



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Political legitimacy in Chinese history : the case of the Northern Wei Dynasty (386-535)**

Liu, P.

### **Citation**

Liu, P. (2018, April 25). *Political legitimacy in Chinese history : the case of the Northern Wei Dynasty (386-535)*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/61623>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/61623>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/61623> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Liu, P.

**Title:** Political legitimacy in Chinese history : the case of the Northern Wei Dynasty (386-535)

**Issue Date:** 2018-04-25

# Political Legitimacy in Chinese History: The Case of the Northern Wei Dynasty (386-535)

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op woensdag 25 april 2018  
klokke 13.45 uur

door

Puning Liu

geboren te Shuozhou, China  
op 27 december 1985

## Samenstelling Promotiecommissie

Promotor	Prof. dr. H.G.D.G. De Weerd
Co-promotor	Dr. P. van Els
Overige leden:	Prof. dr. A.T. Gerritsen
	Prof. dr. B.J. ter Haar (University of Oxford)
	Dr. F. Lin
	Prof. dr. C. Schwermann (Ruhr-Universität Bochum)

北人詆南為島夷，南人指北為索虜，在當日之人，不務修德行仁，而徒事口舌相譏，已為至卑至陋之見。

Northerners slighted Southerners as “Island Barbarians,” while Southerners pointed to Northerners as “Plaited Barbarians.” The people in those days never worked at cultivating their virtue or practicing benevolence. Instead, they just looked for occasions to dispute and slander one another. It was a show of the most vulgar and ugliest kind.

— Emperor Yongzheng 雍正 (r. 1722-1735)



# Table of Contents

Preface.....	i
List of Maps and Charts.....	ii
List of Abbreviations.....	iii
Introduction.....	1
State of the Field.....	2
Theories of Legitimacy.....	2
Research on Traditional Chinese Views on Legitimacy.....	10
Research on the Northern Wei.....	16
My Contribution.....	20
Legitimation Practices of the Northern Wei and Southern Dynasties.....	20
The Intellectual History of the Northern Wei Legitimacy Dispute.....	21
Traditional Chinese Views on Legitimacy.....	22
Research Questions.....	26
Source Problems.....	27
Outline.....	28
Chapter 1. History of the Northern Wei and the Southern Dynasties.....	31
1.1 History of the Tuoba Tribe and the Northern Wei.....	32
1.1.1 Origin and Early History of the Tuoba Tribe.....	32
1.1.2 Rise and Fall of the Northern Wei Dynasty.....	37
1.2 History of Southern China.....	41
1.2.1 History of the Eastern Jin Dynasty.....	41
1.2.2 History of the Southern Dynasties.....	44

Chapter 2. The Contest for Legitimacy.....	47
2.1 Establishing Legitimacy: The Northern Wei’s Practices .....	47
2.1.1 Dynastic Name.....	47
2.1.2 Dynastic Phase .....	52
2.1.3 Capital City .....	57
2.1.4 Chinese Cultural Conventions .....	62
2.1.5 Diplomacy.....	68
2.2 Preserving Legitimacy: Practices of the Southern Dynasties .....	73
2.2.1 Abdication .....	73
2.2.2 Auspicious Portents.....	79
2.2.3 Capital City and “Immigrant Commanderies” .....	84
2.2.4 Diplomacy.....	90
2.3 Conclusion .....	95
 Chapter 3. Early Views on the Legitimacy of the Northern Wei .....	 99
3.1 Views in the Period of Disunion .....	99
3.1.1 Wei Shou .....	100
3.1.2 Shen Yue and Xiao Zixian .....	105
3.2 Views in the Tang Dynasty .....	110
3.2.1 Li Yanshou .....	110
3.2.2 Huangfu Shi .....	114
3.3 Conclusion .....	118
 Chapter 4. Wang Tong’s Views on the Legitimacy of the Northern Wei .....	 119
4.1 Wang Tong’s Life and Texts.....	119
4.2 Wang Tong’s Views on the Legitimacy of the Northern Wei.....	122
4.2.1 Evidence of Legitimacy .....	123
4.2.2 Two Questions Regarding the Northern Wei’s Legitimacy .....	124

4.2.3 Succession of Legitimate Dynasties .....	128
4.3 Conclusion .....	132
Chapter 5. Later Views on the Legitimacy of the Northern Wei .....	133
5.1 Views in the Song Dynasty .....	133
5.1.1 The Northern Wei is Legitimate.....	135
5.1.2 Both Sides Fail to be Legitimate.....	140
5.1.3 The Northern Wei is Illegitimate.....	148
5.2 Views after the Song Dynasty.....	152
5.2.1 The Adoption of Neo-Confucianism: Fang Xiaoru .....	153
5.2.2 The Deconstruction of <i>zhengtong</i> .....	156
5.3 Conclusion .....	164
Chapter 6. Evolution and Disintegration of Traditional Chinese Views of Legitimacy .....	167
6.1 Traditional Chinese Views of Legitimacy.....	167
6.1.1 Practical Criteria .....	167
6.1.2 Variable Factors .....	170
6.2 Evolution and Disintegration of Traditional Chinese Views of Legitimacy ....	172
6.3 Conclusion .....	176
References.....	179



## Preface

Four years ago, when I started doing my Ph.D. research in Leiden, I never thought it would turn out to be a journey this tough but joyful. It has been a challenging task to “talk” with various politicians, philosophers, and historians in Chinese history, and investigate their distinct views on legitimacy. Luckily, many people supported me along the way.

It is hard to adequately express my gratitude to my mentor, dr. Paul van Els, one of the most warm-hearted and encouraging supervisors that I have ever seen. He guided me into the groves of academe, and continuously offered me kind encouragement. I thank him for his wonderful support during my entire Ph.D. period.

I also owe a debt of gratitude to my other supervisors, prof. dr. Franke Pieke and prof. dr. Hilde De Weerd, both of whom meticulously read this manuscript. Pieke’s comments on the aim and structure of this dissertation greatly helped me improve this work; and De Weerd is a paragon of erudition who taught me how to do rigorous scholarship. I also thank prof. dr. Barend ter Haar, who provided insightful comments the issue of sinicization, and prof. dr. Ding-Xiang Warner, who gave me crucial feedback on Wang Tong.

In the past three years, I was fortunate to attend the Chinese history research meetings organized by De Weerd. I thank my friends in those meetings: Gabe, Jialong, Xiong, Jiyan, Daniel, Monica, Hu Jing, and others. Every two weeks, we gathered to exchange views on each other’s research. I benefited greatly from your views. Many thanks also go out to my friends in Leiden: Rui, Guangsheng, Wenbo, Yinguang, Ka, Liu Jia, Niu Jing, Yifei, Shanshan, Xiaoyu, Jiali, Siyuan, Jianqiang, Ruixuan, and others. We had lots of fun here, which render my memories of Leiden colorful.

I owe the deepest appreciation to my parents for supporting my choice of an academic career even though they knew it would take me far from their side. They also provided me with financial support that enabled my studies in Leiden.

In the end, I thank you, my reader. It is a great joy to see that you share with me an interest in the issue of political legitimacy in Chinese history. I hope you will find as much happiness in reading this dissertation as I experienced writing it. *Omnes homines natura scire desiderant.*

## List of Maps and Charts

Map 1. Migration of the Tuoba People

Map 2. Map of the early Liu Song Dynasty and the Northern Wei in 440

Chart 1. Dynasties in the Period of Disunion

Chart 2. Two Permutations of Official Dynastic Phases in Chinese History

Chart 3. Succession of Legitimate Dynasties in the *Beishi* and *Nanshi*

Chart 4. Huangfu Shi's Version of the Succession of Legitimate Dynasties

Chart 5. Wang Tong's Version of the Succession of Legitimate Dynasties

Chart 6. Ouyang Xiu's Version of the Succession of Legitimate Dynasties

## List of Abbreviations

*Jinshu* 晉書, *JS*

*Liangshu* 梁書, *LS*

*Nan Qi shu* 南齊書, *NQS*

*Sanguozhi* 三國志, *SGZ*

*Songshu* 宋書, *SS*

*Weishu* 魏書, *WS*

*Zizhi tongjian* 資治通鑒, *ZZTJ*

