Hispaniola - hell or home? : Decolonizing grand narratives about intercultural interactions at Concepción de la Vega (1494-1564)

Kulstad, P.M.

4 HISTORY OF HISTORY: PARTIAL CHRONOLOGY OF MILITARY, POLITICAL AND DIPLOMATIC EVENTS AFFECTING INTERACTIONS AT CONCEPCIÓN (1494-1564)

4.1 Introduction

As discussed in Chapters 1 and 2, Historical Archaeology gathers data from various avenues of inquiry to create a more complete picture of past lifeways (Collingwood 1946; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 4; Hodder 1986; Jamieson 2004, 432; Little 1996, 45; McGuire and Paynter 1991; Scott 1994, 3; Silliman 2010, 42; Singleton 1998; Wiley 1989, 1993). Chapter 3 presented a chronology of the archaeological interventions which have been undertaken at the Concepción site, and this Chapter will present a chronology of military, political and diplomatic events which affected intercultural interactions at Concepción during our period of study (1494-1564) (For a succinct list of governing authorities, See Table 4-1).

Traditionally, historical chronologies are closely linked to Grand Narratives, which often are subjective, rather than objective, recording of events, as discussed in Chapter 1 (Voss 2015, 353). Additionally, Historical Grand Narratives present data in a very descriptive and event-specific way, which are often hard to link to more anthropological concerns, such as household level activity and materiality (Deagan and Scardaville 1985, 34-35).

In spite of this limitation, it is important to examine the events which occurred at Concepción and other cities of Hispaniola during this crucial period. It must be remembered that from 1492 to 1509 - 17 years - Spanish colonization was focused solely on Hispaniola (Deagan 1996, 136), and Santo Domingo and Concepción were the largest settlements on the island at that time. Due to Concepción's political and economic importance in the Spanish colonization process, its lifeways and cultural practices were not only shaped by events which occurred within the city, but also by events which occurred elsewhere in the Spanish empire. Of particular importance are the government and religious policies used to mold the 16th century colonial experience.

The events will be subdivided and linked to the different settlement types imposed by the Spanish Crown during the period of study on the landscape of Hispaniola. The settlement process of Concepción itself was achieved in a series of steps, going from peopling a settlement to the foundation of a city (see Utrera in Guerrero 2016, 12). The settlement types were, in chronological order:

- Pre-contact Indigenous Settlements
- Palisades
- Casas Fuertes/Medieval
- Grid Town Plan
- Pueblo Tutelado

4.2 Examination of Historical Documentary Sources

For the purposes of this dissertation, historical documentary sources have been divided into primary and secondary. Primary sources have been defined as those contemporary documents which were written about Concepción by authors who did not base their work on other accounts. Secondary historical sources are considered to be those interpretive or narrative studies based on the works of earlier chroniclers. It is important to note that these are all European documents, since no documents have been found written by the Amerindians or the Africans who lived at Concepción during this period of occupation (See previous discussion of this in Kulstad 2008, 15).

Spanish primary documents were divided into two main categories: official chronicles and official correspondence. Information from the official chroniclers was commissioned by the colonial government and/or the Spanish Crown. Official correspondence covers both colonial government and religious sources (see Kulstad 2008, 15).

Primary source chronicles of the period during which Hispaniola was the only colonized island are limited to those written by Fray Ramón Pané (1974, 1990, 1999), Christopher Columbus (1947; 1982), Ferdinand Columbus (1959), Bartolomé de las Casas (1945, 1951, 1958, 1967, 1985, 1994), and Gonzalo Fernandez de Oviedo y Valdes (1959). Various authors have extracted data from these sources related solely to Santo Domingo and/or the Dominican Republic, such as Marte (1981), Rueda (1988), Patronato (1995), Rodríguez-Demorizi (1971) and Rodríguez-Morel (1999, 2000, 2011). These compilations do not include any interpretation of this data.

Although Christopher Columbus founded the fortress of Concepción in 1495, his writings do not offer much information about his time at Concepción. It is believed that his writings were edited by his son and by Las Casas (Keen 1959; Varela 1982), and it is possible that pertinent information about Concepción may have not been included (previously discussed in Kulstad 2008, 15).

Fray Ramón Pané, a Jeronymite priest, came to Hispaniola on Christopher Columbus's second voyage and was chosen by Columbus and the Crown to record the religious tradition of the Indigenous peoples (Arrom 1988; Kulstad 2008, 24). His writings are discussed in more detail below.

Although Gonzalo Fernandez de Oviedo lived in the Americas since 1515 (Guerrero 2016, 13), he did not become Mayor of the Fort at Santo Domingo and Official Chronicler of the Indies until 1533 (Rueda 1988, 14). His Historia general y natural de la Indias (1959) covers events in the New World from 1492 to 1548. It is an important primary source about the island as a whole, recording economic activities and natural resources of the island (Keegan and Carlson 2008; Keegan and Hofman 2017, 244). Although not officially published until 1548 (Guerrero 2016, 13; Palm 1955a, 73), Las Casas and others must have seen some of the earlier drafts.

Las Casas was dismayed by the fact that Oviedo only recorded natural history, and did not record the political and human events that were happening (Keegan 2007; Keegan and Hofman 2017, 244), particularly events relating to the mistreatment of the Indigenous people of the New World (Pérez-Fernández 2010). He decided to write his own history because the King needed to know about the terrible actions of the laity in the New World (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 363). His first volume, written in 1525-1527, covered the period from 1492 to 1520 (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 363).

Las Casas planned to publish a second volume of his history, covering from 1520 to 1550 (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 331). For this purpose, he collected documents from the Columbus family, Fray Ramon Pané, the Royal Court and others (Pérez-Fernández 2010). However, he died in 1566 before being able to finish writing, and all of the documents were sent to the Colegio San Gregorio in Valladolid (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 331).

Unfortunately, soon after his death, his writings were used by Spain's enemies as justification for actions against them, both in Europe and the Caribbean (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 363). His writings were used against Spain as early as the Dutch independence movement (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 341).

Fray Bartolomé de las Casas lived at Concepción around the year 1523 (Las Casas, Historia II, 1927, 152-54; Rueda 1988), and it is possible that his experience influenced his writings, particularly Brevísima relación de la destrucción de las Indias (1945, 1992, 1994), Historia de las Indias (1951, 1985), and the Apologética historia Sumaria (1958, 1967). However, most of Las Casas's writings focused on exposing the mistreatment of the Indigenous people by the Spaniards. For this reason, there is little information about everyday life at Concepción in his work. Concepción is mentioned specifically in the Apologética Historia Sumaria, but this source only covers from 1492 to 1520, and was not written until 1527 (Rueda 1988, 30) (See previous discussion of this in Kulstad 2008, 25).

Official correspondence came from various government and religious officials and dealt with various subjects (see Kulstad 2008, 16). Rodriguez-Morel (1999, 2000, 2011) has compiled religious correspondence dealing with Santo Domingo and Concepción, while Marte (1981), Incháustegui (1955), Utrera (1946, 1973), compiled government correspondence dealing with Hispaniola as a whole.

There were secondary sources produced both in the colonial and modern period. Although Pietro Martire d'Anghiera (1989) was the first to publish information related to the New World, he never lived in Concepción, or even the Americas. His work is nevertheless very important, since he had first-hand access to Columbus's writings, to Columbus himself, and the accounts of others who had also returned from the New World (see Kulstad 2008, 23). Others continued in later periods in the same vein, including Antonio de Herrera (1601) and Luis Joseph Peguero (1975).

In 1571 King Philip II commissions Herrera y Tordesillas to write a more complete Spanish history, presumably more objective than the one written by Las Casas (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 341). Philip II gave Herrera all the documents collected by Las Casas and the Archivo de Indias to use as sources (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 341). In spite of this, Herrera's book, published in 1601, only seems to use Las Casas's first volume (up to 1520), and mentions little of Hispaniola after 1520. Like Martire d'Anghiera and Oviedo, Antonio de Herrera did not visit Concepción, receiving his information from persons who had lived there. His chronicles cover the period from 1492 to 1554 (see Kulstad 2008, 26). In 1762, Luis Joseph Peguero extracted information from Herrera's document related to Hispaniola.

French Jesuit priest Pedro Francisco Charlevoix (1730) was directed to write a history of the French possessions in the New World, and decided to chronicle the entire history of Hispaniola, both Spanish and French. He based much of his historical data on the Spanish chroniclers, but also traveled throughout the island (1717-1722) and described the condition of each place (Charlevoix 1730, X). Of particular importance is his description of the architectural remains still present at the Concepción site during his travels (Charlevoix 1730) (see previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 27).

In Spain, meanwhile, a new compilation of documents about the the Spanish arrival in the Americas was attempted in time for the 400th Anniversary of Columbus' First Voyage. Between 1825 and 1837, Spanish scholar Martín Fernández de Navarrete undertook a review and census of the materials regarding the Spanish colonial attempts in the Americas during late 15th and early 16th centuries. Unfortunately, he used a system to compile material which was neither chronological, nor accurately indexed. For example, indexation of documents by important personalities mentioned takes precedent over the related geographical locations.

American writer and diplomat, Washington Irving, was notified of Fernández de Navarrete's work in 1826, and he went to Spain to look over the documents. Although Irving stated his purpose for republishing the documents as making the research more accessible to the public (see introduction to A History of the Life and Voyages of Christopher Columbus), he used a "romantic history" style, which mixes research data with the writer's interpretation. Irving's writings (1828a; 1828b; 1828c; 1829) are considered secondary sources.

Several modern (20th century) Dominican historical texts, based on interpretations of historical data, are also secondary sources. Some of these include Cassá (1978), García (1906), Guitar (1998), and Moya-Pons (1974, 1978, 1983, 1998, 2008) to name a few. A group of La Vega historians must be highlighted amongst them, principally Mario Concepción (1981), his niece Patria Quisqueya Ana Concepción (2000), and Francisco Torres-Petitón (2009) (See previous discussion of this in Kulstad 2008, 27).

Starting in the 1980s, the Archivo de Indias in Seville has been working on the digitation of material related to the Spanish colonial effort. The project has been ongoing and, at this time, has stated that it has been able to digitize most of the 16th century material (Kulstad 2018; Stevens-Acevedo 2018). However, attempts to use these collections both for this dissertation and for research about commerce at Concepción for the CUNY Dominican Studies Institute (Kulstad 2018), has shown the digitation to have been non-systematic and biased to previously researched topics (Stevens-Acevedo 2018).

The Dominican Academy of History believes that these files are not complete and have permanently hired Genaro Rodríguez-Morel to conduct historical research in the Archivo de Indias (Coste 2015). Unfortunately, Rodriguez-Morel is only assigned to research about the city of Santo Domingo, as opposed to the Santo Domingo province, and has collected little information about Concepción (Olsen 2011).

Of note is the CUNY Dominican Studies Institute's collection of documents dealing with Africans and/or the sugar industry, which have been transcribed and translated are included in an online exhibit "First Blacks" (CUNY DSI 2015). Although dealing with a different region and time period from the ones delimited in this dissertation, this collection contains important documents about Africans living on the island.

4.3 Before: The Pre-Contact Magua Cacicazgo Indigenous Settlement

As the base of operations for European actions in the American continent during most of the 16th Century, there is a good amount of historical documentation related to the island named La Española [Hispaniola] by Christopher Columbus, starting in 1492. Attempts were made by the Crown to record some of the history and lifeways of the Indigenous people living on the island, including the way settlements were laid out. Unfortunately, due to the fact that Indigenous people of the Caribbean did not have a writing system, only the information about the areas of interest of the Europeans were recorded (see discussion in Diamond 2005, Chapter 12, 215).

According to the Hell on Hispaniola Grand Narrative, the island was divided into five major cacicazgos: Maguá, Marién, Higuey, Maguana and Xaragua (Cassá 1974; Las Casas 1994; Moya 1976; Moya-Pons 1983; Rouse 1992; Tavares 1976, 33; Wilson 1990b). Vega (1980, 8) suggests this is based on Charlevoix's (1730) divisions, who, in turn does not cite his source, but appears to use Oviedo's divisions (Oviedo I, 1959, 62). However, the locations and boundaries of these divisions have been questioned (Vega 1980), and are still not fully understood today, and may have been more social than geographical (For further discussion see Cassá 1974; Herrera-Malatesta 2018; Rouse 1992; Vega 1980; Wilson 1990b).

Concepción de la Vega was founded in the Cibao Valley, in the Maguá cacicazgo (Las Casas I, 1967, 15-51), which was ruled by the Indigenous cacique (or chief)

Guarionex (Sauer 1993, 83; Kulstad 2008, 112; Las Casas I, 1967, 97; Wilson 1990b, 90). The main settlement of his cacicazgo was Guaricano (Wilson 1990b, 15), at a location currently unknown.

Las Casas described Indigenous settlements as varying from small to very large (Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 156–58). He described the settlements as not having any distinct streets, with the ruler's house found in main place or position. Ruler's homes were known as caneys (Rouse 1992,16–17; Wilson 1990b, 31–32), while the rest of the people lived in bohíos (Prieto 2010, 271). Although most archaeological data seems to present that bohíos were made of perishable materials, and laid out in a circular pattern (see also Hofman and Hoogland 2015; Hofman et al. 2014, 2018; Samson 2010; Sonneman et al. 2016), it has been suggested that the caneys may have been made of perishable materials in a square layout (Prieto 2010, 271).

Las Casas describes a well-swept and leveled rectangular open space in front of the ruler's dwelling (Las Casas 1985, vol. 1,156–58). This space, according to Las Casas, was known as the batey, and was used for a special ball game. Large settlements had several bateys within them (Las Casas 1985, vol. 1,156–58). Later researchers (Curet and Torres 2010, 262; Oliver 1998) have identified three types of ceremonial spaces in the Caribbean: rectangular, quasi-cuadrangular, and circular. It appears that only the rectangular were used as bateys, but the other spaces also had social and ceremonial uses, and are alternatively known as plazas (Curet and Torres 2010, 262). No ceremonial bateys or plazas have been found, so far, in the Concepción area.

4.4 Castile and Aragon in 1493

As has been amply documented elsewhere, Columbus did not anticipate arriving in a "New World" in 1492. His mission was to find a new trade route to the Indies so that the Spanish could create trade colonies there, similar to those already held by the Portuguese known as "feitorías" [factorías] (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 12; Diffie and Winius 1977, 41-50; Kulstad 2008, 35; MacAlister 1984, 46-51).

Isabella, Queen of Castile, offered to sponsor Columbus in his quest under a set of generous terms contained in the *Capitulaciones de Santa Fe*. Signed in April 1492, the Capitulaciones gave Columbus and his heirs the right to govern the lands he discovered in perpetuity, as well as economic benefits similar to those given to the leaders which fought with the Crown during the Reconquista and the colonization of the Canary Islands (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 12; Kulstad 2008, 36; Stevens-Arroyo 1993). It has been suggested by some that the ample rights given Columbus in the Capitulaciones reflect a lack of confidence in his success (García-Gallo 1987, 29; Pérez-Collados 1992, 95). Nevertheless, Columbus was successful, and returned to Spain in early 1493 with the idea of expanding the colony he had left on the northern coast of the island of Hispaniola (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 47; Chanca 1907). The

way in which this colony would be organized and governed became a point of contention between Columbus, Queen Isabella, and King Ferdinand.

The political situation in Castile, at the time of Christopher Columbus's return from his first voyage, was greatly affected by events which later influenced the way in which the New World colony would be governed. These events included the end of the Spanish Reconquista in 1492, and the power conflicts between the kingdoms of Castile and Aragon (see previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 35).

Spain had just completed the Reconquista in 1492. The Reconquista had been an 800 year war which had the unification of the country under Christian rule as its principal purpose. This process was mainly achieved through the conquest of lands in the hands of Moslem Moors living on the Iberian Peninsula (Fernández-Álvarez 2000, 49; Kulstad 2008, 36; Moya-Pons 1983, 11; Pérez-Collados 1992, 116; Pérez de Tudela 1955a). Success came partly due to the unification of the two main kingdoms, Castile and Aragon, through the marriage of its rulers, Isabella and Ferdinand (Fernández-Álvarez 2000, 49; Kulstad 2008, 36).

Although both Castile and Aragon had worked together in the Reconquista effort, each kingdom functioned as a separate entity, and would do so until the death of both Isabella and Ferdinand, and their joint heir ascended to the throne - Philip II in 1556 (Fernández-Álvarez 2000, 176; Kulstad 2008, 77). Of the two, Castile, governed by Isabella, had the most power, including the right to explore parts of the Atlantic, a Papal right shared with the kingdom of Portugal (Pérez-Collados 1992, 66; Pérez-Embrid 1951). The Papal mandate meant that when Columbus returned, only Castile could ask the Pope for the rights to these new territories (Ballesteros-Beretta 1945, 440; Charlevoix 1730, 64; Giménez-Fernández 1955, 316-317; Pérez-Collados 1992, 67). In 1493 the Pope granted Castile exclusive rights to the territories found by Columbus through the Bulas de Donación (García-Gallo 1982, 638; Pérez-Collados 1992, 36). These Bulas not only excluded other European countries from ownership of the new territories, but also excluded other Spanish kingdoms as well, including Aragon (Charlevoix 1730, 64). Major decisions regarding the Columbus enterprise during this period were undertaken by Queen Isabella as ruler of Castile. This continued until her death in 1504 (Fernández-Álvarez 2000, 262) (See discussion of this in Kulstad 2008, 62).

4.5 Medieval Casa Fuerte - La Isabela Feitoría (1493-1494)

Columbus planned to organize a gold-acquiring *feitoría* at Fort La Navidad, where he had left a group of Spaniards during his first trip (Chanca 1907; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 47;Kulstad 2008, 32). When he arrived to see La Navidad destroyed, he moved further east, and settled there(Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 47; Chanca 1907). The settlement was named La Isabela, leaving little doubt as to the Queen's leadership role in the enterprise (see previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 35).

Feitorías were a type of settlement set up in isolated locations to facilitate trade between two distant locations (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 8; DeCorse 2010, 210; Kulstad 2008, 35), and often close to existing African settlements (DeCorse 2010, 212-213). These settlements often exploited raw materials not readily available in Europe, such as gold or spices (Haring 1947, 31; Incháustegui 1955, 53; Pérez-Collados 1992, 117; Pérez de Tudela 1954, 317-318). These settlements were backed by private capital, and led by an individual who hired artisans, craftsmen, and laborers to undertake the labor (Arranz-Márquez 1991, 27; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 8; Kulstad 2008, 35). These types of trading posts had been used in the Mediterranean by several different countries since the mid-14th century (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 8; DeCorse 2010, 210)

Pérez de Tudela (1954) established that Columbus was quite familiar with the Portuguese feitoría model used in West Africa. It is believed he visited Saõ Jorge del Mina in coastal Ghana shortly after it was founded in 1482 (DeCorse 2010, 216). According to this model, the community leader would receive a license from the Portuguese Crown to start his colony and funds to pay the workers' wages. In exchange, the Crown would receive one-fifth of the profits generated, however, the Portuguese Crown did not assume political control over the territory in which the feitoría was established (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 8; Kulstad 2008, 35). (For more detailed information on feitorías see Diffie and Winius 1977, 41-50; MacAlister 1984, 46-51).

The La Isabela feitoría was set up according to the terms presented in the Capitulaciones de Santa Fe (Parry and Keith 1984,18–20). Columbus became the Governor of the settlement, fairly independent of Crown authority (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 12; Kulstad 2008, 35). He also took 1/10 of the merchandise acquired, i.e. the gold produced (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 12). Feitorías were considered purely economic (DeCorse 2010, 209; Kulstad 2008, 35; Moya-Pons 1983, 13), so religion and its representatives did not play a big role in these types of settlements.

4.6 Columbus Palisade Settlements (1494-1495)

Gold was necessary for the success of the La Isabela feitoría, so forays were planned to the Cibao, where this mineral was to be found(Chanca 1907; Sauer 1993, 127; Wilson 1990b, 76). There were two forays into the island inland in January 1494. One led by Alonso de Ojeda, gathered relatively large amounts of gold (Chanca 1907; Wilson 1990b, 76). In March of the same year, Columbus recreated Ojeda's trip with close to 500 people, seeing several villages on the plains along the way where they traded various items (Las Casas 1951, 368; Wilson 1990b, 78). The path cleared became known as the Paso de los Hidalgos (Coste 2015; Hofman et al. 2018; Las Casas 1951, 368;Wilson 1009b, 78).

According to Las Casas, Columbus set up various fortresses along the way, La Magdalena, Santo Tomas de Janico, Santiago, Santa Catherina, Esperanza,

Concepción and Bonao (Las Casas 1875 TII, 30-35; Ulloa-Hung and Sonneman 2017, 12). As with similar forts in West Africa (DeCorse 2010, 212-213), these were more outposts with few people, close to existing Indigenous villages. Concepción seems to have been established on December 8th, 1494 (Concepción 1981; Kulstad 2008, 38; Torres-Petitón 1988, 2009). It was located close to the Indigenous village of Guarícano (Deagan 1999, 8; Kulstad 2008, 38; Las Casas 1985, 400).

As trade did not yield enough gold, Columbus decided to modify his settlement model and incorporate an Indigenous tribute system (AGI, Indiferente General 418, LI, ff121v-122; Charlevoix 1730, 110; Cassá 1978, 33; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 62; Wilson 1990b, 89). According to the tribute system, each Indigenous community had to pay one hawk's bell full of gold for each member of their community over 14 years of age, every three months (Cassá 1978, 33; Charlevoix 1730, 110; Las Casas 1951, I, 417; Wilson 1990a). In those areas where gold was difficult to find, the tribute was negotiated as 25 lbs of cotton Charlevoix 1730, 110; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1,445–46; Wilson 1990b, 93), labor, food (Sauer 1993, 86; Las Casas 1951, I, 417; Wilson 1990b, 93) or personal services rendered to the Spanish every three months (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 62; Columbus 1959,149–50). *Indios* had to wear a brass or copper token around their neck as proof of payment. Those who did not wear it were punished (Columbus 1959, 149-50; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 62) (see previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 40).

Guarionex, unlike other caciques, was willing to negotiate with the Spanish and fulfill their tribute requirements (Anghiera 1970, 21-122, 142-149; Wilson 1990b, 90). The Spanish were also willing to be more lenient with him due to the fact that his region paid the most tribute (Las Casas 1951, 458; Wilson 1990b, 105). As a consequence, a Spanish settlement grew around the Concepción fortress.

The collection of tribute was haphazard, creating tensions between the European/Spanish and the *Indios*, leading the European/Spanish to impose the tribute through force (Incháustegui 1955, 51; Kulstad 2008, 40; Las Casas 1951, I, 417). Tensions between the two groups grew, leading to armed conflict (Incháustegui 1955, 51; Las Casas 1951, I, 417).

4.6.1 Battle of the Santo Cerro (1495)

As discussed in Chapter 1, the Battle of the Santo Cerro is a foundational element of the "Hell on Hispaniola" Grand Narrative. What actually occurred during the battle, its actual location, and even its appropriate name, has been debated by historians and chroniclers since colonial times (González 2013; Guitar 2013; Kulstad 2008, 40). The pertinent details are reviewed in the next sections.

4.6.2 Battle(s) of the Vega Real

The Dominican Academy of History has stated that the “Battle of the Santo Cerro” could not have occurred as tradition records it (see Chapter 1) (González 2013). The Academy has debated the incongruity of accounts, and has proposed that two separate events actually occurred: the Battle of La Vega Real and the Battle of the Santo Cerro. This is based on incongruities in accounts (Columbus 1824, 128) which state that the Battle of La Vega Real occurred two days travel from La Isabela, making a battle at the Santo Cerro geographically impossible, since the Santo Cerro is farther away (González 2013; Incháustegui 1955, 83; Kulstad 2008, 40).

Wilson (1990b, 74), after reanalyzing historical documents at the Archivo de Indias, proposed that more than one battle occurred. He suggested that the legendary battle is actually based on three skirmishes within the Vega Real. More specifically, he pinpoints one in March 1495, the second in the spring of 1497, and the third in the summer of 1498 (Battle of El Cabrón).

4.6.2.1 First battle of the Vega Real (1495)

According to Wilson’s (1990b) research, the first battle of the Vega Real occurred in late March 1595 against “100,000 men” on Cacique Caonabo's side, while Cacique Guacanagarix fought on Christopher Columbus's side (Columbus 1824, 128; Wilson 1990b, 89). Since Wilson found no mention of Guarionex related to this battle (Anghiera 1970, 21-122, 142-149; Columbus 1824, 128; Wilson 1990b, 90), it is possible that this battle did occur closer to La Isabela, in the western part of the Vega valley, but so far there is no definite proof of this.

As a consequence of this battle, the Spanish began to consider Guarionex as the most powerful leader left in the valley (Wilson 1990b, 91), and many important events began to occur in and around Guaricano and Concepción.

4.7 Relocation of the Concepción Settlement (1495)

In 1495 the Fort and settlement of Concepción were moved half a league away from Guaricano after attempts by the Indigenous people to burn them (Las Casas 1985, 430; Deagan 1999, 9). It is uncertain whether the burning occurred during the First Battle of the Vega Real, or at a later time. The new fort and settlement moved away from the Rio Verde and Guaricano (Las Casas 1985, 400; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 60) to be close to the Santo Cerro, at the location known today as Vega Vieja.

As time progressed, King Ferdinand became concerned that a feitoría settlement gave Columbus too much power (Pérez-Collados 1992, 116, 160). For years, as part of the Reconquista process, Ferdinand and Isabella had been centralizing power around their united Crown, taking it away from the old landed nobles in both of their kingdoms

(Fernández-Álvarez 2000, 49; Guitar 1998, 133). If the La Isabela colony were successful, Columbus's success would threaten this effort. For this reason, Ferdinand proposed that the La Isabela settlement be changed from a feitoria to a settlement based on the Castilla-León Reconquista model used during their campaigns in both Spain and the Canary Islands (Aznar-Vallejo 1983; Pérez-Collados 1992, 116; Pérez de Tudela 1954, 317-318; Stevens-Arroyo 1993) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 35).

This model, however, unlike the feitoría, required an involved local work force. The Reconquista model would require that the Indigenous peoples work as opposed to just paying tribute (Cassá 1978, 44; Wilson 1990a). This made the *Indios* the most important element of colonial production ((Moya-Pons 2008, 35). If this were to be implemented, knowledge of Indigenous lifeways would be essential to this endeavor.

4.7.1 Fray Ramón Pané Studies Indigenous Lifeways at Concepción (1496-1498??)

While colonial authorities were re-organizing the economic model of the colony, the Church started to ponder the position of the Indigenous people in the religious world. An all-important question arose as to whether they had souls - where they human? Alternately, depending on their level of knowledge of Christianity, they could or could not be enslaved in the same way Africans had been enslaved (Deive 1995).

For both of these reasons, Christopher Columbus commissioned Fray Ramon Pané to study the religious beliefs of the Indigenous peoples on the island (Arrom 1988; Deagan 1999, 8; Kulstad 2008, 41; Las Casas 1958, 417; Pané 1974, 1990, 1999). Pané attempted to record the Indigenous religious tradition in the area from 1496 to 1498 (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 39; Kulstad 2008, 41; Las Casas 1958, 417; Pané 1974, 1990, 1999). There is some dispute as to whose customs did Pané actually record, since he does not state it specifically (Keegan and Hofman 2017, 115; Pané 1974, 1990, 1999). However, he does record specific events which occurred in Guarionex's settlement (Arrom 1988; Pané 1974, 1990, 1999; Wilson 1990b, 87), where he is believed to have lived close to two years (Arrom 1988; Wilson 1990b, 12).

4.7.2 Roldán Rebellion (1496-1498)

While Pané was undertaking his work at Concepción, the Roldán Rebellion was occurring at La Isabela. In 1496, while Christopher Columbus was in Spain (Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448-57; Pérez-Collados 1992, 144), and his brothers were in command of the colony, the Spanish colonists at La Isabela began to resent the fact that they were only paid workers with no stake in the enterprise (Sauer 1993, 112). It did not help that they were starving and were unable to find much gold (Anghiera 1989, 53-54; Cassá 1978, 33; Charlevoix 1730, 127; Las Casas 1951, 448; Pérez-Collados 1992, 153). The

protest was led by Columbus's servant, Francisco Roldán (Charlevoix 1730, 127; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 68; García 1906, 42; Guerrero 2016, 16; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448-57). Up to one third of the Spanish on the island supported Roldán, especially those of the artisan, or non-elite, class Cassá 1978, 35; Charlevoix 1730, 127; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448 – 57) (See previous discussion of this in Kulstad 2008, 42).

In order to successfully defeat the Columbus brothers, the fort system had to be disabled (Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448-57; Wilson 1990a). To do this, Roldán had to take over Concepción fort, located in the middle of the fortification line (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 69; García 1906, 43; Kulstad 2008, 41; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448 – 57). Roldán managed to convince many of the caciques of the Vega Valley to support him (Charlevoix 1730, 128; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448 – 57). He left 70 men stationed close to the settlement of a lesser cacique, Diego Marque, close to the Concepción settlement (Guerrero 2016, 16; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448 – 57).

His attack, however, was repelled by Miguel de Ballester, commander of the Concepción fort (Charlevoix 1730, 128; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448 – 57; Kulstad 2008, 41; Las Casas in Rueda 1988, 430; Varela 1982, 234-235). The next day, additional Spanish troops arrived at Concepción fort, led by Bartolomé Columbus, and they disbanded Roldán's troops (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 69; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448 – 57; Las Casas in Rueda 1988, 430). Unable to conquer Concepción, Roldán's followers roamed the island, taking the Indigenous peoples' food and women, and looking for gold. They eventually set up a separate European settlement in Jaragua, on the western part of the island (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 69; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448-57; Guerrero 2016, 16). Roldán's rebellion lasted two years, from 1496 to 1498 (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 69; Las Casas 1985, vol. 1, 448 – 57; Moya-Pons 1978; Pichardo 1944) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 41).

4.7.3 Second and Third Battle(s) of the Vega Real

4.7.3.1 Second battle of the Vega Real/Night of the 14 Caciques

The second Battle of the Vega Real happened in the spring of 1497 (Las Casas I, CXV 1985, vol. I, 445-46; Wilson 1990b, 96). A group of 14 caciques in the La Vega Valley, including Guarionex, united to protest against the tribute system by fighting against the Spanish forces (Anghiera in Gil and Varela 1984a, 90-91; Las Casas I, CXV 1985, vol. I, 445-46; Wilson 1990b, 96). Two main causes are cited as the reasons behind the revolt. The first was the burning at the stake of a group of Guarionex's people who had supposedly desecrated Christian images in Concepción (García 1906, 41; Pané 1974, 1990, 1999). The second was the inability to pay the tribute imposed by Christopher Columbus. Famine and disease also contributed to the disruption of

Indigenous society (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 62, 199; Wilson 1990a). Although Cacique Guarionex had been able to meet the tribute quota in 1495 (Anghiera 1970, 21-122, 142-149; Wilson 1990a), it was impossible the second year, so he offered Columbus the produce of a manioc farm “50 leagues long and 20 wide” (Charlevoix 1730, 110; Peguero 1975, 85; Wilson 1990a). Columbus did not accept that offer (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 70).

In May 1497, Bartolome Columbus led a nighttime raid against the caciques and imprisoned them in the Concepción fort (Anghiera in Gil and Varela 1984a, 90; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 67; Kulstad 2008, 40; Wilson 1990a, 1990b, 100). Las Casas (1951, 445-46) narrates that many lesser caciques were killed, but that Guarionex was spared because of 5,000 of his followers came to beg for his forgiveness. Anghiera (1970, 21-122,142-149 is more cynical and proposes Guarionex was saved to guarantee that his subjects would continue to tend their food plots.

4.7.3.2 Third battle of the Vega Real/Battle of El Cabrón (1498)

At this point Guarionex found himself in a quandary. According to the Spanish regulations, as the cacique he had the responsibility to deliver the gold tribute in exchange for his freedom (Anghiera 1970, 21-122,142-149; Charlevoix 1730, 130; Wilson 1990a). According to his subjects, he had to help liberate them from the Spanish invaders (Charlevoix 1730, 130; Wilson 1990a). He could not break his promise to his people, and would have been imprisoned at the fort again if he went against the Spanish, so Guarionex ran away to a northern province to distance himself from the conflict (Anghiera 1970, 21-122,142-149; Charlevoix 1730, 130; Las Casas I, 1951, 445). Bartolomé Columbus, however, saw this as a breach of Guarionex’s agreement with the European/Spanish (Las Casas I, 1951, 445; Wilson 1990b, 102-108), so he recaptured, and incarcerated him again at Concepción fort. He remained there until he was sent to Spain in 1502, drowning at sea on the way (Las Casas in Rueda 1988, 444).

4.8 Implantation of the Medieval Casa Fuerte Model at Concepción (1499-1502)

By the end of 1499 the situation on Hispaniola had become chaotic. The *Indios* continued to rebel, and Roldán’s followers tried to manipulate the political situation to their advantage through small-scale uprisings (Kulstad 2008, 42; Las Casas I, 1951, 447; Wilson 1990b, 129. Concepción was especially affected, since many of Roldán’s followers lived in the area (Las Casas I, 1951, 447; Charlevoix 1730, 158). Christopher Columbus could no longer govern the colony, and the Spanish Crown sent a judge Bobadilla to settle the disturbances (Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 47; Pérez-Collados 1992, 161).

An agreement was reached which gave Roldán's group the choice of returning to Spain or staying in the official colony, the payment of back wages, and the right to have the vassalage of the caciques linked to the land they received (Cassá 1978, 36; Charlevoix 1730, 153; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 201; García 1906, 47; Las Casas 1985, vol. 2, 103; Pérez-Collados 1992, 156; Varela 1982, 274-275). Those who decided to stay were resettled in the Central Cibao Valley (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 203; Las Casas 1985, vol. 2, 103), specifically in Bonao, around the Rio Verde close to Concepción, and in Santiago (Charlevoix 1730, 153). Some also were settled close to Esperanza Fort (Guerrero 2016, 18; Las Casas 1985, vol. 2, 103). Each settler received 1,000 manioc plants, which were cared for by their *Indio* workers (Charlevoix 1730, 153). It also guaranteed land and *Indio* labor to the non-elite ex-rebels, a privilege that the existing Spanish class structure had previously only allowed the highest classes (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 201; Las Casas 1985, vol. 2, 64; Moya-Pons 1983, 24) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 44).

The Crown took advantage of Columbus's defeat against Roldán to take control of the colony (Julián 2015) and impose the Castilla-León Reconquista colonization model. This model was based on the one implemented in the Reconquista of Spain and in the Canary Islands (see Aznar-Vallejo 1983; Pérez-Collados 1992, 116; Pérez de Tudela 1954, 317-318; Stevens-Arroyo 1993).

The Reconquista, a 800-year war which had the Christianization of the Spain as its principal purpose, created the 15th century Castilian institutions that governed Spanish life (Kulstad 2008, 162; Moya-Pons 1983, 11; Pérez-Collados 1992, 116; Pérez de Tudela 1955a). The Castilians used a specific model to resettle the land they had conquered. This model saw Christians as a force on a military offensive, and then as a colonizing presence which would distribute land, convert the infidel, and establish municipal structures (Kulstad 2008, 162; Pérez-Collados 1992, 116; Pérez de Tudela 1954, 317-318). Unlike the inherently economic feitoría system that Columbus had tried to implement, the Reconquista model followed an intricate moral code of ethics, known as hidalgüismo (Elliott 1963, 38; Moya-Pons 1983, 13; Vicens-Vives 1969, 349). One of the main precepts of hidalgüismo was the disdain for manual labor (Kulstad 2008, 163; Moya-Pons 1983, 12). It considered work done by tradesmen, merchants, and those involved in agricultural labor, to be of less "quality" (Kulstad 2008, 163; Moya-Pons 1983, 12). These precepts were to greatly impact the development of the Spanish colonial system.

Municipal centers and towns were led by a group of landowners who chose their leaders from amongst themselves (Kulstad 2008, 164; Moya-Pons 1983, 16-17). There were several posts, and together they formed a town government (ayuntamiento) whose main functions included collecting taxes, keeping the peace, guaranteeing town supplies, regulating prices, and executing public works (Kulstad 2008, 37; Moya-Pons

1983, 16-17). (For a more comprehensive analysis of this model see Pérez de Tudela 1954, 1956, 1983).

In the Reconquista model, land conquered from “infidels” was distributed among those elite Christians who had helped in the conquest (Kulstad 2008, 36; Moya-Pons 1983, 15; Pérez-Collados 1992, 116; Willis 1984, 12). In exchange, the new owners promised to convert the infidel and establish municipal centers and towns (Pérez-Collados 1992, 116; Pérez de Tudela 1954, 317-318). This type of structure is inherently dependent on centralized Crown control (Pérez-Collados 1992, 163) (see previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 36).

The integration of *Indios* into the colonial system was an essential element of this colonial model, given that manual work was disdained. “Land without Indios were worthless” (Arranz-Marquez 1982, 47), since there was no labor available. This type of colonization model was also more logistically useful for the Church’s christianization efforts. Workers within a colony organized around urbanity were easier to indoctrinate, as they were easier to access (Graham 1998, 26).

4.8.1 Bobadilla Government (1500-1502)

The Crown, especially Queen Isabella, was unpleased with Columbus’s decision to distribute *Indio* workers to Roldán’s followers (AGI, Indiferente General 418, LI, ff121v-122; Charlevoix 1730, 157; Kulstad 2008, 46; Pérez-Collados 1992, 166). They sent Judge Francisco de Bobadilla to substitute Columbus (Cassá 1978, 36; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 203; Kulstad 2008, 46; Julián 2015; Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 47; Pérez-Collados 1992, 161).

The main accusation against the Columbuses was their encroachment on what were perceived to be Crown rights in the colony, most specifically in regards to the distribution of *Indio* laborers (AGI, Indif. Gen., Leg. 418. tomo III, f. 249; Charlevoix 1730, 158; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 203; Las Casas I, 1985, 172; Kulstad 2008, 47; Moya-Pons 1987). The Crown believed that all *Indios* owed vassalage to Castile and its Queen, and only she could decide what type of work, if any, they would undertake (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 206; Incháustegui 1955, 93; Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 165-174; Kulstad 2008, 47; Lamb 1956, 91; Las Casas I, 1985, 172; Pérez-Collados 1992, 155). The Queen, it should be noted, did not protest the collection of tribute from the *Indios*, just their assignment to private individuals.

Once on the island, Bobadilla opted to maintain the status quo with one notable exception, which was the decision to exempt gold miners from paying the 60% tax on their production (50% for the Crown and 10% for Christopher Columbus) in an effort to boost the industry (Cassá 1978, 40; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 204). Suddenly large amounts of gold were collected, just as Columbus had predicted (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 204). Much of the gold must have come from the Concepción area, since the

city was later chosen as the site of one of the colony's two foundries (Charlevoix 1730, 221; Deagan 1999; García 1906, 68; Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 18-19, 20, 31, 41, 57; Kulstad 2008, 47; Lamb 1956, 44). This decision led to Bobadilla being recalled by the Crown in 1502 (Cassá 1978, 40; Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 48; Lamb 1956, 41; Rodríguez-Morel 1999, 444), and to the appointment of Fray Nicolas de Ovando as the new governor (Chacón-Calvo 1929, 39-42; Incháustegui 1955, 28-29, 89; Lamb 1956, 41; Marte 1981, 9).

4.9 Ovando's Implantation of the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan (1502-1509)

Ovando's main tasks were to organize the colony according to the Reconquista model and collect the Crown's revenues (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 205; Marte 1981, 9; Moya-Pons 1983, 24; Pérez-Collados 1992, 168). In order to do this, he had to reorganize both the power structure and the workforce. More specifically, he had to take away the power and workers Columbus had given to Roldán's followers, and find a way to have a productive workforce (Charlevoix 1730, 189) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 48).

Governor Nicolas de Ovando arrived on Hispaniola in 1502 with 2,500 settlers in 30 ships, including women and children. The ships carrying his expedition were to return not only with large quantities of gold-probably mined at Concepción, but also carrying passengers such as ex-Governor Bobadilla, Roldán and his followers, and the imprisoned Cacique Guarionex (Kulstad 2008, 48; Moya-Pons 1983; Peguero and de los Santos 1983). Unfortunately, a hurricane destroyed the entire fleet soon after leaving (Kulstad 2008, 48; Las Casas II, 1985, 226; Moya-Pons 1983; Peguero and de los Santos 1983; Rodríguez-Morel 1999, 444).

Ovando started by liberating all the *Indios* held by Roldán's followers, and taking away the group's source of economic power (Charlevoix 1730, 189). At the same time, Queen Isabela ordered that the *Indios* should live in independent communities and work for the Spanish in the gold mines (and in other activities) for specific periods during the year (Cassá 1978, 44; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 206; Incháustegui 1955, 94; Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 172; Lamb 1956, 92). This work would serve to pay the tribute, and the *Indios* were to be taught Christian ways and the European/ Spanish way of life (Cassá 1978, 44; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 206; Incháustegui 1955, 9). A final, secret, instruction to Ovando ordered *Indio* communities to be set up close to gold mines to provide a constant workforce(Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 206; Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 174-179; Lamb 1956, 92; Moya-Pons 1986, 149; 1987, 37) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 48).

The plan was a failure because the *Indios* ran away and would not work (Charlevoix 1730, 189; Incháustegui 1955, 94; Moya-Pons 1987, 37). At the same time, the European/Spanish were unable to perform the agricultural and gold production

work, due to either the lack of desire or the lack of knowledge (Moya-Pons 1983, 12). Ovando's solution was to suggest an expansion of the distribution system whereby all Castilian settlers, not just Roldán's followers, were entitled to "hold" *Indio* laborers (Charlevoix 1730, 189; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 206). As the governor representing the Crown, he would be able to decide who would be assigned laborers, and in what numbers (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 205). The holding of *Indio* workers was justified under the principle that this system would guarantee constant exposition and indoctrination in Christian values (Charlevoix 1730, 189; Las Casas II, 1985, 226; Moya-Pons 1978, 1983, 25; Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 54). The system, known as the Repartimiento, was ratified by the Crown in 1503 (Cassá 1978, 43; Moya-Pons 1978; Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 54) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 49).

Ovando also reorganized the colony's power structure through the imposition of the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan, which implanted an idealized version of the Castillo-Leon social model on the landscape. These settlements were to be run by the settlement's elite members, or vecinos (landowning families). The vecino condition was based on the three elements of Castilian worthiness - honesty, good upbringing and limpieza de sangre [clean bloodlines] (Arranz-Márquez 1991, 172; Kulstad 2008, 51), and on marital status (Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971, 266). No Jews, Moors, or anyone converted from these religions could be considered a vecino. Ideally, the person had to be older than 20, and both a Christian and a Castilian (Haring 1939, 131; Incháustegui 1955, 62; Kulstad 2008, 51).

The Crown was concerned with creating a urban model which guaranteed their possession on the land they conquered, both in Spain and in the Americas. The need to rapidly populate the whole continent was solved through the creation of a standardized population model (Brewer-Carías 2007, 53).

This model was based on the pre-Renaissance and Renaissance ideas which circulated in the Spanish court during the reign of Isabel and Ferdinand, and later Charles V and Philip II (Pérez-Montás 2001, 195). This Ibero-American Grid Town Plan was based on the Partidas of King Alonso X of Castile. This model was also influenced by the Vitruvian principles that had governed Greek and Roman city construction (Brewer-Carías 2007, 32, 35-40; Pérez-Montás 1998). When it was taken to the Americas, the city was adapted to the geographical conditions present at each site, following ideas presented by Renaissance man León Battista Alberti (Brewer-Carías 2007, 40-43; Pérez-Montás 2001, 195).

The plan consisted of a settlement organized around a central plaza, or square. The main streets would extend from this plaza in a square grid pattern (Oviedo n.d. Bar. I, Quin. III, Dial. 6; Pérez-Montás 2001, 104). The lots closest to this main plaza would be reserved for government buildings, commerce, and the highest status families (Lamb 1956, 84; Pérez-Montás 2001, 104; Oviedo n.d. Bar. I, Quin. III, Dial. 6). All of these buildings were to be built from stone (Lamb 1956, 84; Oviedo n.d. Bar. I, Quin. III, Dial.

6). Class status was determined by distance of homes from the main square (Lamb 1956, 84; Oviedo n.d. Bar. I, Quin. III, Dial. 6). This model had two versions, one for coastal cities and the other for inland settlements (Brewer-Carías 2007, 52).

One of the main functional reasons for the use of this model was the ease with which expansion and ordinary city growth could be achieved (Brewer-Carías 2007, 52). In other words, streets and other urban areas could be added to a city more easily if this was organized in a rectilinear, rather than in an organic, manner.

The first Royal instructions for construction using this model were given to Nicolas de Ovando when on his way to Hispaniola in 1502 (Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 100; Oviedo n.d. Bar. I, Quin. III, Dial. 6; Pérez-Montás 2001, 104). Ovando was familiar with this type of city because he had helped organize the city of Santa Fe in the province of Granada, in Spain, after the Conquest over the Moors in January 1492 (Pérez-Montás 2001, 106).

These instructions for colonization regulated, among others, the following aspects of the city landscape (Brewer-Carías 2007, 53):

1. The discovery and settlement procedure

2. Regulations of the site and location of the settlements
    - A. Choosing the site
        - a. Principles related to health
        - b. Principles related to supplies
    - B. Location of towns
        - a. Altitude
        - b. Inland towns on river banks
        - c. Coastal towns

3. Regulations on land distribution
    - A. Land as public property and the allocation of property to colonists
    - B. Land distribution
    - C. Distribution of lots to individuals
    - D. The obligation to occupy the land
    - E. Equality in land distribution
    - F. Distribution units: peonías and caballerías
    - G. Colonist obligations

4. Norms about regular and limitless plotting in the foundation of new towns
    - A. The orthogonal grid starting at the main plaza
    - B. Main Plaza
        - a. Location
        - b. Form
        - c. Dimension
        - d. Intersection of streets within the plaza

e. Orientation of corners and protection from the wind
f. Gateways to the main plaza

C. Streets
a. Width of the streets
b. Extension of the regular street grid

D. Minor Plazas

5. Regulations for Buildings
A. Temple or Main Church (Cathedral)
a. Churches in coastal settlements
b. Churches in inland settlements

B. Public Service Buildings
a. In coastal settlements
b. In inland settlements

C. The use of lots

By the end of his term in 1509, Ovando had either created or reorganized 16 settlements to follow the Spanish municipal structure: Lares de Guahaba, Puerto Real, Puerto Plata, Santiago de los Caballeros, Concepción de La Vega, Cotuí, Bonao, Santa Cruz de Icayagua, Higüey, Santo Domingo, Buenaventura, Azua, San Juan de la Maguana, La Vera Paz, Yaquimo, and La Sabana (Cassá 1978, 42; Charlevoix 1730, 196; Deagan 1999, 9; García 1906, 65; Moya-Pons 1987; Sauer 1966). These settlements made up a complementary east/west axis to Columbus's north/south settlements (Guerrero 2016, 21). In 1508, there were also efforts to start organized settlements in Puerto Rico (Moya Pons 2008, 34). Each of these settlements set up a city governance structure, constructed of municipal buildings and churches, installed the mayor and priests, etc. (García 1906, 70). In other words, Ovando organized the town infrastructure in a manner that guaranteed alliance to the Spanish Crown (Concepción 1981; Kulstad 2008, 49; Lamb 1956; Moya-Pons 1978; Palm 1951, 1952).

The shift to the Grid Town Plan also included a religious component. The Pope allowed the Crown to collect tithes and taxes from Hispaniola's settlers in exchange for building and safeguarding all church-related objects, from Cathedrals to the mass accoutrements (Patronato 1995). This made the construction of churches just as important as the construction of forts within a Spanish town (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 111).

In Concepción, there is evidence of construction of not only the Cathedral, but also of a Franciscan monastery (Ober 1893, 321; Palm 1955a, 47-48). Although it is known that Franciscan friars were present on the island since the settlement of La Isabela (Errasti 1998, 25-26), their first large community (12-13 friars) arrived with Ovando in 1502 (Arranz-Marquez 1982, 30; Colección Muñoz, XV, 209 sig.; Lamb 1956, 49). Most of these friars moved to Concepción (Incháustegui 1955). The Franciscan Monastery was one of the first buildings to be commissioned by Ovando at Concepción

(Cohen 1997b, 6; Kulstad 2008, 123; Lamb 1956). It was a temporary structure built of wood and thatch sometime between 1502 and 1509 (Deagan 1999, 10; Palm 1955a, 22- 23). (For more information on the Franciscans in early colonial Hispaniola, see Arranz-Márquez 1991, 19-32; Dobal 1987, 1991; Errasti 1998, 25-26; Tavani 1991, vol. 1, 129).

Only two settlements - Santo Domingo and Concepción - were formally designated as "cities" (as opposed to being towns, as the rest were considered) by King Ferdinand in 1508 (Concepción 1981; Herrera 1601; Marte 1981; Peguero 1975, 154-155; Rodríguez-Morel 2000, xvii). Concepción was designated as a city because of its economic and geographical importance, and is thought to have been larger in area than Santo Domingo during the early 16th century (Deagan 1999, 9; Kulstad 2008, 51).

Ovando visited each of the settlements to personally present them with their coat of arms (García 1906, 70; Inéditos América y Oceanía, 1884 XXXII, 60-65; Lamb 1956, 158). Concepción's coat of arms reflects the city's religious history (Peguero 1975, 154-155). It has a red background, with a silver castle in the center. Over the castle is a smaller blue shield with twelve gold stars. The color blue and the placement of the stars symbolize the Virgen de las Mercedes (Peguero 1975, 156) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 50).

A large portion of European/Spanish settlers went to the gold-mining regions, Concepción and Buenaventura (in the south) (Charlevoix 1730, 221; Las Casas 1985, 226), and by 1503 these were the two places on the island where gold was smelted twice a year (Charlevoix 1730, 221; García 1906, 68; Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 18-19, 20, 31, 41, 57; Lamb 1956, 44). Concepción's central location also led to its having legal jurisdiction over the northern half of the island, namely the towns of Santiago, Puerto Plata, Puerto Real, Bonao, Lares de Guahaba, and Montecristi (Peguero 1975, 167) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 51).

By 1508, however, gold mining was affected by the loss of *Indio* laborers (known as *Naborías*) to disease and working conditions. This forced colonial authorities to find new sources of laborers (Anghiera II, 1989, 248-274; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 209; Guitar 1998, 127; Las Casas II, 1995, Chps. 43-45). In 1508, the Crown gave permission to import Indigenous people from other parts of the Circum-Caribbean (Arranz-Márquez 1991, 79-26; Ferdinand 1511; Keegan 1992, 221-223; Marte 1981, 89; Moya-Pons 12008, 34; Rogoziński 2000, 31). These *Indios* would be known as the *Perpetual Naborías* (See discussion of *Indio* social/labor classifications in Chapter 5).

4.9.1 First Governorship of Diego Columbus (1509-1514)

After having tried unsuccessfully to restore his family's rights through personal petitions to King Ferdinand (AGI, Patronato, Tomo III, ramo 14, legajo 8; Keegan and Hofman 2017, 243; Pérez-Collados 1992, 171; Sauer 1993, 35-36), Diego Columbus,

Christopher's son, tried to regain the privileges offered in the Capitulaciones de Santa Fe through a trial in the Spanish Courts - the Pleitos Colombinos(AGI, Patronato, Tomo III, ramo 14, legajo 8; Charlevoix 1730, 225; García 1906, 71; Keegan and Hofman 2017, 243; Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 54; Pérez-Collados 1992, 170). Diego had some powerful allies and an agreement was reached in which Ferdinand sent Diego as Governor of the Indies in 1509, in an effort to appease his supporters and get him away from the Court deliberations (AGI, Indif. Gen., Leg. 418. tomo III, f. 249; Pérez-Collados 1992, 171; Rueda 1988, 106). He did not, however, have any special privileges beyond those Ovando had held in the same post (García 1906, 71; Pérez-Collados 1992, 172) and appointed Aragonese government officials to high positions of power (Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 55; Pérez-Collados 1992, 122), including Miguel de Pasamonte. Pasamonte arrived in 1508 holding the second-highest position, that of Tesorero General (Royal Treasurer) (García 1906, 69; Las Casas in Rueda 1988, 98, 108; Moya-Pons 1987, 55). While Diego lived in a court-like atmosphere in Santo Domingo, Miguel de Pasamonte lived in the Concepción fort, and was in charge of gold production in the region (Herrera 1601, III, 110; Moya-Pons 1978, 82; 1987, 61; Pérez-Collados 1992, 176) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 37).

During Diego Columbus's governorship there was a constant power struggle between his supporters and those of King Ferdinand. Most of the conflicts centered around one main topic: who controlled the Indian workforce (Kulstad 2008, 53; Las Casas, Historia II, 1927, 9-12; Lamb 1956, 82; Moya-Pons 1983, 26; Pérez-Collados 1992, 191). Two different types of Indigenous workers were available at this time: the *Naborías*, which were owned by the King, and *Perpetual Naborías*, brought from other areas of the Caribbean. (See discussion in Chapter 5).

Diego Columbus arrived at a moment of great wealth, but great social upheaval. In 1509, a series of sumptuary laws were instituted regulating the use of certain clothing, food and luxury items according to social rank (Acosta-Corniel 2013, 37; Alba 1500?, Box 24-2, Box 144-175, Box 144-176; Deagan and Cruxent 2002a, 188; Moya-Pons 1978, 110; Ribeiro 2003, 12–16; Suárez-Marill 1998, 15). At the same time in Spain, during the Habsburg rule, piety was linked to lack of excess, effectively linking high expenditure to sin (Fernández-Navarrete 1626, 519; Ramírez 2016).

4.9.2 Repartimiento of 1510

It seems that Diego Columbus's original plan was to reinstate the tribute system organized by his father (García 1906, 72), but he decided to use the Repartimiento system as a means of empowering his supporters (Moya-Pons 1983, 24). As Ovando had done at the beginning of his term, Diego Columbus collected all *Naboría* workers and distributed them according to his own benefit and convenience (See Kulstad 2008, 53).

Although officially he was to distribute the workers among all qualified vecinos (Spanish landowners), in practice he favored the men married to his wife's ladies-in-waiting (Charlevoix 1730, 229), and those who supported his style of government (Moya-Pons 1983, 26; Rodríguez Demorizi 1971, 52). As a result, he concentrated most of the workforce, and the means to gain economic power, in his supporters' hands (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 54).

The Crown had even less control than it did during the Ovando governorship and instituted measures to change this (Arranz-Márquez 1991; Moya-Pons 1983, 26). One measure was Ferdinand's 1508 decree declaring Indigenous people from other parts of the Caribbean (cannibals or those resistant to conversion) could be enslaved, and imported to Hispaniola. Those loyal to the King were favored in this enterprise (Ferdinand 1511; Marte 1981, 89) (See Kulstad 2008, 54).

4.9.3 Arrival of the Dominican Order (1510)

Although the first members of the Dominican order did not arrive on Hispaniola until 1510 (Charlevoix 1730, 240; Incháustegui 1955, 105), they were influential in New World affairs as advisers to Queen Isabela. Dominicans influenced the Queen's her decision to declare Indigenous peoples as free vassals of the Crown (Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 165-174; Lamb 1956, 91; Moya-Pons 1978). The first Dominicans were sent to Hispaniola as representatives of the Royal Inquisition, in response to various complaints regarding the deficient methods used to Christianize the *Indios* (AGI, Indif. Gen. 1624; Charlevoix 1730, 240; Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971). Claims were made that most of the *Indios* were merely baptized, and no other religious instruction was provided by the Church or the colonists, which was an infringement on the terms of the Repartimiento (Arranz-Márquez 1982, 41; Charlevoix 1730, 240) (See discussion in Kulstad 2008, 55). Also, large numbers of the *Indios* in the care of the European/ Spanish were dying at alarming rates. Eventually the Dominican order created a plan to save the Indigenous people which involved a change in the colony's source of income. There would be substitution of gold production for sugar (Moya-Pons 1978, 176). The *Indio* workers in gold would be substituted for the enslaved Africans in sugar production (Moya-Pons 1978, 176).

4.9.4 Creation of the Real Audiencia (1511)

Another effort to offset Diego Columbus's growing powers was the creation of the Real Audiencia (Royal Court of Appeals) in 1511 (Cassá 1978, 50; Charlevoix 1730, 239; García-Menéndez 1981; Incháustegui 1955, 115; Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 57). This court was made up of three judges, or oidores, who held the colony's judicial, administrative and legislative powers. As the highest provincial court in the New

World, the Real Audiencia handled civil and criminal cases in the colonies, which previously have been resolved by the Governor (See Kulstad 2008, 55).

From 1511 to 1528, the Real Audiencia in Santo Domingo dealt with cases from all colonies in the Americas (Rogoziński 2000, 48). The first three judges appointed were Marcelo de Villalobos, Juan Ortiz de Matienzo and Lucas Vásquez de Ayllón (Moya-Pons 1978, 114). Vásquez de Ayllón had been a vecino at Concepción, and lost his workers in Diego Columbus's Repartimiento of 1510. He became Pasamonte's close ally, and often ruled in favor of other settlers in his same situation (Moya-Pons 1983, 27) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 54).

4.9.5 Bishopric of Concepción de la Vega (1511)

Although the Church had sent various representatives throughout the early colonial period, no organized religious administrative structure existed in the New World until 1511. That year three bishoprics were created, in Santo Domingo, Concepción (under Pedro Suárez de Deza), and San Juan, Puerto Rico (Charlevoix 1730, 260; García 1906, 74; Rodríguez-Morel 2000, xvii). Since the Archbishop of Seville, Diego de Deza, had been one of Christopher Columbus's close friends (Charlevoix 1730, 214; Kulstad 2008, 52; Pérez-Collados 1992, 169), the Bishops in Hispaniola supported Diego Columbus, rather than Miguel de Pasamonte and the King (See Kulstad 2008, 52).

Of the three bishoprics, Concepción de la Vega was the most powerful. Although it officially only had jurisdiction over the northern half of the island, (Santiago, Puerto Plata, Puerto Real, Bonao, Lares de Guahaba and Montecristi) it was the only bishopric with a resident bishop until the arrival of Alessandro Geraldini, sometime after 1516 (García 1906, 74; Kulstad 2008, 55; Peguero 1975, 167).

4.9.6 Montesinos's Sermon (1511)

The Dominicans' campaign to save the Indigenous peoples from extinction through a reform of the labor system was the basis for Fray Anton de Montesinos's Advent sermon in December 1511 in Santo Domingo (Charlevoix 1730, 261; Incháustegui 1955, 106; Kulstad 2008, 56; Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 58; Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 23). Montesinos, however, did not limit himself to denouncing the abuses of the Repartimiento system, but went so far as to question the Crown's right of ownership of land and Indian laborers in the New World (Kulstad 2008, 57; Pérez-Collados 1992, 183), a subject being debated in Spain at the time (García-Gallo 1972, 1976; Kulstad 2008, 57; Manzano-Manzano 1948). Most government officials were present when the sermon was read, including Diego Columbus and Miguel de Pasamonte, and were gravely insulted (Charlevoix 1730, 261; García 1906, 75;

Incháustegui 1955, 106; Kulstad 2008, 57). They asked Montesinos to apologize, but he refused (Incháustegui 1955, 108; Kulstad 2008, 57).

While the Dominicans championed for *Indio* rights within the Repartimiento system, the Franciscans, centered in the gold-rich Concepción area, saw no grave problems with the way *Indios* were treated. They often expressed their support of the Repartimiento through their leader Alonso de Espinal, headquartered at Concepción (Las Casas in Rueda 1988, 535) (See Kulstad 2008, 57).

The dispute between the religious orders grew to such proportion that representatives were sent to Spain to the Castilian courts to solve the problem (Charlevoix 1730, 262; Moya-Pons 1978, 126; Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 59). The Dominicans were represented by Fray Antón de Montesinos, while Fray Alonso de Espinal from Concepción represented the Franciscans (Charlevoix 1730, 262; García 1906, 76; Incháustegui 1955, 107; Kulstad 2008, 57; Moya-Pons 1978, 126; Peguero and de los Santos 1983, 59).

Ferdinand initially officially received the Franciscan friars, but not the Dominicans (Charlevoix 1730, 262; Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 32), since Montesinos had questioned the Crown's ownership rights - the basis of his whole enterprise - in the New World (Pérez-Collados 1992, 183). Eventually, however, Ferdinand was forced to engage with Montesinos due to pressures from the Dominican faction (Charlevoix 1730, 264). Court discussions and debates were held to review both sides of the argument, resulting in the Laws of Burgos of 1512 (AGI Indiferente General 419, L4, f83; García 1906, 77; Incháustegui 1955, 107; Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 32) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 56).

4.9.7 Laws of Burgos (1512)

Court discussions and debates were held to review how Indigenous peoples were being treated in the New World, resulting in the Laws of Burgos of 1512 (AGI Indiferente General 419, L4, f83; Arranz-Márquez 1982, 34; García 1906, 77; Incháustegui 1955, 107; Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 32). Although the Laws declared the *Naborías* to be free vassals of Spain (Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 32), or more specifically to be the equivalent of the Christian peasants, but located on Hispaniola (AGI, Indiferente General 418, LI, ff121v-122; Guitar 1998, 166), they did little more than justify the Repartimiento system (Arranz-Márquez 1982, 47; Incháustegui 1955, 94). This represented a defeat for the Dominicans, who had hoped to abolish the Repartimiento system (Arranz-Márquez 1982, 44; Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 32). Instead, the Repartimientos were declared to be based on the authority given the Castilian Crown by the Holy See, and the Dominicans were not to contest it (García 1906, 76) (See discussion in Kulstad 2008, 58).

A study of the Laws of Burgos presents what is happening in the colony. As often happened, the Crown creates legislation to stop something that was currently happening (Arranz-Márquez 1982, 41). (For a summary description of the Laws of Burgos, see Guitar 1998, 104-108). Although all laws influence and/or reflect *Indio* lifeways on the island, Law #17 is of particular interest. This law stated that cacique sons older than 12 had to go to Franciscan monasteries to learn reading, writing, and matters of the faith for four years, and then return to their communities and teach others what they had learned (AGI Contratación 5090; Arranz-Márquez 1982, 42; Altman 2007, 589). The most famous student of these monasteries was the cacique Enriquillo, educated at the monastery in Verapaz, at the same location as current-day Port-au-Prince (AGI Contratación 5090; Altman 2007, 589; Mira-Caballos 2007, 189).

4.9.8 The New Repartimiento of 1514

In 1514, the Crown sent Rodrigo de Alburquerque and Pero Ibañez de Ibarra to conduct a new Repartimiento at Concepción (AGI, Justicia 6, N4; Charlevoix 1730, 276; Ferdinand 1514; García 1906, 77; Marte 1981, 121; Moya-Pons 1983, 27). As before, specific qualities were required of a vecino who would receive *Naboría* workers at the Repartimientos - honesty, good upbringing, clean bloodlines, be older than 20, Christian and Castilian (Arranz-Márquez 1991, 172; Haring 1939, 131; Incháustegui 1955, 62; Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971, 266), but few, if any, of these criteria were used by Alburquerque. Like Diego Columbus before him, he used the Repartimiento to benefit members of his own political faction (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 58).

Alburquerque had been the Mayor of the Concepción Fort until 1513, when he had returned to Spain (Benzo 2000; García 1906, 77). He had a personal enmity with Diego Columbus (Charlevoix 1730, 276). Little is known about Ibarra, except that he died soon after arriving in Santo Domingo, allowing Alburquerque to name Treasurer Miguel de Pasamonte as his assistant (AGI, Patronato 172, R4, ff109-111; García 1906, 77, 78; Guitar 1998, 134; Mira-Caballos. 1997, 123) (See Kulstad 2008, 59).

The 1514 Repartimiento for the entire island took place at Concepción, from Nov. 23, 1514 to Jan. 9, 1515 (Arranz-Márquez 1991; Ferdinand 1514; Kulstad 2008, 59; Marte 1981, 121; Moya-Pons 1978, 157). The main gold mining centers on the island at the time were Concepción, Santo Domingo and San Juan de la Maguana (Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 18-19, 20, 31, 41, 57; Lamb 1956, 44; Moya-Pons 1987, 109), but vecinos in other cities received workers as well. Each city and town had to pick an official representative to go to Concepción, and receive the *Naborías* assigned to that settlement's vecinos (García 1906, 78; Kulstad 2008, 60). Diego Columbus was not allowed to be present (Kulstad 2008, 60; Moya-Pons 1978, 156).

The process was plagued with corruption and obvious partiality (Cohen 1997b, 5; García 1906, 78; Guitar 1998, 134; Moya-Pons 1983, 27). Alburquerque also used the

process for his own personal gain by taking large bribes (Charlevoix 1730, 276; García 1906, 77). Ultimately, most of the *Naboría* workers were concentrated in the hands of a select group of Pasamonte's friends (Moya-Pons 1983, 27) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 58).

Concepción's distribution was the first completed, on Nov. 23, 1514 (García 1906, 78). Concepción's share of the Repartimiento was the second largest, with only Santo Domingo's vecinos receiving more workers (Arranz-Márquez 1991; García 1906, 78; Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971). The process was witnessed by two Concepción vecinos, with no Royal scribe present (García 1906, 78). A number of unmarried men received workers, in opposition to the governmental policy giving family units special privileges (Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971, 252). The Franciscan monastery at Concepción received several *Naborías* workers in the Repartimiento (Arranz-Márquez 1991; Incháustegui 1955, 106; Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971). Although the Franciscans explained that they did not benefit personally from the work done by the *Naborías*, the Dominican friars saw this as totally unacceptable (Arranz-Márquez 1991; Incháustegui 1955, 106). Unlike what happened in the Repartimiento of 1510, the Franciscans returned their *Naborías* to the Crown (Arranz-Márquez 1982, 46). (For an in-depth, comprehensive review of the Repartimiento of 1514, see Arranz-Márquez 1991 and Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 59).

One of the main complaints about Repartimiento of 1510 had been that large numbers of *Naborías* were held by persons living in Spain, not on Hispaniola. This complaint came from a group known as the Viejos Pobladores (First Settlers) (Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 519-521; Guitar 1998, 133; Lamb 1956, 151; Marte 1981, 310). This was not supposed to happen in the new Repartimiento, but the promise was not kept (Arranz-Márquez 1991; Charlevoix 1730, 221; García 1906, 78; Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971) (See Kulstad 2008, 59).

Not unexpectedly, Diego Columbus, his followers, the Viejos Pobladores and the less wealthy members of society challenged the Repartimiento of 1514 (García 1906, 79; Guitar 1998, 134; Kulstad 2008, 61; Mira-Caballos 1997, 123; Moya-Pons 1983, 27, 1997, 1998). However, unlike with the 1510 Repartimiento, the Pro-Pasamonte Real Audiencia and Court officials were sufficiently powerful to prevent any changes (García 1906, 79; Kulstad 2008, 61). The Crown, in fact, decreed this to be the last Repartimiento to be undertaken on Hispaniola (García 1906, 79; Kulstad 2008, 61; Moya-Pons 1983, 27, 1997, 1998). It claimed that the process was too controversial and that the *Indios* were dying out (Arranz-Márquez 1991, 328; Guitar 1998, 134; Kulstad 2008, 61; Moya-Pons 1983, 27, 1997, 1998).

Those without *Naboría* workers after the 1514 Repartimiento were unable to force those in power to share their privileges. The settlers in Hispaniola who did not receive Indians saw no reason to remain on Hispaniola. Most left to emigrate to Central America and Mexico (Guitar 1998, 135; Marte 1981, 390; Moya-Pons 1978, 174-75;

Rueda 1988). Although it has often been assumed that the emigration was because of the lack of gold (Floyd 1963, 68-69; Marte 1981, 390; Moya-Pons 1983, 1987, 1997, 1998), in reality it appears to have been due to the absence of mine workers (see Kulstad 2008, 61).

4.10 Pueblo Tutelado Period (1516-1519)

On January 23, 1516, King Ferdinand died, forcing the Spanish government to enter into a complicated series of compromises to ensure succession in Castile and Aragon. A compromise was reached in which his grandson, Charles, was named co-regent with his mother, Juana (Fernández-Álvarez 2000, 175; Incháustegui 1955, 71). Meanwhile, regencies were set up in both Castile and Aragon until Charles' coming of age (Fernández-Álvarez 2000, 141; Kulstad 2008, 62). Cardinal Francisco Jimenez de Cisneros (a close friend of the Columbus family) was named regent of Castile, and Alonzo de Aragón, Archbishop of Zaragoza, became regent of Aragon (Charlevoix 1730, 214; Incháustegui 1955, 89; Kulstad 2008, 62; Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997, 1998; Pérez-Collados 1992, 169).

Castile's regent, Cardinal Francisco Jimenez de Cisneros, set up an impartial religious government on Hispaniola, with the main purpose of saving the Indigenous people from extinction (Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240; Incháustegui 1955, 121; Moya-Pons 1983, 28, 1997, 1998; Pérez-Collados 1992, 183). The Jeronymites hoped to not only save the Indigenous people, but also to create a less polarized colony (See Kulstad 2008, 62).

The Jeronymites were concerned with the *Indios'* living and working conditions (Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240; Incháustegui 1955, 121; Moya-Pons 1983, 28, 1997, 1998; Pérez-Collados 1992, 183). It was obvious to Cisneros and the Jeronymites that if the Repartimiento system continued without change it would cause the *Indios'* demise (Charlevoix 1730, 282; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240; Incháustegui 1955, 124; Moya-Pons 1983, 29). They believed that by changing the main production system in the colony from mining to agriculture using African slave labor, the lives of the Indigenous peoples could be spared (AGI, Indiferente General 1624; Cassá 1978, 58; Charlevoix 1730, 292; García 1906, 84; Moya-Pons 1983, 28, 1997, 1998).

The new program to be implemented on Hispaniola followed much of the rhetoric presented by the Dominican friars, and the writings of Las Casas (Charlevoix 1730, 282; García 1906, 82; Hanke 1935; Kulstad 2008, 63; Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997, 1998). Essentially, the Repartimiento system would be replaced by a series of parallel worker villages, or Pueblos Tutelados (Charlevoix 1730, 282; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240; Incháustegui 1955, 124; Kulstad 2008, 63; Mira-Caballos 2010, 362; Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997, 1998). These pueblos would be similar to the Reducciones proposed during the Ovando government, in which the *Indios* would

live in towns close to centers of production (Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240; Incháustegui 1955, 94; Kulstad 2008, 63).

The villages had three main purposes: Christianize the *Indios*, organize their labor, and have them pay tribute extracted from the pay received from their work (Charlevoix 1730, 282; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; García 1906, 83; Guitar 1998, 240). The men of the village would be required to undertake paid work for the European/Spanish a certain number of hours a day (Charlevoix 1730, 282, 283; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240; Moya-Pons 1978). The tribute would be calculated according to the settlement's location (Charlevoix 1730, 282; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240). Most of the *Indios* were to labor in the mines, but those living in settlements where gold was not found would cultivate different agricultural products such as cotton, ginger, cañafístola, indigo, or sugar (Charlevoix 1730, 283; Lamb 1956, 58; Las Casas, Historia I, 1927, 99). No more than a third of the villagers could work in the gold mines during a given period of time and for no more than two straight months (Charlevoix 1730, 283; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240) (See Kulstad 2008, 64).

These towns would have 300 people each, governed by a Spanish-educated cacique and a missionary priest (Charlevoix 1730, 282, 283; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240; Moya-Pons 1978). Within each settlement, each family would receive a plot of land to cultivate in their free time (Charlevoix 1730, 282, 283; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240; Moya-Pons 1978). The caciques would receive four times as much land as the rest, with the guarantee that each of the subordinates would work on the plots for at least 15 days a year (Charlevoix 1730, 283; Documentos Inéditos Ultramar IX, 1885, 53-70; Guitar 1998, 240). The villages would also have their own church and hospital (Charlevoix 1730, 283; Hanke 1935; Lamb 1956, 171; Las Casas II, 1927, 268) (See Kulstad 2008, 65).

Although the *Indios* were to be allowed to live in villages separate from the Spanish settlements, they would not be allowed to return to their precontact customs and beliefs. The *Indios* were to be molded into Christians, which for the Spanish meant being molded into Spaniards as well (Charlevoix 1730, 191; Peguero 1975, 187). The caciques to be chosen to rule the villages would come from among those educated "Christians" (Peguero 1975, 187). "Christian" ways included wearing clothes at all times, having only one wife, and learning to speak and read Spanish (Charlevoix 1730, 282) (See previous discussion Kulstad 2008, 65).

In 1517, the Jeronymites began by undertaking an Interrogatorio (or Questioning) into the possibility of creating these pueblos (AGI, Indif. Gen. 1624; Guitar 1998, 158, 166; Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971, 273-354), and learned that the vecinos holding the most *Indios* through the Repartimiento (the Pasamonte group) opposed the plan (AGI, Indif.

Gen. 1624; García 1906, 82; Guitar 1998, 158; Incháustegui 1955, 123; Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971, 273-354). These vecinos were able to influence judges and officials in their favor (Cassá 1978, 57; García 1906, 82; Pérez-Collados 1992, 188). The Franciscans also opposed the pueblo plan since they believed *Indios* would die faster away from the protection of the Europeans (Arranz-Márquez 1982, 39) (See Kulstad 2008, 63-65).

Although there is historical evidence that some pueblos were established in the Cibao area at unspecified locations (AGI, Indiferente General 1624; Guitar 1998, 176; Hanke 1935, 38-39; Kulstad 2008, 65), the Jeronymites were never able to successfully implement their program on the long term, owing both to political factors and to epidemic disease (Guitar 1998, 176; Kulstad 2008, 65; Moya-Pons 1983, 29, 1997, 1998). A smallpox epidemic struck Hispaniola between December 1517 and January 1518, killing about two thirds of the *Indio* population (Kulstad 2008, 66; Marte 1981, 281-82; Moya-Pons 1983, 29; Pichardo 1944; Zuazo and Espinosa 1528). Given the new circumstances, the Jeronymites did not need much encouragement to maintain the status quo and abandon their pueblo resettlement plan (Guitar 1998, 176), agreeing that the *Indios* should continue to live under the Repartimiento system (Charlevoix 1730, 287, 288; Kulstad 2008, 66).

The turnabout by the Jeronymites alienated several groups in the colony, and consolidated the power of those who had benefited from the 1514 Repartimiento (AGI, Patronato 172, R4, ff109-111; Cohen 1997b, 5; García 1906, 78; Guitar 1998, 134; Kulstad 2008, 66; Moya-Pons 1983, 27, 1997, 1998). In spite of the loans offered to set up the sugar mills, the enterprise was too costly for most settlers (García 1906, 103; Kulstad 2008, 66). Those with few or no workers could not afford to buy African slaves, causing them to migrate to other colonies (Guitar 1998, 135; Julián 1997; Rueda 1988).

The adjusted Jeronymite program also disappointed a third group, the Spanish-educated *Indios* who had been chosen as leaders of the pueblos (Guitar 2001). It must have been hard for these leaders to return to the Repartimiento system after being trained for the relative independence and other expected privileges conferred by the proposed government of the pueblos (See Kulstad 2008, 67).

Due to all of these failings the Jeronymites finally lost the support of the person who had once been their staunchest supporter, Bartolomé de las Casas (Guitar 1998, 172; Hanke 1935, 40; Kulstad 2008, 67). Las Casas traveled to Spain and convinced King Charles to recall the Jeronymites after only three years on Hispaniola (Cassá 1978, 59; Guitar 1998, 177; Kulstad 2008, 67).

4.11 Post Pueblo Tutelado Period (1519-1564)

4.11.1 Figueroa Government (1519-1520)

In 1519, After the recall of the Jeronymites, Governor Rodrigo de Figueroa was sent to Hispaniola (AGI, Indif. Gen. 419, L7, f156v.; Charlevoix 1730, 294; García 1906, 85; Guitar 1998, 253). In 1519, Concepción was the main city of the island (AGI, Patronato Real 172, R35; Guitar 1998, 267). It appears that Figueroa's main goal was to reinstate the pueblo plan (Charlevoix 1730, 341; García 1906, 86; Herrera 1601; Incháustegui 1955, 127). He created two model pueblos at unspecified locations and was bound by law to allow any *Indios* to move there (Charlevoix 1730, 341; Incháustegui 1955, 127; Figueroa Residencia 1521) (See Kulstad 2008, 67).

However, as had happened in previous governments, the interests of the Repartimiento holders, and their power to influence government procedure, caused Figueroa to declare pueblos a failure (Charlevoix 1730, 341; García 1906, 86; Figueroa Residencia 1521; Hanke 1935; Kulstad 2008, 67). He claimed, as had been done before, that the *Indios*, once outside the Spanish sphere of influence, ran away into the hills rather than work, and did not follow Spanish religion and customs (Charlevoix 1730, 341; Guitar 1998, 149; Incháustegui 1955, 94; Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 54; Kulstad 2008, 67; Lamb 1956, 51) (For a more detailed account of the pueblo experiment during Figueroa's governorship, see Hanke 1935).

Another mayor event during Figueroa's government was Las Casas's experiment in pacific colonization (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 327). Las Casas went to Cumaná, on the modern Venezuelan coast, and attempted to settle the area using peaceful methods to approach the local Indigenous peoples (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 344). His experiment failed because the area was one of the places where *Perpetual Naborías* had been captured in previous years, and his settlement was attacked by the local Indigenous people (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 344). Las Casas had to return to Hispaniola without achieving his goal (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 344).

4.11.2 War of the Bahoruco (1519-1533)

In 1519, Cacique Enriquillo, who had been offered the leadership of a Pueblo Tutelado in the Southwestern part of Hispaniola during the Jeronymite era, rebelled against the Spanish and founded his own pueblo in the Bahoruco Mountains, where he had grown up (Cassá 1978, 60; Guitar 1998, 347; Kulstad 2008, 68; Las Casas, III, 1995, Ch. 12; Oviedo IV, 1959, Ch. 4-8; Wilson 1990b, 14). He was surprisingly effective in his revolt, which only ended in 1533 after receiving a signed agreement from King Charles himself (Guitar 1998, 347; Las Casas, III, 1995, Ch. 12; Oviedo IV, 1959, Ch. 4-8). Enriquillo's story is best known because of Las Casas, who wrote about this rebellion sympathetically, even though he was not on the island during most of the

events of this war (Altman 2007, 587, 596; Guitar 1998, 347; Las Casas, III, 1995, Ch. 12).

Although Enriquillo did not attack the Concepción area, his rebellion inspired similar rebellions (Altman 2007, 588; Guitar 1998, 347; Las Casas, III, 1995, Ch. 12; Oviedo IV, 1959, Ch. 4-8). Such was the case of Ciguayo, who had 80 followers which roamed the area around Concepción, Santiago and Puerto Real in 1529 (Guitar 1998, 388; Las Casas 1985, 127; Espinosa and Suazo 1529; Marte 1981, 347; Utrera 1973, 230). He was captured the next year by a bounty hunter (Guitar 1998, 270; Las Casas III, 1995, Chp. 127;Utrera 1973, 230) (See Kulstad 2008, 68).

4.11.3 Diego Columbus's Second Governorship (1520-1524)

Emperor Charles V is perhaps best known for the vast extent of kingdoms and lands he controlled, both in Europe and the Americas. In Europe his kingdoms stretched from Austria to Spain (Fernández-Álvarez 1975, 194) and it was during his reign (1517-1555) that most of the great discoveries of the New World were made (Incháustegui 1955). Charles was a co-regent with his "mad" mother, Juana, in Castile (Fernández-Álvarez 2000, 175; Incháustegui 1955, 71), and his European kingdoms outside Spain were appointed to him via Imperial election (Fernández-Álvarez 1975, 28). To be able to finance his Imperial bid, Charles asked wealthy individuals to help him, most notably Diego Columbus (Pérez-Collados 1992, 198). In exchange, Charles named Diego Columbus as governor of Hispaniola again in 1520 (Pérez-Collados 1992, 198; Ramos-Pérez 1970, 30) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 68).

Charles V also inherited the responsibility to deal with the incipient movement led by German monk, Martin Luther (Fernández-Álvarez 1975). Luther, which had been questioning Catholic doctrine since 1517 (Fernández-Álvarez 1975), now had a wider audience for his preachings as Germany became part of the Habsburg empire. Charles V met with Luther at the Diet of Worms, a meeting of the whole Empire, in an attempt to get Luther to recant his writings, in 1521 (Fernández-Álvarez 1975). When Luther refused, he was excommunicated (Fernández-Álvarez 1975).

Meanwhile, Diego Columbus returned to Hispaniola in 1520, with the belief that he would be able to establish the Viceroyalty in the manner promised to his father and family (Kulstad 2008, 68; Pérez-Collados 1992, 198; Ramos-Pérez 1970, 30). Unfortunately, during his six year absence, too many obstacles had surfaced to make this possible (Pérez-Collados 1992, 198). Nevertheless, Diego's governance helped create the political environment in Hispaniola for the next 30 years (see Kulstad 2008, 68).

Diego, unlike the Jeronymites and Figueroa, was ordered to help European/ Spanish who wished travel from Hispaniola to Mexico and Central America, rather than making them stay. Many settlers, disgruntled by the Repartimiento of 1514, became part

of these expeditions (AGI, Indiferente General 1961, L1, ff57v-58; Guitar 1998, 130; Kulstad 2008, 61; Moya-Pons 2008, 35; Rueda 1988). Diego also continued the Jeronymite program of establishing sugar mills with their corresponding African slave workforce (García 1906, 90, 91; Kulstad 2008, 68; Letter dated Sep 14, 1519, Marte 1981, 318-319). This was a particularly unstable period for the *Indio* workforce, suffering from epidemics and overwork, and resisting labor organization by constantly running away to join Enriquillo (García 1906, 90; Kulstad 2008, 69; Las Casas III, 1951, Chp. 12; Oviedo 1959, Vol. 117, Book 1).

In 1522, Diego was one of colony's main ingenio (sugar mill) ownersAGI, Patronato 295, No. 104; Moya-Pons 1983, 35, 1997, 1998). During Christmas that year, he suffered a rebellion of Wolof African slaves on his sugar plantation (AGI, Patronato 295, No. 104; García 1906, 90; Moya-Pons 1983, 35, 1997, 1998). The rebellion was quickly dissipated, but created a precedent that had deep repercussions for the whole island, and especially Concepción, where several revolts occurred (see Kulstad 2008, 70).

In spite of the quick resolution of the African revolt, by mid-1523 Diego still had not resolved the Enriquillo revolt (Guitar 1998, 347; Kulstad 2008, 70; Las Casas, III, 1995, Ch. 12; Oviedo IV, 1959, Ch. 4-8; Pérez-Collados 1992, 199). Due to all these problems he was asked to return to Spain to discuss his mismanagement of Hispaniola (García 1906, 92; Kulstad 2008, 70; Pérez-Collados 1992, 199).

4.11.4 Interim Government (1524-1528)

When Diego Columbus left in 1524, the colony's government was once again left in the hands of the Real Audiencia judges, namely Alonso Suazo, Cristóbal Lebrón and Gaspar de Espinosa (Guitar 1998, 70; Incháustegui 1955, 89-80). This was the first of several interim periods during which the Real Audiencia ruled Hispaniola (Incháustegui 1955, 117) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 71).

Two important events during this period greatly affected Concepción. The first was the unification of the Hispaniola bishoprics in 1524 (García 1906, 94; Incháustegui 1955, 129; Schafer 1935, 60), and the second was the designation of the Santo Cerro as a place of absolution in 1527 (Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971, 140). The unification of the bishoprics was justified by the mass out-migrations occurring throughout the island, particularly centered in the Concepción area (Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 36). Concepción appears to have lost its bishopric as its population and its importance declined. In spite of this, the designation of the Santo Cerro as an important religious site points to Concepción's continuous religious importance. The site's appointment may have been a way of appeasing the few, yet influential, Concepción vecinos. The Santo Cerro Church was awarded 20,000 maravedíes a year to take care of the pilgrims, and an important

Mercedarian monastery was built there (Rodríguez-Demorizi 1971, 140) (See Kulstad 2008, 71).

During this period, Las Casas was assigned as the head of the Dominican monastery to be built in Puerto Plata (Pérez-Fernández 2010). The construction of this monastery created a presence of the Dominican order in the northern part of the country, and probably was competition for the Franciscan monastery at Concepción. It was built using the materials left over from the stone church of La Isabela (Duval 2017).

4.11.5 Fuenleal Government (1528-1531)

In 1528, the post of president of the Real Audiencia was united with that of the bishop of Santo Domingo (García 1906, 94; Oviedo in Rueda 1988, 91; Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 36), and Sebastian Ramirez de Fuenleal became the first president/bishop of the new style government. That year, the Real Audiencia governance of the Americas was divided into two Audiencias, one based in Santo Domingo, and the second in Mexico (Rogoziński 2000, 48). Fuenleal presided over the Audiencia which covered the Caribbean islands, Florida and settlements in northern coast of Venezuela (Charlevoix 1730, 371; Rogoziński 2000, 48). The other members of the Santo Domingo Real Audiencia continued to be the same, namely Alonso Suazo, Cristóbal Lebrón and Gaspar de Espinosa (Guitar 1998, 70; Incháustegui 1955, 89-80) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 72).

Fuenleal's government's main goal was to diversify the colony's economy in an effort to halt the massive outward migration (AGI, Indif. Gen., 421, 42, ff216r-216v; Guitar 1998, 268; Kulstad 2008, 72; Moya-Pons 1983, 33, 1997, 1998). Sugar was mostly produced around Santo Domingo and the south coast (Concepción 1981; Incháustegui 1955, 73; Moya-Pons 1983, 33, 1997, 1998; Ortiz 1940, 1947; Wright 1916, 199), while the area around Concepción and the northern part of the island was mostly used for cattle ranching (Concepción 1980, 1981; Kulstad 2008, 73).

Much of Fuenleal's time was spent trying to halt the Enriquillo rebellion (Guitar 1998, 347; Kulstad 2008, 73; Las Casas, III, 1995, Ch. 12; Oviedo IV, 1959, Ch. 4-8; Patronato 1995, 250). Although Fuenleal was unable to sign a peace treaty with Enriquillo, before he left Hispaniola in 1531, he instituted an interesting counter-revolutionary methodology. This involved creating schools for *Indios* who were loyal to the Spanish effort (García 1906, 96; Kulstad 2008, 73). These schools taught religion, reading, writing and math (García 1906, 96; Kulstad 2008, 73).

4.11.6 Interim Period - Trial of Dean Alvaro de Castro (1531-1532)

A period of two years passed between Fuenleal's departure and the arrival of Hispaniola's next bishop-president. There is a relatively large amount of information

available about Concepción during this period found in documents related to Dean Alvaro de Castro's trial in 1532 (Patronato 1995). The document states that gold prospecting and cattle ranching occur within the Concepción area (Patronato 1995, 250). The trial documents also show that a large number of Concepción's inhabitants were non-elites (Patronato 1995, 134, 136) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 26).

The document also presents Concepción as a city where religious authorities were believed to be capable of various crimes, including concubinage and illegal trade (Patronato 1995, 134, 136). It presents the names of several women accused of having affairs with Dean de Castro, including two *Perpetual Naborías* from the Lucayas (Bahamas) (Patronato 1995) (See Kulstad 2008, 133).

The Proceso de Alvaro de Castro also provides what may be the first evidence of the La Vega Carnival (Patronato 1995) which remains one of the most popular carnival celebrations in the Dominican Republic today. The Proceso records horse races being held at Concepción, as well as a mock battle between "Christians" and "Moors" (Patronato 1995, 213). Mock battles between Moors and Christians are an important element of these carnival celebrations (Valdez 1995) (See Kulstad 2008, 271).

4.11.7 Fuenmayor Government (1533-1543)

Lic. Alonso de Fuenmayor assumed the role of Hispaniola's president/bishop in 1533 (García 1906, 103; Incháustegui 1955, 89-80). Although Fuenmayor governed for 10 years, little is known about his period of government, especially outside of Santo Domingo. Most of the chroniclers present on Hispaniola, or their sources, did not travel much outside of Santo Domingo, due either to job requirements, or fear of being attacked by *Indio* or African rebels (see Oviedo in García 1906, 103-105). During his government all productive areas -including sugar and cattle, as well as gold - were plagued with workforce problems (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 73).

Although Enriquillo formally signed a peace treaty in 1533 (García 1906, 99; Guitar 1998, 347; Kulstad 2008, 74; Las Casas, III, 1995, Ch. 12; Oviedo IV, 1959, Ch. 4-8), his example sparked many other rebellions (Guitar 1998, 387; Kulstad 2008, 68; Las Casas III, 1951, Chp. 127; Utrera 1973, 481-82). Many workers ran away, or were "recruited" during the rebels' frequent raids (AGI, Indiferente General 420, L10, f198v; Guitar 1998, 262; Kulstad 2008, 75; Moya-Pons 1983, 1997, 1998). At the same time, African enslaved peoples were expensive and hard to obtain (García 1906, 103; Kulstad 2008, 75).

4.11.8 New Laws of 1542

In 1542, the New Laws of Indies were created, eliminating the Repartimiento system and effectively making the *Indios* free inhabitants of the colony (Guitar 1998, 258; Rogoziński 2000, 31; Rueda 1988, 25). It would be done through a plan that would eliminate *Naboría* labor and fase out *Perpetual Naboría* enslavement (Guitar 1998, 258; (Mira-Caballos 2007, 186; Rogoziński 2000, 31; Rueda 1988, 25) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 106).

For many years it was believed that the Indigenous people of Hispaniola had not survived to see the New Laws of 1542, due to the many abuses they were subjected to (Kulstad 2008, 106; Moya-Pons 1987, 10). Recent studies, however, suggest otherwise. According to ethnohistorical studies by Karen Anderson-Córdova (1990, 122-133, 2017) and Lynne Guitar (1998, 222-227) it appears that certain biases were introduced into primary historical sources used to calculate the number of *Naborías* present on Hispaniola for the purpose of slave importation. For example, decreases due to diseases were exaggerated in order to gain royal permission to import slaves (Ferbel and Guitar 2002, 1, 7). Also, many *Indios* were reclassified as *Perpetual Naborias* after 1542 to retain their labor (Ferbel and Guitar 2002, 7) (See Kulstad 2008, 106).

These workforce difficulties prompted several vecinos on Hispaniola, especially those in the Concepción area, to focus on cattle ranching, which required less workers (Concepción 1980, 1981; Guitar 1998, 326; Sáez 1994, 267-272). Cattle thrived on the island and were so abundant at the time that frequently only their hides were used in commercial trading (Guitar 1998, 281; Espinosa and Suazo 1528; Marte 1981, 332-335) (See Kulstad 2008, 232).

4.11.9 Cerrato Government (1543-1548)

Although Fuenmayor dissipated the Enriquillo rebellion, he was unable to halt the African slave revolts. The resolution of this problem, together with the substitution of the remaining gold industry with cattle ranching, were the main goals of Alonso López de Cerrato, when he was named as head of government in 1543 (García 1906, 114; Moya-Pons 2008, 51) (See previous discussion in Kulstad 2008, 74).

In the 1530s, gold was still mined on a small-scale at Concepción (Patronato 1995, 250), but by this period, cattle and cattle derivatives were the main goods produced. In fact, by 1547, gold was no longer smelted at Concepción, and miners had to go to Santo Domingo instead (Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 106). The prevalence of cattle ranching was made obvious in a complaint about the Cathedral being a manure deposit since there was much ranching close to it (Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 107).

Introducing these economic changes was not as difficult as controlling the African slave revolts. African rebels were known as *Cimarrones* – which was later corrupted to

Maroon on French and English colonies (Deive 1989; Kulstad 2008, 179; Mintz 1974; Weik 1997). Most of the *Cimarrones*, like those who followed Enriquillo, knew Spanish customs and language, and used it to their advantage (Kulstad 2008, 68; Marte 1981, 301; Informes 1546). Africans became an important concern as they were now the only peoples eligible to forced labor on the island.

This did not mean, however, that illegal enslavement of Indigeous people did not continue. Girolamo Benzoni, an Italian officially hired to enslave Indigenous peoples on Portuguese territories, tells of his experience raiding the Venezuelan coast in his lesser, yet widely popular chronicle (Moya Pons 2008, 50, 52). In 1546, the lack of enforcement of the New Laws all over the Americas prompted Las Casas to return to Spain and plead for the Court to enforce the laws (Pérez-Fernández 2010, 333).

4.11.10 Are These Not Men?: Religious Debates in Europe and Their Consequences on Hispaniola (1550)

It is often forgotten that when Columbus returned to Europe from the Americas, he created a schism in the European "reality." He discovered a "New World" with a series of new species, including one that appeared to be human. Discussions ensued as to whether or not these were real humans, given that God had not allowed them to know the Gospel until that time, meaning that perhaps they had no human souls and could not reach salvation (Maxwell 1975). After much deliberation, driven in great part by the fact that Christian theologians had to preserve a unity in their established world view of human creation (the Biblical story of Adam and Eve), the Indigenous peoples of the New World were found to be human, have souls, and eligible for conversion to Christianity (Erickson 1983, 21).

Pope Paul III declared Indigenous peoples to be human through the Sublimis Dei papal bull in 1537 (Maxwell 1975), 35 years after Columbus' first landfall. However, discussions continued as to the type of humanity exhibited by these peoples, specifically the amount of "free will" or "free agency" they possessed with regards to their understanding of "good" and "evil," and their capacity to understand the Gospel (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 735; Erickson 1983, 21). This was no idle discussion, since if the Indigenous peoples were found to be "barbarians" who had broken certain natural laws, enslavement was justified (Erickson 1983, 22; Las Casas 1999; Maestre-Sánchez 2004, 104; Sepulveda 1984). Humanness meant freedom from slavery, and a higher hierarchical position within society as opposed to Africans (Brunstetter 2012, 97; Las Casas 1999; Maestre-Sánchez 2004; Sepulveda 1984).

To settle this, a long term debate was held in Valladolid, Spain (1550-1551), officially focusing on whether 'just war" could be waged on Indigenous peoples to convert them to Christianity, but unofficially to determine whether they could, or should, be enslaved (Inéditos América y Oceanía XXXI, 1884, 54; Lamb 1956, 51; Losada

1971). The two main discussants in the debate were Fray Bartolome de las Casas, known for being one of the main supporters of giving Indigenous peoples full rights, and the other was Juan Gines de Sepulveda, who believed the Indigenous peoples deserved to be enslaved for breaking certain natural, or universal, laws (Losada 1970). It is important to note that both Sepulveda and Las Casas made their arguments based on considering all Amerindians as a unified "race" (Erickson 1983, 21), as opposed to focusing on a specific "tribe" or ethnic group in the Americas.

Sepulveda presented his argument first in his book, Democrates Secundus. Here he stated that Amerindians were barbarians because they broke natural, or universal, laws based on reason (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 733; Sepulveda 1984). The waging of war against them was justified due to (Losada 1970; Sepulveda 1984):

- Their natural condition was fit for slavery
- Spaniards were entitled to stop cannibalism
- Spaniards were entitled to stop human sacrifice
- Slavery was an effective method for conversion

Sepulveda based his arguments on Aristotle's definitions of good and evil, and the fact that the Indigenous peoples practiced idolatry, cannibalism and human sacrifice Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 736-737; Sepulveda 1984). These actions proved that they had no concept of good and evil, or of the rationality underlying human society (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 737; Sepulveda 1984). This made them naturally inferior in Aristotelian terms, that is, subject to slavery (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 737; Sepulveda 1984). It must be noted that this was Sepulveda's particular interpretation of Aristotle's natural slave, and that he believed this war would eventually be good for the barbarians (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 738; Sepulveda 1984) since their souls would be saved.

His arguments were vigorously challenged by Bartolome de Las Casas in his In Defense of the Indians (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 738; Las Casas 1999). Las Casas did not believe war was necessary for evangelization, as per the doctrines of St. Augustine and St. John Chrysostom; in fact it should be avoided at all costs (Losada 1970). For him, war could only be justified to punish crimes against nature, perpetrated by barbarians (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 739; Las Casas 1999). His main argument is based on the subjectivity of the term "barbarian" (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 740; Las Casas 1999). Las Casas also attacks the idea that barbarism implies inequality and goes on to classify different barbarian types (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 739-740; Las Casas 1999):

- Man acting against human reason
- Those without written language (which is a matter of circumstance)

- Those who because of their evil and wicked character are cruel and strangers to reason. (He argues that it would be impossible to find one whole race, nation, region or country that fits into this category).

- All those who do not acknowledge Christ

It is interesting to note that Las Casas points out how his fellow Spanish could easily fit into these different classifications due to their misconduct during the Conquest of the Americas (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 739; Las Casas 1999). He also justifies most of the Amerindian's actions as acts of self-defense - 'every nation, no matter how barbaric, has the right to defend itself against a more civilized one that wants to conquer it and take away its freedom. Moreover, it can lawfully punish with death the more civilized as a savage and cruel aggressor' (Las Casas 1999). Most importantly, he sees acts such as human sacrifice and cannibalism as an expression of each particular culture that practices it, and of no concern to the Spanish because it does not harm Spanish sovereignty (Brunstetter and Zartner 2011, 742; Las Casas 1999), putting aside the idea that this falls into natural law. Unfortunately, no clear winner was declared in the Valladolid debates (Losada 1970).

4.11.11 The Last Years of Occupation (1549-1564)

Current Dominican historiography has uncovered little documentation about life on Hispaniola, and particularly Concepción, from 1549 to 1564, the last years of occupation of the Concepción site. Information is available about the sequence of governors present on Hispaniola during this period. These were Lic. Alonso Maldonado (1549-1559), Lic. Cepeda (1559-1560), and Lic. Alonso Arias de Herrera (1560-1562) (Guitar 1998, 70; Incháustegui 1955, 89-90; Kulstad 2008, 77). There is only one regidor in La Vega - Daza - who is not respected by the rest of the vecinos (Escolano-Giménez 2017).

The last mayor event that occurred during this site's occupation was the earthquake of Dec. 2, 1562. Historical accounts (Rodríguez-Morel 2000, 77) describe this as a broad-ranging quake that destroyed Santiago de los Caballeros; Concepción de la Vega; Cotuí; the Dominican convent in Puerto Plata; the Franciscan convent in La Yaguana (Charlevoix 1730; Deagan and Cruxent 2002b, 76; Palm 155a, s.n.) and was felt on other Caribbean islands (Kulstad 2008, 77; Woods 1999, 5). It is possible that aftershocks continued to be felt weeks after the first, as happened with the most recent large earthquake in the area, on Sept. 22, 2003 (Cocco-Quezada 2006; Kulstad 2008, 77).

4.12 Conclusion

This chapter has presented the influential military, political and diplomatic events related to Concepción during the period 1493 to 1564, previously examined in Kulstad

2008, chronologically. An attempt was made to match these events to a chronological succession of environmental interactions with the landscape (Pre-contact Indigenous settlements; palisades; casas fuertes/Medieval layout; Iberian Grid Town Plan; Pueblo Tutelados; and post-Pueblo Tutelado period) in an effort to identify what events affected which interactions.

In the end, this chronology of events culled mainly from historical records has provided an understanding of the political and economic forces that shaped the colony of Hispaniola, in general, and the city of Concepción in particular. However, the events presented here are too general to provide much information about the daily lives of those who lived at Concepción. A more thorough examination of historical data, with the purpose of gathering information about people and the activities they undertook, undertaken at a more specific scale, in necessary to better interpret artifact deposition patterning. This will be the aim of the next chapter.