



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The development of the Proto-Indo-European syllabic liquids in Greek
Beek, L.C. van

Citation

Beek, L. C. van. (2013, December 17). *The development of the Proto-Indo-European syllabic liquids in Greek*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/22881>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/22881>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/22881> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Beek, Lucien van

Title: The development of the Proto-Indo-European syllabic liquids in Greek

Issue Date: 2013-12-17

The development of the Proto-Indo-European syllabic liquids in Greek

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,

op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,

volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

te verdedigen op dinsdag 17 december 2013

klokke 13:45 uur

door

Lucien Christiaan van Beek

geboren te Delft

in 1979

Promotiecommissie

Promotor: Prof. dr. A.M. Lubotsky

Overige leden: Prof. dr. F.H.H. Kortlandt
Prof. dr. Ch. de Lamberterie (École Pratique des Hautes Études, Parijs)
Prof. dr. I. Sluiter

Het onderzoek dat geleid heeft tot dit proefschrift werd financieel mogelijk gemaakt door NWO.

Table of contents

Preface9
Abbreviations and conventions	...11
Languages and sources	...11
Symbols	...11
Grammatical abbreviations	...12
Greek authors	...12
Translations	...12
1. Introduction	...13
1.1 The Greek reflexes of * <i>r</i> and * <i>l</i> : the problem and its relevance	...13
1.1.1 A brief summary of previous accounts	...13
1.1.2 Research questions and hypotheses	...16
1.2 Environments with Pan-Greek or Proto-Greek <i>αρ, αλ</i>	...17
1.2.1 * <i>r</i> and * <i>l</i> in front of a glide	...17
1.2.2 Word-initial * <i>r</i> and * <i>l</i>	...19
1.2.3 Word-final * <i>r</i> and * <i>l</i>	...20
1.2.4 * <i>r</i> and * <i>l</i> in front of a nasal	...21
1.2.5 Conclusion on early <i>a</i> -anaptyxis	...22
1.3 The <i>o</i> -colored reflexes	...22
1.3.1 Which dialects have a regular <i>o</i> -colored reflex?	...23
1.3.2 The <i>o</i> -colored reflex of the syllabic nasals	...24
1.4 Previous explanations of - <i>ρα</i> - versus - <i>αρ</i> - in Ionic-Attic	...26
1.4.1 Accent-conditioned development	...28
1.4.2 Liquid metathesis	...28
1.4.3 Secondary ablaut <i>TeRT-</i> : <i>TaRT-</i>	...29
1.4.4 Conditioning by neighboring consonant clusters	...30
1.5 A metrical explanation for - <i>ρα</i> -	...32
1.6 Outlook	...34
2. The Mycenaean reflex of *<i>r</i> and the numeral ‘four’	...35
2.1. The color of the anaptyctic vowel in Mycenaean	...35
2.2 Syllabic <i>r</i> in Mycenaean?	...38
2.2.1 Heubeck’s argument for the preservation of <i>r</i> in Mycenaean	...39
2.3 The Mycenaean evidence	...42
2.3.1 Examples deserving consideration	...43
2.3.2 Doubtful and irrelevant examples	...45
2.4 Previous explanations of <i>qe-to-ro-po-pi</i> versus <i>to-pe-za</i>	...48
2.4.1 Liquid metathesis	...48
2.4.2 Ruijgh’s analogical explanation of <i>to-pe-za</i>	...49
2.4.3 Klingenschmitt’s accent-conditioned explanation	...49
2.5 Ion.-Att. τέταρτος and the reduction of *- <i>tw</i> -	...51
2.6 Analogical explanation of τετρα-, <i>qe-to-ro</i> °, and τέταρτος	...55
2.7 Conclusions regarding Mycenaean	...57

3. Reflexes of *r̥ in the Alphanumeric Greek dialects	...58
3.1 Introduction	...58
3.2 The alleged Cretan liquid metathesis	...58
3.2.1 Cretan -αρ- < *r̥: evidence and counterevidence	...60
3.2.2 Cretan -ορ- < *r̥ after a labial consonant	...61
3.3 Other West Greek dialects	...63
3.3.1 Laconian and colonies	...63
3.3.2 The literary Doric evidence	...65
3.3.3 Elis	...65
3.3.4 Conclusion for West Greek	...66
3.4 The Aeolic dialects	...67
3.4.1 The numerals in the Aeolic dialects	...67
3.4.2 Epigraphic evidence (Boeotian, Thessalian, Lesbian)	...68
3.4.3 The relation between Lesbian poetry and Ionic Epic	...69
3.4.4 Evidence for <i>o</i> -vocalism in literary Lesbian	...71
3.4.5 Evidence for <i>a</i> -vocalism in literary Lesbian	...72
3.4.6 Evidence for Aeolic <i>o</i> -vocalism from lexicographical sources	...73
3.4.7 Conclusion for the Aeolic dialects	...74
3.5 Arcado-Cyprian	...75
3.5.1 Cyprian: evidence for <i>o</i> -vocalism	...75
3.5.2 Cyprian: evidence for <i>a</i> -vocalism	...77
3.5.3 Arcadian: evidence for <i>o</i> -vocalism	...77
3.5.4 Arcadian: evidence for <i>a</i> -vocalism	...79
3.5.5 Conclusions for Arcado-Cyprian and Achaean	...79
3.6 Pamphylian	...80
3.7 Conclusions	...81
4. Reflexes of *r̥ and *l̥ in Caland formations	...82
4.1 The root ablaut of Caland formations in Greek and PIE	...82
4.1.1 <i>u</i> -stem adjectives	...83
4.1.2 Adjectives in -ρό-	...85
4.1.3 Primary comparatives and superlatives	...86
4.1.4 Compounding first members	...87
4.1.5 Adverbs in -α	...88
4.1.6 <i>s</i> -stems nouns and adjectives	...89
4.2 Analogical restoration and replacement	...90
4.2.1 The spread of <i>a</i> -vocalism across Caland formations	...90
4.2.2 The avoidance and replacement of <i>u</i> -stem adjectives in Homer	...93
4.2.3 Derivational history of the factitives in -ύνω	...97
4.3 Reflexes of *r̥ and *l̥ in the <i>u</i> -stem adjectives	...99
4.3.1 *r̥ > αρ is regular in ταρφέες	..100
4.3.2 Derivation of Hom. τραφερός	..101
4.4 The <i>u</i> -stem adjectives of the structure *CLaC- <i>u</i> -	..103
4.4.1 πλατύς	..104
4.4.2 κρατύς	..104
4.4.3 βραχύς	..104
4.4.4 βραδύς	..105
4.4.5 *βλαδύς and ἀμαλδύνω	..106
4.5 θρασύς and θαρσύνω	..109
4.5.1 The roots θρασ- and θαρσ- in Homeric Greek	..109

4.5.2 The roots θρασ- and θαρσ- in Classical Greek	..111
4.5.3 Reconstruction	..114
4.6 Conclusions	..115
5. κράτος, κρατερός and related forms in Epic and Classical Greek	..117
5.1 Derivational history, semantics, etymology	..117
5.1.1 Derivational history	..117
5.1.2 The competing etymologies	..118
5.1.3 The semantics of καρτερός ~ κρατερός in Epic Greek	..120
5.1.4 Reconstruction of the semantic developments	..124
5.2 The allomorphy of κρατ- and καρτ- in Homer and Classical Greek	..126
5.2.1 The non-Ionic-Attic reflexes	..126
5.2.2 Synchronic description of the forms attested in Classical prose	..128
5.2.3 Synchronic description of the forms attested in Homeric Greek	..130
5.2.4 καρτερός and κρατερός in Homer	..131
5.2.5 The <i>s</i> -stem forms and derivations in Homer	..132
5.2.6 The forms of comparison in Homer	..135
5.2.7 κρατύς and καρτύνω in Homer	..138
5.2.8 κάρτα	..139
5.2.9 From Proto-Ionic to Classical Ionic-Attic	..140
5.2.10 The reconstruction of κραταιός and κραται-	..143
5.2.11 κραταιίς, Κράταιϊς	..149
5.3 A new etymology for καρτερός	..151
5.3.1 Vedic <i>śithirá-</i> ‘loose’, <i>śrath-</i> ‘to loosen’	..151
5.3.2 The origin and spread of the suffix -ερό- within Greek	..155
5.4 Conclusions for the vocalization of * <i>r</i>	..157
6. The Epic reflex -ρα- and the origin of the <i>McL</i> licence in Homer	..158
6.1 The reflex -ρα- and the metrical behavior of κραδίη	..158
6.2 <i>Muta cum liquida</i> scansions in Homer	..161
6.3 Wathelet’s proposal for the origin of <i>McL</i> scansions	..163
6.4 Criticism of Wathelet’s scenario	..165
6.5 The avoidance of <i>McL</i> scansion in Epic Greek	..168
6.6 Epic * <i>r</i> : -ρα- is the regular reflex of artificially retained * <i>r</i>	..171
6.7 The evidence for -ρα- from Epic * <i>r</i>	..175
6.7.1 δράκων	..175
6.7.2 κραδίη	..175
6.7.3 κραταιός, κραταιίς, Κράταιϊς, κραται-	..176
6.7.4 τέτρατος	..176
6.7.5 τραπέιομεν	..177
6.7.6 τράπεζα	..178
6.7.7 στρατός	..179
6.7.8 θρασειάων	..182
6.7.9 τραπέσθαι	..183
6.8 Uncertain evidence for Epic * <i>r</i>	..186
6.8.1 κραδαίνω and κραδάω	..186
6.8.2 κρατευταί	..186
6.8.3 κράνεια	..187
6.8.4 βραχίων	..188
6.9 Homeric nonce formations with -ρα-	..189

6.10 <i>McL</i> scansion in words continuing * <i>l</i> ?	..190
6.11 Conclusions	..190
7. Epic forms with -ρο-	..192
7.1 The dialectal origin of forms with -ρο-	..192
7.2 -ρο- as a conditioned reflex of Epic * <i>r</i>	..194
7.2.1 The metrical evidence for βροτός	..195
7.2.2 ἀσπίδος ἀμφιβρότης and the compounds in -(μ)βροτος	..197
7.2.3 ἄμβροτος, ἀμβρόσιος and νῦξ ἀβρότη	..199
7.2.4 ἀβροτάξομεν and ἤμβροτον beside ἀμαρτεῖν	..200
7.2.5 πρὸς, πρόσω and πρόσωπον	..201
7.2.6 προκείμενα	..205
7.2.7 Ἀφροδίτη	..205
7.2.8 ῥόδον, ῥοδόεντ- ~ <i>Myc. wo-do-we</i>	..208
7.3 Other forms with -ρο-	..209
7.3.1 ἀνδροτήτα	..209
7.3.2 Ἐνυαλίῳ Ἀνδρεϊφόντη	..214
7.3.3 Other Homeric forms with ἀνδρο- and ἀνδρα-	..216
7.3.4 θρόνος	..218
7.3.5 The Homeric attestations of θρόνος	..220
7.3.6 The compounds in -θρονος	..222
7.3.7 Κρόνος	..224
7.3.8 Κρονίων	..226
7.3.9 κροαίνω	..228
7.4 Conclusions	..229
8. The reflexes -αρ- and -ρα- in the thematic aorist	..231
8.1 Introduction	..231
8.2 The regular development * <i>r</i> > -αρ- in the thematic aorist	..232
8.2.1 ἔδραθον, κατέδαρθον, and καταδαρθάνω	..232
8.2.2 ἀμαρτάνω, aor. ἤμαρτον, ἤμβροτον	..233
8.2.3 Hom. ταρπώμεθα	..234
8.3 The pattern of attestation of the thematic aorists with -ρα-	..236
8.3.1 δέρκομαι, ἔδρακον, δέδορκα	..237
8.3.2 ἔπαρδον, ἔπραδες	..238
8.3.3 πέρθω, ἔπραθον	..239
8.3.4 Conclusion	..240
8.4 Epic * <i>r</i> in the thematic aorist	..240
8.4.1 The metrical behavior of thematic aorists with -ρα-	..241
8.4.2 The origin of -ρα- in ἔδρακον, ἔδραθον, ἔπραθον	..242
8.5 Pindaric δρακέντ-	..245
8.6 Conclusions	..247
9. Remaining evidence for αρ and ρα	..249
9.1 The development of *- <i>r</i> s- in Ionic-Attic	..249
9.1.1 The development of *- <i>ŕ</i> sV-	..250
9.1.2 Retained -σ- from *- <i>r</i> s-: regular or analogical?	..251
9.1.3 The Dp. in -Cράσι	..253
9.1.4 γράσος and γράω	..253
9.1.5 ταρσός and τρασιά, ταρσιή	..255

9.1.6 τρήρων	..257
9.1.7 Uncertain and irrelevant evidence for -αρσ- and -ρασ-	..258
9.1.8 Conclusions on *-r̥s-	..259
9.1.9 Excursus: Attic πόρρω	..260
9.2 Verbs with a non-ablauting root <i>CLaC-</i>	..261
9.2.1 δράσσομαι and δραχμή	..261
9.2.2 γράφω	..263
9.2.3 φράσσω	..265
9.2.4 Conclusion	..270
9.3 Word-final *-r̥	..270
9.3.1 ἄορ and ἤτορ	..271
9.3.2 *-r̥ > -αρ in Ionic: chronology	..272
9.3.3 ὑπόδρα and other instances of -ρα	..273
9.4 Uncertain evidence for -αρ- and -ρα-	..276
9.4.1 Ambiguous or unconvincing evidence	..276
9.4.2 Irrelevant words; untenable and doubtful etymologies	..281
9.5 The development of *-r̥n-	..286
9.6 Evidence for -αρ- < *-r̥ in isolated nominal formations	..288
10. The reflex of *l̥ in Ionic-Attic and in the other dialects	..290
10.1 Unknown, doubtful, or uncertain etymologies	..290
10.2 Cases of -λα- and -αλ- influenced by a full grade form	..293
10.3 The pre-form did not necessarily contain *l̥	..295
10.3.1 βλάβομαι, βλάπτω	..295
10.3.2 διπλάσιος	..299
10.3.3 λαγαρός and λάγνος	..300
10.4 Possible cases of *l̥ > -λα-	..300
10.4.1 βλαδεῖς	..300
10.4.2 βλαστός	..301
10.4.3 γάλα, γλακτοφάγος, γλάγος	..301
10.4.4 γλαφυρός	..303
10.5 The development of *l̥n	..305
10.5.1 καλλι-, περι-καλλής	..307
10.5.2 ἀλής, Hom. ἀολλέες	..308
10.6 Dialectal evidence	..310
10.7 Conclusions	..311
11. Remarks on relative chronology	..313
11.1 A Proto-Ionic development	..313
11.2 The late, but pre-Homeric elimination of Epic *r̥	..314
11.3 Relative chronology: other sound changes	..316
11.3.1 φιλότητι τραπέιομεν εὐνηθέντε and the etymology of εὐνή	..316
11.3.2 The formula φιλότητι _T τραπέιομεν εὐνηθέντε	..319
11.3.3 The creation of ἀνδροτήτα καὶ ἦβη	..320
11.4 The prehistory of Epic Greek	..322
11.5 Conclusions	..323
12. Conclusion	..324
12.1 The reflex of word-internal *r̥ in Ionic-Attic and Epic Greek	..324
12.2 The dialectal reflexes of word-internal *r̥	..328

12.3 Remaining issues	..329
Bibliography	..331
General bibliography	..331
Abbreviations of handbooks and dictionaries	..341
Abbreviations of epigraphic corpora	..342
Editions and commentaries	..342
Online resources	..343
Samenvatting in het Nederlands	..344
Curriculum Vitae	..346

Preface

This dissertation is the result of a project titled “Proto-Greek: a reconstruction” funded by NWO (Organisatie voor Nederlands Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek) within the program “Toptalent”. The research was carried out within LUCL (Leiden University Centre for Linguistics) under the supervision of Prof. A. Lubotsky. Originally, the main objective of the project was to establish a relative chronology for the sound changes that took place from Proto-Indo-European, via Proto-Greek, down to the various dialects of Ancient Greek. In the initial stages of the project, I focused on the various waves of palatalizations that took place in the second millennium BC. In the course of my research, however, it gradually became clear that the vocalization of the syllabic liquids was one of the most crucial sound developments: not only for issues of relative chronology, but also for the prehistoric genesis of the four main dialect groups of Alphabetic Greek. When a new solution for the problematic double reflex of **r* started to present itself, I decided to devote the entire dissertation to this topic.

The bold hypothesis underlying this thesis is that *-αρ-*, not *-ρα-*, is the regular reflex of word-internal **r* in Ionic-Attic. The idea first took shape in a rudimentary way when I realized that two seemingly independent metrical peculiarities of Homeric Greek had to be related. In view of Wathelet’s article (1966) on the origin of *muta cum liquida* scansion in Homeric words like δράκων and βροτός, it seemed logical to view not only their aberrant scansion, but also the outcomes *-ρα-* and *-ρο-* themselves, as a trace of the pre-forms with **r*. It also appeared that the word κραδίη is hardly ever preceded by a short vowel in Homer, whereas other words of the same metrical structure make abundant use of this possibility, as discovered by Hoenigswald (e.g. 1991). In combination, these two peculiarities suggested that **r* had been preserved until not very long before Homer. Along with the novel hypothesis came a large number of problems: all Ionic-Attic forms with *-ρα-* had to be accounted for, and the evidence from all other Greek dialects had to be re-examined. Whether the solutions proposed here are correct or not, they would not have been found without the conviction that Wathelet’s explanation of the Homeric *muta cum liquida* licence somehow had to be correct.

As the title suggests, this dissertation is primarily a work about historical phonology, but this is, I hope, not its only contribution. The solution proposed here for the development of **r* entails a new view on the relation between Epic Greek and the vernacular. The elaboration of the consequences for the prehistory of Epic Greek and for the synchronic understanding of Homer, however, must be left for another occasion.

I am grateful to the support staff of LUCL, in particular to the Institute Manager Gea Hakker, for help and support in practical matters. Furthermore, I would like to express my gratitude to the board of OIKOS (Netherlands Research School for Classical Studies) for kindly allowing me to follow part of their PhD program, including the 2010 Masterclass in Athens. I have learned a lot from my teachers at the Indo-European department of Leiden University: Rob Beekes, Frits Kortlandt, Sasha Lubotsky, Michiel de Vaan, Alwin Kloekhorst, Guus Kroonen, Michaël Peyrot; among those at the Classics department, I would like to mention Casper de Jonge and Adriaan Rademaker in particular. I am grateful to Frits Kortlandt for having encouraged me right from the start and for commenting on earlier versions of several chapters. During conferences and Summer Schools, I have learned much from discussions with colleagues and fellow students, of whom Jesse Lundquist deserves particular mention. Finally, I profited from the broad knowledge of Karl Praust and of Velizar Sadovski, who both stayed in Leiden as visiting scholars and discussed various topics from my work with me.

Working on this dissertation would not have been quite the same if it had not been for my friends and colleagues. My thoughts go out in the first place to Alwin, with whom I have shared an office for five years; to Michaël, Guus, and Tijmen: after you left Leiden, lunches simply have not been the way they used to be; and to Casper, for being an academic tutor right from the start. Finally, I thank my wife Annelies for her loving support and care: she alone knows how much time I spent working on this book, rather than with her.

Leiden, November 2013

Abbreviations and conventions

Languages and sources:

Aeol.	Aeolic	Lyc.	Lycian
Alb.	Albanian	MHG	Middle High German
Arc.	Arcadian	Mo-	Modern
Arc.-Cypr.	Arcado-Cyprian	MoE.	Modern English (but E. = Euripides)
Arm.	Armenian	ms(s).	manuscript(s)
Att.	Attic	Myc.	Mycenaean
Av.	Avestan	NWGr.	North West Greek
Boeot.	Boeotian	O-	Old-
c.	century	OHG	Old High German
Class.	Classical	ON	Old Norse
Cret.	Cretan	OP	Old Persian
CS	Church Slavic	P-	Proto-
Cypr.	Cyprian	Pamph.	Pamphylian
Cz.	Czech	PCelt.	Proto-Celtic
Dor.	Doric	PGr.	Proto-Greek
Du.	Dutch	Phryg.	Phrygian
Fr.	French	Pion.	Proto-Ionic (= Proto-Ionic-Attic)
G.	German	PIE	Proto-Indo-European
Gm.	Germanic	Ru.	Russian
Goth.	Gothic	RV	Rigveda
Gr.	Greek	SCr.	Serbo-Croatian
Hitt.	Hittite	Skt.	Sanskrit
Hom.	Homer	Sl.	Slavic
Ilr.	Indo-Iranian	Slov.	Slovene
Ion.-Att.	Ionic-Attic	Thess.	Thessalian
inscr.	epigraphic	Toch.	Tocharian
Ir.	Irish	Ved.	Vedic Sanskrit
It.	Italic	W.	Welsh
Ital.	Italian	WGr.	West Greek
Lat.	Latin	YAv.	Young(er) Avestan
Latv.	Latvian		
Lesb.	Lesbian		
Lith.	Lithuanian		

Symbols:

*	reconstructed form	C	consonant
<	developed from	H	laryngeal
>	developed into	L	liquid
<<	analogically developed from	N	nasal
>>	analogically developed into	R	resonant
←	was derived from	V	vowel

|_P penthemimeral caesura

|_T trochaic caesura

|_H hephthemimeral caesura

|_B bucolic diaeresis

Grammatical abbreviations:

1/2/3	1 st , 2 nd , 3 rd person	mg.	meaning
A	accusative	mid.	middle
act.	active	msc.	masculine
adj.	adjective	N	nominative
adv.	adverb	ntr.	neuter
aor.	aorist	opt.	optative
athem.	athematic	p.	plural
comp.	comparative	pass.	passive
D	dative	pf.	perfect
denom.	denominative	PN	personal name
du.	dual	prep.	preposition
fem.	feminine	pres.	present
fut.	future	pret.	preterite
HN	hydronym	ptc.	participle
I	instrumental	red.	reduplicated
impf.	imperfect	s.	singular
impv.	imperative	subj.	subjunctive
ind.	indicative	superl.	superlative
inf.	infinitive	them.	thematic
inj.	injunctive	TN	toponym
intr.	intransitive	tr.	transitive
L	locative		

Greek authors: I have generally followed the abbreviations of Greek authors and their works that are used in *LSJ*, with the exception of *Ol.*, *Pyth.*, *Nem.*, and *Isthm.* (instead of *O.*, *P.*, *N.*, *I.*) for the works of Pindar.

Translations: I have provided my own translations of Greek passages, unless otherwise indicated. When using existing translations, I have generally used Wyatt's recent reworking of Murray's Loeb translation of Homer, and Race's translation of Pindar (also in the Loeb series). In all other cases, the source for the translation is made explicit in the text.