



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

How lawyers win land conflicts for corporations: Legal Strategy and its influence on the Rule of Law in Indonesia

Kouwagam, S.U.

Citation

Kouwagam, S. U. (2020, June 23). *How lawyers win land conflicts for corporations: Legal Strategy and its influence on the Rule of Law in Indonesia*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/123059>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/123059>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/123059> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Kouwagam, S.U.

Title: How lawyers win land conflicts for corporations: Legal Strategy and its influence on the Rule of Law in Indonesia

Issue Date: 2020-06-23

How Lawyers Win Land Conflicts for Corporations:
Legal Strategy and its Influence on the Rule of Law in Indonesia

*The supreme benevolence does something,
Yet some things remain undone.
The Law does something,
And leaves much to be done.
The Ritual acts,
And when no one cares,
It raises arms and uses force.*

*When Tao is lost, there is Virtue
When Virtue is lost, there is Justice
When Justice is lost, there is Ritual
Ritual is the shell of Truth,
The beginning of Chaos.*

(Excerpt from personal translation of Tao Te Ching verse 38)

How Lawyers Win Land Conflicts for Corporations

*Legal Strategy and its Influence on the
Rule of Law in Indonesia*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 23 juni 2020
klokke 13.45 uur

door

Santy Utami Kouwagam

geboren te Ujungpandang (Indonesië)

in 1983

Promotoren: prof. dr. A.W. Bedner
 prof. dr. C.E. von Benda-Beckmann-Drooglever Fortuijn

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. J.M. Ubink
 prof. dr. A.G. Castermans
 prof. dr. J.M. Smits (Maastricht University)
 prof. dr. R.L. Abel (University of California, Los Angeles,
 USA)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2020 S. Kouwagam

ISBN 978-94-028-2070-6

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets in deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Het reproductie recht wordt niet uitgeoefend.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, made available or communicated to the public, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, unless this is expressly permitted by law.

Acknowledgements

Thank you, Papi and Mami for your endless support in every way possible. Thank you my brother Sigit for always looking out for me, his gracious wife Inke, and both for making the duties of being a daughter and an aunt effortless. Sorry that this project took longer than expected, but I hope I made you proud just the same. I am grateful for encouragements from my aunts, uncles, cousins and friends from Makassar: Om Hao, Om Jin and Tante Cella, Tante Meily and Om Lun, Lita and Reinhard, Naldy, Ria, Julai, Ollie, Ivana, Diana, Jayne, Cecilia, just to name a few. For *familie* de Werd and Meyer in Holland. For meaningful friendships with Jeremie and Lora McKnight, Bob Coblentz, Os Erdem and Markus Altenkirch, even from afar, and for unconditional support from Maarten Manse.

I will remain indebted to Pak Lucas for including me in many business meetings where women are usually excluded, and trusting me with his work. Having colleagues in Jakarta who were always open to answer my questions is a great advantage. For this, I particularly thank As'ary, Primas, Nur Asiah, and Oscar.

I especially would like to thank Professor Otto for his inputs in the early stage of this project. I am lucky to have found such incredible professors. Jan Michiel Otto has set an example on asking the right questions, Keebet von Benda-Beckmann for her friendship, kindness and valuable insights, and Adriaan Bedner for moderating, unfailing trust and relentlessly positive outlook. I respect and admire them greatly.

Thank you, Kari and Kora, for your care and support. To colleagues at VVI who have become my board game foes, victims of cooking experiments, and my "academic family": Willem van der Muur, Bruno Braak, Bernardo Ribeiro de Almeida and Laura Ogden, Hoko and Michi Horii, Laura Lancée and Frank, Annelien Bouland, Mies Grijns, Laure D'Hondt, Henky Widjaja, Surya Tjandra, and Deasy Simandjuntak. Throughout this process I went through multiple heartbreaks, they were the ones who kindly and carefully picked up the pieces.

In addition, I value the friendships and discussions with Fachrizal Afandi, Upik Djalins, Rikardo Simarmata, Herlambang Wiratraman, Yance Arizona, Anton Cahyadi, Ken Setiawan, Jacqueline Vel, Carolien Jacobs, Janine Ubink, Dennis Janssen, Nick Huls, Erik Herber, Nadia Sonneveld, Danielle Chevalier, Daniel Blocq, Maartje van der Woude, Roxane de Massol de Rebetz, Fayola Antonius, Suliman Ibrahim, Arshad Muradin, Dian Rositawati, Binziad Kadafi, Awaludin Marwan, Stijn van Huis, Dyah Wirastri, Sulistyowati Irianto, Yuzuru Shimada, Bayu Dwi Anggono, Sandra Moniaga, Wiwiek Awiati, Ward Berenschot, Sander Tetteroo, Sander Luchtenburg, Byapti Sur, Alexander Shaik, and Maarten van den Bosch.

I am thankful for PPI Leiden and the Indonesian community in Leiden, especially Mas Tio, Al Farabi, Arfiansyah, Julia, Nazarudin, Vanessa Deviani, Natasha Santoso, Raditya Kosasih, Hari Nugroho, Mega Atria, Fifi Tjokrosonto, Ucok and his family, and Kurniawan Saefullah. For professionals who provide a good life in Leiden: Annet, Brian, Piet, and Zoë.

I would like to express my gratitude to all my interviewees for their time and reflections. Also to University College Roosevelt, CILC, IDLO and KITLV for the experience and inspirations they have given me.

I dedicate this book for my Opa, my very first teacher, whose love for our *tanah air* often moved him to tears.

Preface

'Having a meeting with him is like seeing a magician. He is there to grant your wishes, but you should not know how.' – A client describing his lawyer, Jakarta 2013.

In 1906, Houdini the magician published a book titled *The Right Way to do Wrong*, intending to inform the public on the 'real thoughts and feelings of the denizens of the world of police and courts' in early 20th century America. The book is a collection of short stories on performing tricks and cons.

Much like magicians, the criminals described in Houdini's book are not desperate or lazy. They are creative and sometimes possess skills that, at best, make others eyewitnesses. They do not act alone. They have assistance: wives who make things happen in the background and the larger *familia* who practice with them, knowing their secrets, tricks, assets, and limits.

This book shares Houdini's motives to help the readers to be able to detect the tricks and cons to protect themselves from them. It further aims to present the weaknesses of the Indonesian legal system to aid the reader in reforming it.

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
PREFACE	VII
INTRODUCTION	1
I Conceptual and theoretical framework	10
II Research questions	15
III Methodology and research notes	15
IV Structure of the book	19
1 OVERVIEW OF CORPORATE LITIGATION ABOUT LAND IN INDONESIA (COURTS PAVING THE WAY FOR LEGAL STRATEGY)	21
1.1 Types of Cases	23
1.1.1 Parties	25
1.1.2 Objectives	27
1.1.3 Standing to Sue/Legal relationship	28
1.1.4 Claims	29
1.1.5 Issues	30
1.1.6 Legal basis	31
1.1.7 Defense	32
1.1.8 Court decisions	33
1.2 Problems concerning Indonesian Legal Procedure	35
1.2.1 Jurisdiction	38
1.2.2 Appeal procedure	39
1.2.3 The nature of discovery	41
1.2.4 Legal reasoning	43
1.3 Procedural justice in the pursuit of truth?	47
2 THE ILLUSION OF PRESTIGE: BUSINESS AND POLITICS OF LAWYERS IN INDONESIA	49
2.1 Role and Functions of Lawyers	50
2.2 Organization of Lawyers	52
2.2.1 Struggle for the Indonesian Bar Association(s)	54
2.3 Becoming a Lawyer: Training and Certification	59
2.4 Types of Lawyers and Law Firms: Between stoic law-abiders and goal-oriented players	61
2.4.1 Corporate transactional lawyers and Litigators	63
2.4.1a Corporate transactional lawyers	63
2.4.1b Litigators (brokers and fixers)	64
2.4.2 Modern and traditional firms	66
2.4.3 Premier league fixers: 'Family' lawyers	69

2.5	Professional relationships	70
2.6	Liabilities from violating ethical frameworks	74
2.7	Conclusion	77
3	BUYING OPPORTUNITIES, SELLING DREAMS	79
3.1	Typical process and organization of land acquisition for urban development projects	80
3.1.1	<i>Business model / process in acquiring land</i>	82
3.1.2	<i>Business organization</i>	89
3.2	Corporate governance	93
3.3	Causes of disputes in business relationships	100
3.4	Conclusion: The nightmare of enforcing agreements	105
4	PRE-LITIGATION, LITIGATION, AND ENFORCEMENT STRATEGIES	109
4.1	Pre-Litigation strategies	110
4.1.1	<i>Engage both cooperative and combative lawyers</i>	111
4.1.2	<i>Know the opponent</i>	114
4.1.3	<i>Build and use social capital</i>	115
4.1.4	<i>Have a broad Power of Attorney and vague legal opinions</i>	117
4.1.5	<i>Structure assets and financial transactions</i>	118
4.1.6	<i>Contract drafting strategies</i>	121
4.1.7	<i>Protect the real patron</i>	124
4.1.8	<i>'Certify' evidence</i>	126
4.1.9	<i>Increase chance by using many forums and test dominance of one forum against another</i>	127
4.1.10	<i>Somasi (summons)</i>	133
4.1.11	<i>Drafting and filing complaint/lawsuit</i>	133
4.2	Litigation strategies	134
4.2.1	<i>Tactics in court</i>	136
4.2.2	<i>Tactics outside court</i>	136
4.2.3	<i>Appeals</i>	137
4.2.4	<i>Securing certainty of winning litigation</i>	138
4.3	Enforcement strategies	139
4.4	Conclusion: A business of favors	141
5	CONCLUSION	143
5.1	Influence of lawyers on the legal system	146
5.2	Condition of the Rule of Law found in this study	147
5.2.1	<i>Tort and contract claims are insufficient in initiating a level-playing field</i>	148
5.2.2	<i>Corruption as a façade covering legal uncertainty and incoherent principles for economic development</i>	149
5.2.3	<i>Rejecting the Netherlands-Indies' legal heritage has resulted in a commercial litigation practice that relies on rituals</i>	150

<i>Table of Contents</i>	XI
5.3 Policy suggestions and further research	151
5.3.1 <i>Policy suggestions:</i>	151
5.3.2 <i>Further research</i>	152
5.4 Final remark	153
ANNEX 1	155
ANNEX 2	157
BIBLIOGRAPHY	161
SUMMARY	171
SAMENVATTING (SUMMARY IN DUTCH)	173
RINGKASAN (SUMMARY IN BAHASA INDONESIA)	177
CURRICULUM VITAE	181