



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

On the emergence of the energy transition

Kraan, O.D.E.

Citation

Kraan, O. D. E. (2019, April 25). *On the emergence of the energy transition*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/71807>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Leiden University Non-exclusive license](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/71807>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The following handle holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation:

<http://hdl.handle.net/1887/71807>

Author: Kraan, O.D.E.

Title: On the emergence of the energy transition

Issue Date: 2019-04-25

On the Emergence of the Energy Transition

Oscar Kraan

On the Emergence of the Energy Transition

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 25 april 2019
klokke 16:15 uur

door

Oscar Dirk-Jan Eduard Kraan

geboren te 's-Gravenhage
in 1985

Promotores:

Prof. dr. G. J. Kramer

Utrecht University

Dr. ir. I. Nikolic

Delft University of Technology

Copromotor:

Dr. V. Koning

Utrecht University

Promotiecommissie:

Prof. dr. P. M. van Bodegom

Leiden University

Prof. dr. A. Tukker

Leiden University

Dr. R. Kleijn

Leiden University

Prof. dr. ir. P. Herder

Delft University of Technology

Prof. dr. B. de Vries

Utrecht University

Dr. E. M. Fumagalli

Utrecht University

This research has been funded by Royal Dutch Shell and has been carried out in collaboration with Leiden University, Utrecht University and Delft University of Technology.

Copyright © 2019 by O.D.E. Kraan

All rights reserved. No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilised in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the author. A digital version of this dissertation is available at <https://openaccess.leidenuniv.nl/>

Cover: Designed by Bright Brands

Produced with L^AT_EX

ISBN: 978-94-028-1299-2

Contents

List of Figures	ix
List of Tables	xi
List of Abbreviations	xiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Climate change and the energy transition	3
1.2 The main research question	5
1.3 Research approach	8
1.4 Relevance	13
1.5 Aim and outline	14
2 Intellectual framing of the energy transition	19
2.1 The pace and the path of the energy transition	21
2.2 Economic decision making	22
2.3 What's on the agent's mind?	32
2.4 Critical transitions	35
2.5 Dealing with uncertainty and high-impact	37
3 The Energy Transition: A reliance on technology alone ultimately leads to a bet on Solar Fuels	41
3.1 The choice at the heart of the energy transition	43
3.2 Current and future energy demand	44
3.3 Renewable electricity and electrification: immediate push to inevitable limits	45
3.4 The orthodox energy transition for fuels: efficiency, bio-energy and offsets	46
3.5 The technology leap: what one needs to believe for solar fuels	47
3.6 Conclusion	50

4	The influence of the energy transition on the significance of key energy metrics	53
4.1	Introduction	55
4.2	The use of Total Primary Energy	58
4.3	The use of Electricity Generation Capacity	67
4.4	Reflection on findings and consequences for policy design	69
4.5	Conclusion	70
5	Jumping to a better world: An agent-based exploration of criticality in low-carbon energy transitions	73
5.1	Introduction	75
5.2	Critical transitions	77
5.3	Methods	81
5.4	Experiments & results	85
5.5	Reflection on model results	88
5.6	Reflection on modelling approach	90
5.7	Conclusion	94
6	Investment in the future electricity system - An agent-based modelling approach	97
6.1	Introduction	99
6.2	Investment decisions in an evolving electricity system	101
6.3	Conceptualisation	104
6.4	Experimental setup and results	109
6.5	Validation and discussion on model results	117
6.6	Conclusion	121
7	Why fully liberalised electricity markets will fail to meet deep decarbonisation targets even with strong carbon pricing	125
7.1	Introduction	127
7.2	Background	129
7.3	Methodology	131
7.4	Experimental setup and hypotheses	138
7.5	Results	143
7.6	Discussion	149
7.7	Conclusions and policy implications	151
8	Conclusions, Recommendations & Reflection	155
8.1	Research context, focus and approach	157
8.2	Conclusions	159
8.3	Recommendations for policy makers	162
8.4	Recommendations for business decision makers	164
8.5	Reflection	165

9 Samenvatting	171
Acknowledgements	189
About the author	191
Publications	193
Bibliography	195

List of Figures

1.1	A simple formula that summarises the challenge of mitigate climate change	4
1.2	World energy-related CO ₂ -emissions	7
2.1	Three systems	22
2.2	A perspective on the energy transition	24
2.3	Types of goods	25
2.4	The tragedy of the commons	25
2.5	A prisoner's dilemma	26
2.6	Climate and welfare sensitivity	30
2.7	Policy perspective matrix	31
2.8	The concept of critical transitions	36
2.9	A diagram differentiating applied science, professional consultancy and post-normal science	38
3.1	A paradigm for the two dimensions of progress in the energy transition	43
3.2	The five principal elements of solar fuels production	48
3.3	Outline costs for solar fuels production	49
4.1	Primary energy metrics and efficiency indicators	58
4.2	Primary energy sources	59
4.3	Total primary energy of Shell's Sky scenario under different accounting methods	62
4.4	Total Primary Energy by selected country by accounting method	62
4.5	Energy Intensity by selected country by accounting method	66
4.6	Relationship between investments, capacity factors and actual production.	68
5.1	The catastrophe fold	78

5.2	Model structure	85
5.3	Results of the ACT model	86
5.4	Summary of results and comparison with the Shell Scenarios	90
5.5	Learning by analogy	93
6.1	Model description	105
6.2	Decision-making process of investors.	106
6.3	Relationship between scarcity rent and excess capacity factor	108
6.4	Electricity production in percentage by resource with two carbon price scenarios	111
6.5	Comparison between current study and two other scenario studies	114
6.6	The effect of heterogeneity of investors on the electricity mix	115
6.7	Electricity mix with varying power generation from renewable generation	116
6.8	Three scenarios for the cost development of a renewable power generation asset	117
6.9	Electricity mix by source with varying technology learning curves	117
6.10	The average discount rate of investors over time	118
7.1	Scarcity rent	133
7.2	Floor price	134
7.3	Scarcity rent and floor price development with increasing shares of renewable power production	136
7.4	Experiment-tree	140
7.5	Carbon price scenario	143
7.6	Results from experiments	145
7.7	Ideal energy - only market	146
7.8	Realistic energy-only market	146
7.9	Realistic market with CRM	147
7.10	Sensitivity to carbon price scenarios	149

List of Tables

1.1	Research questions by chapter	15
4.1	Production efficiencies of non-combustible energy sources	61
4.2	Average capacity factors of renewable generators	68
4.3	Qualitative assessment of the effect of policy targets set in TPE or related indicators	70
4.4	Qualitative assessment of the effect of policy targets set in EGC	70
5.1	The relationship between the energy transition and elements with which ACT was extended	83
5.2	Application of mean-field model to the energy transition in ACT.	83
5.3	Experimental design	86
5.4	Comparison between mean-field experiment and subsequent ex- perimental results	87
6.1	Variables of parameters at initialisation	110
6.2	Comparison of scenarios of the Dutch Electricity system	113
7.1	Values of variables of parameters at initialisation	144
8.1	Research questions by chapter	158
9.1	Onderzoeksvragen per hoofdstuk	174

List of abbreviations

GHG	GreenHouse Gas
ABM	Agent-Based Modelling
BC	Base Case
BECCS	Bio-Energy Carbon Capture and Sequestration
CRM	Capacity Remuneration Mechanism
CCS	Carbon Capture and Sequestration
CPR	Common Pool Resource
CAS	Complex Adaptive System
CSP	Concentrated Solar Power
DAC	Direct Air Capture
DEM	Direct Equivalent Method
EGC	Electricity Generation Capacity
EE	Energy Efficiency
EI	Energy Intensity
ES	Energy Service
GHG	GreenHouse Gas
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IEM	Incident Energy Method
KISS	Keep it Descriptive S.
KIDS	Keep it Simple S.
KPI	Key Performance Indicators
LtG	Limits to Growth
MFA	Mean-Field approach
NDC	National Determined Contributions
NPV	Net Present Value
OPEC	OPERating EXPenses
ODD	Overview, Design concepts, and Details
PSM	Partial Substitution Method
PV	PhotoVoltaic
PECM	Physical Energy Content Method
PNS	Post-Normal Science
SRMC	Short Run Marginal Costs
TFC	Total Final Consumption
TPE	Total Primary Energy
VOLL	Value Of Lost Load

