

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/25398> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Khalifa, Mohsen Abdelaty Haredy

Title: Female Transmission of Hadith in the Mamluk Period : an annotated edition and study of Ibn Hajar's Mu`jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam

Issue Date: 2014-04-29

Chapter Three

The Place of the *Muʿjam* Among Ibn Ḥajar's Writings and Some Similar Contemporary Works

3.1. Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī: A Biographical Sketch¹

Having established the authorship of the manuscript, and before looking at what the *Muʿjam* can add to our knowledge of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam, we need to pay attention to the historical and literary background of its compiler, Ibn Ḥajar. I will give a brief sketch on some important elements in his life. His full proper name is Aḥmad ibn ʿAlī ibn Muḥammad ibn Muḥammad ibn ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad al-Kinānī al-ʿAsqalānī. His *laqab* is Shihāb ad-Dīn. Later, he was given the *kunya* of Abū Al-Faḍl after Abū al-Faḍl Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad An-Nuwayrī, the *qāḍī* of Mecca.² He is known simply as Ibn Ḥajar. He was born in Cairo in 773/1372.

3.2. Ibn Ḥajar as an Author

Ibn Ḥajar is known as a teacher, a jurist, an author and a merchant.³ I will focus in these few pages on his position as a prolific writer, especially in the field of Ḥadīth, as he surpassed in that field most other scholars of his time, at least measured by the number of compilations that carry his name.⁴ Ibn Ḥajar left behind a huge number of writings. Historians differ on the exact number of the books he composed. Muhammad Zubayr Siddiqi gives the number 150 for both incomplete and complete works.⁵ In his *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī: A Study of the Background Education and Career of an ʿĀlim in Egypt*, Sabri Khalid Kawash divides Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī's works into four main categories: Ḥadīth, history, fiqh and poetry. Since Ḥadīth is a broad religious discipline, Kawash specifically divides Ibn Ḥajar's works in this field into seven categories: 1) collections of Ḥadīth; 2) annotations of some works on Ḥadīth; 3) commentaries; 4) methodology; 5) *rijāl*; 6) biographical works; 7) bibliographical works.⁶

¹ The life and career of Ibn Ḥajar have been studied in detail in three doctoral dissertations. The first is a Cambridge dissertation, A. A. Rahmani, "The Life and Works of Ibn Ḥajar al-Asqalani", which has been printed in installments in consecutive issues of *Islamic Studies*, XLV/3 (July 1971)- XLVII (July 1973). The second is a Princeton dissertation (1996), Sabri Khaled Kawash, *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī: A Study of the Background, Education, and Career of an ʿĀlim in Egypt* (Ph.D. diss., Princeton University, 1969.). The third is Shākir Maḥmūd ʿAbd al-Munʿim, *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī wa dirasāt Muṣannafātih wa manhajihī wa mawāridihī fī kitāb al-Iṣābah*, Baghdad: Dār ar-Risālah liṭ-Ṭibāʿah, 1978. This sketch is based on Kawash's and Andi Muhammad Ali Amiruddin, *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī on Tajrīḥ and Taʿdīl of Ḥadīth Transmitters: A Study of His Tahdhīb at-Tahdhīb*, (MA thesis, McGill University, 1999).

² Kawash, *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī*, 41.

³ For details on these four positions, see Kawash, *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī*, 115-218.

⁴ Amiruddin, *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī on Tajrīḥ and Taʿdīl*, 14.

⁵ Muhammad Zubayr Siddiqi, *Ḥadīth Literature*, 182 quoted from Amiruddin, *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī on Tajrīḥ and Taʿdīl*, 14.

⁶ Kawash, *Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī*, 192-193.

Another pivotal study on the works of Ibn Ḥajar is Shākir Maḥmūd ‘Abd al-Mun‘im’s *Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī wa-Dirāsāt Muṣannafātih wa-Manhajih wa-Mawāridih fī Kitābih al-Iṣābah*.⁷ ‘Abd al-Mun‘im gives the total number of Ibn Ḥajar’s works as 282 books. He divides these works into twenty-four categories as follows: the sciences of the Qur’ān (7 books); the principles of Ḥadīth (8 books); commentaries (*shurūḥ*) on Ḥadīth (12 books); the content (*matn*) of Ḥadīth (16 books); the defects (‘*ilal*) and criticism of Ḥadīth (11 books); methods of Ḥadīth (41 books); classification (*takhrīj*) of Ḥadīth (8 books); the collections of ten traditions (*al-‘Ushāriyyāt*) (11 books); the collections of forty traditions (*al-arba‘īniyyāt*) (11 books); the books of *al-Aṭrāf*⁸ (9 books), additions (*zawā‘id*)⁹ (7 books), substitutions (*Abdāl*)¹⁰ and accordances (*al-muwāfaqāt*)¹¹ (6 books), rearrangement (*at-Tartīb*)¹² (5 books), jurisprudence (*fiqh*) and its principles (28 books), theology (6 books); dictionaries and biographies of the masters (11 books); bibliographies (7 books); books of men (*rijāl*) (22 books); biographies and virtues (7 books); books of history (18 books), literature and language (13 books); collections of poems (*dawāwīn*) (3 compilations); scattered writings (*mutafarriqāt*) (3 books); answers (*ajwibah*) (13 books) and compilations attributed to him (*muṣannafāt mansūbah*) (38 books).

It is argued that Ibn Ḥajar lost many books during his second trip to Yemen. It is reported that while on his way from Mecca to Yemen, the ship on which he was traveling was wrecked off the shore. Ibn Ḥajar lost all he had aboard.¹³ As-Sakhāwī mentions the titles of the books that Ibn Ḥajar lost. He lost his *Aṭrāf al-Mizzī*, *Aṭrāf Musnad Aḥmad*, *Al-Aṭrāf al-Mukhtārah*, *Tartīb Musnad at-Ṭayālīsī*, and *Tartīb Musnad ‘Abd ibn Ḥumayd*.¹⁴

Within the scope of the present study we focus on the biographical dictionaries composed by Ibn Ḥajar. It was a common practice in early Muslim scholarship to collect the biographies of the teachers of a certain individual in a *mashyakhah* or a *mu‘jam*. This was done by the students who wanted to venerate their teachers on the one hand, and show the amount of their own learning on the other hand.¹⁵ This kind of work made it easier for subsequent generations of students of Ḥadīth to make the connection between one generation of scholars and the preceding one.¹⁶ (See further Chapter 4, below).

Ibn Ḥajar wrote a few books within this genre, the most important of which is *al-Mu‘jam al-Mu‘assis lil-Mu‘jam al-Mufahras*.¹⁷ This *Mu‘jam* is divided into two parts.

⁷ (Beirut: Mu‘assasat ar-Risālah, 1997)

⁸ *Al-Aṭrāf* is an index of the beginnings of *isnāds* of canonical collections. The most famous work on *al-Aṭrāf* is *Tuhfat al-Ashraf bi-ma‘rifat al-Aṭrāf* of the Syrian scholar Yūsuf ibn ‘Abd ar-Raḥmān al-Mizzī (d. 742/1341).

⁹ *Zawā‘id* are the Ḥadīths that are reported in one of the collections and are not included in other collections.

¹⁰ *Abdāl* is when a student of Ḥadīth transmits from the teacher of, for example, Imām Muslim’s teacher with a number of masters less than the number of masters if he transmits from Imām Muslim directly.

¹¹ See Chapter 6 below.

¹² Ibn Ḥajar arranged many Ḥadīths according to the *musnads* (‘*alā al-masānīd*) or legal topics to make it easy for students to locate the Ḥadīths in the canonical collections.

¹³ Kawash, *Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī*, 227; as-Sakhāwī, *al-Jawāhir*, 151.

¹⁴ As-Sakhāwī, *al-Jawāhir*, 151.

¹⁵ Kawash, *Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī*, 204.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁷ The *Mu‘jam* has been edited by Yūsuf ‘Abd ar-Raḥmān al-Mar‘ashlī (Beirut: Dār al-Ma‘rifah, 1992).

The first part contains the biographies of people whom Ibn Ḥajar calls *shuyūkh ar-Riwāyah*, the teachers of narration. This group consists of Ibn Ḥajar's teachers with whom he studied Ḥadīth or other disciplines. It also contains the biographies of the shaykhs from whom Ibn Ḥajar obtained *ijāzahs* without having studied with them. The second part contains the biographies of Ibn Ḥajar's teachers who taught him other branches of knowledge. He calls this group *shuyūkh ad-Dirāyah*¹⁸ (the teachers of the science which investigates the *isnād*, contents, subject, and the mode of transmission of Ḥadīth).

Ibn Ḥajar compiled some *Mu'jams* on behalf of some of his teachers. One of these is *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam*, the focus of this study. He also compiled *Mu'jam at-Tanūkhī* or *al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr li ash-Shāmī* for his teacher Burhān ad-Dīn Ibrāhīm ibn Aḥmad at-Tanūkhī (d. 800/1398). The book is divided into 24 parts and contains the biographies of more than four hundred teachers from whom at-Tanūkhī either obtained *ijāzahs* or heard Ḥadīth.¹⁹ Ibn Ḥajar also has a book entitled *Al-Muntaqā min Mu'jam as-Subkī*.²⁰

Sources tell us that Ibn Ḥajar also compiled a *Mashyakhah* called *al-Mashyakhah al-Bāsimah lil-Qibābī wa Fāṭimah*.²¹ In this *Mashyakhah*, he compiled the teachers of Taqī ad-Dīn 'Abd ar-Raḥmān ibn 'Umar al-Qibābī al-Maqdisī al-Ḥanbalī (d. 838/1434) from whom he heard some Ḥadīths or was given an *ijāzah* to transmit such Ḥadīths, along with the teachers of Fāṭimah bint Khalīl ibn Aḥmad al-Kinānī al-Maqdisī al-'Asqalānī (d. 833/1429). This *Mashyakhah* contains the biographies of 166 teachers, 136 biographies for al-Qibābī's teachers, 30 biographies for Fāṭimah's teachers, and 52 biographies of their common teachers.²² This *Mashyakhah* has an introduction in which Ibn Ḥajar explained the structure of the *Mashyakhah*. Ibn Ḥajar focused on the biographees and their relation to al-Qibābī and Fāṭimah bint Khalīl. Ibn Ḥajar did not quote any Ḥadīth or so after each biography as he did in the *Mu'jam ash-Shaykhah Maryam*. He explained that the purpose of the *Mashyakhah* was to list transmitted works, including the *Ṣaḥīḥs*, *Musnads*, *Mu'jams*, *Mashyakhahs*, *Fawā'id*, and other books which both al-Qibābī and Fāṭimah heard from or read to their teachers.²³ Ibn Ḥajar made an index at the end of the *Mashyakhah* of these transmitted works, a valuable element missing in the *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam*.²⁴ In another index, Ibn Ḥajar gave a list of the teachers for whom he could not find a biography. This element is missing in the *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam* as well.²⁵ A very unique characteristic of this *Mashyakhah* is that Ibn Ḥajar mentions the year in which the biographee gave an *ijāzah*

¹⁸ Kawash, *Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī*, 204.

¹⁹ As-Sakhāwī, *al-Jawāhir*, 669; 'Abd al-Mun'im, *Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī*, 289.

²⁰ 'Abd al-Mun'im, *Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī*, 290.

²¹ The *Mashyakhah* has been edited twice; first by Jacqueline Sublet (unpublished dis. *École Pratique des Hautes Études*. J. Sublet wrote an intensive article on the *Mashyakhah*, see Jacqueline Sublet, "Les Maitres et les études de deux traditionnistes de l'époque mamelouke: Al-Mashyakhah al-basima lil-Qibabi wa Fatima de Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani," *Bulletin d'études orientales* 20 (1967). It has also been published by Muḥammad Muṭī' al-Ḥāfiẓ (Damascus: Dār Farfūr, 2002).

²² Al-Kattānī, *Fihris al-Fahāris*, 2:636.

²³ Ibn Ḥajar, *al-Mashyakhah al-Bāsimah lil-Qibābī wa Fāṭimah*, ed. Muḥammad Muṭī' al-Ḥāfiẓ (Damascus: Dār Farfūr, 2002), 24.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, 165-173.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 174.

to al-Qibābī and Fāṭimah,²⁶ a very important element also missing in the *Mu'jam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam. A comparison of both *mashyakhahs* seems to underline that Ibn Ḥajar left the *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam* as a first (perhaps even unfinished) draft.

Ibn Ḥajar also compiled the *Mashyakhahs* of Abū aṭ-Ṭāhir ibn al-Kuwayk (d. 821/1418), Abū al-Ḥasan 'Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Abī al-Majd (death date unknown), al-Burhān al-Ḥalabī (Ibrāhīm ibn Muḥammad ibn Khalīl (d. 841/1438),²⁷ and Ibrāhīm ibn Yaḥyā al-'Azāzī best known as Ibn al-Kayyāl (d. 732/1331). He also compiled selections from the *Mashyakhahs* of Ibn 'Asākir (d. 571/1176), Ibn as-Sarārī, and al-Fakhr ibn al-Bukhārī (d. 690/1291). Ibn Ḥajar composed a *juz'* which had the comments of Ibn al-Jazarī (d. 833/1429) on the *Mashyakhah* of his teacher al-Junayd ibn Aḥmad al-Balyānī (d. 809/1406).²⁸ Unfortunately, these texts are not available to us.

3.3. Ibn Ḥajar's Care for Women's Biographies

It is worth drawing attention to Ibn Ḥajar's interest in including women's biographies in his works. In his *al-Iṣābah fī Tamayyūz aṣ-Ṣaḥabah*, he devoted the fourth volume to the biographies of female Companions.²⁹ Also in his *Taqrīb at-Tahdhīb*, he introduced 300 entries of female Companions, female Followers and female transmitters in the six major collections.³⁰ In his *Tahdhīb at-Tahdhīb*, Ibn Ḥajar devotes a special place to female transmitters, women known by their *kunyah* or *laqab*, and those known by "obscure names" (*asmā' mubhamah*).³¹ Ibn Ḥajar's *ad-Durar al-Kāminah*³² is also abundant with female biographies which reflect the female participation in the cultural and religious spheres in Egypt and Syria during the Mamluk period. Interestingly, Ibn Ḥajar was not the first to devote a special place to female transmitters. It has been a common practice by early biographers to devote a separate volume to females in their biographical dictionaries. This practice was first developed in the third/ninth century after Ibn Sa'd (d. 230/844) wrote his *aṭ-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubrā* and supplemented it with a volume on female transmitters. Al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī included a short section on the women of Baghdad in his *Tārīkh Baghdād*.³³ Both Ibn 'Abd al-Barr (d. 463/1070) in his *al-Istī'āb fī Ma'rifat al-Aṣḥāb* and Ibn al-Athīr (d. 630/1232) in his *Usd al-Ghābah fī Ma'rifat aṣ-*

²⁶ In many biographies, we read *wa ajāz li ṣāhib al-mashyakhah* (and he gave an *ijāzah* to the owner of this *Mashyakhah*...). See for example, *al-Mashyakhah al-Bāsimah*, entries no. 27, 28, 36, 39, 43, 46-7, 52, 53, 56, 63, 70, 74, 75, 76, 83, 84, 94, 97, 99, 106, 107, 108, 110, 114, 118, 131, 139, 140.

²⁷ As-Sakhāwī, *al-Jawāhir*, 670; 'Abd al-Mun'im, *Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī*, 291-292

²⁸ 'Abd al-Mun'im, *Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī*, 292.

²⁹ Amīnah Muḥammad Jamāl ad-Dīn, *An-Nisā' al-Muḥaddithāt fil-'Aṣr al-Mamlūkī wa dawruhunna fil-Ḥayāh al-Adabiyyah wa ath-Thaqāfiyyah* (Cairo: Dār al-Hidāyah, 2003), 10. The volume covers 1543 entries on women.

³⁰ *Ibid.*

³¹ Amiruddin, *Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī on Tajrīḥ and Ta'dīl*, 61.

³² It is a collection of 5204 biographies of the persons, who died in the eighth Islamic century—mainly, but not exclusively, Egyptians and Syrians—and who in Ibn Ḥajar's opinion, made a contribution to Islamic society, whether that contribution was political, military, religious, educational, literary, or economic in character. This work has been published twice, four volumes (Hyderabad, 1929/32); five volumes ed. M. Sayyid Jād al-Ḥaqq, (Cairo 1966). References in this study are to the first edition. Donald P. Little, "As-Safadi as Biographer of His Contemporaries," in Donald P. Little, ed. *Essays on Islamic Civilization Presented to Niyazi Berkes* (Leiden: Brill, 1976) 195.

³³ Huda Lutfi, "As-Sakhāwī's *Kitāb an-Nisā'* as a Source for the Social and Economic History of Muslim Women during the Fifteenth Century, AD," *Muslim World*, 71, (1981), 108.

Ṣaḥābah followed the same trend.³⁴ It is not surprising, then, that Ibn Ḥajar's student and biographer as-Sakhāwī (d. 902/1497) devoted the twelfth volume of his *aḍ-Ḍaw' al-Lāmi' li ahl al-Qarn at-Tāsi'* to noteworthy women in the ninth/fifteenth century. He entitled the volume *Kitāb an-Nisā'*.³⁵ He included nearly three hundred women who earned *ijāzahs* or awarded them to their own students.³⁶

3.4. A Comparison Between Ibn Ḥajar's *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam* and *ad-Durar al-Kāminah*

To place the *Mu'jam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam among Ibn Ḥajar's writings, I will make a comparison between it and *ad-Durar al-Kāminah*. The *Durar* is concerned mainly with biographies of people who lived in the eighth Islamic century. Therefore, it includes a reference to Ash-Shaykhah Maryam's teachers whom Ibn Ḥajar did meet personally. As-Sakhāwī gives another name to the *Durar*, which is *al-Wafayāt al-Kāminah li a'lām al-mi'ah ath-Thāminah*. Ibn Ḥajar expressed his wish to make the book in four volumes, but as-Sakhāwī tells us that he made a fair copy of two volumes only.³⁷ Ibn Ḥajar completed it in 830/1426. The *Durar* covers the period from 701/1301 to 800/1397.³⁸ Later, the author made a supplement to it and included the biographies of those who lived until 837/1433. He gave it the name of *Dhayl ad-Durar al-Kāminah*. There are two abridgements of the *Durar*; one by Jalāl ad-Dīn as-Suyūṭī (d. 911/1505) and the other by Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Hādī (d. 909/1503).³⁹

It is noteworthy that the information contained in biographical dictionaries usually presents both factual and illustrative material. Generally speaking, the factual material is employed, suggests Fahndrich, to designate a certain amount of information that is offered in almost every biography and that establishes each personality genealogically, historically, geographically, philosophically, professionally, and politically. It is the information that is usually not changed except in volume and arrangement, on its way from one historical work to another. This kind of information can be contrasted with illustrative material that, within the limits of an author's respect of tradition and his

³⁴ Amīnah Muḥammad Jamāl ad-Dīn, *An-Nisā' al-Muḥaddithāt*, 10.

³⁵ For an overview of the roles of women in this work, see Huda Lutfi, "As-Sakhāwī's *Kitāb an-Nisā'*", 104-24.

³⁶ Asma Sayeed, *Shifting Fortunes*, 239, note. 48.

³⁷ As-Sakhāwī, *al-Jawāhir*, 685.

³⁸ Ibn Ḥajar was the first to introduce the genre of centenary biographical dictionaries. In the ninth/fifteenth century as-Sakhāwī wrote *aḍ-Ḍaw' al-Lāmi' li ahl al-Qarn at-Tāsi'*. In the tenth/sixteenth century 'Abd al-Qādir al-'Aydārūs wrote *an-Nūr as-Sāfir fī A'yān al-Qarn al-'Ashir*, and Najm ad-Dīn al-Ghazzī (1061/1650) wrote *al-Kawākib as-Sā'irah bi A'yān al-Mi'ah al-'Ashirah*. In the eleventh/seventeenth century, al-Muḥibbī (d. 1111/1699) wrote *Khulaṣat al-Athar fī A'yān al-Qarn al-Hādī 'Ashar*. In the thirteenth/eighteenth century, Muḥammad ibn Khalīl al-Murādī (d. 1206/1791) wrote *Salk ad-Durar fī Tārīkh al-Qarn ath-Thālith 'Ashar*. However, it should be mentioned that before the eighth/fourteenth century there is a reference to similar works such as *al-Badr as-Sāfir wa Tuḥfat al-Musāfir fī Tarājim mashāhīr al-Qarn as-Sābi'* by al-Idfawī and *Tārīkh Mukhtaṣar al-Qarn as-Sābi'* by al-Qāsim ibn Muḥammad al-Birzālī. 'Abd al-Mun'im, *Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī*, 574.

³⁹ 'Abd al-Mun'im, *Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī*, 577.

personal literary capabilities and taste, is changed and modified in order to express changes in the image of the person he depicts.⁴⁰

As mentioned before, Ibn Ḥajar drafted the *Muʿjam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam in 803/1400. This means that he started it before compiling the *Durar*. One might suppose that the lacunae found in the *Muʿjam* should be missing in the *Durar*, as Ibn Ḥajar could have gathered the missing information from other sources and added them to the *Durar*. But to one's surprise, it is possible to find almost the same lacunae in the *Durar* too.⁴¹ It is of no special value to list the numerous occasions when Ibn Ḥajar borrows information from the *Muʿjam* in the *Durar*. Since Ibn Ḥajar had a tendency to paraphrase rather than quote his sources verbatim, it is difficult to trace all the details in his *Durar* which have the *Muʿjam* as their source.

Both books arrange the biographies alphabetically and insert the biographies of women within the alphabetical order, not in a separate volume. There is no consistency in terms of the length of biographies included in both books. Some biographies are very short and they do not exceed one line, while others may be very long. In the *Muʿjam*, Ibn Ḥajar's sources are mainly Ash-Shaykhah Maryam's *samāʿāt* and *ijāzāt*, in addition to other sources which were covered in **Chapter Two**. In the *Durar*, the sources are more numerous. Ibn Ḥajar says in the introduction:⁴² "I drew the information contained in this book from:

Aʿyān al-ʿAsr of Abū aṣ-Ṣafāʾ aṣ-Ṣafadī;⁴³

Majānī al-ʿAsr of Abū Ḥayyān;⁴⁴

Dhahabīyyat al-ʿAsr of Ibn Faḍl Allāh al-ʿUmarī;⁴⁵

Tārīkh Miṣr of Quṭb ad-Dīn al-Ḥalabī;⁴⁶

Dhayl Siyar an-Nubalāʾ of Shams ad-Dīn adh-Dhahabī;⁴⁷

Dhayl Dhayl al-Mirʾāh of ʿAlam ad-Dīn al-Birzālī;⁴⁸

Al-Wafayāt of Taqī ad-Dīn Ibn Rāfi;⁴⁹

Dhayl al-Wafayāt of Shihāb ad-Dīn Ibn Hijjī;⁵⁰

Al-Mawāʾiẓ wal-Iʿtibār of al-Maqrīzī;⁵¹

⁴⁰ Hartmut E. Fahndrich, "The Wafayāt al-Aʿyān of Ibn Khallikān: A New Approach." *Journal of American Oriental Society*, 93:4 (1973): 438.

⁴¹ Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 2:116 (1739), Ibn Ḥajar, *Muʿjam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam*, no. 98.

⁴² Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:5.

⁴³ Aṣ-Ṣafadī is quoted more than 100 times. See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:16 (24, 26), 1:27 (65), 1:71 (190), 1:135 (379). These may be cases in point.

⁴⁴ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:111 (307), 1:152 (410), 1:185 (480), 1:221 (569), 1:274 (700). These may be cases in point.

⁴⁵ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:71 (189), 1:191 (495), 1:259 (664), 1:346 (855), 1:432 (1134), 1:475 (1282). These may be cases in point.

⁴⁶ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:9 (9), 1:553 (1440), 2:124 (1773), 2:136 (1819), 2:161 (1858). These may be cases in point.

⁴⁷ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:11 (14), 1:526 (1424), 2:210 (1964), 2:253 (2129), 2:357 (2390). These may be cases in point.

⁴⁸ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:44 (111), 1:112 (310), 1:167 (424). These may be cases in point.

⁴⁹ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:9 (11), 1:15 (23), 1:16 (24), 1:27 (66), 1:36 (89). These may be cases in point.

⁵⁰ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:62 (166), 1:200 (515), 1:338 (842), 2:24 (1530), 2:104 (1706). These may be cases in point.

The *Muʿjams* of our teachers;

Al-Wafayāt of Abū al-Ḥusayn ibn Aybak ad-Dimyāṭī;⁵²

Dhayl al-Wafayāt of Abū al-Faḍl ibn al-Ḥusayn al-ʿIrāqī.⁵³

Tārīkh Ghirnāṭah of Lisān ad-Dīn ibn al-Khaṭīb;⁵⁴ and

At-Tārīkh of Walī ad-Dīn ibn Khaldūn al-Mālikī.⁵⁵

In the *Durar*, Ibn Ḥajar made use of all these sources. However, in the female biographies, he did not make it clear whether he used some of them except in a very few cases.⁵⁶ The main sources from which he drew information on female biographies are the *Wafayāt* of Ibn Rāfiʿ⁵⁷ and the *Dhayl Siyar an-Nubalāʾ* of adh-Dhahabī.⁵⁸ We can also notice that Ibn Ḥajar did not depend on books of history or obituaries for collecting data on female biographies. We mentioned earlier that he made use of the *Muʿjams* and the *Mashyakhahs* of his teachers. These *Muʿjams* and *Mashyakhahs* were very accurate, as they were composed from data obtained in personal contacts between the student and the teacher. The *Muʿjams* and *Mashyakhahs* have abundant information on the *muḥaddithāt* as their main focus falls upon the Ḥadīth teachers (including the women among them) of the author of the *Muʿjam* or the *Mashyakhah* or their principal protagonist(s).⁵⁹ These *Muʿjams* and *Mashyakhahs* include the following:

The *Muʿjam* of Abū Ḥamid ibn Zahrāh (11 biographies);⁶⁰

The *Muʿjam* of Ibn Rāfiʿ (10 biographies);⁶¹

The *Muʿjam* of adh-Dhahabī (4 biographies);⁶²

The *Mashyakhah* of al-ʿIzz ibn Jamāʿah, compiled by Abū Jaʿfar ibn al-Kuwayk (3 biographies);⁶³

The *Muʿjam* of al-Birzālī (3 biographies);⁶⁴

The *Mashyakhah* of Wajīhiyyah aṣ-Ṣaʿīdiyyah al-Iskandārāniyyah, compiled by Taqī ad-Dīn Ibn Rāfiʿ (1 biography);⁶⁵

⁵¹ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:137 (384), 1:272 (695), 2:89 (1662). These may be cases in point.

⁵² See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:259 (666), 1:300 (760), 2:234 (2071). These may be cases in point.

⁵³ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:17 (27), 1:75 (201), 1:107 (296), 1:137 (384). These may be cases in point.

⁵⁴ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:59 (157), 1:77 (204), 1:102 (279), 1:135 (378), 1:178 (455). These may be cases in point.

⁵⁵ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 3:377 (999), 2:309 (2248), 3:289 (766). These may be cases in point.

⁵⁶ Amīnah Muḥammad Jamāl ad-Dīn, "Tarājim al-Muḥaddithāt fil-ʿAṣr al-Mamlūkī: Dirāsah Awwaliyyah fil-Maṣādir," *Majjalat Buḥūth as-Sunnah wa as-Sīrah* (Qatar 1992), 483. For these cases, see Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 4:406 (his sources are *al-Wafayāt* of Ibn Rāfiʿ and *Aʿyān al-ʿAsr* of aṣ-Ṣafadī), 3:227 (his source is *Tārīkh Miṣr* of al-Quṭb al-Ḥalabī, 2:123, 3:224, 225 (his source is *Dhayl Dhayl al-Mirʿah* of al-Birzālī; 2:127, 128, 3:220 (his source is *Dhayl al-Wafayāt* of Abū al-Faḍl ibn al-Ḥusayn al-ʿIrāqī).

⁵⁷ Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:361, 2:120, 121, 126, 3:222, 224, 228, 4:386.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 2:221, 129, 3:221, 225, 4:390.

⁵⁹ Amīnah Jamāl ad-Dīn, "Tarājim al-Muḥaddithāt", 484.

⁶⁰ Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:360, 412, 2:120, 121, 123, 189, 236, 3:225, 268, 4:385, 404.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, 1:361, 2:120, 121, 126, 3:222, 224, 228, 4:386.

⁶² *Ibid.*, 3:221, 223, 225, 4:397.

⁶³ *Ibid.*, 3:224, 225, 5:385.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, 3:221, 223, 225.

⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, 4:406.

The *Mashyakhah* of Zāhidah bint Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd Allāh aṭ-Ṭāhirī, compiled by al-Muqātilī (1 biography);⁶⁶

To one's surprise, Ibn Ḥajar never mentioned the *Muʿjam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam* as one of his sources. There is no clear reason for this, but it is possible that he did not have access to the *Muʿjam* at the time of compiling the *Durar*.

In more than one case, Ibn Ḥajar cites what has been recorded in more than one *Muʿjam* about the same biographee and compares between the different stories, selects the authentic one and adds it to the biography.⁶⁷ In the biography of Fāṭimah bint Abī Bakr, he says: "Al-Birzālī, adh-Dhahabī, and Ibn Rāfiʿ heard Ḥadīth from her and they cited Ḥadīths on her authority in their *Muʿjams*."⁶⁸ In the biography of Nafīṣah bint Ibrāhīm ibn Sālim, we read: "Al-Birzālī, adh-Dhahabī, and Ibn Rāfiʿ heard Ḥadīth from her and mentioned her in their *Muʿjams*. She transmitted a lot until she died in 15 Jumāda al-ʿUlā 15, 749, according to Ibn Rāfiʿ."⁶⁹ Though Ibn Ḥajar drew his information from the *Muʿjams* of Nafīṣah's three students, he preferred to quote the date of her death from the *Wafayāt* of Ibn Rāfiʿ.⁷⁰ In six female biographies, Ibn Ḥajar drew the information orally from one of the biographee's students.⁷¹ One final source, which is not mentioned in the introduction, is the book of *Man kān ḥayyan min Shuyūkh Ḥalab* by Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā ibn Saʿd.⁷²

A closer look at the biographies in both the *Muʿjam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam and the *Durar* reveals that the space of time covered by them is common, as they include the biographies of those who died in the eighth century of the Hijrah. Ibn Ḥajar pays much attention to the biographies of Ḥadīth scholars and he relates this to the fact that many of the biographees were the teachers of his teachers.⁷³ Surprisingly enough, in the *Durar*, we may find lacunae which do not figure in the *Muʿjam*. For example, in the biography of ʿĀminah bint ʿAbd ar-Raḥmān al-Maqdisiyyah, the date of her birth is mentioned in the *Muʿjam* while Ibn Ḥajar misses it in the *Durar*. There is no clear reason for that. The *Durar* is supposed to have been compiled many years after the *Muʿjam*, hence Ibn Ḥajar could have made use of it to fill out such a lacuna. Before venturing into an explanation, let us first pay attention to another inconsistency between the *Muʿjam* and the *Durar*. The following biographies which Ibn Ḥajar included in the *Muʿjam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam are missing in the *Durar*: no. 69, 70, 71, 78, 79, 91, 92, 94, 96, 112, 136, 140, 161, 167, 170, 171, 182, 186, 201, 205, 211, 228, 233, 240, 246, 249, 260, 287, and 299.

It is noteworthy that some biographies are almost identical in both the *Durar* and the *Muʿjam*.⁷⁴ However, some biographies are very short in the *Durar* while they are

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 2:112-113.

⁶⁷ Amīnah Jamāl ad-Dīn, "Tarājim al-Muḥaddithāt", 485.

⁶⁸ Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 3:223.

⁶⁹ Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 4:397.

⁷⁰ Amīnah Jamāl ad-Dīn, "Tarājim al-Muḥaddithāt", 485.

⁷¹ *Ibid.* For examples, see Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:361, 2:188, 237, 3:227 (no. 569, 570).

⁷² Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 2:129. Amīnah suggests that the book has been lost as there is no reference to it anywhere. Amīnah Jamāl ad-Dīn, "Tarājim al-Muḥaddithāt", 485.

⁷³ Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:4.

⁷⁴ See, for example, the biography of Yūnus ibn al-Qaṣṣār. In the *Durar* we read: "Yūnus ibn Muḥammad ibn Yūnus ibn Abī al-Qāsim al-Ḥarrānī Abū an-Nūn ad-Dallāl. Wulida sanat 650 wa ʿusmi ʿa ʿala an-Najīb al-Ḥarrānī as-Sādis wal-ʿāshir wal-ḥādī ʿashar min Muwāfaqātih wa min Abī Bakr ibn al-ʿImād Muṣāfahātih wa ḥaddath. Māta fī 12 Jumāda al-ʿUlā sanat 739." Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 4:488 (1340).

more detailed in the *Mu'jam*.⁷⁵ On the other hand, some biographies are short in the *Mu'jam* but are much more detailed in the *Durar*.⁷⁶ Sometimes the details added to a biography complete the picture about the life of a certain scholar. For example, in the biography of Aḥmad ibn 'Umar ibn 'Afāf al-'Aṭṭār, included in the *Mu'jam*, Ibn Ḥajar adds that he suffered from a slight form of blindness when he was of an old age. He also adds that al-'Aṭṭār was an experienced pharmacist. Both pieces of information are not included in his biography in the *Durar*. This opens the possibility that he in fact worked on the *Mu'jam* and added information to it, even after having completed the *Durar*. Now we have a complete picture about al-'Aṭṭār. By stating that he was blind, people are warned against relying much on reports from him. Having had some experience in pharmacy is an indication of the vast knowledge that al-'Aṭṭār had even in non-religious sciences.

Ibn Ḥajar shows an interest in mentioning the relation between him and the biographee. For example, in the biography of Ibn al-Kayyāl, he says: "I compiled a *mashyakhah* for him, which contains the biographies of 80 teachers."⁷⁷ We can also notice that in both works, Ibn Ḥajar attaches great value to mentioning the person's dates of birth and death. If there is more than one possibility, he records them all without giving the reference. The usual term used in this case is *qīla* (it is said).⁷⁸ Ibn Ḥajar's reliability becomes evident by reading the *Durar* and the *Mu'jam* hand in hand with the sources referred to by him wherever this is feasible. Such a comparison proves his reliability in excerpting other works, which enables us to obtain trustworthy references to and extracts from works non-extant or data on authors unknown to us. If we pay special attention to female biographies, we can notice that in the *Durar* Ibn Ḥajar was very careful to state whether a female biographee worked as *muḥadditha* or not. However, he left out this item in the biography of 3 female biographees,⁷⁹ while in the *Mu'jam* of Ash-

In the *Mu'jam* we read: "*Yūnus ibn Muḥammad ibn Yūnus al-Qaṣṣār al-Ḥarīrī Abū an-Nūn Badr ad-Dīn ad-Dallāl, sami'a min an-Najīb ath-Thālīth min Mashayakhatih aṣ-Ṣuḡhrā as-Sādis wal-'āshir wal-ḥādī 'ashar min Muwāfaqātih wa sami'a aydan min Abī Bakr ibn al-'Imād Muṣafāḥātih, wa ḥaddath. Mawliduhu sanat khamsin wa sittmi'ah wa mat fī thānī 'ashar Jumāda al-'Ākhira min sanat tis' wa thalāthīn wa sab'mi'ah.*" Ibn Ḥajar, *Mu'jam Maryam*, no. 323.

⁷⁵ See, for example, Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 2:326, (2287). We read "*Abd ar-Raḥmān ibn Ismā'īl ibn Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh ibn Mūsā al-Maqdisī Zayn ad-Dīn Abū Muḥammad wulida sanat Wa 'usmi'a 'alā al-Yaldānī wa ḥaddath wa māta ...*" In the *Mu'jam Maryam* we read: "*Abd ar-Raḥmān ibn Ismā'īl ibn Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Maqdisī ibn aṣ-Ṣaffī al-'Aṭṭār Zayn ad-Dīn sami'a min Ibrāhīm ibn Khalīl Juz' Ibn al-Furāt wa Nuskhāt Abī Mushir wa Juz' Ibn Ubayy al-Furātī wa 'alā Ibn 'Abd ad-Dā'im wa 'alā al-Yaldānī Juz' Ibn 'Arafah wa 'alā Ibn 'Abd ad-Dā'im wa Ibn 'Abd al-Hādī wa Khatīb Mardā Juz' Bakr ibn Bakkār wa sami'a min hā'ulā' ghayra dhālik wa min ghayrihim wa ajāza lahu as-Sibṭ wa Muḥammad ibn Anjab wa Ibn Banīn wal-Mundhirī wa Ibn 'Abd as-Salām wa ghayrihim wa ḥaddatha mawliduhu fī Ramaḍān sanata sitt wa arba'in wa sittmi'ah wa tuffiya fī sādis 'ashar shahr Rabī' al-'Awaal sanata sab' wa 'ishrīn wa sab'mi'ah.*" (Biography no. 135).

⁷⁶ For example, we read in the *Mu'jam*: "*Asmā' bint Ya'qūb ibn Aḥmad ibn Ya'qūb ibn 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abd ar-Raḥmān al-Muqri'.*" (Biography no. 63) While we read in the *Durar*: "*Asmā' bint Ya'qūb ibn Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abd ar-Raḥmān al-Ḥalabīyyat al-aṣl thumma al-Miṣriyyah al-ma'rūf wāliduha bi Ibn aṣ-Ṣābūnī tuknā Umm al-Faḍl uḥdirat fī ath-Thālīthā 'alā al-'Izz al-Fārūthī wa ḥaddathat wa mātat fī thālīth 'ashar Ṣafar sanat 762 wa qad zādat 'alā t-Tis'in arrakhahā Ibn Rāfi'.*" Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 1:361.

⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, 1:76.

⁷⁸ In the *Mu'jam Maryam*, see biographies no. 87, 90, 139, and 141. In the *Durar*, see 1:70 (187), 1:223-4 (573), 1:477 (1289), 2:27 (1537), 4:26 (71), 4:37 (100), 4:64-5 (184), 4: 125 (324), 4:168 (450),

⁷⁹ Ibn Ḥajar, *ad-Durar*, 2:103 (1701), 2:126 (1782), 4:399 (1098)

Shaykhah Maryam the position of the same biographees in Ḥadīth transmission is well documented.⁸⁰ The preceding discussion supports the possibility that Ibn Ḥajar never made any use of the *Mu'jam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam at all. There may be a very simple explanation for this, for instance that the papers of his draft had been put in a place where he did not succeed to trace them.

3.5. The *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam* and Similar Contemporary Works

Upon comparing the *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam* with similar contemporary works, I will try to point out the different styles of compiling *Mu'jam ash-Shuyūkh* in the age of Ibn Ḥajar. This will tell us about how certain details were collected and how each compiler came by his information. If we compare the *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam* with one of its contemporary *Mu'jams* such as that of Tāj ad-Dīn as-Subkī (d. 771/1369), the following remarks are pertinent. Both *Mu'jams* were compiled by a student of the author. The *Mu'jam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam had been compiled by her student Ibn Ḥajar, that of as-Subkī by his student Ibn Sa'd aṣ-Ṣāliḥī (d. 759/1357). Both Ibn Ḥajar and Ibn Sa'd aṣ-Ṣāliḥī compiled *Mu'jams* for other male and female scholars. Abū al-Maḥāsīn al-Ḥusaynī (d. 765/1364) said about Ibn Sa'd: "And he compiled (*mu'jams* and *mashyakhahs*) for many of his teachers and colleagues."⁸¹ Ibn Sa'd aṣ-Ṣāliḥī compiled *mashyakhahs* for 'Ā'ishah aṣ-Ṣāliḥiyyah, 'Abd al-Karīm ibn 'Abd al-Karīm ibn 'Abd ar-Raḥmān al-Ba'labakkī (d. 760/1358),⁸² 'Abd ar-Raḥīm ibn 'Abd al-Waḥhāb as-Salmī al-Ba'labkki (d. 737/1337),⁸³ and Yūsuf ibn Yaḥyā 'Abd ar-Raḥmān ibn Najm al-Anṣārī (751/1350).⁸⁴ Ibn Kathīr attributes Ibn Sa'd's interest in compiling the *mashyakhahs* to the fact he had a good knowledge of the names of *ajzā'* of Ḥadīth and their transmitters.⁸⁵ Apart from the *Mu'jam Ash-Shaykhah Maryam*, Ibn Ḥajar also compiled, among others, the *Mashyakhah* of al-Qibābī and Fāṭimah.⁸⁶

Ibn Sa'd al-Anṣārī died in 759/1357, that is 12 years before the death of as-Subkī. In fact, as-Subkī had seen a draft of his *Mu'jam* and made comments on it.⁸⁷ Ibn Sa'd al-Anṣārī read the 16 gatherings of the *Mu'jam* in the presence of as-Subkī; the first gathering in seven sessions, the second in nine sessions.⁸⁸ In the case of the *Mu'jam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam, it is true that Ibn Ḥajar finished its compilation in 803/1400, that

⁸⁰ See biographies no. 97, 103, 30^.

⁸¹ Muḥammad ibn 'Alī ibn al-Ḥasan al-Ḥusaynī, *Dhayl Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1998), 60.

⁸² For his biography, see as-Subkī, *Mu'jam ash-Shuyūkh*, 257.

⁸³ For his biography, see Ibn al-'Imād, *Shadharāt adh-Dhahab*, 6:225.

⁸⁴ *Mu'jam ash-Shuyūkh li Tāj ad-Dīn 'Abd al-Waḥhāb ibn 'Alī as-Subkī*, ed. Bashshār 'Awwād Ma'rūf and others (Beirut: Dār al-Gharb al-Islāmī, 2004), 16. For the biography of Yūsuf ibn Yaḥyā, see as-Subkī, *Mu'jam ash-Shuyūkh*, 591-20.

⁸⁵ Ismā'īl ibn 'Umar Ibn Kathīr, *Al-Bidāyah wa an-Nihāyah* (Cairo: Dār Iḥyā' at-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1988), 14:236.

⁸⁶ For other works compiled by Ibn Ḥajar, see Chapter 3.

⁸⁷ As-Subkī added to the *Mu'jam* the biographies of Khalīl ibn Aybak aṣ-Ṣafadī (entry no. 47), Khalīl ibn Kaykaldī al-'Alā'ī (entry no. 48), Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd ar-Raḥmān al-'Asjadī (entry no. 33), and Jibrīl ibn Yāqūt al-Maṣrī (entry no. 45). The comments made by as-Subkī may be in the form of adding some more *ajzā'* or books which he heard from a certain teacher. *Mu'jam ash-Shuyūkh*, 17.

⁸⁸ *Mu'jam ash-Shuyūkh*, 17.

is 2 years before the death of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam, but it is not clear whether she had seen a draft of it or not, nor whether it had been read to her.

The *Muʿjam* of as-Subkī includes the biographies of 172 male and female teachers, and is arranged alphabetically. The biographies of female teachers come at the end of the biographies of male teachers, not interspersed among them, as is the case of the *Muʿjam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam. The total number of female teachers in the *Muʿjam* of as-Subkī is twenty, but in the *Muʿjam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam there are 28 female teachers.

The compiler of the *Muʿjam* of as-Subkī divides each biography into three main parts. In the first part he gives some details on the personal life of the biographee. This includes his/her lineage, his/her teachers, what as-Subkī heard from him/her, his/her educational background, and what other scholars say about him/her, and the date of his/her death and birth. His main sources for this part are as-Subkī's *aṭ-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubrā*, al-Bīrzālī's *Muʿjam ash-Shuyūkh*, and adh-Dhahabī's *Muʿjam ash-Shuyūkh*. In the second part, the compiler lists a report which as-Subkī heard from his teacher. In the third part, the compiler locates this report in the Ḥadīth collections based on al-Mizzī's *Tuḥfat al-Ashrāf*.⁸⁹ What is unique about this part is that the compiler gives many details about the report quoted and its authenticity. He might explain difficult words in the text or give a short biography of the transmitter from al-Mizzī's *Tahdhīb al-Kamāl*.⁹⁰

Another unique feature of the *Muʿjam* of as-Subkī is that the compiler gives the year in which as-Subkī heard a certain Ḥadīth from his teacher or the year in which he was awarded an *ijāzah* by the teacher. In many entries we read “*wa ajāza lanā fī sanati...*” (and he awarded us an *ijāzah* in the year of...).⁹¹ The compiler of the *Muʿjam* of as-Subkī lists all the reports which as-Subkī heard from or read to his teachers. This aspect is missing in the case of the *Muʿjam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam. But Ibn Ḥajar listed these reports in other books such as *al-Majmaʿ al-Muʿassis lil-Muʿjam al-Mufahras*.⁹²

Usually, a biography of the author of a *Muʿjam*, or of the person for whom the *Muʿjam* was compiled, is provided within the *Muʿjam*. Such a biography can tell us about the places the author or the main protagonist visited, and the people he/she met. It also gives us an idea about the way of life he/she led, the events of his/her time he/she was involved in, and the sort of company he/she kept. Unfortunately, the compilers of the *Muʿjam* of Ash-Shaykhah Maryam and the *Muʿjam* of as-Subkī did not include a biography for the authors for whom the *Muʿjams* have been compiled.

⁸⁹ In very few entries, he quotes *Musnad Aḥmad*, *Sunan al-Bayhaqī* and the *Mustadrak* of al-Ḥākim.

⁹⁰ For comments on the narrators, see *Muʿjam as-Subkī*, 173, 217, 249, 250, 261, 266, 272, 274, 276, and 296. For comments made by Ibn Ḥajar on the narrators, see for example biographies no. 3, 61, and 243. In one case Ibn Ḥajar identifies the name of one transmitter referred to in the *isnād* by his *kunyah* and family name. See the report quoted in biography no. 125.

⁹¹ See, for example, *Muʿjam as-Subkī*, 40, 65, 75, 82, 130, 142, 171, 176, 200, 212,

⁹² See *al-Majmaʿ al-Muʿassis lil-Muʿjam al-Mufahras*, 400-5.