

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/56024> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Chen, D.

Title: Intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English: an exploration in China and the Netherlands

Issue Date: 2017-12-06

Chapter 2

A review study into intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English ¹

¹ Manuscript published in revised form as: Chen, D., Tigelaar, D. E. H., & Verloop, N. (2016). The intercultural identities of non-native English teachers: An overview of research worldwide. *Asian Education Studies*, 1(2), 9. doi:10.20849/aes.v1i2.48

Abstract

Non-native EFL teachers who teach English as a second or foreign language can play an important role in the promotion of intercultural competence and often have an advantage over native English-speaking teachers because they once were language learners of the same foreign language and are more aware than the latter of the particular difficulties that students can encounter. Because of this, a better understanding is needed of non-native teachers of English in language-and-culture teaching. Research on how these teachers perceive themselves in relation to two or more cultural groups (i.e., teachers' intercultural identities) would be useful in this respect, but little such research has been conducted to date. In the present study, we systematically reviewed 21 studies on the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English. Our study provides insight into key characteristics of these teachers' intercultural identities, factors in the formation of these identities, inconsistencies in studies to date, and directions for further research.

2.1 Introduction

Teachers who teach English as a second or foreign language play an important role in not only helping learners learn the language but also preparing learners for future intercultural communication (Council of Europe, 2001). Such teachers must, for example, teach their students about ES cultures (Cortazzi & Jin, 1999) and unavoidably compare ES cultures with their own cultures. However, teachers are not merely ‘technicians’ who simply adopt right methods to reach the teaching target (Varghese et al., 2005). Considering the sociocultural background of teachers, for example, it is difficult for them to be absolutely impartial when thinking about different cultures (Byram et al., 2002). Starting from the observation that most teachers of English worldwide are *non-native* teachers who do not have English as their first language and are not teaching in English-speaking countries (Braine, 2010), their understanding of ES cultures can be expected to vary widely along with their positions and roles of teaching about ES cultures. The weight that teachers of English give to intercultural knowledge, skills, and attitudes of students — often referred to as their ‘intercultural communicative competence’ (or just ‘intercultural competence’, cf. Byram, 1997) — will also vary accordingly (Sercu et al., 2005).

Earlier studies have shown that non-native teachers of English in different countries have different notions of themselves when it comes to teaching ES cultures (Menard-Warwick, 2008; Weisman, 2001; Wette & Barkhuizen, 2009). The teachers also have different ideas about why the relevant methods and contents are used in teaching about these cultures (Moran, 2001; Sercu et al., 2005). To better understand just how they teach cultures in different countries, how they see their roles in teaching about cultures, and how English teaching worldwide helps cultivate intercultural competence, we must gain insight into how teachers of English regard themselves within the language-and-culture teaching context. This means that we need a better understanding of how teachers of English view themselves in relation to the cultures they teach about. As Varghese et al. (2005) commented on language teacher identity in general:

...in order to understand language teaching and learning we need to understand teachers; and in order to understand teachers, we need to have a clearer sense of who they are: the professional, cultural, political, and individual identities which they claim or which are assigned to them (Varghese et al., 2005, p. 22).

In the literature the concept of teachers' identities, i.e., their perception of themselves as teachers, has been used to help us understand this issue, and when referring to teachers of English in teaching language with an intercultural dimension, the concept of teachers' *intercultural identities*, i.e., teachers' perceptions of themselves in relation to two or more cultural groups, has often been used (Alptekin & Alptekin, 1984; Y. Gao, 1999; Menard-Warwick, 2008).

Since the beginning of the 1990s, increasing numbers of studies have been conducted into the self-perceptions of non-native English-speaking teachers of English (shortened in the following to 'non-native teachers of English'). The scope of the studies has expanded from a native/non-native English-speaker comparison to observation of professional behaviour across different sociocultural contexts (Braine, 2005, 2006, 2010; Moussu & Llorca, 2008; Samimy & Kurihara, 2006). The available research has shown that non-native teachers of English, in particular, face the challenge of not only helping students solve problems stemming from conflicts between cultures but also develop their own intercultural identities while doing this (Moran, 2001). Non-native teachers of English can play a particularly important role in the promotion of intercultural competence and often have an advantage over native English-speaking teachers because they once were language learners and are more aware of the typical pitfalls and difficulties that students of the same languages and cultures as theirs can encounter. They may share their experience of culture shock with their students as they might have experienced it themselves once, and they can help their students to prepare for it (Moussu & Llorca, 2008). However, because of the limited amount of relevant research, no clear picture has emerged of the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English.

The aim of the present study is to provide an overview of the recent research on the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English and to come up with directions for further research. For this purpose, we conducted a review study. Before presenting our review of studies, however, we must first clarify a few additional concepts, highlight what is known about the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English, and pinpoint what is lacking in the existing literature. For the sake of clarity, it should be noted that we will use 'identity' and 'intercultural identity' to refer to the identity or self of the teacher within a language-and-culture teaching context in the remainder of this chapter and we offer a more detailed definition of such identity below.

2.2 Conceptualizing intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English

Identity can be defined as the individual's sense of who he or she is during his/her ongoing interaction with the world (Erikson, 1963). The concepts of *identity* and *self* are often blurred (White & Ding, 2009, p. 336). According to Beijaard et al. (2004), a teacher's identity is constantly developing and involves two strongly interwoven sides: the teacher's own ideas accumulated on the basis of personal experience and the ideas or expectations imposed upon the teacher by the social context. In other words, both person and context are implied in this conceptualization of 'teacher identity.' In addition, the notion of teacher identity may involve different sub-identities depending on the context (Beijaard et al., 2004). More integrated, dynamic conceptualizations of language teachers' identity suggest that it clearly depends on the social, cultural, and political context and develops via language and discourse (Faez, 2011; Gee, 2001; Rivers & Ross, 2013; Varghese et al., 2005).

Many studies about language teaching and learning use identity theories as a new perspective through which to view teaching in relation to classroom practice (Gee, 2001; Norton, 2006). This means that the identity of a language teacher is seen as a crucial component not only in 'determining how language teaching is played out' within the classroom, but also in understanding the 'sociocultural and sociopolitical landscape of the language classroom' (Varghese et al., 2005, p. 22). Previous studies into intercultural identity have often focused on immigrants (including short-stay teachers or students) or cultural groups and their developing views of themselves in relation to more than one culture (e.g., Flunger & Ziebertz, 2010; Kim, 1994; Menard-Warwick, 2008; Ortaçtepe, 2015). Alptekin and Alptekin (1984) used the term 'intercultural identity' primarily when describing the target of EFL teaching. Recent studies of non-native teachers of English have used the concept of teachers' intercultural identity, investigating how these teachers viewed themselves from a sociocultural and pedagogical perspective (e.g., Duff & Uchida, 1997; Ilieva, 2010; J. Liu, 1999; Nugroho Widiyanto, 2005). The studies just mentioned present very different pictures and expectations of non-native teachers, and a clearer view is needed on what characterizes the intercultural identities of teachers, and how these identities are formed in language-and-culture teaching contexts. In particular, we felt that it was necessary to conduct a review of the available studies into in-service teachers, because their experiences of teaching and intercultural communication could

be expected to shed light on the formation of teachers' intercultural identities.

In the present review, we examined recent studies of the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English across different countries. All of the studies were published in peer-reviewed journals with a worldwide circulation. And on the basis of this literature, we hoped to be able to increase our understanding of the characteristics and formation of the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English in particular and thus pave the way for future studies of their unique position and roles for the teaching of English and intercultural competence. The following two research questions were addressed in our review.

1. How are the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English characterized and defined in recent studies?
2. What do these studies report about the formation of these intercultural identities?

2.3 Method

2.3.1 Data collection

We searched the following international databases for articles on the identities of non-native teachers of English: ISI (including JSTOR), ERIC, PsycINFO, and Springerlink. In addition, we searched Google Scholar and the references of the selected articles. We limited our search to peer-reviewed articles based on empirical studies published between 1997 and 2015 so as to obtain an overview of acknowledged state-of-the-art achievements in the field and avoid the dangerous 'inflationist repetition of the same ideas in different words' found in the many non-empirical articles that have been written on this topic (Moussu & Llurda, 2008).

Considering various alternative labels that might be used for 'non-native English-speaking teachers,' 'English as a second or foreign language (ESL/EFL),' 'intercultural', and 'identity,' we initially ran a preliminary search in title, keywords, and abstracts of articles by using various combinations of keywords. The combinations included (a) 'non-native teacher' and 'ESL/EFL' and 'intercultural/cross-cultural/cultural' and 'identity/self,' (b) 'non-native teacher' and 'English/TESOL' and 'intercultural/cross-cultural/cultural' and 'identity/self,' and (c) 'non-native teacher' and 'English/TESOL'

and ‘identity/self’ and ‘culture.’ The search with the combinations yielded no hits. We tried to enlarge the scope of search by replacing ‘non-native teacher’ by ‘teacher’ in each of the combinations, or searched in the full text of articles with these combinations.

In the end, we identified 59 articles and then narrowed this down to 21 articles meeting the following inclusion criteria:

- Focus on only in-service non-native teachers of English (43 articles met this criterion; 10 articles were excluded because both non-native English-speaking and native English-speaking teachers of English were included (but not distinguished) or teachers of other subjects were included (but not distinguished); 6 articles were excluded because they studied pre-service teachers).
- Keywords in the title or the article such as *cultural*, or *intercultural identity/awareness/self* or *identity in intercultural/cross-cultural context* (21 articles met this criterion; 22 papers were excluded because the use of the words in the enlarged search led to topics of little or no relevance to the present study (e.g., *transnationalism*, *cultural capital*, *identity status*) or consideration of only the linguistic or pedagogical qualities of non-native teachers of English without attention to cultural issues).

2.3.2 Data analysis

In order to answer our research questions, we categorized the 21 selected articles into two groups: (a) those concerned with the characteristics of teacher identities; and (b) those concerned with dynamic processes shaping these teacher identities.

For each article, we gave an overview of the characteristics of the study (see Tables 2.1 and 2.2 for more information). We labelled the studies with the previous (if the teachers were trainees at the time of studies) or present types of teachers of English participating in the studies, i.e., ESL or English as a second language (in English-speaking regions or countries, e.g., the United States, Australia, Hong Kong) and EFL or English as a foreign language (in non-English-speaking countries, e.g., Belgium, Chile, China, Vietnam).

2.4 Characteristics of the identities of non-native teachers of English

The identities of non-native teachers of English have only recently been studied (Braine, 2010). The 21 articles published between 1997 and 2015 and thus qualifying for our review were selected from only 59 articles published in peer-reviewed journals. Fourteen of the studies were about non-native EFL teachers from Belgium, Brazil, Bulgaria, Chile, China (mainland), Colombia, Greece, Indonesia, Japan, Korea, Mexico, Poland, Spain, Sweden, and Vietnam, and seven studies about non-native ESL teachers in Australia, Canada, Hong Kong, and the United States (see methodology in Tables 2.1 and 2.2).

The first category of studies provides insight into the characteristics of the identities of non-native teachers of English in language-and-culture teaching contexts where they have to deal with differing cultures, values, and norms (see Table 2.1 for an overview).

Table 2.1

Overview of studies included in the review on characteristics of intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English

Author, year / type of teachers	Aim of study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
J. Liu (1999) / ESL	To explore the complexities of the labels native/non-native English-speaker and relevant consequences in teaching	<i>Non-native English-speaking TESOL professional or dual identities</i> ; no explicit definition	Native /non-native English-speaker dichotomy; cultural affiliation	Data gathered from e-mail and interviews with 7 non-native English-speaking TESOL professionals in the United States	The participants interpreted the term 'non-native English-speaking professional in TESOL' in various ways. Their diverse backgrounds and experiences revealed complex dimensions of the label, involving the sequence in which the languages were learned, competence in English, cultural affiliation, self-identification, social environment, and political labelling.
Weisman (2001) / ESL	To examine bicultural identities of bilingual teachers and their attitudes	<i>Bicultural identity</i> described in terms of the individual's identification with cultural	Biculturalism	Interviews with 4 Latino teachers in the United States; data examined for expressed attitudes,	Differences between teachers' bicultural identities appear in their ways of coping with pressures in a society that encourages conformity to the dominant culture; there are connections

Author, year / type of teachers	Aim of study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
	towards English and Spanish as well as the relationship between the two languages	groups; no explicit definition		contradictions, and conceptualizations concerning key issues related to language and culture	between: bicultural identity and political consciousness; teachers' bicultural identities and language attitudes; and identification with Latino culture, political consciousness, and recognition of the value of the Spanish language as a means to affirm the cultural identities of Latino students.
Sercu (2002) / EFL	To inquire into how foreign language teachers' current professional self-concepts and teaching practices relate to the envisaged profile of the intercultural foreign language teacher	<i>Teachers' professional self-concept</i> operationalized in terms of knowledge, attitudes, skills needed to develop learners' intercultural competence; no explicit definition	Intercultural communicative competence	Questionnaire survey in Belgium among 78 teachers of English, 45 teachers of French, and 27 teachers of German	Participating teachers were willing to support intercultural objectives. Their teaching practices, however, could not be characterized as directed towards the full attainment of intercultural communicative competence.
Llurda and Huguet (2003) / EFL	To uncover the self-perception of non-native English-speaking EFL teachers	<i>Self-awareness</i> or self-perception as non-native English-speaking teachers with particular attention to language proficiency, teaching views, and the native/non-native English-speaker debate; no explicit definition	Native /non-native English-speaker dichotomy	Questionnaire survey of 101 non-native English-speaking primary and secondary school English language teachers in the city of Lleida, Spain	Compared to primary school teachers, secondary school teachers showed (a) a higher regard for their own language skills, (b) a higher preference for a communicative orientation in teaching, and (c) stronger critical awareness of their situation as non-native English-speaking teachers in teaching English as an international language.
Sercu (2006) /	To investigate whether or	<i>Foreign language and</i>	Professional self-concept;	Teachers' beliefs profiled over 7	Teachers' profiles do not yet meet those of the envisaged 'foreign language and

Author, year / type of teachers	Aim of study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
EFL	not teachers' profiles meet the specifications put forth for a teacher of 'foreign language and intercultural competence'	<i>intercultural competence teachers</i> , referring seemingly to teachers who possess the knowledge, skills, and attitudes to teach intercultural competence; no explicit definition	intercultural communicative competence	countries (Belgium, Bulgaria, Greece, Mexico, Poland, Spain, Sweden) by means of a web-based questionnaire	intercultural competence teacher'; different patterns in teacher thinking and teaching practice found.
Diniz de Figueiredo (2011)/ ESL	To investigate how non-native English-speaking teachers in American K-12 schools perceive their identities in various relationships	<i>Teachers' identities</i> defined as both self-perception and image as observed by others	Native /non-native English speaker dichotomy	Survey with 19 open questions of 15 Brazilian ESL teachers working in elementary and middle schools in the United States	The teachers' language skills were crucial in defining their identities as non-native English-speaking teachers. Native/non-native English speaker dichotomy still affects the ways in which the teachers are perceived.
Guerrero Nieto and Meadows (2015) /EFL	To investigate how dialogues between expert and novice teachers provide them with spaces to activate critical awareness of their global professional identity.	<i>Global professional identity</i> , meaning a globally-minded professional identity, aware that 'any teaching context is situated at both global and local scales simultaneously'	None	Case study based on the thematic analysis of (a) the online dialogue between 14 expert non-native English-speaking English language teachers in Colombia and 12 novice non-native English-speaking teachers in the United States who attended graduate programmes in teacher	(a) Teachers considered different contextual factors, e.g., teaching experience, coursework, in the online dialogue. (b) Expert and novice teachers differed in considering the role of English language teaching (ELT), institutional constraints, whose culture to teach, and linguistic diversity in language teaching. E.g., the expert teachers were sensitive to the dangers of colonialism and they supported a critical perspective between ES cultures and their own. The novice teachers considered American culture as the focus of instruction and their future selves as representatives of American

Author, year / type of teachers	Aim of study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
				education at the same time; and (b) the interviews with those 12 teachers in the United States about the dialogue	culture.

Note. * The terms in *italics* are those concepts used in the studies. ESL = English as a second language; EFL = English as a foreign language; TESOL = Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages.

2.4.1 Aims of the studies

The studies in this group were designed to explore the identities of non-native teachers of English in various pedagogical, institutional, and sociocultural relationships either inside or outside the classroom setting. The aims of the studies varied as the contexts of the teachers were different. The aims of the studies with teachers working, living, or studying in a ES country addressed the identities of the teachers within various *sociocultural* and *institutional* relationships (J. Liu, 1999; Weisman, 2001); they also explored the connections between the identities of the teachers, their attitudes towards sociocultural relationships, languages and cultures, and their teaching expertise (Diniz de Figueiredo, 2011; Weisman, 2001).

The aims of the studies of non-native teachers of English in their home countries were mainly to define and describe their identities within *institutional* relationships, and thus in relation to native English-speaking colleagues (Llurda & Huguet, 2003), or specifically from the perspective of the need to promote intercultural competence among students (Sercu, 2002, 2006). Guerrero Nieto and Meadows (2015) brought expert and novice non-native EFL teachers together in dialogue with a view to exploring the teachers' critical awareness of professional identity as situated in a teaching context with both global and local scales.

2.4.2 Definitions

As shown in Table 2.1, various terms were used to describe the intercultural identities of the non-native teachers of English: cultural affiliation, dual identity (J. Liu, 1999), bicultural identity (Weisman, 2001), or global professional identity (Guerrero Nieto &

Meadows, 2015). Most of the terms were not explicitly defined and could only be interpreted according to their context of use.

The identity concepts varied depending on the focus and perspective of research: identity as a sense of belonging to a certain culture (J. Liu, 1999); identification with a cultural group within society (Weisman, 2001); professional qualification (e.g., language skills, teaching views) within the teaching context (Diniz de Figueiredo, 2011; Llurda & Huguet, 2003); awareness of professional identity in both global and local teaching context (Guerrero Nieto & Meadows, 2015); or ability to teach intercultural competence (Sercu, 2002, 2006). In some of the studies, a native/non-native English-speaking dichotomy was quoted as this was presumably an important aspect of the identities of non-native teachers of English in these contexts (Diniz de Figueiredo, 2011; J. Liu, 1999; Llurda & Huguet, 2003).

2.4.3 Related concepts

Related concepts in these articles included the native/non-native English speaker dichotomy and intercultural competence. The attitudes and positions of non-native teachers of English with respect to the native/non-native English speaker debate were considered important for their self-perceptions (Diniz de Figueiredo, 2011; J. Liu, 1999; Llurda & Huguet, 2003). Intercultural communicative competence, consisting of the intercultural knowledge, skills, and attitudes relating to both the teacher's native culture and the foreign culture which the teachers is teaching, also helped to define a competent foreign language teacher (Sercu, 2002, 2006).

2.4.4 Methods

Four out of the 7 empirical studies were conducted as small-scale interviews, classroom observations, or questionnaires with open questions; the other 3 were large-scale surveys. Teachers' knowledge, attitudes, and judgments with respect to their identities, language teaching, and student responses were given much more weight in the studies than their teaching behaviour. Both qualitative and quantitative approaches were adopted. Qualitative approaches allowed the researchers to examine teacher identity in depth in a specific context and not to make generalizations beyond the immediate setting (Guerrero Nieto & Meadows, 2015). Quantitative approaches, however, enabled the researchers to draw individual results together and consider them as a totality to

show trends and divergence among different countries or groups (Sercu et al., 2005).

2.4.5 Main findings

With regard to the characteristics of the identities of the non-native teachers of English, the teachers often perceived and evaluated themselves in terms of: their language proficiency and ability to teach, their relationships with various parties in the school and society, conflicts they have encountered, and their sociocultural experiences (see the last column of Table 2.1). The specific *pedagogical settings* and *sociocultural backgrounds* of the teachers also appeared to be of major importance for their intercultural identities.

The way in which the teachers label their identities was closely connected to their sociocultural backgrounds and experiences, and they appeared to be aware of the interactions between this labelling and their professional functioning. J. Liu (1999), for example, reports that the environment in which people are exposed to languages plays a crucial role in their definition of the ‘non/native English-speaking TESOL professional’ and their ‘(perceived) competence in English, cultural affiliations, self-identification, social environment, and political labelling’. Guerrero Nieto and Meadows (2015) found in their study that expert teachers recalled their working experience and teaching context when reflecting on their identities, while novice teachers resorted to their learning experience to imagine their future identities.

The self-perceptions of linguistic proficiency and awareness of the pedagogical advantages of being a non-native teacher of English as opposed to a native English-speaking teacher of English proved important for the identities of the non-native teacher. This is illustrated by the findings of both Llorca and Huguet (2003) and Diniz de Figueiredo (2011). Not only the English-language competence of non-native teachers of English contributed to how they identified themselves in the workplace but also their bilingual or multilingual skills and ability to relate to the cultures of their students and their students’ parents (Diniz de Figueiredo, 2011). In addition, the self-concepts of the teachers can develop as they narrow the gap between their actual teaching profiles and their ideal profiles of foreign language teachers who are willing and competent to teach intercultural competence (Sercu, 2002, 2006), or as novice teachers communicate with expert teachers in dialogue (Guerrero Nieto & Meadows, 2015).

Further variation in the intercultural identities of the non-native teachers of English

was found to depend on their *self-narratives* and thus relate to their political, linguistic and cultural attitudes. Weisman (2001), for example, found teachers to vary between having only a vague sense of belonging to a certain culture versus a strong sense of belonging. They showed very different cultural orientations that could range from complying with the expectations of the mainstream culture in the ES country (i.e., the United States) to retaining their native cultural identity. A strong connection was also detected by Weisman between the identities of the teachers and their awareness of the status of language and culture within society, on the one hand, and their attitudes towards their mother tongue and the English language, on the other hand. Teachers may consider their roles differently in relation to the cultures they teach. Guerrero Nieto and Meadows (2015, p. 22) found expert teachers supported critical views of the home and target cultures in class, while novice teachers considered that they would ‘represent for their students authentic American English and culture’.

2.5 Formation of the identities of non-native teachers of English

The second category of studies explored the formation of the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English. The factors influencing the formation of teachers’ identities were associated with the teachers’ sociocultural — including intercultural — experiences. These factors were described as constantly developing in conjunction with changing contextual elements that include the family, classroom, school, and society. Most of the factors affecting the teachers’ ongoing identity formation appeared to arise from matters like the discrepancy between language in teaching in the home country and language in use in the ES country (Ortaçtepe, 2015), the teachers problems of socialization in the ES country (Fotovatian, 2010), or a conflict or collision of values from different cultures (Nugroho Widiyanto, 2005) (see Table 2.2).

Table 2.2

Overview of studies included in the review on formation of intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English

Author and year / type of teachers	Aim of the study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
Duff and Uchida (1997) / EFL	To explore teachers' roles and identities as instructors and purveyors of (American) English language and cultures in Japan	<i>Sociocultural identity</i> (sometimes interchanged with <i>cultural identity</i>), seemingly referring to how the teachers perceive their role in this sociocultural context; no explicit definition	Professional, social, political, and cultural identities	4 EFL teachers and their classes in Japan as the subject of an ethnographic case study plus data collected via questionnaires, weekly retrospective journal entries, audio/videotaped classroom observations, field notes, interviews, review of instructional materials, and the research journal of teachers	The teachers' perceptions of their sociocultural identities were found to be formed and constantly developed on the basis of their personal histories, past educational, professional, and (cross-) cultural experiences. Language teachers socialise students in new cultural practices. Teachers are involved in cultural transmission.
Nugroho Widiyanto (2005) / ESL	To discuss a range of social and cultural influences on his emerging identity as a teacher of English	<i>Identity</i> , always connected to race, religion, and social status in reflection; no explicit definition	None	Self-study of an Indonesian teacher of English via autobiography and critical reflection	He discusses in a self-reflective manner the types of discourses at work to construct his identity in a range of different settings.

Author and year / type of teachers	Aim of the study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
Phan and Phan (2006) /EFL	To analyse the nature of Vietnamese teacher identity construct-ions and the relations between the personal, the professional, and morality of teachers	<i>Identity</i> as ‘being’ and ‘becoming’ (stability within changes); identity as national /cultural entity and sense of belonging	(National) morality	Individual/group interviews and guided reflective writing with 7 Vietnamese teachers of English in Australian TESOL programmes	Despite being teachers of English, teachers’ morality-related identities remained persistent. They negotiated their identities alongside morality and moral values in their cultural and professional practices. They presented a strong sense of self as a teacher in relation to morality and being a cultural model of the moral guide role.
Phan (2007) / EFL	To examine the identity formation of the teachers, with regard to their negotiations of their seemingly conflicting roles and selves	<i>National /cultural identity</i> , noted as constructed, multiple, and dynamic with a sense of belonging in relation to mobility and the construction of national identity; no explicit definition	None	Case study of 7 Vietnamese teachers of English (six females and one male) studying TESOL at different Australian universities; data collected through individual in-depth interviews, focus group interviews, and guided reflective writing	The results show that a strong sense of a Vietnamese national/cultural identity is consistently constructed and confirmed by the teachers, despite their global mobility.
Tsui (2007) / EFL	To understand the processes of identity formation, the interplay between	<i>Identity</i> seems to refer to teachers’ professional identity; no explicit	None	A Chinese teacher’s reflections collected over 6 months; data analysed by	The process of self-identification interacts with the participation in negotiating meanings. The interplay of identification and the

Author and year / type of teachers	Aim of the study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
	processes and identities as teachers position themselves	definition		sorting and interpretation based on Wenger's framework (1998)	negotiability of meanings could generate identity conflicts.
Menard-Warwick (2008) / ESL	To explore the connections between the development of teachers' intercultural competence and their transnational life experiences; how they define their own (inter)cultural identities; and how they approach cultural issues with their students	<i>Intercultural identity</i> as 'a negotiated investment in seeing the world through multiple cultural lenses' (p.622)	Culture, identity, inter-culturality, teacher identities	Two teachers (one Brazilian, one Chilean), who both emigrated to the United States; classes audiotaped with ethnographic field notes; pre-observational and follow-up interviews	The two female teachers developed their bicultural identity through their past experiences in two cultures. They were observed to differ somewhat in their approaches to the teaching of cultural issues.
S. Yang and Bautista (2008) / EFL	To investigate how a Korean teacher of English (re)shaped her teacher self through reflective and interrelated negotiations with herself and others	<i>Identity and teacher self</i> , connected to a necessary 'self' confrontation in varying forms in and outside the classroom; no explicit definition	None	A Korean English teacher enrolled as a participant, who narrated ideas about her Korean English teacher identity in a letter	Korean teachers of English struggle to establish their own identity against the background of continuous compliance with values, standards, and norms for individual, school, and society; this struggle can result in positive transformations.

Author and year / type of teachers	Aim of the study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
Fotovatian (2010) / EFL	To describe non-native English-speaking EFL teachers' struggle to construct a social and professional identity	<i>Social and professional identity</i> (social identity referring seemingly to a sense of belonging to a community, and professional identity related to native-like proficiency and competence as a teacher of English); no explicit definition	Intercultural interaction strategies	Interview with 2 Iranian teachers of English in an Australian university; audio-recording of team conversation and the participants' electronic journals	Teachers value social interactions as the major channel for integration and networking; Their isolation resulted from cultural gaps, difficulty in engagement in local discourses, asymmetrical power relationship and legitimacy.
Ilieva (2010) / EFL	To explore and analyse non-native EFL teachers' negotiations of TESOL programme discourses in the process of developing identities	<i>Teaching /professional identities</i> ; understood as critically related to social, cultural, and political contexts, constructed and negotiated through language and discourse; multiple, shifting, and	None	The Bakhtinian analysis of portfolios from 20 Chinese teachers of English in a Canadian TESOL programme	Despite being teachers of English, their morality-related identities persisted. The process of identity formation consolidates their understanding of identity as dynamic and a sense of belonging.

Author and year / type of teachers	Aim of the study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
		in conflict; no explicit definition			
Menard-Warwick (2011) / EFL	To explore teachers' perspectives on their own bilingual identity development through their appropriation of English language popular culture across five decades	<i>Teacher (bilingual) identity</i> considered to be pedagogical, context-dependent, and constructed through the appropriation of voices from cultures	None.	Interview with 18 Chilean teachers of English at a Chilean University	There are connections between popular culture and bilingual development. Teachers had multiple identities. One identity they all brought to their pedagogy was that of active second language user and discerning popular cultural consumer.
Reis (2011) / ESL	To explore the processes through which non-native ESL teachers can achieve a sense of professional identity legitimacy 'by being empowered to recognize, acknowledge, and contest ideological discourses that position them as second-rate professionals' (p. 141)	<i>Professional /teacher identity/self</i> , used interchangeably with reference to the understanding of oneself in relation to sociocultural context, social relationships, and activity in the world	None	A dialogic journal, videotaped classroom observations, audio-taped interviews, teaching philosophy statements, student surveys about a Chinese teacher of a graduate-level English writing course in the United States	The participant went from being a 'blind believer' in the native-speaker myth to challenging it; worked to empower his own students as expert speakers and users of the language. His beliefs and attitudes toward the native speaker myth remained ambivalent and contradictory.

Author and year / type of teachers	Aim of the study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
Wu and Wurenbilige (2012) / EFL	To investigate the identity of a (Chinese) Mongolian teacher of English at university, her own perceived identity, and factors influencing identity formation in sociocultural contexts	<i>Teacher identity</i> , referring to the knowledge of ‘who I am’ and ‘what kind of person I am’; dynamic; developing over lifetime; reinterpreted and reshaped while interacting with social and cultural community	None	Interview of a (Chinese) Mongolian trilingual teacher of English in a Chinese university	The teacher’s identity is complex: a (Chinese) Mongolian person, a Chinese speaker, and a university teacher of English. Her identity formation was influenced by many factors such as her living environment, family background, and employment context with learning experiences playing a very crucial role.
Trent (2012) / ESL	To explore how the experiences of teaching a language and its sociocultural aspects shape the professional identities of a beginning English language teacher in Hong Kong.	<i>Teacher identity</i> as ‘our understanding of who we are and who we think other people are’ (Danielewicz, cited in Trent, 2012)	None	Three-rounds of interviews with 8 non-native ESL teachers of English in Hong Kong (with results of 2 rounds reported in article)	The participants’ engagement in the practices and activities of teaching, their relations with colleagues, and their positioning within different discourses of teaching and learning by their schools as well as by the wider educational environment shaped their decisions about whether to continue to pursue a teaching career.
Ortaçtepe (2015) / EFL	To explore how 2 EFL teachers’ language socialization	<i>Teachers of intercultural competence</i> seems to refer to ‘language	Intercultural communicative competence; language	Interviews with 2 experienced Turkish EFL teachers coming to the United	The language socialization of the 2 teachers in the United States led to personal transformations in their

Author and year / type of teachers	Aim of the study	Concept and definition adopted*	Related concepts	Methodology	Main findings
	in the United States enable them to (re)construct their identities as teachers of intercultural competence.	teachers who teach the target language with its cultural dimension' (p. 96)	socialization	States for graduate study; the 3-phase interviews comprised the participants' past, present, and future over 9 months	identity as teachers of intercultural competence. And such identity also enabled them to reflect on their current and future language and culture teaching practice. Teacher identities are dynamic, situated, multiple, and even sometimes blurred.

Note. *The terms in *italics* are the concepts used in the studies. ESL = English as a second language; EFL = English as a foreign language; TESOL = Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages.

2.5.1 Aims of the studies

Many of the studies of identity formation focused on how identities were formed and negotiated as part of transnational life (Menard-Warwick, 2008; Nugroho Widiyanto, 2005), either by discourses with regard to TESOL training or PhD programmes in ES countries (Fotovatian, 2010; Ilieva, 2010; Ortaçtepe, 2015; Phan, 2007), or by teaching experiences in teachers' home countries (Tsui, 2007; Wu & Wurenbilige, 2012; S. Yang & Bautista, 2008).

In other studies on the formation of identities of non-native teachers of English, the stated purpose often included both the observation of identity formation in order to understand it and the search for related factors, including the cultural content of the ESL curricula (Duff & Uchida, 1997), educational morality (Phan & Phan, 2006), popular English-language culture (Menard-Warwick, 2011), and other teaching factors (Trent, 2012) (see the second column of Table 2.2).

2.5.2 Definitions

The terms used in the studies of identity formation pointed, implicitly or explicitly, to sociocultural and institutional background as the context for identity formation. Either the sociocultural and institutional contexts (Duff & Uchida, 1997; Menard-Warwick, 2011; Nugroho Widiyanto, 2005; Phan, 2007; Phan & Phan, 2006) or the professionalism of the teachers (Fotovatian, 2010; Ilieva, 2010; Ortaçtepe, 2015; Reis,

2011; Trent, 2012; Tsui, 2007; Wu & Wurenbilige, 2012; S. Yang & Bautista, 2008) were emphasised in the definitions of identities.

Menard-Warwick (2008) was the only author to adopt the term ‘intercultural identity,’ which was then defined in relation to the perspectives teachers formed on the basis of their transnational experiences and ‘negotiated investment in seeing the world through multiple cultural lenses’ (p.622). In the remaining studies, the term ‘identity’ was used more in the sense of teacher/professional identity within a specific intercultural context, such as teaching of English language and culture or studying, working or living in ES cultures.

The identities of the non-native teachers of English were also typically characterized as multidimensional in the definitions (Duff & Uchida, 1997), involving a sense of belonging (e.g., on the basis of race, nation, religion, social status) (Nugroho Widiyanto, 2005), or in terms of the different roles required in the classroom and beyond (Ortaçtepe, 2015; S. Yang & Bautista, 2008). Ortaçtepe (2015), for example, found that the socialization of two Turkish teachers in the United States involved three identities, i.e., an experienced EFL teacher, an L2 user, and a burgeoning scholar, which were often blurred. Several of the definitions included a dynamic element such as ‘being and becoming’ (Phan & Phan, 2006), language socialization (Ortaçtepe, 2015), interacting with mobility (Ilieva, 2010; Phan, 2007), or interacting with the social and cultural community over a lifetime (Nugroho Widiyanto, 2005; Wu & Wurenbilige, 2012).

In some of the studies, identity formation is defined as a reaction to the conflict between the ideas, values, and norms of different cultures (Phan, 2007) or a reaction to gaps between past and present selves, current self-perceptions, or existing social norms (S. Yang & Bautista, 2008). Such conflict is seen to result in stress, confusion, or dilemma in the formation of a teacher’s identity in a multi-cultural context (Nugroho Widiyanto, 2005).

2.5.3 Related concepts

References to such concepts as professional, political, or cultural identities (Duff & Uchida, 1997; Menard-Warwick, 2008) reveal the focus of the relevant studies. The concepts of culture, identity, and interculturality, in particular, appear to provide the

basis for a definition of intercultural identity (Menard-Warwick, 2008).

Other researchers describe the interactions between some related factors and the formation of identity. Phan and Phan (2006) discuss the role of *ideology* in teachers' development of their identities when part of the teachers' identities remained stable because their morality remained unchanged despite their transnational experience, while Fotovatian (2010) examined the *intercultural interaction strategies* of teachers in the formation of their identities in social integration and professional recognition. Ortaçtepe (2015) explored how language teachers negotiated their identities as teachers of *intercultural competence* in the language socialization process in the United States. She considers that language teaching needs a cultural dimension, and the development of teachers' identities of intercultural competence requires a socialization process.

2.5.4 Methods

The research on identity formation was conducted in small-scale or individual case studies involving interviews, journals, portfolios, and observations. These qualitative methods helped teachers to reflect upon their identities and transform implicit ideas into well-constructed stories with sometimes considerable depth.

2.5.5 Main findings

The findings presented in the last column of Table 2.2 can all be summarized as pointing to some common features of the identity formation of non-native teachers of English.

Teachers developed and negotiated their identities through — often conflicting — interactions or discourses in various sociocultural and institutional contexts, which may include family, local community, religion, classroom, school, and (TESOL) training or postgraduate programs.

Various factors in the interaction between teachers and contexts influenced the formation of their identities: their cross-cultural experiences, prior learning or training experiences, relationships with students and colleagues, job demands, and extent of or need for cultural assimilation or socialization.

Various aspects of the identities of non-native teachers of English and their attitudes influenced each other in the development of their identities within an

intercultural context, making ‘intercultural’ crucial for understanding their identity formation. On the one hand, teachers’ social, cultural, linguistic, ethnic, political, and professional identities often merged when responding in a particular context. On the other hand, their attitudes towards language, culture, their profession, and power relationships in society can be influenced by their identity development within an intercultural context.

Even within the same sociocultural context, the identities of non-native teachers of English can develop differently and thus vary (Duff & Uchida, 1997; Ilieva, 2010; Menard-Warwick, 2008; Ortaçtepe, 2015). In the study by Menard-Warwick (2008), for example, both participants had worked as ESL teachers in the United States for some years and defined themselves as bicultural, but their approaches to teaching cultural issues were different. Their different teaching approaches were connected to their intercultural experiences and institutional contexts. One teacher lived with family members of a different cultural background and she taught immigrants by frequently comparing her students’ cultures with the local culture. The other teacher was impressed by the social changes in her home country and often discussed changes brought about by globalization with her students. In this study, Menard-Warwick highlighted the value of the pedagogical resources that the teachers brought into their language-and-culture teaching.

2.6 Conclusion and Discussion

The studies reviewed here provide insights into how the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English manifest themselves. We found three groups of interrelated factors that shape the intercultural identities of the teachers: (a) factors related to traits such as personality characteristics; actual and perceived linguistic, intercultural, and teaching competence; ideas about language and culture; and own experiences with language learning; (b) factors related to the teaching context, including relationships with colleagues; relationships with non-native English-speaking students and their parents; and teaching curricula; and (c) factors related to the more general sociocultural context, which may include influences from family and society, ideas about the dominant culture and their own culture; and the transnational experiences of the teacher.

The conclusions we draw from our review about the definition and characteristics of the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English (i.e., research question one) are discussed below.

First, the teachers' intercultural identities were found to be flexible and were constantly adjusted, depending on the challenges and conflicts they were confronted with. Using various means of communication and negotiation, teachers constructed and maintained their identities. We found the conflict between the cultural values of the non-native teachers of English and the local culture of the ES countries to be more manifest among the teachers working abroad than among the teachers in their home countries (i.e., when the teachers were most likely living and working in their own culture). In the ES countries, moreover, the need for the non-native teachers of English to identify with the ES culture was more apparent than in their home countries. In their home countries, the identities of EFL teachers are also influenced by ES cultures (e.g., popular music or public media), and education plays an important role in their identity formation (Menard-Warwick, 2011). These findings could be useful in cultivating intercultural identities among pre-service teachers. The studies we reviewed confirmed the finding of other studies that pre-service EFL teachers found the exposure to the lifestyles and values of Western people was effective in the formation of their identities (Atay & Ece, 2009). Sending teachers abroad to study in ES cultures can be one way to increase their exposure to another culture (Han & Yin, 2016). Conscious reflection on their competence and positioning themselves in the community of language teachers also helps pre-service teachers to form and negotiate their identities in practice (Guerrero Nieto & Meadows, 2015; Pavlenko, 2003). More studies of how teachers in EFL contexts consider their identities in relation to ES cultures are nevertheless needed.

Second, non-native teachers of English are not a homogenous group. They develop differing intercultural identities depending on their sociocultural and institutional backgrounds, which can vary from an ES to a non-ES country, from a lower to a higher level of teaching, from novice to expert types of teachers, and from positive to negative responses to various factors at play in the intercultural context of their teaching.

Third, the teachers' confidence in their language skills and intercultural competence influences their intercultural identities, which may then — in turn — influence their attitudes towards languages, teaching, culture, and so forth within the intercultural context.

These three characteristics of the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English point to both personal and contextual sides of teacher identity, as previously observed by Beijaard et al. (2004).

Although the contexts of the studies we reviewed were all specifically about the teaching of English language and ES cultures or intercultural competence, the labels applied to the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English were sometimes vague and or even non-existent. We can expect a teacher's identity, professional identity, bilingual identity, sociocultural identity, and intercultural identity to actually overlap to such an extent that the boundaries between these labels are blurred. However, to understand how the roles or positions of non-native teachers of English are formed in a specific language-and-culture teaching context, and how their roles and positions benefit teaching of ES cultures and intercultural competence, it is advisable to focus on how teachers view themselves in the specific contexts and what those views of themselves can contribute to language-and-culture teaching. The teachers' intercultural identity, as one of the sub-identities of their professional identities (the concept 'sub-identity' was proposed by Beijaard et al., 2004), may be quite a dominant aspect of a non-native teachers' identity, in particular for those who work in language-and-culture teaching contexts. More information on just how the teachers regard themselves within specific language-and-culture teaching contexts is nevertheless needed to provide insight into how to help teachers to reflect and justify their roles and positions in teaching.

Taking a step back, the purpose of the present review was to gain insight into the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English. Knowing about the characteristics of teachers' intercultural identities and the factors that shape them can help teachers reflect on their identities, think about how their identities have been formed, and how their identities influence their teaching. This may be especially useful for in-service teachers who may overlook the importance of such factors for the teaching of intercultural competence and knowledge of ES cultures or for pre-service and practising teachers studying or working in an environment where ES culture is distant. Reflection on one's intercultural identity may positively affect the teachers themselves and allow them to reject the myth of native speakers always being more qualified than non-native English-speakers to teach English, for example (Guerrero Nieto & Meadows, 2015; Reis, 2011). Such reflection may also allow teachers to

respond more effectively to the tensions that can arise in teaching contexts from issues such as race, gender, culture, and class (S. Yang & Bautista, 2008).

Research on the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English in language-and-culture teaching contexts has only recently begun to receive widespread attention from researchers and language-teaching professionals. The small number of relevant studies, the limited number of participants in the studies, the limited variety of the participants, and the inconsistency of terminology used lead us to conclude that only limited insight can currently be gained from the existing research literature into how teachers in general, but also in specific countries, consider their identities in relation to the target language and culture of their teaching (i.e., ES cultures). As sociocultural theories such as that of Vygotsky became more popular in the study of language pedagogy (Ellis, 2013; van Compernelle & Williams, 2013), studies of the intercultural identities of teachers shifted their focus more and more to the interaction between sociocultural factors and teachers' perceptions of themselves in the teaching context. More studies comparing non-native teachers of English across varying sociocultural and teaching contexts are needed. To enable further exploration of the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English and to arrive at fruitful approaches for understanding the formation and roles of their intercultural identities, we need more in-depth case studies and large-scale surveys across countries. Only then may we reach agreement on the characteristics of the intercultural identities of non-native teachers of English, how they are formed, and how they connect to the knowledge, beliefs, attitudes, and behaviour of teachers in language-and-culture teaching contexts.

