



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Labour law and development in Indonesia

Tjandra, S.

Citation

Tjandra, S. (2016, February 4). *Labour law and development in Indonesia*. Meijers-reeks.
Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/37576>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/37576>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/37576> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Tjandra, Surya

Title: Labour law and development in Indonesia

Issue Date: 2016-02-04

Labour Law and Development in Indonesia

Labour Law and Development in Indonesia

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 4 februari 2016
klokke 10.00 uur

door

Surya Tjandra

geboren te Jakarta (Indonesië)

in 1971

Promotor: Prof.dr. G.J.J. Heerma van Voss

Copromotor: Dr. A.W. Bedner

Promotiecommissie: Prof.dr. P.F. van der Heijden

Prof.dr. J.M. Otto

Dr. M.H. Shubhan (Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya,
Indonesia)

Prof.dr. O. Törnquist (University of Oslo, Norway)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Waddinxveen

Printwerk: Wöhrmann Printservise

ISBN 978-94-6203-981-0

© 2016 S. Tjandra

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Het reprorecht wordt niet uitgeoefend.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, made available or communicated to the public, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, unless this is expressly permitted by law.

Acknowledgments

Several institutions and individuals supported me during my doctoral study. I am grateful to all of them. I wish to thank the Netherlands Education Centre, which provided me the financial support for the first stage of my doctoral study through the Huygens Scholarship Program. I am grateful to the Faculty of Law of Leiden University, and in particular to the Van Vollenhoven Institute, which provided me with a great environment for my research. I thank the teaching and research staff: Guus Heerma van Voss, Adriaan Bedner and Jan Michiel Otto, who accompanied me from the start of my study journey. I also thank the VVI supporting staff: now, Kari van Weeren, Kora Bentvelsen, Dennis Janssen, and then, Jan van Olden and Marianne Moria; the libraries of the Law Faculty and the KITLV, especially the late Albert Dekker who was always willing to help. I also acknowledge the support and friendship of fellow PhD-students and other colleagues in the Institute. In particular I would like to mention my fellow Indonesian students: Antonius Cahyadi, Henky Widjaja, Herlambang Wiratraman, Rikardo Simarmata, Santy Kouwagam, Hari Nugroho, and many others, for their friendship during my stay in Leiden.

During my studies I have had the opportunities to meet great people that introduced me to the wider world. I would like to mention a few of them: Sulisyowati Irianto of the University of Indonesia, Michele Ford of the University of Sydney, Australia, Teri Caraway of the University of Minnesota, USA, Kosuke Mizuno of the University of Kyoto, Japan, Olle Törnquist of the University of Oslo, Norway; Gerd Botterweck and Erwin Schweissheim of the Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, and their staff at the Jakarta office, especially Rina Julvianti and Mian Manurung; Nina Berg and Susanne Ludwig of the DGB Bildungswerk; as well as Ruth Vermeulen and Tjalling Postma of the FNV Mondiaal.

Colleagues at the Trade Union Rights Centre and the Faculty of Law, Atma Jaya Catholic University, Jakarta, have always encouraged me throughout my studies. Special thanks go to Rita Olivia, Jafar Suryomenggolo, Lucky Rooshinta, Andriko Otang and Tuti Nurhayati, as well as to Samuel Hutabarat, Tisa Windayani (during my first years at the Centre and the Faculty), and to Bernadeth Setiadi, my friend and mentor at the University.

Various people in Jakarta and in other regions in Indonesia assisted me in the collection of data for this study. I am grateful to all of them. In particular I thank my interviewees who shared their views on the issues covered in this study, especially those from the trade unions, employers' organization, government officials, ad hoc judges, fellow academics.

I thank my late parents – my mother Wiriana Tjandra and my father Satya Wirawan for their love and encouragement throughout my educational career. I am also grateful to my wife Wina Suntiowangi for her love and patience throughout my studies.

Finally, I wish to thank Bec Donaldson who edited the final manuscript.

Jakarta, 10 October 2015

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| ACKNOWLEDGMENTS | V |
| GLOSSARY | X |
| INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1 Labour law and development: 'competing conceptions' | 3 |
| 2 The political economy of law and the approach of this study | 6 |
| 3 Focus and framework of the study | 9 |
| 4 Theoretical and comparative considerations | 10 |
| 4.1 The character of labour law in East Asia | 10 |
| 4.2 The impact of labour law in East Asia | 14 |
| 5 Labour law reform and its limits | 20 |
| 1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND: EVOLUTION OF INDONESIA'S LABOUR LAW | 27 |
| 1 The colonial era – the law of the lords | 28 |
| 2 Labour disputes, emergence of unions, and their laws | 33 |
| 3 The early independence – protective legislation (1945-1949) | 40 |
| 4 Parliamentary democracy and 'guided democracy' – the beginning of a conflict (1949-1965) | 43 |
| 5 Summary | 48 |
| 2 THE NEW ORDER ERA: 'RULE BY (LABOUR) LAW' (1965 – 1998) | 51 |
| 1 The political economy of labour and development: 1965 – 1998 | 51 |
| 1.1 Industrialisation and the authoritarian state | 52 |
| 1.2 Economic agenda of the early New Order | 54 |
| 1.3 Collapse of oil-prices and export-oriented industrialisation | 56 |
| 1.4 Structural adjustments and 'Soeharto Inc.' | 59 |
| 2 Labour law and industrial relations in practice | 62 |
| 2.1 State corporatism and Pancasila Industrial Relations | 62 |
| 2.2 Labour law in practice | 65 |
| 3 Concluding remarks | 70 |

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 3 | THE REFORMASI: NEO-LIBERALISM, DEMOCRACY, AND LABOUR LAW REFORM (1998 – 2006) | 73 |
| 1 | Democratization and neo-liberal economic reform | 74 |
| 2 | Labour law changes | 80 |
| 2.1 | The Trade Union Law No. 21/2000 | 82 |
| 2.2 | The Manpower Law No. 13/2003 | 86 |
| 2.3 | The Industrial Relations Dispute Settlement Law No. 2/2004 | 91 |
| 3 | The aftermath and further efforts towards change | 93 |
| 4 | Concluding remarks | 98 |
| 4 | TRADE UNIONS AND THE LAW IN INDONESIA | 99 |
| 1 | Introduction | 99 |
| 2 | The regulation of trade unions | 101 |
| 2.1 | Trade unions and their regulation before 1998 | 101 |
| 2.2 | Trade unions and their regulation after 1998 | 111 |
| 2.3 | Challenging the SPSI dominance | 117 |
| 2.4 | Post-1998 trade unions in Indonesia: key features | 124 |
| 3 | The two levels of the trade union movement in Indonesia | 128 |
| 3.1 | Regional level: towards political trade unionism? | 129 |
| 3.2 | National level: the battle of paradigms? | 137 |
| 4 | Conclusion | 155 |
| 5 | THE LAW AND POLITICS OF MINIMUM WAGE SETTING | 159 |
| 1 | Introduction | 159 |
| 2 | The evolution of minimum wage policies | 162 |
| 3 | Minimum wage setting | 172 |
| 3.1 | Wage councils | 172 |
| 3.2 | Regional minimum wage setting | 175 |
| 4 | Wage councils and the workers' struggle for better wages | 178 |
| 4.1 | Union involvement: influencing from within and without | 180 |
| 4.2 | Union strategies: targeting the KHL, pressuring the government | 182 |
| 5 | The case of Sukabumi and the KBS | 184 |
| 5.1 | The background of the case study | 184 |
| 5.2 | The struggle | 185 |
| 6 | The case of Jakarta and the national government response | 191 |
| 7 | Discussion | 196 |
| 8 | Conclusion | 201 |

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 6 | THE INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS DISPUTES COURT, QUO VADIS? | 205 |
| 1 | The Industrial Relations Court (PHI) | 206 |
| 1.1 | Birth of the Industrial Relations Court | 207 |
| 1.2 | The industrial relations dispute process | 209 |
| 1.3 | Key aspects of administration of the dispute process | 214 |
| 1.4 | Effects of the PHI on unions | 221 |
| 2 | The Industrial Relations Court (PHI) in practice | 224 |
| 2.1 | Cases bestowed from the P4P/D | 226 |
| 2.2 | Which procedural laws? | 228 |
| 2.3 | Law No. 2/2004 versus HIR/RBg? | 230 |
| 2.4 | 'The case is free, but costly' | 231 |
| 2.5 | Time for case proceedings | 235 |
| 3 | Consequences of the PHI for labour | 238 |
| 3.1 | Conceptual inadequacy and enforcement issues | 238 |
| 3.2 | 'Pure' civil procedural law? | 240 |
| 3.3 | Problems of judicial corruption | 242 |
| 3.4 | Solutions outside the PHI | 244 |
| 3.5 | All parties disappointed | 249 |
| 4 | Reformers from within? | 250 |
| 5 | Conclusion | 256 |
| | CONCLUSION: IN SEARCH OF THE RIGHT BALANCE | 259 |
| 1 | The new institutional landscape: changes and continuities | 259 |
| 1.1 | Trade union legislation | 261 |
| 1.2 | Minimum wage setting | 263 |
| 1.3 | Industrial Relations Court | 264 |
| 2 | The re-emergence of the labour movement: opportunities and challenges | 265 |
| 3 | Theoretical considerations: the effectiveness of the labour law | 269 |
| 3.1 | Effective labour law enforcement | 271 |
| 3.2 | How can labour law enforcement be made more effective? | 274 |
| 4 | Suggestions for further research | 279 |
| 5 | Final remarks | 281 |
| | SUMMARY | 285 |
| | SUMMARY (IN DUTCH) | 289 |
| | REFERENCES | 293 |
| | CURRICULUM VITAE | 313 |

Glossary

| | |
|--|--|
| Asosiasi Pengusaha Indonesia (Apindo) | Association of Indonesian Employers |
| Badan Pelaksana Jaminan Sosial (BPJS) | Social Security Executing Agency |
| Bupati | Regent / District Head |
| <i>Burgerlijk Wetboek</i> | The Netherlands Indies' Civil Code |
| Buruh | Labour / Worker |
| Dewan | Council |
| Dewan Pimpinan Cabang | Branch Leadership Council |
| Dewan Pimpinan Daerah | Regional Leadership Council |
| Dewan Pimpinan Pusat | National Central Leadership Council |
| Dewan Pengupahan | Wage Council |
| Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI) | Indonesian Metal Workers Federation |
| Global Union Federation | International Federation of Sector Unions |
| Hakim ad hoc | Ad hoc Judges (at the Industrial Relations Court) |
| <i>Herziene Indonesisch Reglement</i> (HIR) | Revised Indonesia Regulations (civil litigation procedure in Java) |
| Hukum perburuhan | Labour law |
| Kabupaten | Regency / District |
| Kebutuhan Fisik Minimum | Minimum physical need |
| Kebutuhan Hidup Layak | Decent living need |
| Kebutuhan Hidup Minimum | Minimum subsistence need |
| Keputusan | Decree |
| Ketenagakerjaan | Manpower |
| Kesehatan | Health |
| <i>Koeli Ordonnantie</i> | Coolie Ordinance |
| Komite Aksi Jaminan Sosial (KAJS) | Action Committee for Social Security Reform |
| Kuli kontrak | contract coolie |
| Lembaga Bantuan Hukum | Legal Aid Institute |
| Lembaga Kerja Sama Tripartit | Tripartite Cooperation Institution |

| | |
|---|---|
| Menteri Tenaga Kerja | Minister of Manpower |
| Orde Baru | the New Order |
| Pancasila | The Five Principles (Indonesia's national ideology) |
| Panitia Penyelesaian Perselisihan Perburuhan Daerah/Pusat (P4D/P) Pekerja | Regional/Central Labour Dispute Settlement Committee Workers |
| Pengadilan Hubungan Industrial (PHI) | Industrial Relations Court |
| Peraturan | Regulation |
| Perjanjian Kerja Bersama | Collective Labour Agreement |
| <i>Poenale sanctie</i> | Penal sanction |
| Reformasi | Reform era, starting in 1998 |
| <i>Rechtsreglement Buitengewesten</i> (RBg) | Regulation for the Outer Territories (civil litigation procedure in the outer islands of Indonesia) |
| Rupiah (Rp) | Rupee (Indonesia's currency) |
| Serikat Pekerja/Serikat Buruh | Workers Unions/Labour Unions |
| <i>Staatsblad</i> | State gazette |
| Tim Kecil | Small Team |
| Undang-Undang | Act of parliament |
| Upah minimum | Minimum wages |

*This crisis consists precisely in the fact that the old is dying and the new cannot be born;
in this interregnum a great variety of morbid symptoms appear.*

(Antonio Gramsci, 1971: 276)

*In this vision, the framework of decollectivized, deregulated, and deinstitutionalized
neo-liberal labour law is here to stay because it matches the basic needs of a globalized
capitalist market economy and of liberal democracy. Yet at the very moment of its apparent
triumph, individualized market labour law faces political, industrial and judicial challenges.*

(Bob Hepple, 1996: 626)

*Labour law evolved in response to ... worker resistance to injuries and injustices visited
upon them by industrial capitalism ... [with a] vocation 'to address and seek to relieve a
fundamental social and economic problem in modern society: the subordination of labour
to capital, or of employee to employer'.*

(Karl Klare, 2002: 3, referring to Hugh Collins, 1989)