



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Addressing industrial pollution in Indonesia: The nexus between regulation and redress seeking

D'Hondt, L.Y.

Citation

D'Hondt, L. Y. (2019, October 17). *Addressing industrial pollution in Indonesia: The nexus between regulation and redress seeking*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/79606>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/79606>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/79606> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: D'Hondt, L.Y.

Title: Addressing industrial pollution in Indonesia: The nexus between regulation and redress seeking

Issue Date: 2019-10-17

Addressing Industrial Pollution in Indonesia

Addressing Industrial Pollution in Indonesia

The Nexus between Regulation and
Redress Seeking

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 17 oktober 2019
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Laure Yvonne d'Hondt

geboren te Hilvarenbeek

in 1981

Promotor: prof. dr. A.W. Bedner
Co-promotor: dr. J.A.C. Vel

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. W.J.M. Voermans
prof. dr. G.A. Persoon
prof. dr. B. van Rooij (Universiteit van Amsterdam)
prof. dr. R. Uylenburg (Universiteit van Amsterdam)

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio, Delft
Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

© 2019 L.Y. d'Hondt

ISBN 978 94 028 1697 6

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the author.

Acknowledgements

Five days I sat on a boat that took me back from North Maluku to Jakarta. I was returning from my very first field work period in Indonesia. Although I was planning to write the first version of the chapter on the case during that boat trip, I was exhausted by the impressions. I barely left my cabin during those five days and I only managed to sort out my receipts. Research is demanding, and so it took longer than I had anticipated. Every step of the process, there have been people who have supported me and I owe them many thanks.

Although doing fieldwork is exhausting, nothing is more exciting than meeting people that teach you about their world. During my time in Indonesia, I met so many people who were kind, who took the time to share their views and knowledge, and who -in whatever manner- helped me to realize this research. I am grateful to all of them. First, I would like to thank NWO-WOTRO for financing this research, as well as the Dutch Embassy in Jakarta for funding the 'Making Environmental Regulation Work for the People' project (MERW). Regarding my time doing fieldwork, I want to especially thank the staff of the Provincial environmental agencies in West Java, East Java and North Maluku, as well as the staff of ECOTON. My special thanks also go to the young, open-minded, and smart research-assistants -often students from local universities- who accompanied me during various fieldwork periods. Syahril Sangaji, Tyan Dylan, Ulibasa Theresia Sitompul (Tesa), Fernando Lintong, and Handika Tjen, your practical help, critical reflections and input, as well as your companionship has been indispensable, and your enthusiasm and interest in the research was encouraging. The *VVI-gang* in Indonesia has offered me support on many different occasions. Thank you for that Herlambang Wiratraman, Rikardo Simarmata, Surya Suryadi, Myrna Safitri, Ibu Sulis, Wiwiek Awiati, Professor Sudharto, Tristam Moeliono, Gustaaf Reerink, Dyah Paramita and Tirta Parikesit. I am furthermore grateful to the staff of ICEL. Isna Fatima, Raynaldo Sembiring, Henri Subagiyo and Shafira Hexagraha, and also Bart Teeuwen, during the final years of this research trajectory, when implementing the 'Making Environmental Regulation Work for the People'-project, it was a pleasure to cooperate with you and I learned a lot from you.

In 2005, I first set foot in the Van Vollenhoven Institute. Little did I know what an impact this would have on my life, and more importantly, what a bunch of lovely and kind people are gathered there and make it a wonderful place, to work and to make friends. Kari van Weeren, Kora Bentvelsen, Jan Michiel Otto, Dennis Janssen and Jan van Olden, your kind help and guidance has enabled me to progress and made me feel secure because I knew you would back me up. Annelien Bouland, Carolien Jacobs, Laura Lancée, Willem van der Muur, Santy Kouwagam, Bruno Braak, Arshad Muradin, Bernardo Ribeiro de Almeida, Fachrizal Afandi, Feby Kartikasari, Yance Arizona, Stijn van Huis, Loes van Rooijen, Mies Grijns, Hoko Horii, Suliman Ibrahim, Roxane de Massol de Rebetz, Elizabeth Alividza, Jessica Carlisle, Mareike Boom, Erik Herber, Esther van Eijk, Kathinka Fürst, and Wouter Oude Alink, you have been wonderful colleagues and friends, with whom I shared the hustles of finding our way in academia and in life.

Adriaan, you invited me to the academic world. Your trust allowed me to explore and learn beyond anything I had ever imagined as a student, to look at the world in a socio-legal way. You taught me about Indonesia, academia and whatever other topic that came up during the past 15 years. The most important lessons were about kindness. You are an example of how to be a good person. Your positive outlook on people is inspiring as well as sometimes inimitable. Your passion for music and your love for your family has moved me on many occasions. I am grateful for the friendship that we have developed over the years.

Jacqueline, you came to the rescue when I was stuck. Your support, both academically as well as personally, gave me the practical tools and the courage to finalize this project. You even invited me to stay in your home and eat from your vegetable garden. I admire your ability to make complicated things understandable, by asking spot-on simple questions. Thank you for the new perspectives you offered and your friendship.

Gilbert, thanks for putting an arm around my shoulder and giving me the confidence to look the beast, and myself, in the eye. I also owe much gratitude to Filip Kostanecki for editing and polishing the text of this book, while being patient, flexible and thoughtful and to Anne-Marie Krens for making the lay-out of this book beautiful.

I am very thankful to my family and friends. My parents have encouraged me to explore the world, while making sure there was always a safe haven I could return to. I have no words to thank them for the support they have offered me, always and in so many ways. Thanks also to my parents-in-law, Juup and Ada, who welcomed me in their warm family and supported me, not in the least by taking loving care of Noël when I was struggling to get

this book finished. Indra, Hans, Eva, Arjoen, Heleen, Esther, Liselotte and Jacquélien, thank you for your friendship throughout the years. When I was away, you made the Netherlands the place I wanted to return to, and you welcomed me back every time. Dear Jeroen, even though you love to read thick books, I know you will never read this one. We share other interests. I am amazed about what we have discovered together so far. I am very grateful for the things you have taught me, for the true interest that you take in me, for your patience, trust and love. Noël, you funny, loud, sensitive, passionate and loving boy, you turned my life upside down, and I am happy about that.

27 May 2019

Table of contents

LIST OF MAPS, FIGURES, AND APPENDICES	XIII
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	XV
1 ANALYSING HOW POLLUTION IS ADDRESSED: INTRODUCTION, RESEARCH QUESTION AND METHODOLOGY	1
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Environmental challenges of all times	1
1.2 Industrial water pollution and other environmental problems in Indonesia	3
2 Research question and approach	4
2.1 Two angles of analysis: redress seeking and regulation	4
2.2 Exploring the nexus between regulation and redress seeking	7
2.3 Key actors	8
3 Methodology and course of research	8
3.1 Sensitivity and ethical considerations	11
4 Outline of the book	11
2 REGULATION AND REDRESS SEEKING PROCESSES: CONVERGING AIMS AND ACTORS	15
1 Regulation and public interest promotion	16
1.1 Who should regulate, and how? A brief history of changing views	16
1.2 Command and control regulation	19
1.2.1 Administrative law framework	19
1.2.2 Criminal law framework	20
1.2.3 Command and control in relation to private law	22
1.2.4 Combining administrative and criminal law; normative stands and empirical findings	22
1.3 Alternatives for command and control regulation	24
1.3.1 Flexibility in state regulations: 'Responsive regulation' and economic instruments	25
1.3.2 Civil society and citizen participation in regulation	27
1.4 State-society relations and regulation in developing countries	31
1.4.1 A brief history of state-society relations discourses and 'development'	31
1.4.2 Regulation and participation in developing countries	33

1.5	Promotion of environmental interests	34
1.5.1	Environmental regulation and citizen participation in developing countries	37
2	Redress seeking processes	38
2.1	Access to Justice discourses	39
3	Environmental regulation and redress seeking in Indonesia	42
3.1	Previous regulatory studies by Indonesian environmental agencies	44
3.2	Redress seeking and public participation in Indonesia	44
4	Analysing the nexus between regulation and redress seeking	46
3	THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORKS REGULATING ENVIRONMENTAL POLLUTION IN INDONESIA	5
1	The first environmental management acts of 1982 and 1997	52
1.1	Environmental Management Act 1982	53
1.2	Environment Management Act 1997	54
2	Decentralisation and environmental regulation	57
2.1	Regional Government Act 1999	58
2.2	Regional Government Acts of 2004 and 2014	59
3	Water legislation	61
3.1	Water Act of 1974	61
3.2	Government Regulation on Water Quality Management and Pollution Control of 2001	61
3.3	Water Act 2004	63
4	The Environmental Management Act of 2009	64
5	Problems in the current legal framework to regulate industrial water pollution	67
5.1	'Control' or 'Management'?	67
5.2	Norm-setting through planning and licensing	68
5.3	Monitoring instruments	70
5.3.1	Regular monitoring, self-monitoring and self-reporting	70
5.3.2	Complaint verification	71
5.3.3	PROPER: an 'ad hoc' Ministerial programme	72
5.4	Inconsistencies in administrative law enforcement instruments	74
5.4.1	The function and aim of administrative sanctioning	74
5.4.2	Administrative coercion and the fine	75
5.4.3	Escalation by imposing increasingly severe sanctions	76
5.5	Division of authority	78
5.5.1	Shifting authorities in transboundary cases?	79
5.5.2	Oversight, second line enforcement and complaint handling	80
5.6	Alternatives for administrative law based 'command and control' regulation	81
5.6.1	Economic instruments and the standard regulatory mechanism	81
5.6.2	Criminal law enforcement	84
5.7	The role of citizen in environmental regulation	84
6	Conclusion	87

4	PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENTAL AGENCIES IN EAST AND WEST JAVA; A PATCHWORK OF REGULATORY APPROACHES, WITH LIMITED RESULTS	91
1	Regulating industrial water pollution in East Java Province	93
1.1	A sketch of the East Java environmental agency	94
1.2	Monitoring in East Java	95
1.2.1	Regular monitoring efforts and self-monitoring reports in East Java	95
1.2.2	Water Patrol	97
1.2.3	Complaint handling in East Java	99
1.3	Following up on detected violations in East Java	100
1.3.1	Following up on regular monitoring	101
1.3.2	Following up on complaint verification	101
1.3.3	Following up on Water Patrol inspections & the case of closing a sugar factory	101
1.4	Some conclusions on regulation by the East Java agency	103
2	The West Java environmental agency	104
2.1	A sketch of the West Java environmental agency	104
2.2	Monitoring in West Java	106
2.2.1	Monitoring the general river quality, regular monitoring, and self-monitoring in West Java	106
2.2.2	PROPER inspections in West Java	108
2.2.3	Complaint verification in West Java	109
2.3	Following up on detected violations in West Java	110
2.3.1	Unclear division of enforcement authority between District, Province and Ministry	111
2.3.2	Provincial agency's units and their conflicting regulatory strategies	115
2.3.3	Following up on verified complaints; the policy	117
2.3.4	Enforcement by the Compliance subunit, in numbers	118
2.3.5	Imposing administrative sanctions	120
2.3.6	Acting as a mediator in disputes between violators and affected citizens	121
2.3.7	Criminal prosecution	123
3	Conclusion	124
5	TWO DECADES OF WHEELING AND DEALING: REGULATING POLLUTION IN RANCAEKEK, WEST JAVA	129
1	River water pollution and its causes	131
2	Two decades of regulating and seeking redress for pollution	133
2.1	The first complaints during a period of centralization (1989-1997)	134
2.2	Unused regulatory authorities by the regional governments (1999)	134
2.3	Public demand to halt noncompliant behaviour (2000)	135
2.4	A private law agreement that resembles an administrative law approach (2001-2002)	137
2.5	Administrative sanctions based on a private law agreement (2002-2003)	139

2.6	Interest groups as regulators (2004-2007)	140
2.7	Parallel regulatory approaches: Sanctioning and mediating (2007-2008)	142
2.8	Local interest groups; attacking versus defending the industry (2007-2008)	145
2.9	The regulation process 'muddles through' (2007-2012)	146
2.10	The mushrooming of interest groups (2008-2012)	154
2.11	Reflecting on two decades of regulating and redress seeking	155
3	The diffuse impact of the industries on villagers' lives	157
3.1	Farmers; 'land lords', small-holders and agricultural labourers	159
3.2	'Job brokers', NGOs and <i>preman</i>	161
3.3	Agricultural and industrial laborers	164
4	Conclusion	165
6	LOSING SIGHT OF APPROPRIATE REDRESS: MINING AND POLLUTION IN KAO-MALIFUT, NORTH MALUKU	167
1	Regulating mining and NHM's environmental impact	169
1.1	Regulating the environmental impact of NHM	170
2	Seeking opportunities to obtain redress for many grievances	173
2.1	A brief history of the Kao-Malifut area and its population	174
2.2	Mass demonstrations, but for what cause? (2003-2004)	175
2.3	Reframing grievances (2004-2009)	178
2.3.1	Labour related grievances	178
2.3.2	Environment related grievances	179
2.3.3	CSR related grievances	180
2.3.4	Bundling grievances and seeking monetary redress	182
2.3.5	Parliaments acting as intermediaries between citizens and the company	183
2.3.6	Reflecting on the reframing and bundling of grievances	184
3	The revival of indigenesness as a basis for claims	184
3.1	The Pagu in 2009	185
3.2	A revival of claims based on customary rights: compensating the Pagu or individual landowners?	186
4	Addressing environmental grievances, but no appropriate redress (2010-2012)	188
4.1	Some redress for some people	189
4.2	Reflecting on the role of an environmental NGO	191
4.3	Villagers' perspectives on pollution	194
5	Conclusion	197
7	THE NEXUS BETWEEN REGULATION AND REDRESS SEEKING	201
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	219
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	227
	APPENDIX	237
	CURRICULUM VITAE	239

List of maps, figures, and appendices

MAPS

Map 1	Rancaekek area	130
Map 2	Schematic map of Kao-Malifut area	168
Map 3	Schematic map mining site NHM	171

FIGURES

Figure 1	West Java environmental agency's organisational chart	106
Figure 2	Table of follow-up action on detected violations by West Java environmental agency's Compliance subunit	118

APPENDIX

237

Abbreviations and acronyms

AMAN	<i>Aliansi Masyarakat Adat Nusantara, Archipelago's Alliance of Indigenous Peoples</i>
ADR	Alternative Dispute Resolution
Art(t)	Article/ articles
BAPEDAL	<i>Badan Pengendalian Dampak Lingkungan, Environmental Impact Agency</i>
BAPEDALDA	<i>Badan Pengendalian Dampak Lingkungan Daerah, Regional Environmental Impact Agency</i>
BAPPENAS	<i>Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional, Indonesian National Development Planning Agency</i>
BBWS	<i>Balai Besar Wilayah Sungai, Water Board</i>
B(P)LH	<i>Badan (Pengendalian) Lingkungan Hidup, Environmental Agency</i>
B(P)LHD	<i>Badan (Pengendalian)Lingkungan Hidup Daerah, Regional Environmental Agency</i>
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
DPR	<i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat, People's Representative Council</i>
DPRD	<i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah, Regional People's Representative Council</i>
EMA	Environmental Management Act
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GR	Government Regulation
HiiL	The Hague Institute for Innovation of Law
ICEL	Indonesian Center for Environmental Law
IDLO	International Development Law Organization
ITB	<i>Institut Teknologi Bandung, Bandung Institute of Technology</i>
IPB	<i>Institut Pertanian Bogor, Bogor Agricultural University</i>
KHLS	<i>Kajian lingkungan hidup strategis, Environmental Protection and Management Plan</i>
KNPI	<i>Komite Nasional Pemuda Indonesia, National Youth Committee of Indonesia</i>
LAKIP	<i>Laporan Akuntabilitas Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah, Government Agency Performance Accountability Report</i>
LEAD	
(UNDP LEAD)	The Legal Empowerment and Assistance for the Disadvantaged project of UNDP
MERW	Making Environmental Regulation Work for the People project (IDLO project)

MoE (KLH)	Ministry of Environment, <i>Kementrian Lingkungan Hidup</i> , (before October 2014)
MoEF (KLHK)	Ministry of Environment and Forestry, <i>Kementrian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan</i> , (since October 2014)
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
NHM	Nusa Halmahera Minerals
NWO	<i>Nederlandse Organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek</i> , The Dutch Research Council
PDAM	<i>Perusahaan Daerah Air Minum</i> , Regional Drinking Water Company
PerMen LH(K)	<i>Peraturan Menteri Lingkungan Hidup (dan Kehutanan)</i> , Ministry of Environment (and Forestry) Regulation
PerMen PU	<i>Peraturan Menteri Pekerjaan Umum</i> , Ministry of Public Works Regulation
PT	<i>Perseroan Terbatas</i> , Public Limited Company
PRL	<i>Peduli Ramah Lingkungan</i> , <i>Care for the Environment</i> (Interest Group from North Halmahera, North Maluku)
PROKASIH	<i>Program Kali Bersih</i> , Clean River Programme of the Ministry of Environment
PROPER	<i>Program Penilaian Peringkat Kinerja Perusahaan</i> , Programme for Pollution Control Evaluation and Rating
REDD	Reduced Emissions from Degradation and Forest Deforestation
RGA	Regional Government Act
ROLAX	Rule of Law and Access to Justice analytical framework
RPPLH	<i>Penyusunan Rencana Perlindungan dan Pengelolaan Lingkungan Hidup</i> , Environmental Protection and Management Plan
RW/RT	<i>Rukun Warga/Rukun Tetangga</i> , Neighbourhood (Administrative unit)
SLAPP	Strategic Lawsuits against Public Participation
SOP	Standard Operational Procedure
TSS	Total Suspended Solids
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UGM	<i>Universitas Gadjah Mada</i> , Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta
VOC	<i>Vereenigde Oostindische Compagnie</i> , Dutch East India Company
WALHI	<i>Wahana Lingkungan Hidup Indonesia</i> , The Indonesian Forum for the Environment
WHO	World Health Organisation