The handle http://hdl.handle.net/1887/61237 holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

**Author**: Sun, Jianqiang  
**Title**: Re-dating the seven early Chinese Christian manuscripts : Christians in Dunhuang before 1200  
**Date**: 2018-03-21
Re-dating the Seven Early Chinese Christian Manuscripts

Christians in Dunhuang before 1200

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties te verdedigen op
woensdag 21 maart 2018 klokke 13:45

door

Jianqiang SUN

geboren te Tengzhou, China in 1980
Promotores

Prof.dr. H.L. Murre-van den Berg (Radboud University)

Prof.dr. Ab de Jong

Prof.dr. Barend ter Haar (Oxford University)

Promotiecommissie

Prof.dr. H.G.B. Teule (Radboud University / Katholieke Universiteit Leuven)

Dr. M. Nicolini-Zani (Monastero di Bose, Italy)

Dr. P. Riboud (INALCO, Paris)

Prof.dr. R.P.E. Sybesma

Prof.dr. S.N.C. Lieu (Macquarie University, Australia)
Chronology and Geography have been justly called the “eyes of History”, without the lights of which all is chaos and uncertainty; but perhaps a better simile would be, that Dates are to History, what the Latitude and Longitude are to Navigation, — fixing the exact position of, the objects to which they are applied.

— Harris Nicolas (1833:vi).
To

my parents

and

my niece, SUN Xinyi 孫心怡
Contents

Timeline of China’s dynasties ........................................................................................................... 10
Reigns of Tang emperors .................................................................................................................. 11
Abbreviations ................................................................................................................................. 12
List of Maps, Figures and Tables ................................................................................................... 13
Stylistic matters ............................................................................................................................... 16
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................................... 17
Introduction ...................................................................................................................................... 18

1 Main question ............................................................................................................................... 18
2 Methods of dating sources and research scope ........................................................................... 26
3 Dissertation structure .................................................................................................................... 31

Chapter 1 The traditional narrative of China’s pre-twelfth-century Christians .................. 32

1.1 Possible Christian presence in pre-Tang China and expansion of the Church of the East ...... 32
  1.1.1 The Church of the East in the pre-fifth-century Middle East ............................................. 33
  1.1.2 The expansion of the Church of the East from Central Asia to China’s western borders .... 34
  1.1.3 Speculation about a pre-Tang Christian presence ............................................................ 36

1.2 The earliest undisputed Christian presence in China: the Tang church ............................ 37
  1.2.1 The Xi’an Stele .................................................................................................................... 37
  1.2.2 Chinese non-Christian sources ......................................................................................... 40
  1.2.3 Newly discovered Christian inscriptions ......................................................................... 41
  1.2.4 Other sources .................................................................................................................. 41

1.3 The three periods of the Tang church (635-840s) ................................................................. 42
  1.3.1 Arrival-diffusion (635-649) .............................................................................................. 42
  1.3.2 Expansion-setback-recovery (649-790s) ........................................................................... 44
  1.3.3 The so-called disappearance (800-840s) ....................................................................... 50

1.4 Conclusion ................................................................................................................................ 55

Chapter 2 Introducing The Messiah Sutra and On One God ............................................ 57

2.1 Description and the earliest publications .............................................................................. 57

2.2 A synopsis of The Messiah Sutra and On One God .............................................................. 59
  2.2.1 Four sections of The Messiah Sutra ............................................................................... 60
    2.2.1.1 The title: The Messiah Sutra .................
2.2.1.3 Section Three: a transitional part

2.2.1.4 Section Four: Gospel stories

2.2.2 The Four parts of *On One God*

2.2.2.1 Essay One: The Parable, II

2.2.2.2 Essay Two: On One Heaven, I

2.2.2.3 Essay Three: *Shizun On Almsgiving*, III

2.2.2.4 The title: *On One God*

2.3 Rejecting the forgery theory

2.3.1 The emergence of the forgery theory

2.3.2 The arguments propounded by the forgery theory

2.3.3 A critique of the forgery theory

2.4 The tenuous conventional chronology

2.4.1 The popular dates

2.4.2 The problematic arguments

2.4.2.1 Three inconclusive arguments about *On One God’s date*

2.4.2.2 Three dubious observations about *The Messiah Sutra’s date*

2.4.2.2.1 Historical observations

2.4.2.2.2 Philological observations

2.4.2.2.3 Doctrinal observations

2.5 Conclusion

---

**Chapter 3** A refutation of the conventional chronology

3.1 Relying on the name taboo practice to date sources

3.1.1 A historical overview of the name taboo practice

3.1.2 Using the taboos to date sources

3.2 The four methods of tabooring Tang Taizong’s name, *shimin*

3.2.1 Examples taboored using the two older methods, omitting and replacing

3.2.2 Examples taboored using the new method, *quebi*

3.2.2.1 *Quebi* examples of *shi* and *min*

3.2.2.2 The introduction of *quebi*

3.2.3 Complex characters taboored using the new method, *gaijian*

3.2.3.1 The term *gaijian*

3.2.3.2 The introduction of *gaijian*

3.2.3.3 Reconstructing the *gaijian* method

3.3 *The Messiah Sutra* and *On One God* taboored Tang Taizong’s name inconsistently

3.3.1 Non-taboo of Tang Taizong’s name

3.3.2 Taboo of Tang Taizong’s name

3.3.2.1 Die 隕 was taboored

3.3.2.2 Qi 棄 was taboored
3.4 Tang tombstones reveal that gaijian was introduced in 658 ........................................ 102
3.4.1 The survey design ........................................................................................................ 103
3.4.2 Die 諱 was not tabooed before 658 ........................................................................ 104
3.4.3 Hun 晦 was not tabooed before 658 ........................................................................ 105
3.4.4 Die 諱 was not tabooed before 658 ........................................................................ 106
3.4.5 Summary of the survey ............................................................................................... 107
3.5 Discussion and conclusion ............................................................................................. 108

Chapter 4 The Messiah Sutra and On One God cannot have been made in the 650s-790s 111
4.1 The Messiah Sutra and On One God were not made in Tang Gaozong’s reign .......... 111
  4.1.1 Zhi was not omitted .................................................................................................... 111
  4.1.2 Zhi was not replaced by other characters .................................................................... 112
  4.1.3 Zhi was not deprived of its strokes ........................................................................... 113
  4.1.4 Discussion ................................................................................................................ 115
4.2 The Messiah Sutra and On One God were not made in Empress Wu’s reign .............. 115
  4.2.1 The usage of Wu’s new forms and the dating of a source ....................................... 115
    4.2.1.1 Why were the new forms widely used? ................................................................. 116
    4.2.1.2 Empress Wu changed seventeen characters into eighteen forms ..................... 118
    4.2.1.3 Wu’s new forms were widely used before 705 ................................................... 119
    4.2.1.4 Revoking Wu’s new forms after 705 ................................................................. 121
  4.2.2 The non-use of Empress Wu’s new forms in The Messiah Sutra and On One God ... 122
    4.2.2.1 Comparing examples with Wu’s new forms ....................................................... 122
    4.2.2.2 The form  is a scribal error of  恶 ....................................................................... 124
    4.2.3 The non-taboo of Empress Wu’s name in The Messiah Sutra and On One God .... 126
    4.2.4 Discussion .............................................................................................................. 127
4.3 The Messiah Sutra and On One God were not made in Tang Xuanzong’s reign .......... 127
  4.3.1 Long and ji were not omitted .................................................................................... 127
  4.3.2 Long and ji were not replaced by other characters .................................................. 128
  4.3.3 Long and ji were not deprived of their strokes ......................................................... 129
  4.3.4 Discussion ................................................................................................................ 129
4.4 Conclusion ...................................................................................................................... 130

Chapter 5 An alternative chronology .............................................................................. 131
5.1 Relying on the Chinese passive to date sources ............................................................ 132
5.2 An overview of the passive use in The Messiah Sutra and On One God ...................... 135
  5.2.1 Occurrences of yu, wei and jian ............................................................................... 135
  5.2.2 Occurrences of bei .................................................................................................... 136
5.2.3 Two remarks about the passives in the Christian texts .................................................. 137

5.3 The dominance of bei and the date of the two Christian texts ........................................ 138
  5.3.1 The emergence of bei in the pre-Qin period ................................................................. 138
  5.3.2 The rise of bei in the Han and Six-Dynasties period .................................................... 140
  5.3.3 The dominance of bei in the Late-Tang and Five-Dynasties period ............................. 142
  5.3.4 Discussions ...................................................................................................... 144

5.4 The ‘bei + verb + jiangqu’ order and the date of the two Christian texts ......................... 146
  5.4.1 The pre-seventh-century coalescence between the ‘bei + verb’ order and jiangqu ...... 147
  5.4.2 Unclear examples in the seventh century .................................................................... 150
  5.4.3 Emergence in the eighth century ................................................................................ 151
  5.4.4 Limited use between the ninth century and the eleventh century ............................ 154
  5.4.5 Discussions ...................................................................................................... 156

5.5 Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 158

Chapter 6 A documentary history of Dunhuang Christians .............................................. 160

6.1 The presence in the eighth century .............................................................................. 161
  6.1.1 Kojima Forgeries A and B ....................................................................................... 161
    6.1.1.1 Description and the earliest publications .......................................................... 161
    6.1.1.2 Convincing arguments for forgery ...................................................................... 163
    6.1.1.3 Three more arguments in support of the forgery claim .................................... 165
  6.1.2 Two other eighth-century Christian manuscripts: The Mysterious Bliss Sutra and The Sutra of the Origins of the Daqin Jingjiao ................................................................. 167
    6.1.2.1 Description and the earliest publications .......................................................... 167
    6.1.2.2 Authenticity, authorship and chronology ............................................................. 169

6.2 Dunhuang Christians between the ninth century and 907 ......................................... 170
  6.2.1 Christian Manuscripts ............................................................................................. 171
    6.2.1.1 Two confirmed Sogdian fragments: Or.8212/86 and Or.8212/182 .................... 171
    6.2.1.2 Three possible fragments: Or.8212/89, Pelliot Chinois 2782, and Pelliot Chinois 3134 ............................................................. 172
    6.2.2 A late-ninth-century Christian painting: Ch. xlii. 001 ........................................ 174

6.3 Post-Tang Christians (before the twelfth century) ...................................................... 178
  6.3.1 Christian manuscript P.3847 ................................................................................. 179
    6.3.1.1 Description and the earliest publications .......................................................... 179
    6.3.1.2 Dating P.3847 ................................................................................................. 181
  6.3.2 A bronze cross: B105:2 ......................................................................................... 182

6.4 Christians in Chinese and Tibetan sources ................................................................ 184
  6.4.1 Five appellations relating to Christianity ................................................................. 184
    6.4.1.1 Mishihe 彌施科 ............................................................................................... 184
    6.4.1.2 Bosifo 波斯佛 and Bosi 波斯 ................................................................. 186
# Timeline of China’s dynasties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Dynasty/Region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>c. 2100-1600 BCE</td>
<td>Xia 夏</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. 1600-1050 BCE</td>
<td>Shang 商</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. 1046-256 BCE</td>
<td>Zhou 周</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Western Zhou 西周 (circa 1046-771)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eastern Zhou 东周 (circa 771-256)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spring and Autumn Period 春秋 (circa 770- circa 475)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Warring States Period 戰國 (circa 475-221)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>221-206 BCE</td>
<td>Qin 秦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>206 BCE-220 CE</td>
<td>Han 漢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Western Han 西漢 (206 BCE-9 CE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interregnum of Wang Mang 王莽 (9-25)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eastern Han 東漢 (25-22)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>220-589</td>
<td>Six Dynasties 六朝</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Three Kingdoms 三國 (220-265)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jin Dynasty 晉 (265-420)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Northern and Southern Dynasties 南北朝 (386-589)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>581-618</td>
<td>Sui 隋</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>618-907</td>
<td>Tang 唐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Empress Wu’s Zhou 武周 (690-705)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>907-960</td>
<td>Five Dynasties and Ten Kingdoms 五代十國</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>960-1279</td>
<td>Song 宋</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Northern Song 北宋 (960-1127)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Southern Song 南宋 (1127-1279)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1271-1368</td>
<td>Yuan 元</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1368-1644</td>
<td>Ming 明</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1636-1912</td>
<td>Qing 清</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Reigns of Tang emperors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emperor</th>
<th>Reigns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gaozu 高祖</td>
<td>618-626</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taizong 太宗</td>
<td>626-649</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaozong 高宗</td>
<td>649-683</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhongzong 中宗</td>
<td>683-684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ruizong 睿宗</td>
<td>684-690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empress Wu 武后</td>
<td>690-705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhongzong 中宗</td>
<td>705-710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ruizong 睿宗</td>
<td>710-712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xuanzong 玄宗</td>
<td>712-756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzong 肃宗</td>
<td>756-762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daizong 代宗</td>
<td>762-779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dezong 德宗</td>
<td>779-805</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shunzong 順宗</td>
<td>805</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xianzong 憲宗</td>
<td>805-820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muzong 穆宗</td>
<td>820-824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jingzong 敬宗</td>
<td>824-827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wenzong 文宗</td>
<td>827-840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wuzong 武宗</td>
<td>840-846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xuanzong 宣宗</td>
<td>846-859</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yizong 懿宗</td>
<td>859-873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xizong 僖宗</td>
<td>873-888</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhaozong 昭宗</td>
<td>888-904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aidi 哀帝</td>
<td>904-907</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abbreviations

b. born

d. died

r. reign
List of Maps, Figures and Tables

Maps

1. Cities along the Silk Road

Figures

1.1 The Xi’an Stele
1.2 The crest of the Xi’an Stele
1.3 The Luoyang Pillar
2.1 End part of The Messiah Sutra
2.2 The roll of On One God and the first frame
6.1 Haneda Toru’s Photo of Kojima Forgery B
6.2 P.Y. Saeki’s Photo of Kojima Forgery B
6.3 Or.8212/86: a business letter drafted by Sargi
6.4 Or.8212/182: a Christian divination text
6.5 Or.8212/89: a possible Christian letter
6.6 Pelliot Chinois 3134: a possible Christian business document
6.7 Pelliot Chinois 2782: two possible Christian lines
6.8 Ch. xlix. 001: a Christian painting
6.9 Crosses decorated with pearls found in Central Asia
6.10 Crosses decorated with pearls found in China
6.11 Verso of P.3847
6.12 Seal and colophon of P.3847
6.13 The bronze cross unearthed in Dunhuang
6.14 A Sasanian cross in Pelliot tibétain 1182
6.15 A Greek cross in Pelliot tibétain 1676
6.16 A cross in IOL Tib J 766

Tables

3.1 Replacement characters used to taboo Tang Taizong’s name, shimin
3.2 Orthodox orthographies of shi in The Messiah Sutra and On One God
3.3 Orthographies of die 確 in Tang stones (618-663)

3.4 Orthographies of hun 昏 in Tang stones (618-663)

3.5 Orthographies of die 確 in Tang stones (618-663)

4.1 Replacement characters used to taboo Tang Gaozong’s name, zhi

4.2 Comparison of orthographies in The Messiah Sutra and On One God with Wu’s new forms

4.3 Replacement characters used to taboo Tang Xuanzong’s name, longji

5.1 Occurrences of yu, jian, wei and bei in The Messiah Sutra and On One God

5.2 Pre-twelfth-century usage of passive markers, yu, jian, wei and bei
Map 1 Cities along the Silk Road (Source: Xinru Liu 2015:459, adapted)
Stylistic matters

This study employs both traditional Chinese characters and the modern Hanyu pinyin system of transcription. As Chinese tones are not indicated in this system, and the tone-free transcriptions can be mismatched with other characters, this dissertation uses Chinese characters wherever they are relevant to the argument and gives an Asian author’s full name in transcription and in the original characters. For the sake of consistency, western scholars are also mentioned by their full names. This research uses the name-date system in the footnotes and offers the full reference information in the Bibliography. In order to save space, the titles of Asian publications are not transcribed. Both footnotes and the Bibliography make a distinction between western literature and Asian publications. This research refers to Dunhuang Chinese manuscripts by their conventional catalogue numbers: S.2215 is manuscript number 2215 obtained by Aurel Stein and now held by the British Library; P.3847 is manuscript number 3847 collected by Paul Pelliot and now housed in Bibliothèque Nationale de France. Non-English quotations are all translated; the translation is followed by the original texts in brackets. All translations, punctuation, underlining, italics, column numbering and division (/), and other emphases are mine unless otherwise stated. Moreover, Chinese dates have been transferred into the Western (Gregorian) chronology via the Sino-Western Calendar Transfer Program offered by the Academia Sinica (http://sinocal.sinica.edu.tw). All internet publications were retrieved during the whole process of the research and were re-retrieved on August 17, 2017.
Acknowledgements

This study would not have been written without the support and the help of many people. Some I have probably forgotten, and I sincerely apologize to those who are not mentioned here. Some I still recall, and I would like to list them here.

My heartfelt thanks go first to Heleen Murre-van den Berg, Ab de Jong, Barend ter Haar, Liu Zhaoyong 劉兆永 and Jia Zhengchuan 賈正傳. They provided intellectual guidance for years, helping me greatly expand my horizons and accurately explore the unknown territories.

Special thanks shall also be extended to Peter de Hoog, Matthias Brand and Song Chunli 宋春利. Without their help, I may have ended up with doing other things.

This project has also benefit from many other people. They either sent me material or typed the difficult Chinese characters and Syriac words or gave advice to my Ph.D. application and research in Leiden or read some chapters — all mistakes that should remain, are mine: Chang Hsiangming 張向明, Chen Huaiyu 陳懷宇, Chen Ruixuan 陳瑞翾, Chen Zongli 陳宗利, Christien Kiewiet de Jong, Gao Ziwen 高子雯, Han Jianxia 韓建俠, Hidemi Takahashi 高橋英海, Jiang Tengfei 江騰飛, Li Xiaohu 李小虎, Liu Puning 劉璞寧, Liu Xiaojing 劉曉靜, Liu Zheng 劉鉉, Mark Dickens, Matteo Nicolini-Zani, Miao Shengfa 苗聖法, Michael Radich, Nicholas Sims-Williams, Ren Baoyan 任寶彥, Rint Sybesma, Samuel N.C. Lieu, Song Changchun 宋春春, Sun Jianchun 孫建春, Tijmen Baarda, The East Asian Library and The Lipsius reception of Leiden University, Wu Yue 吳越, Xiu Xudong 修旭東, and Zhong Lei 鍾雷.