



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Pleading for diversity : the church Caspar Coolhaes wanted

Gottschalk, Linda Stuckrath

Citation

Gottschalk, L. S. (2016, April 6). *Pleading for diversity : the church Caspar Coolhaes wanted*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/38762>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/38762>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/38762> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Gottschalk, Linda Stuckrath

Title: Pleading for diversity : the church Caspar Coolhaes wanted

Issue Date: 2016-04-06

Pleading for Diversity:
The Church Caspar Coolhaes Wanted

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,

volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

te verdedigen op woensdag 6 april 2016

klokke 10.00 uur

door

Linda Stuckrath Gottschalk
geboren te Pittsburgh, PA, V.S.

in 1959

Promotor:

Prof.dr. E.G.E. van der Wall

Co-promotor:

Dr. J.W. Buisman

Promotiecommissie:

Prof.dr. W. Janse (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Prof.dr. A.F. de Jong

Prof.dr. M.G.K. van Veen (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Table of contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Abbreviations | v |
| Technical notes | vi |
| Introduction | 1 |
| A forerunner of Arminius and the Remonstrants? | 4 |
| Overview of Coolhaes study: some trends and aspects | 10 |
| | |
| Part I: The life Coolhaes led: a biographical sketch | 20 |
| | |
| Chapter 1: From silent monk to preacher of reform | 20 |
| Preaching in the Palatinate | 24 |
| To Deventer in the “miracle year” | 25 |
| Examinations in Essen | 29 |
| Permanent immigration | 34 |
| Theological disagreement in liberated Leiden | 39 |
| A new university | 45 |
| At home between Rapenburg and Papengracht | 49 |
| Coornhert and the Leiden disputation | 51 |
| | |
| Chapter 2: The “Coolhaes affair”: a struggle for dominance | 54 |
| Re-shuffle the preachers? | 55 |
| Consistorial innovation | 57 |
| Who is an elder? | 59 |
| Attempts at compromise | 62 |
| The magistracy strikes back | 64 |
| Taking it outside | 67 |
| Tilius and Coornhert intercede | 71 |
| Unapologetic <i>Apology</i> | 74 |
| More division | 76 |
| Successful arbitration | 79 |
| | |
| Chapter 3: Middelburg trials (1581) | 83 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| The stage is set | 83 |
| The Middelburg theses | 86 |
| A seeming about-face | 90 |
| More trials: The Hague (1581) and Haarlem (1582) | 94 |
| Revisiting the theses | 96 |
| Rushing to the defense | 98 |
| Making an end | 100 |
| | |
| Chapter 4: Distilling spirits and theology | 103 |
| Reinventing himself | 105 |
| Continuing to incite | 107 |
| Tolerant Leiden | 109 |
| New hope | 111 |
| A peculiar shop | 114 |
| Defending himself: pamphlets and <i>hutspot</i> | 118 |
| | |
| Chapter 5: Mature preoccupations | 123 |
| Sebastian Franck <i>via</i> Coolhaes | 123 |
| Defending Mennonites and others: the “Severe Edict” | 134 |
| Almanacs and superstitions | 143 |
| Theology and academia: Arminius and Gomarus | 148 |
| “Hard food” served at Leiden University | 151 |
| Reflections on a long life | 156 |
| | |
| Part II: The church Coolhaes wanted: an ecclesiology | 163 |
| | |
| Chapter 6: Through a Spiritualist prism | 163 |
| Stepchildren and other rebels | 165 |
| His closest Spiritualist relatives | 168 |
| Individualistic, critical, tolerant | 173 |
| Was Coolhaes a mystic? | 175 |
| True baptism | 179 |
| Pictures of the invisible | 180 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Spiritual eating | 183 |
| Gansfort, Hardenberg, Hoen | 187 |
| Schwenckfeld and the non-physical flesh | 189 |
| Looking through the prism | 192 |
| | |
| Chapter 7: Church and state: under good guardianship | 195 |
| Moses must rule | 199 |
| Model for a Christian magistrate | 201 |
| Giving each other a hand | 207 |
| Drafting for order | 209 |
| Some common ground with Coornhert | 212 |
| Sermons from Gwalther | 216 |
| | |
| Chapter 8: The clergy: what makes a good preacher? | 222 |
| Faithful servants | 222 |
| False and hypocritical | 226 |
| More than the Bible | 230 |
| The preacher's context I: Order or power? | 233 |
| The preacher's context II: Amputation and other discipline | 239 |
| The preacher's context III: Education versus spiritual preparation | 240 |
| | |
| Chapter 9: The congregation: pleading for diversity | 245 |
| Visible foundation and biblical interpretation | 247 |
| Inclusion and exclusion | 251 |
| Visible signs of inclusion: physical sacraments | 254 |
| Not covenants but reformations | 257 |
| From violence to toleration | 263 |
| Confessional diversity | 266 |
| Christian freedom | 270 |
| Predestination and "TULIP" | 274 |
| Personal consequences of freedom | 276 |
| | |
| Conclusion | 279 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| A portrait of a tolerant, Reformed, Spiritualist | 279 |
| The ideal church | 281 |
| Relationship between life and thought | 284 |
| In his time and beyond | 285 |
| Epilogue | 288 |
| | |
| Bibliography | 290 |
| Summary | 318 |
| Samenvatting: “Een pleidooi voor diversiteit: De kerk die Caspar Coolhaes voor ogen stond” | 321 |
| | |
| Index of persons | 324 |
| Curriculum vitae | 328 |

Abbreviations

| | |
|-----------|--|
| AD | Archief Delft |
| BBKL | <i>Biographisch-Bibliographisches Kirchenlexikon</i> |
| BLGNP | <i>Biografisch lexicon voor de geschiedenis van het Nederlandse protestantisme</i> |
| BWDN | <i>Biographisch woordenboek der Nederlanden</i> |
| BWNZL | <i>Biographisch woordenboek der noord- en zuidnederlandsche letterkunde</i> |
| BWPGN | <i>Biographisch woordenboek van protestantsche godgeleerden in Nederland</i> |
| CBR | De Centrale Bibliotheek Rotterdam |
| ELO | Erfgoed Leiden en omstreken archieven |
| HEG/SAE | Haus der Essener Geschichte/Stadtarchiv |
| HUA | Het Utrechts Archief |
| LHAKo | Landesarchivverwaltung Rheinland-Pfalz/Landeshauptarchiv Koblenz |
| NAKG/DRCH | <i>Nederlands Archief voor Kerkgeschiedenis/Dutch Review of Church History</i> |
| NDB/ADB | <i>Neue Deutsche Biographie/Allgemeine Deutsche Biographie</i> |
| NL-HaNA | Nationaal Archief, Den Haag, Collectie Realia |
| NNBW | <i>Nieuw Nederlandsch Biografisch Woordenboek</i> |
| OER | <i>Oxford Encyclopedia of the Reformation</i> |
| SAB | Stadsarchief en Athenaeumbibliotheek Deventer |
| SAA | Stadsarchief Amsterdam |

| | |
|------------|--------------------------------------|
| SAMH | Streekarchief Midden-Holland |
| UBL | Universitaire Bibliotheken Leiden |
| <i>WMV</i> | <i>Werken der Marnix-Vereeniging</i> |

Technical notes

Translations into English from Coolhaes or others in the text or the footnotes have been made by the author, unless otherwise indicated.

Spelling of English words is according to American English conventions.

Citation is according to *The Chicago Manual of Style*, sixteenth edition (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2010). Please note that, according to Chicago style, footnotes and bibliographic citations of the same work differ from each other in various ways, especially in the use of commas, periods, and parentheses. For examples, see: www.chicagomanualofstyle.org/tools_citationguide.html (accessed Feb. 18, 2016).