



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Pleading for diversity : the church Caspar Coolhaes wanted

Gottschalk, Linda Stuckrath

Citation

Gottschalk, L. S. (2016, April 6). *Pleading for diversity : the church Caspar Coolhaes wanted*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/38762>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/38762>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/38762> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Gottschalk, Linda Stuckrath

Title: Pleading for diversity : the church Caspar Coolhaes wanted

Issue Date: 2016-04-06

Pleading for Diversity:
The Church Caspar Coolhaes Wanted

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,

volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

te verdedigen op woensdag 6 april 2016

klokke 10.00 uur

door

Linda Stuckrath Gottschalk
geboren te Pittsburgh, PA, V.S.

in 1959

Promotor:

Prof.dr. E.G.E. van der Wall

Co-promotor:

Dr. J.W. Buisman

Promotiecommissie:

Prof.dr. W. Janse (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Prof.dr. A.F. de Jong

Prof.dr. M.G.K. van Veen (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Table of contents

Abbreviations	v
Technical notes	vi
Introduction	1
A forerunner of Arminius and the Remonstrants?	4
Overview of Coolhaes study: some trends and aspects	10
Part I: The life Coolhaes led: a biographical sketch	20
Chapter 1: From silent monk to preacher of reform	20
Preaching in the Palatinate	24
To Deventer in the “miracle year”	25
Examinations in Essen	29
Permanent immigration	34
Theological disagreement in liberated Leiden	39
A new university	45
At home between Rapenburg and Papengracht	49
Coornhert and the Leiden disputation	51
Chapter 2: The “Coolhaes affair”: a struggle for dominance	54
Re-shuffle the preachers?	55
Consistorial innovation	57
Who is an elder?	59
Attempts at compromise	62
The magistracy strikes back	64
Taking it outside	67
Tilius and Coornhert intercede	71
Unapologetic <i>Apology</i>	74
More division	76
Successful arbitration	79
Chapter 3: Middelburg trials (1581)	83

The stage is set	83
The Middelburg theses	86
A seeming about-face	90
More trials: The Hague (1581) and Haarlem (1582)	94
Revisiting the theses	96
Rushing to the defense	98
Making an end	100
Chapter 4: Distilling spirits and theology	103
Reinventing himself	105
Continuing to incite	107
Tolerant Leiden	109
New hope	111
A peculiar shop	114
Defending himself: pamphlets and <i>hutspot</i>	118
Chapter 5: Mature preoccupations	123
Sebastian Franck <i>via</i> Coolhaes	123
Defending Mennonites and others: the “Severe Edict”	134
Almanacs and superstitions	143
Theology and academia: Arminius and Gomarus	148
“Hard food” served at Leiden University	151
Reflections on a long life	156
Part II: The church Coolhaes wanted: an ecclesiology	163
Chapter 6: Through a Spiritualist prism	163
Stepchildren and other rebels	165
His closest Spiritualist relatives	168
Individualistic, critical, tolerant	173
Was Coolhaes a mystic?	175
True baptism	179
Pictures of the invisible	180

Spiritual eating	183
Gansfort, Hardenberg, Hoen	187
Schwenckfeld and the non-physical flesh	189
Looking through the prism	192
Chapter 7: Church and state: under good guardianship	195
Moses must rule	199
Model for a Christian magistrate	201
Giving each other a hand	207
Drafting for order	209
Some common ground with Coornhert	212
Sermons from Gwalther	216
Chapter 8: The clergy: what makes a good preacher?	222
Faithful servants	222
False and hypocritical	226
More than the Bible	230
The preacher's context I: Order or power?	233
The preacher's context II: Amputation and other discipline	239
The preacher's context III: Education versus spiritual preparation	240
Chapter 9: The congregation: pleading for diversity	245
Visible foundation and biblical interpretation	247
Inclusion and exclusion	251
Visible signs of inclusion: physical sacraments	254
Not covenants but reformations	257
From violence to toleration	263
Confessional diversity	266
Christian freedom	270
Predestination and "TULIP"	274
Personal consequences of freedom	276
Conclusion	279

A portrait of a tolerant, Reformed, Spiritualist	279
The ideal church	281
Relationship between life and thought	284
In his time and beyond	285
Epilogue	288
Bibliography	290
Summary	318
Samenvatting: “Een pleidooi voor diversiteit: De kerk die Caspar Coolhaes voor ogen stond”	321
Index of persons	324
Curriculum vitae	328

Abbreviations

AD	Archief Delft
BBKL	<i>Biographisch-Bibliographisches Kirchenlexikon</i>
BLGNP	<i>Biografisch lexicon voor de geschiedenis van het Nederlandse protestantisme</i>
BWDN	<i>Biographisch woordenboek der Nederlanden</i>
BWNZL	<i>Biographisch woordenboek der noord- en zuidnederlandsche letterkunde</i>
BWPGN	<i>Biographisch woordenboek van protestantsche godgeleerden in Nederland</i>
CBR	De Centrale Bibliotheek Rotterdam
ELO	Erfgoed Leiden en omstreken archieven
HEG/SAE	Haus der Essener Geschichte/Stadtarchiv
HUA	Het Utrechts Archief
LHAKo	Landesarchivverwaltung Rheinland-Pfalz/Landeshauptarchiv Koblenz
NAKG/DRCH	<i>Nederlands Archief voor Kerkgeschiedenis/Dutch Review of Church History</i>
NDB/ADB	<i>Neue Deutsche Biographie/Allgemeine Deutsche Biographie</i>
NL-HaNA	Nationaal Archief, Den Haag, Collectie Realia
NNBW	<i>Nieuw Nederlandsch Biografisch Woordenboek</i>
OER	<i>Oxford Encyclopedia of the Reformation</i>
SAB	Stadsarchief en Athenaeumbibliotheek Deventer
SAA	Stadsarchief Amsterdam

SAMH	Streekarchief Midden-Holland
UBL	Universitaire Bibliotheken Leiden
<i>WMV</i>	<i>Werken der Marnix-Vereeniging</i>

Technical notes

Translations into English from Coolhaes or others in the text or the footnotes have been made by the author, unless otherwise indicated.

Spelling of English words is according to American English conventions.

Citation is according to *The Chicago Manual of Style*, sixteenth edition (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2010). Please note that, according to Chicago style, footnotes and bibliographic citations of the same work differ from each other in various ways, especially in the use of commas, periods, and parentheses. For examples, see: www.chicagomanualofstyle.org/tools_citationguide.html (accessed Feb. 18, 2016).