



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The implementation of international law in the national legal order : a legislative perspective

Beenakker, E.B.

Citation

Beenakker, E. B. (2018, June 5). *The implementation of international law in the national legal order : a legislative perspective*. Meijers-reeks. s.n., S.l. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/63079>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/63079>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The following handle holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation:

<http://hdl.handle.net/1887/63079>

Author: Beenakker, E.B.

Title: The implementation of international law in the national legal order : a legislative perspective

Issue Date: 2018-06-05

The implementation of international law in the national legal order

A legislative perspective

The implementation of international law in the national legal order

A legislative perspective

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 5 juni 2018
klokke 13.45 uur

door

Emile Bernard Beenakker

geboren te Huizen

in 1985

Promotor: prof. dr. W.J.M. Voermans

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. R.A. Lawson
prof. dr. N.J. Schrijver
mr. dr. H.G. Sevenster (Dutch Council of State)
prof. dr. H. Xanthaki (University College London, UK)
prof. dr. S.E. Zijlstra (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2018 E.B. Beenakker

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets in deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Het reprorecht wordt niet uitgeoefend.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, made available or communicated to the public, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, unless this is expressly permitted by law.

Acknowledgements

Working on this thesis as an external PhD-candidate has been sometimes challenging, but always rewarding. I was fortunate to enjoy the support of many people who have contributed, in various ways, to the project's completion.

First of all, I would like to thank my promotor, prof. dr. Wim Voermans, for his support during the past years.

Furthermore, I would like to express my thanks to prof. dr. Rick Lawson, prof. dr. Nico Schrijver, mr dr. Hanna Sevenster, prof. dr. Helen Xanthaki and prof. dr. Sjoerd Zijlstra for being part of the doctorate committee and for reading the manuscript.

I am also indebted to my former employer, the Dutch Ministry of Health, Welfare and Sports. In particular, I would like to thank Rien den Boer LL.M and Bert Jan Clement LL.M, director and head of section of the ministry's Legislative and Legal Affairs directorate. Throughout the entire project you have encouraged me to continue and for two years you have generously allowed me to spend a significant amount of working hours on it. To say that your flexibility and support have been helpful, would be an understatement.

I would also like to take this opportunity to express my gratitude to my parents, Wim and Joke, and to my brothers, Ivo en Remy, for their love and support. I also owe many thanks to my friends, who have played an important role in the successful completion of this project, even though they may not always have been aware of it.

Finally, Isabelle, I am aware it must have been difficult at times to live together with a person who has spent many hours during the evenings and weekends working on this thesis. During the past years, however, it has not prevented you from expressing your belief in me and in my ability to accomplish the PhD-process. Thank you.

Summary Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XVII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
PART I THE IMPLEMENTATION OF INTERNATIONAL LAW IN THE NATIONAL LEGAL ORDER	23
INTRODUCTION TO PART I	23
2 THE RELATION BETWEEN INTERNATIONAL LAW AND NATIONAL LAW	25
3 SOURCES OF OBLIGATIONS TO ADOPT IMPLEMENTING LEGISLATION	39
PART II THE REGULATION OF IMPLEMENTING LEGISLATION UNDER SELECTED INTERNATIONAL LEGAL REGIMES: LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS	73
INTRODUCTION TO PART II	73
4 LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF HUMAN RIGHTS LAW	77
5 LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF EU LAW	109
6 LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW	131
7 LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF INTERNATIONAL HEALTH LAW	147
8 LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW	161
9 LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF INTERNATIONAL LABOUR LAW	175
CONCLUSION TO PART II	193

PART III	ASSESSMENT OF LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	195
	INTRODUCTION TO PART III	195
10	METHODS OF HARMONISATION AND LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW: COMMON FEATURES	197
11	LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AND THE QUALITY OF IMPLEMENTING LEGISLATION	239
12	QUALITY STANDARDS PERTAINING TO IMPLEMENTING LEGISLATION AND INTERNATIONAL LEGAL PRACTICE: A GAP TO BRIDGE?	277
13	CONCLUSIONS	287
	SOURCES AND LITERATURE	295
	SUMMARY IN DUTCH	321
	CURRICULUM VITAE	329

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XVII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of the study	1
1.1.1 The state and the implementation of international law	1
1.1.2 The national legislature under international law: position	2
1.1.3 National legislation under international law	6
1.1.4 The national legislature under international law: four roles	9
1.2 Implementation of international law in the national legal order: a working definition	15
1.3 Research subject and research questions	17
1.4 Aims and relevance of the study	18
1.5 Outline, scope and methodology of the study	21
 PART I THE IMPLEMENTATION OF INTERNATIONAL LAW IN THE NATIONAL LEGAL ORDER	 23
INTRODUCTION TO PART I	23
2 THE RELATION BETWEEN INTERNATIONAL LAW AND NATIONAL LAW	25
2.1 Introduction	25
2.2 Understanding the relation between international and national law	25
2.3 Monism and dualism in contemporary international law	30
2.4 Why are national implementing measures indispensable?	33
2.5 Conclusion	38
3 SOURCES OF OBLIGATIONS TO ADOPT IMPLEMENTING LEGISLATION	39
3.1 Introduction	39
3.2 Treaties	40
3.2.1 Treaties as a source of law	40
3.2.2 Treaties as a source of obligation to adopt implementing measures	42
3.3 Customary law	48
3.3.1 Custom as a source of law	48

3.3.2	Custom as a source of obligation to adopt implementing measures	52
3.4	Binding decisions of international organisations	56
3.4.1	Binding decisions of international organisations as a source of law	56
3.4.2	Binding decisions of international organisations as a source of obligation to adopt implementing measures	60
3.5	Categories of norms addressing the national legislature	69
3.6	Conclusion	71
PART II	THE REGULATION OF IMPLEMENTING LEGISLATION UNDER SELECTED INTERNATIONAL LEGAL REGIMES: LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS	73
	INTRODUCTION TO PART II	73
4	LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF HUMAN RIGHTS LAW	77
4.1	Implementation of positive obligations under the European Convention on Human Rights	77
4.1.1	General	77
4.1.2	Content of the Convention	79
4.1.2.1	Right to life	79
4.1.2.2	Prohibition of slavery and forced labour	81
4.1.2.3	Right to liberty and security	83
4.1.2.4	Right to respect for family and private life	84
4.1.2.5	Right to freedom of expression	86
4.1.3	Legislative standards	87
4.1.3.1	Effectiveness	87
4.1.3.2	Non-discrimination	88
4.1.3.3	Enforcement, remedies and 'proper implementation'	90
4.1.3.4	Formal aspects	91
4.1.4	Overview	92
4.2	Implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	92
4.2.1	General	92
4.2.2	Content of the Convention	94
4.2.3	Legislative standards	95
4.2.3.1	Implementation and progressive realisation	95
4.2.3.2	Non-discrimination	96
4.2.3.3	Consultation	98
4.2.3.4	Observance of applicable international law	98
4.2.3.5	Monitoring of compliance and enforcement	100
4.2.3.6	Remedies	102
4.2.3.7	Evaluation of legislation	105

4.2.3.8	Formal aspects	106
4.2.3.9	Information to the public	106
4.2.4	Overview	107
5	LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF EU LAW	109
5.1	Implementation of directives of the European Union	109
5.1.1	General	109
5.1.2	Legislative standards	110
5.1.2.1	Timely implementation	110
5.1.2.2	The nature of the implementing measures	112
5.1.2.3	The content of the implementing measures	114
5.1.2.4	Effective application and enforcement in practice	117
5.1.3	Overview	125
5.2	Implementation of regulations of the European Union	126
6	LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW	131
6.1	Implementation of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime	131
6.1.1	General	131
6.1.2	Content of the Convention	132
6.1.3	Legislative standards	133
6.1.3.1	Implementation, effectiveness and harmonisation	133
6.1.3.2	Observance of applicable international and national law	135
6.1.3.3	Criminalisation and enforcement	138
6.1.4	Overview	139
6.2	Implementation of the International Convention for the Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism	140
6.2.1	General	140
6.2.2	Content of the Convention	141
6.2.3	Legislative standards	142
6.2.3.1	Implementation, effectiveness and harmonisation	142
6.2.3.2	Observance of applicable international and national law	143
6.2.3.3	Criminalisation and enforcement	145
6.2.4	Overview	145
7	LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF INTERNATIONAL HEALTH LAW	147
7.1	Implementation of the International Health Regulations	147
7.1.1	General	147
7.1.2	Content of the Regulations	147
7.1.3	Legislative standards	149
7.1.3.1	Implementation and harmonisation	149

7.1.3.2	Observance of human rights, including non-discrimination	150
7.1.3.3	Observance of applicable international and national law	150
7.1.4	Overview	151
7.2	Implementation of the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control	152
7.2.1	General	152
7.2.2	Content of the Convention	153
7.2.3	Legislative standards	154
7.2.3.1	Implementation, 'guiding principles' and harmonisation	154
7.2.3.2	Observance of applicable international and national law	155
7.2.3.3	Compliance and enforcement	157
7.2.3.4	Participation of stakeholders	158
7.2.3.5	Monitoring and evaluation of measures	159
7.2.4	Overview	160
8	LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW	161
8.1	Implementation of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species	161
8.1.1	General	161
8.1.2	Content of the Convention	162
8.1.3	Legislative standards	163
8.1.3.1	Implementation and harmonisation	163
8.1.3.2	Information to the public	164
8.1.3.3	Observance of applicable international and national law	164
8.1.3.4	Enforcement	165
8.1.4	Overview	166
8.2	Implementation of the Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and their Disposal	167
8.2.1	General	167
8.2.2	Content of the Convention	168
8.2.3	Legislative standards	171
8.2.3.1	Implementation and minimum requirements	171
8.2.3.2	Observance of applicable international and national law	171
8.2.3.3	Enforcement	173
8.2.4	Overview	174
9	LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AS PART OF INTERNATIONAL LABOUR LAW	175
9.1	Implementation of the Maritime Labour Convention	175

9.1.1	General	175
9.1.2	Content of the Convention	176
9.1.3	Legislative standards	178
9.1.3.1	Implementation, harmonisation and flexibility	178
9.1.3.2	Observance of specified human rights	179
9.1.3.3	Observance of applicable international and national law	180
9.1.3.4	Compliance and enforcement	181
9.1.3.5	Prohibition of favourable treatment of third states	183
9.1.4	Overview	183
9.2	Implementation of the Convention concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers	184
9.2.1	General	184
9.2.2	Content of the Convention	185
9.2.3	Legislative standards	186
9.2.3.1	Implementation and harmonisation	186
9.2.3.2	Observance of applicable international and national law	188
9.2.3.3	Remedies, complaint mechanisms, monitoring of compliance and enforcement	189
9.2.3.4	Non-discrimination	190
9.2.3.5	Consultation with stakeholders	191
9.2.3.6	Information to employers and domestic workers	191
9.2.4	Overview	192
	CONCLUSION TO PART II	193
PART III	ASSESSMENT OF LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	195
	INTRODUCTION TO PART III	195
10	METHODS OF HARMONISATION AND LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW: COMMON FEATURES	197
10.1	Introduction	197
10.2	Methods of harmonisation under international law	198
10.2.1	Harmonisation	198
10.2.2	Harmonisation through minimum requirements	200
10.2.3	Other methods of harmonisation	203
10.2.3.1	Optional provisions	203
10.2.3.2	Language	205
10.2.3.3	Equivalent measures	206

10.3	Legislative standards	208
10.3.1	Introduction	208
10.3.2	Effectiveness	209
10.3.2.1	Effectiveness under the selected international legal regimes	209
10.3.2.2	Effectiveness in the context of treaty interpretation under general international law	213
10.3.3	Subsidiary elements of effectiveness	215
10.3.3.1	Legal certainty	215
10.3.3.2	Observance of applicable international and national law	220
10.3.3.3	Consultation with stakeholders	223
10.3.3.4	Provision of information concerning legislation	225
10.3.3.5	Monitoring of compliance	226
10.3.3.6	Enforcement	227
10.3.3.7	Remedies	229
10.3.3.8	Ex post evaluation of legislation	233
10.3.4	Conclusion	234
10.4	Binding character of legislative standards	235
10.5	Conclusion	237
11	LEGISLATIVE STANDARDS AND THE QUALITY OF IMPLEMENTING LEGISLATION	239
11.1	Introduction	239
11.2	National approaches to the quality of implementing legislation	239
11.2.1	Introduction	239
11.2.2	The Netherlands	240
11.2.2.1	General policy on the quality of legislation, including implementing legislation	240
11.2.2.2	Specific legislative standards applicable to legislation to implement EU instruments	244
11.2.2.3	Specific legislative standards applicable to legislation to implement non-EU international instruments	245
11.2.3	The United Kingdom	246
11.2.3.1	General policy on the quality of legislation, including implementing legislation	246
11.2.3.2	Specific legislative standards applicable to legislation to implement EU instruments	251
11.2.3.3	Specific legislative standards applicable to legislation to implement non-EU international instruments	252

11.2.4 Conclusion	253
11.3 International approaches to the quality of implementing legislation	254
11.3.1 Introduction	254
11.3.2 Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development	254
11.3.3 European Union	257
11.3.4 Conclusion	263
11.4 The quality of implementing legislation: common ground?	263
11.4.1 Introduction	263
11.4.2 Regulatory quality and legislative quality: a matter of perspective	264
11.4.3 Defining the quality of implementing legislation	267
11.4.4 Legislative quality and legislative standards	270
11.4.5 Conclusion	274
11.5 Conclusion	274
12 QUALITY STANDARDS PERTAINING TO IMPLEMENTING LEGISLATION AND INTERNATIONAL LEGAL PRACTICE: A GAP TO BRIDGE?	277
12.1 Introduction	277
12.2 Quality standards pertaining to implementing legislation and international legal practice: a comparison	278
12.2.1 Scope of the regulation of national implementing legislation	278
12.2.2 Character of the regulation of national implementing legislation	279
12.2.3 Substance of the regulation of national implementing legislation	279
12.3 A gap to bridge?	282
12.4 Conclusion	286
13 CONCLUSIONS	287
13.1 The research questions revisited	287
13.2 The gap to bridge	292
13.3 The international pursuit of high quality implementing legislation	293
SOURCES AND LITERATURE	295
SUMMARY IN DUTCH	321
CURRICULUM VITAE	329

List of abbreviations

CAT	Convention against Torture
CCTMW	Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and their Disposal
CDWDW	Convention concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CFR	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU
ChUN	Charter of the United Nations
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CPPCG	Convention for the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide
CTOC	Convention against Transnational Organised Crime
EC	European Commission
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
FCTC	Framework Convention on Tobacco Control
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organisation
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICSFT	International Convention for the Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IHR	International Health Regulations
ILC	International Law Commission
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMF	International Monetary Fund
LoN	League of Nations
MLC	Maritime Labour Convention
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations

UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
VCCR	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WHO	World Health Organisation
WMO	World Meteorological Organisation