

African Studies Centre
Leiden, The Netherlands

Promoting Gender Equality and Female
Empowerment: A systematic review of the
evidence on property rights, labour markets,
political participation and violence against
women

Marleen Dekker

ASC Working Paper 111 / 2013

Promoting Gender Equality and Female
Empowerment:
A systematic review of the evidence on
property rights, labour markets,
political participation and violence against
women

Marleen Dekker

Afrika Studiecentrum, Leiden

Table of content

1. Introduction	1
1.1 Conceptual background.....	1
1.2 Research Question.....	2
1.3. Dutch Gender Policy	3
1.4. Pathways of empowerment	4
1.5. This report	9
2. Methodology	10
2.1. Search Strategy.....	10
2.2. Studies included	12
2.3. Geographical distribution	14
3. Well defined property and inheritance rights for women.....	15
3.1. Titling schemes.....	16
3.1.1. Land.....	16
3.1.2. Housing	20
3.2. Changes in land and inheritance laws	21
3.3. Conclusion.....	25
4. Promote female employment and equal opportunities for women on the formal and informal labour market	27
4.1. Reducing the burden of reproductive responsibilities	27
4.2. Labour Market Policies	29
4.2.1. Recruitment services	29
4.2.2. Changes in Family Law.....	30
4.2.3. Social protection programmes.....	30
4.2.4. Women's networks.....	32
4.3. Widening the scope for self-employment.....	33
4.3.1. Increasing female participation in agricultural production.	33
4.3.2. Micro-credit and self-employment.....	34
4.3.3. Training	36
4.4. Conclusion:.....	40
5. Increased participation of women in political and local governance structures.....	42
5.1. Village assemblies in India.....	42
5.1.1. Political Participation of Women	42
5.1.2. Policy outcomes	44
5.1.3. Attitudes: aspirations, voice and perceptions	47
5.2. Female leadership at district level	49
5.3. Other governance structures	51
5.4. Conclusions:	53
6. Reducing gender based violence	56
6. 1. Intimate Partner Violence.....	57
6.1.1. Changing Social Norms	57
6.1.2. Improving Women's economic position	63
6.1.3. Law and security sector reform and support for survivors.....	68
6.2. Female Genital Mutilation or Cutting (FMG/C)	69
6.3. Conclusions:	70
7. Conclusion.....	72
8. References	75

1. Introduction¹

Increasing gender equality and strengthening the position of women and girls has been an important (cross cutting) theme in Dutch development cooperation since several decades. Gender equality is a core development objective in its own right (a core human right) as is evidenced by the adoption and ratification of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). However, greater gender equality can also be instrumental by enhancing productivity and improving and achieving other development outcomes since the misallocation of women's skills and talents may come at high social and economic costs (World Bank, 2011c).

The World Development Report 2012 on Gender Equality and Development documents how, over the past 25 years, unprecedented progress has been made in gains in women's legal rights, in women's education, fertility and life expectancy and in access to jobs and livelihoods. This progress however has not been achieved by all countries, or all women, or across all dimensions of gender equality, especially when poverty combines with other factors of exclusion, such as ethnicity, caste or remoteness. There are still large gender gaps in education and health and sexual and reproductive health rights are not equal for all. Divorce or widowhood still causes many women to become landless and lose their assets, women continue to work in sectors with low pay and still find it difficult to access formal employment. Women are also more strongly affected by the AIDS epidemic, they are more likely to be victims of violence at home and women's agency in the private sphere and representation in politics and (business) governance remains lower than men's (World Bank, 2011c). This backward position of women vis-à-vis men can be related to existing socio-economic power differentials between women and men. Female empowerment is often advanced as a way to expand women's opportunities in the direction of gender equality.

This report is a systematic literature review that documents experiences with interventions aimed at promoting gender equality or female empowerment. This introduction of the report sets out the conceptual background to the study, the research questions, gender policy by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and potential pathways of empowerment.

1.1 Conceptual background

Conceptually, gender equality has two dimensions: equality in opportunities and equality in outcomes (measured as differences in outcomes between men and women or boys and girls, the gender gap). As opportunities are difficult to measure, gender equality is often measured in outcomes. An imperfect measure since men and women do

¹ We gratefully acknowledge the funding provided by the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs (IOB). The usual disclaimer applies.

have different preferences and when given the same opportunities, men and women may choose differently.

There is a range of definitions for women's or female empowerment.² Central in all definitions is the ability of women to manage their lives. Kabeer (2005) for example defines female empowerment as the ability of women to exercise power to live the life they choose to live. Women's empowerment can be defined as an outcome, or may refer to processes by which women who were denied the ability to make choices acquire the ability to do so. These processes take place both at the individual and collective level, emphasising "agency" (the capacity of individuals to act independently and to make free choices) and "structure" (the rules and social forces that limit or influence the opportunities for individual action).

This becomes clear using an example of granting property rights to women. When women gain access to land resources, they may not have the agency to use these resources for cultivation, for example because their mobility is restricted and discourages them to till the land (gender norms). If however they are able to participate in the rental market and obtain an income from the land, granting them property rights may improve their economic position. This example highlights that empowerment has different, interrelated, dimensions. A distinction that is often made is economic empowerment (access and control over resources), social and legal empowerment (roles, expectations, rules, formal and informal sanctions) and political empowerment (representation and voice).

1.2 Research Question

The purpose of this systematic review is to provide an overview of the empirical methods and indicators used in the academic literature on women's empowerment. Specifically, the review focusses on indicators and empirical methods to evaluate development interventions aimed at women's empowerment and gender equality. Main research question for this review is: What is the evidence for and the nature of the impact of development interventions aimed at improving female empowerment and gender equality in developing countries?

Specific research questions are:

1. What are the impact pathways from development interventions to women's empowerment?
2. What is the evidence of impact for each of these impact pathways?

Gender equality and female empowerment is however a vast field and covers a substantial number of sub-themes, urging us to reduce the thematic scope of the interventions to be considered and to focus on particular themes that have been important in the gender development policy of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

² For an overview of different definitions of and conceptual approaches to empowerment, see for example Luttrell et al (2009)

1.3. Dutch Gender Policy

The Dutch development policy on gender equality is guided by the third Millennium Development Goal as defined by the UN to “Promote gender equality and empower women”. The targets and indicators defined under this goal are (i) to eliminate gender disparities at all levels of education (ii) to increase women’s share in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector and (iii) to increase the proportion of seats held by women in national parliaments.

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs has identified seven priority themes for gender policy that would enhance the opportunities of meeting these goals. These priority themes are:

1. Secondary education for girls
2. Sexual and reproductive health and rights
3. Time-saving infrastructure for women
4. Well defined property and inheritance rights for women
5. Formal employment and equal opportunities on the labour market
6. Participation and representation of women in politics and governance
7. Violence against women

These priority themes are in line with the four policy priority areas defined in the World Development Report 2012 (Gender Equality and Development): reducing gender gaps in human capital (mortality and education), closing gender gaps in access to economic opportunities, earnings and productivity, shrinking gender differences in voice and agency within society and limiting the reproduction of gender inequality across generations (World Bank, 2011c).

The Minister has developed a specific funding window to support organisations working towards these aims, the MDG3 Fund (2008-2011) followed by FLOW (2012-2015). The thematic focus of the funding is restricted to priority theme 4 to 7, as the other themes are already covered in other programmes and funds from the Ministry (Ministerie van Buitenlandse Zaken, 2007).

This working paper thus reviews the evidence for and the nature of the impact of development interventions aimed at improving female empowerment and gender equality in developing countries, with a specific focus on interventions aimed at increasing property and inheritance rights for women, increasing formal employment and equal opportunities on the labour market, increasing participation and representation of women in politics and governance and reducing violence against women. These themes have goals at different levels in/of the empowerment process and they may each individually contribute to women’s empowerment. However, they do not operate in isolation and may mutually reinforce one another. Improvement in one domain may lead to advances in other domains as well. Granting property and inheritance rights may for example reduce or increase violence against women, while the political context in which such rights are granted to women may influence the effectiveness of legal changes in reaching women. The interplay between these elements becomes visible in the discussion on the intervention logic or the pathways to

empowerment that are the basis of various interventions in the priority fields. These pathways reinforce the importance of different levels of interventions, from the individual and household level up to national level.

1.4. Pathways of empowerment

The papers included in this review provide elements of different pathways of empowerment that may result from development interventions. Here, it is relevant to distinguish (intermediary) outcomes and proxy indicators for female empowerment. Given the emphasis on the ability to manage their own lives, proxy indicators for empowerment can be defined in terms of decision making authority and/or the freedom to move and undertake activities/visits or the resulting indicators such as age of marriage, time use and use of contraceptives and educational or health outcomes of children women), signalling empowerment of future generations as well³. Outcomes of interventions may enhance this ability to manage their own lives, such as increased income, changed attitudes towards women and aspirations of women, while intermediary outcomes are participation in the labour market, access and control over land, etc. Many studies only consider one dimension and do not address the multi-dimensionality of empowerment.

Summary of pathways to female empowerment

Intermediate outcome	labour market participation	property ownership	political participation	reduced levels of violence
Outcome	income, changed attitudes, aspirations			
proxy impact	decision making and female autonomy			
Impact	age of marriage	time use	contraceptive use	children's outcomes

These distinctions between outcomes and proxy indicators are not cast in stone and the two may be interrelated as well. Consider the example of fertility choices, where current births (measured over the past two years for example) or aspired fertility (the desired number of children) are (intermediary) outcomes and true fertility (life-time births) would be the proxy indicator. However, measuring the effect of a development intervention on women life-time births is difficult given the time period that should be covered. Another example concerns the choice of women to engage in the rental market when they obtain property rights over land. This is considered an outcome, but when

³ Improvements in outcomes for children (especially girls) are often interpreted as an indicator signalling women's empowerment, assuming that mothers care more for their children than fathers and a greater say of mothers in the household would thus be translated to improvements in children's wellbeing. Most studies are not however able to disentangle this effect (more say for women) from more general effects that improve the household's situation.

resulting from the choices that women themselves make it can be interpreted as a proxy indicator as well. Alternatively, the changes resulting from the increased income obtained through rental market participation are considered proxy impact indicators as well. These contemplations should be kept in mind when interpreting the schematic overviews of the pathways to empowerment for each of the themes as presented in the remainder of this section. The rows represent the different levels (outcome/impact) and could contain indicators from within each row, while the columns suggest the possible pathways to empowerment.

The papers included in this review differ from one another in the extent to which the pathways to female empowerment are made explicit. Many measure (intermediary) outcomes of development interventions only⁴, sometimes because the interventions themselves were more general in nature and had gender differentiated effects that were worth reviewing. This is particularly evident for interventions aimed at economic dimensions of empowerment, such as property rights and equal opportunities on the labour market, with some notable exceptions.⁵

It is important to realize that most of the studies used self-reported and prospective indicators (aspirations, desired fertility, perceived tenure security) that do not necessarily capture realized behavioural changes, which may take more time to be realized and measured.

Secure property rights for women

Property rights may enhance the ability to make choices in pursuing economic activities. Granting women secure property rights to land, houses and/or other assets is thought to improve her position in the household, either directly as a result of independent asset ownership, or indirectly as a result of increased (shares in) production/income/food security that may enhance women's economic autonomy and lead to increased decision making power within the household (for example benefitting their children) and possibly in the public sphere. These increases in income are not only resulting from land ownership per se (that may enhance production and participation in the land rental market for example), but also potentially from participation in the credit market, use of subsidies, training and other support that is often linked to land ownership.

⁴ A similar tendency is found in IOB evaluations on water, basic education and sexual and reproductive health rights. Although the education evaluations do refer to potential impacts on empowerment (in terms of economic and social returns to education), these effects are not empirically assessed. The water evaluations address the impact of time-saving as a result of water interventions to some extent, for example by considering changes in school attendance for girls and changes in time-use for women (more time devoted to economic and other domestic activities). The wider implications of these changes are however not addressed.

⁵ Consider for example Jensen(2012) who studies the effect of recruitment services for women on their desired fertility and other aspirations.

Intervention	Granting property rights to land/houses						Inheritance Laws	
Intermediate outcome	investment/credit or other support		property ownership	reduce insecurity			tensions within households	women inherit
Outcome	productivity, SWC, off farm business, income	rental market participation, income	knowledge of the outside world, having certificates, knowing who will inherit	safe haven/ attachment to the house/ IPV	increase mobility/l labour market	reduce productive value of children/ female name on title	suicides, justification of wife beating, occurrence of wife beating	dowry paid
Proxy Impact	self confidence/intra-household bargaining			resistance to sale of house		fertility choices		household decision making
Impact	fertility					fertility		age of marriage/ educational attainment

Additionally, property ownership can enhance the knowledge of the outside world and increase self-confidence, while a reduction of tenure insecurity may protect women against domestic violence and abandonment, increase their mobility and decision making authority, for example with effects on fertility choices and age of marriage. At the same time, increased income/property may not always be beneficial for women as under certain conditions it may backlash against them in particular in contexts where men feel threatened by this increased independence and use violence against their spouse to keep the status quo.

Increasing formal employment and equal opportunities on the labour market

Increasing formal employment and equal opportunities on the labour market is an important element of economic empowerment of women. It is suggested that (formal) employment will enhance the position of women as it will improve (the stability) of her income and her working conditions. This enhances her contribution to the household income and may therefore improve her participation in decision making with potential impacts on marriage, fertility and intra-household distribution of resources (including educational outcomes of their children) say in decision making and say or control over utilization of earnings. As reported before, increased income/property may not always be beneficial for women as under certain conditions it may backlash against them in particular in contexts where men feel threatened by this increased independence and use violence against their spouse to keep the status quo.

Intervention	pre-school services	recruitment services	self-employment: business/vocational training/credit	Family law	employment creation/cash transfers
Intermediate outcomes	children attend preschool		business knowledge/labour market status		labour market outcomes
Outcomes	labour market participation/hours worked	employment/training	income/ wages/ non wage benefits	employment	income
Proxy Impact		aspirations	decision making/ perceptions on household roles	occupational choice	decision making
Impact	children's outcomes	delayed marriage/ child bearing, investement in girls	physical mobility/ control over assets/time allocation		children's educational outcomes

Several interventions to promote equal opportunities are included in this review, ranging from interventions aimed at reducing the burden of reproductive responsibilities, improving access to the formal labour market and widening the scope for informal employment through training and access to credit for example. Most studies reviewing interventions for the labour market primarily focus on outcomes in terms of employment and income, while some also consider proxy empowerment indicators that address household decision making. Few studies specifically addressed an intermediary outcome on skills acquisition, while another referred to changes in intra- and extra household bargaining positions resulting from changes in family law, that lead to changes in labour market outcomes for women.

Political participation of women

Lack of voice prevents women from ensuring that their needs are taken into account in public goods/service delivery and policy design and will reinforce existing biases against women. Having capable women at important (political) positions is important to hold political leaders accountable, for example when it comes to securing goals for gender equality and to develop democracy. One way to achieve this is through female reservation (or gender quota's) of leadership positions in (local) government or commission composition in for example Community Driven Development or water and forestry management. Such reservations can have several outcomes and proxy impacts in the pathways to empowerment:

- increase female political representation, measured by numerical and proportional strength in leadership or governance positions.
- increase the participation of "ordinary" women in politics and governance, measured for example by attending and speaking up in meetings and being able to articulate issues effectively
- change policy choices and outcomes, measured for example by targeting of (non) government programmes, investments in and quality of (female/male preferred) public

goods, school attendance and (gender gap in) education attainment and maternal health indicators

- d) change voter attitudes on women as leaders measured for example with perceptions on leadership quality and implicit tastes
- e) Change aspirations for future generations (social norms may shift and reduce the reproduction of gender inequality over time) for example in terms of desired fertility, education or engagement in economic activities, changes in time allocations and reporting crimes committed against them

Intervention	local government		CDD
Intermediate outcomes	Female Participation in village meetings		female participation
Outcomes	policy outcomes: targetting, women preferred public goods, corruption		policy outcomes/quality of maintenance/ women in leadership positions
Proxy Impact	women leaders in non reserved seats/aspirations/ willingness to report crimes/ women speaking out in meetings	aspirations (school, marriage, childbirth, job)/changed opinions on women leaders	attitudes towards women/ decision making in hh/
Impact	children's outcomes		

Reduce violence against women

Violence against women constrains their choices and (potentially) excludes women from participation in social, economic and political life. A reduction of violence against women may thus increase her choices and include or enhance women's position in social, economic and political life (including the priority areas defined above). Important interventions to reduce violence against women are aimed at (i) preventing violence against women by shifting norms and behaviours (ii) enacting laws against violence against women and (iii) providing timely and effective assistance when violence does occur, ranging from the police and judiciary to health and social services.

The review primarily documents evidence on social norm interventions and interventions aimed at increasing women's economic independence. The social norm interventions aim at changing attitudes towards the acceptability of violence against women, not only by the society at large or by men, but also for women themselves. Interventions range from educational programmes to media campaigns and measure (changes in) attitudes (towards women in general and violence against women specifically and actual (self-reported) levels of violence and sexual behaviour. These are sometimes combined with other outcome measures or proxy indicators such as desired fertility or fertility choices, using contraceptives and autonomy in decision making and the prevalence of infectious diseases (herpes, HIV) or unwanted pregnancies.

Women's economic independence, enhanced for example through micro-finance or conditional cash transfers, may improve her authority over decisions allowing women to challenge gender norms and thereby reduce violence against them. Alternatively, backlash theory suggests increased economic independence may result in increased levels of violence when men fear losing control.

Intervention	Micro-finance/training	training/discussion	radio/media	primary education	public transfers
Intermediate outcomes	economic status,	STDs			income
Outcomes	levels of violence, gender norms	levels of violence, gender norms	changes in gender norms	gender norms	levels of violence
Proxy Impact	decision making authority	decision making	women's autonomy		
Impact		fertility choices	fertility choices	contraceptive use	

1.5. Structure

This working paper is structured as follows. Section 2 discusses the methodology used for the systematic review. Section 3 documents the evidence on interventions aimed at property and inheritance rights for women. Section 4 discusses interventions aimed at increasing women's formal employment and equal opportunities on the labour market. Section 5 reviews the evidence on participation and representation of women in politics and governance, while section 6 documents efforts to reduce violence against women. Section 7 concludes.

2. Methodology

Based on the prime importance of this track in Dutch development gender funding, the literature review is focussed on the four central themes of the MDG3 Fund: (i) property and inheritance rights (ii) employment (iii) violence against women and (iv) political participation. Given the focus on development interventions, the literature search was restricted to interventions in low and middle-income countries. The search was restricted to English documents and considered both peer reviewed academic publications and the so-called grey literature, evaluation reports available from institutional websites and working papers that were not (yet) published.

Search Strategy

The literature search was conducted with keyword searches in academic databases (Econlit and SSRN), evaluation data bases (3ie, Poverty Action Lab and the DAC Evaluation Resource Centre) and institutional websites such as Search4Dev, The World Bank and the Centre for the Study of African Economies in Oxford (backtracking specific themes in their academic conferences). An overview of keywords and searches is presented in table 1 below. Additional titles were obtained from searches in specific journals (Development Policy Review and the Economics of Peace and Security Journal) and informal leads provided by colleagues and experts in specific fields and alerts from institutions (The World Bank and AWID) and academic journals. The review prioritizes programmes that have been evaluated using rigorous designs, emphasizing formal impact evaluation, and we specifically looked for randomized controlled trials but also included other designs that measured elements women's empowerment and gender equality with control groups or comparison communities.

The search process is presented in table 2 below. The initial keyword search gave 2696 hits⁶ that were subsequently pre-screened on title, yielding 194 titles of potentially relevant papers that were more thoroughly screened on their abstract and in some cases by quick reviews of the data and methodology sections. The three main criteria used for the selection were:

1. Study on an intervention (project or programme)
2. The research methodology included a reliable counterfactual analysis
3. The study included relevant indicators for the specific empowerment pathway studied

Papers on particular pathways to empowerment did not necessarily come up in the specific search on that pathway, but were identified in the other searches and subsequently moved from one category to another. In an iterative process, selected papers provided input for reference snowballing, both bibliographic back tracking (reviewing references of included studies) and citation tracking (reviewing references of included studies)

⁶ Note that this includes double hits, i.e. the same paper being listed in more than one search.

Table 1. Overview of keywords used

Database/Website	Keywords
EconLit	"female genital mutilation" evaluation "violence and women" evaluation "gender based violence" prevention evaluation "intimate partner violence" evaluation women and violence evaluation "post conflict intervention "Gender Quota" "community driven development" "political participation " and "female empowerment" "political participation" women "property rights" women "land rights" "female empowerment" "inheritance law" "female empowerment" inheritance law and gender "labour market" "female empowerment"
SSRN	Gender Based Violence Female Reservation Political Participation and Women Property Rights Gender Female Empowerment employment women's empowerment formal sector employment women
PAL	Gender Community
3ie	Gender Female Empowerment Labour Market women Political Participation Women Violence Gender
Search4dev	Female Empowerment Political Participation Gender Based Violence Violence Against Women Labour Market Land Rights Property Rights Empowerment and evaluation Gender and evaluation
World Bank	CDD and women's empowerment
DEREC	Gender equality and women in development
CSAE Conference Papers	Gender Conflict studies

Table 2. Summary of the search process

	Keyword hits	Pre-screening titles	3 criteria screening
Property rights	329	40	11
Labour market	245	27	15
Political participation	1204	37	17
Violence against women	661	72	14
General	257	18	
Total	2696	194	57

2.2. Studies included

In total 57 studies were included in this review:

- 11 studies on property rights and female empowerment,
- 15 studies covering increasing equality for men and women on the labour market.
- 17 studies on interventions aimed at improving women's political participation
- 14 studies covering interventions aimed at reducing violence against women

The emphasis on rigorous evaluations meant that most evaluations from donors and other (aid) institutions were not included as these predominantly evaluated relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of interventions, without addressing effects and impact (see for example: ADB, 2010).

Not all included studies considered the whole pathway from intervention to impact on female empowerment. Some interventions were specifically aimed at women's empowerment, while other interventions did not have that specific focus, but yielded gender results that are empowering. Interestingly, some interventions appear in more than one of the priority themes as they may impact on more than one dimension of female empowerment. An example is the changes in family law in Ethiopia in 2000 that have been studied for its impact on perceptions on asset-distribution with divorce and on women's occupational choices and micro-finance programmes that appear in the interventions to reduce violence against women as well as to promote equal opportunities on the labour market.

The literature search also identified several (systematic) literature reviews in the same, or related, thematic fields as targeted in this review (for example Heise, 2011, Berg and Denison (2012), Pandolfelli and Quisumbing (2010), Todd (2012). These reviews will be referred to in the text and when applicable the findings were summarized and specific case studies traced.

There is a growing literature on the impact of micro-finance and conditional cash transfer programmes. The latter suggest that such programmes are relatively successful in improving education, health and nutrition outcomes, especially for girls, while studies on micro-finance report very mixed results. Since evidence on the impact of these programmes have been reviewed elsewhere (see for example Heise(2011), Yoong (2012) on CCTs, Stewart et al (2010), Duvendack et al (2011) and Vaessen et al (2012) on microfinance), this review is restricted to CCT and micro-finance studies that specifically address the relationship to female empowerment, employment or gender based violence. Some of the included studies concern multiple component interventions, e.g. combined micro-finance and business training, or micro-finance and social norms training.

Most of the reviewed papers were based on individual or household level data collected specifically to evaluate the outcome or impact of particular programmes. Some combined purposefully collected data with existing data sources, such as electoral data (Bhavani, 2009 and Beaman et al, 2009) or data on educational achievements at a district level in India (Clots-Figuras, 2012). The data collection tools ranged from Standard LSMS type of questionnaires sometimes complemented with innovative elements such as the use of vignettes and speeches or implicit association tests to elicit information on perceptions of leaders (Beaman et al, 2009) or questions on gender norms (using validated GEM scale) or violence against women (WHO tool). Most of these questionnaires were not only directed at the household head, but (also) interviewed women separately, or women only. Some studies also collected data on “institutional level” or village level, either through focus group discussions (to elicit preferences of men and women for particular goods) or by reviewing the participation and complaints records (the latter also to measure preferences).

For each of the included studies a number of basic characteristics were documented: type of intervention, sample size and sources of data, methodology outcomes considered, indicators used and results found. The identified papers are summarized in Appendix Table 1 documenting the intervention, evaluation methodology and results, and Appendix Table 2 presenting the outcome indicators used and effects found in the studies. A substantive discussion of the studies and the findings is presented in the four thematic sections in this review. In the discussions in these sections reference is made to other (relevant) literature that did not meet the methodological or thematic criteria used for the selection of studies. Each of the included studies has a summary table in the text with a presentation of the findings on outcome, proxy impact and impact indicators. The scores presented in these tables, -/0/+, represent a negative, no, or positive statistical result. Note that in some cases, a negative statistical relationship may signal a positive empowerment outcome, for example in the case of a reduction in intimate partner violence.

2.3 Geographical distribution

Overall the studies are well spread over three continents (17 from Africa, 28 from Asia and 12 from Latin America and the Caribbean), but the distribution across countries and themes is rather skewed, as becomes evident from table 3. The evidence on the effect of female political participation almost entirely comes from India, while the studies on land are concentrated in India and Ethiopia. The evidence on labour market interventions and GBV had a wider geographical coverage, although the first tend to be located in a Latin American or Asian context and the latter in the African context. With the dominance of India on political participation, the Asian evidence predominantly comes from that country, while the evidence from Latin America and Africa included a wider range of countries.

Table 3. Geographical distribution of the studies

Latin America	Property	Labour	Political Part.	Violence	12
Argentina		2			2
Brazil				1	1
Colombia		1			1
Dominican Republic		1			1
Mexico		1		3	4
Peru	1	2			3
Africa					17
Burundi				1	1
DRC			1		1
Ethiopia	3	1		1	5
Kenya			1		1
Rwanda	1				1
Sierra Leone				1	1
South Africa		1		4	5
Tanzania	1				1
Uganda		1			1
Asia					28
Bangladesh		1			1
India	5	3	15	3	26
Philippines		1			1
Total	11	15	17	15	57

3. Well defined property and inheritance rights for women

The importance of secure property rights for economic development is now widely recognized (North, 1990, De Soto, 2000). Men and women can acquire land or other property in many ways; through inheritance, purchases or transfers from the state. In each of these ways, women face more obstacles than men (Deere and Leon, 2001, Cooper and Bird, 2012). Women are often disadvantaged in both statutory and customary land tenure systems (Agarwal, 1994). They have weak property or contractual rights to land and even where legislation is in place to strengthen their position, lack of legal knowledge and weak implementation may limit women's ability to exercise their rights (Pandolfelli and Quisumbing, 2010). The existence of this so-called asset-gap has been documented for example by Deere and Doss (2006) and Doss et al (2011) while other studies highlight how such lack of property and related tenure insecurity affects the efficiency of female land use and the economic advancement of women (see for example Goldstein and Udry (2008) for Ghana and Bezabih and Holden (2008) for Ethiopia).

Based on work highlighting these asset gaps, Agarwal (1994) argued for independent and effective property rights that would enhance welfare, efficiency, empowerment and equality for women while Deere and Leon (2001) also acknowledged the role that joint titling could play in addressing inequality in property ownership. Granting property rights to women means women have an enforceable claim on the property and they are free to rent, bequeath or sell the property. In corollary with the debate on secure property rights in general (De Soto, 2000), ownership of assets in the hands of women may enhance their possibilities to undertake more remunerative activities, either because property rights allow for physical investments that may enhance productivity, they may be able to obtain credit (land as collateral) and start off-farm businesses, or because they are able to rent or sharecrop their land and generate a (higher) income that can be invest in off-farm activities. Granting property rights to women may not however only advance economic empowerment, it could also foster empowerment in other domains for example by providing a safe haven (escape and as such deterrent of domestic violence) or increasing mobility and participation in decision making.

Several studies have examined women's actual ownership of land and other assets and found positive associations between assets in the hands of women and welfare outcomes for these women and their families. Allendorf (2007) for example shows that Nepalese women who own land are more likely to participate in decision making and less likely to have underweight children. Deere et al. (2004) show that households with female land ownership in Peru and Paraguay have higher (non-agricultural) income (household rather than individual), while Swaminathan et al (2012) link women's property to women's mobility, independent decision making about employment and healthcare and the availability of money and independently deciding on how to spend it. Agarwal and Panda (2007) find that women with property are less likely to suffer from long-term physical and psychological violence. They argue that property status reduces the risk of violence by increasing a woman's economic security, reducing her tolerance

to violence and providing a potential escape route, which in itself may function as a deterrent.

These studies do not however consider the potential joint determination of individual level asset ownership and (welfare) outcomes when, for example, women in more equal relationships are more likely to own assets and are more likely to work outside the home, or less likely to suffer from domestic violence⁷. Pandolfelli and Quisumbing (2010) and Peterman (2011) emphasize there is little quantitative evidence specifically addressing the impact of (changes in) women's property and inheritance rights on welfare outcomes and female empowerment. The literature search yielded papers covering on the one hand property titling programmes in rural and urban areas (land and housing) and changing land and inheritance legislation on the other hand. Although some interventions such as the Hindu Succession Act were explicitly and only aimed at reducing gender inequality, other interventions such as the urban and rural titling programmes in Ethiopia and Peru had a more general character, with or without an explicit aim to improve women's property rights. The review is however restricted to papers that address gender inequalities. The studies reviewed mostly consider (intermediate) outcome indicators in assessing the impact of property titling (or transfers), either focussing on agricultural outcomes or off-farm activities and income, with a few exceptions covering (proxy) impact outcomes such as fertility and education.

3.1. Titling schemes

3.1.1. *Land*

There is a growing literature that documents the impact of land registration or titling programmes on agricultural outcomes (Deininger et al (2007) and Deininger and Chamorro (2004), but there are only few papers that specifically address the impact of such programmes on women. We found evidence from Ethiopia and Rwanda.

Ali et al (2011) evaluate the impact of land tenure regularization (LTR) in Rwanda on land-related investments, women's land and inheritance rights and land market activity. To assess the impact of the program, they rely on a cross-sectional comparison of pilot areas and non-pilot areas, using a spatial discontinuity design with spatial fixed effects. Based on a sample of 2300 households in three areas in Rwanda (with high, middle and low population density) who were interviewed 2.5 years after Land Tenure Regularisation, the authors report mixed results on several indicators. In regression analyses they do not find significant effects of the LTR on subjective measures of expropriation risk or the use of improved seeds. Households with LTR are however almost 10 percentage points more likely to make or maintain soil conservation measures and this effect is even stronger in female headed households (19 percentage points). The effect of the LTR program on women's land rights is mixed too, with little changes reported for the full sample. Disaggregation of the data however shows a small but

⁷ Swaminathan et al acknowledge this problem and only consider assets that are exogenous to the household bargaining process (assets obtained through inheritance or from government) an observation also advanced by Agarwal and Panda (2007) who emphasize inheritance and marriage as a source of assets.

statistically significant reduction (8 percentage points) of the probability of having documented land ownership for women who are not legally married, while married women are 17 percentage points more likely to be regarded as joint land owners. The results also show increased inheritance certainty, as more respondents know who will inherit the land with equal benefits for girls when compared to boys, although the latter does not hold in female headed households. There is significant reduction of land market activity after the LTR. Although the authors are tempted to interpret this as a rejection of the hypothesis that LTR may lead to impoverishments due to distress sales, they also contextualize this finding by pointing at the increased costs of land transfers as a result of institutional changes. Moreover, 2.5 years may not be long enough to measure distress sales as these would depend on the occurrence of shocks.

Environmental and gender impacts of land tenure regularisation in Africa	Ali et al (2011)	Rwanda	
Property Rights	Land Titling	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	0/+ Household type Marital status

The heterogeneity of effects to different beneficiaries is also documented for the low-cost, bottom-up land registration and certification process in Ethiopia that started in 1998 and aimed to increase tenure security and strengthen women's rights to land to ensure a more sustainable use of land resources. Holden et al (2011) interviewed 400 farmers in 16 communities in Northern Ethiopia, where the head of household was given a title in his or her name. The survey contains four waves; one year before the certification process and 2, 5 and 8 years after the certification process. The authors look specifically at the land rental market and used a predicted certification variable to obtain unbiased estimates of the impact of the certification process. They found more activity in land renting, including better access to land for tenants. More specifically, they found that especially female headed households were more likely to rent out their land. Tenure security allowed them to do so by reducing the risk to lose their possession. For female headed households, participation in the rental market may have been the best option to obtain returns to owned land in a cultural setting where women are not expected to cultivate the land themselves.

Tenure insecurity, Gender, Low-Cost Land Certification and Land Rental Market Participation	Holden et al (2011)	Ethiopia	
Property Rights	Land Titling	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ Household type

Similar findings are reported by Deininger et al (2011) who study the effect of certification on perceived tenure security, land investments and rental market participation in Amhara region. Their analyses suggest that certification enhances tenure security, land investments and rental market participation for all farmers, with distinct effects on land rentals for female headed households.

Impacts of land certification on tenure security, investment and land markets	Deininger et al (2011)	Ethiopia	
Property Rights	Land Titling	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+
		Heterogeneity	Household type

Bezabih et al (2012) analyse the impact of land certification on crop productivity of male and female-headed households in Ethiopia using a geographical discontinuity approach that compares changes in land productivity between villages with land certification to non-certified villages. Using plot-level data collected in 2 districts and 14 villages in Amhara Region in 2005 and 2007 they find that certification has a positive effect on plot-level productivity. Productivity gains were realized both by men and women, but the mechanism behind this effect differs between men and women and between the two districts in the study. Productivity gains were found on self-managed plots in both districts, but the districts presented heterogeneous effects in the land rental market. In one district female owned plots were increasingly rented out after certification and productivity on these rented out plots increased, while in the other district the increased rental market participation for both male and female owned plots was not accompanied with an increase in plot level productivity. Although finding heterogeneous impacts is important, it is unfortunate that the authors do not unpack these geographical differences nor address the indirect effects that this increased productivity may have on the position of women.

Gender and land productivity on rented out land	Bezabih et al (2012)	Ethiopia	
Property Rights	Land Titling	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+
		Heterogeneity	Household type District level

Given these significant effects on rental market participation, Deininger et al (2008a) call for research on consequences for female empowerment of these economic resource transfers. Rao (2006) argues that an increasing share of land in the hands of women may not necessarily lead to more equal gender relations. In a context of diversified rural livelihoods where the contribution of agricultural production to household subsistence

has been declining and men have been able to access better paid non-agricultural jobs, right to land for women may enhance their work burden, especially when associated to food security, without much change in terms of status or decision-making authority.

Such non-economic empowerment effects are explored in Holden and Tefarra (2008). Although this paper did not meet the methodological criteria to be included in the review, the scope of this study provides an interesting example of potential pathways to empowerment. Based on interviews with 600 households in two districts in two southern Ethiopian regions, just after the 2004 land certification, Holden and Tefarra's study specifically considers the situation in which husbands and wives are given joint titles to the land. The cross section data only allows for an explorative analysis, but suggests that the land certification increased the perceptions of tenure security for both women and men, and especially for second and later wives in polygamous marriages. Farmers also perceive a reduction in the number of border and inheritance disputes. But both men's and women's knowledge of the laws and regulations were poor. So far, the land reform had limited impact on women's ability to influence farm management, but wives have more say in relation to rental decisions (as consent of the family is required to rent out land). This (legal) requirement is meant to enhance the food security of households and may empower wives in relation to their husbands. Comparing women's participation in village activities and household decision making before and after the land certification process, suggest that there is a tendency for increased participation and decision making (with the exception of independent decisions over own income and involvement in non-farm activities), albeit with strong local differences. It should however be noted that these differences are based on a retrospective question in the cross-section household survey and should be considered explorative at this point. Future survey work may provide more robust estimates of the effect of joint titling on women's empowerment.

Based on interviews with local conflict mediators, Holden and Tefarra (2008) also stresses the discrepancies between *de jure* and *de facto* land rights and potential failure of local courts to give fair judgements in case of land conflicts. In the context of Ethiopia, these courts are thought to benefit the wealthy and influential, while Mak (2005) also stress the patriarchal nature of many local institutions that may not rule in favour of women, even when their rights have been laid down in the constitution, a point also made by Brulé (2012), see below. It matters how laws are implemented, enforced and protected and legal rights have little effect if they are not accompanied by legal awareness campaigns and an increased ability of women to mobilize the law. Several innovative pilot interventions to overcome this discrepancy between legal and *de facto* procedures are currently being implemented (Knox et al, 2007), but to our knowledge these have not yet been rigorously evaluated (Pandolfelli and Quisumbing, 2010).

Although not in the context of gender equality, the importance of legal awareness has been emphasized by Deiniger et al (2008b) who found that Ugandan households awareness of their land rights significantly increased the likelihood of undertaking soil conservation measures. The magnitude of the effect found was equivalent to increasing

the length of possession by 15 years or the level of education of the head by more than 7 years.

3.1.2. Housing

In contrast to the work on land titling, the papers that we found on urban housing titles have an explicit non-economic empowerment focus. Although Field (2007) documents the positive effects of housing titles in Peruvian cities on the allocation of labour in households⁸, this effect can be attributed to change in male labour hours mostly. In earlier work, Field (2003) considered the effect of the titling programme on fertility. Exploiting the staggered implementation of a titling programme in eight cities in Peru, and comparing women in households who had titles before the programme and women who got titles through the programme, Field found considerable effects of the titling programme on fertility and explores if the change in fertility is also related to changes in the level of female property ownership. She finds a 54 percentage point increase in the rate of female ownership (defined as 1 if the title belongs to any female member of the household). If fertility decisions are subject to intra-household bargaining, female property ownership (vs male property ownership) may shift fertility patterns. Using an Instrumental Variable estimation to control for the endogenous determination of which name appears on the title (joint or not) she found differential effects for households with or without joint titles. Households in which property titles are distributed to both male and female members of the household experience nearly twice the reduction in the probability of having a child. Additionally, changes in tenure security may have an independent negative effect on the desired number of offspring, reducing the productive value of children (in old age subsistence or securing informal ownership rights).

Fertility Responses to urban land titling programmes	Field (2003)	Peru	
Property Rights	Housing titles	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+ +

Although not aimed at women's empowerment but at a reduction of house sales after regularisation in such settlements, a joint titling policy in informal settlements in India also had empowering effects on the women in these settlements. A comparison of a random sample of men and women in three types of informal settlements in a city in India (without titles, with individual titles to men and with joint titles to housing) by Datta (2006) suggest that women in areas with joint titling are more attached to their houses and would more strongly act on their spouse's unilateral decision to sell the house. Using ethnographic material, Datta argues that this differential attachment is not

⁸ Field (2007) finds that households without a legal claim spend an average of 13.4 hours per week maintaining their informal tenure, which is equal to a 14 percent reduction in work hours. Moreover, household members are 40 percent more likely to work within rather than outside the home. For smaller households, titling also reduces child labour outcomes, suggesting that children may play an important role in securing the informal tenure rights in such families.

just related to different perceptions between men and women but an attachment that has grown after the realisation of joint titles. These titles provide women with (i) a greater say in household affairs (participation in decision making) and knowledge of the outside world (ii) a greater sense of security from abandonment by their husband, and (iii) greater respect from their spouse. A house is not only a home to live in or an office/workplace to generate income it is also an entry into the world of property ownership, which brings a higher sense of empowerment, self-confidence and respect.

Joint titling, a win-win policy?	Datta (2006)	India	
Property Rights	Housing Titles	Impact	+
		Proxy impact	+
		Outcome	+

3.2. Changes in land and inheritance laws

Other papers on improving property rights for women address changes in property and inheritance law that did not coincide with explicit certification or titling activities. Peterman (2011) for example evaluates the effect of changes in the constitutional arrangements in land administration in 1999 in Tanzania. This land law shifted land administration to the village level and stipulated that women are to be represented in the land administration bodies and that women's rights to co-ownership of the land and their individual right to acquire, hold, sell and use the land are protected. Using the KHDS panel study that includes some 800 households in 51 communities, Peterman takes the changes in community level variations of customs between 1991 and 2004, the *de facto* implementation of this law, to study the effects of the *de jure* change in property rights to land. Communities are defined as having a high women property and inheritance rights regime when a group of village leaders indicated that "in case her husband dies, the women (i) inherits the land, (ii) inherits the house, (iii) inherits other assets and (iv) she herself is not to be inherited". Peterman finds that increasing property and inheritance rights are significant in promoting (self-) employment and earnings, but not increasing individual level expenditures. The magnitudes of the effect are comparable or larger than those found for education in other developing countries. Since Peterman finds this effect for all women and not only for widows, she argues that the effect of improved women's property and inheritance rights works through expectations and current ownership of assets (in marriage) and is more generally related to empowerment norms. As such she links the changes in the economic position of women as a result of changes in property rights to a change in the position of women more generally. This link is however not empirically tested with proxy impact indicators.

Women's property rights and gendered policies	Petermann (2011)	Tanzania	
Property Rights	Land laws	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	(+) implicit +/0

Another set of papers studied the impact of the Hindu Succession Act (HSA) that formally regulates the inheritance of a large group of Indians (Hindu, Buddhist, Sikh or Jain) in case the deceased father did not have a will, granting unmarried daughters the right to a claim on joint family property equal to their brothers. The exogenous variation in the implementation of this Act (the timing of implementation varied in different states) allows for an identification of the effects of this change in legislation on various outcomes.

Goyal et al. (2010) study the effect of the law reform on inheritance practices. Based on the 2006 REDS including 1371 rural Hindu households in Karnataka and Maharashtra State that includes detailed information on three generations, they compare the inheritance of land to males and females with fathers who died before and after the amendment of the Act. They find that the HSA increased women's likelihood to inherit land, but could not fully eliminate the underlying inequality (i.e. men are still more likely to inherit compared to women, but the gender gap is smaller). The authors argue the effect of legislative changes were not only restricted to inheritance but also increased the age of marriage of women, relative to men and had a positive significant impact on women's educational attainment (0.3 years more education).

Hindu Inheritance Law, Land Bequests and Educational Attainment	Goyal et al (2010)	India	
Property Rights	Inheritance Law	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+ +

Brulé (2012) scrutinizes these results and suggests they are sensitive to the definition of the dependent variable and the control group. She proposes to use comparison groups across geographic boundaries (to ensure common cultural, historical and economic backgrounds) and within families (comparing daughters who married before or after the passing of the HSAA)⁹ and defines as a dependent variable the equality of the daughters' share of inheritance rather than a dummy variable on any inheritance of land.¹⁰ With these alternative specifications, the effects of the law are still positive but

⁹ Treatment group is father died and daughter married after the reforms and control group consists of daughters with fathers' death and/or marriages prior to reform.

¹⁰ A comparable argument is made by Roy (2012) who argues it is important to consider the death of a grandfather rather than a father because the HSA regulates ancestral (joint family) land rather than the father's separate property.

no longer statistically significant. Comparing daughters who married before or after the passing of the HSA suggests that the inheritance reforms rarely alter intra-family distribution of daughters' inheritance. Qualitative evidence suggest lack of change is related to reluctance of local officials to enforce the law (supply side) resulting in a passive attitude of local revenue officers (responsible for law enforcement) and no demand for enforcement from daughters out of fear to loose the support of their natal family. Brulé tests the demand side constraints by comparing daughter's land inheritance shares in cases where local officials are perceived to be responsive to demands from male household heads vs women's demands. This suggests the impact of the law reform is heterogeneous, depending on the nature of local officials' accountability. Although the significance of the results vary across specifications, she finds some evidence that when leaders are accountable to women, inheritance is more equal for daughters, while when they are accountable to men, inheritance is less equal for daughters. Responsiveness to local political economy is further addressed by considering the effect of female reservation (see also the section on political participation of women) on inheritance outcomes. Villages with one out of three elections with a reserved female seat are more likely to have more equal inheritance compared to villages without female reservation.

Gender Equity and Inheritance Reform	Brulé (2012)	India	
Property Rights	Inheritance law	Impact	0
		Proxy impact	0
		Outcome	0/+
		Heterogeneity	Political economy

In line with our findings on de jure and de facto land rights mentioned above, Brulé's analysis suggests that passing more equal inheritance laws does not necessarily guarantee more equal inheritance rights in practice. Local practices and power relations may hinder enforcement of the law and cause conflicts or tension. Such tension can have serious repercussions as is argued by Anderson and Genicot (2012) who study how the law amendments affected suicide rates in different states (1967-2004). Based on crime statistics, they report an increase in male and female suicide rates following the amendments, with a higher increase for men, thereby reducing the female to male suicide ratio. These results hold with several robustness checks (for example using alternative control measures for economic and cultural setting, in- and excluding particular states, alternative property rights measures, considering only suicides where family problems were mentioned as a cause). Based on these findings, Andersson and Genicot argue that increasing female property rights have increased conflict within the households and this increased conflict resulted in more suicides among both men and women. Using individual data from the NFHS they indeed find a positive and significant effect of amendments on the justification of wife beating (if a given female thinks that wife beating by her husband is justified under any of a number of circumstances) and the occurrence of wife beating as reported by wives. These results

emphasize that increased gender equality through property rights can increase tensions and distress within households.

Suicide and Property Rights in India	Anderson and Genicot (2012)	India	
Property Rights	Inheritance law	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	 + +

The effect of the inheritance law reforms on human capital accumulation as presented by Goyal et al (2010), is confirmed by Roy (2012) who investigates if greater female inheritance rights improve girls' education. Using difference in difference comparisons between treated cohorts (cohorts after the legislative reform) and control cohorts (before the legislative cohort) in reforming states and non-reforming states in the NFHS, he finds that an improvement in inheritance rights increases educational attainment by 0,5 years for cohorts of women who were of primary school age at the time of the passage of the reform. These results are robust when controlling for the possibility that the state level passing of the law and female education are correlated. This is analysed using a triple differences approach using variation within state cohorts on landownership, religion and gender. To explore the potential mechanisms behind this effect, Roy uses data from the REDS to demonstrate that daughters did not benefit in terms of increased inheritance. He further argues that such "disinheritance" of daughters (which is rational in a virilocal society) may be compensated by the parents through investment in education for younger daughters (<10 years of age) and larger dowries for daughters past school-going age. Although this argument is supported by the REDS data, Roy emphasizes this evidence is not fully conclusive, a point to be taken at heart given the restricted Hindu only sample of the REDS used in the analysis.

Female empowerment through inheritance rights	Roy (2012)	India	
Property Rights	Inheritance Law	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	 + + 0

That changes in land inheritance laws may result in differential human capital investments as a form of compensation has been reported elsewhere, albeit not in the context of gender equity. La Ferrara and Milazzo (2011) study the impact of a policy change in Ghana where the 1985 Intestate Succession Law substantially reduced the share of land going to the matrilineal after the death of a father. Based on five rounds of the Ghana Living Standard Surveys they use a difference in difference strategy that compares educational attainment and health outcomes of cohorts and ethnic groups for males and females separately. They find that Akan boys exposed to the reforms received approximately 1 year less of education as compared to non-Akan boys, while Akan and non-Akan boys showed similar trends before 1985. Akan and non-Akan girls have

different educational attainment both before and after the law changes. Akan boys also experience an increase in height for age after the reform (0.3-0.4 standard deviations higher), while this change is not documented for non Akan boys or Akan girls. These results suggest significant and sizable effects of changing customs. At the same time, Kutsoati and Morck (2012) argue that changes in inheritance law have hardly affected actual inheritance practices in Ghana.

That customary practices, rather than formal law, may indeed influence choices made within households is also illustrated by Kumar and Quisumbing (2012a) who study the impact of perceptions on divorce in rural Ethiopia. Based on three rounds of the Ethiopian Rural Household Survey and using IV estimation, they find a strong link between perceptions of asset dissolution and welfare outcomes. Women who perceive that their husbands would get all the assets in case of a divorce also tend to perceive less control over their lives and their children, and especially girls, have lower schooling compared to other children in their cohort. The authors did not find any effect on changes in perceptions on the distribution of assets upon divorce after the passage of the Family Law in 2000 that stipulates equal division of assets at divorce. This underscores that legislative reform by itself is not sufficient to bring about changes and that it may take time for changes in legislation to change perceptions and lead to improved well-being. Other work by the same authors (Kumar and Quisumbing, 2012b) studies inheritance practices in the same context and argue that it is the amount of inheritance (and especially of land) received rather than whether women inherit or not that has the most profound impact on household consumption, poverty and food security. These findings suggest that it is especially important that women inherit equally with men.

Conclusion

The reviewed papers suggest several pathways of empowerment that can be opened up with increasing property and inheritance rights for women. The studies on land titling programmes generally find positive effects of these interventions on perceived tenure security and outcomes such as land investment (in soil and water conservation) productivity and rental market participation. Interestingly, the identified increases in productivity defy the sometimes heard argument that land alone may not be sufficient to improve female production as women may also lack access to credit, inputs and technical support. The titling schemes reported here were not accompanied by interventions in these other domains, but resulted in improvements nevertheless. Potential complementarities between interventions on land and the other domains were not included in the studies reviewed.

Although these outcomes potentially result in increased income and a better bargaining position of women in their households, these (proxy) indicators are not included in the reviewed papers. Increased property ownership and reduced tenure insecurity may also result in less tangible effects such as an increased knowledge of the outside world resulting in increased self-confidence, or providing a safe haven/outside option that may protect women against domestic violence and abandonment and/or increase her mobility and decision making power. These outcomes and proxy impacts

are more difficult to measure, but were addressed in the work on housing titles by Field (2003) and Datta (2006).

The reviewed study on changed land laws in Tanzania suggested positive economic outcomes in terms of self employment and earnings, with potential, but not explicitly tested, effects on the position of women in society. The studies on changing inheritance law in India reported mixed results, with one study documenting positive effects on women's likelihood to inherit land (Goyal et al, 2010), while using a different methodology, two others (Roy and Brule) did not find statistically significant differences in inheritance. Roy and Goyal et al. also documented compensatory behaviour vis-à-vis children that may result from the legal changes, with increasing age of marriage, dowry prices and educational attainment for girls. Papers in this field have also stressed the potential backlash effects that may result from granting property or inheritance rights to women and girls, with reference to (justification) of wife beating and suicide rates.

Work on each of the pathways (titling, changing laws) has demonstrated it is important to consider heterogeneity. Not all women benefit equally, benefits or effects may depend on their marital status, the type of household they reside in (female headed vs male headed) or the geographical or political economic context they live in.

4. Promote female employment and equal opportunities for women on the formal and informal labour market

The World Development Report 2012 documents how despite increased labour force participation, gender gaps in earnings and productivity persists across all forms economic activity. Women in manufacturing earn less than men, farms operated by women on average have lower yields and female entrepreneurs are less productive than male entrepreneurs (World Bank, 2011c). Women may be restricted in their access to labour market opportunities due to lack of capacities or skills. Alternatively they may face time shortages due to their reproductive roles or they may be restricted in their freedom to move and act independently, either at their individual level or by social norms and discriminatory practices in markets and formal institutions.

Consequently, policies and programmes to promote female employment and equal opportunities for women in the formal and informal labour market may intervene at various levels. Here, we distinguish interventions aimed at:

- (i) Reducing the burden of reproductive responsibilities and change time-use patterns, for example by providing child care or parental leave, infrastructural services (water, transport and communication)
- (ii) Improving access to formal labour markets through active labour market policies, affirmative action, women's networks, labour or other laws and public works or other social protection programmes.
- (iii) Widening the scope for self-employment by introducing new technologies, improving access to credit or providing (business or vocational) training.

Not all of the interventions listed above are equally covered in this review and some of the interventions reviewed were undertaken to increase employment in general, some specifically to increase female employment and yet others for other reasons.

4.1. Reducing the burden of reproductive responsibilities

Several interventions could potentially reduce the burden of reproductive responsibilities of women, freeing up women's time to be invested in labour market participation. These range from providing (free) child care services, ensuring parental leave, delivering infrastructural services such as water and electricity or reducing transaction costs to access markets, for example by improving transport and communication. Here, the review focusses on interventions to provide child care services, while the potential for time-saving investments have been addressed elsewhere (see IOB evaluation on water for example).

Berlinsky and Galiani (2007) examine the effect of a large infrastructure programme that built preprimary class rooms for children aged 3-5 in Argentina. By exploiting the variation in pre-school construction intensity across regions and cohorts, the authors are able to estimate the impact of expanding pre-primary school facilities on school attendance and maternal labour supply. They find that the pre-school constructions induce a large increase in enrollment for children aged 3-5 and increase maternal employment.

The effect of a large expansion of pre-primary	Berlinsky	and	Argentina	
--	-----------	-----	-----------	--

school facilities	Galiani (2007)		
Labour market	Reducing reproductive burden	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+

In a more general approach, i.e. not related to a specific intervention, Berlinsky, Galiani and McEwan (2011) study the impact of free pre-school child care on maternal labour market outcomes in Argentina. Using a regression discontinuity design and IV estimation based on birth dates, they find that children's preschool enrolment was associated with improved labour market outcomes for women. Mothers with youngest children who were enrolled in the final year of preschool were 12.7 percentage points more likely to be employed, suggesting that 13 mothers for every 100 youngest children start to work, although this estimate was not statistically significant at conventional levels. A statistically significant effect was found of youngest children's preschool enrollment on full-time employment and hours worked: mothers with children enrolled in preschool were 19.1 percentage points more likely to work full time, measured as more than 20 hours per week, while women with children in preschool worked 7.8 hours more per week on average. Interestingly, the reported benefits were not found for mothers with children aged 4 who are not the youngest, pointing at important heterogeneity. These findings imply that expanding access to preschool education for youngest children can enhance the wage-earning prospects of mothers with preschool-age children, in addition to any positive effects on educational outcomes for the children.

Pre-school and Maternal Labour market outcomes	Berlinsky et al (2011)	Argentina	
Labour market	Reducing reproductive burden	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+
		Heterogeneity	Age youngest child

Similar findings are reported by Todd (2012) who reviews several studies on community day care programs in Latin America; In general these programmes substantially increase women's propensity to work and the number of hours that they work, as well as improving health, educational and nutrition outcomes for their children. Todd suggests however that these results may be context specific (i.e. to a context where women work in the formal sector) as a comparison of Guatemalan and Ghanaian women suggest that working patterns of the latter are not driven by child care supply as mothers mainly worked in the informal sector where it was easier to combine work with taking care of children.

4.2. Labour Market Policies

Some evidence exists on the possibilities to improve access to formal or stable informal sector jobs, such as through recruitment services, changes in family law or public works and social protection programmes.

4.2.1. Recruitment services

Jensen (2012) for example reports on an experiment changing the opportunity costs of entering the labour market; job opportunities in the business outsourcing industry in India. Three years of recruitment services were offered to women in randomly selected villages in the vicinity of Delhi at a time when the industry was so new that there was no awareness of these jobs outside the metropolis (2003-2006). The study randomly selected 80 treatment and 80 control villages and 20 households in each village. Young women (18-24) in the treatment villages were significantly less likely to get married or have children during this period. They choose to enter the labour market or obtain more post-school training. They also reported wanting to have fewer children and to work more after marriage and child birth. For school-aged girls, there were increases in both enrolment and BMI. Jensen does not find any evidence that working-aged men and younger boys also experienced changes in response to the treatment. Although the effects observed are sizeable, the author argues that recruitment services may not necessarily be the most cost effective way of providing information to the target group, other work by Jensen and Oster (2009) for example shows that the introduction of cable television in rural Indian villages also led to gains in women's schooling and reductions in fertility, potentially by providing new information on roles women might play outside of the home more generally and in the labour market in particular. In large, rural, and geographically dispersed populations media campaigns might be more cost effective compared to recruitment services.

Do labour market opportunities affect young women's work and family decision?	Jensen (2012)	India	
Labour market	Labour market policies	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	 + + +

Jensen does not discuss the effect of recruitment services on the type of job that women could obtain. This point is advanced by Glick and Roubaud (2006) in their analysis of labour markets and gender impacts of export processing zones (EPZ) in Madagascar, where EPZ jobs provide a significant increase in the pay for women with a background in low wage informal sector work, potentially contributing to gender equality in earnings in the urban economy. Hossein (2012) explores related questions for the ready-made garment (RMG) sector workers in Bangladesh. Here, the mass-scale of RMG employment for women has contributed to their individual economic empowerment, including greater autonomy and bargaining power within households. However, to date, this individual level progress has not been echoed at a collective level. The need for upgrading female worker productivity may provide an opportunity

to move to the collective level and demand that women workers are treated as full citizens with effective rights to personal safety and respect and a collective voice (events in 2013 have demonstrated the need for these).

4.2.2. *Changes in Family Law*

Hallward-Dreimeier and Gajigo (2011) study the impact of changes in the Ethiopian family law on strengthening women's economic rights and their ability to pursue economic opportunities. The Revised Family Code sets a minimum age of marriage to 18 years, expands women's control over assets (see also discussion under property rights) and removes the ability of a spouse to deny his wife the permission to work outside the home. These changes may enhance the ability of women to enter the labour market, either directly, or indirectly through an increased bargaining position in the household that results from their increased voice or exit option that the law provides. The introduction of this new family law was phased and was piloted in 2 cities and 3 of the 9 regions of the country. This allows for a difference in difference approach comparing regions with the reform to those that did not yet adopt the reform.¹¹ The authors find an increase in the proportion of women in occupations with a high proportion of non-home based employment and paid work. These effects were driven by changes for younger and single women, and did not affect older and married women. Moreover, younger and single women were found to have increased their share of occupations with year round employment and occupations with higher educational requirement. The heterogeneity of the effects suggests that although aimed at married women, the revised family law improved the bargaining position of younger single women, while not redressing the position of older married women.

Strengthening economic rights and women's occupational choice	Hallward-Dreimeier and Gajigo (2011)	Ethiopia	
Labour market	Reducing reproductive burden	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	(+) + Age and marital status

4.2.3. *Social protection programmes*

Social protection programmes could also affect labour market opportunities for women, for example through (public) employment programmes or as a "by-product" of cash transfer programmes. Todd (2012) reviews several wage subsidy and employment programs and reports that such programmes have been effective in increasing employment rates in general and women have often benefited from such programmes. The evidence on increased wages (or worker productivity) is mixed, potentially related

¹¹ The authors indicate there may be some issues concerning the comparability of the variables between the two DHS survey rounds (but find no evidence for this) and fail to account clearly for the level of aggregation used in the analysis.

to the short time frame between programme and evaluations. The Argentinean Proemplo program increased employment rate of participants but did not result in higher income levels. The Trabajar II public works programmes in Argentina created jobs and increased income, for both men and women. The Jefes income support programme in Argentina, a public works programme, increased both income and employment of women. Although officially targeted at unemployed head of households, participation in Jefes has been predominantly female. Qualitative information from discussions with program participants suggests that the program has enriched their life by allowing them to become involved in and contribute to their communities, the programme provides mother-friendly jobs (such as working in community kitchens) and potentially prepares them for other paid jobs (Tcherneva and Wray, 2007). Devereux and Solomon (2006) discuss important gender dimensions that may contribute to effectively incorporate women as beneficiaries in public works programmes and point at the potentially indirect empowering effect through the selection of female preferred community works.

Although female employment has not been a primary goal of (most) conditional cash transfer programmes aimed for example at improving educational attainment, health and nutrition for children, the incentives created by such programmes indirectly have influenced adult women's time use. The rural evaluation of the Oportunidades programme in Mexico reviewed by Todd (2012) for example found no significant changes in mother's labour force participation, while participation in the programme did affect mother's time use. Mothers spent substantial amounts of time to meet program requirements (bringing children to school and health check-ups and attending health talks) and in families with older girls (12-17 years) mothers' time engaged in child care activities increased, while that of older girls decreased, pointing at a substitution effect.

In a comparative paper on cash transfer programmes in Latin America, Veras Soares et al (2010) argue that although impacts on labour force participation vary from country to country, overall, there is no evidence for a negative impact on labour force participation of adults or women. In fact, the Bolsa Familia programme in Brazil, increased labour market participation rates of treated adults by 2.6 percent, with a higher participation rate for women compared to men.

Eyal and Woolard (2011) also point at labour market effects for mothers from the unconditional child support grant in South Africa. Using a regression-discontinuity design (based on eligibility age) and a difference in difference approach to deal with the potential endogeneity of child grant receipt, their preliminary analysis suggests that grant receipt is associated with a higher probability of being in the labour force, potentially because the grant funds daycare and the costs of sending children to school.

Female labour force participation and South Africa's child support grant	Eyal and Woolard (2011)	South Africa	
Labour market	Labour market policies	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+

Although different in nature, the Youth Opportunities Program in Northern Uganda also suggest positive labour market effects from a cash transfer scheme (Blattman et al,

2011). The programme provided cash transfers for investment in skills training and capital for self-employment. Interestingly, the transfers went to self-organized (occupational) groups rather than individuals. Out of 535 eligible groups, 265 groups (5460 individuals) were randomly assigned to receive the cash transfer, while 270 groups (5828 individuals) did not and could serve as a control group for the study. Although Blattman et al (2011) review the impact of the programme on a range of indicators it suffices here to focus on employment outcomes only. The authors find a large and significant effect on employment and income. Men and women increase their hours in employment outside the home, with a 25 percent increase reported by men and a 50 percent increase reported by women. There is a substantial increase (doubling) in skilled, capital intensive work, a result that is slightly but not significantly larger for women compared to men. The effects on income, household wealth or cash savings are generally positive but mixed when disaggregated by gender, and depend on the econometric specification.

Employment generation in rural Africa	Blattman et al (2011)	Uganda	
Labour market	Labour market policies	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+

These studies suggest that cash transfer programmes can increase labour market participation by women. However there is a lack of reliable data on the overall empowerment effects. Some programmes, especially those aimed at children, assume that women are available to carry out the care-related obligations associated with the conditional transfers without consideration of their breadwinning responsibilities or need for paid work, and to the neglect of any recognition of fathering responsibilities. Molyneux (2008) argues that by reinforcing gender stereotypes cash transfer programmes may in fact not contribute to female empowerment at all, especially when considering the combination other negative effects such as the potential backlash effects as reported in the section on violence against women. The literature review did not identify any publications that quantitatively addressed a multi-dimensional assessment of social protection programme effects on female empowerment.¹²

4.2.4. Women's networks

Women's involvement in networks may provide information and encourage them to increase their participation in the labour market. Although the literature search identified some work on the effects of membership in women's organisations more generally, or the effect of funding for such organisations (Gugerty and Kremer, 2008), these did not include the potential effects on labour market outcomes. Janssens (2007)

¹² Blattman et al (2011) in their evaluation of the Youth Opportunities Programme in Northern Uganda, do report heterogeneous gender effects of this cash transfer programme on social cohesion and community support, but they do not explicitly address gender relations or female empowerment in their study.

for example presents an impact evaluation of the Mahila Samakhy Programme in India. This women's empowerment programme that mobilises and supports low caste women through joint action did change levels of social capital, cooperation, immunization, school enrolment and access to credit for participants (and to some extent for non-participants in intervention villages as well), but did not directly address labour market outcomes.

Similarly, Deininger and Liu (2009a and 2009b) study the effect of a CDD programme on self-help groups in India and report positive changes in social capital (different measures of trust), economic empowerment (activities without permission of husband) and political participation, as well as improvements in nutritional status, consumption and assets, but not income or employment.

Gugerty and Kremer (2008) assess the effects of outside funding on the dynamics of participation in women's community associations in Kenya. After a random assignment of funding to women's organisations, they found little evidence that outside funding increased the organisational strength of the funded associations (based on member's evaluations and activities undertaken by the groups). They did find substantial evidence that funding changed group membership and leadership, with a reduced role of the disadvantaged. Younger, more educated and better-off women entered the group and these new entrants took up leadership positions (men and more educated women), while older women were more likely to leave the groups.

4.3. Widening the scope for self-employment

4.3.1. Increasing female participation in agricultural production.

Pandolfelli and Quisumbing (2010) documented a range of interventions aimed at increasing female participation in agricultural production (extension, technology etc). Not many of the interventions they review have been rigorously evaluated, but a few interesting examples are worth mentioning here.

The introduction of New Rice for Africa in West Africa marked important gains for women farmers, both in terms of productivity and non-productive indicators such as school attendance among children, increased gender parity, household consumption spending and higher calorie intake. (Note however that the methodology and precise definitions of outcomes could not be checked as the source documents could not be traced).

Pandolfelli and Quisumbing (2010) also refer to an evaluation of Farmer Field Schools (FFS) in Uganda, Tanzania and Kenya that showed increases in per capita agricultural income and crop productivity for participants in FFS. These increases were higher for female headed households compared to male headed households (Davies et al. 2012). Moreover, Humphreys et al (2012) emphasize the potential empowering effect of FFSs in Honduras, by documenting self-reported changes (measured ex-post) in participation in agriculture, household decision making and changes in freedom to move and participate in community activities.

Another interesting example is provided by Hallman et al (2007) who study the impact the introduction of small scale agricultural technologies (vegetable growing and fish ponds) in Bangladesh. Using a mixed method approach and controlling for endogenous programme placement, they found small, technology specific effects on income, assets and nutrition status of various household members and considered the effect of the intervention on survey based female empowerment indicators. These indicators were defined in focus group discussions and included physical mobility, control over resources, domestic violence and political knowledge and activity. When controlling for other covariates and endogenous programme placement, most empowerment indicators were not significantly different between treatment and control villages, with the exception of a marginal increase in the likelihood to work for pay and the ability to save money for expenses or security for women exposed to the new technology. The effects on the empowerment indicators were however site and technology specific as well.

An integrated economic and social analysis to assess the impact of vegetable and fishpond technologies	Hallman et al (2007)	Bangladesh	
Labour market	Widening the scope for self-employment	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	0 +/-0 + Technology and site

4.3.2. Micro-credit and self-employment

The findings on the impact of micro-finance are controversial and inconclusive (Yoong et al, 2012 and Todd, 2012). Whether and how much it helps the poor, and especially women, is the subject of intense debate. Even in the same country (Bangladesh) and using the same data sets, results vary, often depending on the type of econometric techniques used and the type of treatment effects considered. (see for example the debate between Pitt and Khandker (1998) and Roodman and Morduch (2009) who fail to replicate the earlier findings). Some studies show positive impacts, others report negative consequences, while still others stress the heterogeneity of effects on different groups. Hussein and Hussein (2003) argue that gender targeting of microfinance is beneficial in some contexts and not in others, while at the same time, the extent to which micro-finance will promote female empowerment is also likely to differ from one situation to the next, an issue beyond the scope of this review.

Most studies on micro-credit focus on economic outcomes (labour market participation, profitability of businesses etc.) while only few specifically consider female empowerment beyond the economic gains. Here we only report on studies that included both labour market outcomes as well as other proxy indicators for female empowerment or only the latter. Banerjee et al (2010) for example report on a randomized evaluation of the impact of introducing microcredit in a new market. Half

of 104 slums in Hyderabad, India were randomly selected for opening of an MFI branch while the remainder were not. This intervention increased total MFI borrowing and had heterogeneous effects on the creation and the profitability of small businesses, investment, and consumption. 15 to 18 months after the program, there was no effect of access to microcredit on average monthly expenditure per capita, but durable expenditure did increase. The effects are heterogeneous: Households with an existing business at the time of the program invest in durable goods, and their profits increase. Households with high propensity to become business owners see a decrease in nondurable consumption, consistent with the need to pay a fixed cost to enter entrepreneurship. Households with low propensity to become business owners see nondurable spending increase. Beyond these economic outcomes, the authors do study, but do not find impact on measures of health, education, or women's decision-making.

The miracle of micro-finance?	Banerjee et al (2010)	India	
Labour market	Widening the scope for self-employment	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	0 0 + Existing businesses Propensity to become business owner

Ashraf et al (2009) study the effect of securing women's control over allocated savings in a rural bank in the Philippines. They randomly allocated a commitment savings product (including marketing) to bank clients (increasing financial control) and compared empowerment indicators between these clients and two other groups; clients who received a marketing treatment on separate finances and a control group.¹³ Both the savings product and the marketing treatment increased decision making power, albeit the latter effect was smaller. For the savings product, the effect is predominantly driven by increases for women with below median decision making power at baseline. And also in this group the authors find an effect on the type of durable goods that are purchased in the household (female oriented durable goods such as kitchen appliances, sewing machines etc.). Protection of savings (and more generally protection of assets) against husbands (or husbands families in case of death/inheritance) are likely to have positive impact on women.

¹³ Ashraf et al (2009) used a decision making power index combining a range of elements, similarly but differently from the one used by Pitt et al (2006) who constructed 10 proxy empowerment indicators based on 75 questions, reflecting empowerment in nine different domains and an aggregate index.

Female empowerment: impact of a commitment savings product	Ashraf et al (2010)	Phillipines	
Labour market	Widening the scope for self-employment	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ + Baseline decision making power

4.3.3. Training

Several studies review the international experience of training programmes on employment and earnings, often with gender disaggregated results (see for example McKenzie and Woodruff, 2012, Todd, 2012). We first report some findings from general training programmes, followed by interventions specifically aimed at women. Regardless of the target group, training programmes are usually evaluated at a relatively short time after the completion of the programme, resulting in considerable uncertainty about the persistence of training effects.

Attanasio et al (2009) evaluate the impact of the Colombian training programme Jóvenes en Acción that run in 2005 in 7 cities. By randomly selecting programme participants from applications received by training institutions, their study compares the impact of the training on the population of individuals who are good enough to be accepted in the programme. The programme consisted of 3 months training in the classroom and 3 months training on the job and offered a daily cash transfer to cover transportation, lunch and (when relevant) childcare. Attanasio et al find large effects of the programme. Receiving the training increases paid employment by almost 7 percent and the monthly wage and salary earnings are 12 percent higher. Trainees are also more likely to be employed in a job with non-wage benefits and that have a written contract. This overall result is predominantly driven by women who significantly increase their likelihood to work and have higher wages. The effects for men are similar in size but are imprecisely estimated.

Subsidizing vocational training for disadvantaged youth	Attanasio et al (2011)	Colombia	
Labour market	Widening the scope for self-employment	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+

Using a similar evaluation set-up, the assessment of the Youth Job Training Programme in the Dominican Republic by Card et al (2011) found no evidence for basic impacts of the provided training and internships on employment and only some evidence of a modest impact on income for trainees. A more extended regression model that controls for the potential sample selection bias that may have resulted from not including youth that was originally assigned to receive training but failed to show up, show relatively small effects on employment outcomes. Disaggregating the sample by

gender, age, education and location shows large effects on employment rates for better educated trainees and those resident in the capital city. These subgroups are substantially different from the main beneficiaries that have been identified in evaluations of other training programmes (women and young adults) elsewhere. This may relate to the operation of the youth labour market in the Caribbean, suggesting that both content and context are important to understand the impact of a training intervention on labour market outcomes.

The labour market impacts of youth training	Card et al (2011)	Dominican Republic	
Labour market	Widening the scope for self-employment	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	0/+

Todd (2012) also reviews some programmes providing formal training to develop occupational skills (sometimes in response to economic shocks). The Mexican PROBECAT program had heterogeneous results by increasing employment of women older than 25 years with previous labour market experience, but not for younger inexperienced women. PROBECAT had no effect on women's earnings. The Joven program in Argentina significantly increased income for adult women and younger males, while adult men and younger females did not benefit. In Peru, ProJoven increased employment and hours worked by women, with modest increases in income and decreased gender segregation in occupational choices.

An example of an evaluation of training programmes targeted specifically at women is provided by Field et al (2010) who explore how traditional religious and caste institutions in India that impose restrictions on women's behavior influence their business activities. The authors make use of a field experiment in which a randomly selected sample of poor self-employed women were trained in basic financial literacy and business skills and encouraged to identify concrete financial goals (total sample nearly 600 women, 2/3 was offered training, 70% attended training). The women all lived in Ahmedabad and have savings accounts with SEWA Bank. The sample is relatively homogenous in terms of socio-economic status (e.g., education). Differences in religion and caste mean that they face very different traditional restrictions on mobility and social interactions. Restrictions are measured as a composite index based on the ability of women to socialize alone, their requirements to cover the face of wear a veil, their ability to directly speak to elders, ability to leave the house or neighbourhood alone and their ability to remarry. Muslim women face the most restrictions. Among Hindu women, upper castes (UC) face significantly more restrictions than scheduled castes (SC), the lowest group in the caste hierarchy. The outcomes considered are borrowing money, their level of savings in rupees (last month), earning any business income and talking about business plans with family members. Training increased borrowing for UC Hindu women, but not for SC Hindu or Muslim women. Savings were not significantly different between trained or non-trained women of any background. Trained UC Hindu women were 25 percent more likely to report business income in the past week and were more likely to talk with family members about

business plans. Muslim women did not benefit from the training program. These findings suggest that training helped women whose businesses had been restricted by social restrictions. However, women subject to extreme restrictions had too little agency to change their aspirations or activities. Even with more knowledge or higher aspirations, the most restricted women might face too many social constraints to undertake entrepreneurial activities.

Do traditional institutions constrain female entrepreneurship	Field et al (2010)	India	
Labour market	Widening the scope for self-employment	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	0/+ Restrictions on mobility and social interactions

Urguieta-Salomon et al (2008) study the effect of 10 capacity building projects in Mexico, with four projects including productive activities. Such projects seek to simultaneously strengthen women's work capacities and skills and initiate processes to effectively transform these capacities and earned income into better living conditions. This study examines the overall impact of these projects on indigenous women's participation in productive economic activities, autonomy in decision making, perceptions of household roles, time spent on household chores and their technical and administrative skills. The evaluation design is observational; 1,278 women are interviewed, and the comparison group is estimated by propensity score matching. The impact estimation was carried out for the following subsamples: (a) the aggregate of all initiatives, (b) initiatives that had exclusive capacity building activities, and (c) initiatives that promoted productive activities as well.

The authors report mixed results concerning the impact of the project on women's empowerment. First, the programme was associated with a statistically significant, 13.9 percentage point increase in the probability of participating in any productive economic activity (driven by agricultural activities) with the largest effect being observed among women who participated in projects that promoted the performance of productive activities in addition to capacity building. This is consistent with the fact that most of the initiatives implemented were oriented toward promoting backyard agricultural activities or livestock raising. Second, the programme was associated with a significant, 13.7 percentage point decrease in the frequency with which women asked their husbands for permission to participate in work activities, but not on other decision making variables; this result suggests that the programme was associated with only some improvement in women's autonomy. However, this study also finds that the programme was not associated with significant effects on household expenditures or improvements in technical and administrative skills, including knowing how to use a calculator or file for credit and ability to identify institutions to approach in case of

group or community problems. The programme did result in significant improvements in women's perceptions of gender roles only for the subset of projects involving both capacity-building and productive activities; participation in this subset of projects was associated with a 10.7 increase in the probability of agreeing that women and men have the same capacity to perform a paid occupation. Additional analysis revealed that no differential effect of the projects were found on young women subsample (under 36 years of age) and in the subsample of women with the highest education level (secondary school and over).

Poverty and Gender Perspective in Productive Projects	Urguieta-Solomon et al (2009)	Mexico	
Labour market	Widening the scope for self-employment	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	-/0/+ +/0 Type of intervention

Karlan and Valdivia (2011) used a randomized control trial, to measure the marginal impact of adding business training to a Peruvian village banking program for female microentrepreneurs. Entrepreneurship training sessions were given during normal weekly or monthly banking meetings in the treatment group, while control groups met at the same frequency for making loan and savings payments. Karlan and Valdivia report little or no changes in business revenue, profits or employment, but do find improvements in some business knowledge outcomes. The training does not have any impact on household level outcomes concerning decision making (such as loan use, saving or family size) nor on outcomes for children (labor and schooling). And although the training did not affect loan size or accumulated savings, positive effects were measured on client retention

Teaching entrepreneurship: impact of business training on micro-finance clients	Karlan and Valdivia (2011)	Peru	
Labour market	Widening the scope for self-employment	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	0 0 +/0

Mensch et al (2004) report on a vocational counselling and training programme for adolescents in India and present results on a range of intermediate outcomes (including hours spent in the labour market) and proxy indicators of female empowerment (including indices on gender roles, desired age at marriage and a self-esteem index). Their quasi-experimental pre and post-test research design yields mixed results that

could potentially be explained by a low number of girls who were interviewed both before and after the training. For this reason we do not discuss this paper in more detail.

4.4. Conclusion:

This section reviewed the evidence on interventions aimed at promoting equal opportunities for women on the formal and informal labour market and covered interventions aimed at reducing the burden of reproductive tasks for women, labour market policies and interventions aimed at widening the scope for self-employment. Two papers addressed the maternal labour market outcomes resulting from pre-school day care services in Argentina. The availability of such facilities indeed encourages maternal labour market outcomes, both in terms of likely employment and the hours worked. Other literature reviews suggests these results are found more consistently in the Latin American context, and may be specific to the labour market conditions in this context. Although the evidence on improved labour market outcomes is consistent, the studies did not include any (proxy) empowerment indicators to assess the effect of labour market participation on female empowerment more broadly.

The section on labour market policies covered recruitment services, changes in family law and social protection programmes. Recruitment services in India have showed to be particularly beneficial as a pathway to empowerment. Not only were women who received recruitment services more likely to enter the labour market or to obtain more schooling, they were also less likely to get married or have had children and reported different aspirations for the future as compared to women without recruitment services. Different aspirations not only for themselves, but also for children in their households, as evidenced by increased human capital investments in school-aged girls. The study on changes in the Ethiopian Family Law also showed beneficial outcomes for women. Especially young and single women were more likely to work outside the home and to work for pay, suggesting they are more free to make such choices.

The labour market effects of social protection programmes are mixed and depend on the type of programme. Existing reviews suggest that employment programmes are generally beneficial for women, mostly, but not consistently, for both employment and income. It is however not clear if and how this employment and income contribute to the broader empowerment of women. On the other hand, cash transfer programmes aimed at children have shown mixed evidence on maternal labour market outcomes, with no effect on labour market participation measured in Mexico and positive effects in South Africa). The extent to which this contributes to empowerment at large was not addressed in the south Africa study, while the Mexican study suggested increased reproductive time burden for women as a result of the programme.

Several interventions were included in the section on widening the scope for self employment. Efforts to increase women's participation in agricultural production have been reviewed elsewhere, with some positive results in terms of outcomes and (proxy) empowerment indicators. The study reviewed here also reported positive income effects after the introduction of small-scale productive technology. The intervention however

had limited empowerment effects in terms of decision making authority, with the exception of some economic choices, decisions. As micro-finance interventions have been reviewed extensively elsewhere, this review only included two such interventions that studied both economic outcomes and proxy empowerment indicators. The Indian study reviewed only found effects on the economic/business outcomes and not on decision making authority. The provision of a commitment savings product to bank clients in The Phillippines had positive effects on both economic outcomes and decision making indices, suggesting that the type of financial product offered potentially influences the type of empowerment effects that can be obtained.

Training can be an effective tool to enhance women's skills and capacity to participate in the informal or formal labour market, but the evidence is mixed, with positive effects on employment and income in some studies, while no effects or partial effects in others. Not all training is equally successful and not all skills may be equally important in obtaining access to jobs. Finding no effect of training may then also be related to the content of the training. In the evaluations reviewed, programmes are often taken for granted and the effect of content is not considered. Two of the papers reviewed studied a program especially aimed at women and also addressed proxy indicators of empowerment. The study by Field et al (2010) in India suggested women who are most strongly constrained did not benefit from business training, while those with less stringent constraints were able to make more economic choices. The evaluation of capacity building projects in Mexico showed positive economic outcomes and some increases in autonomy, notably changes in economic, but not in non-economic decision making.

Several of the reviewed papers on interventions to promote equal participation of women on the labour market also highlight heterogenous effects of interventions. Not all women equally benefit from interventions. The work on pre-school services suggested it is only women whose youngest child goes to child care who is able to increase her labour market participation, while the changes in the Ethiopian Family Law only affected young and unmarried women and not older and married women. Effects can be technology, site or programme specific (see social protection programmes), and interventions can have differential effects on women depending on their socio-cultural position (e.g. with lower baseline decision making authority or cultural mobility constraints).

Most of the reviewed papers only address the economic outcomes of the interventions, while few address (proxy) indicators of empowerment. Those who do, generally find no effect, with a few exceptions, predominantly in economic decision making or aspirations. Finding no or only limited effects on (proxy) indicators does not necessarily mean that the interventions do not have any empowering effects beyond the economic outcomes. The economic outcomes and economic decision making changes are more easy to measure in the short term.

5. Increased participation of women in political and local governance structures.

Reservations for women in political or local governance structures are often proposed as a way to enhance women's ability to participate in policymaking and they are now practiced in more than 100 countries (Krook, 2009). Gender quotas are not only expected to increase female representation per se, but also the participation of women in politics more generally, policy outcomes (such as the provision of particular goods and targeting of government beneficiary programmes), attitudes (voter attitudes as well as aspirations and voice) and welfare outcomes. The effects of mandated representation have been studied at various levels, such as in village assemblies in India, in district legislations and in community driven development programmes.

5.1. Village assemblies in India

An often cited example of the promotion of women's participation in governance is the reservation system for women in local governance in India. Each Indian village council consists of a set of elected councilors. These councilors elect a chief councilor, or pradhan. In every council election since 1998, one-third of councillor positions in each council and one-third of pradhan positions across councils in a district have been randomly "reserved" for women. The village council, which encompasses between five and fifteen villages, is responsible for the provision of local infrastructure – such as public buildings, water, and roads – and for identifying government program beneficiaries. The design of the legislation allows a natural experiment for measuring the causal impact of mandating a female leader (Pande and Ford, 2011). Researchers studied the effect of this reservation policy on three different dimensions; its effects on political participation of women, local policy and changes in attitudes (aspirations, voice and perceptions on female leadership). Some studies also include welfare outcomes relating to education and health. The focus of these studies is on the (randomly assigned) gender of the village leader and not on the mandatory one-third female reservation of village council posts.

5.1.1. Political Participation of Women

The studies reviewed address the effect of female reservation policies on political participation along two dimensions. First, the participation of general women in local governance meetings and second by considering women's candidacy and electoral success in councils that are not reserved for women.

An example of the first is the study by Chattopadhyay and Duflo (2004). Using data collected on 265 Village Councils in West Bengal and Rajasthan, they study the consequences of female reservation by comparing the political participation of women between reserved and unreserved village councils. Political participation is measured by: (1) The fraction of women among participants in the Gram Samsad, the village meeting (women are more likely to attend a village meeting when the village leader is a

woman, 10 vs 7 percent) (2) Have women filed a complaint in the GP in the last six months (20 vs 11 percent) (3) have men filed a complaint in the GP in the last six months (94 vs 100 percent). Similarly, using innovative data on village meetings, Beaman et al (2010) show that women are more likely to speak out in a village meeting when the local political leader position is reserved for a woman, either as a result of the presence of a woman leader at the meeting or indirectly from changes in the social context that result from female leadership.

The impact of reservation in the Panchayati Raj	Chattopadhyay and Duflo (2004)	India	
Political Participation	Political participation and policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+

Political reservation and substantive representation	Beaman et al (2010)	India	
Political Participation	Political participation and policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+

An example of the second strand of studies that explore future electoral gains for women is Bhavnani (2009). Looking at unreserved seats, he finds that the chances of a woman winning this seat is five times higher in a constituency that has previously been reserved for a woman, compared to constituencies that had not been reserved for women. In trying to unravel the mechanism through which these reservations work, Bhavnani considers four possible hurdles that women face when wanting to take power; from people in their households, from the parties they want to run for, from the voters and from male incumbents. He argues female reservation policy introduces a group of female leaders that are capable of securing their position after reservations have ended and by increasing the willingness of parties to grant women tickets to electoral seats. There is no evidence that voters coordinate on (not) electing women or whether the increased number of female candidates increases the chances of women winning office.

Do electoral quotas work after they are withdrawn?	Bhavnani (2009)	India	
Political Participation	Political participation	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+

Sustained effects on political representation for women is also reported by Beaman et al (2009). Using electoral data on 165 GPs, these authors show that, relative to councils that never had a reserved pradhan, almost twice as many women stood for, and won, these positions in councils where the pradhan position had been reserved for women in the previous two elections.

5.1.2. Policy outcomes

Based on the data from West-Bengal and Rajasthan, Chattopadhyay and Duflo (2004) also study the policy consequences of female representation by comparing the provision of social services (public goods) between reserved and unreserved village councils and ask to what extent these public goods are better aligned to female preferences when the council head is a woman. The preferences of men and women are proxied by the types of formal requests brought to the GP by each gender. Since complaining is costly (the individual has to come to the GP office), the complaints are a reasonable measure of the preferences of the individuals, if the individuals assume that complaining will have an effect. Data on actual investment in public goods was collected using resource mapping in focus group discussions. In both states, on average, the provision of public goods is more closely aligned to the preferences of women than to those of men when the village council seat is reserved for a woman. If the difference between the frequency at which a specific request occurs for women and men is 10%, the provision of that good increases by .16 standard deviations in West Bengal, and .44 standard deviations in Rajasthan. Additional analysis indicates that women are not more responsive to the needs of women or men in their communities, but their own preferences are more aligned to the preferences of women, and therefore, female leaders end up serving women better.

Additional work suggests this effect may be temporal only. Using different sources of data, Beaman et al (2010) find that although male and female leaders are different in terms of the political and social networks they have access to, female leaders first increase the responsiveness to female concerns expressed in these village meetings. However, when they stay in power, women leaders mature and also become more responsive to men's priorities. This study also finds that female leaders may reduce corruption as bribes paid by men and women in villages with a female leader were 2.7 to 3.2 percentage points lower. Interestingly, there is no evidence that investments in public goods made by female leaders will be undone when a male leader takes over, suggesting increased investments in water for example may be a permanent and not a temporal improvement.

Women politicians, children's outcomes and gender bias	Beaman et al (2007)	India	
Political Participation	policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+ +

Additional analysis using the same data, showed the quality of public goods and outcomes for children were also significantly better in villages with women leaders. Children were more likely to finish the entire immunization cycle, had better access to government day care and the gender gap in school attendance is smaller (Beaman et al, 2007). Similar findings are reported by Kumar and Prakash (2012) who study the effect of political decentralisation and gender quota on child health outcomes in Bihar and Jharkhand State. However, these states differ from other Indian States in reservation policy, making it more difficult to identify causality of female reservation to health outcomes.

Given the context specific nature of (most) of these studies documenting the positive relation between female reservation and policy outcomes, critics have questioned their external validity. Other studies do not find positive impacts of female reservation on public good provision. Ban and Rao (2008) for example study the effect of reservations for women in the village assemblies in four southern Indian states that are more gender equal compared to Rajasthan and West-Bengal and differ in decentralisation history. Based on village PRAs (on public good investments) and 5286 household surveys in 523 villages, the authors find there is no difference in performance of Panchayats with male or female leaders (measured in terms of activities in water, health, education, sanitation, roads, transport, electricity). Women's participation in village assemblies is not larger in villages that have women's reservation, and they find no evidence that women politicians make decisions in line with the needs of women. They do find evidence that political experience enhances the performance of women leaders more than it does for men. Moreover, women in villages which are less dominated by upper castes (where most of the land in the village is owned by upper castes), and in states that have relatively mature panchayat systems, perform better than men. This suggests that institutional factors affect women politicians more than they affect men.

The impact of reservation in the Panchayati Raj	Ban and Rao (2008)	India	
Political Participation	Policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	0/+ Political economy

Other authors study the impact of female reservation policy on targeting of program beneficiaries, another responsibility of the village councils. Based on survey data from 89 villages that belong to 57 GPs spread throughout 15 districts in West Bengal Bardhan et al (2010) study the targeting of program beneficiaries in a wider range of local government programs including private benefits such as housing and toilets constructed, employment provided in public works programs, below-poverty-line (BPL) cards, IRDP loans and agricultural mini-kits distributed. The authors specifically consider targeting to female headed households, SC/ST households and landless households and do not find evidence of a positive impact of women reservations on any measures of targeting. They do find significant negative effects on some dimensions, such as targeting to low caste groups.

Impact of political reservations in West Bengal	Bardhan et al (2010)	India	
Political Participation	Policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	-/0

These findings on targeting are in line with Besley, Pande and Rao (2005) who found that reservation of women Pradhan in three south Indian States in 2002 did not have an effect on targeting BPL cards. Earlier work by Bardhan, Mookherjee and Torrado (2005) found that women reservations improved targeting of IRDP credit, but worsened targeting of employment programmes to landless and SC/ST households. GPs with a women reservation were also found to be less effective in raising local revenues from non-tax sources. This work used data on the first year the reservations were in place (1998) and was based on data from official records of disbursing institutions, rather than household surveys.

Political selection and the quality of governments	Besley et al (2005)	India	
Political Participation	Policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	0

Impact of reservations of Panchayat Pradhans on Targeting in West-Bengal	Bardhan et al (2005)	India	
Political Participation	Policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	-/+

In the context of this mixed evidence, Deininger et al (2011) try to unravel the mechanism behind the impact of female reservation on policy outcomes. They study the long-term impact of female reservation in India using a nationally representative dataset that collected individual level data some 15 years after the reforms were implemented, with about one-third of the villages never having been reserved. They study three possible channels through which reservation could affect long term outcomes: increased participation in the political process, changes in the opinions vis a vis women leaders and increased contributions to public goods. They find that reservation led to lower leader attributes and the quality of public service delivery, as perceived by respondents, although female reservation did have a positive effect on the availability of local government officials. The analysis of Deininger et al (2011) also showed that the extent and nature of political participation of women increased, as did the perceived ability to hold leaders to account and the willingness of individuals to contribute to (specific) public goods. These effects persist over time and tend to materialize with a lag, suggesting learning processes take place. These results suggest that the pathway of increased political participation by men and especially women may be the main benefit from female reservation. Initial lower quality of leaders and public service delivery are counterbalanced by increased participation in meetings and willingness to contribute to public goods at later stages. The heterogeneity of their effects across gender suggests that aggregation of results at a household level may hide important differences and effects that can be found in individuals within households.

Does Female Reservation Affect long term political outcomes?	Deininger et al (2011)	India	
Political Participation	Political participation and policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ + sexe

5.1.3. Attitudes: aspirations, voice and perceptions

Apart from intermediary outcomes such as political participation and policy outcomes, female reservation may also change aspirations and voice of women and men in the reserved villages. Beaman et al (2012) studied the [impact](#) of the reservation policy on aspirations of parents and adolescents, specifically by considering the gender gap between aspirations for/of boys and girls. Using 8453 surveys of adolescents aged 11 to 15 and their parents in 495 villages, they found that, relative to villages in which such positions were never reserved, the gender gap in aspirations closed by 20% in parents and 32% in adolescents aspirations in villages assigned a female leader for two election cycles. The decline in gaps is driven by an increase in parents/girls' aspirations, not by a decrease in parents/ boys'. Paralleling the changes in aspirations, the presence of female leaders also alters educational attainment and time use. The gender gap in adolescent educational attainment was erased, and girls spent less time on household chores. No evidence was found of changes in young women's labor market opportunities or changes in the educational environment. These results suggests that the impact of female reservation on aspirations in/for girls and boys goes beyond the (limited) ability to change the concrete situation of women and girls in the short run through direct policy actions. It is their presence as positive role models for the younger generation that seems to underlie observed changes in aspirations and educational outcomes of adolescent girls. In all cases, the gender gap starts shrinking only during the second electoral mandate held by a woman.

Female leadership raises aspirations and educational attainment for girls	Beaman et al (2012)	India	
Political Participation	Attitudes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ + Number of reservations

Another example of how political reservation in India may change attitudes is provided by Iyer et al (2012). These authors examine the impact of mandated political representation on reported crimes against women. Based on an analysis of district and state level crime reports (rape, kidnapping of women and girls, dowry deaths, sexual harassment, molestation, cruelty by husbands or relatives and importation of women

and girls, prostitution, pornography, giving and receiving dowry and sati), they find that the introduction of mandated political representation for women leads to large and statistically significant increases in the number of reported crimes against women. Reported rapes per capita rose by 23% and kidnapping of women showed a 13% increase. These results are robust to the inclusion of controls for economic, demographic and political variables, the strength of the police force and state-specific time trends. Iyer et al (2012) do not find an effect on any categories of crime not specifically targeted against women – such as kidnapping of men, crimes against property or crimes against public order. This strongly suggests that there is no overall deterioration in law and order conditions or policy changes other than the political representation. This is consistent with the insignificant effect of political representation on categories of crime such as murder, where the reporting bias is least likely to be a problem. Further, there is no evidence that the presence of female political representatives leads to a deterioration of police effort. The number of arrests increased significantly after the introduction of women’s representation, particularly for cases dealing with kidnapping of women. The quality of police effort, measured by the percentage of cases where the prima facie evidence for arrests was upheld by a magistrate, also showed no decline after female reservation. Together, this evidence suggests that the relative increase in reported crimes is driven by improved reporting of such crimes rather than a rise in the actual crimes committed against women.

Political Representation and crime	Iyer et al (2012)	India	
Political Participation	Political participation and policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+

Interestingly, and in contrast to the other work on the effect of mandated reservations, Iyer et al (2012) are able to examine whether additional representation at higher levels of government are important for crime outcomes. Having a woman as head of the district council has a much smaller effect on the reported crimes against women, over and above the broad-based representation of women in village and district councils. There is no effect of the presence of women in the state legislature.

Powerful women: does exposure reduce bias?	Beaman et al (2009)	India	
Political Participation	Political participation and Attitudes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	-/+ + Number of reservations Sexe

Finally, Beaman et al (2009) studied the impact of reservations on perceptions on female leaders (Beaman et al 2009.), testing the hypothesis that exposure to women

leaders informs voters on women's ability to lead. The authors address this question with survey data on voter evaluations, voter attitudes and voter implicit tastes. When asking male and female survey respondents to evaluate the effectiveness of female leaders the authors find that repeated exposure improves voter evaluation of female pradhans. Female pradhans in councils reserved for a female pradhan for the first time receive worse evaluations relative to pradhans in councils that have not been reserved. However, this is not true for women pradhan in councils reserved for a second time. Although these results are consistent with an initial voter bias against female leaders that decreases with exposure, they are also consistent with changes in the selection, or behavior, of female leaders over time. To disentangle these effects the authors use experimental data to directly measure bias against female leaders.

First, villagers were asked to evaluate the effectiveness of hypothetical leaders as described through vignettes and recorded speeches in which the leader gender was experimentally manipulated. Exposure to a female leader radically altered male villagers' perceptions of female leader effectiveness. The evaluation gap disappears in currently or previously reserved villages. Among female villagers a smaller (insignificant) bias was observed that does not appear to be affected by the reservation status of the village. A second evaluation criterion consisted of a set of IATs (Implicit Association Tests) to elicit voters' implicit tastes. Exposure to female leaders (through reservation) increased the likelihood that male villagers associated women with leadership activities (as opposed to domestic activities).

Together, these results show an improvement in voter perceptions of female leaders suggesting that the use of gender quotas causes voters to have information on the abilities of women leaders (or other disadvantaged groups).

5.2. Female leadership at district level

Clots-Figuras (2012a and 2012b) takes a different approach to study the effect of increased political participation of women in India. She studies the effect of female leaders on (i) the type of policies implemented (ii) expenditures to sectors and (iii) educational attainment (completed primary education). Her work does not consider the effect of a specific intervention, but assess the effect of female leadership at district rather than village level. She uses instrumental variables estimation to get unbiased estimates of the effect of increased female representation. Using a unique dataset on politicians, female leadership is instrumented with female leadership in constituencies where the female candidates won the elections with a small margin only. This is a valid instrument because female candidates who barely win the elections against a man do it in constituencies where there is no clear "preference for female politicians", as the male politician could have won the election as well. These constituencies will be ex-ante comparable to constituencies in which male candidates win in a close election against a woman.

Women in Politics	Clots-Figuras (2012b)	India	
Political Participation	Policy outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ Social position

In her work on policy decisions, expenditures and public good investments that matches the politicians dataset to district level data, Clots-Figuras (2012b) indeed finds that politicians' gender affects policy, but that their social position, i.e., their caste, should be taken into account as well. Female legislators in seats reserved for lower castes and disadvantaged tribes invest more in health and early education and favor "women-friendly" laws, such as amendments to the Hindu Succession Act, which was designed to give women the same inheritance rights as men. They also favor redistributive policies, such as land reforms. In contrast, female legislators from higher castes do not have any impact on "women-friendly" laws, oppose land reforms, invest in higher tiers of education and reduce social expenditure.

Are female leaders good for education?	Clots-Figuras (2012a)	India	
Political Participation	Policy and educational outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ Social position

A second paper by the same author focusses on female representation and primary education. Here, the assumption is that if female politicians care about improving the lives of those with whom they share their identity then they would choose to invest in education in urban areas as there, returns for women are higher than in rural areas. Combining the politicians dataset with individual data by cohort and district of residence, Clots-Figuras (2012a) finds that increasing female representation in a district by 10 percentage points, the probability that an individual attains primary education in an urban area increases by 6 percentage points (= 8% of the total probability that an individual obtains primary education in an urban area). Given that being a woman reduces the probability of attaining primary education by 6 percentage points and being SC/ST reduces it by 18 percentage points, this is considered as an important magnitude. Female politicians have a positive effect on the education of both girls and boys; the coefficient for the effect on girls is 50% larger in magnitude than the one for the effect on boys, although the difference between these two coefficients is not significant. This difference in magnitudes may be due to the fact that women have lower primary education attainments than men to start with, or may be due to the fact that female

politicians promote educational policies that increase girls' education that also have spillover effects on boys.

Disaggregating between boys and girls also show that the effects are sensitive to the background of the legislator. Both SC/ST and general female politicians have a positive effect on the probability that girls attain primary education in urban areas, while their effect on boys is not significant. By increasing SC/ST female representation by 10 percentage points, the probability that a girl living in an urban area attains primary education increases by 15 percentage points, whereas by increasing general female representation by 10 percentage points, the probability that a girl attains primary education in an urban area increases by 5 percentage points. In general SC/ST female politicians favor education of girls and the SC/STs, while general female politicians favor education of girls and general individuals.

Bhalotra and Clots-Figuras (2011) combine the district electoral data with data on individual level outcomes from the Indian National Health Surveys (1998-1999) to study the effect of an increasing share of women in the state assembly constituencies at district level on health outcomes. They find that a one standard deviation increase in women's share in the assembly reduces neonatal mortality by 24 percent, a 0.06 deviation change. This effect is found both in the birthyear and in the two years preceding the birth. Similar effects are found on infant mortality. To further decompose this effect on health outcomes, Bhalotra and Clots-Figuras (2011) compare investments in public goods at village level and argue that women politicians are more likely to invest in village level public health infrastructure, while men are more likely to invest in financial and communication infrastructure. How exactly this relationship between district representatives and village level facilities works in practice remains unclear. At the same time, higher female representation also results in higher probabilities of attending ante-natal care, taking iron and folic supplements during pregnancy, giving birth in a government facility and not at home, early initiation of breastfeeding and full immunization by the age of one.

Health and the political agency of women	Bhalotra and Clots-Figuras (2011)	India	
Political Participation	Policy and health outcomes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+ +

These analyses add to the evidence base that the gender of a leader influences policy choices and outcomes for constituents. Although these papers do not directly evaluate an intervention they may well inform the ongoing policy debate in India to extend female reservations to state and national levels.

5.3. Other governance structures

Although there is increasing evidence on the impact of female reservation in (local) governance, the knowledge base on mandates for women in Community Driven Development (CDD) or other local governance institutions is limited. We found one paper studying the impact of an intervention that verbally encouraged communities to increase female participation on their water users committees. This study is situated in Kenya, where an NGO delivers engineering works to communities who are then made responsible for the management of the infrastructure. The study included 334 user groups of which half were encouraged to increase female participation. Leino (2007) reports that such encouragement does in fact increase female participation, with more women on committees and a greater likelihood that women acted as chairpersons (as well as other positions) in the committees. Such participation did not however have any effect, positive or negative, on the frequency and quality of maintenance of the water infrastructure.

Gender and community management of water infrastructure	Leino (2007)	Kenya	
Political Participation	Participation and management quality	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	0 +/-0

Agarwal takes a slightly different perspective in studying the effects of the proportional strength of women in Community Forestry Institutions in India and Nepal. Her analysis of women's participation in CFI meetings (measured by attendance, speaking up and holding leadership positions) suggest there is something like a critical mass in the composition of the executive committee of the CFI. Women are more likely to participate in CFI meetings when women for one-quarter to one-third of the executive committee members (Agarwal, 2010). Similarly, Agarwal (2009) argues that more women in the executive committee is also beneficial for the forest conditions as they improve rule compliance and forest protection. Both these studies do not however take into account that the proportional strength of women and the outcomes analysed may be jointly determined.

In line with large increases in funding for participatory development efforts over the past decades, there is increasing effort to rigorously measure the impact of CDD programmes (see Mansuri and Rao (2013) for a recent review). Despite efforts to develop a toolkit to assess gender dimensions of CDD programmes (World Bank, 2011a and 2011b) not all evaluations include female empowerment as an outcome indicator (Parajuli et al, 2012) or can test the effect of increasing female participation in local development committees (Fearon et al, 2008). Beath et al. (2010) for example evaluated the second phase of the Aghanistran National Solidarity Programme, a CDD programme with 250 treatment and 250 control villages that created community development councils (CDC) in each village and disbursed block grants to support the

implementation of projects designed and selected by the councils. Beath et al (2010) reviewed a list of indicators ranging from village governance and political attitudes and social cohesion to access to services and economic activities. The authors reported mixed results on female empowerment indicators, with weak effects on attitudes towards the participation of women in governance, moderate evidence on employment and schooling and respect for women and strong effects on the socialization and mobility of women in the village. Moreover, weak effects on the engagement of women in economic activities did not lead to changes in household decision making. However, these results can only be attributed to the CDD programme itself, and not necessarily to increased female participation in local governance as, by design, all treatment villages had equal participation of men and women in the CDC.

The same holds for the evaluation of the random assignment of a Community Driven Development programme in Sierra Leone (Casey et al, 2011). Although the programme imposed participation requirements for women, Casey et al do not find any lasting evidence on changes in village institutions, decision making processes, *de facto* political power or social norms and attitudes towards female leadership.

One evaluation did specifically address the effect of imposed participation requirements for women. For a community driven reconstruction programme in DRC, Humphreys et al (2012) found small positive effects on gender composition of post-intervention committees and attitudes towards women.¹⁴ A random allocation of a gender parity restriction on the composition of Village Development Committees (in 75 percent of the treated villages) did not result in any differences in post-intervention committee composition nor attitudes towards equal rights for women.

Social and economic impact of Tuungane	Humphreys et al (2012)	DRC	
Political Participation	Participation and attitudes	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	0 0 0

5.4. Conclusions:

The papers on the effect of female reservation policy considered effect in three different fields; its effects on the political participation of women, policy outcomes (such as the provision of particular goods and targeting of government beneficiary programmes) and changes in attitudes (aspirations, voice and perceptions on female leadership). Additionally, some papers included welfare outcomes pertaining to education and health as well. In the pathways to empowerment, increased political participation and policy outcomes aligned to women's preferences are outcomes of the intervention, while changes in attitudes and welfare outcomes signal (proxy) impact indicators.

¹⁴ Humphreys et al (2012) study the effect of the programme on a range of indicators related to project implementation, local public goods, economic welfare and collective action. Here we have restricted the discussion to indicators relevant from a female empowerment perspective.

The studies that considered the effect of the female reservations on the political participation of women in India, all found positive effects and Deininger et al (2011) argue that this is the main channel through which the law reform influences women's lives.

The results on policy outcomes are mixed and context specific. The Indian village studies reported no (or small negative) effects of reservation on targeting of (government) programmes, while mixed results were reported for public goods provisions. The papers studying female representation at district level generally found positive effects on public goods provision, while the papers on CDD reported no effects on policy or management quality outcomes. A possible explanation for these observed differences between reservation in Community Driven Development project and local government bodies may be explained with reference to the type of power that is covered by the female reservations. The Indian political reservations gave women real power over resources as part of the formal state administration, while CDD takes a more indirect approach and does not sideline chiefs or other male elders (Casey, 2011). Similarly, the Indian system with its single member jurisdiction make it easier to capture the policy impacts of having a female leader as compared to the composed committees in the CDD example (Pande and Ford, 2011)

The evidence on a negative relation with some targeting outcomes, albeit marginally, suggests that gender quota's may have negative externalities, for example when reservations cause a crowding out in representation of other marginalized groups or in policy outcomes (Pande and Ford, 2011). Some papers point at the (initially) detrimental effects of women's inexperience as leaders on their leadership performance (Deininger et al. 2011). Ban and Rao (2008) for example find a small difference between men and women without previous political experience, and this difference disappears soon, after 1.3 years in office.

The reservation of village leadership positions has also affected a range of attitudes of the population in the councils that were headed by women. Iyer et al (2012) documented an increase in crimes reported against women, suggesting the reservations may have given women more voice. Beaman et al (2012) reported changed career, marriage and childbearing aspirations for girls and their parents together with a closing of the gender gap in education and a reduction of time that adolescent girls spend on household chores. Female leaders are role models in the pathway to empowerment. Although some measured welfare outcomes related to health and education indeed show improvements, the time span of the studies have been too short to evaluate if changed aspirations indeed lead to actual changes in behaviour and a greater freedom of women to choose the life they want to live.

This raises an important issue on the timing of the measurement of effects; some of the results in the Indian village assembly studies, especially those related to attitudes, are visible only after two periods of reservation. While women leaders initially invest more in public goods preferred by women, when more experienced they are also more responsive to men's needs (compared to leaders of non-reserved villages). Moreover, there is no evidence that policy choices made by female leaders are reversed when the reservation ends.

Some papers reported additional heterogeneity for men and women, boys and girls, but also within these groups. Women are not only their gender, they also have a class position and other characteristics that may influence the impact of interventions (for example place of residence; urban, rural)

Although the papers do point at several pathways to empowerment that may emerge from the female reservation policies, it is not clear if reservations are the best or most cost-effective way to achieve this (Kanpur, 2010).

6. Reducing gender based violence

Gender-based violence is physical, psychological or sexual violence against an individual or a group on the basis of gender or gender norms. Although men can also be victims of GBV, the majority of victims are women. GBV encompasses various forms of violence such as intimate partner violence (IPV), sexual abuse, sexual assault and rape, violence arising from dowries and female genital mutilation, honor killings, trafficking, forced prostitution and sexual harassment and intimidation (Cooper et al, 2013). Here we restrict ourselves to violence against girls and women and do not consider other forms of gender based violence and we use the term GBV interchangeably with violence against women (VAW).

VAW is a violation of the basic rights of women and has severe health and social consequences with associated high economic and social costs (Bobonis, 2013). Choices of women are severely constrained by (the threat of) violence and this may thus restrict their participation in development and realizing their full potential. With the WHO Multi-country study and the DHSs, much progress has been made in measuring gender based violence in the past decade, increasing knowledge about prevalence of IPV and enabling analyses of risk and protective factors (Morrison et al, 2007). VAW can be understood as an interplay between a combination of societal and situational factors on the one hand (such as gender norms, economic factors and legal frameworks) and individual causes (alcoholism, decision making power, attitudes, economic resources, etc.) on the other. VAW is (partially) arising from power inequality, either in the economic sphere or in the socio-cultural or political sphere. In the context of (post) (armed) conflict, these factors interplay with wartime factors such as greater polarization of gender roles and intergroup competition that may exacerbate VAW.

Responses to gender based violence have been documented on various levels/thematic areas.¹⁵ First, interventions which seek to prevent violence, for example by educational programmes aiming to change gender norms, or by enhancing women's bargaining position within the household by economic means. Second, interventions aimed at providing support to women who have been affected by violence. And third, increasing access to justice for survivors of gender-based violence, for example by enacting laws and national plans (Morrison et al. 2007). We follow this distinction in interventions and focus on Intimate Partner violence (IPV) or domestic violence and Female Genital Mutilation/Cutting. The second and third types of interventions have not been rigorously evaluated (Cooper et al., 2013) and are addressed briefly only.

Not all studies or interventions reviewed here were primarily aimed at reducing violence against women, in some cases, changes in (attitudes towards) violence against women were 'side-products' of interventions aimed for example at HIV/AIDS prevention or the economic advancement of women. In interpreting the effects on violence against women, it should be borne in mind, that a reported increase in gender

¹⁵ Responses to GBV have been documented in several recent reviews, see for example Heise (2011), Morrison et al. (2007), Cooper et al (2013), to which we will refer throughout this section.

based violence may be indicative of the success of a campaign encouraging help-seeking behavior or of the perverse consequence of a misaligned social norms marketing campaign that perpetuates perceptions that GBV is common within the community.

Most studies focus on one form of violence (physical or sexual) while others distinguish various forms of violence, such as physical, sexual and emotional violence (see for example Finnoff (2012) and Bobonis et al (2011 and 2013). Although most of the studies reviewed here have a methodological set-up that allow for a comparison between groups, most studies rely on self-reported attitudes and self-reported levels of violence and do not provide evidence on actual behavioural change. As social norms marketing will create pressures for self-reported behavior change where no actual behavior change has occurred, self-reports may be biased.

6. 1. Intimate Partner Violence

This section reviews the evidence that is available on interventions aimed at reducing intimate partner violence (IPV). We review interventions aimed at changing social norms (small group interventions, training and social marketing, free primary education and media), improving women's economic position, law and security sector reform and support for survivors.

6.1.1. Changing Social Norms

Participatory Learning Groups

Stepping Stones is small group intervention designed to improve sexual health by applying participatory learning techniques and stimulating critical reflection. Its primary emphasis is on building knowledge, risk awareness and communication skills around gender, HIV, violence and relationships. The Stepping Stones workshops address a wide range of issues (including gender inequalities, violence etc.) and have now been adapted and used in over 40 different countries. Most versions involve at least 50 hours of intervention over 10 to 12 weeks, delivered in 15 sessions. We found two quantitative evaluations of the programme, including a community randomized trial in South Africa and a quasi-experimental study in India.

The South African evaluation of Stepping Stones was conducted from 2006 to 2008 using a cluster randomized trial in the Eastern Cape province (Jewkes et al, 2008). The trial evaluated a South African adaptation of the curriculum delivered to two, single-sex peer groups in 70 clusters, including 35 intervention villages or townships and 35 control communities. Each group was composed of approximately 20 young women or 20 young men, aged 15 to 26 who received either the full 50-hour Stepping Stones curriculum over 6 to 8 weeks, or a three hour workshop on HIV and safer sex in control communities. Young men participating in the intervention were significantly less likely than men in the control communities to report perpetrating intimate partner violence (IPV). At 12 months, this reduction was 27% and was only marginally significant, but

the reduction increased to 38% at 24 months and became statistically significant. The intervention also achieved significant reductions in male participants' engagement in transactional sex and problem drinking at 12 months. These self-reports should be considered with care however, as female Stepping Stones participants did not report lower average rates of partner violence or forced sex than did young women receiving the 3-hour control workshop.

The Stepping Stone intervention also did reduce acquisition of new cases of herpes (HSV-2) among male participants by one third (risk ratio 0.67; 95% CI 0.46-0.97), but had no demonstrable effect on HIV acquisition at either 12 months or 2 years. However, no evidence was found of any desired behaviour change in women. In fact, women participating reported more transactional sex with a casual partner at 12 months and a trend toward more unwanted pregnancies at 24 months. The authors relate this finding to the possibility that the programme has contributed to the enhancement of descriptive norms ("it is normal to have transactional sex") rather than changing norms.

Impact of Stepping Stones	Jewkes et al (2008)	South Africa	
Gender based violence	Changing social norms	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	-/0/+ -/0/+ Sexe

In India, Bradley et al (2011) evaluated the Karnataka Health Promotion Trust (KHPT) that implemented Stepping Stones in 202 villages in northern Karnataka as part of a larger set of HIV intervention activities. The goal of the study was to evaluate the impact on individual knowledge, attitudes and behaviour, as well as to assess whether the information in the curriculum had diffused to the participants' close friends and whether there had been any diffusion of ideas to the wider community in which the training had taken place.

The study combined in-depth interviews with past trainees and their close contacts, polling booth surveys with past trainees and general population members in their villages, as well as in other villages that had not received the Stepping Stones training. Interviewed respondents reported significant changes in their relationships after training. Although the study found significant changes in knowledge and behaviour of both participants and their close contacts, most attitudes around male-female roles had not changed. Moreover, the evaluation revealed limited diffusion of the information into the wider community, which may be explained by a lack of continued engagement or collective action after the completion of the curriculum.

Evaluation of Stepping Stones as a tool for changing knowledge	Bradley et al (2011)	India	
Gender based violence	Changing social norms	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	-/0 -/0

Training and social marketing

Another interesting example is a combination of participatory training with advocacy and lifestyle social marketing programmes aimed at changing community norms.¹⁶ Comparable interventions have been reported in Brazil (Programme H) (Pulerwitz et al, 2006), Ethiopia (Male Norms Initiative) (Pulerwitz et al. 2010a) and India (Yaara Dosti) (Verma et al, 2008). Studies on these three programmes measure the effect of group education sessions and social marketing programmes (including street plays, posters, t-shirts, community discussions etc) on attitudes towards gender equitable norms using the so-called GEM scale. This scale includes a (context specific) number of attitudinal statements about gender roles in the areas of reproductive health and disease prevention, sexuality, violence and domestic life and child care. Here, we review only the programmes in India and Ethiopia as studies on these interventions also discuss self-reported violence against partners. The results should be interpreted with some care however, although the studies do have a randomized set up, they do not control for self-selection into intervention groups.

In India, Verma et al (2008) report a decline in the proportion of men in the urban intervention sites (two slums in Mumbai) who reported violence against a partner (either sexual or non-sexual/romantic) in the last three months. A more than two fold decline to less than 20% ($p < 0.05$) after six months. The number of men reporting recent partner violence in the project's rural intervention site (Gorakhpur) also declined from 50% to 37%. By contrast, reported rates of partner violence increased significantly in both the urban and rural comparison sites. When controlling for education, age, occupation and marital status regression analysis showed that young men exposed to the intervention in Mumbai and Gorakhpur were about five times and two times less likely, respectively, to report partner violence than men in comparison communities ($p < .001$). The study also considered the association between support for gender equal norms and partner violence. Young men who expressed more gender-equitable attitudes were less likely to be violent with their partners in both Mumbai and Gorakhpur.

Promoting gender equity as a strategy to reduce HIV risk and GBV in India	Verma et al (2008)	India	
Gender based violence	Changing social norms	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	+ -

Increases in gender equitable attitudes, declines in reported rates of partner violence and an association between these two, were also found in Ethiopia, although the study documented little movement in specific attitudes related to domestic violence (Pulerwitz et al, 2010a). The percentage of young men who reported that they perpetrated violence

¹⁶ See Paluck and Bell (2010) for a literature review on social norms marketing.

toward their primary partners decreased, a change that was not seen among the comparison group.

Promoting Gender Equity for HIV and Violence Prevention	Pulerwitz et al (2010)	Ethiopia	
Gender based violence	Changing social norms	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ - LSSM/GES intervention

The set-up of the programmes with three different types of interventions (group education only, group education and social marketing and delayed intervention or control group) also allows for a comparison of the effect of these programme components. This does not however yield clear results. Multivariate analysis in Ethiopia suggests that the combined intervention is less successful as young men from the group education only arm were 65% less likely to exhibit violence toward their partners over time whereas participants from the combined intervention were 55% less likely to exhibit violence over time. Similarly, the Indian study found that the lifestyle social marketing (LSSM) campaign on top of group educational sessions (GES) did not increase the programme's impact on norms and behaviour while Brazil's Programme H that show greater impact of the combined intervention compared to group education alone on some indicators, especially those related to HIV risk behaviour (Pulerwitz et al, 2006). This is in contrast with many studies suggesting that multi-component interventions are more effective than single-focus efforts.

Primary Education

Changing social norms and attitudes towards women or aspirations of women may not only result from specific social norms interventions, but can, at least to some extent also be enhanced through primary education. Mocan and Cannonier (2012) study the effect of the introduction of free primary education in Sierra Leone on women's and men's preferences regarding women's wellbeing, fertility, violence and the use of contraceptives. Exploiting differences in intensity of the free education programme across districts, they report positive and significant changes in health attitudes for both men and women (using modern contraceptives and being tested for AIDS). Women also report a reduction in the desired number of children, less often support wife beating and are more likely to agree with the statement that FMG should be discontinued. These changes are not reported in men however.

Empowering women through education	Macon and Cannonier (2012)	Sierra Leone	
Gender based violence	Changing social norms	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ -/+ sexe

Media

An increasingly popular approach to changing norms and behaviours is the use of media and/or entertainment culture. Well known examples are Soul City Institute for Health and Development in South Africa (now working regionally); Breakthrough, an NGO in India; and *Puntos de Encuentro* in Nicaragua. These organizations develop and deliver television and radio programming and combine this with community mobilisation strategies aimed at changing gender-related norms and behaviours. Evaluations of the impact of these efforts on changing norms and behaviours suggest the programmes are likely to have had positive impacts on a variety of entrenched attitudes and norms. A longitudinal study of more than 4000 young people in Nicaragua found significant improvements in attitudes towards violence and gender equity among those who watched regularly (Solorzano et al, 2008). The difficulty of attributing the changes with certainty to the programme is a challenge shared by many communication programmes, because it is difficult to isolate a community *not* exposed to the intervention and to find ways to measure exposure that do not rely on self-reports.

We did come across some evaluations of media campaigns that have used an experimental set-up but these did not address gender based violence. Using a randomized setting, La Ferrara, et al. (2012) for example report changing in naming patterns of children and declines in fertility in response to access to *telenovelas* in Brazil.

Taking a more general perspective, Jensen and Oster (2009) link the introduction of cable television to changes in women's status in India. Using a panel dataset that covers three years and include the exogenous introduction of cable tv in 21 out of the 180 villages, they find that the introduction of cable television is associated with significant decreases in the reported acceptability of domestic violence against women and son preference. At the same time, they do report increases in women's autonomy and decreases in fertility. The effects are large and happen quickly, decreasing the differences in attitudes and behaviors between urban and rural areas by 45 to 70 percent and have observable impacts in the first year following cable introduction. Suggestive evidence also points at increased school enrolment for younger children potentially because women participate more in household decision making. As there were no pre-existing differences in women's status for villages that do and do not add cable and the timing of changes in outcomes is closely aligned with the introduction of cable and outcomes are not correlated with future cable access.

The power of TV	Jensen and Oster (2009)	India	
Gender based violence	Changing social norms	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	- -/+

Violence against women in (post) conflict situations

Women and girls in conflict situations is specific target group for MDG3 fund, NAP 1325 and bilateral aid programmes. The thematic focus on this group goes beyond Gender Based Violence and encompasses gender equality in all aspects of peace making, peace keeping and post-conflict recovery (Willett, 2010).¹⁷ Reducing sexual and gender based violence is however an increasingly important element of direct and indirect armed violence reduction programmes and has been on the increase since the mid-2000s (OECD, 2011).

Violence and rights abuses in (post) conflict situations pose specific challenges to female empowerment processes and emphasize the importance of context, structure and power relations in women's lives. It is important to note that conflict may have lasting effects on the incidence of violence against women, as is highlighted by Finnoff (2012) who finds a strong correlation between exposure to genocide and post-war intimate partner violence in Rwanda. (Sexual) violence in the aftermath of the war is not only performed by rebels and soldiers but also by the common man who suffers from a manhood in crisis, tied to changing roles as protectors and head of household (backlash). Focussing activities on women only, for example by involving them in small scale commercial activities may suggest breeding female emancipation at the expense of male authority. Men and women should both become agents of change rather than being placed in a victim vs violator role. Thus, Smitz and Cruz (2011) argue that efforts to combat rape in the DRC are likely to be more effective when incorporating opportunities for men and women to resolve conflicts together

At the same time, and analogous to the observation that insecurities may in fact shape possibilities for female empowerment, post-conflict situations where norms and policies are or may be more open to favourable shifts in power may also provide such opportunities (Hossein, 2011).¹⁸

There is a growing literature on women in conflict situations (see for example Bouta et al (2005)) and increasingly interventions in (post) conflict situations are being rigorously evaluated. Education campaigns are common elements of peace building and interventions aimed at changing the rule of law, whether specifically aimed at the reduction of violence against women, or more generally. Education and information can indeed change individual political behaviour, as is evidenced from experimental work in

¹⁷ This is reflected in the indicators advanced for monitoring UNSCR resolution 1325, see for example: <http://www.gnwp.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/02/UNSCR-1325-Monitoring-Tool-Uganda.pdf>.

¹⁸ Turner (2010) provides an interesting example shifts in power in Tanzanian refugee camps where a policy of equality provides young men with the possibility to take up leadership positions that they would be able to take up in traditional hierarchies.

Nigeria, where information campaigns changed turnout and violence levels in elections (Collier and Vicente, 2011) or in Liberia, where alternative dispute resolution campaigns did improve conflict resolution over land disputes (Blattman et al. 2012). It should be noted that these papers address general incidences of violence and conflict resolution and do not specifically address the position of women. Blattman et al do consider the impact of the education programme on self reported norms, including attitudes towards women's rights, but did not find an effect. Experimental work by Paluck (2009 and 2010) in Rwanda and DRC suggests that media can serve as an instrument for reconstructing communities following conflict, but the effects of media programmes are highly sensitive to the content of the message.

Another strand of literature documents for example heterogeneous reintegration processes for male and female soldiers, (see for example Annan et al (2011) for LRA soldiers in Uganda or Humphreys and Weinstein (2007) who found no impact of DDR programmes in Sierra Leone). And although many initiatives are currently undertaken to improve implementation of the law and reduce discrepancies between de jure laws and de facto practices, there is little rigorous evidence on effective post-conflict access-to-justice and legal empowerment programs, or legal empowerment programmes in general. Sandefur and Siddiqi (2010) are currently undertaking an impact evaluation of a Community Based Criminal Justice Programme in Liberia, including some information on women and conditions in prison (sexual and physical abuse), but have only reported on the baseline so far.¹⁹ We also did not come across any work that rigorously evaluated interventions to prevent or reduce violence against women in (post) conflict situations.²⁰

6.1.2. Improving Women's economic position

There are two opposing theories on the relationship between economic assets for women and levels of violence against them. Economic intra-household bargaining theory argues that an increase in household economic resources earned by women may reduce economic stress and improve the bargaining position of women in their household and hence reduce spousal violence, while the sociological backlash theory argues that increasing female economic resources may increase violence by introducing additional tension in changing the status quo in a family. A recent systematic review on social and economic empowerment and women's risk of IPV finds mixed associations (Vyas and Watts, 2009). Based on cross-sectional findings from 41 sites, the authors document that household asset wealth is largely protective, as is women's secondary education and to a lesser extent men's secondary education. Evidence on the potential protective influence of primary education was weak. Inequality in education on the other hand increases the risk of IPV. The evidence on the relationship between women's access to independent sources of income or assets and IPV was mixed as well, with increased and reduced risk of IPV (either life-time or past year) found even in the same

¹⁹ A more general example on legal empowerment is for example the establishment of village paralegals (PEKKA) in Indonesia that is currently being evaluated by The World Bank, for a critical review see for example Venning (2010)

²⁰ Exception is the discussion groups evaluated by Iyengar and Ferrari (2011) situated in post-conflict Burundi, already discussed in the previous section on intimate partner violence.

country (Bangladesh), suggesting that context (for example progressive attitudes) plays an important role in determining the effect of women's income, a point also made by Luke and Mushi (2011) who find caste-heterogeneous effects of female income on choices that parents make for their children and levels of domestic violence.

All of these analyses are based on self-reported and cross-sectional data and thus potentially suffer from various biases, violence may for example motivate a woman to seek work. Bhattacharyya et al (2011) document the importance of correcting for the potential endogeneity of women's work status. Using IV estimation on Indian data, the authors provide evidence on a negative relationship between women's work status and violence, while OLS estimations suggest a positive relationship. Women's ownership of a house is less sensitive to this potential bias and is associated with reduced violence in all specifications; property increases her economic security, reduces her willingness to tolerate violence and provides a credible exit option that may deter spousal violence as well.

Given the potential negative link between economic empowerment and prevalence of GBV, Hossein (2011) argues that a more accurate indicator of women's empowerment may be capturing the extent of resistance or mobilisation against violence, rather than of its prevalence; it is in opposing and resisting insecurities that some of the most powerful of women's individual and collective agency are found.

Most studies in the Vyas and Watts (2009) review, as well as newer studies such as Krishnan et al (2010) consider current asset levels or employment status and do not address the effect of specific interventions that may enhance the social or economic empowerment of women and have effects on IPV as well. In the next subsection we discuss evidence on two types of interventions that were found in the literature, micro-finance and conditional cash transfers.

Microfinance

There are only a limited number of studies available that specifically address whether microfinance or credit programmes affect women's risk of partner violence. In her review on these studies, Heise (2011) documents how some studies suggest declines in partner violence with membership in microfinance programmes and some document increases in domestic violence, while still others suggests that violence may initially worsen for some women even in settings where the long-term impact is positive. The vast difference in the programmes and contexts makes it impossible to draw conclusions about the impact of microcredit schemes on risks of violence.

The majority of existing studies are cross sectional and come exclusively from Bangladesh. As with general micro-finance studies, studies on micro-finance and gender based violence are also subject to potential selection bias, with the exception of those that are randomized at either an individual or community level. Frequently, the studies best designed in terms of controlling bias are the least revealing in terms of empowerment processes or explanations of how and why the programme had the effect that it did. The literature search yielded two interesting studies that evaluated combined microfinance and training interventions.

In South Africa, IMAGE (Intervention with Microfinance for AIDS and Gender Equity) added participatory training sessions on understanding gender, HIV, domestic violence and sexuality onto an existing group lending and savings scheme. Women participated in these one-hour training sessions when they attended fortnightly loan meetings (thus reducing the bias of self-selection into these discussion groups). Kim et al (2007) and Pronyk et al (2006) show that compared to women in the control group, partnered women in the IMAGE intervention group reported 55% less partner violence [AOR=0.45; 95% CI=0.23, 0.91] in the previous year and improvements on nine indicators of women's empowerment and several indicators of financial well-being.²¹

Understanding the impact of a microfinance-based intervention on women's empowerment	Kim et al (2007) Pronyk et al (2006) Kim et al (2009)	South Africa	
Gender based violence	Improving women's economic position and discussion session	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	+ -/+ -/+ Type of intervention

Follow-up research to the original IMAGE study attempted to tease out how much of the observed effect of the programme was due to the microfinance component and how much to the training programme. To do so, the IMAGE team compared data from villages participating in IMAGE with matched villages receiving only the microfinance intervention and a control group. Data was collected 24 months after the intervention was introduced from all individuals who had joined the programme, including those who dropped out during the two years. After two years, both the microfinance-only group and the IMAGE group showed economic improvements relative to the control group. However, only the IMAGE participants showed consistent gains across all measures of women's empowerment, partner violence and HIV-risk behaviour (Kim et al, 2009), supporting that multi-component interventions may be more successful compared to programmes with only one component. As this study relies on a cross-section comparison of outcomes only, these results should be interpreted with some care. Yet, villages for the microfinance only intervention were chosen with similar baseline characteristics, and self-selection is unlikely to influence the comparison between microfinance only and IMAGE group, as both interventions required similar commitments by women.

These results suggest that combined interventions with elements addressing different dimensions (economic and social empowerment) may be more successful in changing attitudes and behaviour compared to interventions combining different type of educational activities.

In contrast with the IMAGE programme, a project in Burundi did not focus on gender issues explicitly, because the implementers feared backlash in the home and community if women's empowerment were to be seen as the focus of the intervention. Instead the programme encouraged husbands and wives to discuss how household

²¹ Exposure to violence is measured using the Violence Against Women instrument of the WHO.

decisions are made and encouraged respect for women's contributions and opinions. If women are more involved in household management and this role is appreciated by her husband, this may result in a reduced likelihood of violence (Iyengar and Ferrari, 2011). The study tested the impact of adding a discussion group onto a pre-existing village savings and loan scheme (where individuals self-selected into the scheme). The experiment randomised half of village savings and loan participants to attend a 6-session discussion group on household decision-making together with their partners. Half continued only with the savings scheme. The programme had a positive and statistically significant impact on the participation of women in only some dimensions of decision making; women attending discussion groups reported an increase in spending of their own earnings (26 percent relative to baseline) and women's decision-making authority over major household decisions (14%.) and fertility. Participation in the discussion programmes did not change the frequency at which women would disagree with their husbands on decision making and only had marginal effects on the acceptability of violence, while the exposure to domestic violence did not change significantly as a result of the programme.²²

Discussion sessions couples with microfinance	Iyengar and Ferrari (2011)	Burundi	
Gender based violence	Improving women's economic position and discussion session	Impact Proxy impact Outcome	0/+ 0

Conditional cash transfers

The impact of conditional cash transfers (CCTs) on women's empowerment is similarly debated in the literature. Some argue that by transferring money to women, conditional cash transfers increase women's bargaining position in the family and hence their autonomy and power. Others question whether receiving stipends necessarily translates into increased power and control and whether resources alone can reasonably be extrapolated to "empowerment". Critics point out that conditionality means that women alone are responsible for these programmes and may thus reinforces their traditional roles as caretakers and mothers. A recent ODI global review of social protection programmes found that only two (in Bangladesh and Mexico) included an explicit focus on women's empowerment. In other cases (Ethiopia, Ghana, India and Vietnam), the sole consideration of gender was the inclusion of women as a targeted group. By contrast, Bangladesh's programme includes intensive income-generation training for women and makes an explicit effort to liaise with men to encourage their acceptance of women's participation. Even where they have not explicitly challenged power relations in the family, there is evidence of some programme's positive impact on women's economic opportunities and self-esteem (Holmes, 2010).

²² The exposure to violence is measured using the HITS (Hurt, Insult, Threaten, Scream) instrument that has been applied in various settings and allows for a rapid appraisal of past experiences of violence (Sherin et al. 1998)

Only few evaluations have explicitly examined the impact of conditional cash transfers on women's risk of intimate partner violence. A number of studies have evaluated this potential effect in the PROGRESO/Oportunidades programme in Mexico that dispenses cash to recipients if they send their children to school, have periodic health care visits, and attend nutrition and health classes. Angelucci (2008) studies the effect of the programme when it was just established. She finds that the benefit package reduces alcohol abuse by 15 percent for all households. The effect on aggressive behaviour is heterogeneous, with substantial reductions (37 percent) in households receiving the minimum transfers and households with husbands who completed primary school. Uneducated husband become more violent however, especially when their wives receive the larger transfers, increasing intra-household inequality and lending support to the backlash theory.

Love on the rocks: domestic violence and alcohol abuse	Angelucci (2008)	Mexico	
Gender based violence	Improving women's economic position	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	-/0 Spouse characteristics and height of transfer

Studying the same programme, Bobonis et al (2013) makes an interesting distinction between prevalence of violence and threats of violence and found that in the short term, women in beneficiary households were 33% less likely to suffer physical partner violence than non-beneficiary women, but were 60% more likely to receive threats of violence and to be victims of emotional abuse from their husbands. These findings suggest that male partners may use threats of violence as an instrument of coercion to (re) gain control over household resources or decision making that improved in favour of his spouse due to the transfer. Distinguishing between women with low and high decision making power, Bobonis finds this mechanism is especially strong in households where women have low decision making power.

Public transfers and domestic violence	Bobonis et al (2013) Bobonis et al (2011)	Mexico	
Gender based violence	Improving women's economic position	Impact Proxy impact Outcome Heterogeneity	-/+ Decision making power Short term/Long term

However, looking at the situation five to nine years after the start of the Oportunidades programme, Bobonis et al (2011) found that physical and emotional abuse rates no longer differed significantly among beneficiary and non-beneficiary

couples, suggesting no long-term benefits from the programme on women's risk of violence.

6.1.3. Law and security sector reform and support for survivors

This section discusses changes in legal frameworks, security sector reforms and support for survivors as a means to reduce the prevalence of GBV. Although interventions in these fields typically have not been rigorously evaluated, several reviews provide some interesting material on lessons learnt.

Several reviews highlight the importance of women's movements in successfully transforming legal frameworks that apply to rape, domestic violence and sexual harassment (Heise, 2011, Cooper et al, 2013). In 2011, 125 countries had passed legislation on domestic violence, including nearly all of Latin America and the Caribbean countries. Two-thirds of all countries have also taken steps to make workplaces and public places safer for women through laws prohibiting sexual harassment. By the end of 2011, 18 countries in Asia had passed specific domestic violence laws, up from zero of 37 countries in 1994 when Malaysia became the first to pass a domestic violence bill. Sub-Saharan Africa follows with 21 of 48 countries having enacted domestic violence bills as of 2010 (Heise, 2011). In a modelling exercise to analyze political, social and economic factors related to the passage of domestic violence legislation, Htun and Weldon (2012) found the strength of a country's autonomous women's movement to be the single best predictor of success in legislative reform. In an analysis that includes information on 70 countries in 1975, 1985, 1995 and 2005, they found that autonomous feminist mobilisation is indeed more strongly correlated to stronger policy on VAW (as measured by an index on government response to VAW that contains information on legal reform, services to victims, training of professionals and prevention campaigns.) compared to other variables that are often considered important for progressive social policy, such as leftist parties, women in government and economic factors. They dismiss the potential endogeneity of their results with reference to qualitative information suggesting the movements precede and spark government action, and the use of a lagged variable on feminist movements that may capture this effect.

Although legal reforms may have positive impacts on intermediate outcomes such as increased reporting levels and raising the number of convictions, it is not clear how these changes in law affect behaviour of perpetrators or the level of partner violence in the overall population (Heise, 2011). Several monitoring studies do however indicate how difficult it is to change judicial practice with discriminatory attitudes toward female victims and report failure to adequately fund or publicize the law, lack of training of key functionaries and lack of capacity or corruption in the system (Ghosh and Choudhuri, 2011, Morrison et al, 2007). Case studies of past law reforms do emphasize the strategic value of the reform process itself, in providing a platform for public discussion and to strengthen networks among civil society groups, government officials and parliamentarians (UNFPA, 2009).

The reviews also suggest that legal reforms should be backed up by reforms in the security sector, for example through the establishment of women's police stations or

through training programmes for the police and the judiciary. Women's police stations are specialized services to facilitate women's access to justice when faced with physical or sexual violence. The first women's police station opened in Sao Paulo, Brazil, in 1985. The idea spread quickly in Latin America and some parts of Asia. In her review of all women police stations in Tamil Nadu in India Natarayan (2008) reports increasing comfort in approaching the police and filing claims. The evaluation of women's police stations in Latin America by Jubb et al (2010) suggests that the police stations have contributed to making the problem of violence against women visible as a public, collective, and punishable matter; and they offer women new opportunities to defend their rights, but they do not necessarily contribute to eliminating or reducing violence, or guaranteeing access to justice for women (Jubb et al. 2010). Morrison (2007) also reports there often is a lack of funding and personnel in these police stations. Moreover, women's police stations may take away the responsibility of the normal police to act on crimes against women and their work may be undermined by other parts of the justice system. For that reason it may be more effective to strengthen law enforcement across the board and not focus on women's police stations specifically.

Evaluations of trainings of the police and judicial force that measure knowledge, attitudes and practices (KAP) before and after the training suggest that these trainings are beneficial when all levels of personnel receive the training and when the training is linked to changes throughout the institution (Morrison et al, 2007). While Heise (2011) underscores the importance of participation and the use of new protocols mandated and supported from the top, and that training sessions are to be taught (or co-taught) by fellow law enforcement personnel and cover all facets of police training.

National plans to support women who have experienced violence is often problematic in the context of developing countries potentially create a space for collaboration between civil society and the state and enhances a public discourse that encourages sanctions against violence. Morrison et al (2007) report that such national plans often do not trickle down and institutionalise, for example the sense that violence also is an important health issue (and should thus also be addressed in the health sector for example by routine screening) and relates to education sector as well, as GBV is widespread in educational settings.

6.2. Female Genital Mutilation or Cutting (FMG/C)

Female genital mutilation or cutting is recognized as a harmful practice with negative health consequences for women and is also considered a form of violence against women (WHO, 2008). Although many African countries have laws that explicitly prohibit the practice, FMG/C is common and prevalence rates are high, as high as 70 percent (WHO, 2008), emphasizing the need to undertake additional efforts to reduce or abandon the practice. The evidence on interventions to reduce the prevalence of female genital mutilation/cutting has been systematically reviewed by Berg and Denison (2012a and 2012b) and is summarized here.

Although FGM/C practice is not restricted to Africa, the studies included in their review were all in African countries (Mali, Egypt, Kenya, Ethiopia, Nigeria, Senegal and

Burkina Faso). The review was restricted to studies with a design containing a comparison group and included four type of interventions; (i) the training of health personnel (ii) education of female students (iii) multifaceted community activities including behaviour change communication activities and advocacy and (iv) empowerment through education in hygiene, problem solving, women's health and human rights.

The outcomes considered included self-reported rates of FGM/C, proportions in the population in favour of abandonment, awareness of rights, knowledge of harmful consequences and beliefs, attitudes towards FGM/C and intentions to perform FGM/C on daughters. An overview of the findings in the studies shows that 19 out of 49 outcomes with baseline similarity were significantly different at study level, mostly reporting positive outcomes of the intervention.

The reported meta-analysis of sufficiently similar studies indicates considerable heterogeneity: there was no statistically significant change in the belief that FGM/C compromises the human rights of women, while changes in the knowledge of harmful consequences of FGM/C were significant only for men and not for women. The meta-analysis does suggest that the prevalence of FGM/C reduced significantly, although the authors do warn to be careful in the interpretation of these effects given the considerable heterogeneity and unequal weights of observations in the studies.

Although the reviewed studies have some methodological limitations (some are not randomized, all depend on self-reported outcomes) and the authors also point at shortcomings in the implementation of the interventions (relevance of the intervention in the local context and implementation fidelity), the findings do suggest some advantageous effects from the interventions.

FGM/C programmes can also have positive side-effects on other elements of GBV, as is witnessed by the education programme on hygiene, problem solving, women's health and human rights in Senegal. A quasi-experimental study of the Tostan programme found that not only did the programme reduce cutting among daughters in the intervention community compared to the comparison community, but women reported a decrease in partner violence over the last 12 months and a significant increase in knowledge of contraceptive methods by both men and women (Diop, 2004).

6.3. Conclusions:

This section reviewed evidence on interventions aimed at reducing violence against women. The studies used a variety of (sometimes internationally comparable) instruments to measure violence against women, such as the WHO Multicountry Study Tool to measure partner violence or HITS to assess levels of violence against women. Others (also) used indices on gender norms, such as the GEM-scale, or developed one-off context specific measurement tools to assess gender attitudes and attitudes towards violence against women more specifically.

Some studies considered changes in attitudes towards domestic violence and not actual levels of violence. Most such studies reported positive changes in attitudes as a

result of the intervention (participatory training, social marketing, media or primary education), sometimes combined with other positive outcome indicators such as lower desired fertility, increasing use of contraceptives or more autonomy in decision making.

The studies considering both changes in attitudes and actual levels of violence suggest the two indicators are related and that interventions can be successful in changing attitudes and actual levels of violence, albeit imprecisely measured through self reports (Kim et al, 2007, Pulerwitz et al. 2010 and Verma et al, 2008). Similarly, the combined microfinance and social norms training intervention in South Africa (IMAGE) did reduce IPV rates reported by women, while such a combined intervention in Burundi did not change reported levels of violence but favourably influenced some decision making variables. These mixed results suggest that both the context and the content of the training provided strongly matters for results.

The evidence on participatory learning interventions (sometimes combined with social marketing) suggests these can have a positive impact on a range of self-reported attitudes, beliefs and behavioural change (measure for example by HIV/Herpes infections, unwanted pregnancies and other sexual behaviour). However, the evidence is mixed, positive on some, negative or non-significant effects on others, with notable differences between male and female participants. Interestingly, it also points at the potentially perverse consequence of a misaligned social norms marketing campaign that may perpetuate perceptions that GBV, or other undesirable behaviour, is common within the community.

Several existing reviews suggest the evidence on a relationship between micro-finance and a reduction of violence against women is mixed. Some studies suggest declines in partner violence with membership in microfinance programmes and some document increases in domestic violence, while still others suggests that violence may initially worsen for some women even in settings where the long-term impact is positive. Similar results are reported for cash transfer programmes.

The evaluation of the IMAGE intervention in South Africa suggests that combined training and microfinance interventions may be successful in reducing IPV. Together, the evidence on the effectiveness of multicomponent vs one dimensional programmes is mixed and may be more beneficial when components combine different dimensions (training and micro-finance) rather than similar dimensions (training and media). Given the small sample of studies, these findings should be interpreted with care as they may be very context and content (training programme) specific.

Importantly, some of the reviewed studies also highlight the heterogeneity of effects on the target population. As is for example demonstrated by the differential effects of training interventions on men and women in Stepping Stones South Africa and several FGM interventions, as well as the time-varying effects of cash transfers on domestic violence in Mexico that also depended on the height of the transfers received, the educational level of the husband and the level of decision making power in the household.

7. Conclusion

This working paper reviewed the evidence for and the nature of the impact of development interventions to improve female empowerment and gender equality in developing countries, with a specific focus on interventions aimed at increasing property and inheritance rights for women, increasing formal employment and equal opportunities on the labour market, increasing participation and representation of women in politics and governance and reducing violence against women. The number and type of interventions covered as well as the geographical spread of the evidence is not equally distributed across the themes. The studies on increasing participation and representation of women in politics and governance for example predominantly address the female reservation of village assembly leader positions in India, while the studies on increasing formal employment and equal participation on the labour market cover a wider range of interventions, as well as intervention locations. The uneven distribution of the evidence means that the pathways to empowerment from outcome to (proxy) impact indicators are not equally defined and substantively supported by the results of the included studies. These are more clearly defined for the Indian village studies on political participation, covering a wide range of mechanisms and elements, than for other interventions subjected to one or a limited number of studies. As a substantive discussion on the impact of the interventions was provided at the end of each thematic section, this concluding section of the paper addresses general findings from the review.

The four policy themes represent areas of intervention influencing a particular domain of women's lives (expected outcomes) that are assumed to impact on other domains as well and to improve the position of women in society more generally. For example, an intervention aimed to improve women's access to the labour market may have a direct effect on the labour market participation of women (outcome), while the labour market participation of women may have effects on their position in their household and society at large (impact), i.e. having more say in the household, delaying marriage and childbirth etc.

Most of the studies reviewed in this paper consider only outcomes and did not include (proxy) impact indicators. The reviewed papers used a wide range of outcome indicators, such as land productivity, rental market participation, crop income, self-reported intimate partner violence, suicides, labour market participation, business knowledge, occupational choice, policy outcomes, gender norms, etc. Most of the interventions had at least some positive effects on these outcomes for women. The extent to which such changes in the economic position/situation of women and policy outcomes (for example women preferred public goods) also translated into more structural changes in the position of women in their households and the society at large, was often not addressed. At the same time, these outcomes suggest improvements, but without additional information or contextualisation it is not always clear if indeed an improvement was realized. Increased participation in the labour market and ownership of land can also contribute to higher burdens and insecurity that may not necessarily

empower women, an issue that is hardly addressed by the reviewed studies, but highlighted for example by Pathways of Women's Empowerment RPC (2011).

The studies that included such (proxy) indicators used (i) One-dimensional indicators: straightforward survey questions on particular elements that may signal impact on empowerment such as decision making within the household, time-use, type of expenditures, children's outcomes etc. (as is common in literature on intra-household bargaining), or (ii) Multi-dimensional indicators: a set of survey questions on various domains used to construct an empowerment index (either a linear index or weighted index). The multi-dimensional indicators are often composed of questions relating to several domains (i.e. resources, finances, purchases, transaction management, mobility and networks, activism, household attitudes, husband's behaviour, fertility and family planning). The precise definition of these indicators is often context specific as is for example evident from the local adaptations of the internationally validated GEM scale. Kabeer (2001) stresses how careful one should be in labelling what constitutes evidence of change in empowerment, especially in societies where public mobility and social norms may in fact be actively chosen by women to signal social standing (they can afford to stay at home). The specific set of indicators to be used in the gender policy review and proposed effect studies can be developed when a final selection of programmes and organisations has been made.

At the same time, it is not always straightforward to interpret what constitute an outcome indicator and what constitutes an impact indicator. This became evident in a number of studies included in the review. Although talking about business plans can be considered an outcome of business training, training only boosted such discussions for women who were moderately restricted (Hindu Upper Caste) and not for the group of women who were most restricted (Muslim), potentially signalling how training increased the choices available to women. Similar findings were reported in the context of changes in family law in Ethiopia, opening up the array of labour market choices of young and unmarried women, and the opportunities to participate in the land rental market that resulted from rural titling schemes in Ethiopia.

Importantly, not all studies including (proxy) impact indicators in their analysis report positive effects of interventions. In a considerable number of cases a positive outcome of an intervention does not translate to improvements in (proxy) impact indicators of female empowerment. This may not necessarily mean that outcomes do not translate to impact on female empowerment, but suggest it may take considerable time for the impact to materialize.

The reviewed studies, and especially those considering a wider range of indicators, typically find mixed results, for example finding positive significant results on some indicators but not or negative results on other indicators. Moreover, studies covering similar interventions have reported different results. Such inconsistencies may have methodological backgrounds, such as the definition of comparison groups and econometric specifications, see for example Brulé (2012) vs Goyal et al (2010) and Roodman and Morduch (2009) vs Pitt and Khandker (1998).

In situations where a range of indicators are used, Casey et al (2011) suggests to using a pre-analysis plan to gather information on results in different domains, rather than cherry picking only those that yield positive significant results.

Many studies reported heterogeneous project or programme impacts. For example, land certification in Ethiopia was especially beneficial for women in female headed households because it offered them the opportunity to enter the land rental market, while the effect of conditional cash transfers on intimate partner violence in Mexico strongly depended on the height of the transfer and the characteristics of the spouse. The studies identified heterogeneity in terms of household type, marital status, geographic location, local political economy, age, technology, baseline decision making power, social position, etc.

In line with the assumption that interventions could result in structural changes in society, various studies provided evidence for (considerable) spill-over effects of interventions. Interventions not only influence the livelihoods and lives of participants, but also on non-participants in treatment communities. In the field of Gender Based Violence, Bradley et al (2011) consider how social norms training has diffused in networks of close friends and the wider community of workshop participants. Work by Deininger and Liu (2009) in India shows that female social and economic empowerment increases for both members and non-members in Self Help Groups. From a slightly different angle, the evidence reported on changes in legal settings (land in Tanzania, family law in Ethiopia and inheritance law in India), suggests such changes (as opposed to more local interventions) may have a more general/structural impact on the position of women in society than just the outcome considered, but these impacts are not empirically addressed .

Several studies considered the effect of multi-component interventions, such as offering business training to micro-finance clients, productive and capacity building projects, social marketing and group education or micro-finance and social norms training to reduce violence against women. The evidence suggests that such combinations may be beneficial for the promotion of female empowerment, but also point to the importance of context and content (of the group education, social marketing, social norms training) of such interventions.

8. References

- ADB (2010) Asian Development Banks's Support to Gender and Development. Phase II: Results from Country Case Studies. Special Evaluation Study SES: REG 2010-80.
- Agarwal, B. (1994) *A Field of One's own: Gender and Land Rights in South Asia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Agarwal, B. and P. Panda (2007) Toward Freedom from Domestic Violence: The Neglected Obvious. *Journal of Human Development*, 8 (3), 359-388.
- Agarwal, B. (2009) Gender and Forest Conservation: The Impact of women's participation in community forest governance. *Ecological Economics*, 68 (11), 2785-2799.
- Agarwal, B. (2010) Does Women's Proportional Strength Affect their Participation? Governing Local Forests in South Asia. *World Development*, 38 (1), 98-112.
- Ali, Daniel Ayalew; Deininger, Klaus; Goldstein, Markus (2011) Environmental and gender impacts of land tenure regularization in Africa : pilot evidence from Rwanda. The World Bank, Policy Research Working Paper Series: 5765.
- Allendorf, K. (2007) Do Women's Land Rights Promote Empowerment and Child Health in Nepal? *World Development*. Vol. 35 (11). p 1975-88.
- Anderson, S. and G. Genicot (2012) Suicide and Property Rights in India. BREAD Working Paper 353.
- Angelucci, Manuela. 2008. "Love on the Rocks: Domestic Violence and Alcohol Abuse in Rural Mexico." *B E Journal of Economic Analysis & Policy*, 8(1), article 43.
- Annan, J., C. Blattman, D. Mazurana and K. Carlson (2011) Civil War, Reintegration and Gender in Northern Uganda. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 55(6), 877-908.
- Ashraf, N., D. Karlan and W.Yin (2010) Female Empowerment: Impact of a Commitment Savings Product in the Phillipines. *World Development*, 38(3), p.333-344.
- Attanasio, O., A.D. Kugler and C. Meghir (2011) Subsidizing Vocational Training for Disadvantaged Youth in Developing Countries: Evidence from a Randomized Trial. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 3(3) 188-220.
- Ban, R. & Rao, V. (2008). "Tokenism or Agency? The Impact of Women's Reservations on Village Democracies in South India," *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 56 (3), 501-530.
- Banerjee, A., E. Duflo, R. Glennerster and C. Kinnan (2010) The Miracle of Microfinance? Evidence from a Randomized Evaluation. JPAL and the Center for Microfinance at IFMR
- Bardhan, P., D. Mookherjee and M. Parra Torrado (2005). *Impact of Reservations of Panchayat Pradhans on Targeting in West Bengal. Some Contemporary Issues in Development and Growth Economics*. Calcutta; Ed. Arpita Dhar, Allied Publishers.
- Bardhan, P., D. Mookherjee and M. Parra Torrado (2010) Impact of Political Reservations in West Bengal Local Governments on Anti-Poverty Targeting. *Journal of Globalization and Development*, 1 (1), article 5.
- Beaman, L., E. Duflo, R. Pande and P. Topalova (2007) "Women Politicians: Children's Outcomes and Gender Bias in India," Background paper for 2007 State of the World's Children Report, UNICEF.
- Beaman, L., Chattopadhyay, R., Duflo, E., Pande, R., & Topalova, P. (2009). Powerful Women: Does Exposure Reduce Bias? *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 124(4), 1497-1540.
- Beaman, L., E. Duflo, R. Pande and P. Topalova (2010). Political Reservation and Substantive Representation: Evidence from Indian Village Councils. *India Policy Forum*, 2010-11, p. 159-191. Brookings and NCAER.
- Beaman, L., E. Duflo, R. Pande and P. Topalova (2012) Female Leadership Raises Aspirations and Educational Attainment for Girls: A Policy Experiment in India. *Science*, 335, 582-586.

- Beath, A., F. Christia, R. Enikopolov, S.A. Kabuli (2010) Randomized Impact Evaluation of Phase II of Afghanistan's National Solidarity Programme (NSP). Estimates of Interim Program Impact from First Follow-Up Survey. The World Bank, August 2011, Report 63773.
- Berg, R.C. and E. Denison (2012) Effectiveness of Interventions Designed to Prevent Female Genital Mutilation/Cutting: A Systematic Review. *Studies in Family Planning*, 43(2) 135-146.
- Berg, R.C. and E. Denison (2012) Interventions to reduce the prevalence of female genital mutilation/cutting in African countries. *Campbell Systematic Reviews* 2012:9.
- Berlinsky, S. and S. Galiani (2007) The Effect of a large expansion of pre-primary school facilities on preschool attendance and maternal employment. *Labour economics*, 14(3), p. 665-80.
- Berlinsky, Galiani and Mc Ewan (2011) Pre-school and Maternal Labor Market Outcomes: Evidence from a Regression Discontinuity Design. *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 59(2), pp.313-344.
- Besley T., R. Pande, and V. Rao (2005), "Political Selection and the Quality of Governments: Evidence from South India", Working Paper N. 921, Economic Growth Center, Yale University.
- Bezabih, M. and S.T. Holden (2008). Gender and Land Productivity on Rented Out Land: Evidence from Ethiopia. In Holden, S. T., Otsuka, K. and Place, F. (Eds.). *The Emergence of Land Markets in Africa: Impacts on Poverty and Efficiency*. Resources For the Future Press, Washington D.C.
- Bezabih, M., S. Holden and A. Mannberg (2012) The Role of Land Certification in Reducing Gender Gaps in Productivity in Rural Ethiopia. Centre for Land Tenure Studies Working Paper 01/12.
- Bhalotra, S. and I. Clots-Figueras (2011) Health and the Political Agency of Women. Centre for Market and Public Organisation. CMPO Working Paper 11/280. Bristol UK.
- Bhavnani, R. (2009). Do Electoral Quotas Work after They Are Withdrawn? Evidence from a Natural Experiment in India. *American Political Science Review*, 103(1), 23-35.
- Blattman, C. N. Fiala and S. Martinez (2011) Employment Generation in Rural Africa: Mid-term Results from an Experimental Evaluation of the Youth Opportunities Programme in Northern Uganda. SP Discussion Paper no. 1120. Washington D.C. : The World Bank.
- Blattman, C., A. Hartman and R. Blair (2012) Building institutions at the micro-level: Results from a field experiment in property dispute conflict resolution. Mimeo.
- Bobonis, G. J. , M. González-Brenes and R. Castro (2013) Public Transfers and Domestic Violence: The Roles of Private Information and Spousal Control. *American Economic Journal: Economic Policy*, 5(1), 179-205.
- Bobonis, G. J. (2011) The Impact of Conditional Cash Transfers on Marriage and Divorce. *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 59(2), 281-312.
- Bouta, T., G. Frerks and I. Bannon (2005) *Gender, Conflict and Development*. Washington D.C. The World Bank.
- Bradley, J. E., P. Bhattacharjee, B. Ramesh, M. Girish and A. Das (2011) Evaluation of Stepping Stones as a tool for changing knowledge, attitudes and behaviours associated with gender, relationships and HIV risk in Karnataka India, *BMC Public Health*, 11 (496).
- Brulé, R.E. (2012) Gender Equity and Inheritance Reform: Evidence from Rural India. Mimeo: http://rachelbrule.files.wordpress.com/2012/09/brule_paper1_final.pdf
- Card, D. , P. Ibarraran, F. Regalia, D. Raosas-Shady and Y. Soares (2011) The Labor market impacts of youth training in the Dominican Republic. *Journal of Labour Economics*, 29 (2), 267-300.
- Casey, K., R. Glennerster and E. Miguel (2012) Reshaping Institutions: Evidence on Aid Impacts Using a Pre-Analysis Plan. *Quarterly Journal of Economics* (forthcoming) published online September 2012.

- Chattopadhyay, R. & Duflo, E. (2004). The Impact of Reservation in the Panchayati Raj: Evidence from a Nationwide Randomized Experiment. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 39(9): 979-986.
- Clots-Figueras, I. (2012). Are Female Leaders Good for Education? Evidence from India. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, American Economic Association, vol. 4(1), pages 212-44.
- Clots-Figueras, I. (2012) Women in Politics: Evidence from the Indian States. *Journal of Public Economics*, 95, p.664-690.
- Collier, P. and P. Vicente (2011) Votes and Violence: Evidence from a Field Experiment in Nigeria. Mimeo
- Cooper, L.B. , E. L. Paluck and E. K. Fletcher (2013) Reducing Gender Based Violence. In: Ryan, M. and N.R. Branscombe (eds), *Sage Handbook on Gender and Psychology*. Forthcoming.
- Cooper, E. and K. Bird (2012) Inheritance: A gendered and intergenerational Dimension of Poverty. *Development Policy Review*, 30 (5), 527-541
- Datta, N.. (2006) Joint titling--A Win-Win Policy? Gender and Property Rights in Urban Informal Settlements in Chandigarh, India. *Feminist Economics*, 12(1-2), p.271 -98
- Davis, Kristin; Nkonya, Ephraim; Kato, Edward; Mekonnen, Daniel Ayalew; Odendo, Martins; Miiro, Richard; and Nkuba, Jackson. 2012. Impact of farmer field schools on agricultural productivity and poverty in East Africa. *World Development* 40(2): 402- 413
- Deere, C. D. and M. León (2001). *Empowering Women: Land and Property Rights in Latin America*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.
- Deere, C. D. Durán, R., Mardon, M. and T. Masterson (2004) *Female Land Rights and Rural Household Incomes in Brazil, Paraguay and Peru*. University of Massachusetts – Amherst, Economics Department Working Paper Series Paper 75.
- Deere, C.D. and C. Doss, (2006) The Gender Asset Gap: What Do We Know And Why Does It Matter? *Feminist Economics*, 12(1-2), p 1-50.
- Deininger, K., Ayalew Ali, D. and T. Alemu (2008a) Impacts of Land Certification Programme on Tenure Security, Investment and Land Markets. Evidence from Ethiopia. World Bank. Development Research Group WPS4764, Washington D.C.
- Deininger, K., D. Ayalew Ali, and T. Yamano. (2008b). Legal knowledge and economic development: The case of land rights in Uganda. *Land Economics*, 84 (4): 593–619.
- Deininger, K. , Ayalew Ali, D. and T. Alemu (2011) Impacts of Land Certification on Tenure Security, Investment and Land Markets. *Land Economics*, 87 (2): 312-334
- Deininger, K. and J.S. Chamorro (2004) Investment and equity effects of land regularisation: the case of Nicaragua. *Agricultural Economics*, 30 (2), 101–116.
- Deininger, K., D. Ali, S. Holden and J. Zevenbergen (2007) *Rural Land Certification in Ethiopia: Process, Initial Impact and Implications for other African Countries*. World Bank Working Paper WPS 4218.
- Deininger, K. and Y. Liu (2009a) *Economic and social Impacts of Self-Help Groups in India*. Policy Research Working Paper 4884. Washington D.C. The World Bank.
- Deininger, K. and Y. Liu (2009b) *Longer Term Economic Impacts of Self-Help Groups in India*. Policy Research Working Paper 4886. Washington D.C. The World Bank.
- Deininger, K., D. Ayalew Ali, and T. Yamano. 2008b. Legal knowledge and economic development: The case of land rights in Uganda. *Land Economics* 84 (4): 593–619.
- Deininger, K., S. Jin, H.K. Nagarajan and X. Fang (2011) Does Female Reservation Affect Long-Term Political Outcomes? Evidence from Rural India. Policy Research Working Paper 5708. Washington D.C.: The World Bank.
- De Soto, H. (2000) *The Mystery of Capital: Why Capitalism Triumphs in the West and Fails Everywhere Else*. Basic Books.
- Devereux, S and Solomon, C (2006) *Employment creation programmes: the international experience*. Issues in Employment and Poverty Discussion Paper 24. Geneva: ILO.

- Diop, N.J. (2004) The TOSTAN Program: Evaluation of a Community-Based Education Program in Senegal. New York.
- Doss, C., C. Grown and C.D. Deere (2011) Gender and asset ownership : a guide to collecting individual-level data. Policy Research Working Paper Series 4704, The World Bank.
- Duvendack, M. and R. Palmer-Jones (2011) High Noon for Microfinance Impact Evaluations: Re-investigating the Evidence from Bangladesh, Working Paper 27, DEV Working Paper Series, The School of International Development, University of East Anglia, UK.
- Eyal, K. and I. Woolard (2011) Female Labour Force Participation and South Africa's Child Support Grant. Mimeo.
- Fearon, J., M. Humphreys and J. Weinstein (2008) Community-Driven Reconstruction in Lofa County: Impact Assessment. http://www.columbia.edu/~mh2245/FHW/FHW_final.pdf
- Field, E. (2003) Fertility Responses to Urban Land Titling Programs: The Roles of Ownership Security and the Distribution of Household Assets. Working paper, Harvard University.
- Field, E. (2007) Entitled to Work: Urban Tenure Security and Labor Supply in Peru." *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 4(122): 1561-1602.
- Field, Erica, Seema Jayachandran, and Rohini Pande. 2010. "Do Traditional Institutions Constrain Female Entrepreneurship? A Field Experiment on Business Training in India." *American Economic Review*, 100(2): 125–29.
- Finnoff, K. (2012) Intimate Partner Violence, female employment and male backlash in Rwanda. *The economics of peace and security journal*, 7 (2) p.13-24.
- Ghosh, B. and T. Choudhuri (2011) Legal protection against domestic violence in India: scope and limitations. *Journal of Family Violence*, 26 (4) 319-330.
- Glick, P. and F. Rouboud (2006) Export Processing zone Expansion in Madagascar: What are the Labour Market and Gender Impacts. *Journal of African Economies*, 15(4), 722-756.
- Goldstein, M. and C. Udry (2008) The profits of Power: Land Rights and Agricultural Investment in Ghana. *Journal of Political Economy*, 116 (6), p.981-1022.
- Goyal, A., K. Deininger and H. Nagarajan (2010) Hindu Inheritance Law, Land Bequests and Educational Attainment of Women in India. In: *Innovations in Land Rights Recognition, Administration and Governance*. Ed. By Augustinus, K. Deininger and P. Munro-Faure, p.105-116. World Bank.
- Gugerty, M.K. and M. Kremer (2008) Outside Funding and the Dynamics of Participation in community Associations. *American Journal of Political Science*, 52 (3), p.585-602.
- Hallman, K., D. Lewis and S. Begum (2007) An integrated economic and social analysis to assess the impact of vegetable and fishpond technologies on poverty in rural Bangladesh. In: Adato, M and Meinzen Dick (eds) *Agricultural Research, Livelihoods, and Poverty: Studies of Economic and Social Impacts in Six Countries*. Washington D.C. IFPRI.
- Hallward-Dreimeier, M and O. Gajigo (2011) Strengthening Economic Rights and Women's Occupational Choice. *The Impact of Reforming Ethiopia's Family Law*. Mimeo.
- Heise, L. (2011) What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An Evidence Overview. http://www.dfid.gov.uk/R4D/PDF/Outputs/Gender/60887-Preventing_partner_violence_Jan_2012.pdf
- Holden, S. , K. Deininger and H. Gebru (2011) Tenure Insecurity, Gender, Low-cost Land Certification and Land Rental Market Participation in Ethiopia. *Journal of Development Studies*, 47(1): 31-47.
- Holden, S. and T. Tefera (2008). *From Being the Property of Men to Becoming Equal Owners? Early Impacts of Land Registration and Certification on Women in Southern Ethiopia*. Final Research Report submitted to UN-HABITAT, Shelter Branch, Land Tenure and Property Administration Section. Nairobi.
- Holmes, R. and N. Jones (2010) Rethinking social protection using a gender lens, ODI Working Paper 320. London: Overseas Development Institute.
- Hossein, N. (2011) Security and the Pathways of Women's Empowerment: Findings from a Thematic Synthesis of the Pathways of Women's Empowerment Research. University of Sussex, Institute of Development Studies. Mimeo.

- Hossein, N. (2012) Women's Empowerment Revisited: From Individual to Collective Power among the Export Sector Workers of Bangladesh. IDS Working Paper 389.
- Htun, M. and S.L. Weldon (2012) The Civic Origins of Progressive Policy Change: Combating Violence against Women in Global Perspective, 1975-2005. *American Political Science Review*, 106 (3). 548-569.
- Humphreys, M. and J.M. Weinstein (2007) Demobilization and Reintegration. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 51(4), 531-567.
- Humphreys, M., R. Sanchez de la Sierra, P. van der Windt (2012) Social and Economic Impacts of Tuungane. Final Report on the Effects of a Community Driven Reconstruction Program in Eastern Democratic Republic of Congo.
<http://www.oecd.org/countries/democraticrepublicofthecongo/drc.pdf>
- Humphries, S., L. Classen, J. Jiménez, F. Sierra, O. Gallardo, M. Gómez (2012) Opening Cracks for the Transgression of Social Boundaries: An Evaluation of the Gender Impacts of Farmer Research Teams in Honduras. *World Development*, 40(10), 2078-2095.
- Hussein, M. and S. Hussein (2003) The impact of micro-finance on poverty and gender equity: Approaches and evidence from Pakistan. Islamabad: Pakistan Microfinance Network.
- Iyengar, R. and G. Ferrari (2011) Discussion sessions coupled with microfinance may enhance the role of women in household decision-making in Burundi, NBER Working Paper Series W.16902. National Bureau of Economic Research: Washington, DC.
- Iyer, L., A. Mani, P. Mishra and P. Topalova (2010) The power of political voice. *Political Representation and Crime: Evidence from India's Panchayati Raj*. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 4(4), 165-193.
- Janssens, W. (2007) Social Capital and Cooperation. An Impact Evaluation of a Women's Empowerment Programme in Rural India. Tinbergen Institute Amsterdam. Research Series No. 401. Thela Thesis.
- Jensen, R. (2012) Do labour market opportunities affect young women's work and family decision? Experimental Evidence from India. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 127(2), 753-792
- Jensen, R. and E. Oster (2009) The Power of TV: Cable Television and Women's Status in India. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 124(3), 1057-1094.
- Jewkes, R., M. Nduna, J. Levin, N. Jama, K. Dunkle, A. Puren and N. Duvvury (2008) Impact of Stepping Stones on incidence of HIV and HSV-2 and sexual behaviour in rural south Africa: cluster randomised controlled trial. *British Medical Journal*, 337: a506.
- Jubb, N. et al (2010) Women's Police Stations in Latin America: An Entry Point for Stopping Violence and Gaining Access to Justice. Quito, Ecuador: Centre for Planning and Social Studies
- Kabeer, N. (2001) Conflicts over credit: re-evaluating the empowerment potential of loans to women in rural Bangladesh. *World Development*, 29(1), 63-84.
- Kabeer, N. (2005): Gender equality and women's empowerment: A critical analysis of the third millennium development goal 1, *Gender & Development*, 13(1), 13-24.
- Kanpur, D. (2010) Comments and Discussion on Beaman et al. (2010). *India Policy Forum*, 2010-11, p. 192-196, Brookings and NCAER.
- Karlan, D. and M. Valdivia (2011) Teaching entrepreneurship: impact of business training on micro-finance clients and institutions. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 93(2): 510-527.
- Kim, J., C. Watts, J. Hargreaves, L. Ndhlovu, G. Phetla, L. Morrison, J. Busza, J. Porter and P. Pronyk (2007) Understanding the impact of a microfinance-based intervention on women's empowerment and the reduction of intimate partner violence in South Africa. *American Journal of Public Health*, 97(10): p. 1794-1802.
- Kim, J., C. Watts, J. Hargreaves, L. Ndhlovu, G. Phetla, L. Morrison, J. Busza, J. Porter and P. Pronyk (2009) Assessing the incremental effects of combining economic and health interventions: the IMAGE study in South Africa. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 2009. 87: p. 824-832.

- Knox, A., A. Kes, N. Milici, N. Duvvury, C. Johnson, E. Nicoletti, H. Swaminathan, N. Bhatla and S. Chakraborty (2007) Mending the gap between law and practice. Organizational Approaches for Women's Property Rights. Washington D.C.: ICRW.
- Krishnan, S., C. Rocca, A. Hubbard, K. Subbiah, J. Edmeades and N. Padian (2010) Do changes in spousal employment status lead to domestic violence. Insights from a prospective study in Bangalore India. *Social Science and Medicine*, 70 (1): 136-143.
- Krook, M.L. (2009) Quotas for women in politics. Gender and candidate selection worldwide. New York and London: Oxford University Press.
- Kumar, N. and A.R. Quisumbing (2012a) Beyond "Death do us part": The long term Implications of Divorce Perceptions on Women's Well-being and Child Schooling in Rural Ethiopia. *World Development*, 40 (12), 2478-2489.
- Kumar, N. and A.R. Quisumbing (2012b) Inheritance Practices and Gender Differences in Poverty and Well-being in rural Ethiopia. *Development Policy Review*, 30(5), 573-595.
- Kumar, S. and N. Prakash (2012) Political Decentralization, Women's Reservation and Child Health Outcomes: A Case Study of Rural Bihar. IGC Working Paper 12/0591. London, UK.
- Kutsoati, E. and R. Morck (2012) Family Ties, Inheritance Rights and Successful Poverty Alleviation: Evidence from Ghana. NBER Working Papers 18080.
- La Ferrara, E. and A. Milazzo (2011) Customary Norms, Inheritance and Human Capital. Evidence from a reform of the Matrilineal System in Ghana. Mimeo.
- La Ferrara, E., A. Chong and S. Duryea (2012) Soap Operas and Fertility: Evidence from Brazil. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 4(4), 1-13.
- Leino, J. (2007) Gender and Community Management of Water Infrastructure: Evidence from a Randomized Evaluation in Kenya. Mimeo World Bank.
- Luttrell, C., S. Quiroz, C. Scrutton and K. Bird (2009) Understanding and operationalizing empowerment. ODI Working Paper.
- Mak, K. (2005) Engendering Property Rights: Women's Insecure Land Tenure and Its Implications for Development Policy in Kenya and Uganda. *Journal of Public and International Affairs*. Vol. 16 (0). p 145-66.
- Mansuri, G. and V. Rao (2013) Localizing Development. Does Participation Work? Washington DC: World Bank.
- McKenzie, D. and C. Woodruff (2012) What are we learning from Business training and entrepreneurship evaluations around the developing world? World Bank Policy Research Paper 6202. Washington D.C. World Bank.
- Mensch, B. M. Grant, M. Sebastian, P. Hewett and D. Huntington (2004) The effect of a livelihoods intervention in an urban slum in India: Do vocational counseling and training alter the attitudes and behaviour of adolescent girls. Population council Policy Research Division Working Paper 194.
- Ministerie van Buitenlandse Zaken (2007) Terms of Reference MDG3 Fonds. Den Haag, mimeo.
- Mocan, N. and C. Cannonier (2012) Empowering women through education: Evidence from Sierra Leone. NBER Working Papers 18016.
- Morrison, A., M. Ellsberg and S. Bott (2007) Addressing Gender-Based Violence: A critical Review of Interventions. *The World Bank Research Observer*, 22(1), p.25-51.
- Molyneux, M., 2008, 'Conditional Cash Transfers: A 'Pathway to Women's Empowerment'', Pathways to Women's Empowerment Working Paper 5, Institute of Development Studies, Brighton
- Natarajan, M. (2008) Women Police in a Changing Society. Back Door to Equality. Ashgate.
- North, D. (1990) Institutions, Institutional Change and Economic Performance. Cambridge University Press.
- OECD (2011) Investing in Security: A Global Assessment of Armed Violence Reduction Initiatives Conflict and Fragility, OECD Publishing.
- Paluck, E. L. (2009) Reducing intergroup prejudice and conflict using the media: A field experiment in Rwanda. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 96(3), 574-587.

- Paluck, E. L. (2010) Is it better not to talk? Group polarization, extended contact, and perspective-taking in eastern Democratic Republic of Congo. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 36 (9), 1170-1185.
- Paluck, E. L. And L. Bell (2010) *Social Norms Marketing aimed at gender based violence. A literature review and Critical Assessment*. New York: International Rescue Committee.
- Pathways of Women's Empowerment RPC (2011) *Empowerment: A Journey not a Destination*, Brighton: Pathways of Empowerment.
- Pande, R. and D. Ford (2011) *Gender Quotas and Female Leadership. Background Paper to the World Development Report 2012 Gender Equality and Development*. Washington DC: The World Bank. <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTWDR2012/Resources/7778105-1299699968583/7786210-1322671773271/Pande-Gender-Quotas-April-2011.pdf>
- Pandolfelli and A. Quisumbing (2010) Promising Approaches to Address the Needs of Poor Female Farmers. Resources, Constraints and Interventions. *World Development*, 38(4), 581-592.
- Parajuli, D., G. Acharya, N. Chaudhury and B.B. Thapa (2012) Impact of Social Fund on the Welfare of Rural Households. Evidence from the Nepal Poverty Alleviation Fund. Policy Research Working Paper 6042. Washington D.C.: The World Bank.
- Peterman, A. (2011) Women's Property Rights and Gendered Policies. Implications for Women's Long-term Welfare in Rural Tanzania. *Journal of Development Studies*, 47(1): 1-30.
- Pitt, M. and S.R. Khandker (1998) The impact of group-based credit programs on poor households in Bangladesh: Does the gender of participants matter? *Journal of Political Economy*, 106(5), 958-96.
- Pitt, Khandker and Cartwright (2006) Empowering Women with Micro-Finance. Evidence from Bangladesh. *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 54(4), 791-831.
- Pronyk, P.M, J. Hargreaves, J. Kim, L. Morison, G. Phetla, C. Watts, J. Busza and J. Porter (2006) Effect of a structural intervention for the prevention of intimate-partner violence and HIV in rural South Africa. A cluster randomised trial. *Lancet*, 368(9551) p. 1973-1983.
- Pulerwitz, J., G. Barker, M. Segundo and M. Nascimento (2006) Promoting more gender equitable norms and behaviors among young men as an HIV/AIDS prevention strategy, in *Horizons Final Report*. 2006, Population Council: Washington D.C.
- Pulerwitz, J., S. Martin, M. Mehta, T. Casillo, A. Kidanu, F. Verani, S. Tewolde (2010a) *Promoting Gender Equity for HIV and Violence Prevention: Results from the PEPFAR Male Norms Initiative Evaluation in Ethiopia*. Washington DC: PATH.
- Pulerwitz, J., A. Michaelis, R. Verma and E. Weiss (2010b) *Addressing gender dynamics and engaging men in HIV Programs: Lessons Learned from Horizons Research*. Public Health Reports, 2010. 125: p. 282-292.
- Rao, N. (2006) *Women's Right To Land, Assets, And Other Productive Resources. Its Impact On Gender Relations And Increased Productivity*. eSocialSciences Working Paper 767.
- Roodman, D. and J. Murdoch (2011) *The Impact of Micro-credit on the Poor in Bangladesh: Revisiting the Evidence*. Center for global Development Working Paper 174. See also: <http://www.cgdev.org/content/publications/detail/1422302>
- Roy, S. (2012) *Female Empowerment through Inheritance Rights: Evidence from India*. Mimeo. Oxford University.
- Sandefur, J. and B. Siddiqi (2010) *Timap Criminal Justice Pilot. Baseline Evaluation Report*. Submitted to the Open Society Justice Initiative, CSAE, Oxford.
- Sherin, K. Sinacore, J.M., X-Q Li, R.E. Zitter and A. Shakil (1998) HITS: A Short Domestic Violence Screening Tool for Use in Family Practice Settings. *Family Medicine*, 30(7) 508-12.
- Smits, R. and S. Cruz (2011) *Increasing Security in DR Congo: Gender Responsive Strategies for Combating Sexual Violence*. CRU Policy Brief #17. Clingendael, The Hague.
- Solórzano, I., A. Bank, R. Pena, H. Espinoza, M. Ellsberg and J. Pulerwitz (2008) *Catalyzing Personal and Social Change Around Gender, Sexuality and HIV: Impact Evaluation of Punto*

- de Encuentro's Communication Strategy in Nicaragua. Horizons Final Report. Washington D.C. The Population Council.
- Stewart R, C. van Rooyen, K. Dickson, M. Majoro, T. de Wet (2010) What is the impact of microfinance on poor people? A systematic review of evidence from sub-Saharan Africa. Technical report. London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, University of London.
- Swaminathan, H., R. Lahoti., and Y, S. J. Suchitra (2012) Women's Property, Mobility, and Decisionmaking: Evidence from Rural Karnataka. IFPRI Discussion Paper 01188.
- Tcherneva, P.R. and L. R. Wray (2007) Public Employment and Women: The Impact of Argentina's Jefes Program on Female Heads of Poor Households. Economics Working Paper Archive wp_519, Levy Economics Institute.
- Todd, P.E. (2012) Effectiveness of interventions aimed at improving women's employability and quality of work: a critical review, Policy Research Working Paper Series 6189, The World Bank.
- Turner, S. (2010) Angry Young men in camps: gender, age and class relations among Burundian Refugees in Tanzania. New Issues in Refugee Research. Working Paper no. 9.
- UNFPA (2009). Programming to address violence against women: 8 case studies. New York: UNFPA Technical Division, Gender Human Rights and Culture Branch. Available from: <http://unfpa.org/public/home/publications/pid/1913>.
- Urguieta-Salomon J.E., A.M. Tepichin-Valle and M.M. Tellez-Rojo (2009) Poverty and Gender Perspective in Productive Projects for rural Women in Mexico. Impact Evaluation of a Pilot Project. Evaluation Review, 33(1), 27-53.
- Vaessen, J., F. Leeuw, S. Bonilla, A. Rivas, R. Lukach, J. Bastiaensen, N. Holvoet (2012) The effects of microcredit on women's control over household spending in developing countries. Campbell systematic reviews.
- Venning, P. (2010) Marrying Contested Approaches: Empowerment and the Imposition of International Principles: Domestic Violence Case Resolution in Indonesia. Journal of Development Studies, 46(3) 397-416.
- Veras Soares, F., R. Perez Ribas and R. Guerreiro Osorio (2010) Evaluating The Impact of Brazil's Bolsa Família. Cash Transfer Programs in Comparative Perspective. Latin American Research Review, 45(2), 173-190.
- Verma, R., J. Pulerwitz, V. S. Mahendra, S. Khandekar, A. Singh, S. Das, S. Mehra, A. Nura and G. Barker (2008) Promoting gender equity as a strategy to reduce HIV risk and gender-based violence among young men in India, in Horizons Final Report. Population Council: Washington D.C.
- Vyas, S. and Watts, C. (2009) How does Economic Empowerment affect Women's Risk of Intimate Partner Violence in Low and Middle Income Countries? A Systematic Review of Published Evidence, Journal of International Development, 21(5), 577-602
- Willet, S. (2010) Introduction: Security Council Resolution 1325: Assessing the Impact on Women, Peace and Security. International Peacekeeping, 17(2), 142-158.
- WHO (2008) Eliminating female genital mutilation: An Interagency statement. Geneva: WHO, in partnership with UNAIDS, UNDP, UNECA, UNESCO, UNFPA, UNHCHR, UNHCR, UNICEF and UNIFEM.
- World Bank, The (2011a) Gender Dimensions of Community Driven Development Operations. A Toolkit for Practitioners. East Asia and Pacific Region Social Development Reports. 66033. Washington D.C.: The World Bank.
- World Bank, The (2011b) Measuring the impact of Community Driven Development Projects on Gender. A Toolkit for the Poverty Reduction Fund, Lao, PDR. East Asia and Pacific Region Social Development Reports. 66035. Washington D.C.: The World Bank.
- World Bank, The (2011c) Gender Equality and Development. World Development Report 2012. Washington D.C.: The World Bank

Yoong, J., L. Rabinovich and S. Diepeveen (2012) The impact of economic resource transfers to women versus men. A systematic Review. London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London.

AUTHORS	INTERVENTION	SAMPLE	SOURCES OF DATA	OUTCOMES	RESULTS	METHOD
POLITICAL PARTICIPATION						
Chattopadhey and Duflo (2004)	women in village leadership positions in India	161 GPs in 1 district in West-Bengal and 100 GPs in 1 district in Rajasthan	records of village meetings and FGD resource mapping	Political participation and Policy Outcomes	greater involvement of women in local politics and more women preferred public goods	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats
Beaman et al (2012)	women in village leadership positions in India	495 villages in 1 district in West-Bengal, 8453 surveys of adolescents and their parents in 2007	household questionnaire	Aspirations of parents and their adolescents	higher aspirations regarding education, jobs and marriage and child bearing but no changes in actual job opportunities	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats, regressions
Beaman et al (2010)	women in village leadership positions in India	197 village meetings in 5 Indian States, Millennial Survey on public goods (30000+ hh, 2304 villages, 24 states in 2000, West Bengal GP survey 2005	reports on village meetings, facilities and household survey Millennial Survey, PRA on public goods in West-Bengal GPs	Political participation and Policy Outcomes	increased participation of women in village meetings, women leaders make different policy decisions and villagers pay less bribes in GPs with female leaders	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats, regressions
Beaman et al (2009)	women in village leadership positions in India	165 GPs in 1 district in West-Bengal, 495 villages, household survey with individual modules for 6642 men and 6568 women	electoral data, village level PRA on public goods and facilities audit, plus household survey	Political participation, voter evaluation, attitudes and implicit tastes vis a vis female leaders	female leaders are more likely to be elected in non-reserved seats after two periods of reservation and female leaders are more positively evaluated by voters after two periods of reservation	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats, regressions

Ban and Rao (2008)	women in village leadership positions in India	523 villages and 5000 households in 4 states in 2002	PRA on provision of local public goods, household survey and leader survey	Political participation and policy outcomes	no effect on public goods provision or women's participation, but interaction of female performance with institutional characteristics	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats
Bardhan et al (2005)	women in village leadership positions in India	89 villages in 15 districts in West-Bengal, 20 hh per village	electoral data and records from government disbursing institutions	Policy outcomes; targetting of non public good programmes	mixed (pos/neg) effects on targetting under different programmes	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats
Bardhan et al (2010)	women in village leadership positions in India	89 villages in 15 districts in West-Bengal, 20 hh per village	household survey	Policy outcomes; targetting anti-poverty programmes	female reservation has no effect on targetting towards female headed households and negative effects on targetting towards low caste households; joint women and SC/ST reservation is better for targetting at village level but not to specific groups within the village	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats
Besley et al (2005)	women in village leadership positions in India	396 villages in 3 States covering 4059 hh	household survey and audit of village facilities	Policy outcomes	no effects on targetting BPL cards	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats

Iyer et al (2010)	women in village leadership positions in India	391 observations from 17 major states 1985-2007	crime data NCRB at district and state level, state level control variables from millennial survey 2000	Crime reports	female reservation has positive effects on crimes reported against women, effect is stronger for village level representation compared to representation at district level	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats
Bhavani (2009)	women in village leadership positions in India	220 wards in Mumbai 1997 and 2002	electoral data	Political participation	women are more likely to be elected in an unreserved seat in constituencies that had reservation before	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats, regressions
Beaman et al (2007)	women in village leadership positions in India	> 2000 children from 100 villages in Udaipur	household survey with specific module on immunization of children	Child outcomes	positive effects on children's immunization records, attendance of day care and gender gap in education	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats
Clots-Figuras (2012a)	share of women politicians at district level in India	constituencies in 16 major states 1967-2001	Electoral data constituencies coupled with district level data on gvmnt expenditures	Policy outcomes	mixed results, gender interacts with caste	IV estimation. Instrument close elections where women won
Clots-Figuras (2012b)	share of women politicians at district level in India	constituencies in 17 major states 1967-2001	Electoral data constituencies coupled with 55th NSS survey with info on some 600000 educational attainment	Education outcomes	mixed results, gender interacts with caste	IV estimation. Instrument close elections where women won
Humphreys et al (2011)	Gender parity in village level committees in CDD programme in DRC	560 villages (280 treatment with training programme of which 75% equal representation)	household questionnaires and committee compositions	Political participation, Policy Outcomes and Attitudes towards women	Some effects on policy outcomes, no effect on political participation (other strengthening numbers) and no evidence of positive changes in attitudes towards women	RCT: comparison of means between gender parity committees and committees without gender parity

Deininger et al (2011)	women in village leadership positions in India	NCAER, 233 villages in rural India in 2008	household panel data with performance measures at individual level for all hh members>16	Quality of service delivery, perception on Pradhan's leadership quality, officials accountability, political participation and willingness to contribute to local public goods	negative effect on perceived leadership qualities, little effect on public service delivery, higher political participation and greater willingness to contribute to local public goods.	RCT: comparison of means of reserved and unreserved seats and men and women and regression based
Bhalotra and Clots Figuras (2011)	share of women politicians at district level in India	> 60000 children, >18000 mothers in 1591 villages in India	electoral data combined with household and village level data from Indian National Family Health Surveys	Effect of female district leadership on public health: neonatal and infant mortality, investments in village public goods and health seeking behavior in pregnancy	woman politicians reduce neonatal mortality, they are more likely to build public health facilities and encourage antenatal care, institutional delivery and immunization	IV estimation. Instrument close elections where women won
Leino (2007)	women's participation in community water management	334 water management committees with randomized allocation to various forms of financial assistance and female participation intervention (168)	survey of user committees and members of such committees	participation of women in the users committees and maintenance outcomes of the water infrastructure	Increased participation of women in the user groups (both as leaders as well as members) but no effect on maintenance quality or other outcomes (income generating activities or tree planting	comparison of groups with female participation intervention to those without such intervention

PROPERTY AND INHERITANCE RIGHTS						
Deininger, Ali and Alemu (2011)	land certification Ethiopia	900 hh and 4000 plots in one zone in Amhara region	household survey 4 rounds panel 1999, 2001, 2004, 2007	perceived tenure security, land investments and rental market participation	female hh no effect on perceived insecurity, lower land investments but higher rental market participation	DiD with treatment and control group due to phased in implementation
Holden, Deininger and Ghebru (2011)	land certification Ethiopia	400 hh in 16 villages in Tigray	4 rounds panel survey starting 1 year before certification	female headed households participation in the land rental market	FHH increased participation in the rental market if they had certificate	regression based analysis with random certification variable
Bezabih, Holden and Mannberg (2012)	land certification Ethiopia	1500 randomly selected households and 7500 plots in 14 villages from 5 districts in 2 zones of Amhara Region	two survey rounds in 2005 and 2007 with about half of the kebeles receiving certification after 2005, treatment and control communities do not differ in terms of distance to, road/town or pre-program productivity with some other ex-ante differences	agricultural productivity on self managed and traded out plots of female and male owned plots	increased productivity on certified plots, especially on self managed plots and partly on traded out plots (in one region only)	DiD, geographic discontinuity, regression based comparison of change in land productivity and separate empirical analysis for the two zones to cater for their heterogeneity
Peterman (2011)	changes in land law in Tanzania	800 hh in 51 communities	KHDS panel 1991-2004	self employment, earnings and expenditures	increased employment and earnings, but no effect for expenditures	IV: community level property rights regime
Deininger, Goyal and Nagarajan (2010)	inheritance law reform in India	2 States with early adoption, 1371 households	REDS 2006 round	land inheritance, age at marriage, educational attainment	Positive effects on all indicators, but still inequality in inheritance	DiD comparing outcomes for females/males before or after the HSA amendment
Roy (2012)	inheritance law reform in India	19000 women at least 22 years old across 28 states	repeated cross section from 3 waves of National Family and Health Survey and REDS 1999 on dowry	female education, real dowry paid and age at marriage	increase in years of education for girls and decrease in dowry prices	DiD between treated cohorts and control cohorts in reforming states compared to non-reforming states

Field (2003)	urban property titles in Peru	4433 women in treated and to be treated neighbourhoods of 8 cities in Peru	Household survey of 2750 households in 2000, midway through program implementation	whether woman gave birth and whether household head makes family decisions	titling reduces fertility, especially in households where female name is on the title	Intention to Treat (ITT) analysis with DiD between group that lacked a title prior to intervention and households that already possessed title prior to intervention (non-squatters). Staggered introduction of programme introduces exogeneity
Ali et al (2011)	land tenure regularisation in Rwanda	2300 hh in three pilot cells and neighbouring cells	household survey in 2010, 2.5 yrs after pilot	land related investment, women's land rights and inheritance and land market activity	positive effects on land related investment (esp. For female headed households) and women's land rights and security about inheritance. Decrease in land market activity.	spatial discontinuity design, tenure regularization was compulsory and not voluntary. Use spatial fixed effects to control for local level unobservables.
Andersson and Genicot (2012)	inheritance law reform in India	annual suicide rates for each state	suicide data 1967-2004 from national crime records bureau and individual level data on domestic violence from NFHS	suicides and justification and occurrence of wife beating	suicides of men and women increase after amendments are passed (more for men compared to women) and justification and occurrence of wife beating increases as well	discontinuity in passing amendments to the inheritance law
Datta (2006)	joint titles for informal housing in India	random hh sample in 3 types of settlements, with no titles, individual titles for men or joint titles	453 structured interviews, 77 unstructured interviews and 15 FGD.	Attachment to the house and active resistance when spouse wants to sell	women with joint titles will act more strongly on unilateral decision by their husband to sell the land	mixed method approach with comparison between three different types of settlements

Brule (2012)	inheritance law reform in India	13.935 individuals with fathers who died five year before HSAA and 6805 individuals with fathers who died within five years after HSAA	REDS	Fair share of land inherited by daughters	daughters are more likely to inherit a fair share of their fathers land if local political agents are more accountable to them	Comparison of means and RDD based on date of father's death.
--------------	---------------------------------	--	------	---	--	--

GENDER BASED VIOLENCE

Pronyk et al (2006)	IMAGE, a combination of micro-finance with 10 sessions gender and HIV training curriculum in South Africa	8 villages, 4 treatment, 4 control in Limpopo Province. 3 cohorts: female participants in the programme, household co-residents and a random sample of community residents	individual interviews at baseline and follow up (2001-2004)	economic wellbeing and social capital, HIV awareness, attitudes towards Gender and Sexuality, Caring and Sharing, GBV; openness to new ideas, experience of forced sex	Limited effects on economic wellbeing and social capital, mixed changes on HIV awareness and attitudes, reduction of (self) reported intimate partner violence	cluster RCT, difference in difference comparing changes in treated and non-treated groups
Kim et al (2007)	IMAGE, a combination of micro-finance with 10 sessions gender and HIV training curriculum in South Africa	8 villages, 4 treatment, 4 control in Limpopo Province. 3 cohorts: female participants in the programme, household co-residents and a random sample of community residents	individual interviews at baseline and follow up (2001-2004)	economic wellbeing, empowerment , IPV	Increases in some elements of economic wellbeing and empowerment and a reduction in reported violence against partners (but only for men)	cluster RCT, difference in difference comparing changes in treated and non-treated groups
Jewkes et al (2008)	Stepping Stones South Africa, 50 hrs participatory learning programme on sexual health through building stronger and more gender equal relationship	70 villages in Eastern Cape with 35 treatment villages and 35 control villages, each with approximately 1400 participants (700 male and 700 female each)	individual interviews and HIV tests at baseline and follow-up (2006-2008)	Incidence of physical or sexual intimate partner violence, sexual behavior	Reduction of herpes in male and females and reduction of physical or sexual IPV at 24 and to a lesser extend 12 months. No effect on HIV and female risk behaviour	RCT, Difference in difference comparing treated and non-treated group

Bradley et al (2011)	Stepping Stones in India	40 villages, 20 control and 20 treatment	Polling booth surveys with past trainees and the general population	Attitudes towards gender based violence	SS trainees and the general population in the intervention communities were generally slightly more enlightened than respondents in non SS villages	ex-post comparison of trainees and general population in the intervention communities to general population in control communities
Jensen and Oster (2008)	cable television in India	180 villages in five Indian States, three year panel of * women with no pre-existing differential trends in women's status.	SARI, individual level surveys	attitudes, autonomy, fertility and school enrollment	decreases in the reported acceptability of domestic violence against women as well as son preference, fertility and increases in women's autonomy	comparison of villages that obtain cable in the panel (21 out of 180) compared to those that did not get cable.
Mocan and Cannonier (2012)	free primary education for children in Sierra Leone in 2001	2600 individuals across Sierra Leone	DHS 2008	women's and men's preferences regarding women's wellbeing, fertility, violence and use of contraceptives	positive changes in attitudes towards women's health and violence against women, reduction in the number of desired children and increase propensity to use modern contraceptives. These effects are only found in women, not in men	exploiting discontinuity in education policy with the introduction of free primary education in 2001 and differences in intensity of the programme across districts; comparing pre FPE cohorts to post FPE cohorts
Iyengar and Ferrari (2011)	effect of 6 joint discussion sessions as add on in VSLs in Burundi	half of the participants in 25 VSLs in Makamba province	baseline and follow-up survey in 2008 and 2009, as well as qualitative information on men and women	decision making authority, attitudes towards gender norms and violence and exposure to violence	some positive changes in decision making authority for women but no significant effects on attitudes towards violence or exposure to violence	comparison of baseline and post-intervention indicators in female and male participants and non-participants

Kim et al (2009)	social and health effects of discussion sessions in South Africa (12 month gender and HIV training session) for women as an add on in micro-finance intervention	1230 women in 12 villages (3 treatments; control, MF only and MF+discussion	ex-post interviews, 2 years after the intervention	economic well-being, empowerment , IPV and HIV risk behavior	No effect of discussion sessions on economic well-being, but consistent greater effect of discussion sessions on empowerment, IPV and HIV outcomes, compared to MF only treatment	comparing outcomes in three arms: Micro-finance only, MF with discussion sessions for women in the fortnightly loan repayment sessions, and no intervention.
Pulerwitz et al (2010)	Community based gender equity programme in Ethiopia	700 men aged 15-24 in 3 low income subcities in Addis Abeba with three different interventions	individual surveys at baseline and follow-up after 6 months	support for equitable gender norms, gender related behavior, including violence and HIV risk	positive effect on GEM scale and partner communication and reduction in self reported partner violence	quasi comparing changes in outcomes between three arms: interactive group education with community engagement activities, community engagement activities only, delayed intervention
Verma et al (2008)	Community based gender equity programme in India	1138 men in 3 slums in Mumbai (aged 16-29) and two blocks of rural villages (15-24 YRS) in UP, with three different interventions	baseline and follow-up survey after 6 months	support for equitable gender norms, gender related behavior, including violence and HIV risk	positive effect on GEM scale, partner communication , condom use, and reduction of self-reported violence against a partner. No difference between group education only and combined group education and social marketing campaign	quasi experimental design comparing changes in outcomes between three arms: interactive group education with community engagement activities, community engagement activities only, delayed intervention

Pulerwitz et al (2006)	Community based gender equity programme in Brazil	800 men (14-25 yrs) in three low income communities in Rio de Janeiro, with three different interventions	baseline and follow-up survey after 6 months and 12 months (for 2 sites only)	support for equitable gender norms and HIV/STI outcomes	positive effect on GEM scale and condom use with primary partner, reduced reporting of STI symptoms with some signs these effects are stronger in the combined GE and social marketing site and may increase over time	quasi experimental design comparing changes in outcomes between three arms: interactive group education with community engagement activities, community engagement activities only, delayed intervention
Bobonis et al (2009)	Public transfers to mothers in Oportunidades program in Mexico (2-6 years after implementation)	sample of 2867 women aged 25 years or older and with children <11 years who married before the onset of the programme	2003 ENDIREH national household survey	physical, sexual and emotional violence	public transfers reduce the likelihood of physical violence but increase non-physical forms of spousal abuse, especially in households with low female decision making power.	Ex-post comparison of beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries based on a sample that reduces the possibility that the results are influenced by self-selection into the programme, including matching estimates and several robustness checks

Bobonis et al (2012)	Public transfers to mothers in Oportunidades program in Mexico (5-9 years after implementation)	sample of 2867 (2003) and 4240 (2006) women aged 25 years or older and with children <11 years who married before the onset of the programme	2003 and 2006 ENDIREH national household survey	physical, sexual and emotional violence	5 to 9 years after the introduction of the programme no significant differences were found between participants and non participants.	Ex-post comparison of beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries based on a sample that reduces the possibility that the results are influenced by self-selection into the programme, including matching estimates and several robustness checks. Considering short term and long term effects
Angelucci (2008)	Public transfers to mothers in Oportunidades program in Mexico, first year of implementation	12,700 households in which woman was interviewed, across 506 villages of which 320 villages randomly received treatment	unclear	alcohol abuse and violent behaviour when drinking	reduces alcohol abuse and heterogeneous effects of violent behavior (depending on transfer size and characteristics of husband)	ex-post comparison of beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries
LABOUR MARKET						
Berlinsky et al (2010)	providing pre-school services in Argentina	23000 children from mothers between 18-49 with at least one child aged 4	Bi-annual panel survey with data from 1995 to 2001	prevalence and duration of labour market participation of women	positive effects on the likelihood that mothers work and the hours worked	birth date allows for a regression discontinuity design to perform IV for preschool attendance
berlinsky and Galiani (2007)	providing pre-school services in Argentina	30000 mothers aged 18-49 with at least one child between 3-5 years	EPH, 1994-2000	labour market participation and hours worked	large but marginally significant positive effects on labour market outcomes	DiD estimates based on differences across regions and cohorts

Jensen (2012)	recruitment services and labour market outcomes and aspirations in India	randomly selected 20 hh per village in 80 treatment and 80 control villages	household survey in 2003 and 2006	labour market outcomes and aspirations	young women are less likely to get married or have children, chose to enter the labour market or obtain more education and have higher aspirations for a career	ex-post regression based comparison and considering changes between baseline and follow up
Field et al (2010)	business training in India	597 female SEWA bank customers, aged 18-50 who were active savers and employed; 2/3 treated, 1/3 control	baseline and follow up survey of women	income and discussing business plans	Especially Upper Caste women are likely to benefit from the training in terms of reporting to earn income and to talk about business plan with their family	instrumenting attendance with treatment status; regression based comparison of groups
Attanasio et al (2011)	vocational training in Colombia	3549 men and women in 7 colombian cities, 1/2 treated and 1/2 control	baseline and follow up survey of trainees, follow up 20 months after the training began	labour market status, wages and non-wage benefits	training in creases likelihood of paid employment, increased monthly wages and in creased non-wage benefits	ITT effects of the training by comparing randomly assigned pupils who were offered or not offered but both selected for the training

Hallward-Driemeier and Gajigo (2011)	changes in family law in Ethiopia	approximately 15000 women aged 15-49 years	DHS 2000 and 2005, pre and post law reform	occupational choice	increasing women's share in paid work outside the home, year-round employment with higher educational requirement heterogeneity for age and marital status	DiD estimates based on differences across regions with robustness checks for pre-existing regional trends and other reforms
Blattman et al (2011)	employment creation programme in Northern Uganda	5 members per group out of 522 groups, approximately half of which received treatment	individual level survey baseline in 2008 and follow up in 2010	economic outcomes, social cohesion and community participation as well as subjective well-being	positive effects on labour market outcomes no significant gender differentiated effects.	regression based treatment on the treated estimate using assignment to treatment as an instrument for treatment
Hallman et al (2007)	training and credit to improve income and non-monetary indicators for women in Bangladesh	990 households across three sites with 110 adopters and 55 non-adopters in treatment villages and 110 likely adopters and 55 non adopters in control sites	four rounds of household surveys after four months, combined with FGD on female empowerment indicators	economic outcomes, female empowerment indicators and nutritional status	increases in farm and off-farm income and crop and pond profit, but no effect on expenditures and total income, marginal effects on female empowerment (economic dimension only)	quasi experimental approach comparing adopting households with likely adopting households (in control villages) using regressions in which programme placement is instrumented by village characteristics
Nopo et al (2007)	occupational training ProJoven in Peru	1014 beneficiaries and 1534 matched controls in 5 cities	individual interviews at baseline and 6, 12 and 18 months after internship was completed	labour supply, income and occupational segregation by gender	increasing employment rate, especially for women; increasing working hours especially for men; increase in	DiD on matched sample

					monthly earnings, with substantial gains for women and reduced occupational segregation	
Afridi et al (2012)	national rural employment guarantee scheme in India: equal wages men and women and 1/3 female quatum	2893 children aged 4 to 15 years in Andra Pradesh, India	Young Lives Survey 2007 and 2009/10	Child educational outcomes and mothers empowerment	women's participation in NREGS increases time in school, especially for children from poorest wealth group, girls and younger children and increases school attainment of younger children and children from poorer families. This positive impact is realized through improved position in household decision making	IV estimation to control for joint determination of parental labour market choices and investments in children's education (instrument: rainfall shock and NREGS projects)
Card et al (2006)	training and internships for low-income, uneducated enemployed or underemplo yed youth in Dominican Republic	563 control and 786 treated youth, randomly selected into treatment (based on application)	individual interviews at baseline and 10-14 months after graduation	employment, earnings and employment conditions	the evaluation found no effect from the training, with the exception of some sub-groups (young and in particular areas) no effects for women	DiD of the trainees with a control group of randomly rejected applicants

Urguieta Solomon (2009)	Productive and capacity building projects for rural women in Mexico	1278 women across 10 NGO intervention areas, participant women (606) were matched to a constructed sample of women (672) who lived in the same communities as participants but who did not participate in the program. 6 NGOs worked on capacity building only, while 6 NGOs combined capacity building and production	individual interviews	Economic outcomes, skills, perceptions on roles in the household and decision making in the household	some economic outcomes, perceptions on the roles in the household and household decision making variables changed positively, while no or a negative impact was found on skills	observational postintervention study estimating the average treatment effect on the beneficiary women by PSM.
Eyal and Woolard (2011)	child support grant in South Africa	black mothers aged 20-45 whose youngest child is within two years of age eligibility cut-off (5-8)	October Household Survey 1997/8 or General Household Survey 2002-2008	mother's employment probability and labour force participation and number of children going to school or day care	Large effects on employment probability and labour force participation as well as number of children attending school or day care	regression discontinuity based on age eligibility of children based on unanticipated variation in cut-off age, DiD,
Ahsraf et al (2009)	commitment savings product for rural bank clients in the Philippines	3125 clients receiving a commitment treatment (1/2) a marketing treatment(1/4) or no treatment	baseline and follow up survey data and administrative bank data	Index on decision making power of women and self-perceived savings behaviour	Positive impacts, particularly for women who have below median decision-making power in the baseline	regression based comparison of the treatments and control group

Karlan and Valdivia (2011)	business training as an add on to rural banking in Peru (FINCA).	>3000 clients of FINCA bank with randomly allocated treatment	FINCA financial transaction data, baseline and follow up survey two years later	economic outcomes for the clients and business knowledge improvement and empowerment in decision making	little or no evidence on business revenue, profits, decision making or employment but improvements on business knowledge and client retention for the micro-finance institution	regression based comparison of the treatments and control group and difference in difference estimation if measure was included in the baseline
----------------------------	--	---	---	---	---	---

REFERENCE	INDICATOR	EFFECT	
POLITICAL PARTICIPATION			
		West Bengal	Rajasthan
Chattopadhey and Duflo (2004)	Fraction of women among participants in GS meeting (%)	pos **	ns
	Have women filed a complaint in the GP in the last six months? (% Yes)	pos**	ns
	Have men filed a complaint in the GP in the last six months? (% Yes)	ns	ns
	Investment in drinking water	pos**	pos**
	Investment in roads	pos**	neg**
	Investments in informal education	neg*	
	Investments in formal education	ns	
	Investments in irrigation	ns	ns
Beaman et al (2012)	Parents aspirations (boys and girls separately)	difference in gender gap	
	Does not wish child to be housewife or whatever in-laws prefer (=1)	pos**	
	Wishes child to have a high education job (=1)	ns	
	Wished child to marry after age 18 (=1)	ns	
	Wishes child to graduate or get higher education(=1)	ns	
	Wishes child to be a pradhan (=1)	pos**	
	Adolescents aspirations (boys and girls separately) age 11-15		
	Does not wish to be housewife or whatever in-laws prefer (=1)	pos**	
	Wishes to have a high education job (=1)	pos**	
	Wishes to marry after age 18 (=1)	pos**	
	Wishes to graduate or get higher education(=1)	ns	
	Wishes to be a pradhan	ns	
	adolescents outcomes		
	Attends school (=1)	pos**	
	Can read or write (=1)	pos**	
	Grade completed (=1)	pos***	
	Normalized average of the above	pos**	
	Minutes per day spend on domestic chores	neg***	
	Labour market outcomes of yong adults (16-30)		
	Educational outcomes (grade attained?)	ns	

	Young women are housewives (=1)	ns	
	Young women have jobs requiring higher education (=1)	ns	
	Young women have access to employment generating schemes (=1)	ns	
	minutes young and other women spend on domestic chores	ns	
		reserved once	
Beaman et al (2009)	Share of female pradhans elected in unreserved GPs	ns	pos
	Share of women who contested and won non-reserved councillor seats	ns	pos
	perception of female effectiveness as leaders (based on speech and vignettes)	neg***	ns
	IAT leadership/domestic and male/female		
	IAT male/female names and good/bad		
	IAT male/female politician and good/bad		
	Feeling ladder male vs female pradhan		
Humpreys et al (2011)	Education vs water and sanitation projects	pos***	
	(Dis)agreement with particular statements		
	Equality: in DRC women should have the same rights as men	ns	
	Right to complain: If a man mistreats his wife she has the right to complain	ns	
	Decision-making: Women should have the same opportunities as men to occupy socio-administrative positions in the village	ns	
	Leadership: Women have knowledge to contribute and so should be eligible to serve as presidents of development committees in the village	ns	
	No of women in add-on development activity functions	ns	
Bardhan et al (2010)	targeting for housing and toilets	ns	
	targeting for employment	ns	
	targeting for drinking water (village level)	ns	
	targeting for roads (village level)	ns	
	targeting for BPL card	ns	
	targeting for IRDP credit programme	ns	
	targeting for agricultural mini-kits	ns	
Ban and Rao (2008)	Fraction of women among GS participants	ns	
	Fraction of villages with women's NGOs formed after last election	ns	
	Fraction of villages with women's CBO formed after last election	ns	

	GP activity in Water	ns	
	GP activity in Health	ns	
	GP activity in Education	pos **	
	GP activity in Sanitation	ns	
	GP activity in Roads	ns	
	GP activity in Transport	ns	
	GP activity in Electricity	ns	
	F/M preferences for water (PRA)	ns	
	F/M preferences for health (PRA)	ns	
	F/M preferences for Education (PRA)	ns	
	F/M preferences for Sanitation (PRA)	pos ***	
	F/M preferences for Transport (PRA)	ns	
	F/M preferences for Electricity (PRA)	ns	
	F/M preferences for Roads (PRA)	neg ***	
	F/M preferences for water	ns	
	F/M preferences for health	ns	
	F/M preferences for Education	ns	
	F/M preferences for Infrastructure	ns	
	F/M preferences for Transport	ns	
	F/M preferences for Electricity	pos **	
	F/M preferences for Housing	pos ***	
Clots Figuras (2012b)	completed primary education through formal education (Y/N)		
Clots Figuras (2012a)	Law: amendment of succession rights (Y/N)	s(+**)	s= scheduled caste, g= general, w=women
	Law: cumulative number of laws on three types of land reform	s(+**), g(-**)	
	number of primary schools per 1000 individuals	w(+*), s(+**)	
	number of middle schools per 1000 individuals	w(+**), g(+**), w(+***),	
	number of secondary schools per 1000 individuals	s(+*), g(+**)	
	number of teachers in primary schools per 1000 individuals	s(+**)	
	number of teachers in middle schools per 1000 individuals	s(-**)	
	number of teachers in secondary schools per 1000 individuals		
	fraction of female teachers in primary schools	w(+***), s(+**)	
	fraction of female teachers in middle schools		
	fraction of female teachers in secondary schools	g(+**)	
	number of hospitals		
	number of dispensaries	s(+*), w(+***),	
	beds in hospitals and dispensaries per 1000 individuals	s(+**), g(+**)	

Deininger et al (2011)	total state expenditures (log pc)				
	share of capital expenditure				
	share of development expenditure	s(+**)			
	share of non development expenditure	w(+*)			
	share of social expenditure	g(-**)			
		w(+***),			
	share of economic expenditure	g(+**)			
	share of expenditures on education				
	share of expenditures on health				
	share of expenditures on family welfare				
		w(-**),			
	share of expenditures on housing	g(-**)			
	share of expenditures on social security	s (-**)			
	share of expenditures on agriculture				
	share of expenditures on industry and minerals	w(+*)			
	share of expenditures on general economic services	s (+**)			
	Leader qualifications				
	Pradhan is illiterate	pos***			
	Pradhan has at least primary education	neg ***			
	Pradhan has at least secondary education	neg ***			
	Pradhan has at least high school education	neg ***			
	Pradhan is SC/ST	ns			
	Pradhan is muslim	ns			
	Pradhan is female	pos***			
	Pradhan held political office before	neg ***			
	Pradhan was candidate before	neg ***			
	Election process and revenue				
	number of candidates contested	ns			
	share of population voted	pos***			
	share of votes received	ns			
	local revenue per capita	ns			
	centrally sponsored schemes	ns			
	Pradhan's leadership qualities				
	honesty and fairness	neg***			
	technical qualification	neg***			
	national knowledge	neg***			
	can provide local public goods	neg***			
	can solve local disputes	ns			
	can fairly select beneficiaries	neg***			
	can represent the village upwards	neg**			
	Quality of service delivery	Res now	resnow*female	res lag1	res lag2
	Total	neg***	ns	pos**	ns
	Water, school, health, sanitation	neg***	ns	ns	neg**
	Roads, electricity, lights, irrigation	neg**	ns	pos***	ns
	Credit schemes, NRM,	neg*	ns	pos**	ns
	reduced absence of government officials	pos**	neg ***	ns	pos*
	Officials accountability				
	getting problems fixed easily	ns	ns	pos***	pos**

	easy accountability	ns	ns	pos***	pos**	ns
	transparant beneficiary selection	ns	ns	pos***	ns	ns
	Meeting attendance					
	Attending meeting	neg***	pos***	neg***	pos***	neg***
	relevant issues discussed	ns	pos***	ns	neg***	neg***
	participating discussing	neg*	ns	pos***	pos***	neg**
	Willingness to contribute					
	Total amount	pos***	neg**	pos***	neg*	neg**
	Water, school, health, sanitation	ns	pos*	pos***	pos***	neg***
	Roads, electicity, lights, irrigation	pos***	neg***	pos***	neg***	ns
	Credit schemes, NRM,	pos***	neg***	pos***	neg***	ns
Bhavnani (2009)	Probability of a woman winning unreserved office	pos ***				
Bardhan et al (2005)	Effect of women's reservation on:					
	Credit subsidy per household (in Rs)	pos **				
	% of credit subsidy going to SC/ST	ns				
	% of credit subsidy going to landless	ns				
	% of credit subsidy going to landless, marginal or small landowner	ns				
	credit subsidy going to SC/ST per SC/ST household	ns				
	credit subsidt going to landless per landless headed household	pos **				
	% of minikits going to landless, marginal or small landowner	ns				
	minikits per houseohld	ns				
	% of employment program expenditures on irrigation	ns				
	% of employment program expenditures on water	ns				
	% of employment program expenditures on roads	ns				
	% of employment program expenditures on education	ns				
	employment budgetary grants per hh (in Rs)	ns				
	mandays created/budgetary grants	ns				
	mandays created/ program expenditures	ns				
	% of SC/ST beneficiaries	neg *				
	% of woman beneficiaries	ns				
	mandays going to SC/ST per SC/ST household	ns				
	mandays going to women per household	ns				
	expenditures on roads	neg **				
	% of total expenditures on irrigation	ns				
	% of total expenditures on water	ns				
	% of total expenditures on roads	ns				
	% of total expenditures on education	neg *				
	% of total expenditures on health	ns				
	% of total expenditures on sports	ns				

	% of total expenditures on cultural	ns
	% of total expenditures on social welfare	ns
	% of total expenditures on employment	neg *
	% of total expenditures on administration and salaries	ns
	local revenue	ns
Beaman et al (2010)	number of men attending village meetings	ns
	number of women attending village meetings	ns
	do women speak in the village meetings	pos
	fraction of issues discussed in meeting with female participation	pos *
	fraction of words spoken by Panchayat representatives	neg *
	Pradhan chairs the meeting	neg ***
	Pradhan speaks during meeting	neg**
	Panchayat will take unconditional action in response to issues discussed	ns
	Availability of public goods in village	pos**
	Quality of public goods in village	ns
	Satisfaction with public goods in village	neg**
	Likelihood of having to pay a bribe	neg **
	Quantity of public goods provision responds to needs expressed by women	pos*
Besley et al (2005)	Beneficiary selection Below Poverty Line cards	ns
Iyer et al (2010)	total crimes against women, per 1000 women	pos **
	rapes per 1000 population	ns
	kidnapping of women and girls per 1000 women	pos *
	kidnapping of men and boys per 1000 men	ns
	crimes against property per 1000 population	ns
	murders per 1000 population	ns
	crimes against public order per 1000 population	ns
	economic crimes per 1000 population	ns
Beaman et al (2007)	Immunization completed (children 1-5)	pos *
	No immunizations received	ns
	Attending child day care	pos **
	Schoolattendance girls	pos***
Bhalotra and Clots Figuras (2011)	Neonatal mortality	neg ***
	infant mortality	neg *
	primary health subcentre in village	ns

Leino (2007)	primary health centre in village	pos**
	community health centre in village	pos **
	government dispensary in village	pos**
	government hospital in village	pos *
	electricity in village	ns
	bank in village	neg *
	post office in village	ns
	telegraph in village	ns
	telephone booth in village	ns
	number of antenatal visits	pos *
	iron and folic supplements	pos**
	tetanus injection in pregnancy	ns
	breastfeeding in first 24hr after birth	pos**
	delivery at home	neg *
	delivery at government institution	pos***
	delivery at private institution	ns
	number of vaccines per child	pos **
	number of people on committee	ns
	number of women on committee	pos***
	% of women on committee	pos***
	chair female	pos***
	vice chair female	ns
	secretary female	pos***
	treasurer female	ns
	assistant secretary female	pos**
	number of leadership positions filled	ns
	number of female leaders	pos***
	% of women leaders	pos***
	days since last slashed	ns
	days since trenches last cleared	ns
	days since storm drain last cleared	ns
	quality of catchment area maintenance	ns
	quality of trench maintenance	ns
	quality of storm drain maintenance	ns
	overall maintenance quality	ns
	income generating activities	ns
	trees planted	ns

PROPERTY RIGHTS

Ali et al (2011)		full	
		sample	FHH
	Likelihood of losing this parcel due to expropriation in the coming five years	ns	ns
	Change in proportion of parcels receiving SWC 2007- 2010	pos**	pos**
	Change seed type since 2007	ns	ns
	Female ownership of land	ns	ns
	Female ownership of land in married couples	pos***	
	Share of parcel owned by females	ns	ns
	Share of parcel owned by females in	ns	

	married couples		
	Knowing how will inherit the land	pos**	ns
	children inherit	pos*	ns
	son inherits	pos**	ns
	daughters inherits	pos**	neg**
	Change in land market participation	neg**	ns
Holden et al (2011)	Participation in the land rental market	pos*	
	Area rented out	pos**	
Bezabih et al (2012)	Log value of the yield per ha full EG sample	pos***	
	Log value of the yield per ha full SW sample	pos***	
	Log value of the yield per ha traded out plots EG sample	ns	
	Log value of the yield per ha traded out plots SW sample	ns	
	Log value of the yield per ha female headed households EG sample	pos*	
	Log value of the yield per ha female headed households SW sample	ns	
	decision to rent out land full EG sample	ns	
	decision to rent out land full SW sample	ns	
	decision to rent out land by female headed households EG sample	ns	
	decision to rent out land by female headed households SW sample	pos**	
	Productivity traded out plots EG sample	ns	
	Productivity traded out plots female headed household EG sample	ns	
	Productivity traded out plots SW sample	ns	
	Productivity traded out plots female headed household SW sample	pos*	
	Productivity self managed plots EG sample	pos***	
	Productivity self managed plots female headed household EG sample	ns	
	Productivity self managed plots SW sample	pos***	
	Productivity self managed plots female headed household SW sample	ns	
Deininger et al (2009 and 2011)	Expect an increase/decrease in land holdings	neg***	
	Propensity and Magnitude of SWC	pos***	
	Rental market participation; renting out	pos**	
	Rental market participation; renting in	ns	
	Size of land rented out	pos***	
	Size of land rented in	ns	
Field (2003)	Women appear as owners on property documents	pos**	
	household head makes family decisions	neg**	
	Birth rates in past two years	neg**	

Datta (2006)	Active resistance if spouse sells house without your consent	pos**
Peterman (2011)	Employed outside the home	pos**
	Self employed	ns
	Earnings in log shillings	pos**
	Total individual expenditure in log shillings	ns
	Total household expenditures in log shillings	ns
Goyal et al (2010)	Any land inherited	pos***
	Age at marriage for girls married after reform with father alive or died after 1994	pos**
	female educational attainment	neg**
	female educational attainment, aged 0-5 at time of amendment	pos**
Brulé (2012)	Equality of a daughters'land inheritance share	ns
	Equality of inheritance share when fathers pass away in five years after reform	ns
	daughters fair share and accountability to men	neg *
	daughters fair share and accountability to women	pos**
	daughters fair share in reserved villages	pos**
Roy (2012)	Years of education cohort <5 yrs girls	pos*
	Years of education cohort 6-10 girls	pos**
	Years of education cohort 11-15 girls	ns
	Years of education cohort 16-20	ns
	real dowry paid cohort <10 yrs girls	ns
	real dowry paid cohort 11-15 girls	neg*
	real dowry paid cohort 16-20	ns
Andersson and Genicot (2012)	suicide rates women	pos***
	Suicide rates men	pos***
	Gender gap suicides rates	neg***
	suicide rates from fammily conflict women	pos***
	Suicide rates from family conflicts men	pos***
	Wife beating justified	pos***
	Wife beaten	pos***

GENDER BASED VIOLENCE

Jensen and Oster (2008)	Wanting the next child to be a boy (=1)	neg **
	Number of situations in which the woman reports that a husband beating his wife is acceptable (0-6)	neg **

	Autonomy (average measured of six items ranging from 0-1) based on questions relating to participating in decision making, needing permission to go to market or visit friends and if they were allowed to keep aside money to spend as they wish	pos ***	
	Fertility (=1 if currently pregnant)	neg ***	
Mocan and Cannonier (2012)		women	men
	Using modern contraceptives	pos **	pos ***
	Has ever been tested for AIDS	pos ***	pos***
	Desired number of children	neg *	ns
	Wife is justified in refusing sex when tired	ns	ns
	Wife is justified in refusing sex with STD husband	pos **	ns
	Wife beating is justified in refusing sex	neg *	ns
	Practice of FMG should be discontinued	pos*	ns
Bradley (2011)	Gender and sexuality	SS trainees/nonSS villages	
	It's OK for women to suggest condom use	ns	
	Girls with too much education are not good wives	neg *	
	Girls should be married as soon as possible	ns	
	Women should feel free to show husbands if they want sex	ns	
	Women should be blamed for spreading AIDS	neg **	
	Men who cook are not real men	ns	
	Caring and Sharing		
	you do not talk about sex, you just do it	neg *	
	It's a woman's responsibility to avoid pregnancy	ns	
	Man should have the final word about decisions in the home	ns	
	An ideal husband controls his wife	ns	
	Women should give their earnings to the husband	ns	
	Gender based violence		
	Men cannot control their sexual urges	neg **	
	It is OK for a man to force his wife to have sex	neg**	
	There are times when a woman should be beaten	ns	
	Raped women are usually at fault	ns	
	openness to new ideas		
	Have you discussed sex with spouse in last 6 months	ns	
	do you discuss finances with your spouse	ns	
	alcohol and forced sex		
	have you forced any woman to have sex in the last 6 months (men only)	neg *	

Jewkes et al (2008)	HIV incidence	ns	
	HSV-2 incidence	neg **	
	for men and women separately	women	men
	Number of partners in the past year	ns	neg * (12 month)
	Any transactional sex with casual partner	pos **	
		(12 m)	neg** (12 month)
	>1 incident of physical or sexual ipv	ns	neg (* 12 month) (**24 m)
	rape or attempted rape		neg * (12 month)
	pregnancy	ns	ns
	any casual partner	ns	neg * (12 months)
	correct condom use at last sex	ns	ns
	depression	ns	neg * (24 months)
	problem drinking	ns	neg ** (12 months)
	misused drugs	ns	neg * (24 months)
Pronyk et al (2006)	Economic well-being and social capital	RRR	
	Household has greater food security	1.01	
	Number of household members 10-19		
	years attending school	1.01	
	Belief the community would work together		
	towards common goals (3 comp)	1.11	
	HIV Awareness		
	Comfortable discussing sexuality at home	1.35	
	Knowledge that a healthy looking person		
	can be HIV positive	1.11	
	Having had an HIV test	1.18	
	Participation in collective action against		
	AIDS	1.37	
	New sexual debut	1.12	
	More than one sexual partner in past 12		
	months (2)	1.16	
	Unprotected sexual intercourse at last		
	occurrence with a non-spousal partner in		
	past 12 months (2)	0.89	
	HIV seroconversion in individuals who were		
	HIV negative at baseline	1.06	
	% of respondents who answers (at least		
	once) positive on the questions if their		
	partner (i) pushed or shoved you (ii) hit you		
	with first or something else that could hurt		
	(III) physically forced you to have sex when		
	you did not want to or (iv) had sex with		
	him when you did not want to , because		
	you were afraid of what he would do if you		
	refused	0.45	
Kim et al (2007 and 2009)	Economic well-being	Relative	
		Risk	
		Ratio	
	Estimated household assets value>2000		
	rand (=1)	1.15	

Expenditures on shoes and clothing > 200 rand/year (=1)	1.23
Savings-group membership (=1)	1.84
Empowerment	
% of respondents who are very confident they could raise their opinion at a community meeting and/or offer advice to neighbour?	1.15
% of respondents who are very confident to raise enough money to feed their family for 4 weeks and/or who are better able to survive this kind of crisis than two years ago	2.25
% of respondents who disagree with all six statements on traditional gender norms (e.g. A woman should do most of the household chores, even if the husband is not working)	1.57
% of respondents who does not need partners permission for at least 5 out of 10 household decisions (e.g. Making small purchases, taking children to the clinic)	1.64
% of respondents who feel that their partner views the respondents money is the most important contribution to the household budget	1.55
% of respondents who have communicated with their partner, children and or other hh members about sex	1.58
% of respondents who indicated that (i) their IP has encouraged her to participate in something outside the home that was only for her own benefit or (ii) their IP has asked her advice about a difficult issue or decision	1.22
Number of groups (18 possibilities) that respondents participate in	1.85
% of respondents who have participated in a meeting, march or rally about HIV awareness	2.06
Intimate partner violence indicators	
% of respondents who answers (at least once) positive on the questions if their partner (i) pushed or shoved you (ii) hit you with first or something else that could hurt (III) physically forced you to have sex when you did not want to or (iv) had sex with him when you did not want to, because you were afraid of what he would do if you refused	0.45

	% of respondents who answers (at least once) positive on the questions if their partner (i) kept you from seeing your friends (ii) insisted on knowing where you are at all times (iii) wanted you to ask permission before seeking healthcare for yourself (iv) insulted or humiliated you in front of other people	1.49
	% of respondents who disagreed with 8 statements on physical and sexual IPV	0.80
Pulerwitz (2006)	GEM scale items	pos **
	reported STI outcomes	neg **
	condom use with primary partner	pos **
Pulerwitz (2010)	GEM scale items	pos **
	Communication with partner about sex, condom use or STD	pos **
	Self reported partner violence	neg ***
Verma et al (2008)	Gem scale score	pos **
	Communication with partner about sex, condom use or STD	pos **
	Condom use	pos **
	Self reported partner violence	neg ***
Iyengar and Ferrari (2011)	Decision making authority (=1 if respondent decides alone)	Female participants /to baseline
	Who decides how money you earn is spent	pos***
	Who decides on major hh purchases	pos**
	Who decides on daily hh purchases	ns
	Who decides on purchases of alcohol and cigarettes	ns
	Who decides to visit your family or friends	ns
	Who decides to visit your spouse's family or friends	ns
	Who decides how many children to have	pos***
	Who decides on having sex	ns
	Dispute resolution over disagreements	
	disagree with spouse on how money is spent	ns
	disagree with spouse on major hh purchases	ns
	disagree with spouse on daily purchases	ns
	disagree with spouse on purchases of alcohol and cigarettes	ns
	disagree with spouse on visit to your family or friends	ns
	disagree with spouse on visit to spouses family or friends	ns
	disagree on having sex	ns
	Attitudes towards gender norms and violence	

It is acceptable to beat one's wife if she goes out without her husband's permission	ns
It is acceptable to beat one's wife if she neglects the children	ns
It is acceptable to beat one's wife if she argues	ns
It is acceptable to beat one's wife if she refuses sex	pos *
It is acceptable to beat one's wife if she burns food	ns
It is acceptable to beat one's wife if she is annoying	ns
it is acceptable to beat one's wife for any reason	ns
It is never OK to beat one's wife	ns
Violence levels	
Physically hurt	ns
Insulted	ns
Threatened	ns
Screamed	ns
Tothit>5	ns

Bobonis et al
(2009) (2012)

	2009	2012
Indicator for any occurrence of physical, sexual, emotional or economic abuse	NS	NS
Indicator for any occurrence of physical abuse (push, beat etc)	neg **	NS
Indicator for any occurrence of physical abuse or threat of physical abuse	neg **	NS
indicator for any occurrence of sexual abuse	NS	NS
Indicator for any occurrence of pshychological abuse	NS	NS
indicator for any occurrence of physical abuse threat	NS	NS
Indicator for emotional violence (no physical or sexual abuse)	pos ***	NS

Angelucci (2008)	Alcohol abuse (any habitual drinkers in the house)	neg **
	does this person have aggressive behaviour when drinking	mixed

LABOUR MARKET

Berlinsky et al
(2010)

mother works	pos*
mother works full time	pos**
hours worked	pos**

Berlinsky and
Galiani (2007)

mother's employment	ns
mothers hours worked	ns

Jensen (2012)	BPO employment	pos***				
	Works for pay away from home	pos**				
	Do you expect to work for pay away from home					
	before you get married	pos**				
	after marriage but before children	pos**				
	when children are still young	ns				
	after all children have left school and are married	pos**				
	enrollment in training	pos***				
	enrolled in school	pos***				
	BMI for age (5-15)	pos***				
	Height for age	ns				
	married t2	neg **				
	had child t2	neg**				
	desired fertility	neg ***				
Field et al (2010)	Borrowed within four months of the training	pos*				
	Savings during the past month	ns				
	Any personal labor income over the past week	pos**	neg*** for SC and *	muslim		
	Talking to family about business plans	pos*	neg*** for SC and muslim			
Attanasio et al (2011)	Have you had a job during the year after training	ns				
	Have you had earnings from a job during the year after training	pos**				
	How many days per month have you worked?	ns				
	How many hours per day have you worked?	ns				
	Period of employment	neg***				
	monthly salaries	pos***				
	monthly self employed earnings	ns				
	paid employment women	pos*				
	formal employment women	pos**				
	salary women	pos***				
	formal salary women	pos**				
Hallward-Driemeier and Gajigo (2011)		all	younger	older	married	single
	share of women who work in non home-based occupations	pos**	pos**	ns	ns	pos**
	share of women who work in paid occupations	pos**	pos**	ns	ns	pos*
	share of women who work all year round occupations	ns	pos*	ns	ns	pos*
	share of women who work in occupation requiring higher education	ns	pos*	ns	ns	pos**
	age at first marriage	pos				
Blattman et al (2011)	Hours on all economic activities in the past four weeks	pos **				

	hours on market activities	pos***	
	total cash earnings in the past month	pos***	
	index of wealth	ns	
Hallman et al (2007)	Female empowerment		
	visited friends/rel outside the village	ns	
	gone to haat/bazaar	ns	
	attended NGO training	ns	
	If sister outside village, visited her	ns	
	if brother outside village, visited him	ns	
	if daughter outside the village, visited her	ns	
	husband/family member verbally abused her	ns	
	husband/family member beat you	ns	
	knows name of UP chairman	ns	
	knows name of her MP	ns	
	knows name of Prime Minister	ns	
	has ever voted	ns	
	for last vote, chose who to vote for	ns	
	worked for pay in past year	pos*	
	ever decides alone about family expenditures	ns	
	able to save money for own security	pos *	
	husband/family member took money against your will	ns	
	husband/family member took asset against your will	ns	
	welfare indicators		
	per capital household expenditure	ns	
	total annual household expenditure	ns	
	total annual household income	ns	
	total annual household farm income	pos***	
	total annual household off farm income	pos*	
	total annual crop profit	pos***	
	total annual pond profit	pos***	
	Height for age z-score (0-5 yrs)		
	Height for age z-score (boys)	ns	
	Height for age z-score (girls)	ns	
	BMI women	ns	
	BMI men	ns	
Afridi et al (2012)		mothers	fathers
	Children's time in school	pos***	neg***
	children's time in school-poor families	pos***	neg**
	children's time in school-rich families	ns	ns
	girls' time in school	pos*	ns
	boys' time in school	ns	neg**
	children 5-9 years	pos***	neg**
	children 10-14 years	ns	neg**
	grade attainment	ns	ns
	grade attainment in land poor households	pos*	ns
	grade attainment in land rich households	ns	ns

	is mother responsible for making key decisions about plots	pos***		IV for workstatus
	does mother control the use of earnings from plots	pos***		
	is mother responsible for key decisions about work activities	pos***		
	does mother control the use of earnings from wages	pos***		
Nopo et al (2007)		6mth	12 mth	18 mth
	employment rate	neg	neg	pos
	employment rate women	neg	pos	pos
	employment rate men	neg	neg	neg
	hours worked	pos	pos	pos
	hours worked women	pos	pos	pos
	hours worked men	pos	pos	pos
	hourly wages	pos	pos	pos
	hourly wages women	pos	pos	pos
	hourly wages men	pos	pos	pos
	average monthly earnings	pos	pos	pos
	average monthly earnings women	pos	pos	pos
	average monthly earnings men	pos	pos	pos
	Duncan Index of occupational segregation	neg	pos	neg
Card et al (2011)	employment rates	ns		
	hours worked per week	ns		
	total monthly labour income	ns		
	hourly wages	pos*		
	obtaining health insurance in primary job	ns		
	hours worked per week	ns		
Urguieta Solomon et al (2008)		full sample	cap. Building only	cap building and prod activities
	independent agricultural activities (incl. Livestock)	pos**	pos**	ns
	worked as a laborer, artisan	ns	ns	pos**
	worked selling products	ns	ns	ns
	mean daily hours household chores was dedicated to some productive activities	pos**	pos**	pos*
	contributes money and work to the household	ns	ns	ns
	food expenditure	ns	ns	ns
	total expenditure last month of the survey	ns	ns	ns
	knows how to calculate expenditures	ns	ns	ns
	knows how to save	ns	ns	ns
	knows how a saving institution works	ns	ns	ns
	knows how to fill out forms to file for credit	neg*	neg*	ns
	knows how to approach different organisations	ns	ns	ns
	knows how to use a calculator	neg*	ns	ns

	it would be best if women dedicated themselves to hh chores only	ns	neg*	ns
	men are better than women at working outside home	ns	ns	ns
	women and men have the same capacity to perform a paid occupation			
	but women face the obstacle of time shortage	ns	ns	pos**
	women encounter problems due to a lack of training	ns	ns	ns
	but women face the obstacle of having to convince their husband	ns	ns	ns
	how frequently does the woman ask for permission to work	neg**	ns	neg**
	how frequently does the woman ask for permission to visit friends/rel	ns	ns	neg**
	how frequently does the woman ask permission to spend money	ns	ns	ns
		full sample	females	males
Ashraf et al (2010)	Level Household decision making index (mean): what to buy at the market, expensive purchases, giving assistance to family members, family purchases, recreational use of money, personal use of money, number of children, schooling of children and use of family planning	ns	pos**	ns
	level Household decision making index (factor): what to buy at the market, expensive purchases, giving assistance to family members, family purchases, recreational use of money, personal use of money, number of children, schooling of children and use of family planning	pos**	pos***	ns
	Change in Household decision making index (mean): what to buy at the market, expensive purchases, giving assistance to family members, family purchases, recreational use of money, personal use of money, number of children, schooling of children and use of family planning	ns	pos**	ns
	Change in Household decision making index (factor): what to buy at the market, expensive purchases, giving assistance to family members, family purchases, recreational use of money, personal use of money, number of children, schooling of children and use of family planning	pos*	pos***	ns
Eyal and Woolard (2011)	employment probability	pos***		
	labour force participation	pos***		
	number of children of schoolgoing age going to school	pos***		

	number of children below school going age attending day care	pos***
Karlan and Valdivia (2011)	Last month's sales	pos*
	Total number of workers	ns
	Paid workers, non-family members	ns
	Weekly profit from main product	ns
	Tax formality	ns
	Paid fixed salary to self	ns
	keeping records of sales	ns
	keeping records of withdrawals	pos**
	number of sales locations	ns
	allows sales on credit	ns
	keeping records of payments to workers	ns
	business knowledge index	pos**
	started new business	ns
	profit used for business growth	pos**
	proportion of clients who planned innovations	ns
	proportion of clients who executed innovations	pos**
	clients participation in decision making	
	saving for business	ns
	saving for household	ns
	borrowing for business	ns
	borrowing for household	ns
	number of children	ns
	taking money/products from business	ns
	keeping track of household bills	ns
	No need to separate money	ns
	working children	ns
	daily hours dedicated to housework	ns
	daily hours dedicated to child labour	ns
	daily hours dedicated to schooling	ns
	children with perfect attendance	ns
	loan size	ns
	cumulative savings	ns
	perfect repayment	pos**
	permanent or temporary drop out	neg *
	permanent drop out	ns

ASC Working Papers

Vol. 1	Laurens van der Laan 1980	Modern inland transport and the European trading firms in colonial West Africa
Vol. 2	Klaas de Jonge 1980	Relations paysans, pêcheurs, capitalisme, état. Une étude d'une lutte de classe en Casamance (Sud Sénégal) <i>out of print</i>
Vol. 3	Gerti Hesseling 1981	Etat et langue en Afrique. Esquisse d'une étude juridique comparative
Vol. 4	Els van Rouveroy van Nieuwaal-Baerends & Emile van Rouveroy van Nieuwaal 1981	Conciliation et la qualité des relations sociales chez les Anufim du Nord Togo en Afrique de l'Ouest <i>out of print</i>
Vol. 5	Piet Konings 1981	Peasantry and state in Ghana. The example of the Veia Irrigation Project in the Upper Region of Ghana <i>out of print</i>
Vol. 6	C.A. Muntjewerff 1982	The producers' price system and the coffee and cocoa trade at village level in West Africa
Vol. 7	C.A. Muntjewerff 1982	Produce marketing cooperatives in West Africa
Vol. 8	Emile van Rouveroy van Nieuwaal & Els van Rouveroy van Nieuwaal-Baerends 1982	La Parcelle du Gendre comploteur. Manières coutumières et modernes d'acquérir des droits sur la terre, à N'zara (Nord Togo)
Vol. 9	B. Merx 1985	Zonder bloed geen vliegen <i>out of print</i>
Vol. 10	Laurens van der Laan 1987	Cameroon's main marketing board: History and scope of the ONCPB
Vol. 11	Laurens van der Laan 1988	Cocoa and coffee buying in Cameroon: The role of the marketing board in the South-West and North-West Provinces, 1978-1987
Vol. 12	Cyprian F. Fisiy 1990	Palm tree justice in the Bertoua Court of Appeal: The witchcraft cases
Vol. 13	Laurens van der Laan & Wim van Haaren	African marketing boards under structural adjustment: The experience of Sub-Saharan Africa during the 1980s
Vol. 14	Rob Buijtenhuijs 1991	The revolutionary potential of African peasantries: Some tentative remarks

Vol. 15	Deborah F. Bryceson & John Howe 1993	Rural household transport in Africa: Reducing the burden on women?
Vol. 16	Deborah F. Bryceson 1993	Easing rural women's working day in Sub-Saharan Africa
Vol. 17	Rob Buijtenhuijs & Elly Rijnierse 1993	Demokratisering in Afrika ten zuiden van de Sahara (1989-1992). Deel 1: Een becommentarieerd overzicht van de literatuur. Deel 2: Onderzoekscapaciteiten in Afrika en in het Westen. <i>out of print</i>
Vol. 18	Nina Tellegen 1993	Rural employment in Sub-Saharan Africa. A bibliography.
Vol. 19	Deborah F. Bryceson 1993	De-Agrarianization and rural employment generation in Sub-Saharan Africa: Process and prospects.
Vol. 20	Deborah F. Bryceson & Corina van der Laan 1994	De-agrarianization in Africa. Proceedings of the "De-agrarianization and Rural Employment" workshop held at the Afrika-Studiecentrum, Leiden, May 1994
Vol. 21	Deborah F. Bryceson & M. McCall 1994	Lightening the load: Women's labour and appropriate rural techology in Sub-Saharan Africa
Vol. 22	Tjalling Dijkstra 1995	Food trade and urbanization in Sub-Saharan Africa: From the early Stone Age to the structural adjustment era
Vol. 23	Patricia Paravano 1997	Working for the future: Elite women's strategies in Brazzaville
Vol. 24	R.J.A. Berkvens 1997	Backing two horses: Interaction of agricultural and non-agricultural household activities in a Zimbabwean communal area
Vol. 25	M. Demeke 1997	Rural non-farm activities in impoverished agricultural communities: The case of North Shoa, Ethiopia
Vol. 26	C.G. Mung'ong'o 1998	Coming full circle: Agriculture, non-farm activities and the resurgence of out-migration in Njombe District, Tanzania
Vol. 27	Ndalahwa F. Madulu 1998	Changing lifestyles in farming societies of Sukumaland: Kwimba District, Tanzania
Vol. 28	George Jambiya 1998	The dynamics of population, land scarcity, agriculture and non-agricultural activities: West Usambara Mountains, Lushoto District, Tanzania
Vol. 29	Davis Mwamfupe 1998	Changing village land, labour and livelihoods: Rungwe and Kyela Districts, Tanzania
Vol. 30	Dick Foeken & Alice M. Mwangi 1998	Farming in the City of Nairobi

Vol. 31	Wijnand Klaver & Robert K.N. Mwadime 1998	Food consumption and nutrition in the Kenya Coast
Vol. 32	C. Manona 1999	De-agrarianisation and the urbanisation of a rural economy: Agrarian patterns in Melani village in the Eastern Cape
Vol. 33	P. McAllister 1999	Agriculture and co-operative labour in Shixini, Transkei, South Africa
Vol. 34	L. Bank & L. Qambata 1999	No visible means of subsistence: Rural livelihoods, gender and social change in Mooiplaas, Eastern Cape, 1950-1998
Vol. 35	Deborah F. Bryceson 1999	African rural labour, income diversification and livelihood approaches: A long-term development perspective
Vol. 36	Elly Rijnierse 1999	The politics of survival. Towards a global, long-term and reflexive interpretation of the African contemporary experience
Vol. 37	Barth Chukwuezi 1999	De-agrarianisation and rural employment in Igboland, South-eastern Nigeria
Vol. 38	Mohammed-Bello Yunusa 1999	Not farms alone: A study of rural livelihoods in the Middle Belt of Nigeria
Vol. 39	Mohammed A. Iliya 1999	Income diversification in the semi-arid zone of Nigeria: A study of Gigane, Sokoto, North-west Nigeria
Vol. 40	Kate Meagher 1999	If the drumming changes, the dance also changes: De-agrarianisation and rural non-farm employment in the Nigerian Savanna
Vol. 41	Jon Abbink 1999	The total Somali clan genealogy: A preliminary sketch
Vol. 42	Abdul R. Mustapha 1999	Cocoa farming and income diversification in South-western Nigeria
Vol. 43	Deborah F. Bryceson 1999	Sub-Saharan Africa betwixt and between. Rural livelihood practices and policies
Vol. 44	A. van Vuuren 2000	Female-headed households: Their survival strategies in Tanzania
Vol. 45	Dick Foeken & Samuel O. Owuor 2000	Urban farmers in Nakuru, Kenya
Vol. 46	Poul Ove Pedersen 2001	Busy work or real business: Revaluing the role of non-agricultural activities in African rural development
Vol. 47	Tjalling Dijkstra 2001	Export diversification in Uganda: Developments in non-traditional agricultural exports

Vol. 48	Boureima Alpha Gado 2001	Variations climatiques, insécurité alimentaire et stratégies paysannes
Vol. 49	Rijk van Dijk 2002	Localising anxieties: Ghanaian and Malawian immigrants, rising xenophobia, and social capital in Botswana
Vol. 50	Dick Foeken, Samuel O. Owuor & Wijnand Klaver 2002	Crop cultivation in Nakuru town, Kenya: Practice and potential
Vol. 51	Samuel O. Owuor 2003	Rural livelihood sources for urban households A study of Nakuru town, Kenya
Vol. 52	Jan Abbink 2003	A Bibliography on Christianity in Ethiopia
Vol. 53	Henk Meilink 2003	Structural Adjustment Programmes on the African continent. The theoretical foundations of IMF/World Bank reform policies
Vol. 54	Chibuike C. Uche & Ogonnaya C. Uche 2004	Oil and the Politics of Revenue Allocation in Nigeria
Vol. 55	Jan Abbink 2004	Reconstructing Southern Sudan in the post-war era: Challenges and prospects of 'Quick Impact Programmes'
Vol. 56	Samuel M. Kariuki 2004	Creating the black commercial farmers in South Africa
Vol. 57	Marcel M.E.M. Rutten 2004	Partnerships in community-based ecotourism projects: Experiences from the Maasai region, Kenya
Vol. 58	Samuel M. Kariuki 2004	Failing to learn from failed programmes? South Africa's Communal Land Rights Act (CLRA 2004)
Vol. 59	Samuel M. Kariuki 2004	Can negotiated land reforms deliver? A case of Kenya's, South Africa's and Zimbabwe's land reform policy Debates
Vol. 60	Jan-Bart Gewald 2005	Learning to wage and win wars in Africa: A provisional history of German military activity in Congo, Tanzania, China and Namibia
Vol. 61	Jan-Bart Gewald 2005	The impact of motor-vehicles in Africa in the twentieth century: Towards a socio-historical case study
Vol. 62	John Sender, Christopher Cramer & Carlos Oya 2005	Unequal prospects: Disparities in the quantity and quality of labour supply in sub-Saharan Africa
Vol. 63	Jan-Bart Gewald 2005	Colonial warfare: Hehe and World War One, the wars besides Maji Maji in south-western Tanzania
Vol. 64	Abel Ezeoha & Chibuike Uche 2005	South Africa, NEPAD and the African Renaissance

Vol. 65	Dick Foeken 2005	Urban agriculture in East Africa as a tool for poverty reduction: A legal and policy dilemma?
Vol. 66	Marcel Rutten 2005	Shallow wells: A sustainable and inexpensive alternative to boreholes in Kenya
Vol. 67	Judith van de Looy 2006	Africa and China: A strategic partnership?
Vol. 68	Tabona Shoko 2006	"My bones shall rise again": War veterans, spirits and land reform in Zimbabwe
Vol. 69	Lwazi Siyabonga Lushaba 2006	Development as modernity, modernity as development
Vol. 70	John Sender & Carlos Oya 2006	Divorced, separated and widowed female workers in rural Mozambique
Vol. 71	Wale Adebaniwi 2007	Necrophilia and elite politics: The case of Nigeria
Vol. 72	Sabelo J. Ndlovu-Gatsheni 2007	Tracking the historical roots of post-apartheid citizenship problems: The native club, restless natives, panicking settlers and the politics of nativism in South Africa
Vol. 73	Sabelo J. Ndlovu-Gatsheni 2007	Giving Africa voice within global governance: Oral history, human rights and the United Nations (UN) Human Rights Council
Vol. 74	Jan-Bart Gewald 2007	Transport transforming society: Towards a history of transport in Zambia, 1890-1930
Vol. 75	Jan-Bart Gewald 2007	Researching and writing in the twilight of an imagined anthropology in Northern Rhodesia 1930-1960
Vol. 76	Dick Foeken, Samuel O. Owuor & Alice M. Mwangi 2007	School farming and school feeding in Nakuru town, Kenya
Vol. 77	Jan-Bart Gewald 2007	Spanish influenza in Africa: Some comments regarding source material and future research
Vol. 78	Zekeria Ould Ahmed Salem 2008	Le partenariat Union Européenne – Afrique dans l'impasse ? Le cas des accords de pêche
Vol. 79	Jeremiah O. Arowosegbe 2008	Decolonising the social sciences in the global South: Claude Ake and the praxis of knowledge production in Africa
Vol. 80	Abigail Barr, Marleen Dekker & Marcel Fafchamps 2008, updated in 2010	Who shares risk with whom under different enforcement mechanisms?
Vol. 81	Basile Ndjio 2008	Cameroonian <i>feyman</i> and Nigerian '419' scammers: Two examples of Africa's 'reinvention' of the global Capitalism

Vol. 82	Khalil Alio 2008	Conflict, mobility and language: the case of migrant Hadjaraye of Guéra to neighboring regions of Chari-Baguirmi and Salamat (Chad)
Vol. 83	Samuel O. Owuor & Dick Foeken 2009	Water Reforms and Interventions in Urban Kenya: International set-up, emerging impact and challenges
Vol. 84	Jan Abbink 2009	The Total Somali Clan Genealogy (second edition)
Vol. 85	Etanislav Ngodi 2009	Mouvement Nsilulu: Rupture ou continuité historique des messianismes congolais (1998 – 2003)
Vol. 86	Fatimata Diallo 2009	Espace public et technologies numériques en Afrique: Emergence, dynamique et gouvernance du cyberspace sénégalais
Vol. 87	Abigail Barr, Marleen Dekker & Marcel Fafchamps 2009, updated in 2010	Bridging the gender divide: An experimental analysis of group formation in African villages
Vol. 88	Michiel Stapper 2010	Tax regimes in emerging Africa: Can corporate tax rates boost FDI in sub-Saharan Africa?
Vol. 89	David U. Enweremadu 2010	La société civile et la lutte contre la corruption au Nigeria : Le cas des ONG anti-corruption
Vol. 90	Abigail Barr, Marleen Dekker & Marcel Fafchamps 2010	The formation of community based organizations in sub-Saharan Africa : An analysis of a quasi-experiment
Vol. 91	Obiamaka Egbo, Ifeoma Nwakoby, Josaphat Onwumere & Chibuike Uche 2010	Legitimizing corruption in government: Security votes in Nigeria
Vol. 92	Wijnand Klaver 2010	Underweight or stunting as an indicator of the MDG on poverty and hunger
Vol. 93	Marleen Dekker & Bill Kinsey 2011	Coping with Zimbabwe's economic crisis: Small-scale farmers and livelihoods under stress
Vol. 94	Saïbou Issa 2011	La SNV au Cameroun: 1963-2005
Vol. 95	Marja Hinfelaar 2011	A history of SNV from a Zambian perspective 1965-2005
Vol. 96	Kiky van Oostrum e.a. 2011	New mobilities and insecurities in Fulbe nomadic societies: a multi-country study in west-central Africa (Niger-Nigeria)

Vol. 97	Kiky van Oostrum e.a. 2011	Mobilités nouvelles et insécurités dans les sociétés nomades Fulbé (peules) : études de plusieurs pays en Afrique centrale de l'Ouest (Niger-Nigeria)
Vol. 98	Gary Baines 2012	A virtual community ? SADF veterans' digital memories and dissenting discourses
Vol. 99	Inge Brinkman & Mirjam de Bruijn, with Hisham Bilal & Peter Taban Wani 2012	The Nile Connection. Effects and meaning of the mobile phone in a (post-)war economy in Karima, Khartoum and Juba, Sudan
Vol. 100	Solani Ngoben 2012	Scholarly publishing: The challenges facing the African university press
Vol. 101	Daan Beekers & Bas van Gool 2012	From patronage to neopatrimonialism. Postcolonial governance in Sub-Saharan Africa and beyond
Vol. 102	Adalbertus Kamanzi 2012	Can we construct differently from an experience of the degrading environment as function of the discourse of modernity? The answer is yes!
Vol. 103	Adalbertus Kamanzi 2012	Enriching ethnographic studies with anchoring vignette methodology
Vol. 104	Adalbertus Kamanzi 2012	"They needed an ethnographer: That is why they missed it!" Exploring the value of bananas among the Haya people of Bukoba, Northwestern Tanzania
Vol. 105	Paul Rabé & Adalbertus Kamanzi 2012	Power analysis: A study of participation at the local level in Tanzania
Vol. 106	Raphael O. Babatunde 2012	Assessing the effect of off-farm income diversification on agricultural production in rural Nigeria
Vol. 107	Samuel O. Owuor & Dick Foeken 2012	Water interventions for the urban poor: The case of Homa Bay, Kenya
Vol. 108	Gesesse Dessie 2013	Is khat a social ill? Ethical argument about a stimulant among the learned Ethiopians
Vol. 109	Sofiane Bouhdiba 2013	Will Sub-Saharan Africa follow North Africa? Backgrounds and preconditions of popular revolt in the Light of the 'Arab spring'
Vol. 110	Zelalem Debebe et al 2013	Coping with shocks in rural Ethiopia
Vol. 111	Marleen Dekker 2013	Promoting gender equality and female empowerment: a systematic review of the evidence on property rights, labour markets, political participation and violence against women

The Working Papers are also online available on our website
www.ascleiden.nl > Publications > ASC Series > ASC Working papers or:
<http://www.ascleiden.nl/?q=content/asc-working-papers>

Working Papers are free of charge if they are for personal use. For bookshops we have to charge € 5 per printed Working Paper, shipping costs not included. They can be ordered from:

Ms Marieke van Winden, Communications Officer
Telephone: +31 (0)71 5273358
E-mail: winden@ascleiden.nl