Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Children's Rights in International Commercial Surrogacy: Exploring the challenges from a child rights, public international human rights law perspective

Achmad, C.I.

Citation
Achmad, C. I. (2018, June 26). *Children's Rights in International Commercial Surrogacy: Exploring the challenges from a child rights, public international human rights law perspective*. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/63088

Version:	Not Applicable (or Unknown)
License:	Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden
Downloaded from:	https://hdl.handle.net/1887/63088

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page

Universiteit Leiden

The following handle holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation:
http://hdl.handle.net/1887/63088

Author: Achmad, C.I.
Title: Children's Rights in International Commercial Surrogacy: Exploring the challenges from a child rights, public international human rights law perspective
Issue Date: 2018-06-26

Children's Rights in International Commercial Surrogacy

Children's Rights in International Commercial Surrogacy

Exploring the challenges from a child rights, public international human rights law perspective

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 26 juni 2018
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Claire Indrawati Achmad

geboren te Auckland, Nieuw Zeeland

in 1983

Promotor:	prof. dr. mr. M.R. Bruning
Co-promotor:	dr. M.J. Vonk
Promotiecommissie:	prof. dr. R.A. Lawson
	prof. dr. M.L.P. Loenen
	prof. dr. K. Sandberg (University of Oslo, Norway)
	prof. dr. W.M. Schrama (Universiteit Utrecht)
	prof. dr. J.J. Sloth-Nielsen

Lay-out: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

ISBN 978 94 0281 061 5

© 2018 C. Achmad

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

Acknowledgements

It has been a privilege undertaking this doctoral study in international children's rights law as a student of Universiteit Leiden, an institution with which I share many values, and which has inspired me through world-leading scholars and legal practitioners.

I am indebted to my principal supervisor Professor Mariëlle Bruning, for the opportunity of doctoral study. Thank you for supporting me to develop as a child rights expert, and for your flexibility and open-mindedness. Thank you for the time you have invested in me over the years to help me pursue this work. It has been a pleasure and privilege working with and being inspired by you.

I am grateful to my second supervisor, Assistant Professor Machteld Vonk. Your constructive feedback and encouragement has been unwavering; your enthusiasm for my topic and work has lifted me throughout. Thank you for your generous assistance translating the study summary into Dutch, and all you have contributed to help me complete this study.

I would not have undertaken doctoral studies if not for my husband Peter Dolan's encouragement. Peter, you said I should 'go for it'; I am grateful for your kindness, love and understanding during 'PhD life'. Thank you for proof-reading my work and testing my thinking so my ideas evolve in new directions.

My family is the bedrock of my commitment to lifelong learning. The wisdom my beloved grandparents Alieen and Tom Ross shared with me, and the life example they provided, has been a guiding force for me completing this doctorate.

I am grateful for the support, generosity and love of my parents, Robin and Bambang Achmad. You have both boosted me during my studies, always providing encouragement and practical help both in-person and virtually whenever necessary. Thank you and terima kasih banyak; you are both a driving force in my life that I cherish.

My brother, Andrew Achmad, has been a pillar of support to me during this work and always. Your thoughtfulness, accountability and good humour means so much.

I am grateful for the support of my wider family members internationally, including the wonderful Dolan family. The support and encouragement of close and dear friends has been grounding and motivating, including col-

leagues in Leiden's Child Law Department and others undertaking doctoral studies.

I have been privileged to work with many outstanding individuals, institutions and organisations during my studies. Thanks to the organisers of the workshops I have contributed to at Aberdeen, Columbia, ITM and La Trobe universities, and conferences in Auckland, Stockholm, The Hague, and Wellington.

My gratitude extends to the esteemed scholars and legal practitioners who have provided feedback and opportunities, discussed ideas and inspired me through their work. Particularly, Maud de Boer-Buqicchio, Adjunct Professor Yasmine Ergas, Assistant Professor Laura van Waas, Professor Ton Liefaard, Professor Eric Blyth, Professor Sanoj Rajan, Professor Mark Henaghan, Margaret Casey Q.C. and Simon Jefferson Q.C.

I am thankful for my supportive colleagues in the organisations I have worked with as a full-time employee while studying. I acknowledge the Leids Universiteit Fonds and the New Zealand Netherlands Foundation for financial support by way of grants, enabling my travel to conferences in The Hague and Stockholm. The opportunities I have had to teach at Leiden University and the University of Auckland while studying have fuelled my desire to continue teaching in future.

I hope this thesis will be of practical help and application for those around the world grappling with the challenges arising from International Commercial Surrogacy. Most of all, I hope it helps to ensure the rights of children born through International Commercial Surrogacy are promoted, protected and upheld.

Claire Achmad
Te Whanganui-a-Tara, 2018

Table of contents

1 INTRODUCTION 1

1 International Commercial Surrogacy as a 21st century phenomenon 1
2 Aims of the study and research questions 5
3 Rationale for a focus on the rights of the child 6
4 Methodological approach and scope 8
5 The place and contribution of this study in the existing legal body of knowledge concerning International Commercial Surrogacy 14
6 Structure of the study 17
7 Outline of the study 22

2 CONTEXTUALISING A 21ST CENTURY CHALLENGE PART ONE
Understanding International Commercial Surrogacy and the Parties whose Rights and Interests are at Stake in the Public International Law Context 29

1 Introduction 30
2 Understanding International Commercial Surrogacy and its parties 32
3 Tracking the emergence and development of a market: a global 'trade' in babies through International Commercial Surrogacy 35
4 The parties to International Commercial Surrogacy arrangements 37
4.1 The commissioning parents 37
4.2 The surrogate mother 40
4.3 The child 41
4.4 The medical staff and surrogacy broker 41
5 Brave new world: the bioethical and moral conundrums of International Commercial Surrogacy and the interface with health law issues 42
6 Human rights protection: when is a child a child? 44

3 CONTEXTUALISING A 21ST CENTURY CHALLENGE PART TWO
Public International Law Human Rights Issues: Why Are the Rights and Interests of Women and Children at Stake in International Commercial Surrogacy 49

1 Introduction 50
2 Children's rights 51
2.1 The immediate practical problems for children born from International Commercial Surrogacy arrangements 52

2.2 The potential for statelessness 55
2.3 The commissioned child as a contested or unwanted child 58
2.4 The child's right to identity 58
2.4.1 The importance of identity to knowing one's personal narrative 60
2.4.2 The importance of identity to knowing one's cultural and ethnic background 61
2.4.3 The importance of identity to knowing one's genetic origins – the medical and health rationale 62
2.5 Potential for selective creation of children – designer babies 63
2.6 The impact of the creation of international surrogate children on potential adopted children 64
3 Women's rights 65
3.1 The potential for exploitation of the socio-economic position of poor women and for ICS to contribute to perpetuated marginalisation 65
3.2 The potential for the exploitation of women's bodies and reproductive rights and autonomy 68
4 Human rights issues common to both women and children in International Surrogacy arrangements 70
4.1 Commodification of women and children 70
4.2 The risk of human trafficking 71

4 Multiple 'Mothers', Many Requirements for Protection Children's Rights and the Status of Mothers in the Context of International Commercial Surrogacy 73

1 Introduction 74
2 Understanding International Commercial Surrogacy as a distinguishable phenomenon 76
3 The central feature of 'mother': child 78
4 Multiple mothers: the many faces of 'mother' in International Commercial Surrogacy 79
4.1 Surrogate 79
4.2 Genetic 81
4.3 Commissioning 82
5 Absence of 'mother' in International Commercial Surrogacy 84
5.1 Human 84
5.2 Legal 85
6 The contestable notion of 'mother' in International Commercial Surrogacy and implications for the rights of the child 86
7 Conclusion 90

5 International Commercial Surrogacy and Children's Rights
Babies, Borders, Responsibilities and Rights 91

1 Introduction 92
2 Conception cross-border 93
3 The ethics and economics of commercialising conception 97
4 Clash of rights: 'parents', children and other parties 102
5 The rights of the child at stake 104
5.1 The rights of the child to identity and nationality 105
5.1.1 The child's right to the preservation of their identity 105
5.1.2 Nationality 108
5.2 The right of the child to grow up in a family environment 109
5.3 The rights of the child to health, education and social security 111
6 International approaches to the rights of the child in International Commercial Surrogacy situations 111
6.1 The rise of 'national guidelines' or government guidance as a response to International Surrogacy: aspects relating to the rights of the child 112
6.1.1 New Zealand: International Surrogacy Information sheets and non-binding ministerial guidelines 113
6.1.2 Australia: 'Fact Sheet 36a on International Surrogacy Arrangements' 115
6.1.3 United Kingdom: 'Guidance: surrogacy overseas' 117
7 Judicial decision-making on the rights of the child in selected reported International Commercial Surrogacy case law 119
8 Conclusion: placing the child's rights and best interests at the heart of International Commercial Surrogacy 123

6 Unconceived, Unborn, Uncertain
Is Pre-Birth Protection Necessary in International Commercial Surrogacy for Children to Exercise and Enjoy Their Rights Post-Birth? 131

1 Introduction 132
2 The impact of actions and decisions in the prenatal and preconception stages of International Commercial Surrogacy on the rights of children once born 135
2.1 Key child rights impacts triggered during the preconception stage of International Commercial Surrogacy 135
2.2 Key child rights impacts triggered during the prenatal stage of International Commercial Surrogacy 137
3 Does international human rights law provide a basis for protecting the unborn child? 138
3.1 United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child 138
3.1.1 Convention the Rights of the Child – Travaux Préparatoires 141
3.1.2 Other international human rights law instruments 143

3.2 Treatment of the unborn child in regional human rights instruments and national constitutions 145
3.2.1 Regional human rights instruments 145
3.2.2 National constitutions 146
4 Jurisprudential approaches to pre-birth issues 148
4.1 Leading regional human rights jurisprudence 148
4.1.1 Inter-American Court of Human Rights 148
4.1.2 European Court of Human Rights 149
4.2 Selected domestic and regional jurisprudence concerning specific non-International Commercial Surrogacy pre-birth issues 152
4.2.1 Wrongful life legal actions, including those based on failures to undertake prenatal testing 152
4.2.2 Actions of a pregnant woman detrimentally impacting on the unborn child and future child 155
4.2.3 Embryos created through ART 157
5 Implications for the future child's rights of the intentional, planned nature of International Commercial Surrogacy and the involvement of multiple possible parents 158
6 A proposed approach to preconception and prenatal protection of the rights of the future child most at risk in International Commercial Surrogacy 160
6.1 Framing the future child in International Commercial Surrogacy through an in eventu approach 161
6.2 Basic safeguards for protecting the future child in International Commercial Surrogacy from rights impacts triggered preconception and prenatally 161
6.2.1 Education 162
6.2.2 Professional codes of practice/best practice guidance 163
6.2.3 Inserting the child's voice and perspective into International Commercial Surrogacy decision-making and actions at the prenatal stage 164
7 Conclusion 167

7 SECURING CHILDREN'S RIGHT TO A NATIONALITY IN A CHANGING WORLD
The context of International Commercial Surrogacy and twenty-first century reproductive technology 171

1 Introduction 172
2 Understanding the problem 174
2.1 International Commercial Surrogacy as a new method of family formation 174
2.2 International Commercial Surrogacy as a new cause of statelessness 174
2.2.1 Scenario one: Lack of recognition of the child's parentage prevents nationality acquisition 176

2.2.2 Scenario two: Application of conflicting nationality and parentage laws by child's birth State and 'commissioning parents'' State of nationality 177
2.2.3 Scenario three: Children abandoned by commissioning parents 181
2.3 Key findings distilled from the three International Commercial Surrogacy child statelessness scenarios and associated cases 182
2.3.1 Examining the wider child rights impacts of child statelessness in International Commercial Surrogacy 183
3 International law governing the child's right to acquire a nationality 185
3.1 General nationality provisions and nationality provisions pertaining specifically to children 185
3.2 Key provisions in the statelessness conventions 186
4 Securing the child's right to nationality in International Commercial Surrogacy 188
4.1 The limitations of the solutions applied in the cases discussed 188
4.2 Possible solutions to child statelessness in International Commercial Surrogacy 192
4.2.1 Jus soli based solutions 192
4.2.2 Jus sanguinis based solutions 194
4.2.3 A practical and effective solution and residual secondary safeguards to secure the child's right to nationality in International Commercial Surrogacy 197
5 Conclusion: the future of the child's right to acquire a nationality in International Commercial Surrogacy 199

8 Answering the 'Who am I?' Question
Protecting the Right of Children Born Through International Commercial Surrogacy to Preserve Their Identity Under Article 8 of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child 201

1 Introduction 202
2 The elements of child identity at particular risk in International Commercial Surrogacy 204
2.1 Genetic and biological 205
2.2 Personal narrative 207
2.3 Cultural 207
3 The child's perspective: why the right to identity preservation is important in International Commercial Surrogacy 209
3.1 Potential impact of conception and birth circumstances through International Commercial Surrogacy on children 209
3.2 The implications for the child of being removed from their state of birth 211
4 The child's right to preserve their identity: Article 8 of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child and beyond 213
4.1 The development of the child's right to preserve identity 214

4.2 The concept of 'preserving' identity under Article 8(1) of the Convention on the Rights of the Child 217
4.3 The content of the right to preserve identity under Article 8(1) of the convention on the rights of the child 218
4.3.1 The child's identity from a biological and genetic perspective 220
4.4 The right to identity in regional human rights jurisprudence 224
4.4.1 Inter-American Court of Human Rights 224
4.4.2 European Court of Human Rights 225
5 How the child's Article 8 right has been breached in International Commercial Surrogacy situations 229
5.1 *Volden twins* 229
5.2 *D and L (Surrogacy)* 230
5.3 *Paradiso and Campanelli v. Italy* 231
5.4 *In the Matter of an Application by DMW and KW to adopt a male child* 232
6 Learning lessons from donor-conception, adoption and domestic surrogacy for the child's right to preserve identity in International Commercial Surrogacy situations 236
6.1 Domestic systems of donor-conceived children and lessons for the child's right to preserve identity in International Commercial Surrogacy 236
6.2 Adoption systems and lessons for the child's right to preserve identity in International Commercial Surrogacy 239
6.3 Domestic surrogacy and lessons for the child's right to preserve identity in International Commercial Surrogacy 242
7 Proposing practical measures of implementation of article 8 for children in International Commercial Surrogacy 244
7.1 Commissioning parents and medical professionals: a first line of defence in preserving child identity in International Commercial Surrogacy 244
7.2 The state's role in protecting the child's right to preserve their identity in International Commercial Surrogacy 248
7.2.1 Facilitating an identity dossier for every child born through International Commercial Surrogacy as an interim measure of protection 249
7.2.2 Facilitating a long-term, inter-state system of protection of identity information in the context of International Commercial Surrogacy 251
8 Conclusion: Answering the 'Who am I?' question in International Commercial Surrogacy situations 252

9 Case Analysis
Children's Rights to the Fore in the European Court of Human Rights' First International Surrogacy Judgments 255

1 Introduction 256
2 Children in limbo for over ten years 257
3 Arguments in the European Court of Human Rights 258
4 Judgments in the European Court of Human Rights 260
5 Multifaceted concept of identity central to private life 261
6 Children's rights to the fore 262
7 French Government reaction and future implications of the *Mennesson* and *Labassee* judgments for human rights in the context of International Commercial Surrogacy 265

Addendum to Chapter 9: Brief case commentary – *Paradiso and Campanelli v. Italy*, Grand Chamber of the European Court of Human Rights 269

10 Multiple Potential Parents But a Child Always at the Centre
Balancing the Rights and Interests of the Parties to International Commercial Surrogacy Arrangements 279

1 Introduction 280
1.1 Focus and scope of this paper 281
2 Balancing the rights and interests of the unborn child with those of the surrogate mother 283
2.1 Leading decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and United Nations Human Rights Committee concerning abortion relevant by analogy to rights balancing in International Commercial Surrogacy 284
2.2 Striking a balance between the rights and interests of the unborn child and the surrogate mother in International Commercial Surrogacy 286
3 Balancing the rights and interests of the child with those of genetic donor parents 289
3.1 A conflict between the genetic donor parents' privacy right and the rights and best interests of the child in International Commercial Surrogacy 289
3.2 Striking a balance between the rights and interests of the child and genetic donor parents in International Commercial Surrogacy 291
4 Balancing the rights and interests of the child with those of the commissioning parents 292
4.1 The rights and best interests of the child in conflict with the rights and interests of the commissioning parents in International Commercial Surrogacy 292
4.2 Is there a right to have a child? 294
4.2.1 Is there a right to a genetic child? 294

4.2.2 Is there a right to adopt? 299
4.3 The concept of 'involuntary childlessness' 301
4.4 Inserting the child's rights into the picture 303
4.5 Striking a balance between the rights and interests of the child and the commissioning parents in the specific situation of International Commercial Surrogacy 304
4.5.1 Selected jurisprudence relevant to the balancing of commissioning parents' and children's rights and best interests in International Commercial Surrogacy 305
4.5.2 Selected International Commercial Surrogacy jurisprudence balancing commissioning parents' and children's rights 309
5 Balancing the rights of the surrogate with the rights and interests of the commissioning parents 312
5.1 A power imbalance in favour of commissioning parents in International Commercial Surrogacy 312
5.2 A power imbalance in favour of the surrogate in International Commercial Surrogacy 314
5.3 Domestic jurisprudence relevant to the balancing of commissioning parents' and surrogates' rights and interests in International Commercial Surrogacy 316
5.4 The surrogates' right not to be exploited through International Commercial Surrogacy 317
6 Conclusion: Overall balancing of rights in International Commercial Surrogacy 318
6.1 A general approach to rights balancing in International Commercial Surrogacy according priority to the child's rights and best interests 318
6.2 Striking an overall balance in the four situations of competing rights and interests in International Commercial Surrogacy discussed in this paper 321

11 CONCLUSION 325

1 Focusing on child rights in International Commercial Surrogacy 325
2 International Commercial Surrogacy: A complex method of family building in a changing landscape 326
3 A child always at the centre, but often unprotected 331
4 A focus on the child, the most vulnerable person in International Commercial Surrogacy arrangements 332
5 A multifaceted child rights challenge 333
6 The Convention on the Rights of the Child as the framework for promoting and protecting the child's rights in International Commercial Surrogacy 338
6.1 The role of the convention on the rights of the child in protecting and reinforcing the rights of children in International Commercial Surrogacy 338

6.2 Understanding and approaching the rights of children in International Commercial Surrogacy from a public international human rights law, child rights perspective, and balancing competing rights in International Commercial Surrogacy
Including a Framework of Recommendations for promoting and protecting the rights of children in International Commercial Surrogacy 339
6.3 Arguments for the Committee on the Rights of the Child to issue a General Comment on the rights of children in International Commercial Surrogacy 349
7 Envisaging International Commercial Surrogacy arrangements that protect the children at their centre 351
8 Prospects for a long-term approach to protecting the child's rights in International Commercial Surrogacy 352
9 Concluding remarks 355

SUMMARY 361
SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY) 369
BIBLIOGRAPHY 377
CURRICULUM VITAE 399