



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## Sizing up protoplanetary disks

Trapman, L.

### Citation

Trapman, L. (2020, November 5). *Sizing up protoplanetary disks*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/138010>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/138010>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/138010> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Trapman, L.

**Title:** Sizing up protoplanetary disks

**Issue date:** 2020-11-05

# Sizing up protoplanetary disks

## Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op donderdag 5 november 2020  
klokke 10.00 uur  
door

Leon Trapman

geboren te Amsterdam, Nederland  
in 1993

Promotiecommissie

Promotores: Prof. dr. E. F. van Dishoeck

Prof. dr. M. R. Hogerheijde

Overige leden: Dr. J. M. Carpenter Joint ALMA Observatory  
Prof. dr. I. E. E. Kamp Rijksuniversiteit Groningen  
Prof. dr. G. Lodato Università degli Studi di Milano  
Dr. P. Pinilla Max-Planck-Institut für Astronomie  
Prof. dr. S. F. Portegies Zwart  
Prof. dr. H. J. A. Röttgering

ISBN: 978-94-641-9049-6

**Front cover:**

ALMA observations of dust and CO in the protoplanetary disk around CX TAU

Image credits: Stefano Facchini

Cover design by Yvonne Meeuwsen and the author

# CONTENTS

|          |                                                                                      |           |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| <b>1</b> | <b>Introduction</b>                                                                  | <b>1</b>  |
| 1.1      | From clouds to cores to disks . . . . .                                              | 1         |
| 1.2      | Inside the disk: physics, chemistry and evolution . . . . .                          | 2         |
| 1.2.1    | Disk (viscous) evolution . . . . .                                                   | 2         |
| 1.2.2    | Disk structure . . . . .                                                             | 4         |
| 1.2.3    | Dust evolution . . . . .                                                             | 6         |
| 1.2.4    | Chemistry in protoplanetary disks . . . . .                                          | 7         |
| 1.3      | Millimeter observations of protoplanetary disks: the ALMA era . . . .                | 11        |
| 1.3.1    | Measuring disk radii . . . . .                                                       | 11        |
| 1.3.2    | Measuring disk masses . . . . .                                                      | 15        |
| 1.4      | Modeling protoplanetary disks . . . . .                                              | 18        |
| 1.5      | This thesis . . . . .                                                                | 19        |
| 1.5.1    | Future outlook . . . . .                                                             | 22        |
| <b>2</b> | <b>Gas versus dust sizes of protoplanetary disks: Effects of dust evolution</b>      | <b>25</b> |
| 2.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                               | 27        |
| 2.2      | Models . . . . .                                                                     | 28        |
| 2.2.1    | DALI with dust evolution . . . . .                                                   | 28        |
| 2.2.2    | Model set-up . . . . .                                                               | 29        |
| 2.2.3    | Grid of models . . . . .                                                             | 29        |
| 2.2.4    | Measuring the outer radius . . . . .                                                 | 30        |
| 2.3      | Results . . . . .                                                                    | 31        |
| 2.3.1    | Dust radial intensity profiles . . . . .                                             | 32        |
| 2.3.2    | $^{12}\text{CO}$ radial intensity profiles . . . . .                                 | 32        |
| 2.3.3    | Effect of dust evolution on $R_{90,\text{dust}}$ and $R_{\text{CO}, 90\%}$ . . . . . | 35        |
| 2.3.4    | Effect of disk mass on $R_{\text{CO}, 90\%}$ and $R_{90,\text{dust}}$ . . . . .      | 37        |
| 2.3.5    | Dust evolution tracer: $R_{90,\text{gas}}/R_{90,\text{dust}}$ . . . . .              | 39        |
| 2.3.6    | Observational factors affecting $R_{90,\text{gas}}/R_{90,\text{dust}}$ . . . . .     | 39        |
| 2.4      | Discussion . . . . .                                                                 | 41        |
| 2.4.1    | CO underabundance and $R_{\text{CO}, 90\%}$ . . . . .                                | 41        |
| 2.4.2    | Effect of the surface density slope on outer radii . . . . .                         | 42        |
| 2.4.3    | Match of observed $R_{\text{out}}$ to physical size of the disk . . . . .            | 44        |
| 2.5      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                | 46        |
|          | Appendices . . . . .                                                                 | 47        |
| 2.A      | Effect of inclination . . . . .                                                      | 47        |
| 2.B      | Measuring $R_{\text{CO}, 90\%}$ from $^{13}\text{CO}$ 2-1 moment zero maps . . . . . | 47        |
| 2.C      | Measuring $R_{\text{CO}, 90\%}$ from peak intensity maps . . . . .                   | 47        |

|          |                                                                                                       |           |
|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 2.D      | Deriving a relation between $R_{\text{CO}, 90\%}$ and the CO column density . . .                     | 52        |
| 2.E      | Continuum intensity profiles for $R_c = 20$ AU . . . . .                                              | 53        |
| 2.F      | Curves of growth for the $R_c = 50$ AU dust profiles . . . . .                                        | 54        |
| 2.G      | Beam size and peak S/N for all disk masses vs. $R_{90,\text{gas}}/R_{90,\text{dust}}$ . . . .         | 55        |
| 2.H      | Gas radii vs. peak S/N . . . . .                                                                      | 57        |
| 2.I      | Mass fractions and flux fractions for the remaining disks . . . . .                                   | 58        |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Constraining the radial drift of millimeter-sized grains in the proto-planetary disks in Lupus</b> | <b>61</b> |
| 3.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                | 63        |
| 3.2      | Observations and sample selection . . . . .                                                           | 64        |
| 3.2.1    | Observations . . . . .                                                                                | 64        |
| 3.2.2    | Sample selection . . . . .                                                                            | 65        |
| 3.3      | Methods . . . . .                                                                                     | 67        |
| 3.3.1    | DALI . . . . .                                                                                        | 67        |
| 3.3.2    | Chemical network . . . . .                                                                            | 69        |
| 3.3.3    | The physical model . . . . .                                                                          | 69        |
| 3.3.4    | Measuring model outer radii . . . . .                                                                 | 72        |
| 3.4      | Results . . . . .                                                                                     | 74        |
| 3.4.1    | Observed versus modeled disk sizes . . . . .                                                          | 74        |
| 3.4.2    | Gas–dust size difference: models versus observations . . . . .                                        | 75        |
| 3.5      | Discussion . . . . .                                                                                  | 77        |
| 3.5.1    | Fast dust evolution candidates in Lupus . . . . .                                                     | 77        |
| 3.5.2    | Are compact dust disks the result of runaway radial drift? . . .                                      | 79        |
| 3.6      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                 | 80        |
|          | Appendices . . . . .                                                                                  | 81        |
| 3.A      | Keplerian masking . . . . .                                                                           | 81        |
| 3.A.1    | Implementation . . . . .                                                                              | 82        |
| 3.A.2    | Making moment-zero maps and calculating noise . . . . .                                               | 83        |
| 3.A.3    | Caveats . . . . .                                                                                     | 84        |
| 3.A.4    | The Keplerian mask parameters of our sample . . . . .                                                 | 84        |
| 3.B      | Influence of dust settling and flaring . . . . .                                                      | 85        |
| 3.C      | $^{12}\text{CO } J = 2 - 1$ emission maps of 17 sources . . . . .                                     | 86        |
| 3.D      | Measuring $R_{\text{CO}}$ from noisy spectral cube . . . . .                                          | 88        |
| 3.E      | Radial 890 $\mu\text{m}$ continuum profiles . . . . .                                                 | 89        |
| 3.F      | Noisy $R_{\text{CO}}$ distributions for the disks in<br>our sample . . . . .                          | 90        |
| <b>4</b> | <b>Observed sizes of planet-forming disks trace viscous spreading</b>                                 | <b>91</b> |
| 4.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                | 93        |
| 4.2      | Model setup . . . . .                                                                                 | 95        |
| 4.2.1    | Viscous evolution of the surface density . . . . .                                                    | 95        |
| 4.2.2    | Initial conditions of the models . . . . .                                                            | 96        |
| 4.2.3    | DALI models . . . . .                                                                                 | 98        |
| 4.3      | Results . . . . .                                                                                     | 100       |
| 4.3.1    | Time evolution of the $^{12}\text{CO}$ emission profile . . . . .                                     | 100       |
| 4.3.2    | Evolution of the observed gas outer radius . . . . .                                                  | 102       |
| 4.3.3    | Gas outer radius traces viscous evolution . . . . .                                                   | 105       |
| 4.3.4    | Possibility of measuring $\alpha_{\text{visc}}$ from observed $R_{\text{CO}, 90\%}$ . . . . .         | 105       |

|          |                                                                                                                                    |            |
|----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 4.4      | Discussion . . . . .                                                                                                               | 107        |
| 4.4.1    | Comparing to observations . . . . .                                                                                                | 107        |
| 4.4.2    | Larger initial disk sizes . . . . .                                                                                                | 110        |
| 4.4.3    | Effect of chemical CO depletion on measurements of<br>viscous spreading . . . . .                                                  | 111        |
| 4.4.4    | Caveats . . . . .                                                                                                                  | 112        |
| 4.5      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                                              | 114        |
|          | Appendices . . . . .                                                                                                               | 116        |
| 4.A      | Disk mass evolution . . . . .                                                                                                      | 116        |
| 4.B      | Local UV radiation field in Upper Sco . . . . .                                                                                    | 116        |
| 4.C      | $^{12}\text{CO}$ radial intensity profiles . . . . .                                                                               | 119        |
| 4.D      | Outer radii based $^{13}\text{CO}$ emission . . . . .                                                                              | 120        |
| 4.E      | Observed sample . . . . .                                                                                                          | 123        |
| 4.F      | Implementing CO chemical depletion through<br>grain-surface chemistry . . . . .                                                    | 124        |
| 4.G      | Effect of CO depletion on the $^{13}\text{CO}$ emission . . . . .                                                                  | 126        |
| <b>5</b> | <b>CO isotopolog line fluxes of viscously evolving disks: cold CO con-<br/>version insufficient to explain observed low fluxes</b> | <b>127</b> |
| 5.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                             | 129        |
| 5.2      | Model setup . . . . .                                                                                                              | 131        |
| 5.2.1    | Viscous evolution of the surface density . . . . .                                                                                 | 131        |
| 5.2.2    | Initial disk mass and disk size . . . . .                                                                                          | 133        |
| 5.2.3    | The DALI models . . . . .                                                                                                          | 134        |
| 5.3      | Results . . . . .                                                                                                                  | 140        |
| 5.3.1    | CO isotopolog line fluxes: a viscously evolving disk . . . . .                                                                     | 140        |
| 5.3.2    | CO isotopolog line fluxes: effects of grain surface<br>chemistry . . . . .                                                         | 140        |
| 5.3.3    | Comparing to the Lupus disk population . . . . .                                                                                   | 142        |
| 5.3.4    | Cosmic-ray ionization rate required to match observed CO iso-<br>topolog fluxes . . . . .                                          | 144        |
| 5.4      | Discussion . . . . .                                                                                                               | 146        |
| 5.4.1    | Reproducing $^{13}\text{CO}$ 3-2 line fluxes observed in Lupus . . . . .                                                           | 146        |
| 5.4.2    | Alternative explanations . . . . .                                                                                                 | 150        |
| 5.5      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                                              | 151        |
|          | Appendices . . . . .                                                                                                               | 153        |
| 5.A      | Model $^{13}\text{CO}$ and $\text{C}^{18}\text{O}$ $J = 3 - 2$ fluxes . . . . .                                                    | 153        |
| 5.B      | Model $^{13}\text{CO}$ and $\text{C}^{18}\text{O}$ $J = 2 - 1$ fluxes . . . . .                                                    | 154        |
| 5.C      | Comparing maximum CO conversion models to observed CO isotopolog<br>line fluxes . . . . .                                          | 155        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>Mass constraints for 15 protoplanetary disks from HD 1-0</b>                                                                    | <b>157</b> |
| 6.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                             | 159        |
| 6.2      | Observations and sample . . . . .                                                                                                  | 159        |
| 6.3      | Modeling . . . . .                                                                                                                 | 161        |
| 6.3.1    | DALI . . . . .                                                                                                                     | 161        |
| 6.3.2    | Model grid . . . . .                                                                                                               | 163        |
| 6.4      | Results . . . . .                                                                                                                  | 166        |
| 6.4.1    | Parameter dependencies in the grid . . . . .                                                                                       | 166        |

|       |                                                                                                              |            |
|-------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 6.4.2 | Constraints on $M_{\text{gas}}$ across the sample . . . . .                                                  | 167        |
| 6.4.3 | HD 163296 . . . . .                                                                                          | 168        |
| 6.4.4 | HD 100546 . . . . .                                                                                          | 170        |
| 6.4.5 | Other individual disks . . . . .                                                                             | 170        |
| 6.4.6 | Are the disks stable? . . . . .                                                                              | 172        |
| 6.5   | Discussion . . . . .                                                                                         | 172        |
| 6.5.1 | Mass of disks, stars, and planets . . . . .                                                                  | 172        |
| 6.5.2 | Observing HD in Herbig disks with SOFIA/HIRMES, SPICA/SAFARI<br>and emphOrigins Space Telescope . . . . .    | 174        |
| 6.6   | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                        | 176        |
|       | Appendices . . . . .                                                                                         | 177        |
| 6.A   | HD 1-0 fluxes for HD 135344B . . . . .                                                                       | 177        |
| 6.B   | HD 2-1 upper limits versus the model fluxes . . . . .                                                        | 178        |
| 6.C   | HD 1-0 line versus 1.3 mm continuum fluxes, showing gas-to-dust ratios<br>and stellar luminosities . . . . . | 179        |
|       | <b>Bibliography</b>                                                                                          | <b>179</b> |
|       | <b>Nederlandse samenvatting</b>                                                                              | <b>197</b> |
|       | <b>List of Publications</b>                                                                                  | <b>205</b> |
|       | <b>Curriculum Vitae</b>                                                                                      | <b>207</b> |
|       | <b>Acknowledgements</b>                                                                                      | <b>209</b> |