

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/18587> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Leenstra, Melle

Title: Beyond the façade : instrumentalisation of the Zambian health sector

Issue Date: 2012-03-14

Beyond the façade.
Instrumentalisation of the Zambian
health sector

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. P.F. van der Heijden,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 14 maart 2012
klokke 16:15 uur

door

Melle Leenstra

geboren te Den haag
in 1976

Promotiecommissie:

Promotores: Prof. dr. A.J. Dietz (Universiteit Leiden)
Prof. dr. L.J. de Haan (ISS, Den Haag)

Co-promotor: Dr. J.B. Gewalt (Afrika-Studiecentrum)

Overige leden: Dr. M. Hinfelaar (National Archives of Zambia)
Prof. dr. R.J. Ross (Universiteit Leiden)
Prof. dr. A.P.R. Visser (emeritus, Universiteit Utrecht)

African Studies Centre
African Studies Collection, vol. 39

Beyond the façade

Instrumentalisation of the Zambian health sector

Melle Leenstra

Published by:
African Studies Centre
P.O.Box 9555
2300 RB Leiden
asc@ascleiden.nl
www.ascleiden.nl

Cover design: Heike Slingerland

Photos: Melle Leenstra, Paulien Boone
Cover photo: Ndeke House; Opd in rural clinic

Printed by Ipskamp Drukkers, Enschede

ISSN: 1876-018X
ISBN: 978-90-5448-111-9

© Melle Leenstra, 2012

Contents

Tables, figures, boxes and maps *viii*

Acknowledgements *ix*

1 INTRODUCTION *1*

Prologue *1*

Prolem description *4*

Theoretical framework *7*

Empirical object of study *20*

Methodology *31*

Reading guide *39*

PART I: THE HUMAN FACTOR

2 INTRODUCTION TO THE HUMAN FACTOR *45*

The case of Ashley Mwansa *46*

What does this case suggest? *51*

3 GETTING (DOWN) TO WORK *53*

Struggling out of poverty *54*

Who pushed you through school? *57*

Qualifications matter *60*

A first posting *64*

Transfers *68*

Lobbying for a transfer *70*

Disciplinary transfers *75*

Conclusions *78*

4. FORGING AHEAD *81*

Further education *82*

Moving into management *86*

Training your way out of the bush *89*

Who's the boss? *93*

It's a docs' world *101*

Conclusions *109*

5	“WE’RE STRUGGLING FINANCIALLY”: COMPETING CLAIMS	113
	Salary and allowances	114
	The cost of living	118
	Educating your children	118
	Relatives and dependents	124
	The material trappings of middle class life	131
	Working beyond the payslip	135
	Preparing for the future	142
	Stealing government’s time, and ...?	147
	Conclusions	152

PART II: THE HEALTH SECTOR

6	INTRODUCTION	157
	Genesis of the health reforms	158
	Introducing the health reforms	158
	‘Symbolic power and urban bias: Limits to health reform in Zambia’	164
	Assessing Kalumba’s thesis	176
	Conclusions	179
7	THE FIRST YEARS OF IMPLEMENTATION	180
	Key actors in the reforms	181
	National health policies and strategies	182
	Health workers’ interests (political turbulence?)	188
	First steps towards implementation of the reforms	190
	A change of power	197
	Conclusions	201
8	POLITICAL DISTRACTIONS FOR THE HEALTH REFORMS	203
	New leadership	205
	Health reforms continue	208
	Building Katele’s kingdom	217
	A mid-term review of health reforms	222
	Conclusions	227
9	HEALTH REFORMS GRIND TO A HALT	229
	Human resource trouble	230
	Luo takes over	234
	Criminalisation of the Zambian health sector	238
	Muddling through	241
	Exit Luo	246
	Conclusions	255

10	A NEW DEAL FOR THE HEALTH SECTOR?	257
	Change of power, change of leadership	258
	Mwanawasa snagged in Chiluba's web	260
	The human resource crisis	264
	Dismantling the boards	271
	Scrapping user fees	279
	Siphon mighty	280
	The K 27 billion scam	285
	Conclusions	289
11	CONCLUSIONS	291
	On the human factor	291
	On the state	294
	On the health sector	297
	On development policy	300
	ANNEXES	307
	I Analysis of the National Health Strategic Plan 1995-1999	309
	II Forewords to the National Health Policies and Strategies	316
	III Key actors and agencies	319
	IV Organisational changes in the health sector	330
	V Glossary of cadres of health workers and health officials	332
	VI Health sector data	337
	Bibliography and source list	339
	Samenvatting (summary in Dutch)	345
	Author's details	350

Tables, figures, boxes and maps

Tables

1.1	Continuum of administrative system	13
1.2	Historical growth and inflation rates	20
5.1	Health workers' incomes	117
5.2	Basic needs basket	119
VII.1	Selected health indicators, 1990, 2000, 2009	339
VII.2	Selected healthcare delivery indicators, 2000-2008	339
VII.3	Historical overview health facilities in Zambia	339

Figures

5.1	Vehicles at Ndeke house	132
5.2	Advertisement at Provincial Health Office	142
6.1	Tribute to Katele Kalumba	161
8.1	Political graffiti, Chiengi district	219
V.1	Organisational structure before 1991	330
V.2	Organisational structure after health reforms (mid-1996)	330
V.3	Organisational structure after restructuring (2009)	331

Boxes

8.1	Health reform: A Zulu healer's tragedy	210
9.1	"Kalumba disappoints Livingstone health workers"	232
I.1	Statement by the Deputy Minister of Health	310

Acknowledgments

The publication of this dissertation marks the end of a long and taxing intellectual journey. This section will allow me to thank some of those that have been an inspiration and a source of support for me during what in essence was a lonely endeavour. As I describe in the prologue to this dissertation, this journey has been in part a response to analyses problematising the African state. Such analyses were unsatisfying to me because they lacked the empathy that I have been taught to value. The notion, ‘before you criticise someone, you should have walked a mile in their shoes’, fits in well with the humanist, post-Calvinist values I have been brought up with. I would thus like to start by thanking those whose stories I have presented in this dissertation. I particularly want to thank one person who represents these people and more, Dr. Katele Kalumba. Sir, you have been a fascinating and inspiring person to study. I am grateful that I had the opportunity to speak with you and sketch part of your story, starting with the dissertation you allowed me retrieve from the depths of the University of Zambia library. This allowed me to see the inspiration you had for undertaking your great works, but it also gave perspective to your own ‘eclipse of idealism’. As with many actors in this dissertation, I may not have portrayed the image you would have wanted me to, but I have collated and framed your story as honestly as I could.

Closer to home I would like to thank my brother, Tjalling, for inspiring me to do a PhD. “If he can do it, so can I” can be a very powerful motivator. The choice for the health sector was also partly influenced by you. I hoped this would not only allow you to understand my preoccupation with institutions and politics, but also allow me to better understand medical people like yourself and the family you married into. My parents, Sjoerd and Inge, I thank you for giving me a privileged start in life. Not only materially, but more importantly, morally and emotionally you have supported me and inspired me to become who I am.

Further thanks go out to my employer, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, which has allowed me and facilitated me, through the IS Academy, to embark on the process of deepening my expertise by conducting this research. The difficulty is that the ministry is a complex human organisation, with more individuals than I can thank. Some of those I am grateful to include Roeland van de Geer, Wepke Kingma, Ieneke Duijvesteijn, Martin Koper, Wouter Plomp, Huub Hendrix, and Caroliene Wiedenhof. Particular thanks go out to the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands in Lusaka, which made me at home ‘in the field’. Some of those to mention are Jan Waltmans, Robert van den Dool, and Harry Molenaar, but of course also Peter de Haan and other members of the Lusaka Gentlemen Cooking Club. Particular thanks go out to Ellen Stappensea for having such patience with me rummaging through the archives, and Marco Gerritsen for getting me hooked on the Zambian health sector in the first place. At my current workplace at the embassy in Kampala, I would like to thank Jeroen Verheul and

Marielle Greaedts for supporting my attempt to get parental leave, which not only allowed me to spend time with Zosia but also to finish this dissertation.

The African Studies Centre also deserves my thanks. As I cannot thank all those that deserve my thanks I will aim my thanks at Gitty, Maaïke and Mieke as a *pars pro toto*. The third floor of the Pieter de la Court was a home of sorts for long months. I apologise for my absent-minded need for intellectual seclusion at times, but I realise that for some that is normal in a research institution. I also want to thank my academic peers, PhD candidates with whom I could spar both at the African Studies Centre and beyond. This includes all those I shared the PhD room with and the group whose comments helped me panel-beat my conclusions. Lotje de Vries deserves special consideration together with Rens Twijstra as transitory furniture in our house in Kampala. Dirk-Jan and Ingeborg, you two I will thank with a quotation from an outstanding piece of academic literature. You are ‘(t)wo colleagues and friends ... who also chose to balance on this bridge (across the gap between academics and policy and) provided both moral and intellectual support’.¹ Ingeborg, you are next. And to complete the list of PhD-buddies, I would like to thank Daniel Reijer. My time in Zambia was made better by your company and reflection, beers and *braais*, and by letting me borrow ‘the Beast’, referred to in this dissertation as a battered pick-up.

The mores of Leiden University do not allow me to offer thanks to those responsible for the academic quality assurance of this dissertation, even when they deserve thanks in other areas. Fortunately, that does not stop me from thanking my language editor, Ruadhan Hayes, for his excellent work.

Finally, I want to thank one last person who has offered support and inspiration. She is most important as she will be around when this madness of writing a dissertation is finally over. Asia, I thank you for all your patience throughout this journey. I also want to thank you for Zosia and our next daughter, who if all goes well will predate the publication of this dissertation. A wise man once told me: “Doctors make better fathers to daughters” ... I aim to prove him right.

Kampala, December 2011

¹ Koch, D.J., *Aid from International NGOs: Blind spots on the aid allocation map* (London, 2009), xiv.