



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Child marriage as a choice: rethinking agency in international human rights

Horii, H.

Citation

Horii, H. (2020, March 18). *Child marriage as a choice: rethinking agency in international human rights*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/87059>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/87059>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/87059> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Horii, H.

Title: Child marriage as a choice: rethinking agency in international human rights

Issue Date: 2020-03-18

Child Marriage as a Choice

Rethinking agency in international human rights

Child Marriage as a Choice

*Rethinking agency in international
human rights*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 18 maart 2020
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Hoko Horii

geboren te Osaka, Japan
in 1990

Promotoren: prof. mr. dr. A.W. Bedner
 prof. dr. G.A. van Klinken (Universiteit van Amsterdam)

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. T. Liefwaard
 prof. dr. B. Oomen (Universiteit Utrecht)
 dr. S.T. van Bemmelen (Senior Consultant, Indonesia)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2020 H. Horii

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets in deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Het reprorecht wordt niet uitgeoefend.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, made available or communicated to the public, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, unless this is expressly permitted by law.

Table of Contents

GLOSSARY	IX
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.1.1 Child marriage in the international arena	1
1.1.2 Academic debates on human rights and children's rights	5
1.1.3 Research setting: Child marriage in Indonesia and changing marriage patterns	10
1.2 Research design	14
1.2.1 Research question	14
1.2.2 Case study: Indonesia	14
1.2.3 Multi-layered analysis	16
1.2.4 Interdisciplinarity	19
1.2.5 Key concepts and terminologies	19
1.3 Research methods	23
1.3.1 Qualitative methodology	23
1.3.2 Multivocality and collaboration with local actors	28
1.3.3 Reflexivity	29
1.3.4 Research with adolescents & ethics	33
1.4 Overview of chapters	35
2 A BLIND SPOT IN THE INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS FRAMEWORK: A SPACE BETWEEN TRADITION AND MODERNITY WITHIN THE CHILD MARRIAGE DISCOURSE	37
2.1 Introduction	37
2.2 Development of the concept 'child marriage' in the international arena	39
2.2.1 Child marriage as a human rights violation	39
2.2.2 The first assumption: what it is to be a 'child'	40
2.2.3 The second assumption: modern ideals of 'marriage'	42
2.3 'Child marriage' in international discourse: childhood and agency	44
2.3.1 Use of terms related to child marriage	44
2.3.2 'Childhood' imagined in the international reports	46
2.4 'Child marriage' in international discourse: modernity and tradition	48
2.4.1 Analytical framework	48
2.4.2 'Tradition' invented in the international reports	49
2.4.3 'Modernity' celebrated in international reports	52
2.4.4 Blind spots in the dominant discourse	53
2.5 Implications of the hegemonic discourse	55
2.6 Conclusion	57

3	COMPROMISES BETWEEN LEGAL OBLIGATIONS AND RELIGIOUS CONCERNS: THE INDONESIAN STATE POLICIES AND CHILD MARRIAGE IN A VILLAGE IN WEST JAVA	59
3.1	Introduction	59
3.2	Child marriage and development in Indonesia	60
3.3	The making of state laws: dilemmas, compromise and contradictions	61
3.3.1	The controversy over the marriageable age and Marriage Law 1974	61
3.3.2	The Marriage Law and other laws with a definition of children	63
3.4	The role of various institutions in the state regulation of marriage	64
3.4.1	Marriage registration office for Muslims	65
3.4.2	Legal practice of underage marriage: judicial perspectives and justifications	65
3.5	Child marriage in a rural Muslim setting	66
3.5.1	Heterogeneity of child marriage	66
3.5.2	Illegal practices around underage marriage: procedures and reasons	68
3.5.3	Illegal practices around underage marriage: The role of marriage registrars, Amil, and KUA	70
3.6	Legal reform on the minimum age for marriage	72
3.7	Conclusions	74
4	LAWS FOR 'HARMONY': TEENAGE PREGNANCY, CHILD MARRIAGE, AND LEGAL INSTITUTIONS IN BALI	77
4.1	Introduction	77
4.1.1	The story of Ratna	77
4.1.2	Discussions over legal pluralism	78
4.1.3	Legal pluralism in Indonesia	80
4.1.4	Methodology	81
4.2	Marriage laws: The minimum age for marriage, marriage registration, and dispensation	82
4.2.1	Social norms and adat law on marriage and pregnancy	82
4.2.2	Relationship between adat and state law	86
4.2.3	Civil marriage registration	88
4.2.4	Marriage Dispensation Cases	90
4.3	Criminal law: sex crimes	93
4.4	Conclusion	98
5	CHILD MARRIAGE AS A 'SOLUTION' FOR MODERN YOUTH IN BALI	101
5.1	Prologue	101
5.2	Introduction	102
5.2.1	The danger of the 'rights discourse'	102
5.2.2	Conceptual framework	102
5.2.3	Methods	104

5.3 Sexual morality for adolescents in today's Indonesia	105
5.3.1 Child marriage and sexual morality	105
5.3.2 An accepted taboo: sex before marriage in Bali	107
5.3.3 Kehamilan Tak Diinginkan ('unwanted' pregnancy)	108
5.4 Current pluralized normative systems for adolescents	111
5.4.1 Opportunities and restrictions in modern social conditions	111
5.4.2 The exercise of agency in pluralized normative system	113
5.4.3 Paradox of modernity	114
5.5 Conclusion	116
6 WALKING A THIN LINE: TAKING CHILDREN'S DECISION TO MARRY SERIOUSLY	119
6.1 Introduction	119
6.2 A paradigm shift?	120
6.3 Child marriage framework within the CRC	122
6.3.1 Evolving capacity and rights to be heard	122
6.3.2 The best interest of the child	123
6.4 Children's agency and participation	124
6.5 Findings & Discussions	126
6.5.1 Case of Risky: exercising agency that inhabits norms	126
6.5.2 Case of Agus and Mawar: parental involvement and different types of decisions	127
6.5.3 Case of Ayu: genuine agency of her own and limited life options	128
6.5.4 Case of Swasti: social pressure	129
6.5.5 Overall Analysis	131
6.6 Conclusion	133
7 CONCLUSION	135
7.1 Discussions on choice in child marriage	135
7.2 Multiple normative frameworks that relate to the practice of child marriage	136
7.3 Multi-layered reasons why children marry	139
7.4 Rethinking agency in international human rights	141
7.5 Epistemologies of 'Human Rights' and functions of 'human rights'	143
7.6 Towards an empowerment approach: policy recommendations	144
SUMMARY	147
SAMENVATTING (SUMMARY IN DUTCH)	151
BIBLIOGRAPHY	155
APPENDICES	179
CURRICULUM VITAE	187

Glossary

ACRWC: African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Adat: social rules and practices of a community; also custom or tradition.

Adat law: *adat* rules with legal value.

Akta kelahiran: birth certificate.

Akta tunggal: single birth certificate, without the name of the father. A child with *akta tunggal* is considered to be an 'illegitimate child' (*anak luar kawin*).

Badan Kependudukan dan Keluarga Berencana Nasional: the governmental family planning institute in Indonesia.

BKKBN: see *Badan Kependudukan dan Keluarga Berencana Nasional*.

CEDAW: Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women.

CEDAW Committee: UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women.

Child Protection Law: Indonesian Child Protection Law No.23 of 2002, *UU Nomor 23 Tahun 2002 Tentang Perlindungan Anak*.

CRC: Convention on the Rights of the Child.

CRC Committee: UN Committee on the Rights of the Child.

CSO: Civil Society Organization.

Fatwa: Legal opinion given by Islamic authorities.

FGD: Focus Group Discussion.

Fiqh: Islamic doctrine.

Girls Not Brides: the platform of international organizations working against child marriage.

ICCPR: International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.

Kantor Urusan Agama (KUA): Office of Religious Affairs (Indonesia).

Kantor Catatan Sipil (KCS): Civil Registry Office (Indonesia).

Katrol usia: Manipulation of the age registered in the state civil registry. Increasing the age of the bride or groom by changing the birthdate in the required documents enables them to receive their official marriage certificates right after the religious ceremony.

KCS: see Kantor Catatan Sipil.

KHI: see Kompilasi Hukum Islam.

Kompilasi Hukum Islam (KHI): Compilation of Islamic Law (Indonesia).

KUA: see Kantor Urusan Agama.

KUHAP: Indonesian Criminal Procedure Code.

KUHP: Indonesian Penal Code.

LBH Apik Bali: *Lembaga Bantuan Hukum Asosiasi Perempuan Indonesia untuk Keadilan Bali* (Legal Aid Association of Indonesian Women for Justice). This is a local branch of the national CSO providing legal assistance for vulnerable people, such as women and children from low-income families.

Marriage Law 1974: Indonesian Marriage Law No.1 of 1974, *UU Nomor 1 Tahun 1974 Tentang Perkawinan*.

Pacaran: dating, courtship, or a romantic relationship formed before marriage.

Parisada Hindu Dharma Indonesia: a major organization involved in rallying for the preservation of Hindu and *adat* customs.

Penghulu: the district-level head of the Islamic bureaucracy whose functions include local marriage registration.

Perkumpulan Keluarga Berencana Indonesia: a civil society organization for family planning in Indonesia.

PKBI: see *Perkumpulan Keluarga Berencana Indonesia*.

PHDI: see *Parisada Hindu Dharma Indonesia*.

Reformasi: the period of political, legal, economic, and social reforms that followed President Suharto's resignation in 1998.

UNICEF: United Nations Children's Fund.

UNFPA: United Nations Population Fund.

Upacara: *adat* ceremonies.

Zinah: fornication, adultery, and sin in Islamic law. Adultery includes extra-marital and pre-marital sexual intercourse.