

Early history of ethnography and ethnology in the German enlightenment : anthropological discourse in Europe and Asia, 1710-1808

Vermeulen, H.F.

Citation

Vermeulen, H. F. (2008, November 12). Early history of ethnography and ethnology in the German enlightenment: anthropological discourse in Europe and Asia, 1710-1808. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/13256

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: License agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the

Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden

Downloaded from: https://hdl.handle.net/1887/13256

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

History of Anthropology

Early History of Ethnography and Ethnology in the German Enlightenment: Anthropological Discourse in Europe and Asia, 1710-1808

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden, op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. P.F. van der Heijden, volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties te verdedigen op woensdag 12 november 2008 klokke 16.15 uur

door

Hendrik Frederik Vermeulen

geboren te 's-Gravenhage in 1952

Leiden 2008

PROMOTIECOMMISSIE

Promotor: Prof. dr. R. Schefold
Promotor: Prof. dr. J.G. Oosten
Referent: Prof. dr. J. Stagl, Salzburg
Overige leden: Prof. dr. A. Barnard, Edinburgh

Prof. dr. C.P. Bertels Prof. dr. R.H.A. Corbey

Prof. dr. F.A.M. Hüsken, Nijmegen

Dr. J.W. McAllister Prof. dr. P. Pels

Cover illustration: Petr Avramovich Chaplin, Map of the Itinerary of the First Kamchatka Expedition under Captain Vitus Bering from Tobolsk to Cape Chukotka (1729), depicting representatives of Siberian peoples contacted by expedition members (Courtesy of Kungliga Biblioteket/National Library of Sweden, Stockholm)

Cover design: Robert Busschots, Infofilm Leiden

Printing: Ridderprint, Ridderkerk

The printing of this thesis was partially funded by Noordman Timber & Plywood, Leiden

Keywords: history of anthropology, ethnology, and ethnography; eighteenth-century German (intellectual) history; conceptual history; Enlightenment studies; classification of sciences

© 2008 Han F. Vermeulen All rights reserved Printed in The Netherlands Aan mijn ouders

To my teachers

Für Anett und Erato

Ethnography is ... the Anthropologist's Muse (Ioan M. Lewis 1973)

L'anthropologue est l'astronome des sciences sociales (Claude Lévi-Strauss 1954)

Die Wahrheit ist das Kind der Zeit, nicht der Autorität (Bertolt Brecht 1938)

Contents

Preface Acknowledgements	X
Chapter 1. Introduction: History of Anthropology and Ethnology History of Anthropology Varieties of Anthropology Anthropology and Ethnology The Problem of History History of Ethnology Recent Contributions Research Questions What's in a Name? Conceptual History as a Method	1
PART ONE. Ethnography and Empire: The Origins of Ethnography in the German and Russian Enlightenment	
Chapter 2. Theory and Practice: G.W. Leibniz and the Advancement of Science in Russia, 1697-1716 Leibniz between Science and Politics Peter the Great Leibniz and Peter the Great The Kunstkamera in St. Petersburg Leibniz's Language Studies Leibniz's Linguistic Program: 'das Werck der Sprachen' Concluding Remarks	27
Chapter 3. D.G. Messerschmidt and the Early Exploration of Siberia, 1719-1727 The Conquest and Early Exploration of Siberia Russian Reports A Dutch Synthesis Halle and the Early German Enlightenment Halle and Pietism Swedish Studies of Siberia Early German Explorers Messerschmidt as Explorer of Siberia Messerschmidt's Itinerary and Results	63
Chapter 4. Ethnography and Empire: G.F. Müller and the Description of Siberian Peoples, 1732-1747 Müller's Life and Work The Imperial Academy of Sciences Müller and the Academy The Kamchatka Expeditions Müller's Recruitment Müller's Preparation Itinerary and Results After the Expedition The Kunstkamera and the Art of Illustrating	99

Müller's Instructions Müller's Ethnography Fischer's History and Vocabulary of Siberia Ethnography and Travel Accounts Müller's Later Career Müller and Comparative Ethnology The Foundation of Ethnography in Siberia Müller's Legacy	
Chapter 5. Anthropology and the Orient: Carsten Niebuhr and the Danish-German Arabia Expedition, 1761-1767 The Arabia Expedition and its Antecedents The Expedition Members Scientific Expeditions and the Apodemics of Linnaeus Preparations for the Expedition The Candidacy of Schlözer and Reiske Itinerary of the Expedition Results of the Expedition Reception of the Texts Michaelis' Research Program and the Theories of Albert Schultens Niebuhr and Ethnography Concluding Remarks	161
PART TWO. From the Field to the Study: The Foundation of <i>Völkerkunde</i>	
Chapter 6. A.L. Schlözer and the German Invention of <i>Völkerkunde</i> , 1767-1808 The Introduction of <i>Ethnographia</i> , 1767-1775 Leibniz, Linnaeus, and Schlözer <i>Völker-Beschreibung</i> in Russia The Emergence of <i>Völkerkunde</i> , 1771-1775 Gatterer and the New Geography <i>Volkskunde</i> and <i>Folk-Lore</i> , 1776-1846 From <i>Ethnographia</i> to <i>Ethnologia</i> , 1781-1787 The View of Herder Anthropology and Ethnology Ethnological Journals Encyclopaedias Ehrmann's Synopsis: General Ethnology and Regional Ethnography Schlözer's Legacy	199
Epilogue: From Ehrmann to Tylor, 1808-1881 Reception of the German Ethnographic Tradition in the West	249
Summary and Conclusions Nomen est Omen: Ethnography, Ethnology, and Socio-Cultural Anthropology	271
Samenvatting Kurzfassung Bibliography Curriculum Vitae	287 297 299 411

List of Tables and Illustrations

Fig. 1. Kunstkamera, St. Petersburg (center) On the left, the Russian Academy of Sciences, St. Petersburg Branch (Courtesy of Kunstkamera, St. Petersburg)	44
Table 1. Leibniz's Classification of Languages of 1710 (From Richter 1946, Appendix)	46
Fig. 2. Messerschmidt's Itinerary in Western and Central Siberia (From Jarosch 1962-77, Teil 5)	90
Fig. 3. Chaplin's map of Siberia added by Bering to his report to the Admiralty in 1730 (Courtesy of Niedersächsische Staats- und Universitätsbiblothek, Göttingen)	106
Fig. 4. Müller's Itinerary during the Second Kamchatka Expedition, 1733-1743 (From Black and Buse 1989)	113
Table 2. Müller's Ethnographic Instructions to Fischer (1740)	128
Table 3. Müller's Beschreibung der sibirischen Völker (Description of Siberian Peoples)	135
Table 4. Vocabulary of Siberian Languages, according to J.E. Fischer's Manuscript	139
Fig. 5. Gerhard Friedrich Müller (Miller) (From <i>Istoriia Sibiri</i> 1999)	157
Table 5. The Linnaeus Apostles, 1745-1796	172
Fig. 6. Niebuhr's Itinerary during the Danish-German Expedition to Arabia, 1761-1767 (From Hansen 1964)	180
Fig. 7. Carsten Niebuhr in Arab costume (From <i>Reisebeschreibung nach Arabien</i> , 1774-78, Tab. LXXI) (Courtesy of Niedersächsische Staats- und Universitätsbiblothek, Göttingen)	193
Table 6. Ethnos-terms in A.L. Schlözer's Early Works, 1771-1775	216
Fig. 8. August Ludwig Schlözer (From <i>Allgemeine Deutsche Bibliothek</i> 43(1), 1780)	244
Table 7. Ethnological Discourse in Asia, Europe, and the United States, 1710-1808	248
Table 8. Ethnographic Museums in the Nineteenth Century, 1816-1894	269

Preface

The present book reports on research on the early history of anthropology in Europe, Asia, and North America conducted over the past twenty years. In April 1988, I completed a lengthy manuscript on 'The Emergence of Ethnology in Göttingen, c.1770,' which the Department of Cultural Anthropology at the University of Leiden accepted as a M.A. thesis (Vermeulen 1988). In this thesis, written in Dutch, I argued that ethnology had originated in eighteenth-century Germany when two professors of history at the University of Göttingen, August Ludwig Schlözer and Johann Christoph Gatterer introduced two concepts for that study, Völkerkunde and Ethnographie. According to the information then available, it was in their work (published between 1771 and 1778) that these concepts, together with variants such as ethnographisch (ethnographic) and Ethnograph (ethnographer), first surfaced as the names of a new academic discipline. In the years 1991-95, thanks to a doctoral fellowship from the Centre of Non-Western Studies in Leiden (later Research School CNWS), I had the opportunity to check these data in the university library of Göttingen and in other libraries, museums, and research institutes in Germany, Scotland, England, Austria, Hungary, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, and Russia. In the course of my investigations, I found much evidence supporting these suppositions and came to the conclusion that there had indeed been a fruitful period in the final quarter of the eighteenth century during which ethnography and ethnology could be said to have come into existence. The astonishing fact was not that this material was unfamiliar to contemporary scholars but, rather, that the post-World War II secondary literature had not or not sufficiently acknowledged it. However, after attending a conference at Halle, Central Germany, in 1996, I became aware that these events had been preceded by an earlier stage, during which ethnography might be said to have originated in the field. After studying the relevant material, I concluded that both periods are part of a process of conceptualization beginning in the early eighteenth century. Thus, ethnography originated in the field, was subsequently introduced as ethnology (Völkerkunde) in scholarly discourse at the University of Göttingen, and then exported abroad.

Acknowledgements

Over the years I have received much valuable support from family, friends, and institutions. For funding various *étappes* of this study, I am grateful to the Research School CNWS, Leiden University, for supporting my research from 1991 to 1995; the Netherlands Organization of Scientific Research NWO in The Hague for sponsoring conference trips during the 1990s; the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD) in Bonn for financing two research scholarships in 1992 and 1993; Göttingen State and University Library and the Institute of Ethnology

of the University of Göttingen for facilitating my research since 1991; and the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology in Halle (Saale) for inviting me as a guest from 2006 to 2008.

I am indebted to my supervisors, colleagues, and friends for their invaluable teaching and encouragement. First, the professors at Leiden who taught me anthropology, history, or history of anthropology: the late G.W. Locher, A.A. Gerbrands, P.E. de Josselin de Jong, and P. Kloos; as well as H.J.M. Claessen, E. Postel-Coster, A.J. Kuper, J.C. Heesterman, and D.H.A. Kolff. Second, my colleagues from the 'Oosterse Club' in Leiden: Bas ter Haar Romeny, Laban Kaptein, and Dirk Kruisheer. Third, my peers: Henk Maier, Rob de Ridder, Roy Jordaan, Anke Niehof, Ad Boeren, the late Kees Epskamp (1950-2003), Sjoerd Zanen, the late Bert van den Hoek (1951-2001), Jos Platenkamp, Elke van der Hoeven and Gérard Geurten, Carla Risseeuw, Dirk and Ankie Nijland, Jan Brouwer, Roger and Robert Busschots, Jerry Mager, Peter Richardus, Sander Adelaar, the late Stefan Elders (1965-2007), Willem van der Molen, Frans de Haan, Paul Folmer, Metje Postma, and Bal Gopal Shrestha. Finally, my friends Tonneke Beijers, Else Denninghoff Stelling, Mascha Toppenberg, Annette van Houwelingen, Joop Goosen, Joep Noordman, Hans Kouwenhoven, Bas Duindam, Charles Beringer, Cor Hendriks, Peter Konter and Yvonne Lammers, Feng and Anna Souverijn, Wim Versteegen, Peter Willegers, and my neighbors John Bakker and José van der Molen, Peter van Hartevelt and Michèle Wernars, Pim Rietbroek, Marco Tang, and Frank Borst in Leiden.

I owe a great debt of gratitude to Robert E. Bieder, Jozien Driessen-van het Reve, John Eidson, Wieland Hintzsche, Peter Hoffmann, Bas ter Haar Romeny, Laban Kaptein, Dirk Nijland, and Sjoerd Zanen for reading several chapters; to Hans Claessen for polishing the bibliography; to Peter Richardus and Roy Jordaan for improving my English. Of the CNWS staff, I thank Ilona Beumer, Willem Vogelsang, and Wilma Trommelen. I am also grateful to Arie de Ruijter (Tilburg), Paul Streumer (Utrecht), Jan Pouwer (Zwolle), René and Rita Wassing (Voorburg), the late Albert Trouwborst (1928-2007) and Jean Kommers (Nijmegen).

In Germany, I thank Edith Lumma, Burkhard Funck and Diane Neemann, Martin Gierl, Rolf and Gabi Hussmann, Erhard Schlesier, Manfred Urban, Peter Fuchs, Brigitta Benzing, Gundolf Krüger, Brigitta Hauser-Schäublin, Ulrich Braukämper, Hans Erich Bödeker, János Gulya, Swen Alpers, the late Frank Dougherty (1952-1994), Norbert Klatt (all Göttingen); Jann Brouer and Heike Schirm, Thomas Theye (Bremen); Gabi Alex (Heidelberg); Michael Prager (Münster); Helga Lühmann-Frester (Hoya); Wolfgang Liedtke and Bernhard Streck (Leipzig); Ulli Wannhoff (Berlin). In Switzerland, Andreas and Kerstin König (Winterthur). In Halle (Saale), I thank Wieland and Elisabeth Hintzsche, Heike Heklau, Günter Mühlpfordt, Erich Donnert; Chris Hann, Günther Schlee, Franz and Keebet von Benda-Beckmann, Otto Habeck, Kathrin Niehuus, Bettina Mann, Katharina Gernet, Brian Donahoe, Merle Schatz, Kirill Istomin, and Sayana Namsaraeva. In Russia, Boris Djubo, Natalja Pavlovna Kopaneva, and Maria V. Stanyukovich (St. Petersburg); Aleksandr Christianovich Elert (Novosibirsk); and Alexei Elfimov (Moscow). In Hungary, Mihály Sárkány and István Sántha (Budapest).

In Great Britain, my thanks go to Alan and Joy Barnard (Edinburgh), Adam and Jessica Kuper (London). In Canada, to Ken Wallace (Halifax) and Gregory Forth (Edmonton). In France, Jean-Claude Galey, Claude Blanckaert (Paris), and Thomas Schippers (Nice). In the Czech Republic, Václav Hubinger (Prague) and Petr Skalník (Pardubice). In Slovakia, Zita Škovierová and Kornélia Jakubíková (Bratislava) for assistance during research on Kollár.

I am indebted to Klaus Schmidt, Renate Essi, and Rüdiger Heyn-Zielhardt of the Journal Indexing Section (*Arbeitsstelle Zeitschriften-Index*) of the Göttingen Academy of Sciences, and to the staff members of the SUB Göttingen, especially Helmut Rohlfing and Reimer Eck, *für ihre unermüdliche Hilfsbereitschaft bei der Auftreibung obskurer Quellen alter Herkunft*.

Last but not least, I thank the directors and my colleagues of the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology in Halle (Saale), Germany, for stimulating discussions and exchanges.

Met dank aan mijn ouders en leermeesters, Anett en Erato, aan wie ik dit boek opdraag.