



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Europe and extraterritorial asylum

Heijer, M. den

Citation

Heijer, M. den. (2011, April 7). *Europe and extraterritorial asylum*. *Meijers-reeks*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/16699>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/16699>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Europe and Extraterritorial Asylum

Europe and Extraterritorial Asylum

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. P.F. van der Heijden,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 7 april 2011
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Maarten den Heijer

geboren te Voorburg in 1979

Promotiecommissie:

Promotores: prof. mr. P. Boeles
prof. dr. R.A. Lawson

Overige leden: prof. mr. H. Battjes (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)
prof. mr. R. Fernhout (Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen)
prof. mr. C.A.P. Hillion (Universiteit Leiden en
Stockholm University, Sweden)
prof. dr. G. Noll (Lund University, Sweden)
prof. dr. P.A. Nollkaemper (Universiteit van Amsterdam)
prof. mr. N.J. Schrijver
prof. mr. P.R. Rodrigues

Lay-out: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

© 2011 M. den Heijer

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Het reprorecht wordt niet uitgeoefend.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, made available or communicated to the public, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, unless this is expressly permitted by law.

Table of contents

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	IX
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Thesis of the study	1
1.2 Genesis of the study	1
1.3 Scope of the study	5
1.4 Goal of the study	7
1.5 Research questions and structure of the study	9
1.6 Delimitations of the study	12
1.7 Sources of the study	15
1.8 Scientific context of the study	16
1.9 Terminology	18
2 THE EXTRATERRITORIAL APPLICABILITY OF HUMAN RIGHTS	21
2.1 Introduction	21
2.2 The concept of jurisdiction in international law	25
2.3 The concept of jurisdiction in human rights law	28
2.4 On the different functions of jurisdiction in general international law and human rights law	32
2.5 International case law on the extraterritorial applicability of human rights	35
2.5.1 Jurisdiction resulting from control over territory	35
2.5.2 Jurisdiction resulting from control over persons	41
2.5.3 Jurisdiction and positive obligations	52
2.6 Human rights treaties not containing a jurisdictional clause	55
2.7 Final remarks	60
3 THE RESPONSIBLE ACTOR	65
3.1 Outline of the chapter	65
3.2 Independent responsibility	69
3.2.1 Attribution and the act of state	69
3.2.2 Attribution of acts of natural persons and groups of persons to the state	70
3.2.2.1 Attribution of acts of de jure and de facto state organs to the state	71
3.2.2.2 Attribution of acts of private persons or entities	74
3.2.2.3 Attribution of conduct directed or controlled by a state	75

3.2.2.4	Positive obligations and due diligence	83
3.2.3	Attribution of state conduct to another state	90
3.2.4	Attribution of joint conduct to the state	94
3.2.4.1	Multiple state responsibility	94
3.2.4.2	Attributing joint conduct to a state	96
3.3	Derived responsibility for aiding and assisting another state	100
3.3.1	Derived responsibility	100
3.3.2	Aid and assistance	102
3.4	Final remarks	110
4	EXTRATERRITORIAL ASYLUM UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	113
4.1	Outline of the chapter	113
4.2	The right to grant asylum	115
4.2.1	State sovereignty and extraterritorial asylum	115
4.2.2	Extraterritorial asylum as humanitarian exception to state sovereignty	120
4.2.3	Immunities and extraterritorial asylum	124
4.2.4	Interim conclusion	128
4.3	The right to obtain asylum	129
4.3.1	Extraterritorial application of the prohibition of <i>refoulement</i> under the Refugee Convention	132
4.3.1.1	The judgments in Sale and Roma Rights	134
4.3.1.2	Interim conclusion	141
4.3.2	Extraterritorial application of the prohibition of <i>refoulement</i> under the Convention Against Torture	142
4.3.3	Extraterritorial application of the prohibition of <i>refoulement</i> under the ECHR and ICCPR	145
4.4	The right to seek asylum	155
4.4.1	The right to seek asylum in international law	155
4.4.2	The right to leave in international law	153
4.4.3	The right to leave and the right to enter	158
4.4.4	Extraterritorial migration control and the right to leave	160
4.4.5	Permitted restrictions to the right to leave	162
4.4.6	Asylum-seekers and the right to leave	165
4.5	A right to be protected but no right to protect?	167
4.6	Final remarks	173
5	EXTRATERRITORIAL ASYLUM UNDER EUROPEAN UNION LAW	175
5.1	Outline of the chapter	175
5.2	The EU's external dimension of asylum and migration	177
5.2.1	The external dimension as a policy strategy of the Union: from Tampere to Stockholm	177
5.2.2	Integrated Border Management and pre-border controls	181
5.2.2.1	The EU visa regime	182
5.2.2.2	Carrier sanctions	184

5.2.2.3	Immigration Liaison Officers	187
5.2.2.4	Frontex	190
5.2.3	The EU's external asylum policy	195
5.3	The territorial scope of EU law on border control and asylum	198
5.3.1	Some observations on the territorial scope of European Union law	199
5.3.2	The territorial scope of the Schengen border control regime	204
5.3.2.1	Council Decision 2010/252/EU	210
5.3.3	The territorial scope of the asylum <i>acquis</i>	214
5.4	Final remarks	217
6	INTERDICTION AT SEA	221
6.1	Introduction	221
6.2	The European interdiction programme	223
6.3	Migrant interdiction and the Law of the Sea	227
6.3.1	The right to interdict	229
6.3.1.1	The territorial sea	229
6.3.1.2	The contiguous zone	233
6.3.1.3	The high seas	234
6.3.1.4	The problem of stateless vessels	235
6.3.1.5	The UN Protocol on Migrant Smuggling and extraterritorial criminal jurisdiction	239
6.3.2	Obligations of search and rescue	242
6.3.2.1	The duty of search and rescue	244
6.3.2.2	Disembarkation and a 'place of safety'	247
6.4	Human rights at sea	252
6.4.1	<i>Non-refoulement</i> obligations arising out of interdiction at sea	254
6.4.2	The right to leave at sea	258
6.4.3	The right to liberty at sea	262
6.5	Issues of attribution and allocation of responsibility	267
6.6	Final remarks	270
7	EXTERNAL PROCESSING	273
7.1	Introduction	273
7.2	The logic of external containment under US and Australian practices	277
7.2.1	The US offshore programme	277
7.2.2	Australia's excised territories and offshore processing	280
7.3	The feasibility of procedural containment	282
7.4	The feasibility of physical containment	287
7.5	Issues of attribution and allocation of responsibility	292
7.6	Final remarks	294

8	CONCLUSIONS	297
8.1	Sovereignty, territory and human rights: towards a general proposition	299
8.1.1	Conflicting sovereignties	303
8.1.2	Conflating sovereignties	304
8.2	The implementation of a human rights strategy: towards recommendations	306
8.2.1	Clarifying the law	308
8.2.2	Clarifying reality	311
8.2.3	Clarifying political aims	313
8.3	The European Union as a panacea for upholding refugee rights?	316
	SAMENVATTING	319
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	323
	LIST OF CASES	335
	INDEX	341
	CURRICULUM VITAE	347

List of abbreviations

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
BYIL	British Yearbook of International Law
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination against Women
CESCR	United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CERD	United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
ComAT	United Nations Committee against Torture
ComRC	United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child
COREPER	Committee of Permanent Representatives
CPT	European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
EC	European Community
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities/European Union
EComHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EEC	European Economic Community
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
EJML	European Journal of Migration and Law
EP	European Parliament
ETS	European Treaty Series
EU	European Union
EUROSUR	European Border Surveillance System
EWCA	England and Wales Court of Appeal
EWHC	England and Wales High Court
EXCOM	Executive Committee of the High Commissioner's Programme
FRY	Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
Frontex	European Agency for the Management of Operational Cooperation at the External Borders of the Member States of the European Union
HRC	United Nations Human Rights Committee
IAComHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICLQ	International & Comparative Law Quarterly
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IDP	Internally Displaced Person
IJRL	International Journal of Refugee Law
ILC	International Law Commission
ILO	Immigration Liaison Officer
ILO	International Labour Organization
IMO	International Maritime Organization
IOM	International Organization for Migration
LNTS	League of Nations Treaty Series
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
OAS	Organization of American States
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PEP	Protected Entry Procedure
RABIT	Rapid Border Intervention Teams
RPP	Regional Protection Programme
SAR	International Convention on Maritime Search and Rescue
SBC	Schengen Borders Code
SIA	Schengen Implementing Agreement
SOLAS	International Convention for the Safety of Life at Sea
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TRNC	Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UKHL	United Kingdom House of Lords
UN	United Nations
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNTOC	United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organised Crime
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
UNRIAA	United Nations Reports of International Arbitral Awards
VCCR	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations
VCDR	Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
VRS	Army of the Republika Srpska (Vojska Republike Srpske)