



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

**State monopoly, Chinese style : a case study of the tobacco industry**  
Cheng, Y.W.

**Citation**

Cheng, Y. W. (2015, May 28). *State monopoly, Chinese style : a case study of the tobacco industry*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/33062>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/33062>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/33062> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

**Author:** Cheng, Yi-Wen

**Title:** State monopoly, Chinese style : a case study of the tobacco industry

**Issue Date:** 2015-05-28

**State Monopoly, Chinese Style:**  
**A Case Study of the Tobacco Industry**

**Yi-Wen Cheng**

Copyright 2015 Yi-Wen Cheng

Cover Design: Kimei Lo

# **State Monopoly, Chinese Style: A Case Study of the Tobacco Industry**

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus Prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op donderdag 28 mei 2015  
klokke 13:45 uur

door

Yi-Wen Cheng

geboren te Taoyuan, Taiwan in 1975

## **PROMOTIECOMMISSIE**

Promotor: Prof. dr. Tak-Wing Ngo

Referent: Prof. dr. Jean-François Huchet (University Sorbonne Paris Cité)

Overige leden:

Prof.dr. Frank Pieke (Universiteit Leiden)

Prof.dr. Henk Schulte Nordholt (KITLV/Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Mw.dr. Daniela Stockmann (Universiteit Leiden)

Mw.dr. Bregje van Eekelen (Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam)

My gratitude to the institutions which financially supported this research at different stages: the KNAW China Exchange Program (the Netherlands), the Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation, the Academia Sinica (Taiwan), and the Ministry of Education (Taiwan).

## Acknowledgements

This dissertation would not have been completed without the kind support, encouragement, and guidance of the following people, all of whom helped me in various ways. I would like to take this opportunity now to express my sincerest gratitude to them.

First of all, I am very grateful to all of my interviewees, most of whose real names I cannot disclose here, for their time and the trust they showed in me. Without their help, I would never have been able to study and comprehend the many facets and historical development of China's tobacco industry. I also have come to appreciate the generosity and enthusiasm of Prof. Benjamin van Rooij, Prof. Wang Qiliang, Prof. Lo Meijuan, Prof. Yi-Chieh Lin, Ren Chaoying, Qian Xiaohua, Lu Caizhen, Yin Hongwei, Xia Peishan, Zhang Yaozu, and Cheng Xiaoya, who helped me to create connections during the course of my fieldwork between 2008 and 2011, which proved vital to the research processes required to write and substantiate such a dissertation.

This research partially arose out of the project "The Political Economy of Rent Seeking and Economic Privilege in China" funded by the KNAW China Exchange Program. I also would like to thank the members who contributed to this project: Prof. Wu Yongping, Prof. Yin Chunyi, Zhang Lin, Jin Biao, Song Chunli, Chen Yiling, and Tang Zhiling. They provided, in addition to a good measure of inspiration, intellectual stimulation and substantial support during my time in China.

A very special thank you goes to Melody Lu and André van Dokkum. From Leiden in the West Europe to Taiwan and Macau in East Asia, they have stood by me every step of the way, seeing me through the difficult times (of which there were not a few) and sharing the joy of achievement with me. Their company has been invaluable, and the *Samenvatting* would never have appeared without André's help. The years spent in the great university town of Leiden have been the richer due to the presence of such people as Hugo M. Nijhof, Cynthia Jimenez Monroy, Yu-Fan Chiu, Brian Granger, Waiman Chueng, Eric Chen, Elise Baardman, Meta van Heusden, Edoardo Ramos Anaya, Syuan-Yuan Chiou, Chin-Hui Lin, Li-Fang Liang, Mei-Wen Chen, Yu-Jen Chen, Juo-Lan Li, Yi-Chi Chen, and Shih-Chen Cheng. Their warm friendship and kind help have been a blessing, and I will always remember the happy times we spent together.

Finally, words cannot fully express the debt I owe to my family. It certainly was not easy for my parents, Chun-Hsiu Cheng and Chu-Hua Chen, to understand why a daughter of theirs would want to spend what seemed like a lifetime to study and write a PhD dissertation. Their support, however, never wavered. My father passed away unexpectedly as I was waiting to defend my dissertation. He will not be able to witness my defense, but his love remains and continues to give me strength and courage. This dissertation is dedicated to his memory and to my dear mother.



# CONTENTS

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b>   | <b>1</b>  |
| 1.1. Theoretical Contribution.....   | 3         |
| 1.2. The Approach of Historical Institutionalism .....                                 | 14        |
| 1.3. The Tobacco Industry as a Case Study .....  | 20        |
| 1.4. Research Methodology & Chapter Outline .....                                      | 27        |
| <b>Chapter 2: The Process of Building the Tobacco State Monopoly</b>                   | <b>29</b> |
| 2.1. The Background to Instituting the Tobacco Monopoly System.....                    | 29        |
| 2.2. Formulating the Tobacco State Monopoly.....                                       | 32        |
| 2.3. Finalizing the Tobacco State Monopoly .....                                       | 36        |
| 2.4. Conclusion.....   | 44        |
| <b>Chapter 3: The Three Phases of Institutional Arrangements</b>                       | <b>47</b> |
| 3.1. Implementing the Tobacco State Monopoly: the Political Context .....              | 48        |
| 3.2. The Varied Political Contexts of the Three Phases .....                           | 50        |
| 3.3. The Links between the Different Phases .....                                      | 63        |
| <b>Chapter 4: Phase 1 - The Two-Track System: From Start to End</b>                    | <b>67</b> |
| 4.1. The Political Context: Decentralization Reforms on Two Fronts .....               | 67        |
| 4.2. The Incremental Change under the Two-Track System.....                            | 71        |
| 4.3. The Introduction of a Three-in-One System.....                                    | 73        |
| 4.4. The Consequences under the Pattern of Governance .....                            | 85        |
| 4.5. The Regulatory Change of the Tobacco State Monopoly System .....                  | 89        |
| 4.6. Conclusion.....   | 91        |
| <b>Chapter 5: Phase 2 - The Prevalence of Local Protectionism</b>                      | <b>95</b> |
| 5.1. The Political Context in the Second Phase .....                                   | 95        |
| 5.2. The Surge in Local Protectionism .....  | 103       |
| 5.3. The Consequences of Local Protectionism.....                                      | 110       |
| 5.4. Production Conditions for Regulatory Change to the State Tobacco<br>Monopoly..... | 116       |
| 5.5. Conclusion.....   | 126       |

|  |                |
|--|----------------|
| <b>Chapter 6: Phase 3 - The Rise of the Central-Led Competitive Monopoly</b>   | <b>129</b>     |
| 6.1. The Centralized Regulatory Framework of the CNTC .....                    | 129            |
| 6.2. Making Big Brands as an Industrial Policy .....                           | 137            |
| 6.3. The Transformation of Local Governments in the Tobacco Monopsony<br>..... | 143            |
| 6.4. The Formation of Large Cigarette Conglomerations .....                    | 162            |
| 6.5. Conclusion.....   | 168            |
| <br><b>Chapter 7: Conclusion</b>   | <br><b>171</b> |
| 7.1. Summary .....   | 173            |
| 7.2. Theoretical Implications .....  | 174            |
| 7.3. The Crises of the Existing State Tobacco Monopoly System .....            | 180            |
| <br><b>Appendices</b>  | <br><b>189</b> |
| Appendix A: The Corruption Case of Chu Shijian.....                            | 189            |
| Appendix B: List of Interviewees .....   | 190            |
| <br><b>Bibliography</b>  | <br><b>194</b> |
| <br><b>Summary</b>   | <br><b>219</b> |
| <b>Samenvatting</b>  | <b>221</b>     |
| <b>CurriculumVitae</b>   | <b>223</b>     |

## List of Figures and Tables

### Figures

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Figure 1.1 - Multi-Stage Causal Mechanisms of Institutional Development .....  | 20  |
| Figure 1.2 - The Production Chain under the Tobacco State Monopoly System ...  | 22  |
| Figure 2.1 - The Structure of the Tobacco State Monopoly .....   | 34  |
| Figure 2.2 - The Design of Control of Overall Quantity .....   | 36  |
| Figure 2.3 - Profit Allocation in the Tobacco Industry under the SOE Reform<br>(1979-1987) .....                                 | 39  |
| Figure 2.4 - Tobacco State Monopoly Structure after Administrative Subordination<br>.....  | 43  |
| Figure 3.1 - Political Context for Implementing Tobacco State Monopoly Rules .   | 50  |
| Figure 3.2 - The Combination of Local States' Incentives and Constraints .....   | 52  |
| Figure 3.3 - Analytical Framework in Each Phase .....  | 64  |
| Figure 3.4 - Three-Phase Flow Chart .....  | 65  |
| Figure 4.1 - Profit-and-Tax Allocations in the Tobacco Sector under SOE Reform<br>.....  | 71  |
| Figure 4.2 - Primary Rules of the Tobacco State Monopoly in the First Phase.....   | 72  |
| Figure 4.3 - Institutional Arrangement of Tobacco Monopsony .....  | 74  |
| Figure 4.4 - Ratio of Taxes on and Profits from Tobacco for the Provincial Fiscal<br>Revenue in Yunnan Province (1980–1990)..... | 79  |
| Figure 4.5 - Distribution of the Plan-specific Cigarettes.....   | 80  |
| Figure 4.6 - Distribution of Non-Plan-Specific Cigarettes.....   | 83  |
| Figure 4.7 - National Production Figures of Cigarette Products (1982–1990).....  | 86  |
| Figure 4.8 - Summary of Institutional Change Process in the First Phase .....  | 93  |
| Figure 5.1 - Primary Rules of the Tobacco State Monopoly during the Second Phase<br>.....  | 96  |
| Figure 5.2 - Distribution of Production Figures across all Cigarette Enterprises<br>.....  | 113 |
| Figure 5.3 - Structure of the Hongta Group in 1995 .....   | 119 |
| Figure 5.4 - The New Structure of the CNTC after the Separation.....   | 125 |
| Figure 5.5 - Summary of the Institutional Change Process in the Second Phase..   | 127 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Figure 6.1 - Primary Rules of the Tobacco State Monopoly in the Third Phase ..            | 130 |
| Figure 6.2 - Scheme of “Planned Planting Based on Market Guidance” in 1998<br>.....       | 147 |
| Figure 6.3 - The Scheme of Major Tobacco Agriculture.....                                 | 155 |
| Figure 6.4 - The Profit-to-Cost Ratio of Tobacco per mu (1996-2007).....                  | 159 |
| Figure 6.5 - Sum of Taxation and Profits in China’s Tobacco Industry (2000–2010)<br>..... | 168 |

## Tables

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Table 1.1 - The Ratio of Tobacco Income to National Revenue (1976–2007) .....   | 24  |
| Table 3.1 - Ratios of Central and Local Fiscal Revenue and Expenditure (1991–2011)<br>.....   | 57  |
| Table 4.1 - Cigarette Manufacturer Prices and Proclaimed Tax Rates (1984).....  | 75  |
| Table 5.1 - Principal Tobacco-Specific Taxes under the Tax-sharing System* .....  | 97  |
| Table 5.2 - Sales Tax Rates on Cigarette Products .....   | 98  |
| Table 5.3 - Ratios of the Two Taxes from the Tobacco Industry to the Totalities of<br>the Two Taxes Paid to the Central State (year: 1995).....                     | 99  |
| Table 5.4 - The Sum of Cigarette Production (1994–2002) .....   | 102 |
| Table 5.5 - The Sales Tax and VAT from the Tobacco Industry* .....  | 103 |
| Table 5.6 - Top Eight Provinces in Terms of Local Production Output* .....  | 108 |
| Table 5.7 - The Market Concentration of Cigarette Companies (%).....  | 113 |
| Table 5.8 - Yuxi-Hongta Tobacco (Group) Corporation’s Rates of Returns on Total<br>Assets for Diversified Undertakings and on Tobacco Business (1997-2001)<br>..... | 115 |
| Table 5.9 - A Comparison of the Top Three TTCs and the Yuxi Cigarette Enterprise*<br>.....  | 124 |
| Table 6.1 - The Evaluated Target List of the Guizhou Province Tobacco Corporation<br>.....  | 137 |
| Table 6.2 - Indices for Selecting Top Core Brands.....  | 139 |
| Table 6.3 - Concentration Ratios of Cigarette Brands (2003–2008) .....  | 142 |
| Table 6.4 - An Example of Duty Contract Evaluation Indices (DJ Town, Yunnan)  |     |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| .....   | 151 |
| Table 6.5 - Scheme for Restructuring Tobacco Production Organization (2009)     |     |
| .....   | 155 |
| Table 6.6 - Market Concentration Ratios of Cigarette Enterprises.....           | 167 |
| Table 7.1 - Expenditure Allocation of Central SOE Submitted Profit in 2013..... | 184 |