Meaning-Construction in warring states philosophical discourse : a discussion of the palaeographic materials from Tomb Guōdiàn One

Meyer, D.

"QIÓNG DÁ YǏ SHÍ" 窮達以時

_____

10. *Reconstruction: "Qióng dá yǐ shí"* 窮達以時

The present appendix provides the philological references to the argument-based text "Qióng dá yǐ shí" as discussed in Part One of the present work. As in the previous chapter, I shall first provide the text and translation of the "Qióng dá yǐ shí", followed by a philological discussion.

The reader finds superscripted a letter ("*q*") to refer to the manuscript ("Qióng dá yǐ shí"). Numbers added, for instance "1", refer to the rank number of the strip in question. "*Q*1", then, refers to strip one of the "Qióng dá yǐ shí"; "*q*1/9", for instance, would refer to the ninth graph on strip one.

10.1. Text and Translation: "Qióng dá yǐ shí"

As discussed in chapter 3, the "Qióng dá yǐ shí" consists of two cantos and five sub-cantos. I have marked this graphically by contrasting the different sub-cantos with a blank line from each other in the transcription of the text.

Canto one of the "Qióng dá yǐ shí" contains four sub-cantos: Sub-canto one is the introduction to the larger question as discussed in the text; sub-canto two contains six building blocks. It assembles narrative material so as to deepen the discussion. Each of these building blocks presents one 'historical' case. Sub-canto three constructs a general principle from the observation made above. It consists of two building blocks. Sub-canto four, the conclusion of canto one, formulates a self-contained argument.

Canto two contains two sub-cantos: Sub-canto five (the first sub-canto of the second part of the text) contains two building blocks. It infers a rule from the conclusion articulated in sub-canto four, where the author(s) of the "Qióng dá yǐ shí" have clarified that action does not necessarily also yield the expected results. Sub-canto six culminates the entire discussion about the apparent arbitrariness of failure or success of Man's deeds in the word *shí* 時 'time'. It provides the overall conclusion of the present text.

10.1.1. Sub-Canto One: Introduction (Canto One)

^{Q1} 有天有人，天人有分；
察天人之分，而知所行矣。
有其人，無其 ^{Q2} 世；
雖賢弗行矣。
苟有其世，何難之有哉？

^{Q1} There is Heaven and there is Man, [yet] there are distinctions between

Heaven and Man;

[Only by] investigating the distinction between Heaven and Man, [one] will

know what they act upon.

There might be the right man, but not the right ^{Q2} times;

Although he [might be] a worthy, he does not act [his worthiness] out.

However, were there indeed the right times, what difficulties could there then

be?

10.1.2. Sub-Canto Two: Legendary Materials and the Crucial Matter of *yù*

(1) 舜耕於歷山， ^[A]
陶拍 ^{Q3} 於河滸。 ^[B]
立而為天子，遇堯也。

Shùn ploughed [the fields] at the Mountain Lì, and he made pottery ^{Q3} at the

banks of the Yellow river. †

The reason he was established and became Son of Heaven, was his encounter

with Yáo.

(2) 邵謠衣枲蓋帽絰蒙巾， ^[C]
^{Q4} 釋板築而佐天子，
遇武丁也。 ^[D]

Shào Yáo wore a hemp coverlet, covered [his head] with a hemp hat, and swathed himself with a [protecting] scarf; † [1]

[Q4] The reason he became the assistant of the ruler by escaping the wooden barriers for building earthen walls was his encounter with Wǔ Dīng.

(3) 呂望為臧棘津，戰監門 [Q5] 棘地；[E]
行年七十，而屠牛於朝歌。
舉而為天子師，遇周文也。

Lǚ Wàng acted as a slave at the ford of Jí, trembling he [Q5] watched the gates of the territory of Jí; †
Seventy years had to go by during which he slaughtered oxen at Zhāogē.
The reason he was elevated to act as the tutor of the Son of Heaven was his encounter with [King] Wén of Zhōu.

(4) [Q6] 管夷吾拘囚束縛；[F]
釋械枑，而為諸侯相，
遇齊桓也。

[Q6] Guǎn Yíwǔ (Guǎn Zhòng) was detained in prison where he was bound and tied up;
The reason he became minister for many lords, freed from [the threatening of] weapons and his prisoner's cage, was his encounter with [Duke] Huán of Qí.

(5) [Q8] 孫叔三斥期思少司馬；[G]
出而為令尹，
遇楚莊也。

[Q8] Sūnshū (Sūnshū Ào) thrice declined [the position of] Vice Minister of War at Qīsī;
The reason he became the senior official although he left, was his encounter with [King] Zhuāng of Chǔ.

(6) [Q7] 百里[奚]轉賣五羊，為伯牧牛。[H]

---

[1] This should point to his poverty.

釋板[?]而為朝卿，†^[I]
遇秦穆。

^{Q7} Báilǐ [Xī] was sold on for the price of five rams and became the elder of oxherds.
The reason he became Minister at the court, freed from [?], was his encounter with [Duke] Mù of Qín. †

10.1.3. Sub-Canto Three: Construing a Principle from the Legendary Materials

^{Q9} 初韜晦，^[J]
後名揚，†
非其德加;

子胥前多功，^[K]
後戮死，
非其智 ^{Q10} 衰也。

^{Q9} [Thus, the fact that] in the beginnings [these worthies] may have been of little value and in obscurity, [and yet], later their names were praised, is not because their charisma (*dé*) has been added to;

[Just like the fact that Wǔ] Zǐxū was very meritorious at first, [and yet] he later fell into disgrace and was put to death, is not because his wisdom ^{Q10} had weakened.

10.1.4. Sub-Canto Four: Formulating a 'Closed Argument'

驥厄張山，驥控於卲棘；†^[L]
非亡體壯也。

窮四海，致千 ^{Q11} 里，
遇造[父]故也。†^[M]

遇不遇，天也。

[That] the thorough-bred horse becomes distressed at the Mountain of Zhāng,

[and] the black-mottled grey horse halts at the thorns of Shào is not because

their have lost their physical strength;[2]

[That they] cover everywhere within the four seas, reaching as far as a

thousand [Q11] *lǐ* [in each direction],

is on the account that they encountered the [excellent rider] Zào Fù. †

[However], to encounter or not—this lies with Heaven.

10.1.5. Sub-Canto Five: Inferences from the Conclusion (Canto Two)

動非為達也；
故窮而不 [Q12] □□□　[怨；隱非]　為名也。† [N]
故莫之知而不吝；

□□□□□□　　　　[芝蘭生於幽谷]　†　[O]
[Q13] □□□□　[[Q13] 非以無人] 嗅而不芳　†　[P]
璡璐瑾瑜包山石，不為　□□□ (□?)([無人知其] [Q14] 善 †　[Q]
怀己也。　† [R] 3

[Thus], to move does not [necessarily mean] to succeed;

From this follows that [the worthy] does not [Q12] {*harbour resentment*} even if

failing; †

{*He* [*simply*] *hides and does not*} achieve a name. †

From this follows that he is without regret even if nobody knows [him].

---

2 Both the 'thorough-bred horse' and the 'black-mottled grey horse' should be understood in the sense of 'fine horses' (see also [J] of the "Reference matter").

3 This difficult passage has yet to be confirmed. The editors of Húběi shěng Jīngmén shì bówùguǎn 1998, p. 145 transcribe it as follows: 無茖菫愈土(缶山one character)石不為　□□□ [Q14] 善怀己也; Lǐ Líng's transcription runs: 無茖菫愈寶，山石不為　□□□[開，非以其] [Q14] 善負己也 (Lǐ Líng, 1999, p. 494); Tú and Luí read　無茖募愈(土缶one character)，山石不為　□□□[所用，夫為]善怀己也. I suggest 不為[無人知其]善怀己 because this would logically connect to the passage above and to the conclusion below. See also my discussion below.

{The [flower] *zhīlán* grows in dark valleys}, ^{Q13} {*it is not because it cannot be*} smelled {by man} that it is not fragrant. †

The beautiful stone of jade is covered in mountain stones, it is not because {*no one knows its*} ^{Q14} goodness that it neglects itself. [4] †

10.1.6. Sub-Canto Six: Directive for the Individual

窮達以時，
德行一也，譽毀在旁。
聽之一母，緇白 ^{Q15} 不釐；
窮達以時，幽明不再。
故君子惇於反己。 [L]

Failure and success appear at their respective time.

[Even if] conduct and charisma (*dé*) are one, fame and slander stand by the side.

[However, if] acuity reaches its 'one mother', black and white need not be distinguished. † [5]

Failure and success appear at their respective time, [yet] dark and bright do not alternate.

It is for this reason that the gentleman esteems self-examination.

---

[4] Although it is downright impossible to know the 'original' reading of this passage since too many characters are simply absent, we can be fairly sure about an approximate reading of the same due to the lines "故莫之知而不吝" even if nobody knows [him], he is without regret), and "嗅而不芳" (not fragrant *since no* [X] smell [it]). See my discussion below.

[5] The terms 'one mother', and 'black' and 'white' will be discussed below.

10.2. Notes on Text and Translation

[A]: For the character *q*2/17 (⿰ here identified as *gēng* 耕), compare the Guōdiàn One manuscript "Chéng zhī wén zhī" 成之聞之, strip 13.[6]

The identity of Mount Lì (Lì shān 歷山) cannot be determined with certainty.[7] Most scholars follow Qián Mù who identifies the Mountain Lì with Mountain Léi Shǒu 雷首 located near the confluence of the Fén 汾 and Yellow Rivers in modern southwest Shānxī 山西.[8]

[B]: The character *q*3/3 appears as *qu*? ⿰ (叵) on the bamboo strips. Lǐ Líng 李零 transcribes it as *hú* 澔 (*the bank of a river*).[9] Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信 suspect that the character is a loan for *gǔ* 沽 (OC *kˤa). This would be the name of a river, thus making 河沽,[10] which would perfectly correlate with 歷山. Liú Zhāo 劉釗 reads it as *pǔ* 浦 (OC *pˤhaʔ), 'banks of a stream'.[11] A transcription of the character as *hú* 澔 (OC *qˤhaʔ) 'the bank of a river' is also conceivable as it correlates with the story in the *Shǐjì* 史記 1 "Wǔ dì běn jì" 五帝本記 (Basic Annals 1), which notes that Shùn made pottery at the banks of the Yellow river (陶河濱).

[C]: The name Shào Yáo 邵謠 does not appear in transmitted texts. Accordingly, Lǐ Líng 李零 does not combine the two characters to generate the reading of a personal name, but explains *q*3/13 ⿰ (*yáo* 謠; Old Chinese *law as *yào* 鷂 (OC *law-s) to be an attribute to *yī* 衣 'clothing', thus making 'shabbily clothing'.[12] He further assumes that *q*3/12 ⿰ (邵) is either a mistaken character, or a variant of another transmitted name. Lǐ's interpretation of reading *yáo* 謠 (OC *law) as *yào* 鷂 (OC

---

[6] See Húběi shěng Jīngmén shì bówùguǎn 1998, p. 50.

[7] Cf. *Zhōngguó lìshǐ dìmíng dà cídiǎn* 中國歷史地名大辭典, p. 145

[8] See Qián Mù 錢穆 1962, p. 42.

[9] Lǐ Líng 李零 1999, p. 493; 2002, p. 87. See also Jì Xùshēng 季旭昇 2001, p. 118.

[10] See, Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信 2001, p. 29.

[11] See Liú Zhāo 劉釗 2005, p. 170.

[12] See Lǐ Líng 李零 1999, p. 493; same author 2002 , p. 87.

*law-s) and thus taking only *q*3/12 as a personal name would also be a valid interpretation. Neither reading whould change the interpretation of this passage. Despite of this, in the other 'historical' examples provided in the present sub-canto, a predicate immediate follows the name of the person. Therefore, to me it seems more plausible to read *q*3/12-13 as a personal, followed by the predicate *yī* 衣 'to cover oneself', 'to wear'.

I follow Lǐ's interpretation of reading *q*3/14 as *xǐ* 枲 'male nettle hemp'.[13]

[D]: Legendary materials often refer to Wǔ Dīng (whose temple name was Gāo Zōng 高宗; Wǔ Dīng was the first of the nine historic rulers of Shāng Dynasty; Robert Bagley puts the reign of Wǔ Dīng around 1200 BC[14]) in connection with Fù Yuè 傅說, whose situation is described similarly to that of Shào Yáo in the "Qióng dá yǐ shí".[15]

[E]: I follow Qiú in his reading of the graphs *q*4/19-21 (牂 棘 津) *zāng jí jīn* 臧棘津.[16] Tales about Lǔ Wàng mention the place name Jíjīn (棘津) in context with Lǔ Wàng.[17] The ford of Jí (Jíjīn) is situated in modern Hénán.[18] To read *zāng* 牂 (ewe; OC *[ts]ˤaŋ) as *zāng* 臧 (slave; *[ts]ˤaŋ) further suits the context of the tale.

---

[13] See Lǐ Líng 2002, p. 86.
[14] See Robert Bagley 1999, p. 181.
[15] Cf. also the *Mòzǐ* "Shàng xián zhōng" (尚賢中第九), pp. 57 ff: 古者舜耕歷山 陶河瀕 漁雷澤 堯得之服澤之陽 舉以為天子 與接天下之政 治天下之民 伊摯 有莘氏女之私臣 親為庖人 湯得之 舉以己相 與接天下之政 治天下之民 傅說被褐帶索 庸築乎傅巖 武丁得之 舉以為三公 與接天下之政 治天下之民 "In antiquity, Shùn ploughed [the fields] at the Mountain Lì, he made pottery at the banks of the [Yellow] River and fished in the lake of Léi (lake of Hùo 濩, Zézhōu 澤州). Yáo discovered him at Fú Zé (uncertain name), made [him] the son of heaven, handed him the government of all under heaven so that [he] should rule the entire people under heaven. Yī Zhì (Yī Yǐn) used to be the private counsellor of the daughter of the clan Yǒu Xīn, [and then] was employed as a cook. Tāng discovered him [and] made [him] his personal senior official so that [he] should rule the entire people under heaven. Fù Yuè wore coarse hemp cloth and belted a rope, his labor was to build earthen walls at Fù Yán. Wǔ Dīng discovered him, made [him] one of the Three Dukes, handed him the government of all under heaven so that [he] should rule the entire people under heaven."
[16] See Húběi shěng Jīngmén shì bówùguǎn 1998, p. 146, n. 6.
[17] See Sarah Allan, "The Identities of Taigong Wang 太公望 in Zhou and Han Literature," *Monumenta Serica*, 30 (1972-1973): 57-99 [originally presented as master thesis at the University of California, Berkeley, 1966], here on p. 74.
[18] See Tán Qíxiāng 譚其驤, 1991, vol. 1, pp. 24-25.

Lǔ Wàng, also known as Lǔ Shàng, was one of King Wǔ's advisors. He received the titles Tàigōng wàng 太公望 (Our Ancestor's hope), and Tutor Shàngfù 師尚父. Sarah Allan has compared the historical evidence of him serving as a minister of Kings Wén and Wǔ of the Zhōu Dynasty with the many references to him in Zhōu and Hàn literature and concludes that these accounts are very contradictory. Historically, Lǔ Wàng was a nobleman of the Jiāng 姜 clan, which traditionally intermarried with the Zhōu royal family. It is possible that he was the uncle of King Chéng of Zhōu.[19] However, legendary materials always describes him—just as in the "Qióng dá yǐ shí"—as a humble man, who was raised up from obscurity by King Wén to become a minister.[20]

Zhāogē 朝歌 is the former capital of Yīn 殷 located northeast of Qí 淇 County, in modern Hénán. Western Zhōu-period Wèi 衛 established its capital there, while Zhāogē belonged to Wèi 魏 throughout the Warring States.

[F]: The character q6/5 appears as yáo 絲 [instead of '缶', '言'] (; OC *l[aw] or *lu) on the strips. Qiú Xīguī, however, argues that this character should be read qiú 囚 (prison, OC *[s.m.l]u).

The story of Guǎn Zhòng can be found in the Shǐjì 62 "Guǎn Yàn liè zhuàn" 管晏列傳 (Memoir 2).

[G]: Mainly for two reasons Chén Wěi proposes to interchange strips q7 (story of Báilǐ Xī, see [X], below; originally the fifth of the six examples of men who rose from destitution to fame) and q8 (story of Sùnshū; originally the last of the sixth example).[21] First, on the basis of chronological evidence: Báilǐ Xī served Duke Mù of Qín 秦穆公 (r. 656-621 BC), Sùnshū Ào served King Zhuāng of Chǔ 楚莊王 (r. 613-591); thus Báilǐ Xī antecedents Sùnshū Ào at least three decades. Second, at the bottom of strip q7 is a black stroke of which Chén Wěi argues that it should end

---

[19] See Sarah Allan 1972-1973, pp. 60-72.
[20] Cf. Sarah Allan 1981, p. 21.
[21] See, Chén Wěi 2002, p. 47.

the above list of examples.[22] I follow Chén in placing *q*8 before *q*7. Note that this change does not influence the reading of the present sub-canto at all. If only sub-canto 'two' remains intact (that is no strips added or removed from the group of *q*2/16-8/end) and none of the six examples are distorted (that is none of the positions of strips *q*2-5 is changed), the positions of *q*6-8 do not alter the contents of this passage, because they are steady components that may be placed at any position within the present sub-canto without changing its reading. Despite of this, it is plausible to assume that the list of anecdotes was finished in chronological order, since strips *q*2/16-5/end of the sub-canto 'two'—whose sequence as a whole is beyond doubt—clearly started to list the anecdotes in chronological order: Shùn, served Yáo (traditional r. 2366-2356); Shào Yáo served King Wǔ Dīng (r. ?-1189); Lǚ Wàng served King Wén of Zhōu (r. 1099/56-1050).[23] Third, when interchanging *q*7 with *q*8, the black stroke can figure as the ending mark of this section. Fourth, yet left unnoticed by Chén Wěi, strip *q*7 is the only instance, in which the example given does not end with a concluding *yě* 也, but carries the black mark instead. Lastly and also unnoticed by other scholars, the change allows us to keep up the parallel form of what I have termed A and B pattern of the present account. These five reasons strongly corroborate the suggestion to interchange strips *q*8 and *q*7 with each other.

I follow Qiú who reads the graph *q*8/4 [graph] as *chì* 斥 'to decline'.[24]

The graph *q*8/5 [graph] was originally transcribed as 亙邑 (written as one graph). As Chén Wěi 陳偉 knows to add, throughout the Guōdiàn One manuscripts, the graph 亙 is often exchanged with 亟.[25] According to Chén, 亟 and 期 are close in sound (OC *k(r)ək and *kʰ(r)ək-s; 期 is OC *[g](r)ə). Together with *q*8/6 [graph] it would be read Qīsī 期思, a place name in Chǔ. This accords with a record in the *Xúnzǐ* 5.1 "Fēi xiàng" 非相 (Contra Physiognomy).[26] At the time of these texts, *kʰ(r)ək-s would

---

[22] Ibidem.
[23] See Edward L. Shaughnessy 1999, pp. 25 f.
[24] See Húběi shěng Jīngmén shì bówùguǎn 1998, p. 146, n. 11.
[25] See, Chén Wěi 陳偉 2003, p. 46.
[26] 楚之孫叔敖，期思之鄙人也，突禿長左，軒較之下，而以楚霸 "[A]s for Sùnshū Ào from Chǔ, he was a native of the small hamlet Qīsī. [He] was partly bald and [his] left foot was too long, so short

have changed to *kʰ(r)ə-s, and I follow Chén Wěi in his reading until a better solution is found.

The title Shào Sīmǎ 少司馬 is a variant of Xiào Sīmǎ 小司馬 "Vice Minister of War".[27] In Chǔ the senior functionary was termed *lìngyǐn* 令尹.[28] However, throughout various sources, Sùnshū Ào was termed Chancellor.[29]

[H]: On the reversal of the two strips *q*7 and *q*8, see above notes to [G].

Based on the *Huáinánzǐ* "Xiū wù xùn" 脩務訓 (Endeavour and duty), where the phrase as follows appears, 百里奚轉鬻 "Bǎilǐ Xī was sold on",[30] Qiú Xīguī reconstructs this part as: 百里奚轉賣五羊 "Bǎilǐ Xī was sold on for the price of five rams".[31] The story of Báilǐ Xī can be found in the *Shǐjì* 5 "Qín běnjì" 秦本記 (Basic Annals 5).

[I]: The character *q*7/13 鷢 remains obscure. According to the context of the story, however, it seems clear that it must have to do with "ox and shepherd tending".

From highest antiquity, the term *qīng* 卿 is used for eminent officials, sometimes particularized with further pre-posed qualifications. Throughout the Zhōu it meant 'minister', denoting the highest category of officials serving the King and Feudal Lords.[32]

[J]: Strip *q*9 is one of the most controversial passages of the "Qióng dá yǐ shí". Neither Chén Wěi, nor Chén Jiàn connect the strips *q*9 and *q*8 (both suggest to place *q*9 between *q*14 and *q*10). Moreover, the proper reading of some of these graphs is as yet an open issue. Originally, the two graphs *q*9/2-3 鷢 鷢 are transcribed as *tāo* 滔,

---

[was he] that [he could] go under the poles of a state carriage. Despite of this [he] made [the sovereign] of Chǔ protector over the states".

[27] See, Charles O. Hucker 1995, p. 416.
[28] See Michael Loewe 1999, p. 1018.
[29] Cf. *Shǐjì* 83 "Lǔ Zhònglián Zòu Yáng lièzhuàn" 魯仲連鄒陽列傳 (Memoir 23).
[30] See *Huáinánzǐ*: 19/203/6.
[31] See Húběi shěng Jīngmén shì bówùguǎn 1998, p. 146, n. 9.
[32] See Hucker 1995, p. 173.

and *hǎi* 酼 (also written 醢). Lǐ Líng transcribes the character *q*9/2 as *tāo* 韜 'to sheathe'. As he states, *tāo* 韜 (OC *l̥ˤu) is derived from *yǎo* 舀 (OC *[l]u), which, throughout early manuscripts, is commonly confused with 滔 (OC *l̥ˤu). He furthermore transcribes the graph *q*9/3 弜 as *huì* 晦 (OC *m̥ˤək-s) 'obscure, dark'.[33] Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信 follow the suggestion made by editors of the Húběi Province Museum and transcribe the graph in question as *tāo* 滔 'overflow, a torrent, rushing water'. In its borrowed meaning of *ní shuǐ* 泥水 'muddy waters' it also carries the meaning 'of little value'.[34] Zhào Píng'ān 趙平安 approaches the two characters in a rather different way.[35] He believes that the two graphs should be read *tǎn hǎi* 醓醢 (boneless brine of pickle minced meat), which, with reference to modern commentary of the *Chǔ cí*, he reads in the borrowed meaning that denotes a certain kind of torture. Moreover, this torture, as Zhào presumes, should refer to the historical figure Bǐgān 比干,[36] who, throughout various sources, is often named together with Wǔ Zǐxū.[37] In order to keep his explanation of this passage sound (the name never appears on he strips), Zhào concludes that certain (?) strips should be added between *q*8 and *q*9 and the "Qióng dá yǐ shí" hence must be incomplete.

To me, this assumption seems rather implausible. As demonstrated (chap. 3), the "Qióng dá yǐ shí" is not merely complete, but it also is contains a highly stringent and argumentatively concise composition. As discussed, structurally, the "Qióng dá yǐ shí" is a 'closed' text (chap. 6).

As mentioned, neither Chén Jiàn, nor Chén Wěi see how strip *q*9 connects with *q*8—none of them make an analysis of the structure of the text (!)—and they both connect strips *q*14 with *q*9. For various reasons this is problematic. Whereas strip *q*9 structurally marks a break after sub-canto 'two' and introduces a new aspect (which

---

[33] See Lǐ Líng 1999, pp. 495-6; idem 2002, p. 88.
[34] See Tú Zōngliú and Liú Zǔxìn 2001, pp. 32, 33.
[35] See Zhào Píng'ān 趙平安 2002, pp. 18 f.
[36] Prince Bǐgān served under King Zhòu of Yīn 殷紂王, by whom he was killed. The story of Prince Bǐgān can be read in the *Shǐjì* 3 "Yīn běnjì" (Basic Annals 3).
[37] See Zhào Píng'ān 2002, p. 20.

leads to the 'open argument' of sub-canto 'three'[38]), both scholars read the whole passage in a line. Then, when looking at the structure of sub-canto 'two', it may be seen that the style of two entirely parallel passages contains the sentence pattern of 3-3-4, 3-3-4 [也].[39] This would be destroyed when reading the sentences in a continuous line of *q*14 and *q*8 ("善鄙己也，窮達以時。德行一也，譽毀在旁，聖之弋母之白 [q14] 初滔[酉有][40]，後名揚，非其德加。子胥前多功，後戮死，非其智 [q9] 衰也。…"[41] Compare the sentences in Chén Jiàn.[42] This passage would have a sentence structure of 4-4-4-4-9(!)-3-4-5-3-5, which is highly problematic.

In sum, I believe to be justified explaining *q*9 as the beginning of what I call the deduction of the legendary materials, rather than to connect it with *q*14.

For the identification of character *q*9/2 🀄, I follow the interpretation of Lǐ Líng (see above). For phonetic reasons I read the graph *q*9/3 🀄 as *huì* 晦 (OC *m̥ˤək-s) 'obscure, dark' as a phonetic loan for *hǎi* 酼. The only received reading of 酼 is *yòu* (MC < hjuwH, which implies OC *[G]ʷəʔ-s. Interpreting *huì* 晦 (OC *m̥ˤək-s) as *hǎi* 酼 works only if the *m̥ˤ- initial in *m̥ˤək-s and the *qˤʷh- in 酼 had already merged. It is important to note at this point that even though this merge is possible, it nevertheless seems surprising that it may have occurred at such an early date.

[K]: Compare the similarity of this account with the story in the *Hán shī wàizhuàn*, chapter 7: 伍子胥前多功，後戮死，非[其]智有盛衰也，前遇闔閭，後遇夫差也 "[The fact that] in the beginning Wǔ Zǐxū was very meritorious, [and yet], he fell into disgrace and was put to death later, was not because his wisdom has either flourished or declined, [but] because he had previously met Hélú 闔閭[43] first, and Fūchāi 夫差 [44] later".[45] The account in the *Shuō yuàn* 說苑 17 "Zá yán" 雜言 (Miscellaneous

---

[38] See my discussion in chapter 3: "Qióng dá yǐ shí".
[39] See chapter 3 "Qióng dá yǐ shí", p. 83.
[40] [酉有] read as one character.
[41] Transcription follows the one chosen by Chén Jiàn 2004, p. 317.
[42] Ibidem.
[43] Hélú (?-496 BC), also Wǔzǐ Guāng 吳子光, Gongzǐ Guāng 公子光 (or simply Guāng 光), or Hélú 闔盧, ruled the state of Wǔ from 514-469 BC. He was one of the Five Hegemons.
[44] Fūchāi 夫差 (?-473 BC) ruled the state of Wǔ from 495-473. He was son of Hélú.
[45] See *Hánshī wàizhuàn*: 7.6/50/24.

sayings) records the case by saying: 非其智益衰也 "It is not that his wisdom has either increased nor decreased".[46] The story of Wǔ Zǐxū and his success in taking revenge for his father and brother's unjust death, but also his own execution, appears throughout early texts.[47] In short: after Wǔ Zǐxū's father and elder brother were murdered by the king of Chǔ, Wǔ Zǐxū fled to the state of Wǔ. In the state of Wǔ he gained the favor of the king, whom he helped to defeat Chǔ. Later, however, Wǔ Zǐxū fell into disgrace and was executed by order of the king's successor.

[L]: The editors of the Húběi Province Museum transcribe the character *q*10/4 [image] as *dí* 馰 (OC *[t]ˤewk) 'horse of good quality'. Lǐ Líng identified it as *è* 厄, (OC *ʔˤrek) 'in difficulty, distressed'.[48] He corroborates this reading by referring to the *Shuō yuàn* 17 "Zá yán", in which the graph *è* 厄 also appears in combination with *jì* 驥 'a thorough-bred horse' (驥厄罷鹽車).[49] What is more, yet unnoticed by Lǐ, this reading is confirmed by the fact that in the subsequent—and entirely parallel—sentence, the second graph also is a verb, which describes the difficulties of a 'good horse' when facing a seemingly insuperable condition.

The character *q*10/5 [image] *zhāng* 張 can also be read as 'nervous, in tension', as mentioned also by Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信.[50] However, referring to the pattern of the subsequent sentence ('fine horse' – verb describing difficulties – place-name), I rather tend to view *zhāng* 張 as a place-name, which can be identified with the name of a place of Spring and Autumns'-time Jìn.[51] Reading *zhāng* 張 as 'nervous' would destroy the parallel structure of the entire passage. Nevertheless, this

---

[46] See *Shuō yuàn*: 17.17/144/10.
[47] Cf. Mark Edward Lewis 1990, p. 84. On the various accounts, see David Johnson 1981, pp. 255-271; and same author 1980 (a) and (b).
[48] See Lǐ Líng 1999, p. 496; 2002, p. 88.
[49] See *Shuō yuàn*: 17.17/144/11.
[50] See *Lǐjì zhùshù* 禮記注疏 21 "Zájì xià" 雜記下 (Miscellaneous records), vol. 5, p. 751: 張而不弛文武弗能也弛而不張文武弗為也一張一弛文武之道也 "strained and yet without relaxation, Kings Wén and Wǔ were incapable in this; relaxed and without tension, Kings Kings Wén and Wǔ would refrain from acting so. Once strained, once relaxed, that is the way of Kings Wén and Wǔ". See also Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信 2001, p. 34.
[51] See *Zhuǒ zhuàn*, "Xiānggōng year 23", p. 604; Píshào yì 郫邵邑, also referred to as Píshào 郫邵, Shàotíng 邵亭, or simply as Shào 邵; the Spring and Autumns' Jìn 晉 place-name is located in Hénán, west to modern Jìyuán shì 濟源市 (see *Zhōngguó lìshǐ dìmíng dà cídiǎn*, p. 926).

reading of *zhāng* as a place-name has yet to be verified.

The editors of the Húběi Province Musem transcribe the character *q*10/7 🐎 as *qí* 騏 'a piebald horse';[52] *qí* 騏 is further read as *qí* 騏 OC *[g](r)ə. Lǐ Líng identified it as *jùn* 駿 'a fine horse'.[53] However, the combination of *jì* 驥 and *jùn* 駿 is unattested in transmitted records (as opposed to the combination of 騏驥).[54] Later, Lǐ corrected his transcription to *qí* 騏 'black-mottled grey horse', which should be understood in the sense of *jì* 驥 'a thorough-bred horse', both referring to 'fine horses'.[55]

[M]: Qiú Xīguī remarks that the story of the excellent rider Zào Fù 造父 also appears in chapter 7 of the *Hán shī wàizhuàn* and in the *Shuō yuàn* 17 "Zá yán". On this basis, Qiú argues that the character *q*10/15 🐎 should be read as *zhuàng* 狀; *q*10/20 🐎 as *zhì* 致, and the character *q*11/3 🐎 should indeed be read *zào* 造, referring to the rider Zào Fù. Accordingly, Qiú argues to add the character *fù* 父 after *q*11/3, to complete the name of the famous horse rider.[56]

[N]: Strip *q*12 has broke off at both ends. On top of strip *q*12 presumably three graphs are missing. Lǐ Líng reconstructs this passage as "怨非為".[57] According to the underlying structure, I suggest to reconstruct the present passage as follows. The topic of sub-canto 'five' is action that bears no result. The pattern runs: "failure, and yet no [x] (something negative, intercepted by preceding 'no')."[58]

The next sentence contains two elements, each of them bolstering one another: "A-element": "hence [a]", "B-element": "[b] to achieve a name." In this case it is the following sentence that reveals the reading of the previous statement: "A-element":

---

[52] See Húběi shěng Jīngmén shì bówùguǎn 1998, p. 145.
[53] See Lǐ Líng 1999, p. 496.
[54] See compare *Xúnzǐ* 23 "Xìng è" 性惡 (Nature is evil): 23/117/14. See also *Zhuāngzǐ* 莊子 17 "Qiū shuǐ" 秋水 (Autumn floods). In *Zhuāngzǐ zuǎnjiān* 裝子纂箋, p. 131.
[55] See Lǐ Líng 2002, p. 89.
[56] See Húběi shěng Jīngmén shì bówùguǎn 1998, p.146, fn. 13.
[57] See Lǐ Líng 1999, p. 496; idem 2002, p. 88.
[58] Consequently, the reading of *yuàn* 怨, 'resentment'.

"although nobody knows him"; "B-element": "he is without regret".[59] Thus, even though we can by no means know the so-called "original" reading, we can nevertheless be fairly sure about an approximate reading of this passage. This pattern applies to the entire passage and reoccurs on strips *q*11 through *q*14. It always reads: [*x*] – something negative – and yet – [*y*].[60]

[O]: Lǐ Líng argues that at the bottom of *q*12, presumably six graphs should be added. Based on the *Xúnzǐ* 28 "Yòu zuò" and the *Hán shī wàizhuàn*, chapter 7, where a similar story can be traced, he adds the graphs "芝蘭生於幽谷".[61] For the following reasons, this would fit the context of the passage: first, the top of the first corrupted (or lost) graph is still visible. Here, the 'grass-radical' can be detected ![grass-radical graph]. Secondly, this reading can be easily brought into line with the next sentence which reads "[*not*] not fragrant because [*x*] smells it".[62] This fits perfectly into the pattern I have detected, above (strips *q*11-12: 'A-' and 'B-element'). Lastly, this reading is corroborated by transmitted texts (*Xúnzǐ* 28 "Yòu zuò" and *Hán shī wàizhuàn*, chapter 7). Again, as above, we can only reconstruct an "approximate" reading of this passage, but not the "original" passage itself.

[P]: Presumably four graphs are missing at the top of strip *q*13. Again, according to the pattern I have described for the present sub-canto ('A/B-element' in which the one bolsters the other, appearing as '[*x*] – something negative – and yet – [*y*]'), we can make an informed guess on the approximate reading of the present passage, by completing the pattern '[*x*] – something negative – and yet – [*y*]', based on the subsequent four characters (嗅而不芳 "[*x*] not fragrant *since no* [X] smell [it]").[63]

At the bottom of strip *q*13 presumably four graphs are missing. Again, since the subsequent line is still visible on strip *q*14 (善怀己也 "goodness, neglect itself"), it is again possible to make an informed guess on the approximate (and probably best) reading of this passage based on these graphs. Once more, taking the 'A/B-element' of the pattern '[*x*] – something negative – and yet – [*y*]', the approximate reading

---

[59] Accordingly the reading of the 'A-element: "[he] hides"; 'B-element': "[and yet] is without regret".
[60] This is another indication that this passage is a unit and should not be disrupted, as opposed to what both Chén Wěi and Chén Jiàn argue.
[61] See Lǐ Líng 1999, p. 496; idem 2002, p. 88.
[62] Compare the pattern I have described for this passage.
[63] Hence "非以無人" as an approximate reconstruction.

should be 無人知其 {*nobody knows its*} goodness"; hence making "[x] does not because of *nobody knows its* goodness, neglect itself", or something similar to this.

[Q]: The visible characters *q*13/5-9 [⿰][⿱][⿱][⿱][⿰] have caused commentators considerable headache. My reading of 璑璐瑾瑜 "beautiful stone of jade" and 包 "contain" follows the reading of Liú Yuèxián 劉樂賢,[64] Liú Zhāo 劉釗,[65] and Yán Shìxuàn 顏世鉉,[66] as suggested also by Chén Jiàn 陳劍.[67]

[R]: On the position of strip *q*14 in the "Qióng dá yǐ shí", see my discussion under [J] above.

[S]: The character *q*14/19 [⿰] is transcribed as *yì* 弋 (a dart; to shoot with bow and arrow; OC *lək), and it takes a lot of effort to create a sound reading by sticking to this transcription.[68] I read it parallel to *q*14/11 [⿰] above, which should be transcribed as 弌 instead of *yì* 弋 (OC *lək). My suggestion is to read the graph as *yī* 一 (one; OC *[ʔ]i[t]), which offers a simple and sound reading since it can be easily justified phonetically, and it perfectly connects to the explanation of one's behavior in accordance to the "one *dé*," above. The reading this graph as *yī* 一 (one) is well attested.[69]

Even though it seems phonetically problematic I tentatively follow Lǐ Líng in reading *zhī* 之 (*a particle*; OC *tə) as *zī* 緇 'black'[70] OC *[ts]rə), until a better solution has been found. This reading connects best to the pairing of *yōu/míng*, below (*q*15/7, 8).

Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信 suggest to read *q*15/2 [⿱] as *lì* 釐 'small, minute; to regulate'.[71] The direct transcription of the graph is 釐. It seems to consist

[64] See Liú Yuèxián 劉樂賢 2000.
[65] See Liú Zhāo 劉釗 2000 and 2005, p. 175.
[66] See Yán Shìxuàn 顏世鉉 2000.
[67] See Chén Jiàn 陳劍 2004, p. 316.
[68] See Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信 2001, p. 37.
[69] See Martin Kern 2005, note 43, pp. 187, 188. See also Hé Línyí 何琳儀 1998, p. 1080.
[70] See Lǐ Líng 1999, p. 496; idem, 2002, p. 88.
[71] See Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信 2001, p. 37.

of two phonophorics, namely *lǐ* 里, which can be reconstructed as OC *(mə.)rəʔ, and the phonophoric *lái* 來, which can be reconstructed as OC *(mə.)rˤə (<*mə.rˤək). These phonophorics match with the Old Chinese reconstruction for *lì* 釐 OC *[r]ə and I follow the suggestion made by Tú Zōngliú 涂宗流 and Liú Zǔxìn 劉祖信.