



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Addressing industrial pollution in Indonesia: The nexus between regulation and redress seeking**

D'Hondt, L.Y.

### **Citation**

D'Hondt, L. Y. (2019, October 17). *Addressing industrial pollution in Indonesia: The nexus between regulation and redress seeking*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/79606>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/79606>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/79606> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** D'Hondt, L.Y.

**Title:** Addressing industrial pollution in Indonesia: The nexus between regulation and redress seeking

**Issue Date:** 2019-10-17

*Addressing Industrial Pollution in Indonesia*



# Addressing Industrial Pollution in Indonesia

The Nexus between Regulation and  
Redress Seeking

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op donderdag 17 oktober 2019  
klokke 11.15 uur

*door*

Laure Yvonne d'Hondt

geboren te Hilvarenbeek

in 1981

Promotor: prof. dr. A.W. Bedner

Co-promotor: dr. J.A.C. Vel

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. W.J.M. Voermans

prof. dr. G.A. Persoon

prof. dr. B. van Rooij (Universiteit van Amsterdam)

prof. dr. R. Uylenburg (Universiteit van Amsterdam)

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio, Delft

Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

© 2019 L.Y. d'Hondt

ISBN 978 94 028 1697 6

*No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the author.*

## Acknowledgements

Five days I sat on a boat that took me back from North Maluku to Jakarta. I was returning from my very first field work period in Indonesia. Although I was planning to write the first version of the chapter on the case during that boat trip, I was exhausted by the impressions. I barely left my cabin during those five days and I only managed to sort out my receipts. Research is demanding, and so it took longer than I had anticipated. Every step of the process, there have been people who have supported me and I owe them many thanks.

Although doing fieldwork is exhausting, nothing is more exciting than meeting people that teach you about their world. During my time in Indonesia, I met so many people who were kind, who took the time to share their views and knowledge, and who -in whatever manner- helped me to realize this research. I am grateful to all of them. First, I would like to thank NWO-WOTRO for financing this research, as well as the Dutch Embassy in Jakarta for funding the 'Making Environmental Regulation Work for the People' project (MERW). Regarding my time doing fieldwork, I want to especially thank the staff of the Provincial environmental agencies in West Java, East Java and North Maluku, as well as the staff of ECOTON. My special thanks also go to the young, open-minded, and smart research-assistants -often students from local universities- who accompanied me during various fieldwork periods. Syahril Sangaji, Tyan Dylan, Ulibasa Theresia Sitompul (Tesa), Fernando Lintong, and Handika Tjen, your practical help, critical reflections and input, as well as your companionship has been indispensable, and your enthusiasm and interest in the research was encouraging. The *VVI-gang* in Indonesia has offered me support on many different occasions. Thank you for that Herlambang Wiratraman, Rikardo Simarmata, Surya Suryadi, Myrna Safitri, Ibu Sulis, Wiwiek Awiati, Professor Sudharto, Tristam Moeliono, Gustaaf Reerink, Dyah Paramita and Tirta Parikesit. I am furthermore grateful to the staff of ICEL. Isna Fatima, Raynaldo Sembiring, Henri Subagiyo and Shafira Hexagraha, and also Bart Teeuwen, during the final years of this research trajectory, when implementing the 'Making Environmental Regulation Work for the People'-project, it was a pleasure to cooperate with you and I learned a lot from you.

In 2005, I first set foot in the Van Vollenhoven Institute. Little did I know what an impact this would have on my life, and more importantly, what a bunch of lovely and kind people are gathered there and make it a wonderful place, to work and to make friends. Kari van Weeren, Kora Bentvelsen, Jan Michiel Otto, Dennis Janssen and Jan van Olden, your kind help and guidance has enabled me to progress and made me feel secure because I knew you would back me up. Annelien Bouland, Carolien Jacobs, Laura Lancée, Willem van der Muur, Santy Kouwagam, Bruno Braak, Arshad Muradin, Bernardo Ribeiro de Almeida, Fachrizal Afandi, Feby Kartikasari, Yance Arizona, Stijn van Huis, Loes van Rooijen, Mies Grijns, Hoko Horii, Suliman Ibrahim, Roxane de Massol de Rebetz, Elizabeth Alividza, Jessica Carlisle, Mareike Boom, Erik Herber, Esther van Eijk, Kathinka Fürst, and Wouter Oude Alink, you have been wonderful colleagues and friends, with whom I shared the hustles of finding our way in academia and in life.

Adriaan, you invited me to the academic world. Your trust allowed me to explore and learn beyond anything I had ever imagined as a student, to look at the world in a socio-legal way. You taught me about Indonesia, academia and whatever other topic that came up during the past 15 years. The most important lessons were about kindness. You are an example of how to be a good person. Your positive outlook on people is inspiring as well as sometimes inimitable. Your passion for music and your love for your family has moved me on many occasions. I am grateful for the friendship that we have developed over the years.

Jacqueline, you came to the rescue when I was stuck. Your support, both academically as well as personally, gave me the practical tools and the courage to finalize this project. You even invited me to stay in your home and eat from your vegetable garden. I admire your ability to make complicated things understandable, by asking spot-on simple questions. Thank you for the new perspectives you offered and your friendship.

Gilbert, thanks for putting an arm around my shoulder and giving me the confidence to look the beast, and myself, in the eye. I also owe much gratitude to Filip Kostanecki for editing and polishing the text of this book, while being patient, flexible and thoughtful and to Anne-Marie Krens for making the lay-out of this book beautiful.

I am very thankful to my family and friends. My parents have encouraged me to explore the world, while making sure there was always a safe haven I could return to. I have no words to thank them for the support they have offered me, always and in so many ways. Thanks also to my parents-in-law, Juup and Ada, who welcomed me in their warm family and supported me, not in the least by taking loving care of Noël when I was struggling to get



this book finished. Indra, Hans, Eva, Arjoen, Heleen, Esther, Liselotte and Jacquélien, thank you for your friendship throughout the years. When I was away, you made the Netherlands the place I wanted to return to, and you welcomed me back every time. Dear Jeroen, even though you love to read thick books, I know you will never read this one. We share other interests. I am amazed about what we have discovered together so far. I am very grateful for the things you have taught me, for the true interest that you take in me, for your patience, trust and love. Noël, you funny, loud, sensitive, passionate and loving boy, you turned my life upside down, and I am happy about that.

27 May 2019



## Table of contents

|                                                                                          |      |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| LIST OF MAPS, FIGURES, AND APPENDICES                                                    | XIII |
| ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS                                                               | XV   |
| 1 ANALYSING HOW POLLUTION IS ADDRESSED: INTRODUCTION, RESEARCH QUESTION AND METHODOLOGY  | 1    |
| 1 Introduction                                                                           | 1    |
| 1.1 Environmental challenges of all times                                                | 1    |
| 1.2 Industrial water pollution and other environmental problems in Indonesia             | 3    |
| 2 Research question and approach                                                         | 4    |
| 2.1 Two angles of analysis: redress seeking and regulation                               | 4    |
| 2.2 Exploring the nexus between regulation and redress seeking                           | 7    |
| 2.3 Key actors                                                                           | 8    |
| 3 Methodology and course of research                                                     | 8    |
| 3.1 Sensitivity and ethical considerations                                               | 11   |
| 4 Outline of the book                                                                    | 11   |
| 2 REGULATION AND REDRESS SEEKING PROCESSES: CONVERGING AIMS AND ACTORS                   | 15   |
| 1 Regulation and public interest promotion                                               | 16   |
| 1.1 Who should regulate, and how? A brief history of changing views                      | 16   |
| 1.2 Command and control regulation                                                       | 19   |
| 1.2.1 Administrative law framework                                                       | 19   |
| 1.2.2 Criminal law framework                                                             | 20   |
| 1.2.3 Command and control in relation to private law                                     | 22   |
| 1.2.4 Combining administrative and criminal law; normative stands and empirical findings | 22   |
| 1.3 Alternatives for command and control regulation                                      | 24   |
| 1.3.1 Flexibility in state regulations: 'Responsive regulation' and economic instruments | 25   |
| 1.3.2 Civil society and citizen participation in regulation                              | 27   |
| 1.4 State-society relations and regulation in developing countries                       | 31   |
| 1.4.1 A brief history of state-society relations discourses and 'development'            | 31   |
| 1.4.2 Regulation and participation in developing countries                               | 33   |

|       |                                                                                                           |    |
|-------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1.5   | Promotion of environmental interests                                                                      | 34 |
| 1.5.1 | Environmental regulation and citizen participation in developing countries                                | 37 |
| 2     | Redress seeking processes                                                                                 | 38 |
| 2.1   | Access to Justice discourses                                                                              | 39 |
| 3     | Environmental regulation and redress seeking in Indonesia                                                 | 42 |
| 3.1   | Previous regulatory studies by Indonesian environmental agencies                                          | 44 |
| 3.2   | Redress seeking and public participation in Indonesia                                                     | 44 |
| 4     | Analysing the nexus between regulation and redress seeking                                                | 46 |
| 3     | THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORKS REGULATING ENVIRONMENTAL POLLUTION IN INDONESIA | 5  |
| 1     | The first environmental management acts of 1982 and 1997                                                  | 52 |
| 1.1   | Environmental Management Act 1982                                                                         | 53 |
| 1.2   | Environment Management Act 1997                                                                           | 54 |
| 2     | Decentralisation and environmental regulation                                                             | 57 |
| 2.1   | Regional Government Act 1999                                                                              | 58 |
| 2.2   | Regional Government Acts of 2004 and 2014                                                                 | 59 |
| 3     | Water legislation                                                                                         | 61 |
| 3.1   | Water Act of 1974                                                                                         | 61 |
| 3.2   | Government Regulation on Water Quality Management and Pollution Control of 2001                           | 61 |
| 3.3   | Water Act 2004                                                                                            | 63 |
| 4     | The Environmental Management Act of 2009                                                                  | 64 |
| 5     | Problems in the current legal framework to regulate industrial water pollution                            | 67 |
| 5.1   | 'Control' or 'Management'?                                                                                | 67 |
| 5.2   | Norm-setting through planning and licensing                                                               | 68 |
| 5.3   | Monitoring instruments                                                                                    | 70 |
| 5.3.1 | Regular monitoring, self-monitoring and self-reporting                                                    | 70 |
| 5.3.2 | Complaint verification                                                                                    | 71 |
| 5.3.3 | PROPER: an 'ad hoc' Ministerial programme                                                                 | 72 |
| 5.4   | Inconsistencies in administrative law enforcement instruments                                             | 74 |
| 5.4.1 | The function and aim of administrative sanctioning                                                        | 74 |
| 5.4.2 | Administrative coercion and the fine                                                                      | 75 |
| 5.4.3 | Escalation by imposing increasingly severe sanctions                                                      | 76 |
| 5.5   | Division of authority                                                                                     | 78 |
| 5.5.1 | Shifting authorities in transboundary cases?                                                              | 79 |
| 5.5.2 | Oversight, second line enforcement and complaint handling                                                 | 80 |
| 5.6   | Alternatives for administrative law based 'command and control' regulation                                | 81 |
| 5.6.1 | Economic instruments and the standard regulatory mechanism                                                | 81 |
| 5.6.2 | Criminal law enforcement                                                                                  | 84 |
| 5.7   | The role of citizen in environmental regulation                                                           | 84 |
| 6     | Conclusion                                                                                                | 87 |

|       |                                                                                                                        |     |
|-------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 4     | PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENTAL AGENCIES IN EAST AND WEST JAVA;<br>A PATCHWORK OF REGULATORY APPROACHES, WITH LIMITED RESULTS | 91  |
| 1     | Regulating industrial water pollution in East Java Province                                                            | 93  |
| 1.1   | A sketch of the East Java environmental agency                                                                         | 94  |
| 1.2   | Monitoring in East Java                                                                                                | 95  |
| 1.2.1 | Regular monitoring efforts and self-monitoring reports in<br>East Java                                                 | 95  |
| 1.2.2 | Water Patrol                                                                                                           | 97  |
| 1.2.3 | Complaint handling in East Java                                                                                        | 99  |
| 1.3   | Following up on detected violations in East Java                                                                       | 100 |
| 1.3.1 | Following up on regular monitoring                                                                                     | 101 |
| 1.3.2 | Following up on complaint verification                                                                                 | 101 |
| 1.3.3 | Following up on Water Patrol inspections & the case of closing<br>a sugar factory                                      | 101 |
| 1.4   | Some conclusions on regulation by the East Java agency                                                                 | 103 |
| 2     | The West Java environmental agency                                                                                     | 104 |
| 2.1   | A sketch of the West Java environmental agency                                                                         | 104 |
| 2.2   | Monitoring in West Java                                                                                                | 106 |
| 2.2.1 | Monitoring the general river quality, regular monitoring, and<br>self-monitoring in West Java                          | 106 |
| 2.2.2 | PROPER inspections in West Java                                                                                        | 108 |
| 2.2.3 | Complaint verification in West Java                                                                                    | 109 |
| 2.3   | Following up on detected violations in West Java                                                                       | 110 |
| 2.3.1 | Unclear division of enforcement authority between District,<br>Province and Ministry                                   | 111 |
| 2.3.2 | Provincial agency's units and their conflicting regulatory<br>strategies                                               | 115 |
| 2.3.3 | Following up on verified complaints; the policy                                                                        | 117 |
| 2.3.4 | Enforcement by the Compliance subunit, in numbers                                                                      | 118 |
| 2.3.5 | Imposing administrative sanctions                                                                                      | 120 |
| 2.3.6 | Acting as a mediator in disputes between violators and<br>affected citizens                                            | 121 |
| 2.3.7 | Criminal prosecution                                                                                                   | 123 |
| 3     | Conclusion                                                                                                             | 124 |
| 5     | TWO DECADES OF WHEELING AND DEALING: REGULATING POLLUTION IN<br>RANCAEKEK, WEST JAVA                                   | 129 |
| 1     | River water pollution and its causes                                                                                   | 131 |
| 2     | Two decades of regulating and seeking redress for pollution                                                            | 133 |
| 2.1   | The first complaints during a period of centralization (1989-1997)                                                     | 134 |
| 2.2   | Unused regulatory authorities by the regional governments (1999)                                                       | 134 |
| 2.3   | Public demand to halt noncompliant behaviour (2000)                                                                    | 135 |
| 2.4   | A private law agreement that resembles an administrative law<br>approach (2001-2002)                                   | 137 |
| 2.5   | Administrative sanctions based on a private law agreement<br>(2002-2003)                                               | 139 |

|       |                                                                                                |     |
|-------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 2.6   | Interest groups as regulators (2004-2007)                                                      | 140 |
| 2.7   | Parallel regulatory approaches: Sanctioning and mediating (2007-2008)                          | 142 |
| 2.8   | Local interest groups; attacking versus defending the industry (2007-2008)                     | 145 |
| 2.9   | The regulation process 'muddles through' (2007-2012)                                           | 146 |
| 2.10  | The mushrooming of interest groups (2008-2012)                                                 | 154 |
| 2.11  | Reflecting on two decades of regulating and redress seeking                                    | 155 |
| 3     | The diffuse impact of the industries on villagers' lives                                       | 157 |
| 3.1   | Farmers; 'land lords', small-holders and agricultural labourers                                | 159 |
| 3.2   | 'Job brokers', NGOs and <i>preman</i>                                                          | 161 |
| 3.3   | Agricultural and industrial laborers                                                           | 164 |
| 4     | Conclusion                                                                                     | 165 |
| 6     | LOSING SIGHT OF APPROPRIATE REDRESS: MINING AND POLLUTION IN KAO-MALIFUT, NORTH MALUKU         | 167 |
| 1     | Regulating mining and NHM's environmental impact                                               | 169 |
| 1.1   | Regulating the environmental impact of NHM                                                     | 170 |
| 2     | Seeking opportunities to obtain redress for many grievances                                    | 173 |
| 2.1   | A brief history of the Kao-Malifut area and its population                                     | 174 |
| 2.2   | Mass demonstrations, but for what cause? (2003-2004)                                           | 175 |
| 2.3   | Reframing grievances (2004-2009)                                                               | 178 |
| 2.3.1 | Labour related grievances                                                                      | 178 |
| 2.3.2 | Environment related grievances                                                                 | 179 |
| 2.3.3 | CSR related grievances                                                                         | 180 |
| 2.3.4 | Bundling grievances and seeking monetary redress                                               | 182 |
| 2.3.5 | Parliaments acting as intermediaries between citizens and the company                          | 183 |
| 2.3.6 | Reflecting on the reframing and bundling of grievances                                         | 184 |
| 3     | The revival of indigeneness as a basis for claims                                              | 184 |
| 3.1   | The Pagu in 2009                                                                               | 185 |
| 3.2   | A revival of claims based on customary rights: compensating the Pagu or individual landowners? | 186 |
| 4     | Addressing environmental grievances, but no appropriate redress (2010-2012)                    | 188 |
| 4.1   | Some redress for some people                                                                   | 189 |
| 4.2   | Reflecting on the role of an environmental NGO                                                 | 191 |
| 4.3   | Villagers' perspectives on pollution                                                           | 194 |
| 5     | Conclusion                                                                                     | 197 |
| 7     | THE NEXUS BETWEEN REGULATION AND REDRESS SEEKING                                               | 201 |
|       | SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)                                                                   | 219 |
|       | BIBLIOGRAPHY                                                                                   | 227 |
|       | APPENDIX                                                                                       | 237 |
|       | CURRICULUM VITAE                                                                               | 239 |

## List of maps, figures, and appendices

### MAPS

|       |                                   |     |
|-------|-----------------------------------|-----|
| Map 1 | Rancaekek area                    | 130 |
| Map 2 | Schematic map of Kao-Malifut area | 168 |
| Map 3 | Schematic map mining site NHM     | 171 |

### FIGURES

|          |                                                                                                         |     |
|----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Figure 1 | West Java environmental agency's organisational chart                                                   | 106 |
| Figure 2 | Table of follow-up action on detected violations by West Java environmental agency's Compliance subunit | 118 |

|          |  |     |
|----------|--|-----|
| APPENDIX |  | 237 |
|----------|--|-----|





## Abbreviations and acronyms

|             |                                                                                                                |
|-------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| AMAN        | <i>Aliansi Masyarakat Adat Nusantara</i> , Archipelago's Alliance of Indigenous Peoples                        |
| ADR         | Alternative Dispute Resolution                                                                                 |
| Art(t)      | Article/ articles                                                                                              |
| BAPEDAL     | <i>Badan Pengendalian Dampak Lingkungan</i> , Environmental Impact Agency                                      |
| BAPEDALDA   | <i>Badan Pengendalian Dampak Lingkungan Daerah</i> , Regional Environmental Impact Agency                      |
| BAPPENAS    | <i>Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional</i> , Indonesian National Development Planning Agency                |
| BBWS        | <i>Balai Besar Wilayah Sungai</i> , Water Board                                                                |
| B(P)LH      | <i>Badan (Pengendalian) Lingkungan Hidup</i> , Environmental Agency                                            |
| B(P)LHD     | <i>Badan (Pengendalian)Lingkungan Hidup Daerah</i> , Regional Environmental Agency                             |
| CSR         | Corporate Social Responsibility                                                                                |
| DPR         | <i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat</i> , People's Representative Council                                               |
| DPRD        | <i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah</i> , Regional People's Representative Council                               |
| EMA         | Environmental Management Act                                                                                   |
| EIA         | Environmental Impact Assessment                                                                                |
| FGD         | Focus Group Discussion                                                                                         |
| GR          | Government Regulation                                                                                          |
| HiiL        | The Hague Institute for Innovation of Law                                                                      |
| ICEL        | Indonesian Center for Environmental Law                                                                        |
| IDLO        | International Development Law Organization                                                                     |
| ITB         | <i>Institut Teknologi Bandung</i> , Bandung Institute of Technology                                            |
| IPB         | <i>Institut Pertanian Bogor</i> , Bogor Agricultural University                                                |
| KHLS        | <i>Kajian lingkungan hidup strategis</i> , Environmental Protection and Management Plan                        |
| KNPI        | <i>Komite Nasional Pemuda Indonesia</i> , National Youth Committee of Indonesia                                |
| LAKIP       | <i>Laporan Akuntabilitas Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah</i> , Government Agency Performance Accountability Report |
| LEAD        |                                                                                                                |
| (UNDP LEAD) | The Legal Empowerment and Assistance for the Disadvantaged project of UNDP                                     |
| MERW        | Making Environmental Regulation Work for the People project (IDLO project)                                     |

|              |                                                                                                                        |
|--------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| MoE (KLH)    | Ministry of Environment, <i>Kementrian Lingkungan Hidup</i> , (before October 2014)                                    |
| MoEF (KLHK)  | Ministry of Environment and Forestry, <i>Kementrian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan</i> , (since October 2014)          |
| NGO          | Non-governmental organisation                                                                                          |
| NHM          | Nusa Halmahera Minerals                                                                                                |
| NWO          | <i>Nederlandse Organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek</i> , The Dutch Research Council                            |
| PDAM         | <i>Perusahaan Daerah Air Minum</i> , Regional Drinking Water Company                                                   |
| PerMen LH(K) | <i>Peraturan Menteri Lingkungan Hidup (dan Kehutanan)</i> , Ministry of Environment (and Forestry) Regulation          |
| PerMen PU    | <i>Peraturan Menteri Pekerjaan Umum</i> , Ministry of Public Works Regulation                                          |
| PT           | <i>Perseroan Terbatas</i> , Public Limited Company                                                                     |
| PRL          | <i>Peduli Ramah Lingkungan</i> , Care for the Environment (Interest Group from North Halmahera, North Maluku)          |
| PROKASIH     | <i>Program Kali Bersih</i> , Clean River Programme of the Ministry of Environment                                      |
| PROPER       | <i>Program Penilaian Peringkat Kinerja Perusahaan</i> , Programme for Pollution Control Evaluation and Rating          |
| REDD         | Reduced Emissions from Degradation and Forest Deforestation                                                            |
| RGA          | Regional Government Act                                                                                                |
| ROLAX        | Rule of Law and Access to Justice analytical framework                                                                 |
| RPPLH        | <i>Penyusunan Rencana Perlindungan dan Pengelolaan Lingkungan Hidup</i> , Environmental Protection and Management Plan |
| RW/RT        | <i>Rukun Warga/Rukun Tetangga</i> , Neighbourhood (Administrative unit)                                                |
| SLAPP        | Strategic Lawsuits against Public Participation                                                                        |
| SOP          | Standard Operational Procedure                                                                                         |
| TSS          | Total Suspended Solids                                                                                                 |
| UNDP         | United Nations Development Programme                                                                                   |
| UNICEF       | United Nations Children's Fund                                                                                         |
| UGM          | <i>Universitas Gadjah Mada</i> , Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta                                                    |
| VOC          | <i>Vereenigde Oostindische Compagnie</i> , Dutch East India Company                                                    |
| WALHI        | <i>Wahana Lingkungan Hidup Indonesia</i> , The Indonesian Forum for the Environment                                    |
| WHO          | World Health Organisation                                                                                              |