



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## Rediscovering architecture : Paestum in eighteenth-century architectural experience and theory

Jong, S.D. de

### Citation

Jong, S. D. de. (2010, December 21). *Rediscovering architecture : Paestum in eighteenth-century architectural experience and theory*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/16266>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/16266>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Rediscovering Architecture  
Paestum  
in Eighteenth-Century  
Architectural Experience and Theory

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. P.F. van der Heijden,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op dinsdag 21 december 2010  
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Sigrid Dagmar de Jong

geboren te Den Helder  
in 1974

promotiecommissie

promotor

Prof.dr. C.A. van Eck

overige leden

Dr. M.J.F. Delbeke (Universiteit Leiden/Universiteit Gent)

Prof.dr. E.M. Moormann (Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen)

Dr. F.H. Schmidt (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Prof.dr. A. van der Woud (Rijksuniversiteit Groningen)

*for my parents*

*and to the memory of  
Elisabeth van Druten*



# Contents

Acknowledgements	10	
Introduction	13	
Rediscovery	13	
The site	17	
Interactions between architectural experience and theory	24	
Part I	Aesthetic Experiences	
Chapter 1	Paradoxical Encounters: Paestum and the sublime	37
Paestum at first sight	41	
Towards beauty and terror: the foundations of the sublime	45	
Architecture and the sublime in theories	55	
The sublime in the experience of buildings	65	
Astonishment and <i>je ne sais quoi</i> : Dupaty and Tatham at Paestum	84	
From the grandeur to the paradox in the sublime	89	
Character and the male aspect: the observations of Vaudoyer and Reveley	98	
‘The shadow of some half-remembered dream’: Shelley and Turner	111	
Mastering a sublime experience	122	
Chapter 2	Scenic Associations: Paestum and the picturesque	129
Framing from a distance: the origins of the picturesque	133	

Towards movement: the picturesque in architecture	138
Pictorial impressions and hasty views: picturesque elements in Paestum	149
In search of the picturesque: Richard Payne Knight's Paestum account	152
Picturesque versus sublime: the Expedition into Sicily and John Cozens' view	165
The educated mind: the theories of Richard Payne Knight and Uvedale Price	174
Associating Paestum	182
Architecture as painting	190

## Part II Experiences of Movement

Chapter 3	Entering Ruins: A physical experience	197
	Entering ruins in the imagination: Diderot and Robert among painted remains	199
	A self-portrait in ruins: John Soane's <i>Crude Hints</i>	210
	Mass and space, load and support: Goethe and Forsyth in the temples	220
	Sensing ruins by Eustace and Shelley	228
	The body in architectural space	235
Chapter 4	Staging Ruins: Theatrical sequences	243
	The sequence of experience: acting and directing	248
	Architecture as scenographic experience	266
	The landscape as scenery	268
	The temples as a stage	275
	Theatricality as a means of plotting an architectural experience	279

## Part III Contextualising Experiences

Chapter 5	In Pursuit of the Primitive: History in the making	291
	Primitive perfection in Laugier's mind	299
	Marvelling at primitive purity in Paestum	318
	Piranesi's theories on invention in architecture	335

History seen as a system by Winckelmann	345
Paoli turns history around	353
Quatremère de Quincy writings towards a universal architecture	364
The genius of the place according to Labrouste	375
Primitivism, origins and history	394
Chapter 6      The Eye of the Architect: Paestum exported	401
Revising treatises: Pâris on Desgodetz and Delagardette on Vignola	405
The development of Greek architecture according to Le Roy and Wilkins	424
Paestum abroad in collections	444
The two-dimensional architecture of Durand	458
Architecture without experience	463
Conclusion	467
Bibliography	474



# Acknowledgements

Just as the publications of the protagonists in this book, my thesis largely originated in, and was inspired by the European centres of the eighteenth century, Paris, London, Rome and Naples. But it could not have been realised without the financial and intellectual support I received at the University in Leiden. Of all the people at Leiden University I would first of all like to thank my supervisor, Caroline van Eck, for many passionate, stimulating, thought provoking and eye-opening conversations and guidance. I am also grateful to Maarten Delbeke, Eric Moormann, Freek Schmidt and Auke van der Woud for agreeing to be on the reading committee of my thesis and for their stimulating reactions.

Thanks to the Pallas Institute, now the Leids Universitair Instituut voor Culturele Disciplines (LUICD), I could finally do my research full time, after some years of trying to combine writing a PhD thesis with a job at the Netherlands Architecture Institute. Pallas provided many a scholarship for research trips to London and Paris and for giving lectures in Belgium and Italy. In addition, the Leiden University Fund gave a travel grant for research in London on two occasions. I am grateful for that. Abroad, my gratitude goes to the Paul Mellon Centre for Studies in British Art for funding a research grant to continue my research in London and to the Fondation de France and the Institut National d'Histoire de l'Art in Paris for making Parisian research possible. In these cities I also benefited from the help of the staff of many libraries and archives, of the British Library, the British Museum (especially Kim Sloan), the Paul Mellon Centre for Studies in British Art, the Sir John Soane's Museum, the Royal Institute of British Architects, and the Victoria & Albert Museum in London, and in Paris, of the Archives Nationales, the Bibliothèque des Arts Décoratifs, the Bibliothèque Nationale de France, the École Nationale Supérieure des Beaux-Arts, the Fondation Custodia, the Institut de France, the Institut National d'Histoire de l'Art. I also thank the staff of the Bibliothèque Municipale in Besançon and the Bibliothèque Municipale and Archives Municipales in

Bordeaux, and in Italy of the Archivio di Stato in Naples. I am highly grateful to Madame Daphne Doublet for very generously allowing me to consult her collection of eighteenth-century papers. Scholars I would like to thank for helping me at different stages of my research are Frank Salmon, Barry Bergdoll, Andrew Ballantyne, and Jean-Philippe Garric.

In the first stages of my research the support of colleagues at the Netherlands Architecture Institute and at Van Hoogevest Architecten enabled me to travel to archives and libraries and granted me time to write the first lines. Special thanks are due to Mariet Willinge (NAi) and Gijsbert van Hoogevest for their support. In this period many other people were important who read my texts and with whom I discussed my subject, of those I would like to thank Sebastiaan Derks, Coert Peter Krabbe, Vladimir Stissi and Petra Brouwer. Later, at Leiden, my colleagues Stijn Bussels, Joris van Gastel, Lex Hermans, Elsje van Kessel, Minou Schraven, and also Bram van Oostveldt were generous in critical reading, useful comments and moments of enjoyment at lectures or travels. Students at courses I taught at the art historical department have also helped me to clearly formulate my ideas, and a memorable visit to Paestum with some of them in 2008 when we entered the temples, made us almost live the eighteenth-century experience.

The support of my friends was important as well, and they have inspired me with their curiosity, their questions and enthusiasm. Here I would especially like to mention Karien Beijers, Loes van Harrevelt, Marja Potters and Esther Starkenburg. Also I wish to express a special gratitude to Philippe Gardaz for his help and his knowledge and passion for the eighteenth century. I am very grateful to Lineke Deurloo for offering me an occasional home at Leiden and for her hospitality and attention. Most of all, my family has never failed to be warmly encouraging. In particular my parents, Hans and Vera de Jong, and my brother Lars de Jong have helped me more than I could thank them for to follow the path towards this thesis. I express my special gratitude to my mother for her generous help in the final stages of writing. To my great regret my wonderful grandmother, Elisabeth van Druten, has not lived to see me becoming a doctor in Leiden, her city. Therefore this book is dedicated to her memory.

I owe the largest debt of gratitude to Patrick Leitner who, with his enlightened and critical outlook on architecture, his creative mind and eagerness nourished our many inspiring exchanges of ideas and stimulated me to constantly discover new viewpoints. Thanks to him, Paris opened both my mind and my heart.