



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Building land tenure systems: The political, legal, and institutional struggles of Timor-Leste

Ribeiro de Almeida, B.

Citation

Ribeiro de Almeida, B. (2020, September 24). *Building land tenure systems: The political, legal, and institutional struggles of Timor-Leste*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/136944>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/136944>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/136944> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Ribeiro de Almeida B.

Title: Building land tenure systems: The political, legal, and institutional struggles of Timor-Leste

Issue Date: 2020-09-24

Building land tenure systems

Building land tenure systems

The political, legal, and institutional struggles
of Timor-Leste

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 24 september 2020
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Bernardo Ribeiro de Almeida

geboren te Lissabon (Portugal)

in 1983

Promotor: prof. dr. A.W. Bedner
Co-promotor: dr. ir. C.I.M. Jacobs

Promotiecommissie: dr. J.M. Ubink
prof. dr. L. Cotula (University of Strathclyde, UK)
prof. dr. C. Lund (University of Copenhagen, Denmark)
prof. dr. L.S. Meitzner Yoder, (Wheaton College,
Wheaton Il, USA)
dr. ir. J.A.C. Vel

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio, Delft
Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

© 2020 R. Ribeiro de Almeida

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden veeleenvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische veeleenvoudingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

Acknowledgments

This study results from a mixture of unplanned events, fortuitous encounters, and good coincidences in which I was lucky enough to connect with, and receive support from, various people and institutions that I must acknowledge.

I want to thank all my colleagues and friends at the Fundação das Universidades Portuguesas, Ministry of Justice of Timor-Leste, DNTPSC, UNDP, The Asia Foundation, Rede Ba Rai, and other organizations that I had the privilege of working with as legal adviser, consultant, and academic researcher. I'm also thankful to Fundação Oriente, NWO and the Knowledge Platform for Security and Rule of Law for the grants that financed parts of this research.

Timor-Leste became the place where I met some of my dearest friends who, sometimes in ways that they are not even aware of, contributed to this research. Among others, I thank Lene Østergaard, Ibere Lopes, Miguel Lemos, João Albuquerque, Gobie Rajalingam, Helen Henderson, Ricardo Cunha, Rod Nixon, Rui Feijó, Susana Viegas, Sara Ribeiro, Nigel Thomson, Patrícia Coutinho, Laura Yoder, and Todd Wassel for their friendship and support.

A meeting in 2012 with Professor Jan Michiel Otto at Schiphol airport started my connection to the VVI. I'm very thankful to Santy, Hoko, Bruno, Annelien, Jan Michiel, Janine, Maartje, Jacqueline, Kari, Kora, Dennis, Pauline, Willem, Laura, Laure, Arshad, Fachrizal, Maryla, Liz, Nadia, Mies, Nick, Suliman, Nienke, Elisabeth, Najib, Yance, Neske, Judith, Daniel, Joseph, Mareike, Danielle, Chase, Rogier, Dorien, Hannah, Bilal, Nada, Feby, Roxane... All of you make the VVI a very special place that goes much beyond professional life.

If you are a PhD student, you must have Adriaan Bedner in your corner as supervisor. His knowledge, kindness, dedication, and friendship were an enormous contribution to this research and to my view of the world in general. Adriaan really shows you that 'there are treasures everywhere'. Carolien Jacobs, my hugely knowledgeable and friendly co-supervisor, showed up at the right time and made a significant contribution to the thesis, for which I am very grateful.

The love, care and support of my family and close friends in Portugal was paramount to finishing this research, and I'm very grateful for it. It is much easier to venture into the world when one has the best secure port to return to. And few people have the privilege of having their grandmother commenting on their manuscript.

My greatest debt is to my wife, Laura Ogden. Due to incredible luck, I share my life with the most loving and caring partner, wonderful researcher, sharpest peer-reviewer and editor, the best friend to share great jokes and deep concerns. With Laura by my side research difficulties and frustrations are small bumps on the most enjoyable road. That makes me the luckiest researcher and the happiest man in the world.

Table of contents

LIST OF MAPS, FIGURES, TABLES AND ANNEXES	XI
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XIII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction	2
1.2 Framework of analysis – The layers and connection points model	4
1.3 Research questions	8
1.4 Methodologies	8
1.5 Ethical considerations	12
1.6 Limitations of the research	14
1.7 Outline	15
2 FORMAL LAND TENURE SYSTEMS	19
2.1 Introduction	20
2.2 Formal land tenure systems and other definitions	20
2.3 The roles of land and formal land tenure systems	27
2.3.1 The characteristics and roles of land	28
2.3.2 Land tenure, formal land tenure systems, and the goals of the state	29
2.3.3 Formal land tenure systems and state power	34
2.4 The problems and dilemmas of formal land tenure systems	36
2.4.1 Problems of formal land tenure systems	36
2.4.2 Dilemmas of a formal land tenure system	41
2.5 Conclusion	44
3 LAND TENURE SYSTEMS THROUGHOUT TIMOR-LESTE’S HISTORY	47
3.1 Introduction	48
3.2 Geographic and social overview	48
3.3 Historical background	50
3.4 Formal land tenure systems in Timor-Leste	57
3.4.1 The Portuguese formal land tenure system in Timor-Leste	57
3.4.2 The Indonesian formal land tenure system in Timor-Leste	63
3.4.3 The formal land tenure system during the UNTAET administration	66
3.4.4 The formal Land tenure system since Independence	71
3.5 Conclusion	78

4	THE POLITICAL ENVIRONMENT	81
4.1	Introduction	82
4.2	Political parties and land tenure	83
	4.2.1 FRETILIN – Revolutionary Front for an Independent East Timor	83
	4.2.2 CNRT – National Congress for Timorese Reconstruction	85
4.3	‘Development’, high-modernism, infrastructure, and investment	87
	4.3.1 Infrastructure	87
	4.3.2 Private investment	90
4.4	Post-authoritarianism and the authoritarian temptation	93
4.5	Weak rule of law	96
4.6	Indonesian legacy in land administration	99
4.7	Corruption, rent-seeking, clientelism, patronage, and elite capture	103
4.8	Natural resources’ windfall, oil dependency, and the resource curse	105
4.9	Post-colonialism debates	109
4.10	Post-conflict debates and potential for violence	111
4.11	Resilience and prevalence of customary land tenure systems	112
4.12	Conclusion	114
5	THE MAKING OF LAND LAWS	117
5.1	Introduction	118
5.2	Making land-related laws in Timor-Leste	119
5.3	Looking at the lawmaking process	123
5.4	Legislative agenda	126
5.5	Knowledge production for the lawmaking process	131
5.6	Decision-making	134
5.7	Legal drafters	138
5.8	Consultation and transparency mechanisms	141
5.9	Drafting options and dilemmas	144
5.10	Monitoring and evaluation	147
5.11	Language	148
5.12	Conclusion	151
6	LAND TENURE LEGISLATION IN TIMOR-LESTE	155
6.1	Introduction	156
6.2	Validity of pre-independence rights	158
6.3	Legal recognition of customary land rights	161
6.4	Long-term possession	163
6.5	State land	164
	6.5.1 Definition of state land	164
	6.5.2 Public and Private Domain of the State	166
6.6	Land rights of legal entities	167
6.7	Processes for identifying land claims and addressing conflicting ones	167
	6.7.1 The Process established by Law 1/2003	168
	6.7.2 The Process established by Decree-Law 27/2011	169
	6.7.3 The Process established by the Land Law	172

6.8	Evictions	174
6.9	Land rights in the Timorese formal land tenure system	175
6.10	Legal Mechanisms for Acquisition and Loss of Land Rights	177
	6.10.1 Transfers of land rights	177
	6.10.2 Adverse possession and legal protection of possessors	178
	6.10.3 Expropriation	179
6.11	Conclusion	180
7	LAND INSTITUTIONS	183
7.1	Introduction	184
7.2	Looking at institutions	185
7.3	State institutions – The National Directorate of Land and Property and Cadastral Services (DNTPSC)	186
	7.3.1 The origins and influences of DNTPSC	187
	7.3.2 DNTPSC’s goals and tasks	188
	7.3.3 Resources	190
	7.3.4 Internal structure	196
	7.3.5 Leadership	207
	7.3.6 DNTPSC’s clients	210
7.4	External institutions	212
	7.4.1 – Ita Nia Rai (INR) and National Cadastre System (SNC)	212
	7.4.2 International organizations and donors	214
	7.4.3 Timorese civil society organizations	216
7.5	Conclusion	219
8	SOCIAL RELATIONSHIPS, IDEAS, AND PRACTICES AROUND LAND TENURE AND THE FORMAL LAND TENURE SYSTEM	223
8.1	Introduction	224
8.2	Relevance of customary systems	226
8.3	Characteristics of land rights	227
8.4	Land tenure security	231
	8.4.1 Legal tenure security	231
	8.4.2 Perceived tenure security	233
8.5	Land titling	235
8.6	Land-related disputes and dispute-resolution mechanisms	237
8.7	‘Development’ and the right to expropriate land	239
8.8	Conclusion	241
9	THE LAYERS IN MOVEMENT – THE FORMAL LAND TENURE SYSTEM AND THE SUAI SUPPLY BASE	243
9.1	Introduction	244
9.2	Oil, politics and ‘development’	245
	9.2.1 The resource dispute in the Timor Sea	245
	9.2.2 The Tasi Mane Project and the Suai Supply Base	247

9.2.3	The Suai and the area of the Suai Supply Base	251
9.3	Land tenure, land tenure systems and 'development'	252
9.3.1	The informal approach of the Inter-Ministerial Team	253
9.3.2	The 10 percent agreement with the 'community of Kamenasa'	256
9.3.3	The legislative approach	260
9.3.3	The contractual approach	266
9.3.4	The effects of land acquisition	267
9.4	Conclusion	269
10	CONCLUSIONS	273
10.1	Introduction	274
10.2	Studying land tenure systems – an analytical framework	274
10.3	What can we learn from Timor-Leste? Factors of success and failure of a formal land tenure system	275
10.3.1	Land tenure and administrative processes, public administrations, and state officials	276
10.3.2	Land tenure and the rule and role of law and lawmaking	280
10.3.3	Land tenure and ideology	283
10.4	The Timorese formal land tenure system – final remarks	285
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	289
	SUMMARY	293
	SUMÁRIU (TETUM SUMMARY)	297
	ANNEX I – PORTUGUESE LAND TENURE LEGISLATION	301
	REFERENCES	305
	CURRICULUM VITAE	337

List of maps, figures, tables and annexes

Maps

Map 1	Timor-Leste	49
Map 2	Survey areas	226
Map 3	The Timor Gap in the Australian Boundary	245
Map 4	Tasi Mane Project clusters	248
Map 5	The Suai Cluster	252

Figures

Fig 1	The Land Tenure System Analysis Model	7
-------	---------------------------------------	---

Tables

Table 1	Most relevant land-related legislation approved since independence	156
Table 2	What are the respondents NOT allowed to do with their land?	229
Table 3	Do you have a formal land title? What kind of land title?	232
Table 4	Estimated number of people WITHOUT legal tenure security	232
Table 5	Are you afraid of being evicted in the next five years?	234
Table 6	In case of dispute over your land parcel, who do you think is able to solve it fairly?	238
Table 7	In which situations can the Government take land from individuals and communities?	240

Annexes

Annex I	Portuguese land tenure legislation	302
---------	------------------------------------	-----

List of abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
APODETI	Timorese Popular Democratic Association (<i>Associação Popular Democrática Timorese</i>)
ASDT	Timorese Social Democrat Association (<i>Associação Social-Democrata Timorese</i>)
AusAID	Australian Agency for International Development
BAL	Indonesian Basic Agrarian Law of 1960 – Law 5/1960 (<i>Undang-Undang Pokok-Pokok Agraria</i>)
BPN	Indonesian National Land Agency (<i>Badan Pertanahan Nasional</i>)
CNRT	National Congress for Timorese Reconstruction (<i>Congresso Nacional da Reconstrução Timorese</i>)
CSO(s)	Civil Society Organization(s)
DNTP	National Directorate of Land and Property (<i>Direcção Nacional de Terras e Propriedades</i>)
DNTPSC	National Directorate of Land, Property and Cadastral Services (<i>Direcção Nacional de Terras, Propriedades, e Serviços Cadastrais</i>)
ESI	Estimated Sustainable Income
FANINTIL	Armed Forces for the National Liberation of East Timor (<i>Forças Armadas de Libertação Nacional de Timor-Leste</i>)
FITUN	Always United Front of Timor (<i>Frente Iha Timor Unidos Nafatin</i>).
FRETILIN	Revolutionary Front for an Independent East Timor (<i>Frente Revolucionária de Timor-Leste Independente</i>)
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GPS	Geographic Positioning System
INR	<i>Ita Nia Rai</i> project ('Our Land' in Tetum)
INTERFET	International Force for East Timor
J4P	World Bank-sponsored Justice for the Poor programme
KOTA	Association of Timorese Heroes (<i>Klibur Oan Timor Asuwain</i>)
LLP	USAID Land Law Program I and II
LPU	UNTAET Land and Property Unit
MoAFF	Ministry of Agriculture, Forest and Fisheries
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MP(s)	Member(s) of Parliament
NGO(s)	Non-governmental organization(s)
NWO-WOTRO	The Dutch Research Council, Science for Global Development programmes
OJECTIL	Organisation of Catholic East Timorese Youth and Students (<i>Organização Juventude Estudante de Timor-Leste</i>)

RENETIL	National Resistance of East Timorese Students (<i>Resistência Nacional dos Estudantes de Timor-Leste</i>)
SAPT	<i>Sociedade Agrícola Pátria e Trabalho</i>
SDP	Strategic Development Plan 2011-2030
SETP	State Secretary for Land and Property (<i>Secretário de Estado de Terras e Propriedades</i>)
SNC	National Cadastre System (<i>Sistema Nacional de Cadastro</i>)
UDT	Timorese Democratic Union (<i>União Democrática Timorense</i>)
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNTAET	United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor
UNTL	National University of Timor-Leste
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USD	United States Dollar
ZEESM	Special Economic Zone of Social Market Economy of Oecusse (<i>Zona Especial de Economia Social de Mercado de Oe-Cusse Ambeno</i>)