



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

**Periphery matters : a cultural biography of Peking Opera in Hong Kong**  
Joshua, Chan; Joshua Chan

**Citation**

Joshua, C. (2017, September 12). *Periphery matters : a cultural biography of Peking Opera in Hong Kong*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/54688>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/54688>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/54688> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

**Author:** Chan Pui Lun

**Title:** Periphery matters : a cultural biography of Peking Opera in Hong Kong

**Date:** 2017-09-12

# Periphery Matters

A Cultural Biography of Peking Opera in Hong Kong

**Chan Pui Lun**

Cover designed by Lydia Lam

Image: Tang Yuen-ha performing in the 2015 Chinese Opera Festival in Hong Kong.

Courtesy: Leisure and Cultural Services Department, HKSAR Government

Printed by Proefschriftmaken

Copyright © Chan Pui Lun, Leiden, the Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this dissertation may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means whatsoever without prior permission of the author.

# Periphery Matters

A Cultural Biography of Peking Opera in Hong Kong

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op 12 September 2017  
klokke 11.15 uur

door  
Pui-Lun Chan  
Geboren te Hong Kong  
in 1985

Promotores

Prof. dr. Maghiel van Crevel (Leiden University)

Em. Prof. dr. Wilt Idema (Harvard University and Leiden University)

Promotiecommissie

Dr. Ashley Thorpe (Royal Holloway, University of London)

Prof. dr. Oliver Moore (University of Groningen)

Dr. Sanjukta Sunderason (Leiden University)

Prof. dr. Rint Sybesma (Leiden University)

## Table of Contents

|                                 |      |
|---------------------------------|------|
| Acknowledgement.....            | ix   |
| Author's Note.....              | x    |
| List of Tables and Figures..... | xiii |

### Chapter One /

|  |          |
|--|----------|
| <b>Introduction.....</b>                   | <b>1</b> |
| 1.1 Building a house .....                 | 1        |
| 1.2 The blueprint.....                     | 4        |
| 1.2.1. Cultural Biography .....            | 4        |
| 1.2.2. Social Network Analysis .....       | 5        |
| 1.3 Why this house?.....                   | 7        |
| 1.4 A review.....                          | 8        |
| 1.4.1. Peking Opera around the world ..... | 8        |
| 1.4.2. Primary sources .....               | 9        |
| 1.5 Building tools.....                    | 9        |
| 1.5.1. Conversing.....                     | 10       |
| 1.5.2. Observing (and participating).....  | 11       |
| 1.5.3. Reading.....                        | 11       |
| 1.6 The interior .....                     | 12       |

### Chapter Two /

#### Early Scenes of Peking Opera in Hong Kong

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>Mei Lanfang.....</b>   | <b>15</b> |
| 2.1 The quest for “national drama” in the late 1910s .....                                  | 16        |
| 2.1.1 National Identity = National Culture: nationalism and the<br>May Fourth Movement..... | 16        |
| 2.1.2 National Culture = National Drama: The social function of drama .....                 | 18        |
| 2.1.3 National Drama = Peking Opera: Qi Rushan's<br>nationalization of Peking Opera .....   | 21        |
| 2.2 Peking Opera = Mei Lanfang: performing “national essence” on stage .....                | 24        |
| 2.2.1 On Mei Lanfang.....   | 24        |
| 2.2.2 Mei's Peking Opera innovations in the 1910s.....                                      | 25        |
| 2.3 The first encounter: Mei's 1922 tour to Hong Kong .....                                 | 28        |
| 2.3.1 Mei Lanfang on stage: a fabulous impersonator of femininity.....                      | 30        |
| 2.3.2 Mei Lanfang off stage: a modern man, a Chinese elite person .....                     | 31        |
| 2.4 Conclusion .....  | 34        |
| 2.5 Epilogue: Mei Lanfang after 1922.....   | 35        |

**Chapter Three /****The First Wave of Peking-Cantonese Opera Interaction**

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>Chen Feinong</b> .....   | <b>37</b> |
| 3.1 A brief history of Cantonese Opera .....                          | 38        |
| 3.1.1 The same roots: <i>pihuang</i> singing mode as foundation ..... | 39        |
| 3.1.2 Different paths: the localization of Cantonese Opera.....       | 40        |
| 3.2 Chen Feinong and his early career.....                            | 42        |
| 3.2.1 Early years (1899-1920/21) .....                                | 43        |
| 3.2.2 In Singapore (1920/21-23).....                                  | 43        |
| 3.2.3 Correcting dates in Chen's life history in the early 1920s..... | 44        |
| 3.3 Inter-genre interaction in the 1920s and 1930s.....               | 45        |
| 3.3.1 Defining and framing the interaction.....                       | 45        |
| 3.3.2 A pioneer .....   | 46        |
| 3.3.3 Interaction as a chain reaction .....                           | 47        |
| 3.3.4 Canonizing adoption.....  | 49        |
| 3.3.5 Impact on Cantonese Opera.....                                  | 50        |
| 3.4 Conclusion .....  | 52        |
| 3.5 Chen Feinong in later years .....                                 | 53        |

**Chapter Four /****Mid-Twentieth Century: Local Training Schools and the Movie Industry**

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>Jackie Chan</b> .....   | <b>55</b> |
| 4.1 Mainland performers in Hong Kong – 1940s and 1950s.....                      | 56        |
| 4.1.1 Mei Lanfang.....   | 57        |
| 4.1.2 Ma Lianliang, Zhang Junqiu, and Yu Zhenfei.....                            | 57        |
| 4.1.3 A site of nostalgia .....  | 60        |
| 4.2 Peking Opera training schools in Hong Kong from the 1950s to the 1970s ..... | 63        |
| 4.2.1 The recruitment system of Peking Opera from the 1790s to 1950s .....       | 63        |
| 4.2.2 Jackie Chan's childhood.....   | 65        |
| 4.2.3 Life in a training school.....   | 65        |
| 4.3 Peking Opera training schools and Hong Kong martial arts movies.....         | 74        |
| 4.3.1 The rise of martial arts movies from the 1960s .....                       | 74        |
| 4.3.2 From Peking Opera performers to movie actors.....                          | 75        |
| 4.3.3 The significance of Peking Opera training schools in Hong Kong .....       | 76        |
| 4.4 Peking Opera in Martial Arts movies in the 1960s.....                        | 78        |
| 4.4.1 King Hu and his Cinema Opera.....  | 78        |
| 4.4.2 Zhang Che: same source, different interpretation.....                      | 82        |
| 4.5 Conclusion .....   | 82        |

**Chapter Five /****Peking Opera and Cultural Politics: from the 1840s to the Present**

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>Liang Hanyong.....</b>   | <b>85</b> |
| 5.1 A look back: from the 1840s to the 1970s.....   | 86        |
| 5.1.1 Collaborative coloniality .....   | 86        |
| 5.1.2 The new City Hall and the 1967 riot .....   | 89        |
| 5.2 The 1980s: Rebirth .....  | 92        |
| 5.2.1 A descriptive cultural policy.....  | 92        |
| 5.2.2 The rebirth of Peking Opera in Hong Kong .....  | 93        |
| 5.3 Peking Opera and politics after 1997: a case study of<br>Liang Hanyong and the YCOC ..... | 95        |
| 5.3.1 Cultural policy after 1997.....   | 95        |
| 5.3.2 Liang Hanyong and the YCOC.....   | 96        |
| 5.3.3 Peking Opera under the post-1997 policy .....   | 97        |
| 5.4 Performances by Chinese mainland troupes.....   | 107       |
| 5.5 Post-1997 Hong Kong's national yet local identity.....                                    | 108       |
| 5.6 Conclusion .....  | 111       |

**Chapter Six /****Local Innovation in the Twenty-First Century**

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Tang Yuen-ha.....</b>  | <b>113</b> |
| 6.1 Tang Yuen-ha and the Jingkun Theatre.....   | 114        |
| 6.2 The national vision among local performers .....                                    | 115        |
| 6.2.1 Peking Opera on the mainland after the Cultural Revolution.....                   | 116        |
| 6.2.2 From Notre Dame de Paris to The Great Belfry.....                                 | 117        |
| 6.3 In search of a “Hong Kong way” .....  | 120        |
| 6.3.1 Return to traditional plays .....   | 121        |
| 6.3.2 The innovative guided demonstration .....   | 122        |
| 6.3.3 Motivation behind the local invention.....  | 127        |
| 6.4 Guided demonstration on the Chinese mainland: the periphery impacting the core. 128 |            |
| 6.4.1 Mainland-Hong Kong collaboration in the making of guided demonstrations ..        | 128        |
| 6.4.2 Appropriating guided demonstration on the Chinese mainland .....                  | 130        |
| 6.5 Teaching activities of Jingkun Theatre.....   | 134        |
| 6.6 Conclusion .....  | 134        |

**Chapter Seven /****Repackaging Cantonese Opera?**

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>Yeung Ming</b> .....  | <b>137</b> |
| 7.1 Current influence of Peking Opera on Cantonese Opera.....                    | 137        |
| 7.1.1 Continuities.....  | 138        |
| 7.1.2 A new role of Peking Opera performers in Cantonese Opera productions ..... | 140        |
| 7.2 Yeung Ming and his “repackaged” Cantonese Opera .....                        | 142        |
| 7.2.1 A brief biography.....   | 142        |
| 7.2.2 Repackaging Cantonese Opera .....  | 144        |
| 7.2.3 Some reflection on “repackaged” Cantonese Opera.....                       | 149        |
| 7.3 Canonizing Peking Opera at HKAPA .....                                       | 150        |
| 7.3.1 Peking Opera in the School’s programmes .....                              | 150        |
| 7.3.2 The big picture .....  | 152        |
| 7.4 Conclusion .....   | 152        |

**Chapter Eight /****Conclusion.....155**

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 8.1 A house of curiosities .....                            | 155 |
| 8.2 A refugee shelter.....                                  | 156 |
| 8.3 A laboratory of performing arts.....                    | 158 |
| 8.4 Peking Opera in Taiwan and Singapore: a comparison..... | 159 |
| 8.4.1 Peking Opera in Taiwan .....                          | 160 |
| 8.4.2 Peking Opera in Singapore .....                       | 165 |
| 8.4.3 So what is special about Hong Kong? .....             | 168 |
| 8.5 What next? .....  | 169 |

|                   |     |
|-------------------|-----|
| Bibliography..... | 170 |
|-------------------|-----|

|                   |     |
|-------------------|-----|
| Samenvatting..... | 184 |
|-------------------|-----|

|                       |     |
|-----------------------|-----|
| Curriculum Vitae..... | 187 |
|-----------------------|-----|

## Acknowledgements

In presenting this dissertation I must express my deepest gratitude to all who have supported my research these past four and a half years. First of all, I thank Prof. dr. Maghiel van Crevel for his invaluable guidance, for his constructive challenges and warm encouragements that shape me bit by bit as a scholar, and for his flexibility and tolerance that allow me to wander through new, untried ideas. I also thank my second supervisor, Prof. dr. Wilt Idema, for his always-insightful feedback and continuous challenges that forced me out of my comfort zone, toward a much broader realm of knowledge. Every meeting with him was an eye-opener to me. I am also grateful to Dr. Ashley Thorpe, Prof. dr. Oliver Moore, Dr. Sanjukta Sunderason and Prof. dr. Rint Sybesma, for their insightful comments on my dissertation.

I am deeply grateful to the Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation for International Scholarly Exchange for their financial support in my last year of research. I am also grateful to the Leiden University Fund and the Leiden Asia Centre (formerly the Modern East Asia Research Centre) for their financial support for my field trips in 2014 and 2015. I also thank my home institution, the Leiden University Institute for Area Studies, for all the institutional support that I received.

In forming my understanding of Peking Opera in Hong Kong and on the Chinese mainland, I have drawn on the experience of many practitioners. In this regard, I am greatly indebted to all my interviewees and informants – Zheng Shaohua, Tang Yuen-ha, Geng Tianyuan, Liang Hanyong, Yeung Ming, Milky Cheung, Li Juhua, Boas Chow, Federic Mao and Chu Yuk-lan – for their time and willingness to share with me their experiences and opinions, and for allowing me to observe their rehearsals and classes. I especially thank Prof. Zhou Jiajuan from the Confucius Institute in Leiden, for connecting me to the Shandong Peking Opera Troupe.

In the past years I have received many insightful comments on the project from the PhD community in LIAS, and I remain grateful for this. I also thank Cynthia Col and Saskia Roselaar, for their copy-editing and comments to help clarify and refine my ideas. A special word of thanks goes to Dr. Frank Kouwenhoven of CHIME, the European Foundation for Chinese Music Research. His commitment and passion is truly inspirational – and I fondly recall our chats in the cozy CHIME library, triggering my nostalgia as a musician.

Doing a PhD is not an easy journey, and I am fortunate to have wonderful parents who support life choices that may look crazy in others' eyes. I am also thankful to my family – notably my brother Jonathan, my aunt Yvonne and my cousin Horeb – for their sincere support from afar. I thank all my friends, those back home in Hong Kong and in the Netherlands, for their moral support and accompaniment. My deepest gratitude goes to my wife, Lydia, who was courageous enough to support my ambition to study abroad, and to adjust her own priorities to make this possible, and walk this journey with me.

## Author's Note

### The misleading Peking “Opera”

Peking Opera and all genres of traditional Chinese theatre (*xiqu* 戲曲) at large, which is often referred to as “Chinese Opera”, are in many ways different from the Western genre of opera. Firstly, the musical features of the two art forms are different. While western opera uses composed music, traditional Chinese theatre bases its music on fixed tunes and the tone-matrix system. Fixed tunes (*qupai* 曲牌) are pre-existing tunes that are preserved and orally transmitted, and are known to people by their titles. To be used in a play, tunes are put together, like a “medley” in the western sense, to form a larger unit of musical entity. This way to organize music is called *lianzhui* 聯綴, or the “medley” form.<sup>1</sup> The tone-matrix (*banqiang* 板腔) system, on the other hand, operates in a play by tempo-variations of singing mode(s). A singing mode (*shengqiang* 聲腔) can be understood as a specific set of structural rules that govern the melodic formation of musical lines. These rules of melodic contour are highly dependent on linguistic features of the performing language (dialect) and, thus, singing modes are highly region-specific. According to Bell Yung and Chan Sau-yan, there are five factors to determine a singing mode: “the text’s verse structure, the metrical pattern and syllable placement, the line-ending notes, the mode and the instrumental accompaniment.”<sup>2</sup> While many genres organize their music with a mix of these two forms, they are not invariably balanced. For example, Kunqu Opera operates mostly in the “medley” form of fixed tunes, while Peking Opera basically sticks to the tone-matrix system.<sup>3</sup>

Secondly, while western opera performers are categorized according to their vocal range, categorization of performers in traditional Chinese theatre operates in a role type (*hangdang* 行當) system. Formed together with the emergence of *zaju* 雜劇 in the Song dynasty (960-1279), the system contained five role types, namely *moni* 末泥, *yinxi* 引戲, *fujing* 副淨, *fumo* 副末 and *zhuanghu* 裝狐, which indicate performers’ tasks in a play. For example, *moni* was the leading male; *yinxi* was responsible for starting the play with songs and dances; and *fumo* was to make jokes during the play.<sup>4</sup> After centuries during which roles were added and removed, the role type system adopted by the majority of traditional Chinese theatrical genres in the present contains four main role types. They include male role (*sheng* 生), female role (*dan* 旦), painted face role (*jing* 淨)<sup>5</sup> and clown role (*chou* 丑), categorizing performers according to the gender and the attributes of the characters of their specialization. Within these four main role types, there are sub-types to further categorize performers according to the age-range of the characters and technical requirements for the performers.

<sup>1</sup> Yung 1989: 7.

<sup>2</sup> Yung 1989: 69-71; Chan 1991: 11.

<sup>3</sup> Yung 1989: 7.

<sup>4</sup> Liao 2014: 32, 62.

<sup>5</sup> Performers in the painted face role specialize in portraying characters with distinctive moral qualities, be they good or bad, as well as characters with a mythical nature or immortality. The role type is named after the conventional practice of elaborate face painting among performers of this type.

For example, under the male role there are junior male role (*xiaosheng* 小生), senior male role (*laosheng* 老生) and martial male role (*wusheng* 武生). Names and numbers of sub-roles under the four main role types may be different across genres due to their diversified paths of development.

Thirdly, traditional Chinese theatre is highly stylized, and this is reflected in its stage setting and performance. In terms of stage setting, the use of backdrops and props is minimized. On the traditional stage one would only find a modestly decorated backdrop of a piece of cloth, a plain-coloured rug, as well as a wooden table and two wooden chairs set in the middle. Such setting is called “one table, two chairs” (*yizhuo liangyi* 一桌兩椅). Small variations to the traditional setting would be made according to the story contexts. For example, if it is to depict a scene in the royal palace or a wedding chamber, respective kinds of decorated silk cloths would be used to cover the table and chairs. In turn, the indicative function of location and context of a scene is taken up by the performers through their verbal deliveries and formulaic actions. For example, performers present a horse ride by a loop run around the stage with a decorated horsewhip in their hand;<sup>6</sup> or performers would have a specific set of actions – for example, they mimic door opening and threshold crossing to indicate that they are entering or exiting a room.

In addition to the aforesaid artistic differences between traditional Chinese theatre and western opera, another reason for my hesitation toward the use of “opera” is that the term “Chinese Opera” can also mean something else altogether. Due to cultural globalization, a development of western opera in China in recent decades is observed. Be the productions produced *in* China, *by* Chinese composers, or *with* culturally Chinese elements, I believe that “Chinese Opera” is the best, if not the only, term for describing these practices of western opera in China.

Indeed a debate has existed for long on a suitable English term for *xiqu*, which covers a wide range of traditional Chinese art forms. I have encountered terms like “Chinese Opera”, “Chinese Theatre Arts”, “Chinese (Musical) Drama”, or its Romanization from the Hanyu Pinyin system, *xiqu*, in scholarship by others. I prefer to use “traditional Chinese theatre” in this research project, for the above-mentioned reasons. As for my seemingly contradicting choices of terms such as “Peking Opera”, “Cantonese Opera” and “Kunqu Opera”, I use them because they are the most established terms for the respective genres in English-language scholarship. Also, precise but wordy alternatives such as “traditional Chinese theatre in Peking (Beijing) style” would hamper readability, especially in view of their numerous appearances in the dissertation.

## **On Romanization and conventions**

In general, I transliterate Chinese names and terms following the official Hanyu Pinyin system of the People’s Republic of China, as it is the dominant Romanization system used in Chinese studies. For names of individuals and places, unless I am aware of an established

---

<sup>6</sup> Up to the sixteenth century, bamboo horses were used on stage.

name in other Romanization systems – for example, the Cantonese Romanization system used by the Hong Kong government – I spell them in Hanyu Pinyin. Names of individuals are in Chinese order (surname, given name), unless an English language publication uses a specific spelling (e.g. King Hu) or if a name is a mix of English and Chinese (e.g. Jackie Chan). A name will be followed by corresponding Chinese characters at its first appearance.

For the sake of readability, a different convention goes with other names and play titles. A name at its first appearance will be in English first, whether it is the official name, a received translation or my own translation. If the appearance of the name is not for reference purpose, it will be followed by Chinese characters. Any subsequent references are in English only. A similar convention goes with play titles, which will be in the order of English, transliteration in Hanyu Pinyin and Chinese characters. Titles of complete plays and scenes that are conventionally performed as independent plays are in italics, while titles of scenes or excerpts from complete plays are put between quotation marks. As for other phrases and terms in Chinese, unless otherwise stated, I will first give an English translation, followed by the Chinese Romanization and Chinese characters.

One exception of such convention is for titles of Chinese-language publications. I will first give the Chinese Romanization and Chinese characters, followed by an English translation, so as to identify its source language. All translations of Chinese texts are mine unless otherwise stated.

Life years of significant individuals in my narrative will be cited, but in those cases where individuals have objected to their life years being cited, I have respected their preferences.

## List of Tables and Figures

|             |  |     |
|-------------|--|-----|
| Figure 1.1. | The network model for my discussion.   | 7   |
| Figure 2.1. | Advertisement for Mei Lanfang's 1922 Hong Kong tour.   | 33  |
| Figure 2.2. | The stage of the Tai Ping Theatre  | 34  |
| Figure 3.1. | The transmission paths of Han Drama to north and south.  | 40  |
| Figure 4.1. | Jackie Chan and Yuan Hong performing <i>Cuiping Mountain</i>   | 71  |
| Figure 4.2. | Students from the China Drama Academy performing <i>A Truce Between the Ba and Luo Families</i>                    | 72  |
| Figure 4.3. | Students from the China Drama Academy participating in the movie <i>The Princess and the Seven Little Heroes</i> . | 73  |
| Table 5.1.  | Replication of the score table used in the point system of City Hall's venue booking.                              | 91  |
| Table 5.2.  | ADC's funding to local Peking Opera troupes/projects from the financial years of 1994/95 to 2014/15.               | 97  |
| Figure 5.1. | Liang Hanyong tutoring secondary school students in a foundational skills class.                                   | 99  |
| Figure 5.2. | Poster of the YCOC's graduation performance.   | 100 |
| Figure 5.3. | Before a YCOC community performance.   | 106 |
| Figure 5.4. | The daughter of Liang Hanyong performing in a community performance.   | 106 |
| Figure 6.1. | A scene from <i>The Great Belfry</i> .   | 119 |
| Figure 6.2. | The rotating stage used in <i>The Great Belfry</i> .   | 120 |
| Figure 6.3. | The civil clown role performing in a guided demonstration.   | 125 |
| Figure 6.4. | A comprehensive excerpt from "Autumn River".   | 126 |
| Figure 6.5. | A comprehensive excerpt from <i>Crossroads</i> .   | 126 |
| Figure 6.6. | The "Chinese Peking Opera with Explanation" performance.   | 133 |
| Figure 6.7. | SPOT's ensemble performing Peking Opera music in the performance.  | 133 |
| Figure 7.1. | Yeung Ming rehearsing a "repackaged" Cantonese Opera play.   | 147 |
| Figure 7.2. | The two performers adopting Yeung's version of the action in their performance.                                    | 148 |

