



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Regional aviation safety organisations: enhancing air transport safety through regional cooperation

Ratajczyk, M.A.

Citation

Ratajczyk, M. A. (2014, November 20). *Regional aviation safety organisations: enhancing air transport safety through regional cooperation*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/29759>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/29759>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/29759> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Ratajczyk, Mikołaj

Title: Regional aviation safety organisations : enhancing air transport safety through regional cooperation

Issue Date: 2014-11-20

LEIDEN UNIVERSITY, INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE OF
AIR AND SPACE LAW

Regional Aviation Safety Organisations

*Enhancing Air Transport Safety Through
Regional Cooperation*

Mikołaj Ratajczyk

2014

Regional Aviation Safety Organisations: Enhancing Air Transport Safety Through Regional Cooperation

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 20 november 2014
klokke 13.45 uur

door

Mikołaj Andrzej RATAJCZYK

geboren te Warsaw, Poland
in 1978

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor: prof. dr. P.M.J. Mendes de Leon

Overige leden: prof. dr. N.M. Blokker
prof. mr. dr. ir. S.C. Santema (Technische Universiteit Delft)
dr. J. Huang (International Civil Aviation Organization,
Montreal, Canada)
dr. N. van Antwerpen (AerCap House, Schiphol,
the Netherlands)

This study is dedicated, with love, to Sarah and Martha

Acknowledgments

This work is the result of five years of research on legal aspects of regional cooperation in civil aviation safety. While writing a doctorate thesis is at the end of the day a very personal and sometimes daunting experience, I have been fortunate to be supported in this endeavour by a number of extraordinary people, colleagues and friends, without whom – and of that I am absolutely sure – this work would have never been completed.

First of all I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor Prof. Dr. Pablo Mendes de Leon, Director of the International Institute of Air and Space Law of the Leiden University, whose professional mentoring, clear guidance and encouragement, which were also provided in moments of doubt, were absolutely invaluable for me in accomplishing this study.

My sincere thanks go also to Messrs Frank Manuhutu, Grégory Lièvre, Krzysztof Kędzierski and Guillermo Iovino for making suggestions for improvement, discussing ideas and reviewing parts of the text.

Likewise I would like to thank numerous officers, present and past, of the Regional Aviation Safety Organisations which are addressed in this study, for kindly providing information about the functioning of their organisations, sharing with me views on the value of regional cooperation in improving aviation safety and reviewing relevant parts of the manuscript.

A special acknowledgment is also given to ICAO for granting me permission to use some of its copyrighted data and materials.

I should also not forget to thank Ms Paula van der Wulp from Leiden University for all the administrative support, and Mr Koen de Vos and Mr Frederik Blaauw for kindly translating for me the summary of the thesis into Dutch.

I owe a special indebtedness to my parents and parents-in-law, for bearing with me and supporting me during all those summer and winter holiday weeks which I spent in their houses researching and writing.

My greatest thanks and love go to my wife Sarah and our daughter Martha, to whom this work is dedicated. Sarah believed so strongly in me over these past five years, and without her support and patience this work would not have been possible.

Finally I would like to underline that I wrote this work in my private capacity and take full responsibility for the views expressed therein, as well as for any errors, omissions or inaccuracies which may have occurred. All those who helped me in the research or agreed to be interviewed have done so in their private capacity and not as officers of their organisations.

Mikołaj Ratajczyk
Brussels, September 2014

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	1
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	7
Chapter 1:	
Research Questions, Methodology and Structure of the Study	10
1.1 Objective of the Study	10
1.2 Civil Aviation Safety as a Global Concern.....	11
1.3 The ICAO Global Aviation Safety Plan	16
1.4 Towards Regional Cooperation on Civil Aviation Safety	17
1.5 Research Methodology and Main Sources Used.....	20
1.6 Review of the Principal Literature on International Law and Aviation Safety Regulation	22
1.7 Structure of the Study.....	23
Chapter 2:	
Towards a Global Aviation Safety Oversight Network.....	25
2.1 Introduction	25
2.2 Strengths and Weaknesses of the Chicago Convention From an Aviation Safety Perspective.....	26
2.2.1 The Principle of State Sovereignty Under the Chicago Convention	28
2.2.2 Implementation of SARPs and Notification of Differences	29
2.2.3 Recognition of Certificates and Licences	36
2.2.3.1 Certificates and Licences Envisaged Under the Chicago Convention.....	36
2.2.3.2 Recognition of an Air Operator's Certificate	37
2.2.3.3 Other Certificates not Envisaged Under the Chicago Convention	39
2.2.3.4 International Aviation Safety Agreements	42
2.2.4 Role of ICAO in Global Safety Oversight	45
2.2.5 ICAO Enforcement Efforts and Competences	49
2.3 Lessons Learned from the International Maritime Sector.....	52
2.4 ICAO and the Regional Governance of Civil Aviation Safety	56
2.4.1 Development of ICAO Regional Policy.....	56
2.4.2 The 2010 ICAO Policy and Framework for Regional Cooperation.	59
2.4.3 ICAO Views on Regional Aviation Safety Organisations	61
2.5 Proposal for a Global Aviation Safety Oversight Network	64
2.6 General Conclusions.....	67

Chapter 3:

Definition and Typology of Regional Aviation Safety Organisations	70
3.1 Introduction	70
3.2 The RASO Concept in State and ICAO Practice	70
3.3 Proposal for the Definition of a RASO	72
3.4 Typology of Regional Aviation Safety Bodies	74
3.4.1 Pre-RASO (Type I): Regional Cooperation Projects of a Technical Nature	75
3.4.1.1 COSCAPs and Their Transition Into RASOs	75
3.4.1.2 Regional Cooperative Safety Inspector Schemes	80
3.4.2 Pre-RASO (Type II): A Regional ‘Association’ of Aviation Safety Authorities	82
3.4.3 RASO (Type I): Regional International Aviation Safety Organisation.....	84
3.4.3.1 Autorités Africaines et Malgache de l’Aviation Civile	84
3.4.3.2 The Pacific Aviation Safety Office	87
3.4.3.3 The Interstate Aviation Committee	90
3.4.3.4 The Banjul Accord Group Aviation Safety Oversight Organisation	94
3.4.4 RASO (Type II): A Supranational Aviation Safety Agency.....	96
3.4.4.1 East African Community Civil Aviation Safety and Security Oversight Agency.....	97
3.5 Regional Accident Investigation Organisations	99
3.5.1 Introduction	99
3.5.2 Establishing a RAIO Legal Framework: Current Examples and Practice.....	103
3.5.2.1 The Interstate Aviation Committee	106
3.5.2.2 The Banjul Accord Group Accident Investigation Agency	107
3.5.2.3 The European Network of Civil Aviation Safety Investigation Authorities	108
3.6 Towards a Regional Civil Aviation Authority	109
3.6.1 Introduction	109
3.6.2 The Eastern Caribbean Civil Aviation Authority.....	110
3.6.2.1 Origins and Evolution	110
3.6.2.2 ECCAA Legal and Organisational Status	112
3.7 General Conclusions.....	115

Chapter 4:

The European Aviation Safety Agency: Case Study of a Supranational Aviation Safety Organisation.....	118
4.1 Introduction	118
4.2 EASA as Part of the EU Civil Aviation Safety System.....	120
4.2.1 Introduction	120
4.2.2 The Initial Attempts to Establish EASA in the Form of an International Organisation	121
4.2.3 The Benefits of Establishing EASA in the Form of an EU Agency	122
4.2.4 The Limits of EASA Powers as an EU Agency	123
4.3 The Role of EASA in International Relations and its Status Under the Chicago Convention	127
4.3.1 The Question of International Legal Personality of EASA	127
4.3.2 The Relationship of ‘International Agency’ between EASA and EU Member States.....	129
4.3.3 Practical Consequences of the Relationship of ‘International Agency’ Between EASA and EU Member States....	133
4.3.4 Legal Status of EASA Under BASAs and Working Arrangements	134
4.4 Contribution of EASA to the Improvement of Global Aviation Safety and Objectives of the Chicago Convention.....	136
4.4.1 The EU Aviation Safety Regulatory Process.....	136
4.4.1.1 Benefits and Shortcomings of the EU Aviation Safety Regulatory Process.....	138
4.4.1.2 Compliance of EU Aviation Safety Requirements with Annexes to the Chicago Convention.....	140
4.4.2 The Role of the EU System in Certification of Civil Aviation Activities.....	142
4.4.2.1 Implications from the Perspective of the Chicago Convention	144
4.4.3 The Benefits of the EU System for Oversight and Enforcement ..	146
4.4.3.1 EASA Standardisation and Monitoring Activities	146
4.4.3.2 Enforcement Competences of the European Commission	147
4.4.3.3 Interaction Between EASA Standardisation and Monitoring Activities and ICAO USOAP-CMA	149
4.4.3.4 Independent EASA Enforcement Actions.....	150
4.5 Association of Non-EU European Countries with EASA.....	151
4.5.1 Implementation and Safety Benefits of ‘Article 66 Agreements’ ..	153
4.6 EASA as a Single Aviation Authority for Europe: Political Fiction or Long Term Vision?.....	155

4.6.1	Milestones Towards a European Aviation (Safety) Authority	156
4.7	General Conclusions.....	158
Chapter 5:		
The Functioning and Evolution of Regional Aviation Safety Organisations		162
5.1	Introduction	162
5.2	Typology of Delegation Arrangements	162
5.3	The Functions of RASOs: Setting up a RASO Using a ‘Tool Box’ Approach	169
5.4	Main Trends in RASO Functioning and Evolution	174
5.4.1	There is no ‘One Size Fits All’ Approach to RASO Establishment	174
5.4.2	RASOs Tend to Evolve Into ‘Institutionalised’ Structures	175
5.4.3	Efficiencies Stemming From a RASO Should not be Taken for Granted	176
5.4.4	Implications of Institutional Choices for the Functioning of RASOs	179
5.4.5	RASOs as Part of the Civil Aviation Safety System of Their Member States	181
5.4.5.1	Unintended Consequences Related to the Establishment of a RASO	182
5.5	RASOs as International Actors.....	183
5.6	General Conclusions.....	185
Chapter 6:		
Responsibility and Liability of Regional Aviation Safety Organisations and of their Member States.....		189
6.1	Introduction	189
6.2	The Principle of Legality and Delegation of State Safety Functions in Civil Aviation	190
6.2.1	Attribution of Competences to Civil Aviation Authorities Under Domestic Law.....	190
6.2.2	Attribution and Delegation of Civil Aviation State Safety Functions Under Public International Law.....	193
6.3	The Obligation to Establish Aviation Authorities, as Envisaged in the Chicago Convention and its Annexes.....	196
6.3.1	‘State of Registry’ and ‘State of the Operator’ in the Context of Establishing RASOs	200
6.3.1.1	RASO as a ‘State of Registry’	200
6.3.1.2	RASO as a ‘State of the Operator’	204
6.4	General Principles of International State Responsibility	206

6.4.1	Act or Omission Attributable to a State Under International Law	206
6.4.2	Breach of an International Legal Obligation	209
6.5	International Responsibility of RASOs and Their Member States	211
6.5.1	Determining International Legal Personality of RASOs	211
6.5.2	The Substance of RASOs Responsibility Under International Law	214
6.5.2.1	Preliminary Remarks	214
6.5.2.2	Ultimate State Responsibility Under the Chicago Convention	216
6.5.3	Relevance of RASOs Oversight by its Member States	221
6.5.4	Parallel Responsibility of RASOs Vis-À-Vis Non-Member States	223
6.6	Civil Liability of RASOs for Negligent Safety Oversight Under Domestic Law	226
6.6.1	Introduction	226
6.6.2	Non-Contractual Liability of Civil Aviation Safety Regulators: Review of Case Law	227
6.6.3	Review of Case Law: Conclusions	230
6.6.4	Application of Tort Liability Principles to RASOs	230
6.6.4.1	Recognition of RASOs Legal Personality in Domestic Proceedings	231
6.6.4.2	Jurisdictional Immunity of RASOs in Domestic Proceedings	231
6.6.4.3	Tort Liability Provisions in RASO Founding Documents	233
6.7	Assessing the Need for an Amendment of the Chicago Convention	235
6.8	General Conclusions	236
Chapter 7:		
Conclusions and Recommendations		242
7.1	Introduction	242
7.2	Conclusions and Recommendations With Regard to Specific Research Questions	243
7.3	Recommendations for Further Research	259
Samenvatting in het Nederlands (<i>Summary in Dutch</i>)		260
Appendix		266
Curriculum Vitae		267
List of Figures and Tables		268
Selected Bibliography		269

List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

AAMAC	Autorités Africaines et Malgache de l' Aviation Civile
AASL	Annals of Air and Space Law
ACAAC	Association of Civil Aviation Authorities of the Caribbean
ACAC	Arab Civil Aviation Commission
ACSA	Agencia Centroamérica para la Seguridad Aeronáutica
AD	Airworthiness Directive
AFCAC	African Civil Aviation Commission
AFI-CIS	AFI - Cooperative Inspector Scheme
AIP	Aeronautical Information Publication
AMC	Acceptable Means of Compliance
AMO	Approved Maintenance Organisation
ANC	Air Navigation Commission
ANS	Air Navigation Services
ANSP	Air Navigation Service Provider
AOC	Air Operator's Certificate
ASA	Air Services Agreement
ASECNA	l'Agence pour la Sécurité de la Navigation Aérienne en Afrique et à Madagascar
ASL	Air and Space Law
ASSA-AC	Agence de Supervision de la Sécurité Aérienne en Afrique Centrale
ATM	Air Traffic Management
AU	African Union
BAGAIA	Banjul Accord Group Accident Investigation Agency
BAGASOO	Banjul Accord Group Aviation Safety Oversight Organisation
BASA	Bilateral Aviation Safety Agreement
CAA	Civil Aviation Authority
CASA	Civil Aviation Safety Authority of Australia
CASSOA	Civil Aviation Safety and Security Oversight Agency
CASSOS	Caribbean Aviation Safety and Security Oversight System
CE	Critical Element of State Safety Oversight
CEMAC	Communauté Economique et Monétaire de l' Afrique Centrale
CEPS	Centre for European Policy Studies
CFR	Code of Federal Regulations
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CMA	Continuous Monitoring Approach
CMLR	Common Market Law Review
COSCAP	Cooperative Development of Operational Safety and Continuing Airworthiness Programme
CS	Certification Specification
CSA	Comprehensive Systems Approach

DARIO	Draft Articles on Responsibility of International Organizations
DASR	Draft Articles on State Responsibility
DOA	Design Organisation Approval
EAA	European Aviation Authority
EAC	East African Community
EASA	European Aviation Safety Agency
ECAC	European Civil Aviation Conference
ECCA A	Eastern Caribbean Civil Aviation Authority
ECR	European Court Reports
EFOD	Electronic Filing of Differences
EFTA	European Free Trade Association
ELR	European Law Review
ENCASIA	European Network of Civil Aviation Safety Investigation Authorities
ENP	European Neighbourhood Policy
EP	European Parliament
EU	European Union
EUROCONTROL	European Organisation for the Safety of Air Navigation
FAA	US Federal Aviation Administration
GASON	Global Aviation Safety Oversight Network
GASP	Global Aviation Safety Plan
HLSC (2010)	ICAO High Level Safety Conference (2010)
IAC	Interstate Aviation Committee
IAEA	International Atomic Energy Agency
IASA	International Aviation Safety Assessment
ICAN	International Commission for Air Navigation
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICVM	ICAO Coordinated Validation Missions
IDISIR	Safety Ramp Inspections Data Exchange Programme
IIL	Institute of International Law
ILC	International Law Commission of the United Nations
ILM	International Legal Materials
IMO	International Maritime Organization
IOLR	International Organizations Law Review
ISASI	International Society of Air Safety Investigators
JAA	Joint Aviation Authorities
JALC	Journal of Air Law and Commerce
JAR(s)	Joint Aviation Requirements
JEPP	Journal of European Public Policy
LACAC	Latin American Civil Aviation Commission
LNTS	League of Nations Treaty Series
MARB	Monitoring and Assistance Review Board
MoC	Memorandum of Cooperation
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NAA	National Aviation Authority of an EU Member State
NPA	Notice of Proposed Amendment
OCLJ	Ocean and Coastal Law Journal

OECS	Organisation of the Eastern Caribbean States
OJ	Official Journal of the European Union
PANS	Procedures for Air Navigation Services
PASO	Pacific Aviation Safety Office
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PICASST	Pacific Islands Civil Aviation Safety and Security Treaty
PSC	Port State Control
RAIO	Regional Accident Investigation Organisation
RANP	Regional Air Navigation Plan
RASG	Regional Aviation Safety Group
RASO	Regional Aviation Safety Organisation
RCAA	Regional Civil Aviation Authority
REC	Regional Economic Community
REIO	Regional Economic Integration Organisation
RIAA	Reports of International Arbitral Awards
RSOO	Regional Safety Oversight Organisation
RTK	Revenue Tonne Kilometre
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SAFA	Safety Assessment of Foreign Aircraft
SARP(s)	Standards and Recommended Practices
SAS	Scandinavian Airline System
SASO	Southern African Development Community Aviation Safety Organisation
SES	Single European Sky
SMS	Safety Management System
SRVSOP	Regional Cooperation System on Safety Oversight in Latin America
SSC	Significant Safety Concern
STK	Scandinavian Flight Safety Office
TEU	Treaty on the European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
UAE	United Arab Emirates
UEMOA	West African Economic and Monetary Union
UKTS	United Kingdom Treaty Series
UN	United Nations
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
US	United States
USC	United States Code
USD	United States Dollars
USOAP	Universal Safety Oversight Audit Programme
WA	Working Arrangement
WTO	World Trade Organization