traditional rule against the rise of modernist Islam.....	99
5.3 After Indonesian independence: Darul Islam, administrative harmonization and the nobility	
.....	101
5.3.1 The Darul Islam rebellion against the nobility.....	101
5.3.2 Administrative harmonization and abolishing adat authority.....	102
5.3.3 The South Sulawesi nobility and the New Order.....	103
5.3.4 Transitions of authority and impact on landownership.....	104
5.4 The last of the patungtung: The Ammatoa Kajang community.....	106
5.4.1 The patungtung communities.....	106
5.4.1 The adat of the Ammatoa Kajang community: egalitarian norms or feudalism culture?	
.....	107
5.5 Conclusion	110
6 ADAT POLITICIZED: THE CONTINUATION OF THE BULUKUMBA PLANTATION	
CONFLICT (2003-2017)	113
6.1 Introduction.....	113
6.2 Finding the ‘tribal slot’: how adat became a claiming strategy in the conflict	114
6.2.1 After the violence: invoking indigeneity as an ‘injustice frame’.....	114
6.2.2 The Ammatoa Kajang community and the ‘tribal slot’.....	117
6.3 Actors, adat claims, and diffuse interests at the local level	119
6.3.1 Adat and the tension between agrarian activists and traditional leaders.....	119
6.3.2 New claims from marginalized noblemen: reviving a former kingdom.....	124
6.4 The role of the district government in the era of regional electoral politics	126
6.4.1 Negotiating land claims through the Bulukumba District Head.....	126
6.4.2 New Government, new alliances.....	129
6.5 Conclusion	131
7 WHO GETS ADAT FOREST RIGHTS? SEEKING RECOGNITION IN KAJANG AND WEST	
SINJAI.....	133
7.1 Introduction.....	133
7.2 The legal recognition of the Ammatoa Kajang community	134
7.2.1 The relationship between the Ammatoa Kajang community and the district	
government.....	134
7.2.2 The enactment of an ‘adat law community’ district regulation.....	138
7.2.3 After legal recognition.....	141
7.3 Forest conflicts and adat community claims in West Sinjai.....	143
7.3.1 Background of forest conflicts in Sinjai.....	143
7.3.2 Is there an adat community in West Sinjai?.....	145
7.3.3 Searching for adat community recognition in court.....	148
7.3.4 The absence of connections with district officials in Sinjai	149
7.3.5 The Kajang and West Sinjai cases in comparative perspective.....	151
7.4 Conclusion	152
8 CONCLUSIONS.....	155
8.1 Introduction.....	155
8.2 The continuity of land conflicts: government interventions and the role of law	156
8.3 The power and limits of the adat community discourse	157

8.3.1 The legitimacy of adat	157
8.3.2 Limitations of the discourse: the niche of continuity and collectivity	158
8.4 Legal reforms and the control of the state.....	159
8.5 Adat community politics at the regional and local level	161
8.5.1 Adat land claims in South Sulawesi.....	161
8.5.2 The opposing forces of adat at the local level in South Sulawesi.....	161
8.5.3 The recognition of adat communities and connections to the state	162
8.5.4 After the 'victory'	163
8.6 Looking ahead: towards a new interpretation?	164
BIBLIOGRAPHY	167
SUMMARY	181
SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	188
RINGKASAN (SUMMARY BAHASA INDONESIA).....	195
CURRICULUM VITAE.....	203

