

The shadow continuum: testing the records continuum model through the Djogdja Documenten and the migrated archives

Karabinos, M.J.

#### Citation

Karabinos, M. J. (2015, June 17). *The shadow continuum : testing the records continuum model through the Djogdja Documenten and the migrated archives*. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/33293

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: License agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the

Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden

Downloaded from: <a href="https://hdl.handle.net/1887/33293">https://hdl.handle.net/1887/33293</a>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

## Cover Page



# Universiteit Leiden



The handle <a href="http://hdl.handle.net/1887/33293">http://hdl.handle.net/1887/33293</a> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Karabinos, Michael Joseph

Title: The shadow continuum: testing the records continuum model through the Djogdja

Documenten and the migrated archives

**Issue Date:** 2015-06-17

#### The Shadow Continuum:

# Testing the Records Continuum Model through the $\it Djogdja$ $\it Documenten$ and the Migrated Archives

#### Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
ter verdedigen op woensdag 17 Juni 2015
klokke 13.45

door

Michael Joseph Karabinos, M.S.L.S geboren te Langhorne, Verenigde Staten van Amerika in 1983

#### Promotiecommissie

Promotor:

Prof. dr. K.J.P.F.M. Jeurgens

Overige leden:

Prof. dr. R.E. Elson, Emeritus Professor of History of Southeast Asia, University of Queensland (Australia)

Prof. dr. F.C.J. Ketelaar, Emeritus Professor of Archival Science, Universiteit van Amsterdam

Prof. dr. D.E.F. Henley, Universiteit Leiden

dr. M. Banton, Senior Research Fellow, Institute of Commonwealth Studies, University of London (United Kingdom)

dr. F. Foscarini, Assistant Professor of Archival Science, Universiteit van Amsterdam

### **Table of Contents**

Table of Contents	iii
Acknowledgements	vii
Abstract	ix
Samenvatting	xi
Propositions	xiii
List of Principal Abbreviations	XV
Chapter I: Introduction	1
A: Origins	1
B. Research Question	2
C. Outline	3
D. Research Methods	4
E. Geographic Concentration and Definitions	5
F. Records Models	7
G. The Records Continuum	9
H. Limits to the Records Continuum Model	13
Chapter II: Missing and Seized Archives and the Shadow Continuum	17
Introduction	17
A. UNESCO, ICA, and International Practices	18
B. Types of Disputed Archival Claims	20
C. Bastian's Research in the US Virgin Islands	22
D. Lost Archives of Europe in the Second World War	26
E. The Second World War in Asia	29
F. Iraq and Other American Military Archival Claims	32
G. The Continuum Model and Access	34
H. The Shadow Continuum	36
I. The Case Studies	39
Conclusion	41
Chapter III: The Creation of the <i>Djogdja Documenten</i>	43
Introduction	43
A. Background on NEFIS	46
B. Situation in the Dutch East Indies after the Second World War	49
C. The <i>Djogdja Documenten</i> in Literature	50

D. Background on Seizure and Military Actions	53
E. Prior to Seizure	56
F. The Dutch Claims	58
G. Opium Trade	60
H. Communist Links	61
I. Insurgency	65
J. Response to Claims	66
Conclusion	67
Chapter IV: After the Transfer of Sovereignty and the Use of the Continuum	69
Introduction	69
A. Initial Attempts at Cooperation	70
B. Sukarno's Indonesia through Two Archivists	73
C. Guided Democracy and Konfrontasi	77
D. The New Order and Increase in Cooperation	80
E. The Work of Soemartini	82
F. Search for More Documents	87
G. The <i>Djogdja Documenten</i> through the Records Continuum Model	90
H. The <i>Djogdja Documenten</i> and the Shadow Continuum	93
Conclusion	94
Chapter V: Introduction to the Migrated Archives	95
Introduction	95
A. Decolonizing the Malay States	96
B. Introduction to the Migrated Archives	100
C. Literature Review	102
D. Anderson's Question of Conspiracy or Bungle	104
E. Bennett's View of the Military in Kenya	106
F. Elkins and Restorative Justice	107
G. Banton's Search for Evidence in Public Archives	109
H. Hampshire's Background on the Decision Making Process	110
I. Badger's Reassurance	113
J. More Recent Hanslope Park Disclosures	115
Conclusion	118
Chapter VI: Contextualizing the Migrated Archives	121
Introduction	121

A. The Contents	122
B. Role in Malayan Emergency	125
C. Role in Creation of Malaysia	129
D. Appraisal and Selection	132
E. Provenance, Original Order and Custodial History	133
F. The Migrated Archives through the Continuum ModelModel	137
G. The Migrated Archives and the Shadow Continuum	140
Conclusion	144
Chapter VII: Conclusion	147
Relevance	149
Future Work	152
Intelligence and Secrecy	152
Relation to Archival Theory and the Writing of History	153
Oral History	
Bibliography	157
Appendix A: Inventory of the <i>Djogdja Documenten</i>	169
Appendix B: Sites of Seizure of the <i>Djogdja Documenten</i>	227
Curriculum Vitae	229

#### Acknowledgements

There are many people who I would like to thank when I think about the completion of this work. First, I must thank Charles Jeurgens for his supervision and suggestions over the past four and one-half years. I would like to thank the Leiden University Institute for History and the *Leidse Universiteits Fonds* for granting me travel support to undertake archival research in Indonesia and Singapore. I would also like to thank the Wee Kim Wee School of Information and Communication of Nanyang Technological University (Singapore), where I spent March-April 2013 as a fellow of the Asian Communication Resource Centre.

I was helped along the way on this research by the staffs of the national archives of Indonesia, the Netherlands, Singapore and the United Kingdom. Special thanks to: the former Director-General of the Arsip Nasional (National Archives of Indonesia) Mr. Djoko Utomo, for taking my wife and I to the former Dutch archive in Bogor, his support of my research and his answering of any questions I had about Indonesian archives; to Kwa Chong Guan of the Singapore National Archives Board; and to Weng Kee Leong of the National Archives of Singapore for their help.

I would like to thank Widaratih Kasimo for her translation help of archives in Bahasa Indonesia, Okeu Yulianasari for her research on Dutch military intelligence (NEFIS) archives and the rest of my friends from the ENCOMPASS program in Leiden. I would also like to thank Jennifer Foray of Purdue University and David Phillips for reading and commenting on my case study chapters. To Don Russell of Provisions Library for Art and Social Change at George Mason University (USA) for access to his collection, use of his space, and for all the help and guidance he gave to me and Ding.

I also must take time to reflect upon the memory of Mary Choquette for her role in inspiring the beginning of this research while acting as my adviser at the Catholic University of America. The independent study paper I wrote for her was the paper that my future PhD adviser Charles Jeurgens would discover online and contact me about, thus leading to the continuation of my work in the form of this dissertation. While she never got to see the completed form of this dissertation, my life and my research would not be in the place it is now without her support and guidance.

To the editors and reviewers of Archives & Manuscripts, Bijdragen voor de taal-, land-

*en volkenkunde,* and *Information and Culture* for their helpful comments on my articles that also helped focus this dissertation.

My family in the United States, who I moved away from to work on this dissertation in the Netherlands. They never failed to offer me love and support along the way.

I must also thank the friends from around the world my wife and I met in the Netherlands, who helped distract me temporarily from the world of archives. The ping pong, barbeques, dinners and movie nights helped this dissertation move along. To the friends I met in Singapore, Malaysia, and Indonesia who helped in research and in travelling through Southeast Asia, I also extend thanks.

It is impossible for me to think about having done this dissertation, and the move from the United States to the Netherlands that allowed for it to happen, without the support and help of my wife, Ding Ren. Reading, editing and the inclusion of her photographs as the cover image and other images in the dissertation are only a small part of what she gave me. Throughout the time this research took, there was no one else I would have rather experienced any of the ups and downs with. My final thanks will always go to you, and to you I dedicate this work.

Amsterdam, the Netherlands, April 2015

MIK

#### **Abstract**

This dissertation aims to test the universal suitability of the records continuum model. The records continuum model was created in the 1990s by Australian archivist Frank Upward, and is seen by many in the archives community to be a successor to the records life cycle model that appeared in the mid-twentieth century. A major draw of the continuum model is its all-encompassing nature. The continuum model is meant to visualize and describe all cases of records, thanks to its innovative approach to the period after a record is initially created. Rather than seeing time as linear, the continuum sees records as free to move throughout four records 'dimensions'.

Using two case studies of archives from the decolonization process with non-traditional experiences, this research attempts to 'map' these cases onto the continuum model and test the universality of the model as a result. The first case study is known as the *Djogdja Documenten* and comes from Indonesia. Seizing documents from various Indonesian government ministries during the Indonesian struggle for independence, the Dutch military turned these unrelated records into one archives group. The second case is the so-called Migrated Archives. Unlike the *Djogdja Documenten*, the records that make up the Migrated Archives were created by the colonial administration—in this case the British. While the Migrated Archives are a worldwide phenomenon, I concentrate on records from Singapore and Malaysia. The Migrated Archives became one archive when records from various colonial governments were sent to London on the eve of independence rather than have them fall into the hands of the successor governments. After nearly fifty years of being hidden in a Foreign Office warehouse, the Migrated Archives were only available to public viewing in 2012.

Following each case study, which includes an extensive history of the archives' formation, background, context, and content, I will attempt to place the archives on the continuum model, mapping each action on to a corresponding dimension. The *Djogdja Documenten* poses no problems at doing this, and in fact acts as a prime example for showing how the continuum model's idea that dimensions can occur is any order is applicable in real world cases. In the case of the Migrated Archives,

however, the glaring omission from the continuum model of places in between dimensions where records can get trapped or lost is seen. I rectify this through the creation of something I call the shadow continuum. In the shadow continuum records proceed through the dimensions of the continuum model, even when they are unknown to exist. The functioning of the shadow continuum is the same as the original continuum model, only its actions are kept intentionally veiled by those who control the record.