



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

A social history of painting inscriptions in Ming China (1368-1644)

Wang, W.

Citation

Wang, W. (2016, October 26). *A social history of painting inscriptions in Ming China (1368-1644)*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/44098>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/44098>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/44098> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Wenxin Wang

Title: A social history of painting inscriptions in Ming China (1368-1644)

Issue Date: 2016-10-26

**A Social History of Painting
Inscriptions in Ming China
(1368-1644)**

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 26 oktober 2016
klokke 13.45 uur

door

Wenxin Wang

geboren te Shijiazhuang in 1986

Promotores:

Prof. dr. Ivo Smits (Leiden University)

Dr. Oliver Moore (Leiden University)

Promotiecommissie:

Prof. dr. Maghiel van Crevel (Leiden University)

Prof. dr. Hilde De Weerd (Leiden University)

Prof. dr. Anne Gerritsen (Warwick University)

Prof. dr. Antoine Gournay (Université Paris-Sorbonne)

To my parents

致我的爸爸媽媽

Illustrations on the cover: The detail of the pictorial section of *Elegant Gathering in the Apricot Garden* (*Xingyuan yaji tu* 杏園雅集圖) after Xie Huan 謝環 (1377-1452), and an inscription by Chen Xun 陳循 (1385-1462) attached to this painting, ca. 1437, handscroll, ink and colour on silk, 37.5×1278.3 cm (overall), The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.

Illustration on the bookmark: The same inscription by Chen Xun, which was embodied in his individual anthology printed between 1594-1620.

Copyrights © 2016 Wenxin Wang, Leiden, The Netherlands.
All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without permission of the author.

Notes

1. Throughout this dissertation, official terms and titles are translated according to Charles Hucker's *A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China* (1988).
2. The basic physical unit of books in late imperial China is *juan* 卷, literarily "scroll," literally "fascicle." *Juan* as a textual unit is akin to a chapter. For the convenience of statement, in the text of this dissertation I use "fascicle," while in footnotes and the bibliography I retain the original term *juan*.
3. *Sui* 歲 is Chinese way of counting age, which adds one year of age at birth.
4. In this dissertation, all Romanizations from Chinese to English follows the rule of *hanyu pinyin* 漢語拼音, which is in official use in the People's Republic of China. The names of scholars from outside mainland China will be transliterated in the same way as they appear in formal English publications and authorized profiles. For those whose information with this respect is not attainable, I have chosen the *pinyin* spellings.

Relevant Chinese Imperial Dynasties

- Tang Dynasty 618-907
- Five Dynasties and Ten Kingdoms 907-960
- Northern Song Dynasty 960-1127
- Southern Song Dynasty 1127-1279
- Yuan Dynasty 1279-1368
- Ming Dynasty 1368-1644
- Qing Dynasty 1644-1911

Abbreviations Used in Texts, Illustrations and Notes

- CSJCCB *Congshu jicheng chubian* 叢書集成初編, edited by Wang Yunwu 王云五 et al. 3467 *juan*. Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1935-1940.
- CSJCSB *Congshu jicheng sanbian* 叢書集成三編. 280 vols. Taipei: Shin Wen Feng, 1997.
- CSJCXB *Congshu jicheng xubian* 叢書集成續編. 100 vols. Taipei: Shin Wen Feng, 1989.
- DMB* Luther Carrington Goodrich, and Chaoying Fang, eds. *Dictionary of Ming Biography 1368-1644*. 2 vols. New York (etc.): Columbia University Press, 1976.
- Tulu* *Gugong shuhua tulu* 故宮書畫圖錄, edited by Guoli gugong bowuyuan 國立故宮博物院. 30 vols. Taipei: The Palace Museum, 1989.
- MSCS *Meishu congshu* 美術叢書, edited by Huang Binhong 黃賓虹 and Deng Shi 鄧實. 4 *ji* 集, 40 *ji* 輯, 20 vols. Shanghai: Shenzhou guoguang she, 1947.
- SBCKCB *Sibu congkan chubian* 四部叢刊初編, edited by Zhang Yuanji 張元濟. 2100 vols. Shanghai: Shangwu yinshu guan, 1922.
- SBCKXB *Sibu congkan xubian* 四部叢刊續編, edited by Zhang Yuanji. 500 vols. Shanghai: Shangwu yinshu guan, 1934.
- SKQS *Yingyin Wenyuan ge 'Siku quanshu* 景印文淵閣四庫全書. 1500 vols. Taipei: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1986.

- SKQSCMCS *Siku quanshu cunmu congshu* 四庫全書存目叢書, edited by Siku quanshu cumu congshu bianzuan weiyuanhui 四庫全書存目叢書編纂委員會 . 1200 vols. Jinan: Qilu shushe, 1996-1997.
- XXSKQS *Xuxiu Siku quanshu* 續修四庫全書 . 1800 vols. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2002.
- Fangzhi* *Zhongguo fangzhi congshu* 中國方志叢書 . Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, 1965-1969, 1973-1975, 1982-1984.
- Tumu* *Zhongguo gudai shuhua tumu* 中國古代書畫圖目, edited by Zhongguo gudai shuhua jianding zu 中國古代書畫鑑定組 . 24 vols. Beijing: Wenwu chubanshe, 1984-1993.
- Huihua* *Zhongguo huihua quanji* 中國繪畫全集, edited by Zhongguo gudai shuhua jianding zu 中國古代書畫鑑定組 . 30 vols. Beijing: Wenwu chubanshe, Hangzhou: Zhejiang renmin chubanshe, 1997-2001.
- Meishu* *Zhongguo meishu quanji* 中國美術全集, edited by Zhongguo meishu quanji bianji weiyuanhui 中國美術全集編輯委員會 . 60 vols. Beijing: Renmin meishu chubanshe, 1988-1989.

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Why Painting Inscription Matters	5
For Scholarly Practices	5
For Connoisseurship, Curatorial and Publishing Practices	13
Resources and Methods	15
Ming: A Shifting Period	17
Thesis Structure	22
Chapter 1: Painting Inscriptions in the Pre-Ming Era	37
Terminology	37
The Emergence of Painting Inscriptions	41
Inscribers and Social Practices	50
Content	58
Concluding Remarks	63
Chapter 2 The Production of Painting Inscriptions in Social Networks and Reciprocities	65
Inscription and Painting Formats	65
Handscroll	66
Hanging Scroll	71
Fan	79
Speculative Spaces for Inscriptions	85
Painting and Poetry as Social Productions	89
Social Spaces of Dwelling	95
Social Spaces of Convening	100
Case Study I: <i>Chanting for the Pictures</i>	112
Social Spaces of Reciprocity	127

Inscriptions Negotiated Social Debts	128
Case Study II: <i>Paying a Debt</i>	133
Concluding Remarks	144
Chapter 3 Painting Inscriptions with Commercial Functions in the Ming Art Markets	147
Issues of Authenticity	148
Art Markets	150
Statements of Authenticity	155
Forgers in the Markets	159
Problematic Absence: Paintings without Inscriptions	164
A Case Study: <i>Clearing After Snowfall</i>	169
The Owner and the Connoisseur	172
The Inscriptions on <i>Clearing</i>	175
Forgery's Division of Labour	178
Cultural and Commercial Elite	179
Ming Painters' Attitudes to Forgeries	182
Cataloguing Paintings by Documenting Inscriptions	191
A Case Study on <i>Records of Precious Paintings: Faking Inscriptions in the Printing World</i>	202
Content	204
The Value and Influence	208
Concluding Remarks	211
Chapter 4 The Compilations and Publications of Literary Painting Inscriptions	213
First Anthology of Painting Inscriptions	214
Contents and the Context	216
Distribution and Dissemination	218
Other Pre-Ming Anthologies of Painting Inscriptions	222

Printed Anthologies of Painting Inscriptions in the Ming Era	223
Private Printing: The Case of Li Rihua	226
Private Printing: Cases of Two Obscure Painters	238
Commercial Printing: Mao Jin and <i>Ni Yunlin</i>	248
Rethinking Anthologies of Painting Inscriptions and their Heritage	259
A Qing Heritage	263
Concluding Remarks	269
Chapter 5 Portrait Inscriptions and Re-Inscriptions: “The Decaying Brushstrokes Are Where Your Spirits Rest”	271
Portrait Inscriptions: The Exploration of a Changing Environment	272
Genres of Portrait Inscriptions	277
Interactions with Social Identities	280
Interactions with the Deceased and the Living	292
A Source of Self-Knowledge	303
The Social Patterns of Portrait Inscriptions	309
Some Reflections on Portraiture	316
Painting Inscriptions as Enduring Objects	319
Controlling the Personal Context	322
Controlling the Social Environment	327
Controlling the Future	331
Concluding Remarks	335
Conclusion	337
Appendix	342
Bibliography	347
Samenvatting (summary in Dutch)	377
Acknowledgements	382
Curriculum Vitae	385