



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Political organization in multi-level settings : Mexican and Latin American parties and party systems after decentralization**

Harbers, I.

### **Citation**

Harbers, I. (2010, April 22). *Political organization in multi-level settings : Mexican and Latin American parties and party systems after decentralization*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/15289>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/15289>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

**Political Organization in Multi-level Settings:**

**Mexican and Latin American Parties and  
Party Systems after Decentralization**

*Proefschrift*

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,

op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. P.F. van der Heijden,

volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

te verdedigen op donderdag 22 april 2010

klokke 15:00 uur

door

*Imke Harbers*

geboren te Papenburg (Ems), Duitsland in 1978

*Promotiecommissie:*

*Promotor:*

Prof.dr. Peter Mair, Universiteit Leiden & European University Institute

*Copromotores:*

Dr. Barbara Hogenboom, CEDLA

Dr. Petr Kopecký, Universiteit Leiden

*Overige Leden:*

Prof.dr. Manuel Alcántara Sández, Universidad de Salamanca

Prof.dr. Michiel Baud, CEDLA

Prof.dr. Ingrid van Biezen, Universiteit Leiden

*The more that you read,  
the more things you will know.  
The more that you learn,  
the more places you'll go.*

*Dr. Seuss*



# Contents

---

Tables	vii
Figures	viii
Abbreviations and Acronyms	ix
Preface	xi
Acknowledgments	xiii
<b>CHAPTER 1</b>	
<b>Decentralization and Its Consequences in Latin America</b>	1
Research Questions	3
Comparative Decentralization in New Democracies	6
On Methodology: Studying the Effects of Decentralization on Parties and Party Systems	8
The Chapters that Follow	13
<b>CHAPTER 2</b>	
<b>Political Organization and Decentralized Governance: Concepts and Expectations</b>	15
The Concept of Decentralization	16
Decentralization and the Development of Nationalized Party Systems in Latin America	18
Decentralization and Party Organizations in Latin America	29
Conclusions	38
<b>CHAPTER 3</b>	
<b>The Rise of Multi-level Politics</b>	39
From Centralized to Decentralized Governance	40
Pathways towards Decentralization	51
Centralization and Decentralization in Mexico	61
Conclusions	78
<b>CHAPTER 4</b>	
<b>The Dynamics of Multi-level Electoral Competition: Subnational and National Party Systems in Mexico</b>	81
Upholding Goliath: The Development of Mexican Party Systems	84
The Diversification of State Party Systems	91
Spillover: The Regionalization of Federal Elections	111
Conclusions	120

<b>CHAPTER 5</b>	
<b>Decentralization and the Challenge to Party Cohesion in Mexico</b>	123
The Predominance of the Center: Traditional Patterns of Party Organization in Mexico	124
Studying Parties and Decentralization in Mexico	132
The Development of Public Funding in Mexico	135
Challenging Centralized Control: The Changing Distribution of Resources	145
Dealing with the Challenge: Towards More Subunit Autonomy	154
Conclusions	160
<b>CHAPTER 6</b>	
<b>Decentralization and Political Organization in Comparative Perspective</b>	163
Decentralization and the Development of Nationalized Party Systems	165
Decentralization and Party Cohesion in Latin America	178
Conclusions	189
<b>CHAPTER 7</b>	
<b>Conclusions and Implications</b>	191
Parties in Multi-level Settings: Concepts and Consequences	192
Implications and Avenues for Future Research	197
<b>Appendix A</b>	
Interviews	203
<b>Appendix B</b>	
Overview of Major Electoral Reforms in Mexico, 1946–1996	207
<b>Appendix C</b>	
State-level Party Finance Information Included in the Party Finance Database, 1996–2008	210
<b>Appendix D</b>	
Streams of Public Funding and Political Money in Mexico	212
<b>References</b>	213
<b>Samenvatting</b>	237
<b>Curriculum Vitae</b>	241

## Tables

---

4.1	The Diversification of State Party Systems	100
4.2	Regression on Party Vote Shares in Federal Legislative Elections	114
4.3	Marginal Effects on Federal Elections	114
5.1	Distribution of Intra-party Transfers to States	150
5.2	Volatility in Intra-party Transfers, 1998–2007	152
6.1	Administrative Divisions and Included Elections	166
6.2	Country Means for Dependent and Independent Variables	170
6.3	Descriptive Statistics for the Party System Nationalization Analysis	172
6.4	Regression on Party System Nationalization Scores	176
6.5	Measuring Cohesion	181
6.6	Descriptive Statistics for the Party Cohesion Analysis	183
6.7	Regression on Party Cohesion	187



## Figures

---

1.1	Research Design – Types of Co-variational Evidence	12
2.1	The Multi-level Party System	25
2.2	Patterns of Party Organization	32
3.1	Concentration of Power, by Region and Decade	45
3.2	Latin American Average of Fiscal Decentralization, by Decade	47
3.3	Country Averages of Fiscal Decentralization Scale, by Decade	48
3.4	Latin American Countries with Democratically Elected Subnational Officials	50
3.5	Pathways towards Decentralization	55
3.6	State-level Expenditure in Mexico, 1989–2007	72
3.7	Expenditure of Mexican State Governments on Wages, 1989–2007	73
3.8	Mexico’s Score on the Polity IV Democracy Measure	74
4.1	Regional Distribution of Electoral Support in the 2006 Presidential Election	83
4.2	Share of Governor’s Party in State Legislatures	93
4.3	Number of Parties in State Legislative Elections	95
4.4	Average Vote Share of Subnational Parties in State Legislative Elections	98
4.5	Distribution of Party Support in State Legislative Elections, 2000–2003	104
4.6	Party System Regionalization, 1991–2006	111
4.7	Development of PRD Vote Share in Federal Elections, 1991–2006	118
5.1	The Predominance of Public Funding in Mexico	138
5.2	Ratio of Federal-to-State Public Funding per Voter	146
5.3	Percentage of Intra-party Transfers of Federal Public Funding	147
5.4	Composition of Subnational Party Income	148
6.1	Party System Nationalization in Latin America	173
6.2	Average Party System Nationalization, by Level of Decentralization	174
6.3	Predicted Level of Party System Nationalization for Values of the Fiscal Decentralization Scale	177
6.4	Predicted Level of Party Cohesion	188

## Abbreviations and Acronyms

---

AMLO	Andrés Manuel López Obrador (Mexico)
CD	Democratic Current (Corriente Democrática - Mexico)
CDE	State Executive Committee (Comité Directivo Estatal)
CEN	National Executive Committee (Comité Ejecutivo Nacional)
CIDAC	Center of Research for Development (Centro de Investigación para el Desarrollo - Mexico)
COFIPE	Federal Code of Electoral Institutions and Procedures (Código Federal de Instituciones y Procedimientos Electorales - Mexico)
FDN	National Democratic Front (Frente Democrático Nacional - Mexico)
FES	Friedrich Ebert Stiftung
IDEA	International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance
IFE	Federal Electoral Institute (Instituto Federal Electoral - Mexico)
IMF	International Monetary Fund
ISI	Import-Substituting Industrialization
KAS	Konrad Adenauer Stiftung
LOPPE	Federal Law of Political Organizations and Electoral Processes (Ley Federal de Organizaciones Políticas y Procesos Electorales - Mexico)
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
PAN	National Action Party (Partido Acción Nacional - Mexico)
PANAL	New Alliance Party (Partido Nueva Alianza - Mexico)
PARM	Authentic Party of the Mexican Revolution (Partido Auténtico de la Revolución Mexicana - Mexico)
PAY	Yucatán Alliance Party (Partido Alianza por Yucatán - Mexico)
PEMEX	Mexican Petroleum Company (Petróleos Mexicanos - Mexico)
PES	Social Encounter Party (Partido Encuentro Social - Mexico)
PJ	Justicialist Party (Partido Justicialista - Argentina)
PMS	Mexican Socialist Party (Partido Mexicano Socialista - Mexico)
PNR	Revolutionary National Party (Partido Nacional Revolucionario - Mexico)
PR	Proportional Representation
PPS	Socialist Popular Party (Partido Popular Socialista - Mexico)
PRD	Party of the Democratic Revolution (Partido de la Revolución Democrática - Mexico)

X

PRI	Party of the Institutionalized Revolution (Partido Revolucionario Institucional - Mexico)
PRM	Party of the Mexican Revolution (Partido de la Revolución Mexicana - Mexico)
PRONASOL	National Solidarity Program (Programa Nacional de Solidaridad - Mexico)
PVEM	Ecologist Green Party of Mexico (Partido Verde Ecologista de México - Mexico)
SNTE	National Union of Education Workers (Sindicato Nacional de Trabajadores de Educación - Mexico)
TRIFE	Federal Electoral Tribunal (Tribunal Federal Electoral - Mexico)
UDC	Coahuila Democratic Unity Party (Partido Unidad Democrática de Coahuila - Mexico)

## Preface

---

My interest in the relationship between decentralization and political parties developed when I was a junior researcher at the German Development Institute (DIE) in Bonn. Upon completing my MA in 2004, I entered the world of policy advice and became part of a research group commissioned to assess decentralization reforms in Ecuador and to map the role of development cooperation in the process. After decades spent focusing on technical cooperation, the development community has now turned its attention to issues of “good governance”. Decentralization is seen as a core component of state modernization programs and considerable efforts are devoted to promoting it. By December 2008 the Inter-American Development Bank alone had granted loans for more than US\$1 billion to support decentralization and the development of subnational government in the Americas (Inter-American Development Bank 2009a). At the same time, however, the realization that development cannot be brought about by external actors and therefore requires the articulation of domestic political strategies has renewed interest in political parties. Party-building has become a prominent item on the agenda of the development community. The thirteen organizations surveyed by the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (IDEA), which include the Netherlands Institute for Multiparty Democracy (NIMD) and various German political foundations (e.g. Friedrich Ebert Stiftung), currently spend almost €140 million per year on party assistance (Catón 2007: 12). Yet, while both decentralization and party-building are focal points for development cooperation, the way decentralization affects parties, and how parties are shaped by the state reforms recommended by international institutions, remain poorly understood. This study seeks to shed light on this important relationship.



## Acknowledgments

---

One of the most gratifying aspects of writing a dissertation is that, at the end of the long process, one has an opportunity to explicitly thank the people involved and to acknowledge some of the debts incurred along the way. I am grateful to my supervisors, Barbara Hogenboom, Petr Kopecký and Peter Mair, for their continuous support and guidance. My colleagues at Leiden University also offered comments and criticisms at various stages of this project. I am particularly indebted to Robin Best, Veerle van Doeveren, Hila Federer-Shtayer, Huib Pellikaan, Gerardo Scherlis, and Maria Spirova. In addition to their feedback on my academic work, my Leiden colleagues provided support as I made my first steps in the world of academia. As I tried to find my feet in both teaching and research they were an invaluable source of knowledge and advice. Christel Koop and Sarah de Lange, two former Leiden colleagues, also made many helpful suggestions along the way.

The fieldwork upon which large segments of the dissertation are based would not have been possible without the support and enthusiasm of a number of people in Mexico. First and foremost, I am indebted to my interview partners, who graciously shared their insights about Mexican politics. I owe them many thanks for their willingness to make time in their busy schedules and for the patience with which they answered my questions. Several Mexican scholars provided food for thought in the early stages of my fieldwork and helped me set up interviews. I am especially grateful to Edith Antal, Rogelio Hernández Rodríguez, Carlos Alba, Jean-François Prud'homme and Carlos Moreno Jaimes. For continuous encouragement and practical support, I thank Valeska Hesse, Kerstin von Bremen, Samuel Aguilar Posadas, and Julio Torres Jiménez. The Casa de los Amigos provided a fantastic base for my Mexico City operations, and the scholars, activists and travelers that passed through the Casa's doors made coming home after long research days both stimulating and enjoyable. I cherish the hours we spent discussing political and social developments, but also our conversations about the more mundane puzzles of everyday life in Mexico. Financial support for my fieldwork was provided by the Leiden University Fund (LUF), the Netherlands Institute of Government (NIG), and the Institute of Political Science at Leiden University. The European University Institute (EUI), which hosted me during the 2008 spring semester, was an excellent environment in which to organize and analyze the data I brought back from Mexico. During these early stages of "writing up" the input I received from EUI graduate students and faculty members was especially helpful.

The chapters of this dissertation draw on papers presented at a number of conferences and workshops. The Leiden PhD seminar and the Latin American Research Group (OLA) at CEDLA were valuable forums for critical feedback, especially during the early stages of the project. Previous versions of the analysis contained in this study have been presented at the Southern Political Science Association (2007), the Latin American Studies Association (2007), the ECPR Joint Sessions of Workshops (2008), the ECPR Graduate Conference (2008), the Politicogenetmaal (2008), and the Midwest Political Science Association (2009). I thank the discussants and participants at these meetings for their helpful comments and suggestions. An earlier version of the party system analysis in Chapter Six is forthcoming in *Comparative Political Studies*.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my family and friends. Throughout my many years of study, their encouragement has been of decisive importance. I am especially grateful to Ellen, Ingeborg and Susanne, whose friendship has been a source of stability throughout these years of wandering. My sincere gratitude goes to the Salinas family for welcoming me into their home and for sparking my interest in Mexico long before I entered the world of political science. My biggest debt is to my family, old and new, to whom Latin America is mostly a faraway place taking me away from them, and who nevertheless always support my going there. Elize took a keen interest in what I was doing. Heike and Magret supported me in more ways than I can count. Armèn somehow managed to strike a delicate balance between tough criticism and encouragement. His unwavering optimism is contagious, and was a crucial ingredient in the completion of this project. I regret not being able to show this study to my father, who I know would have had many comments and suggestions, but I am glad to share this experience with my mother and sister. I would like to dedicate this book to my family, with my love and gratitude.