Universiteit Leiden
The Netherlands

Grounding the past : the praxis of participatory archaeology in the Mixteca Alta, Oaxaca, Mexico

Geurds, A.

Citation
Geurds, A. (2007, June 19). *Grounding the past : the praxis of participatory archaeology in the Mixteca Alta, Oaxaca, Mexico*. *CNWS/LDS Publications*. CNWS Publications. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/12085

Version:	Not Applicable (or Unknown)
License:	Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden
Downloaded from:	https://hdl.handle.net/1887/12085

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Grounding the Past

The Praxis of Participatory Archaeology in the Mixteca Alta, Oaxaca, Mexico

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus, Prof. Mr. P.F. van der Heijden,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op 19 Juni 2007
klokke 16:00 uur

door
Alexander Geurds
geboren te Velp (Gld.)
in 1974

Promotiecommissie

Promotor:	Prof. Dr. M.E.R.G.N. Jansen
	Prof. Dr. W.F.H. Adelaar
Referent:	Prof. Dr. R.A. Joyce, University of California, Berkeley, VS
Overige leden:	Prof. Dr. N. Grube, Universität Bonn, Duitsland
	Prof. Dr. C.L. Hofman
	Prof. Dr. B.J. Ter Haar
	Prof. Dr. W.J.H. Willems
	Dr. S. Wichmann, Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology, Leipzig, Duitsland

Grounding the Past

The Praxis of Participatory Archaeology in the Mixteca Alta, Oaxaca, Mexico

Alexander Geurds

CNWS Publications
2007 Leiden

CNWS Publications 150
CNWS publishes books and journals which advance scholarly research in Asian, African and Amerindian Studies. CNWS Publications is part of the Research School of Asian, African and Amerindian Studies (CNWS) at Leiden University, The Netherlands.

Correspondence should be addressed to:
CNWS Publications
c/o Research School CNWS
Leiden University
PO Box 9515, 2300 RA Leiden
The Netherlands.
cnwspublications@let.leidenuniv.nl
www.cnwspublications.com

Grounding the Past: the Praxis of Participatory Archaeology in the Mixteca Alta, Oaxaca, Mexico
Alexander Geurds
Leiden: CNWS Publications.
(CNWS Publications, Vol. 150)
ISBN: 978-90-5789-150-2
Subject headings: Archaeology, Mexico, Oaxaca, Mixteca Alta, Community Archaeology, Landscape

Printing: Ridderprint, Ridderkerk, The Netherlands
Layout: jnj-studio
Cover design: jnj-studio
Photo's: Alexander Geurds
© Copyright 2007 Research School CNWS
Universiteit Leiden, The Netherlands

Copyright reserved.
Subject to the exceptions provided for by law, no part of this publication may be reproduced and/or published in print, by photocopying, on microfilm or in any other way without the written consent of the copyright-holder(s); the same applies to whole or partial adaptations.
The publisher retains the sole right to collect from third parties fees in respect of copying and/or take legal or other action for this purpose.

Contents

List of Tables x
List of Figures x
Acknowledgements xiii

1. Introduction 1
1.1 Introduction 1
1.1.1 Mesoamerican cultural backdrop 2
1.1.2 Site-based and Valley-based archaeology 5
1.2 Objectives 7
1.2.1 Participatory archaeology 7
1.2.2 Monte Negro Mapping and Heritage 9
1.2.3 The Apoala Valley survey 10
1.2.4 Organization of the thesis 11

2. Background, Methods, and Approach 13
2.1 Geographical and Cultural Backdrop 13
2.1.1 Oaxaca 13
2.1.2 Mixteca Alta 16
2.1.3 Monte Negro 19
2.1.4 Apoala Valley 21
2.2 Previous Research 24
2.2.1 Themes in Oaxacan Archaeology 24
2.2.2 Themes in Mixteca Alta Archaeology 26
2.2.2.1 Monte Negro 30
2.2.2.2 Apoala Valley 34
2.3 Archaeological methods 34
2.3.1 Site-based mapping at Monte Negro 35
2.3.1.1 Mapping 35
2.3.1.2 Heritage Management 39
2.3.1.3 Terraces 40
2.3.2 Valley-based surveying in the Apoala Valley 41
2.4 Reflexive methods 44
2.4.1 Community archaeology 46
2.4.2 Participatory Archaeology in the Mixteca Alta 48

PART I: PAST OVER PRESENT

3. Site-based mapping at Monte Negro 52
3.1 Monte Negro in Oaxacan perspective 52
3.2 Mapping Results 54
3.2.1 Residential units 54
3.2.1.1 Unit 1 55
3.2.1.2 Unit 2 58
3.2.1.3 Unit 3 (X) 58
3.2.1.4 Unit 4 (Building W) 60
3.2.1.5 Unit 5 (Building U) 60
3.2.1.6 Unit 6 61
3.2.1.7 Unit 7 62
3.2.1.8 Unit 8 63
3.2.1.9 Unit 9 63
3.2.2 Plazas 64
3.2.2.1 Plaza 1 64
3.2.2.1.1 Structure 1-Este ('Sistema R') 65
3.2.2.2 Plaza 2 67
3.2.2.2.1 Structure 2-Este ('Templo X') 68
3.2.2.2.2 Structure 2-Oeste ('Templo Y') 69
3.2.2.3 Plaza 3 70
3.2.2.3.1 Structure 3-Este ('Templo T-S') 72
3.2.2.4 Plaza 4 72
3.2.3 Public Architecture 74
3.2.3.1 Temple T 74
3.2.3.2 Temple T-N 76
3.2.3.3 Structure R-Norte 78
3.2.3.4 Structure R-Sur (System R) 79
3.2.3.5 Structures A, B, and C 79
3.2.3.6 The main avenue *(Ichi Iya)* *80*
3.3 Heritage assessment of the monumental core 81
3.3.1 Current State of the Site 82
3.3.2 INAH consolidation 83
3.3.3 Contemporary residences 85
3.4 Analysis 86
3.4.1 Relations between rulership and sacrality 90
3.4.2 Form 91
3.4.3 Location 97
3.5 Conclusion 101

4. Valley-based surveying in the Apoala Valley 103
4.1 Introduction 103
4.2 Ethnohistorical data on the Apoala Valley 105
4.3 Survey results 109
4.3.1 Tiki Tinduu Akama (AV1) 111
4.3.2 Tiki Kahua Akama (AV2) 112
4.3.3 Tiki Kahua Kuchindahua (AV3) 115
4.3.3.1 La Cueva (AV3a) 118
4.3.4 El Guerrero or Danzante del Kahua Laki (AV4) 118
4.3.5 Kahua Tidinuu (AV5) 120
4.3.6 Kahua Torri Kuaha (AV6) 121
4.3.7 Tinduu Va (AV7) 122
4.3.8 Yahui Che'en (AV8) 123
4.3.9 Sata Kahua Laki (AV9) 126
4.3.10 Toto Ndzaka (AV10) 126
4.3.11 Yuku Ñiñi (AV11) 129
4.3.12 Tinduu Toto Ñee (AV12) 129
4.3.13 Tinduu Ñuu Kuaa (AV13) 130
4.3.14 Yuku Andyishi (AV14) 131
4.3.15 Tiki Tinduu Ndodo Kimi- Yuku Andyishi (upper slope) (AV15) 132
4.3.16 Kahua Kandihui (AV16) 133
4.3.17 Ndodo Che – Centro Apoala (AV17) 134
4.3.18 Yahui Kaha – Centro (AV18) 135
4.3.19 Ndoko Yoo-Ofrenda a la luna (AV19) 136
4.3.20 Yahui Kahua Tidinuu (AV20) 138
4.3.21 Yahui Koo Maa (AV21) 138
4.4 Settlement dynamics 139
4.4.1 Early and Middle Cruz (Early Formative phase) Settlement 139
4.4.2 Late Formative (Late Cruz phase) Settlement 140
4.4.3 Ramos (Terminal Formative phase) Settlement 141
4.4.4 Las Flores (Classic phase) Settlement 142
4.4.5 Natividad (Postclassic phase) Settlement 144
4.4.6 Convento (Early Colonial phase) Settlement 147
4.5 Summary Survey data 147

PART II: PRESENT OVER PAST

5. Deconstructing Community Participation 149
5.1 Introduction 149

5.1.1 Archaeological fieldwork and social context 150
5.1.2 Knowledge production in the field 151
5.2 Participation Dilemmas: A chronology of contact 152
5.2.1 Positionality in initiating participation 154
5.2.1.1 Political Office-holders 155
5.2.1.2 Santiago Tilantongo: Power of Authority 155
5.2.1.3 Santiago Apoala: Absence of Authority 159
5.2.1.4 Summary 162
5.2.2 Agency of social actors 162
5.2.2.1 Santiago Tilantongo: 'Donde no hay agua' 163
5.2.2.2 Santiago Apoala: 'Santuario de la Mixteca' 166
5.2.2.3 Summary 168
5.2.3 Positionality in collecting data 170
5.2.3.1 Mapping Monte Negro 170
5.2.4 Trust in the field 176
5.3 Conclusion 178

6. Constructing Landscape Narration 181
6.1 Introduction 181
6.1.1 Oral tradition 181
6.1.2 Archaeology and oral tradition in the Mixteca Alta 182
6.1.3 Landscape 184
6.1.3.1 Landscape archaeology 184
6.1.3.2 Landscape Studies in Mesoamerica 185
6.2 Landscape narration in the Mixteca Alta 186
6.2.1 Deep and recent times of the Cerro Negro landscape 186
6.2.1.1 Foundational symbolism of Monte Negro 188
6.2.1.2 The water paradox 189
6.2.1.3 Foundations 191
6.2.1.4 Summary 192
6.2.2 Mapping knowledge: Toponyms in the Apoala Valley 193
6.2.2.1 Mapping methodology 194
6.2.2.2 Classification of toponyms 198
6.2.2.3 Summary 199
6.3 Conclusion 200

7. Discussion and Conclusions 202
7.1 Introduction 202

7.2 Discussion of key points 203
7.3 Landscape and authority 204
7.4 Conclusion 207

Epilogue 208

Appendix A: Conservation assessment forms (in Spanish) 210
Appendix B: Oral History recorded in Santiago Apoala 228
Appendix C: Oral history recorded in Santiago Tilantongo 231
Appendix D: Toponymic data recorded for the Apoala Valley 248
Appendix E: Ceramic Registration Forms Monte Negro (in Spanish) 255
Appendix F: Ceramic Registration Forms Apoala Valley (in Spanish) 283

Bibliography 335
Index 362
Curriculum vitae 369

List of Tables

Table 2.1 Point measurements taken for Monte Negro perimeter 36
Table 4.1 Total site and component sizes for all phases 110

List of Figures

Figure 1.2 Chronological Chart of different Mesoamerican regions. 3
Figure 1.1 Map of Mesoamerica. 3
Figure 1.3 Villa Chalcatongo de Hidalgo. 8
Figure 2.1 Map of Oaxaca and the Oaxaca Valley (modified from Marcus and Flannery 1996). 14
Figure 2.2 The Oaxaca Valley. 15
Figure 2.3 Map of the Mixteca, outlining the three sub-regions (modified from Terraciano 2001). 16
Figure 2.4 Mixteca Alta landscape. 17
Figure 2.5 Severe gully erosion in the Mixteca Alta. 18
Figure 2.6 Santiago Tilantongo with Monte Negro in the background. 19
Figure 2.7 The Apoala Valley. 21
Figures 2.8 and 2.8a Canal irrigation in the Apoala Valley. 23
Figure 2.9 The monumental core of Monte Albán. 25
Figure 2.10 Early map of Monte Negro (Caso 1938). 31
Figure 2.11 Mapping at Monte Negro. 37
Figure 2.12 Surveying the Apoala Valley. 42
Figure 2.13 Surveying with guide in the Apoala Valley. 43
Figure 2.14 Esteban Avendaño (at left) at Monte Negro. 50
Figure 3.2 Aerial photograph of Cerro Negro, centrally showing Monte Negro. 53
Figure 3.1 Map of Cerro Negro (modified from INEGI E14D35). 53
Figure 3.3 Drawing of Residential Unit 1. 56
Figure 3.4 Drawing of Residential Unit 2. 57
Figure 3.5 Residential Unit 2. 57
Figure 3.6 Drawing of Residential Unit 3. 59
Figure 3.7 Drawing of Residential Unit 3 (as illustrated in Acosta & Romero 1992). 59
Figure 3.8 Drawing of Residential Units 4 and 5. 60
Figure 3.9 Drawing of Residential Unit 7. 62
Figure 3.10 Drawing of Residential Unit 7 (as illustrated in Acosta & Romero 1992). 62
Figure 3.11 Drawing of Plaza 1. 65

Figure 3.12 Drawing of Plaza 2. 67
Figure 3.13 Drawing of Structure 2-Este ('Templo X'). 68
Figure 3.14 Drawing of Plaza 3. 71
Figure 3.15 Structure 3-Este ('Templo T-S'). 71
Figure 3.16 Drawing of Plaza 4. 73
Figure 3.17 Temple T. 75
Figure 3.18 Drawing of Temple T-N (as illustrated in Acosta & Romero 1992). 76
Figure 3.19 The main causeway 'Ichi Iya'. 80
Figure 3.20 Artemio Hernandez G. and Taurino Hernández C. consolidating Residential Unit 3. 83
Figure 3.21 Joke de Vrieze consolidating Residential Unit 3. 84
Figure 3.22 Contemporary residences at Monte Negro. 85
Figure 3.23 Stone carving on structure Temple T. 93
Figure 3.24 Plaza 4, seen from northeast corner. 95
Figure 3.25 Drawing of North section. 96
Figure 3.26 Drawing of Residential Units at Monte Negro. 98
Figure 3.27 Unit 5, seen from Structure 3-Oeste. 98
Figure 3.28 Drawing of Temple Z showing architectural ties to Structure 1-Este. 100
Figure 3.29 Drawing of Temple T-N. 100
Figure 4.1 The Apoala Valley. 104
Figure 4.1a Map of the Apoala Valley (modified from INEGI E14D26). 105
Figure 4.2 Detail from Codex Zouche-Nuttall, Page 36 (modified from Anders et al. 1992b). 106
Figure 4.2a Codex Zouche/Nuttall, Page 36, depicting the Apoala Valley (modified from Anders et al. 1992b). 107
Figure 4.3 General map Tiki Tinduu Akama (AV1). 112
Figure 4.4 General map Tiki Kahua Akama (AV2). 113
Figure 4.5 Panoramic view of Tiki Kahua Akama. 115
Figure 4.6 Boulders that characterize Tiki Kahua Akama's landscape. 115
Figure 4.7 View of the Apoala Valley featuring the Tiki Kahua Kuchindahua peaks in the central background. 116
Figure 4.8 General map Tiki Kahua Kuchindahua (AV3). 116
Figure 4.9 Well preserved defensive walls at north side Tiki Kahua Kuchindahua. 117
Figure 4.10 Rock carving, known locally as 'El Guerrero' or 'El Danzante'. 119
Figure 4.11 Drawing of 'El Guerrero' rock carving. 119
Figure 4.12 Rock art with black paint at Kahua Torri Kahua (AV6). 120
Figure 4.13 Map of Tinduu Va (AV7). 121
Figure 4.14 Platform and adjacent modern structure at Tinduu Va (AV7). 122

Figure 4.15 The southern end of the Apoala valley showing the extensive terracing of Yahui Che'en in the background (AV8). 123
Figure 4.16 Yanhuitlan Red on Cream sherds. 124
Figure 4.17 Eagle or vulture tripod vessel support in Miguelito Hard Grey. 125
Figure 4.18 Yanhuitlan Red on Cream subhemispherical bowl at Toto Ndzaka (AV10). 127
Figure 4.19 Panoramic view of Tiki Tinduu Ndodo Kimi (AV15), seen from northeast. 131
Figure 4.20 Alignments of worked stone at Tiki Tinduu Ndodo Kimi (AV15). 132
Figure 4.21 Boulders dot a path granting access to Kahua Kandihui (AV16). 133
Figure 4.22 Semi- or complete vessels in a private collection from the Ndodo Che site (AV17). 135
Figure 4.23 Basalt instrument, potentially utilized in the production of amate paper. 135
Figure 4.24 Rock art with white paint at Ndoko Yoo (AV19). 137
Figure 4.25 Ramos Phase site sizes. 140
Figure 4.26 Las Flores Phase site sizes. 143
Figure 4.27 Natividad Phase site sizes. 145
Figure 5.1 Municipal sign of Santiago Apoala, on the main entry road from Nochixtlan. 158
Figure 5.2 Laura Van Broekhoven in a communal meeting in front of the municipal building at Santiago Tilantongo. 164
Figure 5.3 Communal meeting on the church lawn at Santiago Apoala. 168
Figure 5.4 The *Parador Turistico 'Ve'e Turista Yutsa To'on'* in Santiago Apoala. 169
Figure 5.5 Communal meeting in the Monte Negro primary school building. 174
Figure 5.6 Dialogue during a communal tour of the Monte Negro site. 175
Figure 6.1 Laura Van Broekhoven discussing the Apoala political landscape at one of several stone border posts, or *mojoneras*. 187
Figure 6.2 Conducting the toponymic survey around Monte Negro. 187
Figure 6.3 A House of Water (*Vehe Savi*) on Cerro Negro, near the Monte Negro site. 190
Figure 6.4 Consulting the map during the toponymic survey in the Apoala Valley. 195
Figure 6.5 Processing toponymic data with local partners. 196
Figure 6.6 Sample of photographic representation of narrated landscape in the Apoala Valley. 197

Acknowledgements

Lucky circumstances put me in contact with many residents of Santiago Tilantongo and Santiago Apoala. This includes those who had to engage with the ideas expressed in this book due to their municipal cargo, as well as those wanting to discuss local history because of their personal interests. All have been of exceptional value for indicating the value of listening to different voices in this research. Sure enough, not all can be mentioned, but for Tilantongo in particular I include Don Artemio Hernandez Gutiérrez; Don Taurino Hernandez Cruz; Doña Ester Gutiérrez Montesimos; and former municipal president Eleazár Pedro Santiago. In Apoala I benefited from conversations with Margarito López Hernández; Don Leopoldo Guzmán Alvarado; Don Antonio Guzmán Gutiérrez; Don Isauro López López; Don Alvaro Ramos López; Doña Otilia Jimenez López; Don Ventura Hernández; Don Gilberto López; Doña Justa Serapia Guzmán; Doña Francisca García López, Doña Liberia García; Doña Tina Ramos; Doña Amalia Hernández López; Don Guillermo López Pacheco; Doña Apolinaria López Pérez; Don Roel García Santiago; Don Mario Jiménez López; and Don Alvaro Guzmán. Also, de manera muy especial: Don Prisciliano Alvarado; Don Ubaldo López Garcia and former municipal administrator Renato Luis Esperanza helped shape the project into what it would become.

The material and financial support of the Research School CNWS for Asian, African and Amerindian Studies and the Netherlands Foundation for Scientific Research (NWO) is acknowledged. The archaeological findings reported on are the result of a voluntary participation in research directed by INAH, under direct and continuous supervision of the regional centre in Oaxaca, within a framework of cooperation between the Centro INAH-Oaxaca and the Faculty of Archaeology of Leiden University. The former director of the Centro INAH-Oaxaca Eduardo López Calzada enthusiastically engaged in this cooperation and facilitated the Faculty's proposals to assist in the development of this project. Nelly Róbles García, the director of the Monte Albán Archaeological Zone, together with her crew provided valuable orientations and equipment regarding the work at Monte Negro. Raul Matadamas Diaz was an insightful colleague and loyal companion on many trips in the Mixteca. He, together with his wonderful family received me and many others with open arms in Oaxaca.

Several archaeology students participated in this research between 1998 and 2004. Ivan Kisjes; Joke de Vriese; Enrique García García; Tom Hos; Shu-li Wang; Pieter Teekens; Sandra Warning; Evelien Pater; and Alessia Frassani are thanked for their dedicated work. A special thank you is given to Ivan and Enrique, who have contributed significantly to the descriptive work of Monte Negro. Alexander Vinkeles Melchers is thanked for his valuable assistance regarding several illustrations.

I thank colleagues and friends who have been willing listeners and valuable contributors. In particular I mention Alistair Bright; Alicia Barabas; Miguel Bartolomé; Arlo Griffiths, Bas van Doesburg; Christopher van Gestel; Corinne Hofman; Gabina Aurora Pérez Jiménez; Ivan

Rivera Guzman; John Bintliff; Juan-Julian Caballero; Manuel Rios Morales; Michael Swanton; Miguel-John Versluys; Sabine Luning; and in particular the Van Broekhoven family. An honorary 1-4-3 Club Member, Rivke Jaffe aided considerably in covering up some of my anthropological shortcomings, many thanks to her.

Finally, I thank my parents for their unconditional and unrelenting support over the years. I hope the present book is as much a meaningful result for them as it is to me.

Laura Van Broekhoven has been my most important stimulator and critic, by far. She made it possible and witnessed every moment of it, and it is therefore dedicated to her. Lastly, my daughter Nandana has witnessed the final stages of creating this manuscript, and taught me the value of 'getting on with it' by periodically luring me away from my desk with a persuasive proposal to play.