



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The legal conception of "religion"

Petty, A.R.

Citation

Petty, A. R. (2016, June 2). *The legal conception of "religion"*. s.n., S.l. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/39933>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/39933>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/39933> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Petty, A.R.

Title: The legal conception of "religion"

Issue Date: 2016-06-02

The Legal Conception of “Religion”

Aaron R. Petty

The Legal Conception of “Religion”

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 2 juni 2016
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Aaron Raymond Petty

Geboren te Detroit, Michigan, U.S.A.

in 1982

Promotor: Prof. dr. P.B. Cliteur

Promotiecommissie: Prof. dr. A. Ellian
Prof. dr. A.N. Guiora (University of Utah, U.S.A.)
Dr. H.M.Th.D. ten Napel
Dr. G. Molier

Table of Contents

Introduction	8
Chapter 1. “Faith, However Defined”: Reassessing <i>JFS</i> and the Judicial Conception of “Religion”	14
I. Introduction	14
II. <i>JFS</i>	17
A. The Dispute	17
B. Before Mr. Justice Munby in the High Court	18
C. Before the Court of Appeal	20
D. Before the Supreme Court	21
1. Lord Phillips of Worth Matravers	22
2. Lady Hale of Richmond	22
3. Lord Mance	23
4. Lord Kerr of Tonaghmore	24
5. Lord Clarke of Stone-cum-Ebony	24
6. Lord Hope of Craighead	25
7. Lord Walker of Gestingthorpe	27
8. Lord Rodger of Earlsferry	27
9. Lord Brown of Eaton-under-Heywood	28
E. The Reaction	29
III. The Legal Concept of “Religion”	30
A. The Religious Subtext of <i>JFS</i>	31
B. The Development of the Idea of “Religion”	32
C. The Christian Construction of Judaism	39
D. Judaism	41
IV. A Christian Understanding	43
A. Explicit Comparisons	44

B. Tacit Assumptions	45
V. Conclusion	47
Chapter 2. The Concept of “Religion” in the Supreme Court of Israel	48
I. Introduction	48
II. The Emergence of the State of Israel	51
A. The Zionist Movement	51
B. Early Legal Foundations	55
1. The Balfour Declaration	55
2. The League of Nations Mandate	55
3. The Macdonald White Paper	56
4. The Proclamation of the State of Israel	57
III. The Israeli Legal System	58
A. The Constitutional Structure	58
B. The Role of the Courts	59
C. The Legal Status of Religion	59
D. The Law of Return	61
IV. Who Is a Jew?	64
A. Cases and Legislation	66
1. Rufeisen (Brother Daniel)	67
a. Becoming Brother Daniel	67
b. Before the Supreme Court	70
2. Shalit	76
3. Amendment No. 2	84
4. Beresford	86
B. The Court’s Conclusions	89
V. A Christian Conception	91
A. A “Rather Odd Modern Concept”	91
B. Christianity is a Religion. Judaism “Refuses to be One”	94
C. A Supreme Irony?	96
1. Forging an Identity	96
2. The Relationship Between Nation-State and Religion	97

3. Zionism as Normalization	99
VI. Reconceptualizing Secularization	99
A. The Secularization Debate	100
B. Disassociation as Secularization	103
VI. Conclusion	104
Chapter 3. Accommodating “Religion”	106
I. Introduction	106
II. The Concept of Religion: Beyond Belief	110
A. Belief as an Internally Problematic Criterion	113
B. Belief as an Externally Biased Category	115
III. The Definitions of Religion	118
A. Essentialist Definitions	120
B. Multifactor Approaches	123
1. Polythetic Classification/Numerical Phenetics	125
2. Family Resemblance	127
3. Prototype Theory	128
4. Other Definitional Strategies	129
a. Self-Definition	129
b. No Definition	131
IV. Fairly Applying a Biased Concept	133
A. Legal Background	135
B. Academic Approaches	140
1. Jesse Choper’s “Extratemporal Consequences”	140
2. Kent Greenawalt’s Prototype Approach	141
V. Avoidance Strategies	143
A. Dual Definitions	143
B. Free Exercise as Free Speech	145
VI. Conclusion	149
Chapter 4: Religion, Conscience, and Belief in the European Court of Human Rights	151

I.	Introduction	151
II.	Europe, the Westphalian State, and the Origin of Human Rights	155
	A. Religion in Europe	155
	B. The State	157
	C. Liberalism	159
	D. The Rise of International Law and Human Rights	160
III.	The Treaty Framework	161
	A. The Council of Europe	161
	B. The Origin of Article 9	162
	C. The European Court and Commission of Human Rights	164
IV.	The Inherent Bias of Article 9	170
	A. Difficulties Internal to the Convention	170
	1. The Process of Adoption	170
	2. The Convention Text	171
	3. The Challenge of “Conscience”	173
	B. Problems of Application and Doctrine	176
	1. Judicial Focus on the <i>Forum Internum</i>	176
	2. The Difficulties with Doctrine: Margin of Appreciation, Subsidiarity and Consensus	179
	3. Defining Religion (or Not)	184
	a. The Problem of Definition	184
	b. Avoiding the Issue	189
V.	European Political Theology: Religious Liberty as a Westphalian Paradox	190
VI.	Conclusion	195
	Conclusion	198
	Bibliography	201
	Summary	219
	Samenvatting	220
	Curriculum Vitae	222