Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

# Reconstructing a Hopeful Theology in the Context of Evolutionary Ethics

Keogh, G.

**Citation**
Keogh, G. (2014, June 11). *Reconstructing a Hopeful Theology in the Context of Evolutionary Ethics*. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/25894

| | |
|---|---|
| Version: | Corrected Publisher's Version |
| License: | Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden |
| Downloaded from: | https://hdl.handle.net/1887/25894 |

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page

Universiteit Leiden

The handle http://hdl.handle.net/1887/25894 holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

**Author:** Keogh, Gary
**Title:** Reconstructing a hopeful theology in the context of evolutionary ethics
**Issue Date:** 2014-06-11

# Reconstructing a Hopeful Theology in the Context of Evolutionary Ethics

Proefschrift
ter verkrijging van de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 11 juni 2014
klokke 13.45 uur
door

**Gary Keogh**

geboren te Dublin, Ireland
in 1987

PROMOTIECOMMISSIE

*Promotor*

Prof.dr. W.B. Drees

*Overige leden*

Prof.dr. E.P. Bos
Prof.dr. H. Philipse (Utrecht University)
Prof.dr. R.D.N. van Riessen
Prof.dr. M. Ruse (Florida State University)

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am privileged to know a number of people who have been highly supportive and encouraging in relation to this project and my career. From teachers to colleagues, there are a number of people to whom I must express my gratitude for their reassuring confidence; Stanford Kingston of Trinity College, Dublin, and Dr Patrick McDevitt and Ronan Tobin of All Hallows College, Dublin City University. Dr Thomas Dalzell and Siobhán Larkin, both also of All Hallows, gave me significant support by allowing me the opportunity to teach on undergraduate modules and thus, further test myself professionally and learn my craft. Dr Siobhán Cahillane-McGovern gave me further opportunities at Hibernia College, allowing me to merge my interests in religious studies and education on their teacher-training programmes, and for that I am also most grateful to her. I must also thank all of my students for their stimulating engagement with my courses.

For conversations and comments on the academic content of this work, I must thank my colleagues on the committee of the Irish Theological Association, and also Dr Joseph McCann for his insightful perspective on various aspects of my ideas. I must also thank my Ph.D. committee, Prof. Michael Ruse, Prof. Renée van Riessen, Prof. Herman Philipse, and Prof. Bert Bos.

Academically, I undoubtedly owe the biggest debt to Prof. Willem B. Drees. I feel honoured that Prof. Drees agreed to act as my promoter at Leiden University, and from the time of my initial proposal, he has provided invaluable guidance and challenged me to develop my ideas more rigorously; for these reasons and others I must simply say a sincere ‘thank you’.

On a personal level, I am certain that those around me invested as much energy into this project as I did, if not more. Without them, completing this work would most definitely, not have been possible; Edel, my brother Eric, and my parents, Maura and Brendan.

*Go Raibh Míle Maith Agaibh* (a thousand thanks)

# CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ..... 3
Introduction ..... 7
Chapter One: The Context of Theological Metaethics: A Presupposed Good and Conspicuous Evil ..... 13
1.0 Introduction ..... 13
1.1 Preliminary Semantic Clarifications ..... 15
1.2 The Theo-Centric Context of Ethics ..... 16
1.3 The Theodicy Question ..... 20
1.4 Original Sin: Evil as Sin and Punishment ..... 26
1.4.1 Sin and Human Nature ..... 31
1.4.2 Suffering as Punishment ..... 33
1.5 The Legacy of Original Sin ..... 36
1.6 Problems with Original Sin as a Theodicy in Light of Darwin ..... 44
1.6.1 Issues with the Asymmetry of A Primordial Good and Conspicuous Evil ..... 44
1.6.2 The Measure of Suffering ..... 48
1.6.3 Anthropocentrism ..... 50
1.7 Conclusion ..... 52
Chapter Two: The Compatibility of Evolutionary Ethics and Christian Ethics ..... 55
2.0 Introduction ..... 55
2.1 An Understanding of Christian Ethics ..... 58
2.1.1 Moral Freedom ..... 59
2.1.2 Agape and Neighbourly Love ..... 61
2.1.3 Natural Law ..... 66
2.2 An Understanding of Evolutionary Ethics ..... 69
2.2.1 The Question of Altruism in an Evolutionary Context ..... 71
2.2.2 Evolutionary Explanations for Altruism ..... 74
2.3 Perceived Conflict with Human Freedom ..... 84
2.4 Perceived Conflict with Agape and Neighbourly Love ..... 97
2.5 Perceived Conflict with Natural Law ..... 102
2.6 Conclusion ..... 108
Chapter Three: An Evolutionary Theological Metaethic ..... 111

3.0 Introduction ..... 111
3.1 A Shift in the Framework for Understanding Good and Evil ..... 114
3.2 A Shift in Understanding God's Creative Action ..... 120
3.3 A Shift Towards an Eschatological View ..... 123
3.4 The Divine in an Evolutionary View ..... 135
3.5 Eschatology and Evil ..... 140
3.6 Eschatology and Present Moral Responsibilities ..... 147
3.7 Culmination of Evolutionary and Axiological Themes ..... 150
3.8 Conclusion ..... 152
Chapter Four: A Theologically Appropriated Naturalistic Ontology ..... 154
4.0 Introduction ..... 154
4.1 A Naturalistic Ontology: Overcoming its Discontents ..... 156
4.2 The Theological Coherence of a Naturalistic Ontology ..... 173
4.2.1 Alternative Possibilities ..... 174
4.2.2 Natural Evil ..... 183
4.2.3 The Integrity of Contingency ..... 189
4.3 A Theological Appropriation of a Naturalistic Ontology ..... 191
4.4 Conclusion ..... 201
Chapter Five: A Hopeful Theology in the Context of Evolutionary Ethics ..... 203
5.0 Introduction ..... 203
5.1 Overcoming Material Fatalism: The Question of Free Will ..... 205
5.1.1 Free Will Contra a Material Mind ..... 208
5.1.2 Free Will in a Naturalistic Ontology ..... 212
5.2 Freedom and Hope ..... 216
5.3 Theological Interpretations of Natural Freedom ..... 223
5.4 The Expanding Moral Circle ..... 224
5.5 A Christian Interpretation of Moral Evolution ..... 235
5.6 Conclusion ..... 242
Conclusion ..... 243
Bibliography ..... 250
Index ..... 266
Samenvatting ..... 270
Curriculum Vitae ..... 273