



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Reparations for international crimes and the development of a civil dimension of international criminal justice

Cohen, M.G.

Citation

Cohen, M. G. (2017, June 28). *Reparations for international crimes and the development of a civil dimension of international criminal justice*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/50081>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/50081>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/50081> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Cohen, Miriam

Title: Reparations for international crimes and the development of a civil dimension of international criminal justice

Issue Date: 2017-06-28



Universiteit Leiden

Reparations for International Crimes and the
Development of a Civil Dimension of International
Criminal Justice

Miriam G. Cohen

**REPARATIONS FOR INTERNATIONAL CRIMES AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF A CIVIL
DIMENSION OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE**

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 28 juni 2017
klokke 10:00 uur

door

Miriam Gouvea Cohen

geboren te Rio de Janeiro (Brazilië)

in 1983

Promotores: prof. dr. L.J. van den Herik
prof. dr. C. Stahn

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. A. Ellian
prof. dr. W.A. Schabas
dr. S. Vasiliev
Prof. dr. C.I. Fournet, (Rijksuniversiteit Groningen)
dr. A. Kiss, (International Criminal Court)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have been fundamental in my doctoral journey; I wish to express here a few words of gratitude and to dedicate this dissertation to them. I would first like to make a special thanks to my principal supervisor, Professor Dr. Larissa Van den Herik for her guidance and feedback throughout the process. Her support, inspiration and extensive knowledge have meant so much in this journey, and I am indebted to her for having trusted me, and this project, from the very beginning. I also wish to express my gratitude to Professor Dr. Carsten Stahn whose invaluable feedback, comments and on-going support have greatly improved this dissertation. They have both contributed immensely to the construction of the final product, and have taught me valuable lessons along the way. I cannot thank them enough for the help they have given me since the beginning of my studies; I learned from them the true meaning of research and supervision.

I also would like to express deep gratitude to Dr. Eric de Brabandere and the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies at Leiden University for accepting me in its prestigious PhD program and providing me a generous PhD award, without which this project would not have been possible. I am indebted to their generosity and honoured to have been part of such an inspiring and intellectually rich community.

My former supervisor at the International Court of Justice, and life mentor, H.E. Judge Antônio Augusto Cançado Trindade, has been a continuous source of inspiration and support. I cannot thank him enough for his support of my research and doctoral studies, during my four years in his Chambers at the International Court of Justice, and thereafter, and for all the encouraging discussions and scholarly opportunities he has provided me along the years.

I also wish to thank Dean Martha Minow with whom I first discussed the foundational ideas that would give rise, years later, to my dissertation topic. My gratitude also goes to my dear friend Dr. Vincent Jöel Proulx, who has been a sounding board from the beginning of this project, and who has encouraged me to always push further; to Ryan Lemay who has provided useful comments in a late stage of the process, on an earlier draft.

A very special thank you also goes to my family for always standing by me and believing in me. My spouse and life partner, Steven Geneau, for his unconditional love and support, for his peaceful inspiration, and for always reminding me that dreams can come true. My parents, Erlinda Cohen and Moises Cohen, who have taught me diligence, hard work and kindness, and who have always believed in my wildest projects, ever since my childhood in Brazil; and my sister Alessandra Cohen, for her support. Last but certainly not least, my young son, Joshua Cohen, who since his birth has been generous and patient to share my attention and my time with this project and whose large smiles have kept me focused: it is my hope that one day he will find some source of inspiration in this study.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	5
ABBREVIATIONS	11
INTRODUCTION	11
I. Research questions and claims	17
II. Research goals	20
III. Methodology and analytical frameworks	22
IV. Definition of key terms and scope of dissertation	24
1. Key concepts	24
2. Exclusions from the scope of this study	27
a) State responsibility:.....	27
b) International/regional human rights mechanisms:.....	27
c) Domestic (transnational) human rights litigation:.....	28
d) Truth and reconciliation commissions:.....	28
e) Mass claims and processes:.....	28
V. Approach and Contribution to Legal Scholarship	28
CHAPTER 1: PUNISHMENT AND REPARATION: CONSTRUING THE LEGAL BASIS OF A DUTY TO REPAIR FOR INDIVIDUAL PERPETRATORS	31
I. A theoretical inquiry into punishment and reparation: an overview of retributive and restorative justice theories	32
1. Crime and punishment	33
2. Victims, reparation and restorative justice theory	39
II. The genesis of international criminal law and the shift from State responsibility to individual accountability	40
III. Paving the way to reparations for mass crimes: overview of the legal duty of reparations in other fields of international law	45
1. The purpose of reparations	46
2. The multifaceted dimensions of reparation	48

3. State responsibility and the duty of reparation in international law	49
4. International human rights law and the development of individual victims' redress	52
5. International humanitarian law: reparation and its enforcement	56
6. Conclusion on the legal duty of reparations	60
IV. The beneficiaries of reparation under international law.....	60
V. Conceptualizing a civil dimension of international justice: a new paradigm and the development of an individual legal duty to repair	66
VI. Concluding remarks.....	71
<u>CHAPTER 2: THE CONTENT OF REPARATION FOR VICTIMS OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES: THE EXPERIENCE OF THE INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS</u>	73
I. Introduction	73
II. International Human Rights Courts and International Criminal Courts: differences and similarities	77
III. The Inter-American Court of Human Rights trailblazing jurisprudence on reparations	80
1. Contextual background	81
2. The concept of victims: who is entitled to receive reparation?.....	81
3. Assessment of harm	84
4. Collective reparations	86
5. Types of reparation.....	89
IV. How the jurisprudence of the IACtHR can inform the content of the duty to repair in international criminal law.....	92
V. Conclusions.....	98
<u>CHAPTER 3: OPERATIONALIZING THE DUTY TO REPAIR WITHIN THE SETTING OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURTS: THE ICC AND OTHER INTERNATIONAL/ HYBRID CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS APPROACHES TO VICTIMS' REDRESS</u>	100
I. Historical account - 'Where it all began': modern international criminal law and the Nuremberg and Tokyo trials.....	102
II. The <i>ad hoc</i> tribunals for the former Yugoslavia and Rwanda.....	104

III. Other international or hybrid criminal tribunals	113
1. The Special Special Tribunal for Lebanon	113
2. The Special Court for Sierra Leone	115
3. Parting with the trend: the Cambodian Extraordinary Chambers (ECCC) approach to civil redress in the international criminal scene	117
A) Civil parties at the ECCC	120
B) Reparation jurisprudence at the ECCC	121
IV. Reparations and the Construction of a Civil Dimension of International Justice before the International Criminal Court	123
1. The search for victims' justice before the ICC: case law on reparations	126
2. Beneficiaries of reparation awards	132
A) Definition of victims	133
B) Constructions of victimhood: inclusion and exclusion, and the collective versus the individual	135
3. Forms of reparation and the tension between collective and individual reparation in the ICC context	137
4. The Trust Fund for Victims	142
5. Victim participation and reparation	144
6. Tackling the difficult dilemmas: reconciling reparations before the ICC with conflicting perspectives and new paradigms	146
A) Critical scholarly outlook on ICC reparations	146
B) Reparations and contemporary issues	149
V. Conclusions	153
CHAPTER 4: PAVING A NEW ROAD FOR REPARATION FOR VICTIMS OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES: THE ICC TRUST FUND FOR VICTIMS AND BEYOND	155
I. Introduction	155
II. The road to the TFV and its legal framework	158
1. Relevant legal provisions	160
2. Mandates of the TFV	164
3. Functioning of the TFV, budget and programs	166
III. The role of the TFV vis-à-vis the Court in the reparations stage	169
IV. Justifications for channelling reparations through the TFV	176

V. Challenges Ahead: the TFV in uncharted ground	182
VI. Concluding Remarks: Trailblazing a new reparation mechanism for international crimes?	185
CHAPTER 5: THE ROLE OF NATIONAL COURTS IN THE ADJUDICATION OF CIVIL REDRESS FOR INTERNATIONAL CRIMES	
	189
I. Domestic approaches to criminal prosecutions and claims for reparation within criminal law proceedings	192
1. Romano-Germanic Systems	194
2. Common law systems	195
II. Case study: Filling in the reparation gap in the former Yugoslavia	196
1. The Balkans War: Reparations in Bosnia and Herzegovina	197
2. Developments at the international level	198
3. Domestic mechanisms in Bosnia and Herzegovina	202
4. Proceedings before domestic courts in Bosnia and Herzegovina	206
III. Fostering civil redress for international crimes in domestic courts: rationales and challenges	207
IV. The Road Ahead: how international criminal law at the international level can inform domestic reparation claims	209
V. Universal civil jurisdiction as an alternative avenue to seek redress for international crimes?	210
1. The doctrine of universal criminal jurisdiction: definition, genesis and rationales	211
A) Conceptualizing universal jurisdiction: legal basis and conditions for exercise ..	214
B) The evolution of theoretical rationales for universal jurisdiction: from piracy to crimes of universal concern.....	219
2. Towards a victim-orientated approach: a civil dimension of universal jurisdiction?	226
A) Defining the civil dimension of universal jurisdiction.....	227
B) Lawfulness of universal civil jurisdiction	228
C) Rationales for adding a civil dimension to universal jurisdiction.....	230
D) Recent State practice and possible rationales for a civil dimension of universal jurisdiction.....	232

E) Desirability, advantages and criticism of a civil dimension for universal jurisdiction	242
3. Assessing universal civil jurisdiction as a way to seek redress for victims of international crimes.....	245
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.....	247
1. Goals of dissertation and summary of research questions.....	247
2. Assessment and critiques	253
A) The emerging civil dimension of international criminal justice	256
B) Recommendations and the road ahead	263
C) Final remarks.....	269
SUMMARY.....	270
SAMENVATTING.....	273
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	276
CV.....	316

ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AC	Appeals Chamber
ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECnHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
IACnHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICTs	International Criminal Courts and Tribunals
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
ILC	International Law Commission
IMT	International Military Tribunal
OTP	Office of the Prosecutor
RPE	Rules of Procedure and Evidence
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
STL	Special Tribunal for Lebanon
TC	Trial Chamber
TFV	Trust Fund for Victims
UN	United Nations