



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

A Textual Study of the *Lakṣaṇaṭīkā

Yonezawa, Y.

Citation

Yonezawa, Y. (2019, October 24). *A Textual Study of the *Lakṣaṇaṭīkā*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/79823>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/79823>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/79823> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Yonezawa, Y.

Title: A Textual Study of the *Lakṣaṇāṭīkā

Issue Date: 2019-10-24

1.2 Tibetan Notes on the *Pras*

Grammatical Explanation of 'Pratītyasamutpāda'

[LVP 5.1–10.10; M 120.6–132.1 (§§ 6–14); MacDonald 2015b: 392.2–397.16]

[LVP 5.1–6; M 120.6–121.5 (§6); MacDonald 2015b: 392.2–13]

§1 **etir gatyārtha ity-ādi** (LVP 5.1; M 120.6) **byings** (LVP 5.1; M 120.6: **dhātu-**) dang **nye bar bsgyur pa** (LVP 5.1; M 120.6: **upasarga-**) gud gud du bshad na'o||

§2 **nye bar bsgyur pa** ste bsdus nas rkyen sngon du 'gro ba byas na **don gzhan du 'gyur te** (cf. LVP 5.1; M 120.6–7: upasarga-vaśena dhātv-**artha**-vipariṇāmāt, LVP 5.2; M 120.8: upasargeṇa dhātv-**artho** valād **anyatra nīyate**; nye bar bsgyur ba'i dbang gis ni|| skad byings don ni yongs bsgyur te||) || iṇ¹⁾ byings ste **'gro ba'i don** (LVP 5.1; M 120.6: **gatyārtha-**) to | de la prati sngon du byin pa ni **nye bar** ^[7a5] **sgyur ba** ste des de'i **don stobs kyis gzhan du 'dren par byed pa'o** (LVP 5.2; M 120.8: upasargeṇa dhātv-**artho** valād **anyatra nīyate**) |

1) See Katre 1968: 110.

§3 de la kṛt pratya ya byas nas **lyap'i** rkyen kyis ta-kāra tya-kāra byas pas iṇ'i phyis ste i-m-it prati'i ti ri lor 'gyur te **pratītya'i sgra'o lyap-anta** ces (LVP 5.4; M 121.2: **pratītyaśabdo** 'tra **lyab-antaḥ**; **lyab kyi mtha' can pra tī tya'i sgra ni**) pa ni “-ta-” la “-ya-” btags pa ste **thob pa'i ltos pa'i** don mtshon par byed pa'o (LVP 5.4; M 121.2: **prāptāv apekṣāyām** vartate; **phrad pa ste ltos pa la** 'jug pa yin te||) |

§4 **samut-pūrvaḥ** (LVP 5.4; M 121.3; **sa mud gong na yod pa'i** pā ta ni 'byung ba'i don can yin pas) ces pa la-stsogs pa'i mdo'i sa samut-nye bar ^[7a6] **sgyur ba** can kyi pada'i byings la apa'i rkyen byin nas pa'i mthus apa la btags pas “pa” ring por 'gyur te bsdus na samutpāda ces bya'o te | de ni skye ba'i **'byung ba'o** (LVP 5.4; M 121.3–4: samutpādaśabdaḥ **prādurbhāve** vartate; sa mud pā ta'i sgra ni **'byung ba la** 'jug go) ||

[LVP 5.7–7.5; M 121.6–124.4 (§7); MacDonald 2015b: 392.13–394.4]

§5 de ltar na rten cing 'brel bar 'byung ba ces thun mong du bsgrubs nas || **gzhan yang** (LVP 5.7; M 121.6: **apare tu**; gzhan dag) ces pa sngon kyi slob dpon kha cig kyi 'dod pa Bhāvivekasya brjod nas sun 'byin par 'dod pa'o |

§6 **itau** sambhava (LVP 5.7; M 121.6–7: **itau** sādharma) ni ^[7a7] **'jig pa'i** rjesu mthun pa'i 'jig pa'o | 'dir

in gatau 'jig pa la bya la **prati bzlas** (LVP 5.7; M 121. 7: **pratir vīpsā**_artha) te brjod pa la bya | **taddhitānta** (LVP 5.8; M 121. 7) ni ta'i rkyen la ya btags pas tya'i yi ge brung ba ste “-ya-” btags pa'i mtha' can no | de ltar na **so sor 'jig pa can kyi skye pa ni rten 'brel** kyi-don to (LVP 5.8; M 122.1–2: **prati prati ityānām vināśinām utpādaḥ pratītyasamutpāda iti**; so so so sor 'gro zhing 'jig pa dang ldan pa rnam kyi 'byung ba ni rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba'o zhes) ces 'chado |

§7 de yang lung kyi don dang ldan te (cf. LVP 6.1–2; M 122.2–4: **pratītyasamutpādam vo bhikṣavo deśaiṣyāmi** | yaḥ **pratītyasamutpādam paśyati** | sa **dharmaṁ paśyatītyaivam ādau viṣaye vīpsārthasya sambhavāt**) gang rten bying res pas **bzlas don** (LVP 6.2; M 122.6: **vīpsārtha**-) brjod pa yang 'grub ^[7a8] la 'di nyid **bsdus pa** (LVP 6.2; M 122.6: **samāsa**-; tshig bsdu ba) yang yin no ||

§8 'dir yang (Pras_LVP 6.3; Pras_M 122.5: **iha tu**) ces pa nas thun mong du dpyad par bya ste | (ārya-Buddhapālita ni **pratītya prāptaḥ samutpāda utpattir ūhe** | **Bhāvivekena prati-vīpsārthaḥ** | **athavā prāptyartha etir gatyartha iti viparītānutpādanāt vivādaḥ**...⁽¹⁾) **don kyi khyad par khas blangs nas** (LVP 6.4; M 122.6123.1: **anāṅkṛtārthaviśeṣe**; don gyi khyad par dngos su zhal gyis) ces pa **mig cig pu la** (LVP 6.4; M 123.1–2: **ekacakṣur**-indriya-hetukāyām; **mig** gi dbang po **gcig** gi rgyu can gyi bzhes) brjod na **bzlas** de brjod par-mi grub ste prati'i don mi 'grub po ces bya'o ||

(1) This Sanskrit notes in the margin is to be placed at the section of Bhāviveka's Objection.

§9 don kyi khyad par khas ma blangs na **thob pa'i don** (LVP 6.5; M 123.3: **prāptyarthas**) mi 'grub po snyam na | de ni de med kyang 'grub par bstan pa **don kyi khyad par khas ma blangs kyang** (LVP 6.5; M 123.3: **anāṅkṛtārthaviśeṣe 'pi**; don gyi khyad par zhal gyis ma bzhes pa'i) ces pa la ^[7b1] stsogs pa la | **don kyi khyad par khas blangs pa la yang srid do** (LVP 7.1–2; M 123.4: **anāṅkṛtārthaviśeṣe 'pi sambhavati**; don gyi khyad par zhal gyis bzhes pa la yang yod pa yin tel) ces pa lugs gnyis pa'o ||

§10 **yang taddhita'i mtha can** (LVP 7.2; M 123.6: **taddhitānte ca**_; phan pa'i mtha' can yin na ni) kyi bsbyor ba byas na ma ning kyi rtag-su 'gyur te **pratītyasamutpādam** ces pa'i thig le thob par 'gyur ro | de yang taddhita'i mtha can la **avyaya med pa** (LVP 7.3–4; M 124.1: **_avyayatvābhāvāt**; mi zad par ma yin pa'i phyir) ni **liṅga**'i mtha can la **rnam par 'byed pa** (LVP 7.4; M 124.2: **vibhakti**-; rnam par dbye ba) ma byin par gzugs cig kyis cig kyi tshig dang mang ^[7b2] po'i tshig la-stsogs pa gnas skabs dang bsdu nas bsbyor ba ste de 'dir mi 'dod pa'o |

§11 thig le yod pas **bsdus pa** (LVP 7.4; M 124.2: **samāsa**; tshig bsdu ba) yang med la | **rnam par dbye ba** (LVP 7.4; M 124.2: **vibhakti**-) byas pa-ni thig le dang tshag drag la-stsogs pa byas kyang **mig la brten to ces pa'i tshig du 'gyur la de ltar ma yin no** (LVP 7.4–5; M 124.2–3: **cakṣuḥ**

pratītyaṃ vijñānaṃ rūpāṇi ceti pāṭhaḥ | **syān na caitad evaṃ; mig** dang gzug la **brten pa** rnam par shes pa zhes bya bar 'don par 'gyur ba zhig na | 'di ni de lta bu yang ma yin pas |)

[LVP 7.6–8.9; M 124.4–126.6 (§8); MacDonald 2015b: 394.5–395.10]

§12 **de phyir lyap-anta nyid khas blang bar bya'o** (LVP 7.5; M 124.3–4: **ity** avyayaśyaiva **lyabantasya** vyutpattir **abhyupeyā**; ... **pas lyab kyi mtha' can** mi zad pa kho nar bye brag tu bshad pa **khas blang bar bya'o** ||) ces bsgrubs nas rjes su brjod pa dngos ni **gang yang** (LVP 7.6; M 124.5: **yas tu**; gang zhig) ces pa la ^[7b3] stsogs pa la **prati bzlas pa'i don la eter thob pa'i don la samutpāda byung ba'i don** (LVP 7.6–7; M 124.6–7: **vīpsārthatvāt praty-upasargasya eteḥ prāptyarthatvāt samutpāda-śabdasya ca sambhava_arthatvāt**) ces pa la-stsogs pa'o (‘Buddhapālita'i 'dod¹⁾ || **so sor 'jigs pa rnam's kyi** (LVP 7.7–8.1; M 125.1–2: **prati prati vināśinām** utpādaḥ **pratītyasamutpāda** ity anya iti) ces pa lugs gnyis pa'o ||

§13 lan ni de ltar rjes su brjod pa ni **legs par rjes su ma brjod pa** ste (LVP 8.2; M 125.3–4: **parapakṣa_anuvādākauśalam**; gzhan gyi phyogs **rjes su brjod pa la mi mkhas pa**) | **rgyu ces zhe na gang phyir** (LVP 8.2; M 125.3: **kiṃ kāraṇaṃ** | **yo hi ...; ci'i phyir zhe na** | **gang zhig ...**) ces pa la-stsogs pa la gang du nye bar sgyur ba **prati** dang byings **eti** gnyis log nas **thob pa'i don** (LVP 8.2; M 125.5: **prāptyarthaṃ**) la 'dod kyi **bzlas** ^[7b4] **pa'i don la ma yin no** (LVP 8.3; M 125.5: **na** asau **pratiṃ vīpsārthaṃ** vyācaṣṭe; rten cing zhes bya ba **zlos pa'i don** du **ma yin** zhing) | 'dir ni nye bar sgyur ba cig su gud du mi 'dod to ||

1) *LT 1b3: eke iti Buddhapālitaḥ. See above (p. 73.).

§14 'on **kyang** (LVP 8.3; M 125.6: **kiṃ tarhi**; 'o na ci zhe na) ces pa nas rjes brjod byin ci log dngos bstan te | des ni 'di ltar **pratiṃ prāptyarthaṃ dang etiṃ 'gro ba'i don** (LVP 8.3; M 125.6–7: **pratiṃ prāptyarthaṃ etiṃ ca gatyarthaṃ**) la | de ltar gnyis **bsdus na yang thob pa nyid brjod lar byed pa** (LVP 8.4; M 125.7: **samuditaṃ ca pratītyaśabdaṃ prāptāḥ eva varṇayati**; tshogs pa rten cing 'brel pa'i sgra ni **phrad pa nyid yin par 'chad par byed do** ||) la ||

§15 **des ni** (LVP 8.5; M 126.1: **tena**; des na) ces pa de'i log rtogs **dngos ston te thob bya srid pa la dngos po ma lus pa la brjod na** (LVP 8.6; M 126.2–2: **niravaśeṣasambhaviḥ padārtha-parāmarśo vivakṣitaḥ**; dngos po srid tshad ma lus pa 'dzin par brjod par 'dod pa) **bzlas te brjod pa yod** (LVP 8.7; M 126.4: **vīpsāsaṃbandhaḥ kriyate**; zlos pa dang 'brel par byed la) la ^[7b5] **khyad par la** (LVP 8.7–8; M 126.4–5: atha **viśeṣa-parāmarśaḥ med do** (LVP 8.8; M 126.5–6: **na vīpsāyāḥ saṃbandha**) ces pa ni **rjesu brjod pa la mi khas pa'o** | **slob dpon** (LVP 8.8–9; M: 126.6: **evaṃ tāvad anuvādākauśalam ācāryasya**) ni **Bhāviveka'o** ||

[LVP 8.10–9.6; M 126.7–129.2 (§§9–11); MacDonald 2015b: 395.11–396.8]

§16 de'i **dgongs pa** (LVP 9.1; M 127.3: **abhiprāya-**) ni **mig** dang **gzugs** gnyi kaṃ dang rnam

shes 'brel pa mi 'thad te gzugs can dang gzugs med mi 'byor ro ces bsañ pa'o (cf. LVP 8.10–11; M 126.7–8: **cakṣuḥ** pratītya **rūpāṇi** cotpadyate cakṣurvijñānam ity atra_ubhayathā_ **abhisambandha_ asambhavād**) ||

§17 **yang na** (LVP 9.1; M 127.3: **atha**; 'on te) ces pa la-stsogs pas de'i **dgongs pa** gsal bar byas pa ste de ni srid te **mi srid na** lung dang 'gal lo ces bya ba'i ^[7b6] don to (cf. LVP 9.1; M 127.1–2katham **asambhava** iti yuktyanupādānena pratijñāmātratvāt; ji ltar **med** ces bya ba'i rigs pa ma bkod pas| dam bca' ba tsam yin pa'i phyir ro||) ||

§18 **thob pa'i don nyid** 'phags pa **Klu grub kyis** (LVP 9.4; M 128.2–3: **prāptiyarthasya_**eva ācārya-**Nāgārjunena** pratītyaśabdasya) ces pa ni mdor bsdus na rgyu rkyen kyi tshogs pa **thob pa las** 'bras 'byung ngo (cf. LVP 9.3–4; M 128.2: **prāpya_**śabdasya cāpekṣyaśabdaparyāyatvāt; LVP 5.5–6; M 121.3–4: hetupratyayāpekṣo bhāvānām utpādaḥ pratītyasamutpādārthaḥ) ces pa'o ||

[LVP 9.7–10.10; M 129.3–132.1 (§§12–14); MacDonald 2015b: 396.9–397.16]

§19 **gang yang rang kyi 'dod pa rnam par bzhag pa** (LVP 9.7; M 129.3: **yac cāpi svamataṁ vyavasthāpitaṁ**; **gang yang** 'o na gang yin zhe na| ...**rang gi lugs rnam par gzhag pa**) ces pa ni Bhāviveka rang kyi'o |

§20 **'di yod pas na 'di 'byung** (LVP 9.7; M 129.4: **asmin satīdam bhavati**) ces pa ni **rkyen 'di pa** (LVP 9.8; M 129.5: **idaṁpratyayatā**) ci ste | des ni **rten cing 'brel pa las dang 'byung ba'i don** gnyis **gud du ma bstan bar 'di ni gnyis kyis** ^[7b7] **re re nas mtshon par 'dod pa'o** (LVP 9.8–10.2; M 129.6–7: **pratītyasamutpāda_**śabdayoḥ **pratyekam artha_**viśeṣa_ **anabhidhānāt** | tadvyutpādasya ca **vivakṣitatvāt**; **rten cing 'brel par zhes bya ba dang 'byung ba zhes bya ba'i sgra gnyis re re la don gyi** khyad par **ma brjod pa'i phyir la** | de bye brag tu bshad pa yang **brjod par 'dod pa'i phyir ro||**) || de gsal bar byed par 'dod pa ni gud gud pa de'o ||

§21 **gang kho na sun 'byin pa** ni sngon kyi slob dpon kyi 'dod pa'o | **de nyid khyod gyi 'dod par khas blangs par 'gyur ro ces** (LVP 10.9; M 131.7: **yad eva dūṣyate tad eva_**abhyupagamyata iti na yujyata; **gang zhig sun 'byin pa de nyid khas blangs par** rigs pa ma yin no||) bya'o ||

Non-Origination of a Hypostatized Entity From Itself: Ancillary Topics

[LVP 12.8–36.2; M 137.3–191.3 (§§ 19–60); MacDonald 2015b: 401.3–426.18]

[LVP 12.8–10; M 137.1–5 (§§ 18–19); MacDonald 2015b: 401.1–6]

§22 **khyad par brgyad** (cf. LVP 11.4; M 133.3–4: ananta-**viśeṣaṇa_**saṁbhava 'pi pratītyasamutpādasya **aṣṭānām** eva_upādānam) kyis **khyad par du byas pa'i rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba'i don ston**

pa'i brjod byed la sgra'i skyon spangs nas | rten 'brel bstan pa legs par bstan ^[7b8] par 'gyur ro | de la skye ba med pa la **skye bar** 'dod pa'i log rtogs **bkag pas bde blag du rtogs par 'gyur ba dang** | gzhan yang 'gag pa la-stsogs pa'i don lhag ma rnam bde blag du go ba'i phyir **skye ba dgag ba** bye brag du bstan la (LVP 12.8–10; M 137.3–: anirodhādi-viśiṣṭa-pratītyasamutpāda-pratipipādayiṣayā | utpāda-pratiṣedhena nirodhādi-pratiṣedha-saukaryam manyamāna ācāryaḥ prathamam eva utpādapratīṣedham ārabhate; slob dpon **rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba 'gag pa med pa la sogs pas khyad par du** 'phags par gyur pa **bstan par bzhed nas** | **skye ba bkag pas 'gag pa la sogs pa dgag pa sla bar dgongs shing** thog mar **skye ba dgag pa** rtsom pa mdzad do||) ||

[LVP 12.13–14; M 138.2–3; MacDonald 2015b: 401.10–13]

na svato nāpi parato na dvābhyāṁ nāpy ahetutaḥ |
utpannā jātu vidyante bhāvāḥ kvacana ke cana || [MMK I.1]

[LVP 14.1–3; M 140.4–141.3 (§22); MacDonald 2015b: 402.13–19]

ācārya Buddhapālita tv āha | na svata utpadyante bhāvās tadutpādavaiarthyaṭd atiprasaṅgadoṣāc ca | na hi svātmanā vidyamānānām padārthānām punarutpāde prayojanam asti | atha sann api jāyeta na kadācin na jāyete iti |

[LVP 14.1–15.2; M 141.4–142.3 (§23); MacDonald 2015b: 403.1–10]

§23 de la **bdag las skye ba mi 'thad te don med pa'i phyir ro** (LVP 14.1; M 140.5: na svata utpadyante bhāvās tadutpāda-vaiarthyaṭ; dngos po rnam **bdag las skye ba med** de | de dag gi skye ba don med pa nyid du 'gyur ba'i phyir) ces slob dpon Sangs rgyas skyong (LVP 14.1; M 140.5: ācārya Buddhapālita) kyis gsungs pa la 'grel pa mkhan gzhan kyis ^[7b9] brtsad pa ni |

§24 de mi 'thad te (LVP 14.4; M 141.5: tad ayuktam |) dpe dang rtan tshigs ma smos pa dang (LVP 14.4; M 141.5: hetudrṣṭāntānabhīdhanāt; gtan tshigs dang dpe ma brjod pa'i phyir dang) | **gzhan kyis skyon brjod pa ma spangs pa dang** (LVP 14.4; M 141.5: paroktadoṣāparihārāt; gzhan gyis smras pa'i nyes pa ma bsal ba'i phyir) | **thal 'gyur kyī ngag yin pa'i phyir bzlog pas mthar thug par 'gyur la de lta na gzhan las skye ba grub pa cing thug pa med pa'i skyon med do grub mtha dang 'gal lo** (LVP 15.1–2; M 141.6–142.2: prasaṅgavākyatvāc ca prakṛtārthaviparyayeṇa viparītasādhayataddharmavyaktaḥ **parasmād utpannā** bhāvā janmasāphalyāj janmanirodhāc¹⁾ ca **kṛtāntavirodhaḥ** syāt |; **thal bar 'gyur ba'i tshig yin pa'i phyir** skabs kyī don las **bzlog pas** bsgrub par bya ba dang | de'i chos bzlog pa'i don mngon pas dngos po rnam **gzhan las skye bar 'gyur ba dang** | skye ba 'bras bu dang bcas pa nyid du 'gyur ba dang | skye ba thug pa yod par 'gyur ba'i phyir **grub pa'i mtha'** dang 'gal bar 'gyur ro) ces brtsad pa'o ||

1) Po: °niṣṭhātvāc.

[LVP 15.3–16.10; M 143.1–147.4 (§§ 24–26); MacDonald 2015b: 403.11–405.5]

§25 de ltar skyon brjod pa slob dpon Zla grags kyis rtsod ba **skyon de dag ni mi 'thad par**

mthong ste (LVP 15.3; M 143.1: sarvam **etad dūṣaṇam ayujyamānam** eva vyaṁ¹⁾ **paśyāmaḥ; skyon 'di dag** thams cad ni **rigs pa ma yin par** kho bo cag gis **mthong ngo||**) ces pa-la-stsogs-ste |

1) *LT 1b6: vāyam iti candrakīrttiḥ.

§26 ^[8a1] 'dir slob dpon 'dis dbu' mar gnas pa'i tshul kyis slob dpon Sangs rgyas skyong kyis 'dod pa bskyangs pa ni **ji ltar byas na** (LVP 15.3; M 143.1–2: **katham kṛtvā; ji ltar zhe na**) ces pa la-stsogs pa ste | de yang slob dpon Zla grags 'di ni skye pa dran pas sngon slob dpon Sangs rgyas skyong du skye ba blangs par shes nas de'i 'dod pa skyong ba la 'bad pa'o ces kha cig kyis'o | kha cig na re thal 'gyur du sgra bar mthun pas ces grag go |

§27 de la **ci'i phyir zhe na** (LVP 15.4; M 143.3: **kiṁ kāraṇam**) ces pa la-stsogs ^[8a2] pas **dpe dang rtan tshigs ma brjod pa'i** skyon (LVP 15.3–4; M 143.2: **hetuḍṛṣṭānta_anabhidhānād**) spangs pa ste thal 'gyur kyis 'gegs pa la dpe dang rtan tshigs **mi dgos par bstan pa'o** (LVP 15.6; M 143.5–6: **na** ca vidyamānasya punarutpattau **prayojanaṁ paśyāmaḥ; yod** pa ni yang skye ba la **dgos pa ma mthong** zhing) ||

§28 co na rang rgyud kyis ci'i phyir mi 'gegs snyam na | lan du **dbu ma ba rnam rang rgyud kyis rjes dpag bya bar mi rigs ste phyogs gzhan khas mi len pa'i phyir** (LVP 16.2; M 145.4–146.1: **na** ca **mādhyamikasya svataḥ svatantram anumānaṁ karttum yuktam | pakṣāntarābhyupagamābhāvāt; dbu ma pa yin na ni rang gi rgyud kyis rjes su dpag par bya ba rigs pa yang ma yin** tel **phyogs gzhan khas blangs pa med pa'i phyir ro||**) ces bya ste |

Quotation of the VV vv.29–30 [LVP 16.6–10; M 146.6–147.4; MacDonald 2015b: 404.15–405.5]

§29 chos can las stsogs pa tshad mas grub pa'i yongs chod khas mi len pa'o || dgag bya gcad pa tsam la tshad ma yin kyis ^[8a3] yongs tshod kyis khas blangs rang rgyud pa la med do snyam na | tshad ma ni 'dir spros pa gcod pa kha mi slu ba yin la des yongs su bcad pa'i don kyis stong na tshad ma'i bya bas stong bas tshad ma nyams par 'gyur ro ||

[LVP 16.11–18.4; 147.5–149.2 (§27); MacDonald 2015b: 405.6–406.7]

§30 **gang kyis tshe rang rgyud mi 'dod pa** (LVP 16.11; M 147.5: **yadā** caivaṁ **svatantra_anumāna_anabhidhāyitvaṁ mādhyamikasya**) de lan kyis **skye mched rnam ces** (LVP 16.11–12; M 147.6–7: **nādhātṁkāny āyatanāni svata utpannāni_iti**) tshad mas grub pa gang la-srid || gal te **dam 'cha** (LVP 16.12; M 147.7: **svatantrā pratijñā**) na **Grangs can** (LVP 16.12; M 147.7: **Sāmkhyāḥ**) phyogs snga ma byed par 'gyur te | 'bras bu'i bdag nyid du pas 'bras bu-mi skye na grub pa la sgrub la (LVP 17.2; M 148.2: **kāryātmanaḥ cet siddhasādhanaṁ; gal** te 'bras bu'i bdag nyid las yin na ni grub pa la **sgrub pa yin la**)¹⁾ | ^[8a4] **rgyu'i bdag nyid las mi skye na 'gal te** (LVP 17.2; M 148.2–3: **kāraṇātmanaś ced viruddhārthatā; rgyu'i bdag nyid las yin na ni 'gal ba'i don nyid du 'gyur te**) **rgyu'i**

bdag nyid las skye ba'i phyir ro (LVP 17.2–18.1; M 148.4–5: **kāraṇātmanā** vidyamānsyaiva sarvvasyotpattimata **utpādād**; skye ba dang ldan pa thams cad ni **rgyu'i bdag nyid du** yod pa kho na **skye ba'i phyir**) || des kho bo cag Thal 'gyur ba la darṇ bca med pas skyon de ga la srid | skyon med na skyon spong ba'i stsol ba byed par mi 'gyur ro ||

- 1) =Po confirmed by Tib. The 'kāryātman-' and 'kāraṇātman-' are karmadhāraya compounds and the ablative form indicates a rephrase of 'svataḥ.' However, MacDonald 2003 (159–167) and MacDonald 2008 (29–33) insist the correct readings are not °ātmana(h) but °ātmaka(h).

[LVP 18.5–9; 149.3–150.3 (the first part of §28); MacDonald 2015b: 406.8–17]¹⁾

§31 yang Rang rgyud smra bas brgal pa | **rang la rang rgyud kyi** rtan tshigs mi 'dod (cf. LVP 16.2 M 145.4–146.1: na ca Mādhyamikasya **svataḥ svatantram** anumānaṁ kartuṁ yuktaṁ) kyang thun mong du grub pa'i rang rgyud la brten nas **gzhan kyi 'dod pa 'gegs pa na** thun mong du grub pa'i **rtan tshigs de'i dpe' la-stsogs pa skyon** ^[8a5] med du rang la grub dgos **la de ma brjod pas** dpe dang rtan tshigs **ma smos pa'i skyon** yod do (LVP 18.7–9; M 150.1–3: **parapratijñāyās** tu svata evānumāna-virodha-codanāyāṁ²⁾ **svata** eva pakṣa-**hetudrṣṭāntāpakṣālarahitaiḥ** pakṣādibhir bhavitavyaṁ | tataś ca tad-**anabhidhānāt** taddoṣāparihārāc ca sa eva **doṣa** iti; **gzhan gyi dam bca' ba** la rang gi rjes su dpag pas 'gal ba brjod par ni bya dgos pas | rang nyid la phyogs la sogs pa dang **gtan tshigs dpe'i skyon dang bral ba dag** yod par bya dgos so || de'i phyir de **ma brjod pa'i phyir** dang | de'i nyes pa ma bsal ba'i phyir **nyes pa** de nyid du 'gyur ro) zhes pa ni | **'di ltar yang** (LVP 18.5; M 149.3: **athāpi**; ci ste yang) ces pa la-stsogs pa'o ||

- 1) The related text in the Pras is regarded as an objection from the Sāṅkhya in MacDonald 2000 and 2003. In the following Tibetan passage, the opponent is clearly Bhāviveka. Concerning the 'Rang rgyud smra ba,' see *LT 1b6 "bhāviveka kila svatantrasā<dha>navādī" (Yonezawa 2004a: 131).
2) Concerning the discussions whether this reading is °codanāyāṁ or °codanayā, see MacDonald 2000, n.23, Yonezawa 2004a: 132, n. 2, and Yonezawa 2005: (57)–(63).

[LVP 19.1–7; 150.4–152.5 (the latter part of §28); MacDonald 2015b: 407.1–15]

§32 lan brjod pa ni **de ltar ma yin te** (LVP 19.1; M 150.4: **naitad evaṁ**) ces pa la de ni pha rol kyis **rang kyi dam bca' ba gzhan la** gsal bar byed pas brjod par 'gyur (LVP 19.1–2; M 150.4–151.2: yasmād yo hi yam arthaṁ **pratijñā**-nīte | tena **sva**-niścayavad anyeṣāṁ niścayotpādanecchayā yayopapattyāsāv artho 'dhigataḥ | saivopapattiḥ **paraśmāy upadeṣṭavyā** |; gang gi phyir don gang zhig gang gis **dam bcas pa** des ni **rang nyid kyis** nges pa bzhin du gzhan dag la nges pa bskyed par 'dod pas | don 'di'i 'thad pa gang gi sgo nas khong du chud pa'i 'thad pa de nyid **gzhan la bsnyad par bya dgos** so ||) **la pha rol la dpe la-stsogs pa med pa ma yin no** |

§33 de la 'thad pa med par **rang kyi dam bca' tsam smra bar byed do** (LVP 19.3–5; M 151.3–152.2: tac cāyaṁ **paraṁ prati hetudrṣṭāntāsambhavāt svapratijñāmātrasāratayaiva** kevalaṁ

svapratijñātārtha-sādhanaṃ upādatta iti; 'di ni gzhan la gtan tshigs kyang ma yin no|| gtan tshigs dang | **dpe med pa'i phyir rang gi dam bca' ba'i** don gyi sgrub par byed pa ni khas 'ches pa'i rjes su 'brangs pa 'ba' zhig nye bar bkod pa yin te||¹⁾ ces sgrub pa nyid ^[8a6] skyon brjod pa ste Rang rgyud la mi ltos so zhes bya'o ||

1) The Sanskrit text is reconstructed on the basis of the Sanskrit notes in *LT (Yonezawa 2004a: 133). Po reads na cāyaṃ paraṃ prati hetuḍṣāntāsambhavāt svapratijñānāṅgaye (read °jñānaṅgī?)prāptatayaiva kevalaṃ sva<pratiñātārthasādhana>m upādatta iti. NB. The text between < > is in defect because the edge of the folio is damaged. Ox: na cāyaṃ paraṃ prati hetuḍṣāntāsambhavāt svapratijñāmātrasāratayaiva kevalaṃ svapratijñātārtha-mātram upādatta iti. In MacDonald 2000: 179 and 2003: 179, 'na cāyaṃ' and 'ārthamātram' are emended as 'sa cāyaṃ' and 'ārthasādhanaṃ' respectively.

[LVP 19.8–21.7; M 152.6–157.1 (§29); MacDonald 2015b: 407.16–409.11]

§34 yang na **bdag las skye ba mi 'thad te don med pa'i phyir ro** ces pa (LVP 20.1–2; M 153.1–2: **na svata utpadyante** bhāvās tadutpāda-**vaiyarthyaḍ iti**¹⁾ 'di nyid rjes su dpag pa'i rtan tshig su brjod pas gzhan kyi dam bca' la 'gal ba bsgrubs pa ste | **yang na gdon mi za bar** (LVP 19.8; M 152.6: **athāpy avasyaṃ**; ci ste yang ...mi za bar) ces pa la-stsogs pa'o |

§35 **burñ pa** (LVP 20.8; M 155.2–3: yathā **ghaṭaḥ**) (²⁾dper byas pa²⁾ yan lag pa'i sbyor ba byas pa'o | **nye par sbyor ba'i** yan lag kyi **'dir rtan tshigs gsal bar** bstan pa'o (LVP 20.8; M 155.4: kṛtakatvam **atra upanaya abhivyakto hetuḥ**; 'dir nye bar sbyar bas gsal bar byas pa'i byas pa gtan tshigs yin pa) ||

1) = LVP 14.1; M 140.5.

(2) *LT 2a1: ḍṣāntīkṛto. See Yonezawa 2004a: 134.

[LVP 21.8–22.2; M 157.2–159.1 (§§ 30–31); MacDonald 2015b: 409.12–410.7]

§36 **gzhan kyi skyon brjod ma** ^[8a7] **spangs so** (LVP 21.8; M 157.2–3: **paroktadoṣāparihāro**) ces pa'i lan bstan pa'i phyir | **dpe dang rtan tshigs ma smos pa 'ba'** zhig du **ma zad kyi** (LVP 21.8; M 157.2: **na ca kevalaṃ hetuḍṣāntānabhidhānaṃ** na sambhavati; gtan tshigs dang dpe ma brjod pa ma yin pa 'ga' zhig tu ma zad kyi) ces pa la-stsogs pa la | **Grangs can gsal ba las gsal ba 'byung bar mi 'dod pa nyid 'dir dper byed pas so** (LVP 21.9–10; M 157.3–5: **Sāṃkhyā** hi **na eva abhivyakta**-rūpasya puro 'vasthitasya ghaṭasya punar **abhivyaktim icchanti** | tasyaiva ca **iha ḍṣāntatvena**-upādānaṃ siddharūpatvāt |; **Grangs can pa dag** mdun na gnas pa'i bum pa **mngon par gsal ba'i** rang bzhin can ni yang **mngon par gsal bar mi 'dod** cing | de nyid **'dir dpe nyid du** grub pa'i ngo bo yin pa'i phyir la) | **nus pa'i rang bzhin kyi skye ba 'gegs pa** ni bsgrub bya ba'i khyad par te (LVP 21.10–11; M 157.5–6: anabhivyaktarūpasya **śaktirūpa āpannasya utpatti-pratiśedha-viśiṣṭasya sādhyatvāt**; **nus pa'i ngo bor** gyur cing mngon par gsal ba'i rang bzhin ma yin pa **skye ba bkag pas khyad par du** byas pa ni **bsgrub par bya ba** yin pa nyid kyi phyir) | gong du **'jim pa'i gong bu la gnas pa'i** (LVP 21.3; M 155.8: **mṛtpiṇḍa ādy-avasthāyām**) **burñ pa gsal bar 'gyur bar mi 'thad par bstan pa 'dir kyang ngo** |

§37 des na thar 'gyur la Grangs can kyis brjod ^[8a8] pa'i nus pa'i rang bzhin du mi skye na **grub pa la sgrub** la | gsal ba'i rang bzhin du mi skye na 'galo ces pa'i skyon **ga la-srid** do (LVP 21.11; M 158.1: **kutaḥ siddhasādhana**-pakṣadoṣāśāṅkā) |

§38 **bum pa la-stsogs pa ces pa'i stsogs pa'i sgras** (LVP 22.1; M 158.5: **ghaṭādikam** iti ca_ādiśabdena) **dngos po 'thad bsdus pas 'ga' zhi**g rang las skye ba'i dgos pa med pas **ma nges pa ma yin no** (LVP 22.1–2; M 158.5–159.1: niravaśeṣotpitsu-**padārtha-saṃgraha**sya vivakṣitatvād **anaikāntikatā**_api ghaṭādibhir **na_**eva **sambhavati**) ||

[LVP 22.3–5; M 159.2–5 (§ 32); MacDonald 2015b: 410.8–11]

§39 **yang na bsbyong ba'i lam gzhan** (cf. LVP 22.3; M 159.2: **atha vā**_ayam anyāḥ **prayogamārgaḥ**; **yang na sbyor** ba 'di ni **tshul** gzhan yin te) ni lugs gzhan te de'i grub mtha las Grags pa'i lugs gzhan la rten pa'o | **skyes bu dper byas nas skyes bu las** ^[8a9] **gzhan pa rnaṃs kyang skyes bu bzhin rang las mi skye'o** (LVP 22.3–4; M 159.2–5: **puruṣa-vyatiriktāḥ** padārthāḥ svata utpattivādinā tata eva **na svata utpadyante** svātmanā vidyamānatvāt **puruṣavad** itīdam **udāharaṇam udāhāryaṃ**; rang las skye bar smra ba'i **skyes bu las tha dad pa'i** don **rnams** ni **bdag nyid las skye ba med de** | rang gi bdag nyid du yod pa'i phyir | **skyes bu bzhin no zhes dper brjod pa 'di nyid dper brjod par bya'o**) ||

[LVP 22.6–23.2; M 159.6–162.1 (§§ 33–34); MacDonald 2015b: 410.12–411.6]

§40 **skye ba bkag pa yin kyis nus pa las gsal bar 'gyur ba** ma bkag pas **skyon med do** (LVP 22.6; M 159.6: yady api ca_**abhivyaktivādina utpādapraṭiṣedho na bādha**kaḥ; gal te yang **skye ba bkag pas mngon par gsal bar smra ba la gnod par byed pa ma yin pa**) **snyarṃ pa'i dgos pa la | gal te yang** (LVP 22.6; M 159.6: **yady api**) ces pa-la-stsogs pa la skye ba bkag pa gnod byed min par klom kyang **dmigs pa dang mi dmigs pa'i khyad par skye ba dang mthun pas gsal ba la skye ba'i sgra'** kha bskangs ste **brjod pas gnod byed do** (LVP 22.7–8; M 159.7–160.2: pūrvam paścāc ca_**anupalabdhy-upalabdhi-sādharmyeṇa utpāda-śabdena abhivyakter** eva_**abhidhānād** ayaṃ praṭiṣedho na_ābādha)kaḥ ||; sngon dang phyi mar ma dmigs pa dang dmigs par chos mthun pas skye ba'i sgras mngon par gsal ba nyid brjod pa'i phyir | 'di bkag pas gnod par byed pa ma yin no ||) ||

§41 slob dpon Sangs rgyas skyong kyis ^[8b1] **tshig gcig las ma gsungs par spros pa 'di dag gang nas snyed** zhe na (cf. LVP 22.1; M 160.3–161.1: **katharṃ** punar **ayaṃ** yathā_**uktaś cārtho** vinā_eva_**ittharṃ** vicārābhidhānāl labhyata iti cet; yang **ji skad smras pa'i** don gyi rjod par byed pa med par rnam par dpyod pa 'di **lta bu 'di ji ltar rnyed ce na**) | **smras pa** (LVP 22.9–23.1; M 161.1: **ucyate**) ces pa la **ngag gyi don 'di dag ni** ces pa **don chen po ste** (23.1: **arthavākyāni hy etāni mahārthāni**) ces pa la sgra'i lugs kyis don rtso bo'i ngag dang tshig rtso ba'i ngag gnyis ste |

§42 tshig gcig kyis don mang po sdud par byed pa dang don kyis stong yang ngag kyis sdeb sbyor shin tu snyan par sdebs pa'o | de la 'di don rtso bo yin pas tshig gcig kyis kyang sbyor ba mang por 'gyuro |

[LVP 23.3–25.7; M 162.2–166.5 (§§ 35–38); MacDonald 2015b: 411.7–413.10]

§43 ^[8b2] **thal 'gyur kyis ngag yin pa'i phyir bzlog pas mthar thug pa** (LVP 15.1; M 141.6: **prasaṅgavākyatvāc** ca prakṛtārtha-viparyayaṇa viparītasādhya-) ces pa la-stsog pa'i lan ni | 'dir gang kyis bsbyor ba byes pa de la bzlog pas phan gnod byed kyis **kho bo bag bsbyor ba mi 'dod** (LVP 23.5; M 162.5 : **asmābhir abhīṣyata** eveti; **kho bo cag mngon par 'dod pa** kho na yin pas) la des na **dam bca med pas** bzlog pa'ang mi 'gyur ro (LVP 23.3; M 162.23: **prasaṅgaviparītena cārthena** parasyaiva sambandhaḥ | **nāsmākaṁ sva-pratijñāyā abhāvāt**; **thal bar 'gyur ba bzlog pa'i don dang yang pha rol po nyid 'brel pa yin gyi** | **kho bo cag ni ma yin te** | **rang la dam bca' ba med pa'i phyir ro**) **des na** bdag las mi skye ba las bzlog pas gzhan las skye ba grub pas **grub mtha'-dang 'gal ba med** (LVP 23.4; M 162.3: **tataś ca siddhāntavirodha_ asambhavaḥ**; **de'i phyir kho bo cag la grub pa'i mtha' dang 'gal ba ga la yod**) do |

§44 **des na grub mtha' dang 'gal lo** (LVP 23.4; M 162.3: **tataś ca siddhāntavirodha_**) ces pa la-stsogs pa'i sgra ^[8b3] **ser ga dang zhags pa thogs pa'i pho nya ba bzhin don rang bdam med par log par sgyur nus pa min la** | **'on kyang sgra'i nus pa yod** nams smra ba po'i brjod 'dod kyis don rjes su brjod pas 'dir gzhan kyis 'dod pa la brten nas gzhan kyis 'dod pa de nyid la mi 'dod pa thog du gtong ba **tsam yin pa'i phyir ro** (LVP 24.3–6; M 163.2–5: na hi śabdā dāṇḍapāśikā iva vaktāram asvatantrayanti | **kin tarhi** | **satyāṁ śaktau** vaktur vivakṣām anuvīdhīyante | **tataś ca para-pratijñā-pratiśedha-mātra-phalatvāt** **prasaṅgāpādanasya nāsti prasaṅgaviparītārtha_ āpattiḥ**) ||

§45 **des na slob dpon** nyid kyis **thal 'gyur kyis sgo nas** gzhan kyis 'dod pa bgegs pa'o (LVP 24.7; M 164.1–2: **tathā ca ācāryo bhūyasā prasaṅga_āpatti-mukhena_eva parapakṣaṁ nirākaroti sma**; **de ltar yang slob dpon** ni ...zhes bya ba la sogs pas phal cher **thal ba sgrub pa kho na'i sgo nas gzhan gyi phyogs sel bar mdzad do**)) ces bstan pa'i phyir ^[8b4] **gal te nam mkha** zhes bya ba'i dngos po **mtshan nyid las snga rol du yod na mtshan nyid med pa'i dngos por thal la de mi srid pas mtshon bya mtshan nyid** phan tshun rten pa'i phyir ngo bos ma skyes so (cf. LVP 24.6–7; M 164.3–4 (MMK V.1): **nākāśaṁ** vidyate kimcit **pūrvam ākāśa-lakṣaṇāt** | **alakṣaṇaṁ** prasajyeta syāt **pūrvam yadi lakṣaṇāt**)) ces bya'o ||

§46 sngar **slob dpon** Sangs rgyas skyong kyis **tshig rnaṁs don rtso bor byas pas don chen po yin no** zhes brjod na **slob dpon** Klu grub kyis **tshig rnaṁs** (LVP 25.3; M 165.6:

atha_arthavākyatvād ācārya-vākyānāṁ mahārthatve saty; ci skye slob dpon gyi ngag rnamṣ ni don gyi ngag yin pa'i phyir don chen po nyid yin pas) bstan chos kyi rtsa ba yin pa'i phyir de ltar rung kyi cig^[8b5] shos kyi ni ma yin no ces rtog pa la lan du | slob dpon Sangs rgyas skyong kyi tshig rnamṣ la ci'i phyir mi 'thad (LVP 25.4; M 165.7–166.1: ācārya-Buddhapālita-vākyāny api kim iti; slob dpon Sangs rgyas bskyangs kyi ngag dag kyang ci'i phyir de ltar yongs su mi rtog) de 'thad pa kho na'o ||

§47 de ni 'grel pa 'khan yin pas tshig spros nas ston par rung la ma spros pas rjes su dpag pa'i sbyor ba mi 'thad do snyam na | lan du ma nges ste 'grel pas spros nas rjes dpag kyi sbyor ba byed pa kho na min te slob dpon nyid kyiṣ brtsod pa^[8b6] zlog pa'i 'grel par ma byas pas so (LVP 25.6; M 166.4–5: Vigrahavyāvartanyāṁ vṛttim kurvātāpy ācāryeṇa prayogavākya_anabhīdhānāt; rTsod pa bzlog pa'i 'grel pa mdzad pa na| slob dpon gyis kyang sbyor ba'i ngag ma gsungs pa'i phyir ro) ||

[LVP 25.7–26.12; M 167.1–170.4 (§§ 39–41); MacDonald 2015b: 413.11–415.4]

§48 de ltar sngon kyi slob dpon kyi 'dod pa la gzhan kyi skyon brjod pa spangs nas | da ni gzhan kyi 'dod pa la skyon brjod pa'i phyir gzhan yang bdag nyid rtoge'i bstan chos la byang bas (cf. LVP 25.7; M 167.1: api ca_ātamanas tarkaśāstra_atikauśalamātram ācikyāsor; gzhan yang rtog ge ba 'dis bdag nyid rtog ge'i bstan bcos la shin tu mkhas pa tsam zhig bstan par 'dod pas) ces pa la-stsogs pa la rang rgyud kyi bsbyor ba byed pa la skyon yod do (LVP 25.8–9; M 167.2–4: yat svatantraprayoga-vākyābhīdhānaṁ tad atitarāṁ aneka-doṣa-samudayās padam asya tārīkasya_upalakṣyate; rang rgyud kyi sbyor ba'i ngag brjod pa gang yin pa de ni ches shin tu nyes pa du ma'i tshogs kyi gnas su rtogs te) ces bya'o |

§49 ji ltar byas nas (LVP 25.9; M 167.4: katham kṛtvā; ji ltar zhe na) zhe na | don dam par phyi nang kyi skye mched rnamṣ rang las mi skye ste don med pa'i phyir ro ce'o^[8b7] sems dpa' bzhin ces (LVP 25.9–26.1; M 167.5–168.2: na paramārthata ādhyātmikāny āyatanāni svata utpannāni | vidyamānatvāc caitanyavad iti |; don dam par na nang gi skye mched rnamṣ bdag las skye ba med par nges te| yod pa'i phyir dper na shes pa yod pa nyid bzhin no zhes smras pa yin no||) bsbyor ba byed pa na | don dam par ces pa'i khyad par kyi tshig (LVP 26.2; M 168.2: paramārthata iti viśeṣaṇam; don dam pa zhes bya ba'i khyad par) gal te chos can kyi khyad par du byed na don dam pa'i dngos po med pas rgol pa bdag nyid la mi grub la | kun rdzob yin na phyir rgol Grangs can la mi grub ste don dam par brjod par yod par 'dod la don dam par ces khas blangs pa dang 'galo |

§50 gal te rtan tshigs kyi khyad par du byed na kun rdzob du rang la skye ba ma bkag

par 'gyur la | kun rdzob du skye ba 'gegs na don dam par ces khas^[8b8] blangs pa dang 'gal la (LVP 26.3–4; M 168.3–4: loka-saṁvṛtyā_ abhyupetasya_ utpādasya_ apratiṣidhyamānatvāt | pratiṣedhe ca_ abhyupetabādhā-prasaṅgād iti cet |; gal te 'jig rten gyi kun rdzob tu skye bar khas blangs pa dgag par bya ba ma yin pa'i phyir dang | 'gog na yang khas blangs pas gnod par thal bar 'gyur ba'i phyir ro zhe na) | pha rol ba don dam par 'dod pa ma bkag pas ma nges par 'gyur ro | des na kun rdzob du yang rang las skye ba med pa la rjes su dpag pa'i bsbyor ba la rten pas gcig bkag pas gcig bsgrubs par 'gyur ba'i phyir de ltar mi rigs so zhes bya'o (LVP 26.4; M 168.4–5: na_etad yuktam saṁvṛtyā_ api svata utpatty anabhyupagamāt; 'di ni rigs pa ma yin te| bdag las skye ba ni kun rdzob tu yang khas ma blangs pa'i phyir ro) ||

§51 des na bCom ldan 'das kyis kyang khas len pa dgag pa'i phyir sa bon de yang (LVP 26.5; M 169.1 (Quotation from the *Śālistamba-sūtra*): sa cāyam bīja-hetuko 'ṅkura; sa bon gyi rgyu las byung ba'i myu gu de yang) ces pa la-stsogs pa'o ||

[LVP 26.13–27.6; M 170.5–171.6 (§§ 42–44); MacDonald 2015b: 415.5–416.5]

§52 gzhan don dam par 'dod pa la ltos nas^[8b9] khyad par de ltar byas so zhe na (LVP 26.13; M 170.5: paramatāpekṣam viśeṣaṇam iti cet; gzhan gyi lugs la ltos te khyad par du byas so zhe na) | kun rdzob du yang gzhan pas skye ba 'jig rten pa 'thad mi 'dod pa'i phyir (LVP 26.13–27.1; M 170.6: saṁvṛtyāpi tadīyavyavasthā_ anabhyupagamāt; de dag gi rnam par gzhag pa ni kun rdzob tu yang khas blangs pa med pa'i phyir ro) don dam pa kho na'i khyad par mi 'thad do (LVP 27.2; M 170.8–9: paramatāpekṣam api viśeṣaṇa_ abhidhānam na yujyate; gzhan gyi gzhung la ltos te khyad par brjod pa yang rigs pa ma yin no) |

§53 de lta na yang gzhan kyī 'dod pa la ltos nas sbyor ba byed do zhe na de lta na thal 'gyur yin kyī rang rgyud nyams la | rang rgyud yin na gzhi chos can ma grub pa la-stsogs pa'i skyon 'gyur ro ||

§54 'jig rten pa yang rang las ji ltar skye bar mi 'dod pas de la rten pa'i khyad^[9a1] par mi byed ce na (LVP 27.3–4; M 171.1–2: na cāpi lokaḥ svata utpattim pratipannaḥ | yatas tad apekṣayāpi viśeṣaṇa-sāphalyam syāt; gang las de la ltos nas kyang khyad par 'bras bu dang bcas par 'gyur ba 'jig rten pas kyang bdag las skye bar mi rtogs te) || 'jig rten pa yang (LVP 27.4; M 171.2: loko hi; 'jig rten pas ni) ces pa la-stsogs pa'o ||

[LVP 27.7–9; M 171.7–172.2 (§ 45); MacDonald 2015b: 416.6–10]

§55 yang na (LVP 27.7; M 171.7: api ca; gzhan yang) rang nyid kyī 'dod pas kun rdzob du skye ba mi 'gegs la pas don dam pa'i khyad par byas so zhe na | de'i tshe (LVP 27.8; M 171.8: tadā) don dam pa'i mig la-stsogs pa'i skye mched rnam don dam par yod par rang la-ma grub

pas chos can ma grub pa dang rtan tshigs rten med pa'i skyon du 'gyur ro (LVP 27.8–9; M 172.1–2: **paramārthataḥ** svataś **caḥśurādy-āyatanānām** anabhyupagamāt; rang gis **don dam par mig la sogs pa'i skye mched rnams** khas ma blangs pa'i phyir rol||) ||

[LVP 27.9–28.3; M 172.3–173.2 (§§ 46–47); MacDonald 2015b: 416.11–417.2]

§56 **kun rdzob** chos can du byas (LVP 27.9; M 172.3: **sāṃvṛtyā** caḥśurādisadbhāvād adoṣa iti cet; gal te **kun rdzob** tu mig la sogs pa yod pa'i phyir nyes pa med do zhe na) nas **don dam par skye ba 'gegs po** zhe na (LVP 27.10; M 172.5: sāṃvṛtānām caḥśurādīnām **paramārthata utpattiṣedhād**; gal te mig la sogs pa kun rdzob pa rnams **don dam par skye ba 'gog pa'i phyir**) | **don par ces** ^[9a2] **pa** gang kyi **khyad par** yin mi shes par 'gyur ro (cf. LVP 28.10–11; M 172.5–6: utpattiṣedha-**viśeṣaṇaṃ paramārtha**-grahaṇam iti ced; **don dam pa** smos pa ni skye ba la 'gog pa'i **khyad par** yin no zhe na) ||

§57 **kun rdzob kyi mig la-stsogs pa la don dam pa'i skye ba 'gegs po** (LVP 27.11–28.1; M 172.7–8: **sāṃvṛtānām caḥśurādīnām paramārthato** nāsty utpattir iti) zhe na | de lta na kun rdzob kyi mig la-stsogs pa rnams **don dam par skye pa** med pa'i phyir ces brjod par rigs pa las ma brjod pa'o ||

§58 **de ltar** don kyi **brjod par 'gyur ro** (LVP 27.11; M 172.6–7: evaṃ tarhy **evam** eva **vaktavyam**; de skad brjod par bya bar 'gyur na | **de skad du** yang **ma smras so**) zhe na gzhan kyis gaṃ rjes tsa yod pa ni 'dod pas gong du smos pa'i rang dang gzhan la ma grub pa'i skyon du 'gyur la | de sel ba la thal 'gyur las rang rgyud la nus pa med pa'i phyir ^[9a3] sbyor ba don med do ||

[LVP 28.4–30.11; M 173.3–177.2 (§ 48); MacDonald 2015b: 417.3–419.2]

§59 **yang na sgra** chos can du 'jog pa na sgra **spyi chos can** du byed pa bzhin 'dir kyang rang dang gzhan kyi 'dod pa kun rdzob dang don dam kyis mpye ba'i mig **spyi** tsam chos can yin kyi **bye prag yin na rjes su dpag pa** rgyun tshad yas gyur te de ni bsgrub bya grub pa'i bdag nyid yin pas so zhe na (LVP 28.4–29.1; M 173.3–5: **atha syād** | yathānityaḥ **śabda** iti dharma-**dharmīṇoḥ sāmānyam** eva grhyate | na viśeṣaḥ | **viśeṣa**-grahaṇe hi **saty anumāna**-anumeya-vyavahārābhāvaḥ syāt | **ci ste** ji ltar **sgra** mi rtag ces bya ba la chos dang chos can gnyis **spyi** nyid gzung ba yin gyi | **khyad par** ni ma yin te || **khyad par** 'dzin **na ni rjes su dpag pa** dang rjes su dpag par bya ba'i tha snyad med par 'gyur ro) | lan du **de ni ma yin te** (LVP 29.7; M 175.1: **na ca etad** evaṃ; **de ni** de ltar yang **ma yin te**) ces pa la 'dir dgol ba dang phyir rgol gnyis la grub pa'i kun rdzob dang ^[9a4] **don dam thun mong ba'i chos can** mi 'grub ste |

§60 phyin ci log du snang bas stong ba'i chos can tshad mas grub pa | 'dod la | **phyin ci log dang ma log pa tha dad pa'i phyir** (LVP 30.2–3; M 175.3–4: **bhinnau** hi **viparyāsāviparyāsau**; **phyin ci log dang phyin ci ma log pa dag ni tha dad pa yin no**) cig la cig kyis stong bar snang la

rgol ba gnyis po phan tshun la ltos nas phyin ci log yin te | phyin ci ma log par snang ba la phyin ci log du snang ba med pas thun mong ba'i spyi chos can mi 'grub po |

§61 des na khyod kyis phyin ^[9a5] ci ma log pa'i tshad mas grub pa chos can snang ba la phyin ci log ga la srid te de ni don dam pa kho na'o zhes bya'o | 'jig rten 'thad la thun mong du snang ba 'di nyid rgol ba gnyis la thun mong du snang bas mig spyi chos cano zhe na | tshad mas grub pa-zhigam 'on te min | tshad mas grub na yang dag par 'gyur ro zhe na | tha snyad pa'i tshad mas grub pas yang dag par mi 'gyur ro | de lta na phyir dgol la gzhi chos can ma grub par 'gyur ^[9a6] te don dam par 'dod pas so ||

§62 gzhan yang tshad mas grub pa dang yang dag min pa 'gal la | gal te tshad mas yang dag pa min pa nyid du grub po zhe na | snang ba yang dag pa'i rang bzhin med pa nyid las bsgrub bya gzhan med pas rtan tshigs dpan du don pa med par 'gyur ro ||

§63 tshad mas snang ba tsam po sgrub la de'i chos rang bzhin med pa sgrub pa la rtan tshigs 'god do zhe na | snang ba de nyid rang bzhin med pa yin na skyon snga ma las mi 'grol lo de nyid las gzhan yin na chos 'thad rang bzhin med pa mi grub ste snang ba yod pa'o |

§64 ^[9a7] spang na tshad ma cig kyis grub pa la cig kyis mi gnod pas rjes dpag brgya bkod kyang dgag par mi nus la | de nyid don dam pa yin na | sangs rgyas pa la rten ma grub pa'am chos can ma grub pa'i skyon du 'gyur te don dam pa'i chos can mi 'dod pa'i phyir ro ||

§65 'on te chos can snang ba'i chos rjes dpag kyis 'gegs na tha dad dam mi dad 'tha mi dad na skyon gong ma nyid do | tha dad na rang bzhin med pa gud du grub kyang ^[9a8] snang ba tshad mas grub par yod pas chos 'thad rang bzhin med par mi 'gyur te des na yang **phyogs ma grub pa'am rten ma grub par 'gyur ro** (LVP 30.10–11; M 177.1–2: **asiddha_ādhāraḥ pakṣa-doṣa āśraya_asiddho vā hetu-doṣa** ity aparihāra evāyam; de'i phyir **gzhi ma grub pa'i** phyogs kyi skyon dang | **gzhi ma grub pa'i gtan tshigs** kyi skyon ldog pa med pa nyid pas 'di lan ma yin pa nyid do||) ||

[LVP 30.12–14; M 177.3–6 (§ 49); MacDonald 2015b: 419.3–8]

§66 **dpe** dang don **yang mi 'tshungs ste** (LVP 30.12; M 177.3: nirdarśanasya **api nāsti sāmyam**; **dpe** la yang 'dra ba yod pa ma yin no) | **sgra mi rtag pa spyi** tsam yod kyang **mig** la **stong bar smra** ba dang mi **stong bar smra** ba la thun mong du grub pa'i spyi med te yang dag dang yang

dag min pa so sor 'dod pa'o (cf. LVP 30.12–14; M 177.3–6: tatra hi **śabda-sāmānyam anityatva-sāmānyam** cāvivaḥṣitaviśeṣam dvayor api samvidyate | na tv evam **caḥṣuḥ-sāmānyam** **śūnyatāśūnyatāvādibhyām** sāmṃṛtyāṅgīkṛtaṁ nāpi paramārthata iti nāsti nidarśanasāmānyam; der ni **sgra'i spyi dang mi rtag pa nyid kyi spyi** khyad par brjod par mi 'dod pa gnyi ga la yang yod na| de bzhin du mig gi spyi ni **stong pa nyid dang stong pa nyid ma yin par smra ba dag gis** kun rdzob tu yang khas ma blangs la| don dam par yang ma yin pas dpe la yang 'dra ba yod pa ma yin no)) ||

[LVP 30.15–33.3; M 178.1–185.1 (§§ 50–53); MacDonald 2015b: 419.9–423.12]

§67 de ltar **rim pa 'dis** ni Bhāvivekas **yod pa'i phyir ces** pa'i bsbyor ba ^[9a9] bkod pa la **yang bsbyar ro** (LVP 30.15–16; M 178.1–2: yaś cāyam asiddhādhārapakṣadoṣodbhāve **vidhiḥ** | **eṣa** eva sattvād ity asya hetor asiddhārthodbhāvane **'pi vojyaḥ**) ||

§68 de ltar sbyin brjod par ma zad kyi **'di ltar yang 'gyur te | gang kyi phyir** (LVP 31.1; M 178.2–3: itthaṁ ca **etad evaṁ yat...**; de lta bu de ni **'di ltar yin te| gang gi phyir...**) zhe na ces pa la | **rtoge ba rang kyis** gzhan la skyon brjod pa'i tshe rang la skyon de dag yod par **khas blangs pa'i phyir ro** (LVP 31.1; M 178.3–4: **svayam** apy anenāyam yathokto 'rtho **'bhyupagatas tārkiyeṇa**) ||

§69 ji ltar **byas na** (M 178.4¹⁾: kathaṁ kṛtvā; ji ltar zhe na) ces pa la | dngos por smra ba rnaṁs kyis **de bzhin gshegs pas gsungs pa'i phyir** (LVP 31.2; M 178.5–6: **tathāgatena nirdeśāt**) skye ba yod par bsbyor ba bkod pa la **kun rdzob dang don dam kyi** (LVP 31.4–5; M 179.4–5: **samṃṛtyā tathā tathāgatena nirdeśāt uta paramārthata** iti) dbye bas khyod kyis skyon brjod pa de nyid **de ltar rigs pa 'dis** (LVP 31.11; M 180.7: yataś ca **evaṁ** svayam eva **amunā nyāyena**; **de ltar 'dis** rang nyid kyis **tshul 'dis**) ces pa la-stsogs pas rang la yod pa'i phyir ro |

§70 **dngos po'i** ^[9b1] **chos nye bar bkod pa** (LVP 31.12; M 180.8: **vastudharmopanyasta**-hetukeṣu; **dngos po'i chos** gtan tshigs su **bkod pa'i**) ni rang rgyud kyi sbyor ba byas pa'o |

1) Missing in LVP.

§71 **sgrub byed 'thad nyaṁs so** (LVP 31.12–13; M 181.1–2: sarvāṇy eva **sādhanaṁ vyāhanyante**; **sgrub par byed pa thams cad rnam par 'jig par 'gyur ro**) ces pa de nyid ji ltar ces na rgyas par bstan pa ni | **'di ltar** (LVP 31.13; M 181.3: **tadyathā**; 'di lta ste) ces pa la-stsogs pa la **don dam par ces** (LVP 31.13–14; M 181.4–5: na **paramārthataḥ** parebhyas tatpratyaeyebhya ādhyātmikāyatanajanma **paratvāt tadyathā ghaṭasya** |; **don dam par** na nang gi skye mched rnaṁs de dag gi rkyen gzhan dag las skye ba med de| **gzhan yin pa'i phyir** | dper na **bum pa** bzhin no) pa la-stsog pas rtog ge bas dngos por sgra ba'i 'dod pa dgag pa'i phyir bsbyor ba byas pa'o | **bum pa** dper byas pa ni chos mi mthun pa dper byas pa'am | bum pa las gzhan rnaṁs bu mi skye ba'o ||

§72 rgyu'i phyogs nas dgag pa'i sbyor ba byas pa ni ^[9b2] sgrub byed kyi **rkyen** (LVP 31.14–32.1; M 181.7–8: na pare paramārthena vivakṣitāś cakṣurādyādhyātmikāyatānanirvartakāḥ **pratyayā** iti pratīyante) ces pa'o | **gzhan nyid** (LVP 32.1; M 181.8: **paratvād**) ces pa don dam pa rtog ge ba **rang nyid la ma grub pa'i** phyir (LVP 32.2; M 182.1: **svata evāsiddham**) rang nyid la yang skyon de las mi grol la | yang na de nyid gsal bar byas pa ni **ji ltar yang** (LVP 32.3; M 182.2: **yathā ca**; ji ltar) ces la rigs pa 'dis (LVP 32.3; M 182.2: **_anena**) rto ge ba rang kyis **khyad par du** gyur par **tha snyad byas pa'i phyir skye ba** yod pa (LVP 32.3; M 182.3–4: **_utpannā** evādhyātmikā bhāvās tadviṣayi-**viśiṣṭavyavahāra-kāraṇāt**; **skyes pa** kho na yin te | de dag gi yul dang ldan pa'i **tha snyad khyad par can byed pa'i phyir** ro ||) dang gzhan pa rang las yang yod pa'o |

§73 de ni kun rdzob du'o zhe na de lta na phyir rgol la **ma grub pa'i** skyon (LVP 32.4; M 182.5: **asiddha**_arthatām) du 'gyur ro || **de'i yul la khyad par du** (LVP 32.3; M 182.3: **tadviṣayaviśiṣṭa**-) 'phags par tha snyad byas ^[9b3] pa ces pa 'di'i skyon spang bar 'dod pa'i phyir | **yang na mnyam par bzhag pa'i rnal 'byor pas** (LVP 32.4; M 182.7: **atha samāhitasya yoginah**; 'on te don dam par rnal 'byor pa mnyam par gzhas pa'i) ces pa la-stsogs pa dngos por smra ba'i 'dod pa'o |

§74 de nyid rto ge bas ma grub par bsgrub pa'i phyir | **'gro ba yang skye ba bkag pas bkag pa'i phyir ro** (LVP 32.6; M 183.1–2: **gater apy utpādapratīṣedhād** eva **niṣedhād**; 'gro ba yang skye ba bkag pa kho nas **bkag pa'i phyir ro**) ces paso ||

§75 skyon de nyid rto ge ba **rang kyis bkod pa'i sbyor ba la** (LVP 32.7; M 183.3: **svakṛtasādhane**) yod bar bstan pa ni | **'gro pa min pa mi 'gro ste phyin zin pa'i lam bzhin** (LVP 32.7; M 183.4: **agataṁ naiva gamyate** | **adhvatvād gatādhvavad** iti) ces pa yang don dam pa'i khyad par **rang nyid la ma grub** ^[9b4] **par bsbyar ro** (LVP 32.8; M 183.5: **adhvatvahetoḥ svato 'siddha**_arthatā **yojyā** | **rang nyid la ma grub pa'i** don nyid du **sbyar bar bya la**) |

§76 de bzhin du gzhan yang rtog ge ba'i sbyor ba ni **bsten tshungs kyi mig** (LVP 32.9; M 184.1: na paramārthataḥ **sabhāgaṁ cakṣuḥ** paśyati; don dam par **brten pa dang bcas pa'i mig** ni gzugs la lta bar mi byed de) kyis ces pa la-stsogs pa | **rang kyi ngo bo bzhin** (LVP 33.1; M 184.4: **svarūpavat**; dper na gzugs bzhin no)¹⁾ ces pa ni buñ pa'i rang bzhin dang 'sra ba'o ||

1) See de Jong 1978: 31 and Tanji 1988: 163–4, n. 278.

[LVP 33.4–6; M 185.2–6 (§§ 54–55); MacDonald 2015b: 423.13–424.3]

§77 gzhan yang **yod pa'i phyir** (LVP 33.4; M 185.2: **sattvād**) ces rto ge bas sbyor ba byas pa ni phyir rgol la ltos nas **ma nges par** bstan pa (LVP 33.4; M 185.2: **parato 'naikāntikah**) ni | **nang**

kyi skye mched rnañs sems dpa' bzhin (LVP 33.4–5; M 185.3: *caitanyavan na_adhyātmikāny āyatanāni* svata utpadyantām) ces pa dang **bum pa bzhin** (LVP 33.5; M 185.4: *ghaṭādivat; bum pa la sogs pa bzhin du*) ces pa nus pa las gsal bar skye ba'i phyir yod pa yang yin^[9b5] la skye ba yang grub pas **ma nges pa'o ces** (LVP 33.6; M 185.5: *na_naikāntikatā_iti*) brjod par bya'o |

§78 **bum pa la-stsogs pa bsgrub bya dang 'tshungs pa** (LVP 33.5–6; M 185.5: *ghaṭādīnām api sādhyasamatvāt; bum pa la sogs pa* yang **bsgrub byar mtshungs pa'i** phyir) ni | 'dir bsgrub bya dang 'tshungs pa ni ma grub pa la mi bya ste bsgrub bya bzhin du bsgrubs so zhes bya ba'i don to || lan tu **de ltar min te | de ltar ma brjod pa** (LVP 33.6; M 185.6: *na-etad evaṁ tathānabhīdhānāt; de ni de ltar ma yin te | de skad du ma smras pa'i* phyir ro) ni skye mched ces brjod kyi bum pa zhes ma brjod pas so ||

[LVP 34.1–12; M 185.7–188.3 (§ 56); MacDonald 2015b: 424.4–425.8]

§79 da ni ltag chod kyi sgo nas rto ge bas smras pa | **'o na** (LVP 34.1; M 185.7: *nanu; gal te*) ces pa la-stsogs pa la | **ji ltar** khyod kyis kho^[9b6] bo cag kyi **rjes dpag la skyon brjod pa de bzhin** khyod kyi **rjes dpag la yang skyon yod do** (cf. LVP 34.1–2; M 185.8–186.1: *yathā parakīyeṣv anumāneṣu dūṣaṇam uktam evaṁ sva_anumāneṣv api yathoktadūṣaṇaprasaṁge sati sa evāsiddhādhārāsiddhahetutvādi-doṣaḥ prāpnoti*) ce na | **smras pa** (LVP 34.4; M 186.4: *ucyate; brjod par bya ste*) **kho bo bag la rang rgyud kyi sbyor ba med** (LVP 34.4; M 186.4–5: *na vayaṁ svatantram anumānaṁ prayuñjmahe*) la bsbyor ba byed pa yang gzhan kyi 'dod pa la brten nas de nyid dgag pa tsam byed te de yang de nyid la grags pa'i **rjes dpag** de nyid kyis de nyid la gnod pa'o (cf. LVP 34.5; M 186.5–6: *parapratijñāniṣedhaphalatvād asmad anumānānām*) ||

[LVP 34.13–35.5; M 188.4–189.6 (§§ 57–58); MacDonald 2015b: 425.9–426.5]

§80 **'o na** rgol ba gnyis po gang yang rung ba cig la grags pa'i **rjes dpag kyi gnod byed**^[9b7] **yod darñ** zhe na (LVP 34.13; M 188.4–5: *kiṁ punar anyataraprasiddhenāpy anumānena_asty anumānabādhā*) | **yod te** (LVP 34.13; M 188.6: *asti*) **'jig rten pa'i** (LVP 35.1; M 188.7: *lokata; 'jig rten nyid du*) shags 'gyed pa dang 'tra'o zhes bya'o |

§81 **kha cig du rang kyi tshig kyis** (LVP 35.1; M 189.2: *kadācit svavacanenaiva*) ces pa ni rigs par sgras pas rgyal ba'añ | nor bar smras pas 'phañ par 'gyur ro | pha rol pa'i cig kyis bdag nyid la rgyal mdar 'tsam par byed mi nus ste pha rol kyi 'dod pa dang mi mthun pa khas khen pa'i phyir ro |

§82 gal te pha rol pas rang kyi 'dod pa dang mthun pa khas blangs na rgyal lo zhe na de lta na^[9b8] brtsod pa'i byed pa zhes tha snyad mi bya ste brtsod pa med pa zhes bya'o ||

§83 **de nyid kyis na kha cig kyis** ces pa phyogs snga ma'i 'dod pa **gzhan la grub pas gnod du byed du mi rung ngo ces bsarñ pa'o** (LVP 35.4–5; M 189.5–6: **ata eva** ca **kaiścid** uktañ | **na paratañ prasiddhivaśād** anumāna-**bādhā** | paraprasiddher eva nirācīkīrṣitatvād **iti** | **de nyid kyi phyir 'ga' zhiḡ gis gzhan la grags pa'i** dbang gis ni rjes su dpag pa'i **gnod pa ma yin** te | gzhan la grags pa nyid dgag par 'dod pa'i phyir ro **zhes bshad do**) || ||

[LVP 35.5–36.2; M 190.1–191.3 (§§ 59–60); MacDonald 2015b: 426.6–18]

§84 **gang yang 'di snyarñ-serñs pa** (LVP 35.5; M 190.1: **yas tu manyate**) ces pa la-stsogs pa ni **gnyi ga** la grags pas **dgag sgrub** rung bar **smra ba'o** || de ltar smra ba rnarñs **kyang** ji skad du smos pa'i 'jig rten pa'i lugs **de ltar shes par bya'o** (LVP 35.5–7; M 190.1–3: ya eva tu **ubhaya-viniścita-vādī** | sa **sādhanañ dūṣaṇañ** vā | nānyataraprasiddhasandigdhavādī | tena **api laukikīñ vyavasthām** anurudhyamānena yathokta eva nyāyo 'bhyupeyaḥ) |

§85 **de yang ji ltar** (LVP 35.8; M 190.4: **tathā hi**; 'di ltar) zhe na ^[9b9] **gnyi ka** la grags pa'i **lung** ni **gnod byed du mi rung** (LVP 35.8; M 190.4: **na_ubhaya**-prasiddhenaiva_ **āgamena** āgama-**bādhā**; **lung gis** gnod pa ni **gnyi ga** la grub pa'i lung kho na'i sgo nas **ma yin** te) la | **rang la** grags pa tsam kyis **kyang** (LVP 35.8; M 190.4–5: kintarhi **sva**-prasiddhena_ **api**) ngo || **rang don rjes dpag** gi bsod min pa **rang la** grags pas tshad mas sgrub byed du rung ste de nyid shin tu gling ba yin pa ni shin du grub pa'o (LVP 35.9; M 190.5–191.1: **svārthānumāne** tusarvatra **sva**-prasiddhir eva garīyasī) | des na de la brten nas dgag pa' yang ngo ||

§86 **de na** rang rgyud la **dgos pa med** la (LVP 36.1; M 191.1: **ata** eva tarkalakṣaṇābhīdhānañ **niṣprayojanañ**; **de** nyid kyi phyir rtog ge'i mtshan nyid brjod pa ni **dgos pa med pa yin** te) || bCom ldan 'das kyis kyang gdul bya'i **skye bo la rang la** grags pa dang mthun pa'i 'thad pas bstan pa'o bya'o (LVP 36.1–2; M 191.2–3: **yathāsvañ** prasiddhayā_ **upapattyā** Buddhais tad anabhijñāvineya-**jana**_anugrahād; Sangs rgyas rnams kyis **rang la ji ltar** grags pa'i 'thad pas de kho na mi shes pa'i gdul bya'i **skye bo la** phan btags pa'i phyir ro) || ||