



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

From chasing violations to managing risks: origins, challenges and evolutions in regulatory inspections.

Blanc, F.O.M.

Citation

Blanc, F. O. M. (2016, November 30). *From chasing violations to managing risks: origins, challenges and evolutions in regulatory inspections*. s.n., S.l. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/44710>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/44710>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/44710> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Blanc, F.O.M.

Title: From chasing violations to managing risks : origins, challenges and evolutions in regulatory inspections

Issue Date: 2016-11-30

From Chasing Violations to Managing Risks

Origins, challenges and evolutions in regulatory inspections.

Florentin Blanc

From Chasing Violations to Managing Risks

Origins, challenges and evolutions in regulatory inspections.

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 30 november 2016
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Florentin Olivier Michel BLANC

geboren te Orange (Frankrijk)

in 1973

Promotor: prof. dr. W.J.M. Voermans

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. M.G. Faure (Maastricht University)
prof. dr. I. Helsloot (Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen)
prof. dr. C. Radaelli (University of Exeter, United Kingdom)
prof. dr. L.F.M. Verheij
prof. dr. A.K. Yesilkagit

To my wife and children, and to my family, both the dead and the living – all those who gave my life meaning and questions, peace and restlessness, all aplenty

Acknowledgements

There would be too many people to thank here, for their contributions to this research, to my work on regulatory inspections in the past 12 years, to my involvement in development work, and for their influence on my life, interests and thinking overall. I can only name here but a few. First thanks go to Tania Lozansky at the IFC for involving me in inspections reform work, to Sanda Liepina for prodding me further in that direction, and to the fantastic teams I have had the honour to work with over these 12 years – in Tajikistan and Ukraine first, then Mongolia, Armenia, Cambodia, Kenya, Côte d’Ivoire, Kyrgyzstan, Greece and many others. Since 2010, encounters across Europe have brought me new ideas and insights, and new enthusiasm for both policy and research work – let me at least mention Jan van Tol and Ira Helsloot in the Netherlands, Donald Macrae and Graham Russell in the United Kingdom, Giedrius Kadziauskas in Lithuania, and many more from these countries and others, in particular Italy. Thoughts also go to the teams at ACTED with whom I had the chance to start development work, to my professors in the Sorbonne who taught me methods and discipline, to the many officials and businesses whom I have worked with and learned from, to my esrtwhile students whose questions kept me thinking – and in particular Giuseppa Ottimofiore who has been working with me on inspections issues for the past two years.

Special consideration goes to Laura Tilindyte, now at the European Parliament, whose PhD thesis on “Enforcing Health and Safety Regulation” was the starting point of one of this research’s most important case studies.

Last but not least, thanks go to my supervisor, Prof. Wim Voermans, who was both confident and prodding, and kept his patience with me over years when things were moving at an inconstant pace. Thanks also to the members of the committee for their time and inputs, Profs. Faure, Helsloot, Radaelli, Verheij and Yesilkagit. Particular acknowledgements go to Prof. Faure for his insights and the joint work we have started together, to Prof. Helsloot for years of exchanges and collaboration, and never letting certainties unturned, and to Prof. Radaelli for his long-standing support and many productive discussions.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	6
List of abbreviations and acronyms.....	10
1. Introduction.....	14
1.1. Research question – do risk-based inspections lead to better outcomes at reduced costs?	15
a. Risk-based inspections and “Smart Regulation”	16
b. Main elements of the research - hypotheses.....	17
1.2. Antecedents and sources for the research	18
a. Drawing on research findings – literature review	19
b. Drawing from the practice – experiences from inspecting agencies and reformers	21
1.3. Structure of the research	22
1.4. Limitations in scope.....	24
2. Inspections, risks and circumstances – historical development, diversity of structures and practices....	26
2.1. Controlling compliance, controlling safety – the early history	27
a. Tracing the earliest examples of “inspections” from Egypt to Greece and Rome	27
b. The developments of the Middle-Ages and Pre-Modern times – and their relevance.....	28
2.2. The emergence and development of modern inspectorates.....	33
a. The emergence and development of modern inspectorates - Occupational Safety and Health.....	37
b. The emergence and development of modern inspectorates - Food Safety	59
2.3. Conclusions and relevance for our research	104
a. Understanding path dependence, and its limits	105
b. Is there (and can there be) a convergence towards risk-based approaches?.....	106
c. Conflicting directions – steps “forward” and “backward”	109
3. Theoretical underpinnings: costs and effectiveness, compliance drivers, discretion issues, risk and regulation	110
3.1. Regulation: uses, costs and effects – a brief overview.....	111
a. The uses and abuses of regulation – introduction	111
b. Costs and effectiveness of regulation and enforcement – theory and evidence.....	125
3.2. Promoting compliance: models, drivers, methods and issues.....	139
a. Models of compliance – deterrence, cooperation, responsive regulation – and beyond	139
b. Challenges in understanding compliance, and promoting it.....	149
c. Conclusion	175
3.3. Risk and regulation – definitions, debates and issues.....	178
a. Defining and measuring risk	178
b. Dealing with risk: precaution, risk aversion, risk proportionality	187
c. Applying risk-based approaches to inspections	203

4. Inspections and enforcement – a view from the practice	220
4.1. Case studies – views from the practice, comparative assessments.....	221
a. Risk-based inspections in Great Britain – methods, practices, outcomes in OSH (and beyond)	222
b. Post-Soviet and Post-Communist Experiences.....	261
c. Short overview of a few EU countries: Lithuania, France, Italy.....	275
4.2. Data challenges – inherent limitations in considering factual evidence.....	281
a. Limitations and contradictions in studies attempting to investigate effectiveness	282
b. Real correlations or “noise” – assessing the quality of available data.....	291
5. Conclusion	303
5.1. Testing our hypotheses	303
5.2. The case for risk-based inspections.....	304
5.3. Challenges with data, and methods.....	304
5.4. Limits and downsides of inspections.....	305
5.5. Inspections and trust.....	306
5.6. Closing remarks and questions.....	307
Note on sources.....	309
Summary.....	310
Samenvatting.....	314
Bibliography.....	319
Curriculum vitae	347

List of abbreviations and acronyms

AHVLA	Animal Health and Veterinary Laboratory Agency
ASL	Aziende Sanitarie Locale (Local Public Health Establishments)
BASEEFA	British Approvals Service for Electrical Equipment in Flammable Atmospheres
BAuA	Bundesanstalt für Arbeitsschutz und Arbeitsmedizin
BCE	Before the Common Era
BEEPS	Business Environment and Enterprise Performance Subject
BIS	Business, Innovation and Skills
BLS	Bureau of Labor Statistics
BRDO	Better Regulation Delivery Office
BRE	Better Regulation Executive
BSE	Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy
CAFO	Concentrated Animal Feeding Operation
CAP	Common Agricultural Policy
CDC	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
CEN	Comité européen de normalisation (European Committee for Standardization) Comité européen de normalisation en électronique et en électrotechnique (European
CENELEC	Committee for Electrotechnical Standardization)
CGEJET	Conseil général de l'économie, de l'industrie, de l'énergie et des technologies
CIEH	Chartered Institute of Environmental Health
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
COIN	Corporate Operational Information System
COKZ	Centraal Orgaan voor Kwaliteitsaangelegenheden in de Zuivel (Central Body for Quality Issues in Dairy)
COMAH	Control of major accident hazards
CPE	Controlebureau voor Pluimvee, Eieren en Eiproducten (Bureau of Control of Poultry, Eggs and Egg Products)
CSA	Chief Scientific Advisor
CSM	Standard Cost Model
csQCA	crisp set Qualitative Comparative Analysis
DALY	Disability Adjusted Life Years
DCFTA	Deep and Comprehensive Free Trade Area
DDT	Dichlorodiphényltrichloroéthane
DEFRA	Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs
DG	Directorate-General
DG	Directorate-General for Health and Food Safety (Direction générale de la santé et des consommateurs)
SanCO	
DGAL	Direction générale de l'alimentation
DGCCRF	Direction générale de la concurrence, de la consommation et de la répression des fraudes (Consumer Affairs, Competition and Fraud Suppression)
DGFIP	Direction Générale des Finances Publiques
DHS	Department of Health Services
<i>E. coli</i>	<i>Escherichia coli</i>
EA	Environment Agency
EBRD	The European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
EC	European Commission
ECDPC	European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control
ECJ	European Court of Justice
EDC	Endocrine Disrupting Chemical

EEC	European Economic Community
EFSA	European Food Safety Agency
EHO	Environmental Health Officer
EMM	Enforcement Management Model
EMU	Economic and Monetary Union
ENGO	Environmental Non-Governmental Organization
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
ESAW	European Statistics on Accidents at Work
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
FBOs	Food Business Operators
FDA	Food and Drug Administration
FFI	Fee For Intervention
FHIS	Food Hygiene Information Scheme
FHRS	Food Hygiene Ratings Scheme
FOD	Field Office Directorate
FSA	Food Standards Agency
FSIS	Food Safety and Inspection Service
FSM	FDA Food Safety Modernization
FSMA	FDA Food Safety Modernization Act
FSU	Former Soviet Union
FTE	Full Time Equivalent
FVO	Food and Veterinary Office
GAO	General Accounting Office
GASI	General Agency for Specialized Inspections
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GB	Great Britain
GBP	Pound Sterling
GdF	Guardia di Finanza
GHP	Good Hygiene Practices
GMOs	Genetically modified organisms
GPD	Gross Domestic Product
H&S	Health and Safety
HACCP	Hazard Analysis Critical Control Point
HM	Her Majesty's
HMRC	Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs
HSC	Health and Safety Commission
HSE	Health and Safety Executive
HSW	Health and Safety at Work
ICC	Interstate Commerce Commission
IFC	International Finance Corporation
ILO	International Labour Organization
IMF	<i>International Monetary Fund</i>
INAIL	Istituto Nazionale per l'Assicurazione contro gli Infortuni sul Lavoro (National Institute for Insurance against Labour Accidents)
INPS	Istituto Nazionale Previdenza Sociale (National Institute for Social Prevention)
IPPC	Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control
IRGC	International Risk Governance Council
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
IT	Information Technology

LA	Local Authority
LBRO	Local Better Regulation Office
LFS	Labour Force Survey
LGA	Local Government Association
MMR	Measles, Mumps, and Rubella
MRLs	Maximum Residue Levels
MSHA	Mine Safety and Health Administration
NCAE	Nederlandse Controle Autoriteit Eieren (Netherlands Eggs Control Authority)
NFA	National Food Agency
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
nvCJD	new variant Creutzfeldt–Jakob disease
NVWA	Nederlandse Voedsel- en Warenautoriteit Netherlands' (Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority)
OECD	<i>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</i>
OHS	Occupational Health and Safety
OIE	World Animal Health Organisation (Office International des Epizooties)
ONR	Office for Nuclear Regulation
ONS	Office for National Statistics
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
OSHA	Occupational Safety and Health Administration
PCB	Polychlorobiphényle
PHLS	Public Health Laboratory Service
PPP	Purchasing Power Parity
QCA	Qualitative Comparative Analysis
RAPEX	Rapid Alert System for Non-Food Products
RASFF	Rapid Alert System for Food and Feed
RGPP	Révision Générale des Politiques Publiques (General Review of Public Policies)
RIDDOR	Reporting of Injuries, Diseases and Dangerous Occurrences Regulations
RoSPA	Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents
RRAC	Risk and Regulation Advisory Council
RRR	Risk Regulation Reflex
RVV	Rijksdienst voor de keuring van Vee en Vlees (State Service for Supervision of Livestock and Meat)
SAPD	Sozialistische Arbeiterpartei Deutschlands
SES	Sanitary and Epidemiological Service
SFARP	So Far As Reasonably Practicable
SFBB	Safer Food, Better Business
SLI	State Labour Inspectorate
SLIC	Senior Labour Inspectors Committee
SME	Small and Medium Enterprises
SPD	Sozialdemokratische Partei Deutschlands
SPS	Sanitary and Phytosanitary
SuGA	Sicherheit und Gesundheit bei der Arbeit
SVB	Uitvoerder van volksverzekeringen (Social Insurance Bank)
SZW	Sociale Zaken en Werkgelegenheid (Social Affairs and Employment)
TBT	Technical Barriers to Trade
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme

US	United States
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USDA	United States Department of Agriculture
UWV	Uitvoeringsinstituut Werknemersverzekeringen (Employee Insurance Agency)
vCDJ	variant Creutzfeldt–Jakob disease
VWA	Voedsel- en Warenautoriteit (Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority)
WBG	World Bank Group
WHO	World Health Organization
WRR	Wetenschappelijke Raad voor het Regeringsbeleid
WTO	World Trade Organization
WTO	
SPS	World Trade Organization Sanitary and Phytosanitary Agreement
ZLB	Zero Lower Bound