



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## Concurrence in European Private Law

Graaff, R. de

### Citation

Graaff, R. de. (2020, September 9). *Concurrence in European Private Law*. Meijers-reeks. Eleven International Publishing. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/136532>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/136532>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/136532> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Graaff, R. de

**Title:** Concurrence in European Private Law

**Issue Date:** 2020-09-09

## Concurrence in European Private Law



# Concurrence in European Private Law

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op woensdag 9 september 2020  
klokke 16.15 uur

*door*

**Ruben de Graaff**

geboren te Delft

in 1988

Promotores: prof. dr. A.G. Castermans  
prof. dr. S.C.G. Van den Bogaert

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. jur. T. Ackermann  
(Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, Duitsland)  
prof. dr. J.-S. Borghetti  
(Université Paris II Panthéon-Assas, Frankrijk)  
prof. dr. H.B. Krans  
prof. dr. R.C. Tobler

*Het onderzoeksverblijf aan de Ludwig-Maximilians Universiteit in München werd mede mogelijk gemaakt door het Swaantje Mondt Fonds (LUF).*

Opmaak: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven

© 2020 R. de Graaff | Eleven International Publishing

*This publication is protected by international copyright law.  
All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system,  
or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or  
otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.*

Printed in the Netherlands

ISBN 978-94-6236-134-8  
ISBN 978-90-5454-684-9 (e-book)

## Acknowledgements

The research benefited greatly from a stay at the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, with the department chaired by Professor Thomas Ackermann. The exchanges organised by the research group Grotius-Pothier should be mentioned as well. Especially Benjamin Moron-Puech has provided essential information on the developments in French law.



# Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XI
1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 An old discourse and a new debate	1
1.2 Different visions of the structure of the legal system	4
1.3 This book's focus on legal relations	9
1.4 Questions and outline	12
1.5 Scope and methodology	14
2 CONCURRENCE IN PRIVATE LAW	19
2.1 Introduction	19
2.2 Concurrence of legal rules	20
2.3 Claims, powers, defences	22
2.4 General and specific rules: <i>lex specialis derogat legi generali</i> ?	26
2.5 An alternative scheme of analysis	29
2.6 Conclusion	34
3 CONCURRENT CLAIMS IN CONTRACT AND TORT: A COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE	37
3.1 Introduction	37
3.2 Concurrence of the laws of contract and tort	38
3.3 The differences between the laws of contract and tort	41
3.4 French law: the gradual emergence of the <i>non-cumul</i> principle	43
3.5 German and Dutch Law: independent yet interdependent categories	48
3.6 English Law: independent yet interdependent categories	54
3.7 Conclusion	58
4 CONCURRENCE IN EUROPEAN PRIVATE LAW: TWO UNDERLYING PROPOSITIONS	61
4.1 Introduction	61
4.2 The sources of Union law and their effects	62
4.3 Primary Union law: claims and defences	66
4.4 Secondary Union law: claims, powers, defences	72
4.5 How to solve questions of interpretation in a multi-level legal order?	79
4.6 Conclusion	82

5	CONCURRENCE IN PRIMARY UNION LAW	85
5.1	Introduction	85
5.2	Article 18 TFEU and free movement law	87
5.2.1	Introduction	87
5.2.2	General and specific prohibitions of discrimination	89
5.2.3	From a discrimination approach to a restriction approach	92
5.2.4	Consequences for the interpretation of Article 18 TFEU?	96
5.2.5	Concurrence of Article 18 TFEU and free movement law?	101
5.2.6	Interim conclusion	105
5.3	Articles 101 and 102 TFEU	105
5.3.1	Introduction	105
5.3.2	A brief overview of the provisions	106
5.3.3	Similarities between Articles 101 and 102 TFEU	107
5.3.4	Differences between Articles 101 and 102 TFEU	110
5.3.5	Concurrence of Articles 101 and 102 TFEU?	114
5.3.6	Interim conclusion	117
5.4	Articles 101 and 102 TFEU and free movement law	118
5.4.1	Introduction	118
5.4.2	Similarities and differences between the provisions	118
5.4.3	Concurrence of competition law and free movement law?	123
5.4.4	Interim conclusion	127
5.5	Conclusion	128
6	CONCURRENCE IN SECONDARY UNION LAW	131
6.1	Introduction	131
6.2	When the Union legislature explicitly leaves room for other Union rules	132
6.3	When the Union legislature remains silent about the relationship between Union rules	137
6.4	How to determine whether national laws are affected by secondary Union rules?	143
6.5	The case of 'complete' harmonisation of national laws	147
6.6	The first exception: alternative rules	150
6.7	The second exception: exclusive rules	155
6.8	Conclusion	159
7	GENERAL CONCLUSION	161
7.1	Concurrence all over the place	161
7.2	Fundamental assumptions challenged	163
7.3	A shared scheme of analysis	165
7.4	Understanding the laws of the European Union	167
7.5	Lessons learned and questions raised	171

---

SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	177
Samenloop in het Europees privaatrecht	
TREATIES AND LEGISLATION	183
International treaties	183
European Union law	183
Primary law	183
Secondary legislation	183
Directives	183
Regulations	187
Documents	190
National legislative texts and proposals	190
France	190
The United Kingdom	191
CASE LAW	193
Union Courts	193
Judgments delivered by the Court of Justice of the European Union	193
Judgments delivered by the General Court of the European Union	200
Opinions of the Court of Justice of the European Union	200
Opinions of Advocates-General of the Court of Justice of the European Union	200
National courts	201
France	201
Germany	201
The Netherlands	202
The United Kingdom	203
LITERATURE	205
CURRICULUM VITAE	233



## List of Abbreviations

AC	The Law Reports, Appeal Cases (reports of court decisions, United Kingdom)
A-G	Advocate-General
Art.	Article
BGB	<i>Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch</i> (Civil Code, Germany)
BGH	<i>Bundesgerichtshof</i> (Federal Court of Justice, Germany)
BGHZ	<i>Entscheidungen des Bundesgerichtshofs in Zivilsachen</i> (reports of decisions delivered by the Federal Court of Justice concerning civil law, Germany)
Bull. civ.	<i>Bulletin civil de la Cour de Cassation</i> (reports of decisions delivered by the Supreme Court concerning civil law, France)
BW	<i>Burgerlijk Wetboek</i> (Civil Code, the Netherlands)
Cass.	<i>Cour de cassation</i> (Court of Cassation, France)
Cass. 1e civ.	<i>Cour de cassation, 1ère Chambre Civile</i> (First Civil Law Chamber of the Court of Cassation, France)
Cass. 2e civ.	<i>Cour de cassation, 2ème Chambre Civile</i> (Second Civil Law Chamber of the Court of Cassation, France)
Cass. 3e civ.	<i>Cour de cassation, 3ème Chambre Civile</i> (Third Civil Chamber of the Court of Cassation, France)
Cass. Ass. Plén.	<i>Assemblée plénière de la Cour de cassation</i>
Cass. ch. Réun.	<i>Les chambres réunies de la Cour de cassation</i>
Cass. Req.	<i>La chambre des requêtes de la Cour de cassation</i> (Chamber of admission, Court of Cassation, France)
CC	<i>Code Civil</i> (Civil Code, France)
cf.	<i>confer</i> (compare)
Ch	Chancery Division of the High Court (United Kingdom)
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
DCFR	Draft Common Frame of Reference
EC	European Communities
ECR	European Court Reports
EEC	European Economic Community
e.g.	<i>exempli gratia</i> (for example)
et seq.	<i>et sequentes</i> (and the following)
EU	European Union
EWCA	England and Wales Court of Appeal (United Kingdom)
HL	House of Lords (United Kingdom)
HR	<i>Hoge Raad der Nederlanden</i> (Supreme Court of the Netherlands)
ibid.	<i>ibidem</i> (in the same place)

---

i.e.	<i>id est</i> (in other words)
NJ	<i>Nederlandse Jurisprudentie</i> (reports of court decisions, the Netherlands)
NJW	<i>Neue Juristische Wochenschrift</i> (law journal, Germany)
OJ	Official Journal of the European Union
QB	Queen's Bench Division (United Kingdom)
Rv.	Wetboek van burgerlijke rechtsvordering (Code of Civil Procedure, the Netherlands)
<i>supra</i>	above
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
UKSC	United Kingdom Supreme Court
WLR	Weekly Law Reports, United Kingdom