



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The Manichaeans of Kellis : religion, community, and everyday life
Brand, M.

Citation

Brand, M. (2019, April 10). *The Manichaeans of Kellis : religion, community, and everyday life*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/71236>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Leiden University Non-exclusive license](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/71236>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/71236> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Brand, M.

Title: The Manichaeans of Kellis : religion, community, and everyday life

Issue Date: 2019-04-10

The Manichaeans of Kellis: Religion, Community, and Everyday Life

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus Prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 10 april 2019 klokke 11.15 uur

door

Mattias Brand
Geboren te Dordrecht in 1986

Promotores

prof. dr. A.F. de Jong
prof. dr. J. van der Vliet

Promotiecommissie

prof. dr. O.E. Kaper
prof. dr. J.K. Zangenberg
prof. dr. I. Gardner (University of Sydney)
prof. dr. H.L. Murre-van den Berg (Radboud University)
prof. dr. S.G. Richter (Universität Münster)

Table of Contents

Table of Contents.....	3
List of Figures.....	7
List of Tables	8
Acknowledgements.....	9
Abbreviations and Translations	11
Chapter 1. Introduction	13
1.1 Introduction.....	13
1.2 Aims, Method, and Directions.....	15
1.3 Manichaeism in Late Antiquity	17
1.4 The Appeal of Mani’s Church.....	28
1.5 Caveat on the Nature of the Sources	34
1.6 Scope and Limitations of This Study	36
Part I.	
Approaching Religion in Everyday Life	41
Chapter 2. Everyday Groupness: Theoretical Perspectives on Religious Groups and Everyday Life	43
2.1 Introduction.....	43
2.2 Everyday Life	43
2.2.1 The Quotidian Turn: Toward Everyday Life.....	44
2.2.2 Challenging Groupism	48
2.3 Individuals and Their Agency.....	52
2.4 Religion	57
2.4.1 Toward a Definition of Religion, before “Religion”	58
2.4.2 The Transformation of Religion: Dis-/reembedding Religion in Novel Social Formations.....	61
2.4.3 Disembedded Religion Reembedded: The Christianization of Egypt.....	67
2.5 Manichaeaness in Four Related Categories of Action	70
Chapter 3. Dakhleh’s Wealth: The Socioeconomic Context of Ancient Kellis	73
3.1 Introduction.....	73
3.2. Kellis in the Dakhleh Oasis	73
3.3 Roman Period Housing	81
3.3.1 Houses 1–3 and the North Building.....	82
3.3.2 Houses 4 and 5	91
3.3.3 Other Residential Units from the Roman Period	92
3.4 Cultural-Religious Repertoires	96
3.4.1 Traditional Egyptian Religion	97
3.4.2 Classical Traditions from the Greek and Roman World.....	102
3.4.3 Celestial Power, Amulets, and Spells	104
3.4.4 Christian Institutions and Repertoire	111

3.4.5 Funerary Traditions: The West and East Cemeteries	118
3.5 Conclusions	121
Part II.	
Individuals, Practices, and the Formation of a Local Community	123
Chapter 4. Makarios’s Family and Pamour’s Letters: Manichaean Affiliations and Village Relations in Kellis	
4.1 Introduction.....	125
4.2 Makarios and Maria	126
4.3 Pamour and Maria.....	131
4.4 Performing personal letters.....	138
4.5 Indications of Manichaeanness.....	140
4.5.1 Traveling with the Teacher	140
4.5.2 Manichaean Prayer Formulas	145
4.5.3 Book Writing	152
4.6 Manichaeans and the Roman Administration.....	154
4.6.1 Direct Connections to the Military and Administrative Elite	155
4.6.2 The Patronage of a Former Strategos?.....	157
4.6.3 Religious Persecution or Maltreatment	159
4.7 Conclusions	162
Chapter 5. Orion’s Language: Manichaean Self-Designation in the Kellis Papyri.....	
5.1 Introduction.....	165
5.2 Self-Designation in Documentary Papyri	166
5.2.1 Kinship Language and Ethnic Reasoning	169
5.2.2 Catechumens and Elect.....	175
5.2.3 Those Who Give You Rest.....	177
5.2.4 Metaphors of Belonging	178
5.2.5 Ascribed Virtues	179
5.2.6 Religious and Institutional Titles	180
5.2.7 Collectives: Those of the Household, Neighborhood, or “People”	181
5.2.8 Summary.....	183
5.3 Excuse: Did Manichaeans Call Themselves Christians?	184
5.4 Coptic as a Community-Specific Language.....	186
5.4.1 Coptic Language Variation	187
5.4.2 Code-switching Greek and Coptic.....	190
5.5 Conclusions	192
Chapter 6. Tehat’s Gifts and Everyday Community Boundaries.....	
6.1 Introduction.....	195
6.2 Almsgiving and Voluntary Poverty within the Manichaean Ideology of Giving.....	196
6.3 Five Types of Giving in the Kellis Letters	204
6.3.1 Gifts to the Elect.....	205
6.3.2 Economic Interaction	208
6.3.3 Household-Support Structures.....	210
6.3.4 Charity to Non-elect.....	213

6.3.5 Patronage	215
6.4 Local Characteristics: Geographical Distance and the Absence of the Elect.....	217
6.5 The Agape, a Manichaean Ritual Meal?.....	219
6.6 Conclusions	226
Chapter 7. The Deacon’s Practice: Manichaean Gatherings and Psalms.....	229
7.1 Introduction.....	229
7.2 Communal Gatherings	231
7.2.1 Incidental Communal Gatherings.....	231
7.2.2 Daily Communal Gatherings.....	232
7.2.3 Weekly Communal Gatherings	234
7.2.4 Annual Communal Gatherings	237
7.3 Did Makarios go to Church? On the Location of Manichaean Gatherings.....	241
7.4 A Manichaean Monastery in the Oasis?.....	243
7.5 Teaching and Emotional Arousal through Music, Song, and Prayer	246
7.5.1 Manichaean Psalms	246
7.5.2 The Daily Prayers	250
7.5.3 Mechanisms Contributing to Groupness	253
7.6 Conclusions	260
Chapter 8. Matthaïos’s Grief: Manichaean Death Rituals in an Egyptian Context.....	263
8.1 Introduction.....	263
8.2 Death and the Deceased in Documentary Papyri.....	264
8.3 Songs and Prayers for the Deceased	270
8.4 Cosmological Salvation and Individual Eschatology.....	278
8.4.1 Excuse: Manichaean Grief.....	282
8.5 Burial practices and Material Culture	283
8.5.1 Early Egyptian Christianity and Changing Funerary Patterns.....	284
8.5.2 Invisible Manichaean Burials: Following Local Customs.....	287
8.6 Conclusions	291
Chapter 9. Ision’s Books: Scribal Culture and Manichaean Texts	293
9.1. Introduction.....	293
9.2 Book Production in Papyrus Letters.....	295
9.3 Local Reading Practices	300
9.3.1 On the Bookshelves	301
9.3.2 The Syriac Connection	309
9.3.3 Materiality: The Use of the Codex and Wooden Tablets	312
9.4 Scribal Activity and Ritual Practice	315
9.4.1 Working on Mani’s Books?	316
9.4.2 Access to Books.....	320
9.5 Conclusions	323
Part III.	
Conclusions	327

Chapter 10. Manichaeans and Everyday Groupness	329
10.1 Untidy History: Manichaeanness in Everyday Life	329
10.1.1 Talking Manichaeanness: Politeness Strategies and Funding the Elect.....	330
10.1.2 Choosing Manichaeanness: Almsgiving and Burial Customs	333
10.1.3 Performing Manichaeanness: Communal Gatherings and Psalm Singing	335
10.1.4 Consuming Manichaeanness: Reading and Copying Texts	336
10.1.5 Summary.....	337
10.2 The Late Antique Transformation of Religion	339
10.2.1 Conflict Model: Lived Religion as Resistance	340
10.2.2 The Nature of the Sources	341
10.2.3 The Integrated and Segregated Mode of Everyday Religion	342
 Bibliography.....	 347
 Appendix 1. Excavation Reports.....	 390
Appendix 2. Outline of Published Documents with their Find Location(s) and Modern Edition(s).....	393
Appendix 3. Self-Designators in Documentary Papyri.....	418
Appendix 4. Prosopography of Makarios's and Pamour's Relatives	427
 Nederlandse Samenvatting.....	 436
Curriculum Vitae.....	442

List of Figures

Front page: Fragment of a Coptic personal letter (P.Kell.Copt. 79 r. Courtesy of Iain Gardner and the Dakhleh Oasis Project, photograph by Jay Johnston).	
Figure 1: Kellis in the Dakhleh Oasis	75
Figure 2: Dakhleh Oasis in Egypt.....	76
Figure 3: Map of the excavation of Kellis.....	81
Figure 4: Plan of Houses 1–3 and the North Building (Area A).....	82
Figure 5: One of the mud-brick structures at Kellis.....	84
Figure 6: Greek and Coptic documents sorted by the most common find locations.....	86
Figure 7: Plan of House 4.....	90
Figure 8: Plan of House 5 (Area A).....	92
Figure 9: Plan of house D/8.....	94
Figure 10: Plan of the East Churches (Area A).....	110
Figure 11: Plan of Enclosure 4 with the West Church and Tombs.	115
Figure 12: Plan of a section of the East Cemetery.....	120
Figure 13: Reconstruction of the family relations of Makarios.....	130
Figure 14: Section of the reconstructed family relations of Pamour III.....	134
Figure 15: Letter P.Kell.Copt. 61.....	141
Figure 16: Syrcic/Coptic bilingual glossary T.Kell.Syr./Copt. 2.....	310
Figure 17: Find locations in Houses 1–3.....	415
Figure 18: Visualization of the number of texts found at various locations.....	417
Figure 19: Visualization of the number of texts found in Houses 1–3 and the North Building.....	417

List of Tables

Table 1. List of the Medinet Madi texts	27
Table 2: Types of documents found in House 3.....	84
Table 3: Types of documents found in House D/8.	84
Table 4. Chronology of the domestic units in Kellis.....	91
Table 5. List of amulets and related texts from Kellis	108
Table 6. Documents in the Makarios Archive	127
Table 7. List of documents directly related to the relatives of Pamour III	133
Table 8. Overview of formula with tripartite division in various sources	152
Table 9. List of document by Pausanias	158
Table 10. Start of two letters written by elect	170
Table 11. References to <i>agape</i> in the Coptic personal letters	223
Table 12: Agape gifts in the KAB per month and related to modern calendar	222
Table 13: Parallel versions of Psalms found at Kellis	243
Table 14. The ten daily prayers with prostrations directed towards supernatural beings. ...	252
Table 15. Texts and content of the wooden board T.Kell.Copt. 2.....	277
Table 16. List of book titles in the Kellis letters	298
Table 17. List of literary texts, excluding the liturgical Manichaean texts	302
Table 18. List of document with Syriac writing.	309
Table 19. Overview of the documentary finds at several find locations	414
Table 20. House 2 deposits and documents.....	416

Acknowledgements

The present study is the result of the project “Manichaeans and Others in Fourth-Century Egypt: The Mechanisms of Religious Change in Late Antiquity,” subsidized by the Netherlands Organization for the Advancement of Research (NWO). I am grateful for this opportunity to explore the everyday lives of individuals and think critically about the study of religious change. I would like to thank my colleagues at Leiden University, in particular Nathal Dessing, Markus Davidsen, Corey Williams, Jürgen Zangenberg, and, during an earlier stage, William Arfman, and Tineke Rooijakkers. They have been of great significance to the completion of this project. It was also a great pleasure to co-organize two papyrological conferences with Cisca Hoogendijk, Koen Donker van Heel, and other colleagues.

Over the years, I have had the opportunity to discuss the topic of this dissertation with a number of fellow scholars and I would like to thank a few of them by mentioning their names here. For feedback and discussion of the papyri and archaeology of Kellis, I am grateful to Olaf Kaper, Klaas Worp, Iain Gardner, Majella Franzmann, Nicola Arveccchia, Colin Hope, and Gillian Bowen. I am indebted to the department of Ancient History at Macquarie University for the hospitality that I experienced during my visiting scholarship in 2016. It was a great pleasure to work with Malcolm Choat and Rachel Yuen-Collingridge, whose expertise I highly value. I thank Bronwen Neil and Amelia Brown for their hospitality in Brisbane. The financial support of the Leiden University Fund (LUF) for this research visit is greatly appreciated. For giving me access to some of their unpublished work, I thank Håkon Teigen, Nils Arne Pedersen, Rene Falkenberg, Iain Gardner, Ewa Zakrzewska, Eldon Molto, Alexandra D. Pleșa, and Rea Matsangou.

This dissertation has profited from interactions with various colleagues, as I was fortunate to receive invaluable feedback at all stages of this project. In addition to the colleagues already mentioned, I would like to express my gratitude to Annemarie Luijendijk, Paula Tutty, Jessica van ‘t Westeinde, Nils H. Korsvoll, Benjamin Sippel, Jennifer Cromwell, Iris Busschers, Miriam Adan Jones, Renate Dekker, Brent Nongbri, and Eline Scheerlinck for their feedback and encouraging words. I thank Marieke Krijnen for revising the English language of this manuscript.

In stating my debts, I cannot but express my deep gratitude to the two academic giants who supervised my doctoral work. Jacques van der Vliet has graciously acted as second supervisor. He tirelessly urged me to critically reexamine the Coptic texts and explore parallels with Egyptian Christianity where possible. His knowledge of the early monastic movement, commemoration rituals, magic, and linguistic developments is outstanding and has steered me forward on many different occasions. My *Doktorvater*, Albert de Jong, has always stimulated me to read widely, to face and challenge existing reconstructions, as well as to engage with academic reconceptualizations of religion beyond the trodden path. His profound insight into the Iranian background of Manichaeism aided my study, and his erudite and comparative approach guided me in my intellectual development as a scholar of religion. I feel very fortunate to have been given the opportunity

to learn from their insights, which have been invaluable for the shaping and completion of this dissertation.

Finally, this project took place at a turbulent time during which social, ethnic, and religious identifications and classifications frequently made the evening news, often in relation to violent situations. I have always felt a profound connection between my work as a scholar and these contemporary events, even though I realize that there is no way of simply learning from the past without projecting our own agendas retrospectively. Here, I would also like to stress that my life has been supremely enriched by the people of the “Jeannette Noelhuis,” my parents, and, above all, by Siska. It is to you that I owe so much more than just my intellectual gratitude and admiration.

As a soundscape to this dissertation I would recommend the BBC’s “Boring Talks” podcast, in which a variety of speakers use the seemingly mundane, overlooked, and “boring” features of everyday life to address our fascinating world.

Abbreviations and Translations

- AA Hegemonius, Acts of Archelaus, translation by Vermes, M. *Hegemonius Acta Archelai (the Acts of Archelaus)*. Turnhout: Brepols, 2001.
- BL Berichtigungsliste der Griechischen Papyrusurkunden aus Ägypten.
- CDT1 Gardner, I., A. Alcock, and W. P. Funk, eds. *Coptic Documentary Texts from Kellis. Volume 1*. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 1999.
- CDT2 Gardner, I., A. Alcock, and W. P. Funk. *Coptic Documentary Texts from Kellis. Volume 2*. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 2014.
- CFM Corpus Fontium Manichaeorum (CFM), series published by Brepols publishers.
- CMC *Cologne Mani Codex*, publication in Koenen, L., and C. Römer, eds. *Der Kölner Mani-Kodex (Über das werden seines Leibes), Kritische Edition Aufgrund der von A. Henrichs und L. Koenen besorgten Erstedition*. Opladen: Westdeutscher Verlag, 1988. Additional readings in Römer, C. *Manis Frühe Missionsreisen nach der Kölner Manibigraphie. Tekstkritischer Kommentar und Erläuterung zu P. 121–P. 192 des Kölner Mani Kodex*. Opladen: Westdeutscher Verlag, 1994. English translation of the larger part of the text by J. M. and S. N. C. Lieu is given in MTRE, 47–73.
- Crum, CD Crum W. E., ed., *A Coptic Dictionary*. (Oxford: Clarendon, 1939) and reprints.
- GPK1 Worp, K. A., ed. *Greek Papyri from Kellis I*. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 1995.
- Hom. The Manichaean Homilies, published with an English translation by Pedersen, N. A., *Manichaean Homilies* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2006) in the CFM series. The Coptic text cited in my notes derives from this English edition, rather than the older German edition.
- KAB Bagnall, R.S. *The Kellis Agricultural Account Book*. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 1997.
- KLT1 Gardner, I., ed. *Kellis Literary Texts. Volume 1*. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 1996.
- KLT2 Gardner, I., ed. *Kellis Literary Texts. Volume 2*. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 2007.
- MTRE Gardner, I., and S. N. C. Lieu, eds. *Manichaean Texts from the Roman Empire*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- NHC Nag Hammadi Codices.
- SB Sammelbuch griechischer Urkunden aus Aegypten.
- TM Trismegistos Database, <http://www.trismegistos.org>, last updated July 2018. Current team includes G. Baetens, Y. Broux, W. Clarysse, M. Depauw, N. Dogaer, T. Gheldof, and H. Verreth.
- 1 Keph. The Berlin *Kephalaia*, known as the “Kephalaia of the Teacher.” Pages 1–295 are translated in Gardner, I., ed. *The Kephalaia of the Teacher*. Leiden: Brill, 1995. Pages 291–440 are published and translated by Wolf-Peter Funk. Individual chapters are cited with a single number, while specific passages are cited with a chapter number followed by manuscript page and line. The Coptic text cited in my notes derives from the critical editions by Ibscher and Schmidt, Böhlig, or Funk.

- 2 Keph. The Dublin *Kephalaia*, known as the “Kephalaia of the Wisdom my Lord Mani” was for a long time only published in facsimile editions. A recent project has led to the publication of a first volume with a critical edition and English translation. I. Gardner, J. BeDuhn, and P. Dilley, *The Chapters of the Wisdom of my Lord Mani*. Leiden: Brill, 2018.
- 1 PsB. First part of the Manichaean Psalmbook, currently only available in facsimile edition.
- 2 PsB. The Manichaean Psalmbook, published by Allberry, C. R. C., ed. *A Manichaean Psalm-Book. Part II*. Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 1938. New editions of sections of the Psalmbook are published by Richter and Wurst in the CFM series. Sometimes cited with a Psalm number followed by the specific manuscript pages. Where possible, the Coptic text cited in my notes derives from these more recent critical editions.

For the Kellis texts I have deviated slightly from the abbreviations as prescribed in the digital checklist of papyri, Founding Editors: John F. Oates and William H. Willis, *Checklist of Greek, Latin, Demotic and Coptic Papyri, Ostraca and Tablets*, <http://papyri.info/docs/checklist>. I have followed the references in the editions by omitting the Roman numbers referring to the various volumes and instead included an abbreviation of the language: P.Kell.Copt. 35 instead of P.Kellis V 35. A guide to the publications of the papyrus documents from the Dakhleh Oasis Project has been included in the appendix. All other abbreviations follow P. H. Alexander, *The SBL Handbook of Style: For Ancient Near Eastern, Biblical, and Early Christian Studies*. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers, 1999.

Without further indications, all translations are from the editions listed among the abbreviations above. The Coptic and Greek text has been included in the notes to give a first indication of the primary text, even though this is not a philological or technical papyrological study. Where possible I have used Gardner’s translation of the *Kephalaia*. I have removed all additional *siglora* in the translation for reasons of legibility. The square brackets in the Coptic or Greek text indicate a lacuna in the text as restored by the editors, or lacunas of a certain length. As in the editions, sublinear dots indicate uncertain readings. All instances in which I have modified the translation, or used another translation than listed above, are indicated in the notes. In all instances of double Greek/Coptic names, I have used the Coptic name (i.e. Pegosh rather than Pekysis).