



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Review of Hart G.: 'Disabling globalization: places of power in post-apartheid South Africa'

Kessel, W.M.J. van

Citation

Kessel, W. M. J. van. (2004). Review of Hart G.: 'Disabling globalization: places of power in post-apartheid South Africa'. *Africa: Journal Of The International African Institute*, 74(3), 475-477. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4751>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Leiden University Non-exclusive license](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4751>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

ons for the extraordinary
Church very cursorily,
tion that international

ionship as constituting a
British attitudes towards
er and the untouchable.
us book will spark off a
speaking. The lion and
uld remember that both
entirely shot out by the
p as almost endangered
moved in during recent
rely too heavily on the

JOHN M. MACKENZIE
University of Aberdeen

Sculinity in colonial Natal,
£29.95, ISBN 1 86888

b Morrell's book are the
known as the Old Natal
oint for this study, most
their farms for no more
cohesion or community
e processes by which this
'ted community' (p. 41).
eyond, the body of work
ionist historians during
that their enquiries were
arch on whites seemed
rked by escalating state
id' (p. 3) Morrell asserts
ultural reproduction and
nd sees his book as an
hich has been somewhat

ests is that surrounding
Morrell views the bulk of
or 'gender blind' (pp. 8,
like Cherryl Walker and
although the history of
ict men are 'as neglected
l's eyes, is that the social
d in favour of essentialist
study is what constitutes

linity of the ONFs is
type of institution. After
eals with the concept of

the Old Natal Family, Morrell goes on to discuss schooling in colonial Natal. He shows the ways in which schools operated as networks for the settler gentry and the role they played in masculinising Natal's power structures (p. 49), as well as how social values were created within the schools, and indeed sometimes subverted or challenged by the boys. The chapter on sport focuses mainly on rugby, showing how it came to overshadow soccer as the predominant winter sport amongst white males in the colony, how the attributes of toughness and athleticism were integral to masculinity, and how rugby fostered both old boy networks and links between the colony and metropole. In his chapter on clubs, societies and professional associations he explores how these institutions were used by ONFs both as mechanisms of exclusion, and as mechanisms of class expansion and reproduction by 'providing limited entry points to immigrants' (p. 107). Furthermore, the rituals and moral codes maintained by these organisations were important signifiers of how the settler gentry wanted to be seen by 'outsiders'. Subsequent chapters deal with the military, which Morrell views as 'the generation point of specific values by which the ONFs identified themselves and disseminated their world view, as well as an institution which provided status and was considered to be a mandatory aspect of class membership' (p. 140); and agricultural associations and farmers' organisations which 'became a focus of local identity, carrying the hopes and aspirations of members' (p. 176). The final chapters revisit the family as an institution in which settler masculinities developed, and consider the means by which the ONFs excluded those who didn't fit in.

Morrell advances sound reasons for not dealing with the colonial state (which was relatively weak in Natal) and the labour market (given the individualistic, independent and isolated nature of agricultural production in this area) (p. 15). However, although the Midlands were dominated by British settlement (p. 26), it would have been interesting to get a sense of how the small pockets of Afrikaans and German speakers living in the area interacted with the hegemonic 'settler masculinity'. Nonetheless, *From Boys to Gentlemen* is a welcome addition to the literature on settlers in South Africa, and to the historiography of colonial Natal.

JO DUFFY
Department of Historical Studies
University of Bristol

GILLIAN HART, *Disabling Globalization: places of power in post-apartheid South Africa*. Berkeley: University of California Press (paperback US\$21.95, £13.95, ISBN 0 520 23756 0; hard covers US\$54.95, ISBN 0 520 23755 2). 2002, 385 pp.

This could have been a fascinating book. Gillian Hart presents detailed and well-researched case studies of processes of racialised land dispossession, accumulation, industrialisation and the resultant political dynamics in two formerly white towns in Northern Natal. On the surface, Ladysmith and Newcastle and their adjacent African townships have much in common. Yet Hart's meticulous research reveals divergent trajectories of dispossession, urbanisation and industrialisation. Local white politicians and bureaucrats have forged different linkages with national and provincial politics and networks of patronage, and different strategies of linking up with the global economy. Divergent experiences have resulted in different patterns of resistance politics: militant nationalism in the case of Newcastle, while workerist tendencies have

Africa, vol 74, 2004
no 5

dominated in Ladysmith, where trade unions maintained a formal distance from activist youth and township politics while developing a good working relationship in practice. In the end, the trade-union movement in Ladysmith has proved more effective, while the township communities were more cohesive both in their resistance to oppression in the 1980s and in the transformation process of the 1990s.

It is fascinating to follow the Great Trek of Newcastle bureaucrats to Taiwan, bypassing central government and overtaking their competitors from Ladysmith in the hunt for investors. As a result of the rapid growth of mostly small Taiwanese textile plants, the Taiwanese population of Newcastle had increased to about 1,500 by the mid-1990s. Some were actively involved in local politics. The Taiwanese were lured by the promise of inexpensive luxury housing, good standards of health care and education and an abundance of cheap, docile labour. When interviewed by the author in the mid-1990s, the Taiwanese industrialists complained bitterly about militant trade unions, lazy workers and incompetent local government officials. They displayed a sense of betrayal: Newcastle officials proved unable to deliver the cheap, docile labour force that they had marketed during their promotion tours of Taiwan. Ladysmith also attracted some Taiwanese industries but in the 1990s began focusing on mainland China. During the 1990s, South Africa embarked on a process of transformation towards a non-racial democracy, but the hunt for Asian investment continued unabated. Asian investment accounted for two-thirds of the foreign investment projects approved in KwaZulu-Natal between 1991 and 1994. Nearly 80 per cent of the projects were Taiwanese, although several projects from mainland China were in the pipeline.

The most interesting and innovative part of the book follows the Taiwanese industrialists in their frustrations in Northern Natal and in their home base. Hart argues that industrial relations in Taiwan, based on kinship notions, could not be carried over to South Africa. She describes the East Asian case as a process of accumulation without dispossession. Rapid industrialisation occurred without dispossession of peasant workers from the land. Family farms subsidised the industrial workforce. In mainland China, rural industrialisation in the post-reform era continued to benefit from state-subsidised housing and state-sponsored social security. Prior socialist redistribution played a critical role in providing a form of social wage. The South African labour force, by contrast, had been expropriated from the land and made fully dependent on wage labour.

Unfortunately, this intriguing argument is enveloped in a dense fog of convoluted jargon. Sentences running to over sixty words are not exceptional. Energy, wasted here on admonishing what the author is *not* saying and what the reader should *not* infer, would have been better spent on developing clarity of style and argument. The long introductory chapter is particularly tortuous. But even in the case studies, the reader constantly has to wade through a morass of multiple social and spatial arenas of practice, layers of meaning, interlocking trajectories and complex concatenations of power-laden practices.

The stated ambition of the author is 'to contribute to a strategy of broadly based mobilization against neoliberal policies'. After having demonstrated the disabling nature of present processes of globalisation, Hart promises 'Enabling Alternatives' in the concluding chapter, such as: 'The challenge then is how to forge connections and alliances across arenas of social practice and spatial scales—a challenge that compels attention to multi-layered and interconnected articulations and trajectories that have gone into the making of what has come to be termed "globalization"' (p. 29). She argues that globalisation does not just happen as an inevitable natural phenomenon. It is made to happen, for example

by the municipal bureaucrats are flocking to East Asia discourse on globalisation process and is, therefore, far from presenting her re globalization', she paralyses

ANTHONY SIMPSON, *'Half mission school'*. Edinburgh Africa Institute (paperback)

This is a thoughtful ethnographic study of an elite, post-colonial boarding school in the face of crises of confidence, school system to a British public school to adulthood.

Simpson taught at this school before a period of more expatriate religious orders: the Brothers who ran the school of their role as simple catechists details how their residence community marked Brothers the connections to family, that shaped students and teachers.

Whatever Christian humanism the school was full of and admitted through competition argues, accepted ideas of staff ran strict classrooms Prefects and leading students perks, such as private bedrooms space. New students were animals until they had the school.

The dissonance between the school and the Zambian student argues, that instead of being with panoptic awareness the school was relatively open 'civilisation' proved to students who saw it as the school was coordinating articulate, organised prefects.

Simpson's study attacks white colonisers forcibly. Instead, missionaries were the school so eager to be ambitious, discipline and

maintained a formal distance in developing a good working union movement in Ladysmith communities were more cohesive in the 1980s and in the transformation

of Newcastle bureaucrats to making their competitors from the rapid growth of mostly population of Newcastle had some were actively involved in promise of inexpensive luxury education and an abundance of author in the mid-1990s, the out militant trade unions, lazy officials. They displayed a sense to deliver the cheap, docile or promotion tours of Taiwan. tries but in the 1990s began, South Africa embarked on a democracy, but the hunt for investment accounted for two-thirds in KwaZulu-Natal between acts were Taiwanese, although a pipeline.

The book follows the Taiwanese in Natal and in their home base. It, based on kinship notions, describes the East Asian case of mission. Rapid industrialisation came from the land. Family farms in China, rural industrialisation, state-subsidised housing and distribution played a critical role with African labour force, by and made fully dependent on

enveloped in a dense fog of typewords are not exceptional for is not saying and what the pent on developing clarity of is particularly tortuous. But as to wade through a morass of meaning, interlocking -laden practices.

But to a strategy of broadly after having demonstrated the ion, Hart promises 'Enabling'. The challenge then is how of social practice and spatial -layered and interconnected the making of what has come to it globalisation does not just made to happen, for example

by the municipal bureaucrats and politicians in Ladysmith and Newcastle who are flocking to East Asia to entice industrialists to Northern Natal. The discourse on globalisation ('There Is No Alternative') is itself shaping the process and is, therefore, as disabling as the process itself. Unfortunately, far from presenting her readers with a 'politically enabling conception of globalization', she paralyses them with disempowering jargon.

INEKE VAN KESSEL
African Studies Centre
Leiden

ANTHONY SIMPSON, *'Half London' in Zambia: contested identities in a Catholic mission school*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, for the International Africa Institute (paperback £16.95, ISBN 0 7486 1804 X). 2003, 224 pp.

This is a thoughtful ethnography about the relationships and rituals within an elite, post-colonial boarding school where Catholic expatriates suffered crises of confidence, school administration was reordered from a Catholic system to a British public school model, and young men found their own ways to adulthood.

Simpson taught at this pseudonymous school during the 1970s and 1980s, before a period of more formal research in the 1990s. He portrays the expatriate religious order sympathetically, discussing the theology that guided the Brothers who ran the school. Beyond Brothers' subjective assessments of their role as simple community members serving students, though, he details how their residence, patterns of socialisation, and sense of international community marked Brothers apart from any Zambian context. Brothers lacked the connections to family, local community, and the region beyond the school, that shaped students and staff.

Whatever Christian humility and simplicity the Brothers sought to model, the school was full of ambitious Zambians (of mixed religious backgrounds) admitted through competitive exams. Zambian students and staff, Simpson argues, accepted ideas of hierarchy at every level of school relations. Zambian staff ran strict classrooms and tolerated no questioning of teachers' authority. Prefects and leading students held administrative responsibilities, and enjoyed perks, such as private bedrooms and the opportunity to decorate their own space. New students went through rituals that mocked the uninitiated as animals until they had their 'tails cut'.

The dissonance between the Brothers' ideology of community and service and the Zambian students' pursuit of individual achievement meant, Simpson argues, that instead of being a hegemonic structure of discipline and civilisation, with panoptic awareness and control of students' bodies and minds, the mission school was relatively open. The most emphatic promoters of discipline and 'civilisation' proved to be not the expatriates, but the Zambian staff and students who saw it as a marker of their distinction. Thus the discipline of the school was coordinated not by a Marian theology of compassion, but by articulate, organised prefects, many of whom were Seventh Day Adventists.

Simpson's study attacks the stereotype of mission schools as places where white colonisers forcibly and intentionally re-made African bodies and minds. Instead, missionaries were constrained by Zambians. And students arrived at the school so eager to be re-made that they internalised ideas of individuality, ambition, discipline and civilisation, protested classroom crucifixes, and