



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

A catalyst for justice? The International Criminal Court in Uganda, Kenya, and the Democratic Republic of Congo
De Vos, C.M.

Citation

De Vos, C. M. (2016, March 16). *A catalyst for justice? The International Criminal Court in Uganda, Kenya, and the Democratic Republic of Congo*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/38562>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/38562>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/38562> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: De Vos, Christian Michael

Title: A catalyst for justice? The International Criminal Court in Uganda, Kenya, and the Democratic Republic of Congo

Issue Date: 2016-03-16

A Catalyst for Justice?

The International Criminal Court in
Uganda, Kenya, and the
Democratic Republic of Congo

Christian Michael De Vos

A Catalyst for Justice?

The International Criminal Court in Uganda, Kenya, and the Democratic Republic of Congo

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 16 maart 2016
klokke 10.00 uur

door

Christian Michael De Vos

geboren te Weymouth, MA, USA
in 1978

Promotores: Prof. dr. C. Stahn
Prof. dr. L.J. van den Herik

Promotiecommissie: Prof. W.A. Schabas
Prof. dr. H. Duffy
Dr. R. W. Heinsch
Prof. dr. H.G. van der Wilt (University of Amsterdam)
Prof. dr. M.A. Drumbl (Washington and Lee University School of
Law, Lexington, USA)

For J.D.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This thesis is the product of many hands and minds, for which I owe many thanks. First and foremost, I wish to acknowledge my interlocutors – in Kenya, Uganda, the Democratic Republic of Congo, and The Hague – without whose time and assistance this research would not have been possible.

I am grateful to my two supervisors – Professor Carsten Stahn and Professor Larissa van den Herik – whose foresight that the work of the ICC should be explored more deeply outside the confines of The Hague helped give this project life. I am likewise grateful to the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO), which provided generous financial support.

Colleagues and friends have been pillars of support. In particular, this work has benefited immeasurably from a conversation and friendship that began (and continues) with Sara Kendall more than five years ago. Jennifer Easterday and Marieke Wierda have also been valued interlocutors and I am grateful to them, as well as to other Grotius Centre colleagues who helped make my experience in The Hague memorable.

The Open Society Justice Initiative, my new professional home, has supported my efforts to complete this work. Particular thanks are owed to Betsy Apple who patiently supported my extended juggling act, as well as to Tracey Gurd and James Goldston. Alpha Sesay and Eric Witte also shared documents and contacts generously, both before and during my time at the Justice Initiative.

I am indebted to a number of individuals whose insights and facilitation of contacts or documents helped this dissertation become what it is. My thanks to Phil Clark, Judy Gitau, Maria Kamara, Pascal Kambale, George Kegoro, Patryk Labuda, Njonjo Mue, Sarah Nouwen, Stephen Oola, Rod Rastan, Chandra Lekha Sriram, Ruti Teitel, Muthoni Wanyeki, and Marcel Wetsh'okonda Koso.

This work would of course not be possible without the love and support of my parents. They raised me to believe that social justice is part of our work here on earth, but they also encouraged me to ask questions. I am grateful for their example. I am also fortunate to have been supported by a wonderful family of choice: the Baims, the Beckers, the Lances, and the Dunlaps.

My greatest debt is to Abigail, who gave me the courage to take this leap and the gift of walking it together. Every thought reflected in these pages is a tribute to her fine mind, her generous heart, and her unwavering support.

I dedicate this dissertation to John Daniel, a dear friend and mentor now departed. John was a transformative educator who devoted his life to fighting the crime against humanity that was South African apartheid. He knew all too well the dangers of the law and the limits of its institutions, but he also believed in their possibilities. It is in the memory of John's generous spirit and his commitment to engaged critique that this work is offered.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	7
Table of Contents	9
List of Abbreviations	13
Prologue	15
1. Uganda: “We Have to Look like We Are Doing Something”	16
2. Democratic Republic of Congo: <i>la poursuite de la pérennité</i>	16
3. Kenya: “One Long Game”	17
Chapter One / Introduction	19
1. Research Aim, Problem Statement, and Research Questions	19
2. Framing the ICC as a Catalyst	20
3. Complementarity as a Catalyst for Compliance	22
4. Structure	26
5. Terms, Methodology, and Country Selection	29
Chapter Two / Tracing an Idea, Building a Norm: Complementarity as a Catalyst	33
1. Complementarity as Constraint	34
1.1 The International Law Commission: 1990-1994	35
1.2 The Ad Hoc and Preparatory Committees: 1995-1998	36
1.3 The Rome Statute: Article 17 and the Substance of the Complementarity Principle	38
2. From Constraint to Catalyst: The Evolution of Complementarity	40
2.1 Early ICC Policy: The Office of the Prosecutor	41
2.2 Emergent Theories: Cooperation and Coercion	42
2.2.1 Cooperation	43
2.2.2 Coercion	46
2.3 A Catalyst for Compliance: The Duties of Complementarity?	48
3. Networks and the Social Production of a (New) Norm	53
3.1 Norm Entrepreneurs	54
3.2 Transnational Networks	55
4. Conclusion	57
Chapter Three / Mirror Images: Complementarity in the Courtroom	59
1. Complementarity as Admissibility Rule	60
1.1 “Same Case” Test: Person, Conduct, and Incident?	60
1.2 Timing of Admissibility Challenges	66
1.3 Evidentiary Thresholds	68
1.4 Due Process: Domestic Legal Systems on Trial	72
2. Positive Complementarity in the Courtroom	74
3. Complementarity as Policy and Law	77
4. Conclusion	79
Chapter Four / Complementarity and the Office of the Prosecutor	81
1. Structure of the Office of the Prosecutor	83
2. Preliminary Examinations	85
2.1 Legal Framework	85
2.2 Relationship to Complementarity	88
2.3 Preliminary Examinations in Practice: A Case Study of Kenya	90

2.3.1	Special Tribunal for Kenya: January 2008-February 2009	91
2.3.2	Subsequent Efforts: March-November 2009	94
2.3.3	Catalytic Effect? The Kenyan Examination Reconsidered	95
3.	Investigations	98
3.1	OTP Framework	98
3.2	Investigating from Afar	99
3.2.1	Limited Field Presence	99
3.2.2	Absence of National Investigators	102
3.2.3	Intermediaries: Quasi-Investigators?	104
4.	Linking Preliminary Examinations and Investigations	106
5.	Conclusion	108
Chapter Five / Competing, Complementing, Copying: Domestic Courts and Complementarity		111
1.	Uganda	112
1.1	Complementarity as Coercion: The ICC and Juba	112
1.2	International Crimes Division	115
1.3	Shifts in Complementarity	116
2.	Kenya	117
2.1	From Special Tribunal to Special Division	117
2.2	Proposed Structure	118
2.3	From Coercing to Complementing	120
3.	Democratic Republic of Congo	120
3.1	Complementarity as Cooperation	121
3.2	Special Chambers/Court	123
3.3	Military/Mobile Courts	127
4.	Three Concerns	130
4.1	Special Courts for Special Crimes?	131
4.1.1	DRC	132
4.1.2	Uganda	134
4.2	Mimicry and “International Standards”	136
4.3	<i>Uganda v. Thomas Kwoyelo</i> : Complementarity and State Power	139
4.3.1	Procedural History	139
4.3.2	Hijacked Justice?	141
5.	Conclusion	142
Chapter Six / Implementation and Domestic Politics		145
1.	Implementation, Standardization and Compliance	147
2.	Implementation in Practice: Uganda and Kenya	151
2.1	Uganda: The ICC’s Host State	151
2.2	Kenya: “Becoming a Global Village”	155
3.	Surfacing Political Discomforts: Post-Implementation Domestic Politics	157
3.1	Uganda: The End of Amnesty?	157
3.2	Kenya: A Return to the Political	160
4.	Democratic Republic of Congo: Resistance and Contestation	161
5.	Implementation Reconsidered	166
5.1	Implementation as Purity	166
5.2	Implementation as Politics	167
5.3	Implementation as “Performance”	168
6.	Conclusion	169

Chapter Seven / Conclusions	171
1. Reassessing Complementarity as a Catalyst	171
2. Ways Forward	174
2.1 Beyond Compliance	174
2.2 Towards a Place-Based Court	175
2.3 Defining Deference	176
2.4 Geographies of Justice	179
2.5 Promoting Pluralism	180
2.6 From Management to Modesty	182
3. Epilogue: <i>Une belle époque?</i>	182
Samenvatting	185
Bibliography	193
Curriculum Vitae	231

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

A&R	Accountability and Reconciliation Agreement (Uganda)
ASP	Assembly of States Parties
CICC	Coalition for the International Criminal Court
CIPEV	Commission of Inquiry on Post-Election Violence (Kenya)
CMJ	<i>Comité Mixte de Justice</i> (DRC)
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
FPA	Final Peace Agreement (Uganda)
HRW	Human Rights Watch
ICA	International Crimes Act (Kenya 2008)
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICC Act	International Criminal Court Act (Uganda 2010)
ICD	International Crimes Division (Uganda and Kenya)
I-CD	Inter-Congolese Dialogue
ICL	International Criminal Law
ICTJ	International Center for Transitional Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
JCCD	Jurisdiction, Complementarity and Cooperation Division
JLOS	Justice Law and Order Sector (Uganda)
JSC	Judicial Services Commission (Kenya)
KNHRC	Kenya National Human Rights Commission
KPTJ	Kenyans for Peace with Truth and Justice
LRA	Lord's Resistance Army
NILD	National Implementing Legislation Database
ODM	Orange Democratic Movement
OTP	Office of the Prosecutor
PAJ	Political, Administrative and Judicial Committee (DRC)
PE	Preliminary Examination
PEV	Post-Election Violence
PGA	Parliamentarians for Global Action
PTC	Pre-Trial Chamber (ICC)
STK	Special Tribunal for Kenya
TC	Trial Chamber (ICC)
UPDF	Uganda People's Defense Force
UVF	Uganda Victims Foundation
VRWG	Victims Rights Working Group
WCD	War Crimes Division (Uganda)

