Hispaniola - hell or home? : Decolonizing grand narratives about intercultural interactions at Concepción de la Vega (1494-1564)

Kulstad, P.M.

7 INTERPRETATION AND COMPARISON

7.1 Introduction

After presenting and re-examining the historical, archaeological, architectural, and oral history data available about Concepción in the previous chapters, this chapter will focus on re-interpreting the intercultural interactions that occurred there during our period of study (1494-1564). More specifically, it seeks to answer the main question: What environmental, sociocultural, and biophysical intercultural interactions that occurred at Concepción in the early colonial period, contributed in the formation of today's multicultural Dominican society? This is due to the fact that lifeways and deathways in Spanish-American colonial cities of the 16th century were structured by these different types of interaction (Ewen 1991; Deagan 1995a, 1996, 2004, 622), occurring simultaneously. Historical and archaeological evidence points to particularly intense interactions at Concepción, owing in large part to its condition as a mining town, where the quest for wealth often united disparate peoples (DeFrance 2003, 99; Kulstad 2008, 158).

Often, in archaeological research of this period, only one type of interaction has been highlighted for study, such as the biophysical interaction of intermarriage (Deagan 1996, 153), the sociocultural interaction of labor (Voss 2008), or the environmental interactions related to settlement patterns like the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan (Palm 1974; Pérez-Montás 1984). At the same time, research is limited to a single scale, often the artifact level, losing the nuances of the Structural and Site scales of analysis.

This research, however, takes a step back and acknowledges the existence of all three types of interactions at Concepción, albeit with different levels of influence. All of these interactions will be identified, and how they all are entangled in a Dominican Merengue (sensu Ortiz 1940, 1947; Rothchild 2015, 184), independent yet reciprocal (Sluyter 2001, 421). Special attention will be paid to the intercultural interactions which helped reach the eventual goal of integrating Indios (and those of African descent) into Spanish society through the following of religious and governmental mandates (McEwan 2001, 635).

Additionally, as explored in Chapter 2, this counterpoint also includes an interplay between the conceptual and the practice/material (Sluyter 2001; Vargas-Arenas 1990), also known as a "play of tropes" (Fernández 1991). Conceptual processes identify the "ideal," intended process that exists in the mind (Sluyter 2001, 425). These are often manifested in the colonial-administrative policies (Fernández 1991). The practice/ material processes deal with what was done (Sluyter 2001; Vargas-Arenas 1990). This includes not only the material record, but the associated actions related to these processes. Special attention will be paid to the moments of conflict between these two

processes, which should offer evidence of resistance and agency of non-Spanish groups.

Conceptually, the “ideal” colonial interactions included domination (Deagan 2011, 55; Rothchild 2015, 183), as well as classification structures created to explain where different individuals are located in relation to power. This was justified as necessary to convert all to Catholicism and the proper, “Spanish,” life (Deagan 2011, 43, 55). Also, colonial authorities were concerned with controlling men and their activities at the economic, political, and material scale. Concern for women and their activities came later, with the implementation of the Castas System in the 17th century (Rothchild 2015, 183). The most important mechanism to control populations was through physical separation. Originally instituted to protect Indigenous groups from perceived abuse (see Las Casas below), it later became the most overt form of control (Rothchild 2015, 188). Various social and environmental hierarchies were instituted, including settlement patterns, labor assignment, and sumptuary laws. These control mechanisms will be discussed in more detail below.

Conversely, material and practice processes were not so easily discerned. As stated in Chapter 2, primary documents only focus on overt, public and exotic behaviors, rather than the more mundane aspects of nonelite and non-Spanish lives (Graham 1998, 28-29; Liebmann and Murphy 2011b, 5); and excavation biases can often confuse interpretation. However, in spite of this, it has been possible to discern all three types of intercultural interactions at Concepción.

The rest of the chapter has been divided into two scales of interpretation: macro and micro. The macroscale interpretation is based on findings at a Site and Structure Scale, most eminent in environmental interactions, but with sociocultural and biophysical manifestations at a lesser degree. The microscale interpretation focuses on artifacts themselves, and the interplay between their intended and actual uses as reflected in their deposition in the landscape.

7.2 Macro Level Interpretation (Site and Structure Scale)

In this section, macro level interpretation has put together Site and Structure Scale because both of these scales rely heavily on the provenience patterning on the landscape. This was also done because, although there are differences in interactions at the Site and Structure Scale when it comes to environmental interactions, this difference is not so evident when dealing with sociocultural and biophysical interactions.

Environmental interactions will be discussed first, and will include subsections dividing the two scales. The section dealing with sociocultural interactions will focus on resistance, and the biophysical section will focus on intermixing, foodways, disease and deathways.

7.2.1 Environmental Interactions at Concepción

7.2.1.1 Site scale

Within the 16th century Spanish colonization model, the spatial and material reconfigurations of the environment were the most obvious and overt manifestations of the Crown's attempt to control intercultural interactions. In fact, one of the most distinctive characteristics of Spanish colonization of the Caribbean and the Americas was the highly organized spatial patterning it imposed on the landscape (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 85; Williams 1995, 115). This distribution was supposed to help in the conversion of all peoples into the ideal "Spanish" subject, faithfully Catholic, pure in blood, and cognizant of his social position (Deagan 2011, 43; Kulstad 2008, 2013b) (See discussion in Chapter 5).

Sauer (1966), a cultural geographer, conducted one of the first and most detailed analysis of how Caribbean peoples and landscapes were molded to fit Spanish colonial models (See Chapters 4 and 5). This was later adapted and expanded on by Sluyter (2001). In the Dominican Republic, Spanish settlement patterns, particularly their urban arrangement, has been an area mostly studied by preservation architects (González 1984; Pérez-Montás 1984, 1998; Prieto and Gautier 1992; Roca-Pezzoti 1984).

The separation of peoples through urbanization made it easier to evangelize and maintain Catholic precepts (Brewer-Carías 2007, 57). For various reasons (discussed at length in Chapter 4), four different urbanization models were instituted in the Concepción area:

- Palisade [*Empalizada*]
- Medieval *Casa Fuerte*
- Ibero-American Grid Town Plan
- Pueblo Tutelado

7.2.1.1.1 Precontact Indigenous settlements in the area occupied by Concepción (AD 800 - 1494)

However, before discussing the European urban settlement models, it is useful to give a short overview of the possible precontact Indigenous settlements that could have existed in the area occupied by Concepción. This section is mostly speculative and inductive, based on the small amount of information about precontact Indigenous peoples in the site area. Additionally, little evidence of an Indigenous settlement's associated static elements - mounds, postholes, hearths, hearthstones, etc., were recovered during the 1976-1995 excavations, due to the fact that excavations at Concepción stopped when the floor of Spanish masonry buildings was reached (Coste 2015).

This has made it difficult to compare Indigenous occupation of the landscape here with those undertaken by the NEXUS1492 project in northern Hispaniola (Herrera-

Malatesta 2016; Hofman and Hoogland 2015, 61–74; Hofman et al. 2008; Sonneman et al. 2016, 2; Ulloa-Hung 2014; Ulloa-Hung and Herrera-Malatesta 2015). More importantly, different excavation techniques, classification systems, and research scales of analysis were used by each project, further complicating comparison.

Three potential areas of precontact Indigenous settlement in the Concepción were identified in this investigation: The first Concepción fort, which lasted one year, was close to the Rio Verde, between 1-5 km north of the Concepción site. The second occupation, at the Concepción site, lasted until 1564. A third is the Rio Verde Mellacoid site, located approximately 2km northwest of the Concepción site.

Little can be said about the Rio Verde Mellacoid site. As stated in Chapter 3, the only pertinent information is that the cultural material gathered during two surveys (1971, 1977) was radiocarbon dated to be from AD 778 to AD 1148 (Veloz-Maggiolo et al. 1981), making it previous to Chicoid intrusions into the area (Caba 2018). In January 2014, a prospection undertaken by a group of NEXUS1492 researchers (Herrera-Malatesta, Keenhen, Kulstad, Ulloa-Hung, and Joffre), together with the corresponding archaeologist from the Ministry of Culture of the Dominican Republic (Coste), seemed to point to a small area of occupation, with little connection to the Concepción site.

The area of the first Concepción fort (occupied from 1494-1495) was not prospected as part of this research, given that the site is outside the geographical parameters of all the archaeological interventions compiled here (See Chapter 3). However, historical documents do seem to point towards a possible Chicoid settlement is its vicinity, given the Battles of La Vega timeline (Keegan and Hofman 2017, 146) (see Chapter 4).

At the Monasterio de San Francisco, there is a juxtaposition of a wall over a flexed body burial at the Monasterio de San Francisco (Fig. 11) heavily suggesting the existence of a precontact Indigenous occupation in this area. The lack of similar proof at the Fort campus could either be due to the fact that the precontact Indigenous settlement was relatively small and more centered in the Monasterio de San Francisco area, or simply be a consequence of the “Spanish floor” excavation bias imposed by the preservation architects during the 1976-1995 excavations.

7.2.1.1.2 European settlement layouts of Concepción

The way European settlement was laid out at Concepción changed four times during our period of study (1494-1495). In spite of this, certain conceptual elements of spatial division stayed the same throughout the period. The first constant was the conceptual division between urban and rural areas. The second was the belief in the need for a different type of settlement for inland locations. The third constant was the disregard for possible disasters (hurricanes and earthquakes, mainly) in the layout organization.

7.2.1.1.3 Palisade [empalizada] (1494-1495)

As explained in Chapter 4, Columbus set up various fortresses along the Cibao Valley to protect areas with gold deposits (Guerrero 2016: 15; Mira-Caballos 2010, 444). The following have been identified, in different combinations, by different authors: Santo Tomas de Jánico, Magdalena, Santiago, Santa Catalina, Esperanza, Concepción and Bonao (Guerrero 2016, 15; Mira-Caballos 2010, 450; Peguero and de los Santos 1983). The Concepción fort was established on December 8th, 1494 (Concepción 1981), and moved to the site of Concepción around April 1495, after the first Battle of the Vega Real (Concepción 1981).

According to colonial documents, these first forts' main function was defense (Mira-Caballos 2010, 444). However, close examination of official chronicles (Columbus 1947; Las Casas 1985; Ulloa Hung and Sonnemann 2017, 14) show them to be little more than temporary, rather small, wooden palisades, built without a plan (Mira-Caballos 2010, 443, 450).

The Concepción palisade is believed to have been built in the Rio Verde area, approximately 1-5 km from Concepción (Coste 2015; Pimentel 1998). Since the site has not been identified archaeologically, it will not be discussed at length here. However, it is not expected to be made of masonry, since the Santo Tomás fort, which occupied the same time period, was made of non-masonry materials (Ulloa and Sonnemann 2017, 24).

7.2.1.1.4 Medieval Casa Fuerte (1495-1512)

The next type of Spanish settlement layout was identified at La Isabela, when the documentary and archaeological records related to settlement layouts did not coincide (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 86). Various authors had interpreted Guillermo Coma's description of a city with defined streets (Coma in Gil and Varela 1984, 199), and Las Casas' description of squares, streets and stone buildings (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 86), as proof that settlement followed the Ibero-American grid town plan, known elsewhere in Latin America (Puig-Ortíz 1973; Dobal 1988, 59; García-Zarza 1996, 73–74; Solana 1986, 13; Varela 1987, 738). A more careful review of La Isabela's layout seems to show that buildings followed geographical features, such as the ravines and the seashore (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 86). Town walls were discovered surrounding Columbus's house (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 89).

Deagan and Cruxent (2002a, 86) proposed that this showed evidence of the settlement being a medieval "casa fuerte" [house-fort]. Casa-fuertes were places of refuge, and could also contain the town's Spanish people, weapons and supplies (Manucy 1997, 35-37). The rest of the time, the settlers lived outside of the fort in an unorganized spatial organization and physical layout (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 89).

No colonial maps of Concepción have been found, but this is not uncommon (Kulstad 2008, 113; Pérez-Montás 1984, 65; Pimentel 1998; Coste 2015). However, the discrepancy between the wooden and masonry structures at the Fort campus may indicate that a wooden casa-fuerte settlement may have also been found at Concepción. This settlement pattern appears to have been used at Concepción until the imposition of the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan sometime between 1502 and the construction of the fort in 1512 (see Chapter 4). Since the first Franciscan monks at Concepción came with Ovando in 1502, there does not appear to have been a monastery related to the casa-fuerte layout.

7.2.1.1.5 Ibero-American Grid Town Plan (1502-1516)

According to historical documents, the Spanish Crown was concerned with creating a urban model which guaranteed their possession over the land they conquered, both in Spain and in the Americas. The need to rapidly populate their possessions in the New World was solved through the creation of a standardized settlement model (Brewer-Carías 2007, 53). This model had two versions, one for coastal settlements and the other for inland settlements, although most of the cities founded in the Caribbean during this period were on the coast (Altman 2017, 24). This model was based on the pre-Renaissance and Renaissance ideas which had circulated in the Spanish court during the reign of Isabel and Ferdinand, and later, Charles V and Philip II (Pérez-Montás 2001, 195). The model appears to have been useful, since it allowed Spain to colonize Spanish America in about eighty years (1493-1573).

The Ibero-American Grid Town Plan was based on the Partidas of King Alonso X of Castile. These stated that streets must be straight, and in a grid pattern (Pérez-Montás 2001, 104). This model was also influenced by the Vitruvian principles that had governed Greek and Roman city construction (Brewer-Carías 2007, 32, 35-40; Pérez-Montás 1998). When it was taken to the Americas, the city was adapted to the geographical conditions present at each site, following ideas presented by Renaissance man, León Battista Alberti (Brewer-Carías 2007, 40-43; Pérez-Montás 2001, 195).

Ovando reorganized the settlements on Hispaniola according to the Grid Town Plan between 1502 and 1509. The Ibero-American Grid Town Plan, also known as La Traza in Mexico City, laid out cities and towns in a grid pattern, starting with a central plaza with streets intersecting at right angles to form an orderly, rectangular defined space (See Kulstad 2008, 113). The main plaza would be surrounded by the Church, administration offices and military headquarters, and elite residences, forming the town's physical and social center (Charlton and Fournier 2011, 127; Rodríguez-Alegría 2005, 558; Voss 2008, 870). Franciscan monasteries would be found on the outskirts of the town (Deagan 1999). (For more on the grid-town plan see Ballesteros 1983; Chueco-Goita and Torres-Balbas 1981; Crouch, Garr and Mundingo 1982; García-

Fernández 1989; García-Zarza 1996; Hugo-Brunt 1972; Manucy 1985; Palm 1951; Rodríguez and Ibañez 1992; Willis 1984, 16; Zendegui 1977; Zucker 1959).

One of the main functional reasons for the use of this model was the ease with which expansion and ordinary city growth could be achieved (Brewer-Carías 2007, 52). In other words, streets and other urban areas could be added to a city more easily if this was organized in a rectilinear, rather than in an organic, manner. The Ibero-American Grid Town Plan also organizes the rural areas surrounding the sites into peonías and caballerías, which are different sizes of farming plots, as well as tierras comunales [communal land] (Brewer-Carias 2007). Further instructions modifying these original construction laws were given to different Conquistadors in different years - 1513, 1521, 1523 (Brewer-Carías 2007, 45). The final, definitive instructions appeared in 1573, soon after the last new territories were conquered. After this date, the laws were used to regulate the construction of new city areas, as opposed to new cities per se (Brewer-Carías 2007, 45).

Ovando did not implement the grid town plan in all of these settlements simultaneously. It is believed he applied his model to Santo Domingo first, and then expanded from there (Kulstad 2008, 111; Pérez-Montás 1984, 66, 1988). Santo Domingo, as capital city, would have been subject to these regulations first.

Several hypothetical models of Concepción's layout have been proposed by preservation architects over the years (Kulstad 2008, 97; Pérez-Montas 1984; Roca-Pezzoti 1984), many based on the location of existing monumental architecture. None were based on a systematic survey of the site until the University of Florida 1996-1998 Project (Cohen 1997b; Woods 1998; Deagan 1999). This investigation suggested that Concepción was laid out on a grid, similar to the one found during the University of Florida's investigation at Puerto Real (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 284-296). At both sites masonry building foundations followed cardinal (compass) orientation (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 284-296). The identification of possible streets at Concepción (Kulstad 2008, 2013c), offers the preliminary conclusion that the Concepción site continues to be laid out in a grid pattern. The Florida Survey also showed that Concepción, at its largest, covered an area of more that 1 km2, bigger than the Santo Domingo, and Santa Fe de Granada of the same period (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 284-296).

Concepción does not appear to have been subject to an adaptation of the grid town plan undertaken at port cities, such as Santo Domingo, to defend themselves from other European powers (Altman 2017, 24). The 1996-1998 University of Florida did not find a wall around the city, in spite of surveying an area of more than 1 km2 (Deagan 1999; Woods 1998).

7.2.1.1.6 Pueblos Tutelados (1516-1519)

The next settlement model instituted by the Crown's Jeronymite representatives on Hispaniola were the *Pueblos Tutelados* (see Chapter 4). These settlements were precursors of the "Two Republics" model, seen later elsewhere in Spanish America (McEwan 2001, 635). In the "Republics" model, the Spanish and Indios would be divided into two settlements, or republics. The Spanish Republic functioned with its own internal hierarchy, while the Indio Republic, which could be made up of multiple tribal entities, had its own hereditary leaders, lands and vassals, but subordinate to the Spanish Crown (McEwan 2001, 635). The Indios were to be Christian and follow Church mandates (McEwan 2001, 635). The eventual goal was to replace Indigenous institutions for Spanish ones and integrate Indios into Spanish society (McEwan 2001, 635).

The Pueblos Tutelados were conceived as first step in this process. Instead of requiring Naborias to live close to the holders of the Repartimiento, Indigenous people from Hispaniola would live in these free Indian towns. These towns' population would be limited to 300 people each. A Spanish-educated cacique and a priest would govern the settlement (Charlevoix 1730, 282, 283; Moya-Pons 1978; Stone 2014, 136). Each family would receive a plot of land (Charlevoix 1730, 282, 283; Moya-Pons 1978). The villages would also have their own church and hospital (Charlevoix 1730, 283; Hanke 1935).

The concept behind these Pueblos came from the belief that Indigenous peoples were dying due to abuses they received from Europeans (Rothchild 2015, 188). The idea for their institution came from Las Casas, which had been pushing the idea for separation in the Spanish Courts (Mira-Caballos 2010, 344), and also heavily influenced the Laws of Burgos, which regulated the Repartimiento (AGI, Indif. Gen. 419, L4, f83; Stone 2014, 124-125). The Laws of Burgos also required that all the sons of caciques on the island, older than 13, be taught religion, reading and writing (in Spanish) by the Franciscans (AGI, Indif. Gen. 419, L4, f83; Stone 2014, 124-125).

Historical documents say that the first Pueblos Tutelados were established in the Cibao area (Guitar 1998, 176; Hanke 1935, 38-39; Mira-Caballos 2010, 362; Stone 2014, 138), but do not give names or locations. There is also little information about the Pueblos in other parts of Hispaniola (Hanke 1935, 38-39; Mira-Caballos 2010, 362). Historians have considered that the Jeronymites were never able to successfully implement their program, owing both to political factors and to epidemic disease (Guitar 1998, 176; Kulstad 2008, 62; Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997, 1998). A smallpox epidemic struck Hispaniola between December 1518 and January 1519, killing about two thirds of the Indigenous population of the island, according to historical sources (AGI, Patronato 172, R35; Guitar 1998, 248; Kulstad 2008, 62; Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997, 1998; Pichardo 1944). Given the new circumstances, the Jeronymites kept the Repartimiento

and the Naborias continued to live in the same settlements as their masters (Charlevoix 1730, 287, 288; Guitar 1998, 176).

A re-examination of the information gathered by 1996-1998 University of Florida Survey (Deagan 1999; Woods 1998, 1999) did not show conclusive evidence of a separate Indigenous pueblo in the area. However, further historical research has unearthed that a school for cacique sons was established at the Concepción's Franciscan Monastery in 1517 (Stone 2014, 127-128). A previous school had been founded at Verapaz in 1513 (Stone 2014, 124), and later one in Santo Domingo in 1523 (Stone 2014, 127-128). The establishment of this school at Concepción may have been the reason for the construction of the masonry buildings at the Monasterio campus (discussed in more detail below).

7.2.1.2 Building scale

This scale of analysis is mostly based on archaeological analysis of building structures and artifact distributions at the Fort and Monasterio de San Francisco campuses at Concepción. Archaeological interpretation of these spaces is relatively unique, given their non-domestic use.

Unlike with settlement layouts, the Crown did not have specific policies for the construction of particular buildings during this time period, with the exception of Cathedrals (Brewer-Carias 2007). This allowed for some adaptation of building structures to environmental conditions, particularly hurricanes (Lamb 1956, 56; Mira-Caballos 2010, 452; Oviedo I, 1855, 161-168). Comparisons with similar buildings of the same time period in Spain have permitted the possible identification of building areas (González 1983; Shepard 1997).

Four distinct structures have been identified archaeologically to have existed at the Monasterio de San Francisco campus: a wooden church, a masonry church, a wooden convent, and a masonry convent. Seven structural areas have been identified at the Fort campus: Wooden structure #1, Wooden structure #2, Masonry Fort (1512), Masonry Fort (1543), Southeastern Tower Structure, House #1, and House #2. The findings in these buildings will be interpreted below (see also Chapter 6).

7.2.1.2.1 Monasterio campus

The Monasterio de San Francisco campus, is found approximately 1000m southwest from the fort campus (Cohen 1997b). It is located proximately halfway between the Santo Cerro and the Fort campus (Woods 1997) (See Fig. 4). Franciscan monasteries were often located on the peripheries of Spanish colonial towns (Deagan 1995a, 427; Kulstad 2008, 124, 2013c), such as in Concepción (Palm 1952; Pérez-Montás 1984), Santo Domingo (Council 1975; Pérez-Montás 1984), St. Augustine

(Hoffman 1994), Sevilla Nueva, Jamaica (Godwin 1946, 156), and in various locations in Mexico (Kubler 1948).

As stated above, four structures have been identified at the Monasterio de San Francisco campus: a wooden church, a masonry church, a wooden convent, and a masonry convent. According to historical information, the wooden church and wooden convent were commissioned by Gov. Ovando between 1502 and 1509 (Cohen 1997b, 6; Kulstad 2008, 124, 2013c; Lamb 1956). The masonry church and masonry monastery were constructed between 1525 and 1528 (Deagan 1999,10; Palm 1955a, 22-23). The masonry foundations overlap with the nail concentrations delimiting the location of the earlier wooden buildings. This means that only two functional areas - a church and a monastery - have been identified on this campus.

Historians have suggested that the first Franciscan churches built on the island were small, in an effort to withstand hurricanes (Mira-Caballos 2010, 458; Ugarte 1981). It must be remembered that a big hurricane struck soon after Franciscans' arrival in 1502 (see Chapter 4). The Monasterio's church is aligned east to west, with the altar in the east, consistent with Catholic liturgical precepts (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 86). This alignment is also found at the La Isabela church (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 86), and the Santo Domingo Cathedral (Pérez-Montás 1998). However, this is not the case of the first Franciscan church in Santo Domingo (Capilla de la Tercera Orden), where the altar is found in the west (Coste 2015).

During excavation, González identified the spaces inside the site's Monastery based on Franciscan monastery distributions in Spain (Coste 2017). A review of the artifacts found in the different areas shows more concordance than expected, particularly in the dining halls. There were less similarities than expected with the Santo Domingo Franciscan Monastery, including its 16th century areas (Coste 2015). Additionally, the other Franciscan monastery adapted for the education of the sons of caciques - Verapaz - has not been found archaeologically. Other Franciscan monasteries in the circum-Caribbean, such as the one in St. Augustine, have not been excavated in the same degree as the Concepción's, and cannot be compared accurately at this scale (Deagan 2017).

7.2.1.2.2 Fort campus

Seven structural areas have been identified at the Fort campus: Wooden structure #1, Wooden structure #2, Masonry Fort (1512), Masonry Fort (1543), Southeastern Tower Structure, House #1, and House #2. It is possible to tentatively recreate a timeline of the construction of the different structures. First, Wooden Structures #1 and #2 belong to the Medieval-Casa Fuerte settlement pattern (1495-1512). They appear to have been the inside of a wooden *Casa Fuerte*.

The next structure to be built seems to be the 1512 masonry Fort. Then, the structure next to the southeastern tower (Southeastern Tower Structure). This appears to have been a masonry structure built when the 1512 Fort started to deteriorate, because it covers part of the area occupied by the 1543 Fort's southeastern tower. It is possible that this structure may have had tapia floors and wooden walls. This structure may have been razed for the 1543 remodelation/construction of the Fort. House #1 occupies part of the same space previously used by Wooden Structure #2, and the widest range of artifacts were found there. It may have also been the last structure built at the Fort campus. House #2 appears to have been built almost completely from nonperishable items, as few nails were found there. Its similar alignment to House #1 may indicate the existence of a rectilinear street or alleyway between both structures. A more complete description of each of these structures is found in Chapter 6.

This chapter section will focus on the three main community functions identified at this campus:

- Defense: Casa-fuerte (Wooden Structures #1 and #2); 1512 Fort; and 1543 Fort
- Healthcare: Hospital (Southeastern Tower Structure; House #2)
- Commerce: Store (House #1)
-

7.2.1.2.2.1 Defense at the Fort campus

Unlike other colonial buildings, forts were often rebuilt. This was true not only in Spanish colonies, but in Dutch (Haviser 2001) and English colonies as well (South 1978). The reasons for this vary. Sometimes it was due to the importance of defense to Spanish authorities (Mira-Caballos 2010, 390), but sometimes it could be simply to justify soldiers' salaries (South 1977).

Historical documents record four Concepción forts (Table 6-3). One was built in 1494 close to the Rio Verde and lasted one year (See Palisade above). Three were built at the Concepción site. The first fort onsite, built in 1495, appears to have been built by Bartolomé Colon, and was known as Bartolomé's Fort (Marte 1981). Ovando commissioned a new fort in 1509, but it was not begun until 1512 (Marte 1981, 68, 86, 90); Ferdinand 1511. This third fort remained in good condition until 1543, when city officials asked that it be repaired (Marte 1981, 400; Vadillo 1543).

Bartolomé's fort was part of the Medieval Casa-Fuerte settlement layout pattern, which includes Wooden Structures #1 and #2. Two interpretative options exist. The first is that both structures could have formed the "casa-fuerte," and had some as yet unidentified wall around them for defense. Wooden Structure #1 would house the common soldiers, while Wooden Structure #2 would house the officers, a division suggested by Gonzalez during excavations (Abreu 2015). A second interpretation would be that Wooden Structure #1 would comprise the fort remains, and Wooden Structure #2 be the home of a prominent citizen - a relationship found in Santo Domingo between the Fort and the Rodrigo de Bastidas house.

The masonry fort ruins currently found at the Concepción site were evaluated by Historical Architect Hershel Shepard in 1997 (Shepard 1997). According to Shepard, the fort was built as a rectangular masonry structure with the long axis oriented north to south. It had two circular masonry towers, one located at the northwest corner and the other at the southeast corner (Shepard 1997, 2). Architect Gonzalez believed a square tower was located in the northeast corner (Abreu 2015).

The 1512 Fort was probably built more to store and control the gold and silver produced in the northern part of the island than for settlers' defense, as was done by the Spanish in other parts of the Americas (Mira-Caballos 2017), and the Portuguese in Africa (DeCorse 2010, 211). This is evidenced by the thick walls of the remaining northwest tower.

Although it is not recorded historically, archaeologically there is evidence of reconstruction/repair of the Fort. It is uncertain why the fort was rebuilt/repaired circa 1543. Two conflicting historical accounts exist. The first is that a new fort was originally requested in 1537 due to disrepair (Mira-Caballos 2010, 400). Moneys were made available for fort defense in 1540, and this Concepción fort construction was started (Mira-Caballos 2010, 390). A second account records an earthquake on the island in 1543 (Palm 1955b). Although no record has been found of the earthquake affecting Concepción, it is possible this affected the building.

The area covered by the 1543 Fort seems to be smaller than the one covered by the 1512 fort. This was discerned through the plotting of the clay extraction pits identified in the archaeological record (Fig 16). Pits #3 and #4 appear to be related to the construction of the western wall. Pits #5 and #6 appear to be related to the construction of the eastern wall. Pits #1, #2, and Pit #7 are not found next to walls and could either be related to the construction of the fort's northern and southern towers, or related to a reduction or expansion of the masonry fort's size.

The presence of stoneware (found in greater quantities after 1550) in the area next to the southeastern tower seems to point to a reduction of the fort's structure around that time. This makes it plausible to assume that the 1512 fort was larger (east to west) than the 1543 remodeled version.

It is difficult to compare the Concepción's masonry fort to others in the circum-Caribbean, particularly those found in port cities. Forts in port cities continued to be mainly for defense against invading forces, while forts in inland gold production areas served as storehouses (Altman 2017; Mira-Caballos 2017). This fort's function is more similar to the Portuguese trading fort of El Mina than the Torre del Homenaje in Santo Domingo.

7.2.1.2.2.1 Healthcare at the Fort campus

The creation of hospitals was part of the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan that Ovando was instructed to implement (Lamb 1956, 132; Ortega and Fondeur 1982, 533; Simancas, Consejo Real, Procesos, Leg. 97, fol. 7). The Concepción Hospital was founded in 1508, along with a second one in Buenaventura, close to the present-day Bonao (Mira-Caballos 2010, 521). Palm (1950, 34) believed both of these hospitals were made out of wood. A third hospital, Nicolas de Bari, was built out of masonry in Santo Domingo (Altman 2017, 16-17; Ortega and Fondeur 1982, 534).

A large number and variety of health-related artifacts were found at the Fort campus including medicine vials, a scalpel, and fragments of pharmacy jars (Deagan and Kulstad 1998). This prompted an attempt to identify the location of the hospital within the delimited area (Kulstad 2008, 2013c). A re-examination of proveniences in this study has offered two potential locations - the area next to the southeastern fort tower, and the House #2 structure.

A wooden building could have occupied the area next to the southeastern tower of the 1512 Fort. This could be especially possible if this second tower was only built for the 1543 Fort, i.e. the 1512 Fort only had the one (northwestern) tower. This structural area was identified as a possible location because it is the provenience of most of the glass vials in the collection.

The second option is that House #2 could have been the hospital. This is a weaker option, since this is a masonry structure. However, a scapel and glass vials were found in the interior area.

7.2.1.2.2.3 Commerce at the Fort campus

The Ibero-American Grid Town Plan implemented by Ovando also included the construction of a Casa de Contratación branch in Santo Domingo (Altman 2017, 16-17). This office, housed in what is now known as the Casas Reales, was in charge of regulating commerce between Spain and Hispaniola. Although the material assemblage at Concepción holds vast amounts of European artifacts imported from Europe, no historical or archaeological evidence of a Casa de Contratación branch at Concepción has been found.

However, there is historical evidence of various storeowners selling imported goods in the town, particularly in the 1532 Proceso de Alvaro Castro (Patronato 1995). It is possible that House #1 could have been a store. The widest variety of artifacts found at the site were unearthed in the eastern side of this structure. This includes tools such as two axes, an awl, a scythe, a chisel, and a hoe. Also clothing items such as two scissors, and two buckles. In terms of weaponry, chain mail, scabbard points, a sword, and a pike were found. A trigger and a dagger were found in the easternmost well. A

large fork, a small fork and four knives were also found. Olive jar is also mostly found in the highest quantity at the eastern edge of this structure. Other items found were glass, griddles, stoneware, low quantities of La Vega Red on White and cupellation item sherds.

7.2.2 Sociocultural Interactions

Although several important intercultural social interactions occurred at Concepción during this period of study, the most overt interactions were linked to the separation policies implemented through the settlement patterns. For this reason, this section will focus on colonial control policies which promoted these intercultural separations, namely hidalgüismo and sumptuary laws, and the resistance against them. Although these interactions were primarily conceptual, it is possible to discern their spatial location and organization through the interpretation of certain artifact distributions on the landscape.

Conceptually, colonial interactions included domination (Deagan 2011, 55; Rothchild 2015, 183), as well as control policies to institute the related classification structures. During this period, colonial authorities were concerned with controlling men and their activities at the economic, political, material scale. As stated above, the most overt mechanism to control populations was through separation (Rothchild 2015, 188), most prominently expressed by where a person spent the night. As will be elaborated on below, the first system of control was through a system related to labor and chivalry. This system failed because it was too successful, allowing people to earn enough to buy their freedom and/or purchase items reserved for the upper classes. A second system of sumptuary laws, linked to religious piety, was instituted next. This failed due to lack of enforcement. By the end of occupation of the Concepción site a satisfactory control method had not been found. It was not until the 1580s that a new method of control, limiting women and their activities, particularly intermarriage between ethnic groups, was found to be relatively effective (Guitar 2002, 8). This Castas system was never implemented at Concepción while it occupied the Concepción site. This fact will be kept in mind while presenting the interpretations below.

This section will also present how various members of society, not just Indigenous peoples resisted to these domination policies. Various forms of resistance will be analyzed, based on interactions with both peoples and the landscape.

7.2.2.1 Hidalgüismo, labor, and social hierarchy

Unlike other societal models which only contemplated sporadic interactions between foreign and native populations (as with the inherently economic feitoría system of the Portuguese in Africa, or the trading posts used in North America), the Castilla-

León Reconquista model contemplated intense interactions between populations with the purpose of evangelizing them, and guaranteeing their place in Heaven. The way to do this was through following an intricate moral code of ethics (Moya-Pons 1983, 13, 1997, 1998), based on honesty, good upbringing and clean bloodlines (Arranz-Márquez 1991, 172). As stated before, hidalgüismo, was an important element of this code (Elliott 1963, 38; Vicens-Vives 1969, 349), and included a disdain for manual labor (Moya-Pons 1983, 12, 1997, 1998). (See Chapter 4, Section: Medieval Casa Fuerte - La Isabela Feitoría). The more labor a person was required to perform, the lower the individual's position in the social hierarchy. This meant enslaved and conscripted (by the Repartimiento) peoples, undertaking forced labor, were at the bottom rung of the social ladder, while the nobility, both Indigenous and Castilian, did not labor at all, and were positioned at the top. This was particularly true of upper class women (Moya-Pons 1983, 13, 1997, 1998; Rothchild 2015, 183). (see Chapter 5, and discussion in Kulstad 2008, Chapter 9).

Certain professions offered a chance at upward mobility, such as being in the clergy, in the military, or in government administration (Jamieson 2004, 445; Lockhart and Schwartz 1983, 5). Professions which required education, such as lawyers and doctors, also created chances to gain upper class privileges (Lockhart and Schwartz 1983, 5).

Table 7-1: Labor Divisions by Gender, Geography and Freedom - presents the identified labor occupations divided by gender, the location where they are undertaken (rural or urban), and whether the work was done by enslaved, conscripted (under the Repartimiento), or free peoples. Several aspects of intercultural interaction in labor at Concepción can be observed. (see Chapter 5 for a more detailed description of the different labor groups and occupations).

First, it is obvious that men performed a wider range of labor occupations than women. However, a greater proportion of women workers were free, as opposed to most working men being enslaved. Most of the free working men appear to have been Libertas, although this may be due to the lack of information about Free Indians after 1542. It is important to note that upper class women, both European and Nitainas, were not required to work.

A wider variety of labor occupations are found in the urban area, as opposed to the rural areas. Rural labor in the Concepción area was undertaken in the following occupations: gold industry, cash crop farming and cattle ranching. This labor was undertaken by large numbers of people, mostly enslaved and conscripted, from various origins. In the urban area, only domestic labor and construction show the same laborer diversity found in the rural areas.

Although labor occupations only undertaken by Europeans - government administration, religion (clergy), and the military (at least at the beginning) - seem to coincide with the upper classes within the hidalgüismo code, another European-only

labor occupation which is present does not. This activity is commerce of goods from outside of the island, including slaves. The importance of this distinction will be discussed in more detail below.

Due in large part to the success of the mining industry, people in Concepción (and the rest of Hispaniola) had access to great wealth, up until about the 1520s. Goods brought from outside of the island were bought by the person who could afford it, not necessarily the one assigned by class. The most common complaints related to this were the use of upper class accruements by the non-elite wives (of all ethnic groups) of working men (Ribeiro 2003, 12–16), and thus equating them to putting them in the special category of non-working elite women. It became necessary to implement a control system which would cover all persons in the colony, not just those who were part of the labor market.

7.2.2.2 Sumptuary laws at Concepción

The new societal control policy instituted on Hispaniola consisted of a series of sumptuary laws which attempted to regulate consumption through the restriction of the use of certain clothing, food and luxury items according to social rank (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 188; Ribeiro 2003, 12–16). During the Habsburg rule, piety was linked to lack of excess, effectively linking high expenditure to sin (Ramírez 2016).

In 1509, Maria de Toledo, Gov. Diego Colón's wife, was the first to institute Sumptuary laws on Hispaniola (Acosta-Corniel 2013, 37; Moya-Pons 1978, 110; Suárez-Marill 1998, 15). The 1532 Proceso a Alvaro de Castro lists various sumptuary laws broken by the Dean of the Concepción Cathedral. Of special importance is the limitation in the sale of purple cloth, only to be used by the clergy, showing that sumptuary laws also separated laity and clergy (Patronato 1995).

Sumptuary laws were also included in the African Slave Ordenanzas of 1528, 1535, and 1544, specifically aimed at controlling African slave expenditures (Archivo Nacional de Cuba, Documento Secreto 243, Legajo 3, No. 97a, ff24-33; Guitar 1998, 373; Larrazabal 1975, 110; Moya Pons 2008, 74). African Bozal women were limited in the clothing and jewels they could wear (Moya Pons 2008, 74). Ladinos were baned from owning taverns and drinking wine (Larrazabal 1975, 110). African slaves were not allowed to carry, or own, weapons (Kulstad 2008, 183; Larrazabal 1975, 107).

There are no comparable ordenanzas regulating Naboria or Nitaino behavior. It could be assumed that the teaching of sumptuary laws was part of the teaching of the "ways of our faith" to caciques' sons through the Laws of Burgos. After all, the idea was for the young men to learn "Spanishness," and then later teach their people how to act in the same manner (AGI, Indif. Gen. 419, L4, f83; Stone 2014, 124-125). It would be safe to assume that this would involve using "Spanish" material culture recursively, that is, as a means to teach certain desired aspects of "Spanish" culture (Potter 1992, 121).

This idea of recursivity would also apply to recreating the physical separation of the Ibero-American Grid Plan as a mental construct (Bourdieu 1990, 53).

7.2.2.3 Resistance to societal control policies

Traditionally, archaeological research on colonial resistance on Hispaniola has focused finding and identifying the settlements occupied by those in conflict with the colonial authority, both Indio and Cimarrón (Arrom and García-Arévalo 1986; Deagan 2011, 48; Vega 1979; Weik 2012). However, these settlements have proved difficult to find, as was their purpose when occupied in the 16th century (Deagan 2011, 48; Singleton 1998, 179).

However, in keeping with the idea of a Dominican Merengue/Cuban Counterpoint - a relationship between voices and/or instruments that is, at once, harmonically interdependent, and independent in rhythm and contour (Ortiz 1940,1947) - this research has taken a different approach to the identification of resistance. As stated earlier, the lack of concordance of actual artifact use can be a sign of macro and microscale resistance/agency by the non-elite and non-dominant. “Resistance” here implies various types of noncompliance to Crown mandates, including not conforming to settlement patterns, Hidalgüismo codes, limpieza de sangre. mestizaje and/or Sumptuary Laws. Resistance and control can also coexist at different moments and spaces (Hodder 2004, 32; Jamieson 2004, 434; Liebmann and Murphy 2011b, 5).

Using this approach, three types of resistance have been identified and are presented below:

- Disregard of assigned space
- Disregard for sumptuary laws
- Disregard for limpieza de sangre codes/Mestizaje

7.2.2.3.1 Disregard of assigned space

As examined in Chapter 4, the Crown colonial authorities implemented various settlement layouts to guarantee separation between different social groups, the most important of which was the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan (See Chapter 4, Section: Ovando’s Implantation of the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan). The plan consisted of a settlement organized around a central plaza, or square. The main streets would extend from this plaza in a square grid pattern (Oviedo n.d. Bar. I, Quin. III, Dial. 6; Pérez-Montás 2001, 104). The lots closest to this main plaza would be reserved for government buildings, commerce, and the highest status families (Lamb 1956, 84; Pérez-Montás 2001, 104; Oviedo n.d. Bar. I, Quin. III, Dial. 6). Class status was determined by distance of homes from the main square (Lamb 1956, 84; Oviedo n.d. Bar. I, Quin. III, Dial. 6).

Conceptually, in this urban settlement pattern, everyone occupied a particular place within this landscape, particularly at night. Enslaved domestic servants slept on their master's properties (Jamieson 2004; Patronato 1995), while free servants lived separately, but within the city limits (Patronato 1995).

In practice, however, individuals, alone or in groups, resisted these mandates. More information is available about group resistances than individual actions, particularly in the historical record. The resistance of four groups had great influence on Concepción: the Roldán rebellion, the Enriquillo revolt, the Ciguayo revolt, and the Diego Ocampo Cimarrón attacks (These are discussed at length in Chapter 4). Each of these is notable in its own way, and influenced subsequent intercultural interactions at Concepción, on Hispaniola, and in subsequent colonial settlements elsewhere in the Americas.

The Roldán Rebellion is notable because nonelite Spaniards chose to leave La Isabela and live in Indigenous communities, as opposed to staying in the city and performing their duties for their master. Their mistreatment of Indigenous people became the justification of the official separation mandate (Morner 1967). However, when this group was reincorporated into society, they became opponents of separation policies, and particularly of the Pueblos Tutelados. The existence and relatively large amounts of Indigenous artifacts and colonowares at Concepción, in areas were the objects found should be mostly European, shows Roldán followers' influence on local lifeways.

The Enriquillo revolt was also influential at Concepción, even if it did not actually occur onsite. This revolt, like the Roldán rebellion, was undertaken by an unexpected group, namely the Nitaino young men. These young men had learned how to be "Spanish," and used this knowledge to their advantage in their resistance. Unfortunately, little information is currently available about whether Concepción's Nitainos supported or opposed Enriquillo, making it difficult to ascertain whether some of the areas around the fort could have housed Nitainos.

The other two movements - the Ciguayo revolt and the Cimarrón attacks - are both traditionally identified as "resistance groups." The Ciguayo group was mostly made up of escaped Naborias, while escaped Bozal and Ladinos made up the Cimarrón movement. These groups disregard for assigned space also involved a disregard for their condition as enslaved and conscripted peoples. It is also known that they continued to interact with those still enslaved and conscripted, prompting Slave Ordenanzas which further limited the movements of enslaved peoples (Archivo Nacional de Cuba, Documento Secreto 243, Legajo 3, No. 97a, ff24-33; Deive 1989, 264; Guitar 1998, 373).

In this study, rather than finding the areas where these rebels escaped to, we have focused on the spaces they have escaped from. We have focused on their presence/absence in urban areas, rather than trying to identify their settlements in the

rural landscape. Given that both of the studied spaces were, conceptually, supposed to have been occupied mostly by Spanish men, any discrepant artifacts can give a clue into these resistances. However, the current lack of data on African-derived material culture on Hispaniola makes it difficult to discern the degree of Naboria and African enslaved peoples' escape from Concepción's urban spaces archaeologically.

7.2.2.3.2 Disregard for sumptuary laws

The disregard for Sumptuary laws has perhaps had the greatest influence on modern human behavior of these three types of resistance. The freedom for anyone to purchase any item, without limitation, has become a fixture in our modern way of life (Fournier 2005, 174; Jamieson 2004, 434). As an economic, religious and political center, Concepción had merchants and commerce creating flow of goods and money. This was especially true during the two fundiciones seasons, when many miners were present.

As seen in Table 7-1, commerce was one of the labor occupations which only involved Europeans, but it did not consider it to be an upper class profession. This would become a double-edged sword, since the acquisition of the material culture which externally manifested the upper class position needed to be purchased. What would stop a nonelite merchant from purchasing these external markers for himself and his family, or selling them to others like himself?

This sale of prestige material culture must have occurred on Hispaniola from the start, as evidenced by the archaeological assemblage at La Isabela (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a: 188) and the implementation of Sumptuary Laws in 1509 (Acosta-Corniel 2013). The penalty of being expelled from the colony for two years for breaking these laws (Moya-Pons 1978, 110), did not stop those who wished to dress like the elite and had money made in mining to spend (Suárez-Marill 1998, 15). Purchases included clothes, jewelry, weapons and horse equipage (Río Moreno 1992; Suárez-Marill 1998, 15). Although there were more complaints about women using these prestige wares (Jamieson 2004, 445; Moya-Pons 2008, 74; Rothchild 2015, 189), there are also records of men breaking sumptuary laws (Patronato 1995; Rothchild 2015, 192). It is important to remember that this type of resistance, or disregard, would not be considered extreme for groups which had already resisted against their assigned spatial use within the colonial plan (see above).

The extent of this type of resistance to authority is exemplified by the accusations against Dean Alvaro de Castro in 1532 (Patronato 1995). As the main clergyman in charge of the Concepción's Cathedral and the main representative of the Inquisition (Patronato 1995, 96) he should have been a pious follower of the Sumptuary Laws. Instead, he was accused of selling African slaves illegally (Patronato 1995, 136) - themselves a luxury item (Deive 1989, 20). He sold meat to miners and then fined them

for eating meat on Fridays (Patronato 1995, 56, 120). He hired a tailor to sew and sell garments made from cloth assigned to religious purposes (Patronato 1995, 155), as well as selling second-hand, ready-made clothes, including capes, corselets and pointed hoods (Patronato 1995, 155, 213, 221). These clothes later became the base for the traditional Limping Devil costumes worn in present-day Carnival at La Vega.

With regards to the Concepción archaeological record, as with similar warm weather sites, clothing is not found in the archaeological record (Deagan and Kulstad 1998). However, various artifacts and luxury items related to sumptuary laws can still be identified. These include olive jars in which luxury foods were transported, rumbler bells, pins, belt buckles, pins, aglets, and scissors (Deagan 1999; Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 188).

7.2.2.3.3 Disregard for *limpieza de sangre* codes / mestizaje

The final type of resistance, mestizaje, was present on Hispaniola nine months after the first European arrival but was not formally acknowledged conceptually by the authorities until the 1580s (Guitar 1998, 411; Voss 2005, 462). Mestizaje, the mixing of peoples from different origin groups, broke the Castilian rules of limpieza de sangre, which stressed the need for keep clean bloodlines and Christianity (Arranz-Márquez 1991, 172; Kulstad 2008, 51; Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971, 266).

As discussed in Chapter 5, the need to implement the casta system appears to have been a consequence of this disregard for the limpieza de sangre social differentiation codes. It is important to remember that the castas system was not instituted in the Spanish colonies until the 1580s (Guitar 1998). The censuses undertaken before that time did not include categories for mixed-blood peoples (Guitar 1998, 411), yet there is little doubt that they existed. A notable example of one such person elsewhere in the Americas was Inca Garcilaso de la Vega, son of a Spanish encomendero and a royal Inca mother (Garcilaso de la Vega 1982). More problematic would be the children of a free person and an enslaved or conscripted one. Examples of these would be the children of Cimarrones with enslaved women, free Indians and enslaved Africans, or even the children of the slave women hired out as prostitutes.

Unfortunately, given that the two excavated campuses were assigned to activities which were mostly undertaken by Spanish men, it would be difficult to use the archaeological relationships found here as a base for studies on mestizaje. This is particularly true for the information found at the Monasterio de San Francisco since, although there could have been some mestizaje related to it, this would not have been the norm.

7.2.3 Biophysical Interactions

Four main biophysical interactions were identified at Concepción: mestizaje, dietary needs, disease, and death. Since mestizaje was not officially recognized during this time period, and DNA studies are beyond the scope of this research, this interaction type will not be discussed here. Additionally, there has been a movement to find other, more appropriate metaphors of long-term social and cultural change (Potter 1992, 125).

The other three types of biophysical interactions: Dietary needs, disease, and death - affect everyone equally. All were regulated by colonial domination policies. This section will deal with the foodways, disease/healthcare, and deathway interactions at Concepción, and how they are manifested archaeologically.

7.2.3.1 Foodways

In this section foodways have been defined as dietary remains, cookware traces, cookware and tableware artifacts. The foodways sequence follows the following steps: acquisition or procurement, preparation, commensality and discard. It is important to note that the following section will be mostly based on extrapolated information, since a systematic analysis of the dietary remains of Concepción's archaeological assemblage has not been undertaken. Information will come from research undertaken at La Isabela, on northern Hispaniola (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a; 2002b); Puerto Real and En Bas Saline, also on the north coast of Hispaniola (Deagan 1995a, 1995b; 1996, 144); St. Augustine, Florida (Deagan 1983), and in 16th century contexts in Seville, Spain (McEwan 1998; Reitz and McEwan 1995).

Dietary remains are difficult to study archaeologically because of their perishable nature,, and/or inappropriate recovery methods do not capture them. Often the only evidence of these are faunal remains, and traces on cookware (use-wear, lipids, starch grains, etc.). It is often necessary to rely on historical data to identify and interpret these cultural manifestations in colonial sites. There are large amounts of faunal remains currently stored at the La Vega Vieja Archaeological Park. A preliminary review of both the remains and the archaeological records points to a preponderance of European domestic animal remains, mostly bovine and porcine, with some chicken, unidentified fish, and crab.

The assemblage also contains examples of various kinds of wares related to food production and food importation. The existence of cassava griddles points to the consumption of cassava bread. There is large amounts of olive jar sherds (Deagan 1999) evidence of the importation of all types of European foods (Avery 1995; Fernández-Navarrete II, 1825, 163-164).

Foodways played an important part in colonial urban interactions on Hispaniola. Access to particular foods related to the Iberian diet were reserved for those with the

monetary resources to import them from Europe. Imported food items at Concepción would have included raisins, wheat flour, vinegar, lentils, beans, almonds, olive oil, and wine (Moya-Pons 1978, 186). This was due to the fact that wheat, grapes, and sheep could not be grown on Hispaniola (Deagan 1996, 148). Concepción's inland location must have increased the costs of these items. Europeans who could not afford these imported items (such as the nonelites) had to reluctantly eat local foods, referring to them as "roots and other distasteful delicacies" (Anghiera 1970, 180; Guitar 1998, 101; Oviedo VI, 1959, Ch. 8, Part 6). It is unknown whether Nitaino tastes could have influenced the food eaten by the upper classes. It is also unknown whether African Libertos enjoyed eating local foods.

Interestingly, Repartimiento holders and slave owners had to provide food for their male workers, so history records the foodways provided to Naborias, Perpetual Naborias, African Ladinos and Bozales (Oviedo in Rueda 1988, 212) records that gold workers ate cassava bread in the field. It appears these were made by Naboria women, under instructions from the Repartimiento holder. No record is made of what protein may have been consumed. It is important to note that the Naborias did have a chance to occasionally return to their home communities during the gold production cycle (which the Perpetual Naborias did not) and eat similar foods to those consumed precontact (Deagan 2004, 603). Not known if food was provided to women.

Later, with the introduction of sugar plantations on the island in the 1520s, the consumption of meat was stressed for slave worker endurance (Larrazabal 1975). Sugar mill owners had to provide their slaves with a diet of cassava bread, corn, peppers and abundant meat (Kulstad 2008, 161; Larrazabal 1975, 107). Abundant beef became available with the advent of the hide/tanning industry in 1520s Moya-Pons 1983, 1997, 1998; Patronato 1995, 56). It is important to note a distinction between Bozal and Ladino food in historical records, specifically mentioning that Bozales used coconut oil for their food (Deive 1989, 266). It would be safe to assume that Ladinos used olive oil, showing a preference for more Spanish style food.

A study of foodway acquisition and procurement at Concepción reinforces the effort to impose the settlement layouts related to the Castilla-León urban model. There is little evidence, both historical and archaeological, that food was produced within the city area itself. There is historical evidence of cattle ranching, a source of beef, close to the city (Moya-Pons 1978). However, evidences of the closest root crop farms are in En Bas Saline, near Puerto Real (Deagan 2004, 603). Although these Puerto Real farms would have fallen under Concepción's political jurisdiction, there must have been closer crop farms to this heavily populated city.

One influencing factor in procurement may have been that, with the exception of colonial officials, Nitaínos, nonelite Europeans, and African Libertos, most people living at Concepción were provided food by their owners/holders. As stated above, Naborias, Perpetual Naborias, African Ladinos and Bozales were to be provided with a basic diet

of native grown foods, probably not much different to that provided to sugar mill workers - cassava bread, corn, peppers, leftover meat (Larrazabal 1975, 107). However, it is possible that those enslaved peoples working under the jornal system could have supplemented their diets with other foods, like fruit, either bought or found in the natural environment.

As stated above, large amounts of olive jar sherds at the site show an effort to acquire European foods. Although some of these foods were prohibited to lower classes by sumptuary laws, and must have been quite expensive, the wealth from mining was obviously enough to overcome the difficulties of bringing these goods in over land, on a journey of several days. The process undoubtedly helped link these foods, and the tablewares used to consume these same foods, to high power of acquisition.

Due to the fact that both the Fort and Monasterio de San Francisco campuses contain public structures, it is difficult to know how food was prepared here. More information is available about food preparation in domestic, rather than non-domestic, spaces in the Spanish colonial Caribbean. Archaeological studies at St. Augustine domestic areas (Deagan 1983), and Puerto Real domestic areas (Reitz and McEwan 1995) point to kitchen activities being associated to non-European women in domestic spaces (Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 284-296). Related to this is the fact that most of the people using these spaces were provided their food, given their enslavement or conscription in the Repartimiento. It is conceivable that food would have been cooked in large quantities, in large kitchens. Such large kitchens could have existed in the Fort area around Wooden Structure #1 and/or the SE corner of House #1 (Fig. 9). At the Monasterio de San Francisco, the kitchens could have been on the eastern side of the Monastery, close to the exit to the orchards (Fig. 10). It is unlikely that European foods would have been cooked at the Fort area kitchens, but some of these foods could have been cooked at the Monastery, especially for the upper class clergy.

It is possible that Naboria women would have cooked the cassava bread on griddles, as recorded during gold mining (Oviedo VI, 1959, Ch. 8, Part 6). Perhaps the meat could have been cooked by African women, since they did have knowledge of domesticated animals before their arrival in the Caribbean (Voss 2008, 873). Historical documents record that beef was eaten boiled fresh, or in a type of sun-dried jerky (Patronato 1995, 56).

The next step is the identification of the tablewares upon which these foods were eaten, as well as the possible commensality spaces. Once again, the fact that enslaved and conscripted peoples, were provided standard food ware, based on native foods, can give insight into possible tablewares. More specifically, provided food would have been served in perishable containers made out of gourds, as was common in the area until the introduction of plastic in the 20th century (Abreu 2015; Porter 1846). Additionally, these enslaved peoples, in urban areas such as the Fort and the

Monasterio de San Francisco, would have mostly worked in construction, and would have eaten at the place of work, that is, at a nonpermanent, moveable, space.

At the same time, the military and the clergy have assigned commensality spaces. González identified two dining spaces at the Monastery (Dining Hall, dining hall for the sick) (Fig. 10). In the Spanish military tradition there are often barracks, which do include a mess hall (Mira-Caballos 2017). An overlapping area of Wooden Structure #2 and House #1 could have been a mess hall at some point, given the presence of the only well-defined tableware, namely Decorated glass.

Artifacts related to foodways - such as faunal remains, ceramic cookwares and tablewares, as well as glassware and metal utensils - were discarded in two areas, namely kitchen refuse deposits and construction fill, particularly the faunal remains. The refuse deposits and the construction fill were identified using patterns previously observed in other Spanish-American sites, in which refuse is believed to have been thrown in household backyards to avoid garbage smells in the homes (Deagan 1981, 632; Jamieson 2004, 432). The relation between these refuse pits/middens and structural remains is discussed in more detail in Chapter 6. Although the disposal in small pits seems consistent with dietary discards in domestic structures, the use of faunal remains in fill seems to be related to nondomestic areas. This was particularly true at the Fort campus, where faunal remains in the fill were quite ubiquitous.

7.2.3.2 Diseases and health care

In recent times, it is believed that diseases contributed as much, or even more, to the destruction of Indigenous lifeways in the New World, and particularly in the Caribbean, than did armed conflict (Diamond 2005, 210). Although several different waves of illnesses have been identified historically since 1492 (AGI, Patronato 172, R35; Guitar 1998, 248; Moya-Pons and Flores-Paz 2013), none seems to have had a greater effect on intercultural interactions at Concepción than the smallpox epidemic which struck from December 1518 and January 1519. It is believed to have killed close to a third of the Indigenous population of the island (AGI, Patronato 172, R35; Guitar 1998, 248; Mann et al. 2005; Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997, 1998; Pichardo 1944). It did not only affect Hispaniola, but historical evidence traces this epidemic in Cuba and Mexico in 1520 and going overland to the Incan Empire by 1526 (Diamond 2005, 210). Historical records mention that the disease came to the Americas through an African slave brought to either Hispaniola (Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997, 1998) or Cuba (Diamond 2005, 210); but Jared Diamond (2005, 207, 210) has suggested that the disease could have been spread to humans from cattle.

The first consequence of this disease was that, due to the sharp decrease in population, the Jeronymites were never able to successfully implement their Pueblo Tutelado program (Guitar 1998, 176; Kulstad 2008, 66; Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997,

1998). This led to a maintenance of the status quo and a continuation of the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan and the Repartimiento system (Charlevoix 1730, 287, 288). The second consequence was the perceived need to bring in African workers to substitute the Naborias stricken with smallpox (Crosby 1972, 47, 75; Kulstad 2008, 118; Purdy 1988, 640-41). It appears that this perceived need also fueled the plan to substitute gold for sugar as the main export of the colony (Moya-Pons 1978, 176).

In spite of the consequences of this disease, there is not much more additional mention of this disease in the historical records. A hospital is mentioned to have been built at Concepción, but no information has been found as to its location, or who the patients where (Lamb 1956, 171; Las Casas II, 1927, 268; Palm 1950). The archaeological record, however, does show that disease was a major concern, given the variety and amounts of health-related objects found at the site (see Chapter 6). Health-related artifacts were also found at La Isabela (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 152) and at Puerto Real (Deagan 1995b), proving that disease was not limited to those involved in gold mining.

7.2.3.3 Deathways

Although death is common to all humans, burial location at Concepción was not regulated. As discussed in more detail in Chapter 6, nine sets of human remains were found at the Monasterio de San Francisco. These all appear to have been formally buried. One set of unprovenienced human remains was found west of the northwest Masonry fort tower at the Fort campus. The burial at the Fort may have been a result of the 1562 earthquake.

During excavation it was believed that Indigenous peoples were buried in the flexed position, while Europeans were buried in the traditional Christian position, that is, laid out face-up with hands crossed on the chest (Abreu 2015; Coste 2015). However, given that Christianized Indios at El Chorro de Maita in northeastern Cuba are buried in extended position (Valcárcel-Rojas 2012), the difference in burial style may not necessarily indicate an ethnic separation. At St. Augustine, Bonnie McEwan (2001) suggested identifying the ethnic origin of the remains through the variety and quantity of artifacts with which they were buried. However, due to the excavation biases, it was difficult to determine which artifacts were buried with the remains, and which may have been above the floor during the earthquake collapse.

A final intercultural interaction revealed by the burials relate to Human Remains #8, found in a flexed position, under the corner of the Monastery's southwestern wall (Fig. 11). This implies that the Convent was built over an existing, precontact Indigenous buried bodies. Given that the masonry building was constructed from 1525-1528, it is unlikely that the construction over Indigenous remains was fortuitous. It may be one of

the earliest examples of the visual imposition of Christian churches over Indigenous religious sites (For examples in Mexico see Matos-Moctezuma 1993).

7.3 Micro-Scale Interpretation (Artifact Scale)

In this section an attempt will be made to ascertain activity and interaction areas based more on the interplay between an artifact's intended use and its actual use. Patterning on the landscape will be secondary.

For this exercise hawksbells will be used, given that their use is well identified in the literature. Also, these items are relatively plentiful at the Concepción site, as opposed to in other Circum-Caribbean sites.

7.3.1 Bells

It has been possible to discern probable uses of the different rumbler bells found at the Concepción site and plotted for this research (See discussion in Chapter 6, Section: Bells). As expected in the colonial context (Silliman 2010, 49), bell use at the Fort and the Franciscan monastery does not appear to be related to their original purpose, that is, as hawk locators. Their uses vary, depending on their contexts (Cobb and DePratter 2012, 456; Deagan 2002a, 138; Silliman 2010, 29). The plotted bells appear to have had one of three uses at the Fort and at the Monasterio de San Francisco: for the carrying of gold tribute, for clothing decoration, or for horse harness decoration.

In spite of missing temporal data, it was possible to discern that these bells were used in the colony's early period, heavily linked to the rich gold boom. Although only Fort Context #1 had a bell, metal slag and cupellation item fragments together in the same context, the rest of the bells were in middens, meaning that they had been discarded before the destruction of the city in 1562. The presence of expensive decorated glass in the same contexts also points to their use during the gold boom period. This does not mean, however, that all the bells were used to carry gold tribute. The presence of horseshoes and belt buckles suggests their use as clothing and/or horse harness decoration, that is, as sumptuary items. This would have also been common in the rich gold boom period.

The location of the contexts with bells in the landscape, as well as the other artifacts found in the same spatial context, suggest that the bells were used by Europeans, or at least persons following European traditions. More specifically, there are proportionally less Indigenous sherds found with bells in the same context, as compared to amounts of European artifacts and colonowares.

Most important, there appears to be differences in use between the Fort and the Monasterio de San Francisco. The presence of cupellation item fragments and metal

slag in three out of the four discrete contexts at the Fort suggest a use of bells in the tribute/gold industry. Conversely, at the Monasterio de San Francisco, the bell contexts did not contain metal slag or cupellation item fragments, but rather horseshoes and other clothing items, indicating their use as sumptuary items.

As with other artifacts in colonial contexts (Silliman 2010, 49), bells were used for different purposes, depending on where they were found within the site, as well as the other artifacts found in the same discrete context. Although only three of the proposed uses for the bells - as carriers for the gold tribute payment, clothing decoration, and horse harness decoration - are applicable in these excavated areas (Fort and Monasterio de San Francisco), it is quite possible that bells found in other areas of the archaeological site could have had other additional uses. Stated more plainly, artifact context is essential to understand artifact use.

7.4 Conclusion

This chapter has attempted to present an interpretation of the interplay between environmental, sociocultural, and biophysical intercultural interactions at Concepción from 1494 to 1564. This has been done in an effort to answer the question “What environmental, sociocultural, and biophysical intercultural interactions that occurred at Concepción in the early colonial period, contributed in the formation of today’s multicultural Dominican society?”

Additionally, it has explored the interplay between the conceptual and the practice/material (Sluyter 2001; Vargas-Arenas 1990). Special attention was paid to the moments of conflict between these two processes, which offered evidence of resistance and agency against the colonial domination policies present in all three types of interactions.

During this period of study, colonial authorities were concerned with controlling men and their activities at the economic, political, and material scale. The most overt population control mechanism was physical separation. Various social and environmental hierarchies were instituted, including settlement patterns, labor assignment, and sumptuary laws.

The data used for these interpretations came from previous chapters, and from extrapolation and comparison to similar sites around the Caribbean of a similar time period. However, due to Concepción’s inland location, and the early time period, comparisons to other sites have been tentative, and more investigations must be undertaken.

Although all three types of interactions were present at Concepción, they did not equally influence the material assemblages of the Fort and Monasterio de San Francisco campuses. This interpretation points to a stronger influence from sociocultural interactions (sumptuary laws and resistance to them, for example) at these sites, than

those played by biophysical interactions (i.e. casta classifications). Meanwhile, there seems to be a greater influence of environmental interactions on the Fort campus than on the Monasterio de San Francisco campus, in great part due to the Fort's campus position close to the central section of the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan.