



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Achieving party unity : a sequential approach to why MPs act in concert

Vonno, C.M.C. van

Citation

Vonno, C. M. C. van. (2016, March 2). *Achieving party unity : a sequential approach to why MPs act in concert*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/38275>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/38275>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/38275> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Vonno, Cynthia M.C. van

Title: Achieving party unity : a sequential approach to why MPs act in concert

Issue Date: 2016-03-02

Achieving Party Unity

A Sequential Approach to Why MPs Act in Concert

Cover

Paulien Varkevisser | Fotografie & vormgeving, Nijmegen

www.paulienvarkevisser.com

The illustration is inspired by the cover of *American Legislative Behavior: A Reader* (1968), edited by Samuel C. Patterson and published by D. Van Nostrand Company, Inc.

Typesetting

Typeset using the $\text{\LaTeX}$ and $\text{\TeX}$ Documentation System.

Print

Wöhrmann Print Service

© 2016 Cynthia Maria Cornelia van Vonno. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission in writing from the proprietor.

© 2016 Cynthia Maria Cornelia van Vonno. Alle rechten voorbehouden. Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen, of op enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de rechthebbende.

Achieving Party Unity

A Sequential Approach to Why MPs Act in Concert

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 2 maart 2016
klokke 16:15 uur

door

Cynthia Maria Cornelia van Vonno

geboren te Alphen aan den Rijn in 1984

Promotor

Prof.dr. R.B. Andeweg

Promotiecommissie

Prof.dr. I.C. van Biezen, Universiteit Leiden

Prof.dr. K. Deschouwer, Vrije Universiteit Brussel

Prof.dr. R.Y. Hazan, The Hebrew School of Jerusalem

Prof.dr. J.J.M. van Holsteyn, Universiteit Leiden

Prof.dr. R.A. Koole, Universiteit Leiden

Prof.dr. J.J.A. Thomassen, Universiteit Twente

Contents

List of Figures	v
List of Tables	vii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Research question	1
1.2 Plan of the book	7
2 Representation in parliament by individual or by political party: shifting emphasis	9
2.1 Representation in theory and in practice	9
2.2 The individual as main representative actor	11
2.2.1 Parliamentaryism	11
2.2.2 The mandate-independence controversy	13
2.3 The political party takes over	16
2.3.1 Party democracy	16
2.3.2 The responsible party model	19
2.4 The return to the individual?	21
2.4.1 Audience democracy	21
2.4.2 Personalization	23
2.5 Conclusion	25
3 Unpacking the unitary actor	27
3.1 Party group unity	27
3.1.1 Conceptualization	28
3.1.2 Measurement	28
3.2 Explaining party group unity	32
3.2.1 Institutions and party group unity	32
3.2.2 Pathways to party group unity	34
3.2.3 Decision-making models	40
3.3 The sequential decision-making model	43
3.3.1 MPs' decision-making process	43

Contents

3.3.2	The sequential logic	46
3.3.3	Simplification	48
3.4	Conclusion	50
4	The influence of institutions: MPs' decision-making mechanisms in 15 national parliaments	51
4.1	The influence of institutions	51
4.2	Expectations	54
4.2.1	Division of labor	54
4.2.2	Party agreement	56
4.2.3	Party loyalty	57
4.2.4	Party discipline	58
4.3	Analysis of the decision-making mechanisms in 15 national parliaments	59
4.3.1	Division of labor	64
4.3.2	Party agreement	66
4.3.3	Party loyalty	72
4.3.4	Party discipline	78
4.3.5	The sequential decision-making process	87
4.4	Conclusion	89
5	Different pathways for different levels: representatives' decision-making mechanisms at the national and subnational level	91
5.1	Different pathways for different levels of government	91
5.2	Expectations	94
5.2.1	Division of labor	94
5.2.2	Party agreement	95
5.2.3	Party loyalty	96
5.2.4	Party discipline	98
5.3	Analysis of the decision-making mechanisms in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies	99
5.3.1	Division of labor	101
5.3.2	Party agreement	102
5.3.3	Party loyalty	106
5.3.4	Party discipline	110
5.3.5	The sequential decision-making process	116
5.4	Analysis of the decision-making mechanisms in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils	120
5.4.1	Division of labor	124
5.4.2	Party agreement	127
5.4.3	Party loyalty	131
5.4.4	Party discipline	138
5.4.5	The sequential decision-making process	145
5.5	Conclusion	147

6	Changes over time: party group unity and MPs' decision-making mechanisms in the Dutch national parliament over time	151
6.1	The one- or two-arena model	151
6.2	The Dutch case	155
6.2.1	The electoral arena	155
6.2.2	The legislative arena	158
6.3	Party group unity over time	160
6.3.1	Party group defection	161
6.3.2	Party group voting	166
6.4	Expectations	178
6.4.1	Division of labor	178
6.4.2	Party agreement	180
6.4.3	Party loyalty	183
6.4.4	Party discipline	183
6.5	Analysis of the decision-making mechanisms in the Dutch Second Chamber	185
6.5.1	Division of labor	187
6.5.2	Party agreement	190
6.5.3	Party loyalty	197
6.5.4	Party discipline	199
6.6	Conclusion	204
7	The sequential approach evaluated	207
7.1	The decision-making mechanisms	207
7.1.1	Division of labor	209
7.1.2	Party agreement	210
7.1.3	Party loyalty	214
7.1.4	Party discipline	218
7.2	Suggestions for future research	221
7.3	Implications	228
	Bibliography	231
	Dutch summary	255
	Acknowledgments	259
	Curriculum Vitae	261

List of Figures

1.1	The study of party group unity	4
2.1	The style and focus of representatives' roles	13
2.2	The connection between constituencies' attitudes and a representative's roll call behavior	14
2.3	Representational role emphasis	16
3.1	MPs' sequential decision-making process	44
4.1	Party agreement (the frequency of disagreement with the party's posi- tion on a vote in parliament) and the absolute distance MPs' perceive between their own position and the position of their party on an 11- point ideological Left-Right scale in 15 national parliaments (%)	70
4.2	Party loyalty (own opinion versus party's position) and the importance ascribed to promoting the views and interests of the party in 15 national parliaments (%)	75

List of Tables

4.1	PartiRep MP Survey response rates for 15 national parliaments	61
4.2	Average party group unity in 15 national parliaments (Rice score)	62
4.3	Specialist or generalist in 15 national parliaments (%)	65
4.4	'The parliamentary party spokesperson gets to determine the party's position on his topic' in 15 national parliaments (%)	66
4.5	Party agreement (the frequency of disagreement with the party's position on a vote in parliament) in 15 national parliaments (%)	68
4.6	Party agreement (the frequency of disagreement with the party's position on a vote in parliament) in 15 national parliaments: multilevel binary logistics regression	71
4.7	Party loyalty (own opinion versus party's position) in 15 national parliaments (%)	73
4.8	Party loyalty (own opinion versus party's position) in 15 national parliaments: multilevel binary logistics regression	77
4.9	Satisfaction with general parliamentary party discipline in 15 national parliaments (%)	79
4.10	Satisfaction with parliamentary party discipline when it comes to sticking to the parliamentary party line in votes in 15 national parliaments (%) .	80
4.11	Satisfaction with parliamentary party discipline when it comes to taking political initiatives only with the parliamentary party's authorization in 15 national parliaments (%)	81
4.12	Satisfaction with parliamentary party discipline when it comes to keeping internal party discussions confidential in 15 national parliaments (%)	82
4.13	'Confidential party discussions usually find their way to the media' in 15 national parliaments (%)	83
4.14	Satisfaction with parliamentary party discipline when it comes to sticking to the parliamentary party group line in votes in 15 national parliaments: multilevel binary logistics regression	85
4.15	The relative contribution of party agreement, party loyalty and party discipline when it comes to sticking to the parliamentary party line in votes in 15 national parliaments (%)	88

List of Tables

5.1	2010 PartiRep MP survey response rates for national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies	100
5.2	Specialist or generalist in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	103
5.3	'The parliamentary party spokesperson gets to determine the party's position on his topic' in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	104
5.4	Party agreement (the frequency of disagreement with the party's position on a vote in parliament) in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	105
5.5	Party loyalty (own opinion versus party's position) in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	107
5.6	Party loyalty (own opinion versus party's position) and competing principals (voters' opinion versus party's position) in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	109
5.7	Satisfaction with general parliamentary party discipline in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	111
5.8	Satisfaction with parliamentary party discipline when it comes to sticking to the parliamentary party line in votes in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	112
5.9	Satisfaction with parliamentary party discipline when it comes to taking political initiatives only with the parliamentary party's authorization in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	113
5.10	Satisfaction with parliamentary party discipline when it comes to keeping internal party discussions confidential in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	114
5.11	'Confidential party discussions usually find their way to the media' in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	115
5.12	The relative contribution of party agreement, party loyalty and party discipline when it comes to sticking to the parliamentary party line in votes in parliament in national and regional parliaments in nine European democracies (%)	118
5.13	PartiRep MP Survey response rates for the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils	123
5.14	Specialist or generalist in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	125
5.15	'The parliamentary party spokesperson gets to determine the party's position on his topic' in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	126
5.16	The main decision-making center in the parliamentary party group in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	127
5.17	Party agreement (the frequency of disagreement with the party's position on a vote in parliament) in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	129

5.18	Party agreement (the frequency of disagreement with the party's position on a vote in parliament) and 'I feel involved in the decision making in the party group' in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	130
5.19	Party loyalty (own opinion versus party's position) in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	132
5.20	Party loyalty (own opinion versus party's position) and competing principals (voters' opinion versus party's position) in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	134
5.21	'There is a strong feeling of unity in the party group' in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	136
5.22	'An individual representative's freedom or party unity' in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	136
5.23	Situations in which an MP who disagrees with the party's position on a vote in parliament still ought to vote according to the party's position in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (% who answer affirmatively)	138
5.24	Satisfaction with general & specific aspects of parliamentary party discipline in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	139
5.25	'Confidential party discussions usually find their way to the media' in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	141
5.26	The likelihood of immediate negative sanctions when a representative repeatedly does not vote with the party line in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	142
5.27	The likelihood of delayed negative sanctions when a representative repeatedly does not vote with the party line in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	143
5.28	The relative contribution of party agreement, party loyalty and party discipline when it comes to sticking to the parliamentary party line in votes in the Dutch Second Chamber, provincial councils and municipal councils (%)	146
6.1	Average electoral volatility and second order personal votes in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1946-2012	155
6.2	MPs who entered the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament on the basis of preference votes who otherwise would have not have done so on the basis of their list position and the number of votes obtained by their political party 1946-2012	157
6.3	Parliamentary party group defections in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1946-2015	164
6.4	Percentage of votes in which party group unity was not complete in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1946-2010 (%)	171

List of Tables

6.5	Percentage of votes in which party group unity was not complete in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1946-2010: CDA, PvdA and VVD averages only (%)	172
6.6	Average party group unity in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1946-2010 (Rice score)	174
6.7	Average party group unity in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1946-2010: CDA, PvdA and VVD only (Rice score)	175
6.8	Number of dissenting MPs in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1946-2010	176
6.9	Use of parliamentary rights in the Second Chamber of the Dutch National Parliament 1956-2012	179
6.10	Dutch Parliamentary Studies and PartiRep MP Survey response rates for the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament	187
6.11	'As an MP you usually vote according to the advice of the parliamentary party spokesperson when it comes to bills that you did not deal with yourself for the party group' in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1972-2006 (%)	188
6.12	The main decision-making center in the parliamentary party group in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1979-2010 (%)	189
6.13	Party group ideological homogeneity on the Left-Right scale in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1972-2010: CDA, PvdA and VVD only (coefficient of agreement)	191
6.14	Perceived ideological distance on the Left-Right scale in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1972-2010 (%)	193
6.15	Perceived ideological distance on the Left-Right scale in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1972-2010: CDA, PvdA and VVD only (%)	194
6.16	Perceived ideological distance on the Left-Right scale in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament: government-opposition (%)	195
6.17	Perceived ideological distance on the Left-Right scale in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament: party group size (%)	196
6.18	Party group loyalty (own opinion versus party group's position) in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1972-2010 (%)	198
6.19	Party group loyalty (own opinion versus party group's position) in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1972-2010: CDA, PvdA and VVD only (%)	200
6.20	Party group loyalty (own opinion versus party group's position) in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 1972-2010: government-opposition (%)	201
6.21	Satisfaction with general party discipline in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 2001-2010 (%)	202
6.22	Satisfaction with specific aspects of party discipline in the Second Chamber of the Dutch Parliament 2001-2010 (%)	203
7.1	Division of labor: summary of expectations and findings	211

7.2	Party agreement: summary of expectations and findings	213
7.3	Party loyalty: summary of expectations and findings	217
7.4	Party discipline: summary of expectations and findings	219

