



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Labor divided. Union structure and the development of the postwar welfare state in the Netherlands and the United Kingdom**

Oude Nijhuis, D.M.

### **Citation**

Oude Nijhuis, D. M. (2009, November 3). *Labor divided. Union structure and the development of the postwar welfare state in the Netherlands and the United Kingdom*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/14322>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/14322>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

# LABOR DIVIDED



# LABOR DIVIDED

UNION STRUCTURE AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE POSTWAR  
WELFARE STATE IN THE NETHERLANDS AND THE UNITED  
KINGDOM

## **Proefschrift**

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. P.F. van der Heijden,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op dinsdag 3 november 2009  
klokke 15.00

door

**Dennie Oude Nijhuis**

Geboren te Oldenzaal  
in 1979

## **Promotiecommissie**

Promotoren	Prof. dr. R.T. Griffiths
Co-promotor	Dr. L.J. Touwen
Overige leden	Prof. dr. K. van Kersbergen (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam) Prof. dr. J. Visser (Universiteit van Amsterdam) Prof. dr. R. Koole Dr. K. Anderson (Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen)

The printing of this dissertation was financially supported by:  
J.E. Jurriaanse Stichting  
M.A.O.C. Gravin van Bylandt Stichting

Printed by: Ridderprint, Ridderkerk

ISBN: 978-90-5335-218-2

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation benefited from the invaluable support of many people. I would first like to thank my colleagues from the Economic and Social History section of the Department of History at Leiden University. Regrettably I cannot thank them all, but I do want to mention a few of them. During my first year as a PhD student, Jurien de Jong's company and advice proved to be invaluable to me. I also want to thank Cátia Antunes, whose help and advice extended far beyond the academic sphere. I want to thank Martijn van der Burg, who joined the department only two years ago, for his company and for helping me in making this book presentable. The joint work with Peter Tammes on public opinion towards European integration was a welcome sidestep from my thesis writing obligations.

Leiden University customs do not allow me to give extensive thanks to Richard Griffiths, but I trust that he realizes how grateful I am to him.

I am particularly grateful to Jeroen Touwen. Jeroen not only drew my attention to a PhD position at the Department of History, but proved to be a great source of support and friendly advice in subsequent years. Sharing an interest in economics and labor-related matters, our many discussions broadened my horizon. It was a pleasure to have him as a co-advisor.

The Posthumus Institute provided me with the first opportunity to present my research. I profited greatly from group discussions with fellow PhD students (Daan, Ton, Bart, Michael) and the comments of staff members. My special thanks go to Ben Gales, Peer Vries, Peter Scholliers, and Lex Heerma van Voss for their insightful criticisms on various stages of my work. Although not related to the Posthumus Institute, I also benefited from the remarks of Jacques van Gerwen.

I was fortunate to meet many helpful colleagues, librarians and archivists during my research trips in the Netherlands and abroad. Many of them offered invaluable assistance in gathering necessary sources and literature. My special thanks go out to Matthieu Leimgruber, for providing me with archival material and for his helpful advice in PhD matters. I also want to thank Doreen Arnoldus for her advice and for accompanying me on a research trip to Friesland.

Writing a PhD thesis is a personal enterprise. I was therefore fortunate to be able to share experiences with friends who embarked on a PhD trajectory at roughly the same time. In this respect, I am particularly grateful to Ismail, Vera and Tom. Outside the direct working environment, I could always rely on good friends for drinks, laughs, and distraction. Most notably, I want to thank Chris, Bartel, Fatima and Luuk for listening to my complaints about the hardships of life as a PhD student.

Special thanks go out to my family. My parents always supported my academic endeavors, although they often must have wondered at what I was doing exactly. Without the moral and financial support they have given me over the years, this thesis would not have been written. My brother Lars always reminds me that there is more to life than academics and books. Franka, I do believe that the deal we made worked out

well for the both us. Finally, towards the end of my PhD period I was fortunate to gain another warm and loving family.

This leaves the most important one to thank, my wife Ayben. It is her love and unconditional support that has helped me through the often very difficult moments of completing my thesis. Her patience, tenderness and affection never cease to amaze me.







# CONTENTS

## LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

1. LABOR AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE POSTWAR WELFARE STATE	5
Revisiting the Role of Labor in Welfare State Development	6
The Importance of Union Structure for Welfare State Development	10
The Organization of the Book	14
A Note on Sources	15
2. LABOR DIVIDED	19
Revisiting British Voluntarism	26
Shaping Solidarity: Union Structure and the Representation of Workers' Interests	41
Unions, Employers, and the Notion of the Social Wage	47
Looking Ahead	56
3. THE DEVELOPMENT OF OLD AGE PENSIONS IN THE NETHERLANDS AND THE UNITED KINGDOM	59
Solidarity versus Egalitarianism: Comparing Pension Reform in the Netherlands and the United Kingdom	61
Labor Unions and the Rejection of a Redistributive Contributory Pension Scheme in the United Kingdom	68
Unions, Employers and the Move Towards Full Subsistence Pensions in the Netherlands	81
A Final Note on Employers	90
4. THE DEVELOPMENT OF UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE IN THE NETHERLANDS AND THE UNITED KINGDOM	93
Toward Superannuation for the Unemployed in the United Kingdom	95
The Economic Benefits of Unemployment Compensation	98
The Introduction of the Earnings-Related Supplementary Scheme	108
From Bismarck to the Social Insurance in the Netherlands	114
From Grant to Right: The Introduction of the Unemployment Provision	123

5. THE DEVELOPMENT OF DISABILITY INSURANCE IN THE NETHERLANDS AND THE UNITED KINGDOM	127
The TUC and the Industrial Preference	130
The Evolution of Public Protection From Non-Work-Related Disabilities in the United Kingdom	137
Toward a Single Disability Insurance for All Disabled in the Netherlands	144
The General Disability Act and the Inclusion of the Self-Employed	156
6. UNION SOLIDARITY AND THE USE OF SOCIAL SECURITY FOR EARLY RETIREMENT PURPOSES IN THE NETHERLANDS	159
Explaining the Extraordinary Exit of Elderly Workers from the Dutch labor market	160
The Dutch Disability Insurance and Exit from the Labor Market	167
Early Exit Through the Dutch Unemployment System	177
The Introduction of Industry-Wide Early Retirement Schemes	182
7. CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS	187
Occupational Unionism and the Emergence of Divided Welfare States	192
The Importance of Union Structure for National Differences in Labor Market Development	198
Mapping Social Solidarity	202
REFERENCES	205
SUMMARY	221
SAMENVATTING	228
CURRICULUM VITAE	233

## LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 2.1	Dispersion of weekly earnings of full-time manual men, 1886-1980	38
Table 4.1	The unemployment benefit as a percentage of weekly earnings under the National Insurance Scheme in 1965	111
Table 4.2	The unemployment benefit as a percentage of weekly earnings under the National Insurance Scheme and the earnings-related supplementary scheme	112
Table 5.1	Weekly benefit level of a fully disabled male worker in shillings, 1959	133
Table 5.2	Benefit as a percentage of previous earnings under Labour's sick pay proposal and the existing National Insurance Scheme during the first 4 weeks of sickness or disability`	140
Table 5.3	Benefit as a percentage of previous earnings under Labour's sick pay proposal and the industrial injury benefit during the first 4 weeks of sickness or disability	142
Table 5.4	Disability insurance in the Netherlands in the early postwar period	146
Figure 6.1	Labor force participation rate of men aged 55-64 in various countries (in %)	161
Table 6.1	Composition of the labor force of older men in various countries, 1989	162
Table 6.2	The use of different early retirement pathways among male workers in the Netherlands, 1980-1992, by number of participants as a percentage of the age groups 55-59 and 60-64	166
Figure 6.2	Disability benefit recipients per 1000 active labor market participants by age in various countries in 1990	168



## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

### The United Kingdom

AEEU	Amalgated Engineering and Electrical Union
BEC	British Employers' Confederation
CAWU	Clerical and Administrative Workers Unions
CBI	Confederation of British Industry
CSPA	Civil Service Pensioner Alliance
EETPU	Electrical, Electronic, Telecommunications and Plumbing Union
FBI	Federation of British Industries
GMWU	General and Municipal Workers Union
ISTC	Iron and Steel Trades Confederation
LOA	Lifes Offices' Association
NALGO	National Association of Local Government Officers
NFPW	National Federation of Professional Workers
NEDC	National Economic Development Council
NEDO	National Economic Development Office
NJAC	National Joint Advisory Council
NUM	National Union of Mineworkers
NUPE	National Union of Public Employees
NUR	National Union of Railwaymen
NUS	National Union of Seamen
NUVB	National Union of Vehicle Builders
RMT	National Union of Rail, Maritime and Transport Workers
SERPS	State Earnings Related Pension Scheme
STOP	Save the Occupational Pension
TGWU	Transport and General Workers' Union
TSSA	Transport Salaried Staffs' Association
TUC	Trades Union Congress

### The Netherlands

AAW	Algemene Arbeidsongeschiktheidswet (General Disability Act)
AKWV	Algemene Katholieke Werkgeversvereniging (General Catholic Employers' Federation)
AOW	Algemene Ouderdomswet (General Old Age Act)
CNV	Christelijk Nationaal Vakverbond (Christian Union Federation)
CSWV	Centraal Sociaal Werkgevers Verbond (Central Social Employers' Federation)
FCWV	Federatie van Katholieke en Protestants-Christelijke Werkgeversverbanden (Federation of Catholic and Protestant-Christian Employers' Unions)
FvB	Federatie van Bedrijfsverenigingen (Federation of Industrial Councils)