



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Hispaniola - hell or home? : Decolonizing grand narratives about intercultural interactions at Concepción de la Vega (1494-1564)
Kulstad, P.M.

Citation

Kulstad, P. M. (2019, October 8). *Hispaniola - hell or home? : Decolonizing grand narratives about intercultural interactions at Concepción de la Vega (1494-1564)*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/80958>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/80958>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/80958> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Kulstad, P.M.

Title: Hispaniola - hell or home? Decolonizing grand narratives about intercultural interactions at Concepción de la Vega (1494-1564)

Issue Date: 2019-10-08

**HISPANIOLA - HELL OR HOME?: DECOLONIZING GRAND
NARRATIVES ABOUT INTERCULTURAL INTERACTIONS AT
CONCEPCIÓN DE LA VEGA (1494-1564)**

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker, volgens besluit van het
College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 8 oktober 2019
klokke 11.15 uur

door
Pauline Martha Kulstad González
geboren te River Falls, Wisconsin, Verenigde Staten
in 1971

Promotor

Prof. dr. C.L. Hofman (Universiteit Leiden)

Co-promotoren

Dr. A. Antczak (Universiteit Leiden)

Dr. J. Ulloa Hung (Instituto Tecnológico de Santo Domingo)

Promotiecommissie

Dhr. Prof.dr. J.A.C. Kolen (voorzitter, Universiteit Leiden)

Dhr. Prof.dr. M.E.R.G.N. Jansen (secretaris, Universiteit Leiden)

Dhr. dr. Arie Boomert (Universiteit Leiden)

Prof. dr. K. Deagan (University of Florida)

Dr. V. Flores Sasso (Pontificia Universidad Católica Madre y Maestra)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

"Whoever you are...I have always depended on the kindness of strangers."
A Streetcar Named Desire

A heartfelt thanks to the NEXUS 1492 project, and its PIs, Corinne L. Hofman, Gareth Davies, and Willem Willems (+), for supporting this research. NEXUS 1492 received funding from the European Research Council under the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013) / ERC grant agreement n° 319209. Special appreciation must be expressed to my supervisor, Corinne Hofman and co-supervisors Andrzej Antczak and Jorge Ulloa Hung. Special acknowledgements must be given to Maribel Adame and Ilone de Vries for their untiring patience and support in project management.

I would foremost like to thank the people of Pueblo Viejo and La Vega who made this all possible, most especially archaeologists Frank and Pablo Coste, and the Park guides: Hipólito Abreu, Domingo, and Junior. At the Ministerio de Cultura de la República Dominicana, special thanks must be given to the Viceministerio de Patrimonio Cultural, specially Nerva Fondeur, Martha Roquel, Ana María Conde; the Dirección General de Patrimonio Monumental, specially Pierre Denis (+), Santiago Duval, and Edda Grullón; the Museo del Hombre Dominicano, specially Orli Peña, Christian Martínez, Glenis Tavares, and Harold Olsen.

Very special thanks to the Historical Archaeology Collection at the Florida Museum of Natural History, particularly Kathleen Deagan, Gifford Waters, and Charles Cobb. Special thanks are also given to Paul Losch at the Latin American and Caribbean Collection, and James Cusick at the Special and Area Studies Collections, both at the George A. Smathers Libraries at the University of Florida.

This dissertation was written in three countries, with the advice and support of various dear friends. In Leiden, thanks to the Antczak and Duin families. In Gainesville, to the Casa del Ritmo Crew, both physical and virtual, most especially to Rosana Resende and Antonio Tovar. Special gracias to the Guilamo family and allegados - particularly Altagracia, Pepi, John Demulain, and Efraín Barradas. In New York, special thanks to the Dominican Studies Institute (CUNY-DSI) for the opportunity to study at their library through the NSA Dominican Studies Fellowship. In Santo Domingo, this dissertation could not have been written without the support of two important neighbors, Il Cappuccino Restaurant, and the Biblioteca Juan Bosch (Funglode).

Last, but not least, a shoutout to my greatest supporters, my siblings, Tess and Roger; Martha Ellen Davis, for the generous use of her front room; and the 3 o'clock coffee ladies - Melania Brazoban, Vianela Vittini, Daisy Jimenez, Toni Russin, Mercedes Pimentel de Canalda, Vanesa Alvarez, and Rosa Elena Collado.

*It's perfectly fine if you don't believe in these "superstitions."
In fact, it's better than fine — it's perfect. Because no matter
what you believe, fukú believes in you.*

Junot Diaz - The Brief Wondrous Life of Oscar Wao

¡ZAFÁ! (BIS)

Yomi Mita

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	3
1 INTRODUCTION CHAPTER	11
1.1 Introduction	11
1.2 Grand Narratives about the Colonization of Hispaniola	13
1.3 16th Century Concepción de la Vega	17
1.4 Terminology	19
1.5 Summary of Chapters	20
2 THEORY AND METHODOLOGY	23
2.1 Introduction	23
2.2 Theoretical Framework	24
2.3 Research Methodology	29
2.4 Conclusion	35
3 ARCHAEOLOGY OF ARCHAEOLOGY: CHRONOLOGY OF ARCHAEOLOGICAL INTERVENTIONS AT CONCEPCIÓN	36
3.1 Introduction	36
3.2 Frederick Ober (1892)	36
3.3 Narciso Alberti Bosch (1912)	37
3.4 Erwin Walter Palm (1945)	37
3.5 University of Florida/Universidad de Santo Domingo/Grupo Guama (1950s)	37
3.6 1960s	38
3.7 First Half 1970s	38
3.8 July – Dec. 1976: Pre-Excavation Investigations	39
3.9 Fort Excavation July – Dec. 1976	41
3.10 Monasterio de San Francisco Fort Excavation	44
3.11 Architectural Interpretation of the Concepción Landscape – González/Pérez-Montás 1984	48
3.12 Return to the Fort (1983-1995)	48
3.13 University of Florida 1996-1999: Project for the Conservation and Development of the Rural, Physical and Human Resources at the Parques Nacionales of the Dominican Republic: La Isabela and Concepción de la Vega)	50
3.14 Concepción de La Vega 1495-1564: A Preliminary Look at Lifeways in the Americas' First Boom Town (Kulstad 2008)	53
3.15 Transfer to the Ministry of Culture (2010)	53
3.16 NEXUS1492: Kulstad Dissertation Research (2013-2016)	53
3.17 Conclusion	54

4 HISTORY OF HISTORY: PARTIAL CHRONOLOGY OF MILITARY, POLITICAL AND DIPLOMATIC EVENTS AFFECTING INTERACTIONS AT CONCEPCIÓN (1494-1564)	56
4.1 Introduction	56
4.2 Examination of Historical Documentary Sources	57
4.3 Before: The Pre-Contact Magua Cacicazgo Indigenous Settlement	60
4.4 Castile and Aragon in 1493	61
4.5 Medieval Casa Fuerte - La Isabela Feitoría (1493-1494)	62
4.6 Columbus Palisade Settlements (1494-1495)	63
4.7 Relocation of the Concepción Settlement (1495)	65
4.8 Implantation of the Medieval Casa Fuerte Model at Concepción (1499-1502)	68
4.9 Ovando's Implantation of the Ibero-American Grid Town Plan (1502-1509)	71
4.10 Pueblo Tutelado Period (1516-1519)	82
4.11 Post Pueblo Tutelado Period (1519-1564)	85
4.12 Conclusion	93
5 HISTORY AS A PROCESS: SOCIOCULTURAL AND BIOPHYSICAL INTERACTIONS AT CONCEPCIÓN IN NON-DOMESTIC SPACES (1494-1564)	95
5.1 Introduction	95
5.2 Indigenous Peoples/Indios	96
5.3 European Lifeways	104
5.4 African Lifeways	112
5.5 Peoples Outside of Organized Society	118
5.6 Sociocultural and Biophysical Interactions at Concepción	120
5.7 Conclusions	135
6.1 Introduction	137
6.2 Archaeology at the Site Scale	137
6.3 Archaeology at the Structural Scale	139
6.4 Specific Artifact and Artifact Group Descriptions	153
6.5 Associations	177
6.6 Results	178
7 INTERPRETATION AND COMPARISON	181
7.1 Introduction	181
7.2 Macro Level Interpretation (Site and Structure Scale)	182
7.3 Micro-Scale Interpretation (Artifact Scale)	206

7.4 Conclusion	207
8 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	209
8.1 Summary	209
8.2 Decolonial Analysis of Grand Narratives	211
8.3 A Small Narrative about the colonization of Concepción and Modern Dominican Society	213
8.4 Future Research	215
8.5 Final Consideration	216
summary	253
Samenvatting	255
Resumen	257
BIBLIOGRAPHY	259

APPENDIX A: TABLES

Table 1-1. Colonial Social System (1494-1499)	217
Table 1-2. Colonial Social System (1500-1508)	217
Table 1-3. Colonial Social System (1508-1542)	218
Table 1-4. Colonial Social System (1542-1564)	218
Table 2-1. Research Taxonomy	219
Table 2-2. List of Artifacts Found at the Concepción de la Vega Site Deposit	220
Table 2-3. Plotted Artifacts from the La Vega Vieja Site	221
Table 3-1. Grids used at La Vega Vieja Site	222
Table 4-1. Colonial Government Chronology (1492-1564)	223
Table 6-1. Presence/Absence in Excavation Units and Number of Units Where Found	225
Table 6-2. Monasterio de San Francisco Campus - Areas of Interest	226
Table 6-3. Fort Campus - Areas of Interest	227
Table 6-4. Mellacoid and Chicoid Ceramic Attributes	228
Table 7-1. Labor Divisions by Gender, Geography and Freedom	230

APPENDIX B: FIGURES

Figure 1. Santo Cerro Church	233
Figure 2. Current view of the Fort campus	234
Figure 3. Current view of the Monasterio de San Francisco campus	234
Figure 4. Topographic contour map	235
Figure 5. Monasterio de San Francisco campus - Excavated Areas	236
Figure 6. Fort Campus.	237
Figure 7. Monasterio de San Francisco Campus.	238
Figure 8. Fort campus - Excavated areas.	239
Figure 9. Fort Campus - Plotted Artifacts	240
Figure 10. Monasterio de San Francisco Campus - Plotted Artifacts	241
Figure 11. Human Remains - San Francisco Campus	242
Figure 12. Monasterio de San Francisco Campus - Nail Distribution	243
Figure 13. Monasterio de San Francisco - Glass, Griddles, Indigenous, La Vega Red on White	244
Figure 14. Fort Campus - Nail Distribution	245
Figure 15. Fort Clay Excavation Pits	246
Figure 16. Fort Campus - Glass, Griddles, Indigenous, La Vega Red on White	247
Figure 17. Fort Campus - Bells	248
Figure 18. Monasterio de San Francisco Campus - Bells	249
Figure 19. Fort - Bookhardware and Glass Vials	250
Figure 20. Cupellation molds	251
Figure 21-24. Diablo Cojuelo costume	252