



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Islamic Reformism and Christinaity. A Critical Reading of the Works of Muhammad Rashid Rida and his Associates (1898-1935)

Ryad, U.

Citation

Ryad, U. (2008, June 12). *Islamic Reformism and Christinaity. A Critical Reading of the Works of Muhammad Rashid Rida and his Associates (1898-1935)*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/12958>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/12958>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Islamic Reformism and Christianity

Islamic Reformism and Christianity:
A Critical Reading of the Works of Muḥammad
Rashīd Riḍā and His Associates
(1898-1935)

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. P.F. van der Heijden,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 12 juni 2008
klokke 13:45 uur

door
Umar Ryad
geboren te Egypte
in 1975

Promotiecommissie

Promotoren: Prof.dr. P.S. van Koningsveld
Prof.dr. G.A. Wiegers
Referent: Prof.dr. J. Waardenburg
Overige leden: Prof.dr. M.S. Berger
Dr. H.L. Murre-van den Berg

إلى ...

أبي الحاج رياض

أمي الحاجة ملاك

نزوجتي إليزابيث

ابنتي جمانة

مع كل الحب والعرفان

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	v
Introduction	I
A Brief Biographical Sketch	2
Previous Studies	6
Sources and Organization of the Study	10
Chapter One	
Riḍā's Sources of Knowledge of the West, With Special Reference to Christianity.....	19
1.1. Western Ideas in Arabic Print	20
1.1.1. Hammurabi and the Babel-und-Bibel-Streit (1903)	25
1.1.2. Arabic Translation of the <i>Encyclopaedia of Islam</i> (1933)	29
1.2. <i>Al-Manār</i> Literary Figures	34
1.2.1 Muslims Living in the West	34
1.2.2. Writers in the Muslim World	43
1.3. Conclusion	52
Chapter Two	
Riḍā and Arab Christians: Attitudes towards Syrian Christians and the Egyptian Coptic Community.....	53
2.1. Syrian Christian Nationalists: A Common Political Agenda	53
2.1.1. Faraḥ Anṭūn (<i>al-Jāmi'ā</i>)	56
2.1.2. Jurjī Zaidān (<i>al-Hilāl</i>)	60
2.1.3. Ya'qūb Ṣarrūf and Fāris Nimr (<i>al-Muqṭataf</i>)	66
2.1.4. Shiblī Shumayyil: A Fervent Darwinist	68
2.1.5. 'Ibrāhīm al-Yāzījī	71
2.1.6. Khalīl Sa'ādeh	73
2.1.7. <i>Al-Machreq</i> : A Jesuit Syrian Review	76
2.2. The Egyptian Coptic Community	81
2.2.1. Riḍā's Attitudes towards the Copts before 1911	82
2.2.2. The Coptic Congress of 1911	84
2.2.3. Salāma Mūsā	92
2.3. Conclusion	96
Chapter Three	
<i>Al-Manār</i> versus Evangelism: Rashīd Riḍā's Perceptions of Social and Theological Aspects of Missions	99
3.1. Mission is the Life of Religion	99
3.2. Mission and Colonialism	103
3.3. Confrontation with the British	106
3.4. Missionary Schools	110
3.5. Encounters with Missions in <i>al-Manār</i>	118

3.6. A Muslim Missionary Seminary	129
3.7. Conversion to Islam versus Evangelization	132
3.8. Al-Azhar Criticised	134
3.9. Conclusion	137

Chapter Four

False Allegations or Proofs? Riḍā's Formative Polemics on Christianity	139
4.1. A Muslim Doubting the Authenticity of the Qur'ān	140
4.2. Researches of the Diligent	143
4.2.1. Three Prophets: Historical Doubts about Judaism and Christianity	144
4.2.2. Islam & Christianity: Three Goals of Religion	146
4.2.3. Judaism & Christianity Derived from Paganism?	148
4.2.4. Qur'ānic Proofs for the Genuineness of the Bible	150
4.2.5. Books of the Old and New Testament	154
4.3. The Glad Tidings of Peace	157
4.3.1. Muḥammad's Superiority above all Prophets?	157
4.3.2. Fear and Hope	159
4.3.3. Faith and Acts of Muslims	160
4.3.4. Absurd Treatment	162
4.3.5. Exceeding the Borders of Politeness	163
4.4. The Standard of Zion	165
4.4.1. Sinlessness of Prophets and Salvation	165
4.5. Conclusion	167

Chapter Five

In Pursuit of a 'True' Gospel: Riḍā's Arabic Edition of the Gospel of Barnabas	169
5.1. Championing Tolstoy's Gospel	171
5.2. Announcing another 'True' Gospel?	173
5.3. A Freemason	174
5.3.1. Critical Analysis of Sa'ādeh's Preface	176
5.4. Riḍā's Introduction	183
5.4.1. Later Use by <i>al-Manār</i>	186
5.5. Short-lived Like an Apricot: A Missionary Response	187
5.6. Conclusion	192

Chapter Six

The Art of Polemics: Tawfiq Ṣidqī's Contributions to <i>al-Manār</i> and Riḍā's Use of Them	193
6.1. Al-Matbūlī of Cairo and the Resurrection of Jesus	194
6.2. The Religion of God in His Prophets' Books	195
6.2.1. Jesus as Offering	195
6.2.2. The Crucifixion and Divinity of Jesus in the Old Testament	196
6.3. The Doctrine of Crucifixion and Salvation	201

6.4. Şidqî's View on the Scriptures of the New Testament and Christian Doctrines	205
6.5. Riḍā's Reflection	209
6.5.1. Riḍā discussing Crucifixion in a Missionary School	211
6.5.2. Reward and Salvation in Islam	212
6.5.3. A Pagan Nature of the Doctrines of Crucifixion and Salvation?	214
6.5.4. An Illusive Crucifixion?	214
6.6. Conclusion	218
Chapter Seven	
Recapitulation of Ideas: Christianity as Reflected in Riḍā's <i>Fatwās</i>	221
7.1. Early Encounters	222
7.2. Are Christians Unbelievers?	224
7.3. A Kuwaiti Petitioner on Slavery in the Bible	225
7.4. An Aḥmadī Petitioner	227
7.5. A Lutheran Danish Missionary in Riḍā's <i>Fatwās</i>	228
7.6. An Egyptian Debater in Gairdner's Magazine	233
7.7. A Muslim Facing Missionaries in Tunisia	235
7.8. Fatherless Birth of Jesus: non-Qur'ānic?	236
7.9. Missionary Doubts on Qur'ānic Narratives	237
7.10. Miḥrāb and Altar	239
7.11. Don't Recite the Qur'ānic Verses on Christians in Public!	239
7.12. A Muslim Copyist of Missionary Books and Crafting the Cross for Christians	241
7.13. Conclusion	242
Conclusion.....	243
Appendix I.....	251
Appendix II.....	261
Appendix III	263
Appendix IV.....	273
Appendix V	275
Appendix VI.....	277
Appendix VII.....	279
Appendix VIII	281
Appendix IX	283

Appendix X	287
Appendix XI	289
Appendix XII.....	293
Bibliography	295
Private Archives	295
Works in Arabic	295
Works in Western Languages	298
Samenvatting en conclusies	319
Curriculum Vitae	325
Select Publications	325

Acknowledgements

A sincere and patient wife should always come in the first place of gratitude. My deepest indebtedness is due to Elisabeth for her habitual endurance and understanding. The smile and jokes of my lovely daughter Jumèna Nermine Fairuz have always relieved me in the situation of stress during the last three years; her coming in the world has made all the difference. My equal imperishable gratitude is also due to my parents, Ḥājj Ryaḍ ‘Abd al-Khālik al-Sa‘īd al-‘Adawī and Ḥājjā Malāk Amīn ‘Awaḍ al-Sayyid Shaṭā who never spare an effort to support me to carve out the academic way. My youngest brother al-Mitwallī has greatly contributed to this work in helping me organize and scan the archive of Rashīd Riḍā in the summer of 2004. Similar gratitude should also go to Elisabeth’s parents, Matthijs and Tjitske Broers, and my brother-in-law and paranimf Gerhard Broers for their support.

Many names deserve a word of thanks: Mr. Fu’ād Riḍā, the grandson of Rashīd Riḍā, Dr. Hārūn Kirām, the son of Zekī Kirām, Mr. ‘Abd al-Ghanī Bū Zikrī, the grandson of Taqī al-Dīn al-Hilālī, Dr. Mohammed Daraoui of the University of Meknes, Mr. Muḥammad Ghannām, and Mr. Yaḥyā ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd for their generous reception and unlimited trust. My gratitude is also due to Wael Nofal for designing the cover and to Abdurraouf Oueslati for finalizing the work. Lastly but not least, three names should not be forgotten: my colleague and dearest friend Mohsen ‘Abd al-‘Aty Haredy, our close friend Marike Baijens and Mr. ‘Attiya Soliman, the tower of strength for Egyptian students in Leiden.

The study would have never taken its present form without the support of the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO) and the Leids Universiteit Fonds (LUF) which subsidized my research trips to Egypt, Germany and Morocco.